https://ntrs.nasa.gov/search.jsp?R=19680028261 2020-03-12T05:38:37+00:00Z



Edwin Kinnen

GPO P	RICE	\$ 
CFSTI	PRICE(S)	\$ 

Hard copy (HC) \_\_\_\_ Microfiche (MF) \_\_

ff 653 July 65

August 1968

This research was supported by the National Aeronautics and Space Administration under Grant NsG-574.

THE UNIVERSITY OF ROCHESTER COLLEGE OF ENGINEERING AND APPLIED SCIENCE DEPARTMENT OF ELECTRICAL ENGINEERING ROCHESTER, NEW YORK

# GRAPHICAL APPROXIMATION TO THE DOMAIN OF ATTRACTION FOR SECOND ORDER SYSTEMS

Ryuzo Yokoyama Edwin Kinnen

College of Engineering and Applied Science

University of Rochester Rochester, New York 14627

August 1968

This research was supported by the National Aeronautics and Space Administration under Grant NsG-574.

# GRAPHICAL APPROXIMATION TO THE

# DOMAIN OF ATTRACTION

# FOR SECOND ORDER SYSTEMS

## CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION
II.	STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM
III.	FUNDAMENTAL THEOREM
IV.	METHOD OF APPROXIMATING THE DOMAIN OF ATTRACTION
v.	MACHINE COMPUTATION
VI.	EXAMPLES
VII.	CONCLUSIONS
VIII.	REFERENCES
	APPENDIX

Graphical Approximation to the Domain of Attraction For Second Order Systems

> Ryuzo Yokoyama Edwin Kinnen

University of Rochester Rochester, New York 14627

#### Abstract

A method is described for developing an approximate domain of attraction for a singular point of the ordinary autonomous second order differential equation  $\ddot{x} + f(x,\dot{x})\dot{x} + g(x,\dot{x}) = 0$ , where f and g are finite order polynomials in x and  $\dot{x}$ . Reverse solution trajectories are calculated for domain boundaries from a selective set of end point conditions known to belong to the domain of attraction. The latter is found initially from an arbitrarily chosen Liapunov function. The process is arranged for machine computation and is particularly effective for equations with solution trajectories not exhibiting limit cycles.

#### GRAPHICAL APPROXIMATION TO THE

DOMAIN OF ATTRACTION

FOR SECOND ORDER SYSTEMS

#### I. INTRODUCTION

The problem of establishing stability characteristics of a singular point is fundamental to the analysis of nonlinear systems. A more difficult problem arises, however, if the domain of attraction about a singular point found to be asymptotically stable is to be determined. The significant practical interest in resolving this latter problem justifies an investigation into the use of computer assisted solutions. The domain of attraction, or the region of asymptotic stability, defines those points in state space around a stable singular point corresponding to initial conditions of all solution trajectories which approach the singular point as t becomes increasingly more positive. A computer assisted procedure is described for systematically developing an arbitrary close approximation to the domain of attraction for a class of second order nonlinear autonomous ordinary differential equations, based on the concepts of an invarient set and limiting set from stability theory [1].

Methods which have been suggested for estimating the domain of attraction are directed generally to finding alternate Liapunov functions which describe more inclusive portions of the domain [2,3,4]. This procedure is based instead on the calculation of selective reverse solution trajectories. It is convenient to use a Liapunov function for the system in an arbitrarily small region about the singular point to start the procedure. The results are independent of the choice of this Liapunov function, however.

While the development has been restricted to one class of nonlinear second order equations, it appears possible to extend the ideas to more complex equations.

The problem is described in Section II, along with some characteristics of solution trajectories of the class of nonlinear differential equations. A theorem is stated in Section III to support the construction procedure. Details of the method and some practical considerations are given in Section IV. The next section describes a machine program for constructing an approximation to the domain of attraction. Three examples with computer assisted solutions appear in Section VI.

### II. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

Consider a second order system

(1)

where N(x,y) is assumed to be a finite order polynomial in x and y of order n, say

$$N(x,y) = a_{00} + (a_{10}x + a_{11}y) + (a_{20}x^{2} + a_{21}xy + a_{22}y^{2}) + \cdots$$
  

$$\cdots + (a_{n0}x^{n} + a_{n1}x^{n-1}y + \cdots + a_{n,n-1}xy^{n-1} + a_{nn}y^{n})$$
  

$$= \sum_{m=0}^{n} \sum_{i=0}^{m} a_{mi}x^{m-i}y^{i}.$$
(2)

Writing (2) as

$$N(x,x) = -f(x,x)x - g(x,x),$$
 (3)

equation (1) is equivalently given as

$$\ddot{x} + f(x,\dot{x})\dot{x} + g(x,\dot{x}) = 0.$$
 (4)

