Non-binary gender identities: challenges and opportunities for re-making gender

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/33202/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
Non-binary gender identities: challenges and opportunities for re-making gender

Dr Tray Yeadon-Lee
University of Huddersfield
t.yeadon-lee@hud.ac.uk
Background: Social context

• increasing visibility of NB e.g.

• Legal recognition in number of countries (e.g. Australia, Germany, India, Bangladesh, Pakistan, Nepal, New Zealand and Thailand).

• Facebook – over 50 gender options for profile pages

• UK & US - some organisations introduced gender neutral titles (e.g. HSBC Bank)

• Change in customer service approaches – e.g. Transport for London has scrapped ‘ladies and gentleman’ announcements

• Changing climate – structural, cultural and discursive levels - but social research on NB people’s experience in this current context is slim
Background: Academic research

• NB identities - particular interest within queer and transgender studies since 1990s. Debates explored gender diversity in trans communities, specifically:

• how trans and NB experience may challenge existing binaries of gender and sexuality

• NB identities largely seen as existing (felt, private identities) but impossible to live out in everyday life due to society’s binary gender structure, e.g. Davidmann (2010)
The research

• **Aim of current research**: to assess past claim of impossibility in the current social context of increasing visibility and moves towards formal recognition

• What are the everyday challenges and opportunities for NB people in establishing NB identities? How are NB identities being lived and established in everyday life?

• More favourable environment being created by policy and legislative changes - but a need for broader social awareness and understanding to bring about social change

• Aim to contribute towards raising awareness of NB identities within sociology and social sciences

• Aim to contribute towards the growing body of knowledge that can used by NB and trans activists and also policy makers in bringing about change.
Methods:

- **Online Study**: personal narratives of NB people found on Internet blogs and forums – accounts of NB identity and everyday experience (10 blogs, 4 forums)

- Blogs and forums found through Google searches

- Advantages - lots of data already there, data is ‘community’ rather than researcher driven

- All data is publicly available

- Data being analysed thematically using Nvivo
Research Framework/approach: Doing Gender

• ‘Doing Gender’ approach (based in ‘ethnomethodology’ - everyday production of social order) - originally devised by West and Zimmerman (1987)

• Early approaches explored maintenance of hetero gender social order. E.g. gender conformity and gender differences in line with hetero norms

• Recent work concerned with how gender might be ‘redone’ or ‘undone’ in range of people’s lives (Walzer, 2008; Hollander, 2012)

• Approach taken up in trans studies - but small numbers of NB people in research samples and focus largely confined to:
• Relationships in the workplace
• Ways cisgender people repatriate NB and trans people into the gender binary (Schilt & Connel, 2007; Schilt and Westbrook (2009); Westbrook and Schilt, 2013)

• In these studies trans and NB people’s agency is under emphasised

• E.g. little attention given to trans and NB people’s management and/or resistance of these and other social constraints – for example, in ‘undoing’ or ‘redoing’ gender

• Connell’s (2010) concept of ‘doing transgender’ in their study of trans people at work has moved towards overcoming this:
• The concept ‘doing transgender’ captures trans people’s unique management of situation conduct ... Doing transgender may operate more like ‘doing gender’ or like ‘undoing/redoing gender’ depending on the context” (Connell, 2010, p. 50).

• But instances where gender is done, redone and undone are not individually explored and concept of ‘doing transgender’ does not differentiate between these process

• Further Connell does not engage with lack of consistency in meaning/application of the concepts ‘doing’, ‘redoing’ and ‘undoing’ gender across studies that adopt a doing gender framework/approach

• Current research – sharpening the concepts ‘doing’, ‘undoing’ and ‘redoing gender’ - a fourth, ‘remaking gender’ is being developed.
Study findings: brief overview

• Everyday life experience of NB people highlight that there is considerable movement across ‘doing’, ‘redoing’, ‘undoing’ and ‘remaking’ gender processes.

• The processes can be experienced both negatively and positively and occur across a variety of social and interpersonal contexts.

• NB encounter varying degrees of constraint but also exercise considerable agency in daily life.

• Significant factors involved so far identified are:

  • relationships – friends, partners, families

  • life stage, norms guiding social interaction, and social etiquette
Doing Gender – assumption NB person is cisgender and where this is not challenged by the NB person

• Doing gender involves misgendering/ misrecognition by others who are unable to see gender beyond the binary. Being seen as cisgender is sometimes unchallenged by NB people:

• to avoid hate crime and to protect loved ones and families from unwanted attention/behaviour from others

• to prevent loss of relationships with others

• Due to normative interaction and etiquette – not all people and situations the same, e.g. rules around appropriateness of disclosure

• emotional labour – it’s hard work to continually inform and educate others
Redoing Gender – where existing cisgender categories are expanded

• Examples: as people are unable to see beyond existing gender binary, NB people seen as as feminine ‘men’ or masculine ‘women’

• Sometimes gender non-conformity seen by others as expressions of being lesbian or gay

• or as signaling ‘eccentricity’ or ‘oddness’

• Redoing gender – sometimes seen by NB people as safer option to avoid violence and keep relationships
Undoing gender - when NB people ‘come out’ to others or where seen as being beyond the boundaries for cisgender categories

• **Favourable** - NB people ‘coming out’ to others, responding to genuine friendly enquiries and educating others about their identities.

• **Negative** – hate crime, e.g:
  • being bullied, harassed or subject to violence
  • receiving offensive comments and remarks

• Unwelcome actions and behaviour can also include being positioned by others as an object of curiosity – e.g:
  • being stared at and being asked inappropriate questions about body parts
Remaking gender - mixed gendered/ungendered selves enacted/accepted

- Tends to occur mostly in context of intimate relationships, close friendships and families

- Involves - gaining respect for identity e.g. being called name of choice, referred to in chosen pronoun, absence of pressure to conform to gender binary in behaviour or appearance

- With unknown others: use of gender neutral pronouns; adoption of gender neutral title – new norms are attempted to be established

- Wearing a visible NB identity statement badge or clear symbol (which attracts people’s attention and generates curiosity).

- Appearance – non-conforming gender appearance, a complicated feature of being NB and not adopted by all
Concluding Comments

• Approach draws attention to how identities are more than individually ‘felt’

• Facilitates a social, interactive approach - enables a focus on both agency and the social constraints/obstacles involved in establishing NB identities in everyday life

• Rather than the catch all term ‘doing transgender’ - ‘doing’, ‘undoing’, ‘redoing’ and ‘remaking’ gender are useful concepts to:
  
  • explore the everyday challenges and opportunities NB people face in establishing their identities
  
  • ways in which gender norms are negotiated, managed and ‘re-made’ in everyday social practices – helpful in creating positive awareness and change
References


• Kristen Schilt and Catherine Connell "Gender, Work and Organization. Vol. 14 No. 6 November 2007 Do Workplace Gender Transitions Make Gender Trouble?


• Monro, S (2005) Beyond Male and Female: Poststructuralism and the Spectrum of Gender, International Journal of Transgenderism, 8:1, 3-22