As singular points of (1) are defined for x = y = 0, all y coordinates are zero and the x coordinates are real roots of the algebraic equation

$$N(x,0) = 0$$

or

$$a_{00} + a_{10}x + \cdots + a_{n0}x^n = 0.$$

(5)

(6)

(7)

Consider  $k(k \leq n)$  distinct real roots of (5) such that the singular points of (2) are

$$(\alpha_{1}, 0), (\alpha_{2}, 0), \cdots, (\alpha_{k}, 0).$$

By a parallel shift of the y axis, the position of each point can be moved to the origin of a new coordinate system. It is convenient to assume, therefore, that an asymptotically stable singular point is located at the origin and, without loss of generality, to consider the problem of finding the domain of attraction of the origin [5]. This assumption requires that the coefficient  $a_{00}$  in (5) is zero. The origin is also assumed to be an isolated singular point, i.e., at least one of the other coefficients in (5) is not zero.

Restated, the problem is the following: for a given system

 $\begin{cases} \mathbf{\dot{x}} = \mathbf{y} \\ \mathbf{\dot{y}} = \mathbf{N}(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}), \end{cases}$ 

where (i) N(x,y) is an  $n^{th}$ -order polynomial in x and y,

 $N(x,y) = \sum_{\substack{m=1 \ i=0}}^{n} \sum_{\substack{m=1 \ i=0}}^{m} a_{mi} x^{m-i} y^{i}, \quad (n \text{ finite})$ (8)

and (ii) at least one  $a_{10}$ ,  $a_{20}$ ,  $\cdots$ ,  $a_{n0}$  is nonzero; obtain an approximation to the domain of attraction of the origin, say D, by another domain entirely within D and arbitrarily close to D.

It is pertinent to recall some characteristics of the solution to (7).

Remark 1: The satisfaction of the Lipschitz condition in a domain R of the state plane for (7) guarantees the existence of a unique

3

solution for any initial state and the nonintersection of trajectories except at singular points. Furthermore, all trajectories are directed to the right in the upper half state plane and to the left in the lower half state plane. On the x axis, trajectories are directed perpendicularly up if N(x,0) > 0 and down if N(x,0) < 0. If N(x,0) = 0, the point is a singular point by definition.

The following theorem provides a necessary condition for the nonlinearity N(x,0) in (7) if the origin is asymptotically stable.

Theorem 1: If the origin of (7) is asymptotically stable, there exists an  $\varepsilon > 0$  such that

 $x \cdot N(x,0) < 0$ 

for all  $0 < |x| \le \varepsilon$ .

Proof: Consider the contrary, that there is a  $\delta_1>0$  or a  $\delta_2>0$  such that

$$N(x,0) > 0 \quad \text{for all } 0 < x \leq \delta_1 \tag{10}$$

(9)

(11)

(12)

or

N(x,0) < 0 for all  $-\delta_2 \leq x < 0.$  (10')

For (10), choose an initial state

where

4

 $0 < x_0 < \delta_1$ .

The trajectory extends from (11) into the first quadrant perpendicular at the x axis and is then directed to the right becoming more distant from the origin. For the trajectory to approach to the origin as  $t \rightarrow +\infty$ , it must necessarily enter the fourth quadrant. Since, by (10), this cannot occur through an intersection of the segment between the origin and  $(\delta_1, 0)$ , the trajectory must become more distant from the origin than  $(\delta_1, 0)$ , independent of the magnitude of  $x_0$ . Because of this independence of  $x_0$ , the assumption of asymptotic stability of the origin is contradicted. The proof is similar if (10') is assumed.

Theorem 2: Let R be a closed, simply connected, bounded region in the state plane of (7). If R does not include any singular point, then a trajectory of (7) starting from a point in R must reach the boundary of R in finite time.



Figure 1

Outline of the proof: A trajectory starting from a point in R can stay in R for all subsequent time if and only if:

(i) R is unbounded, or

(ii) the closure of R, i.e., R, includes a singular point, or

(iii) R completely includes a limit cycle.

The possibility of (i) or (ii) is denied by the boundedness and the closedness of R respectively. The possibility of (iii) is denied by the simple connectedness\_and closedness, that is, if there exists a limit cycle in R = R, there must exist a singular point inside the limit cycle [6] and in R. Consequently under the assumptions no trajectory can stay in R for all time.

Identifying function: Consider a set of functions of class  $C_1$  such that

$$h(x,y) = K,$$

where K is a parameter. Equation (13) is a contour field in the

(13)

state plane of (7). Noting the value of the time derivative of (13) under (7) at some point  $(x_a, y_a)$  is

$$\dot{h}(x,y) \Big|_{(x_a,y_a)} = \{ \frac{\partial h}{\partial x} y_a + \frac{\partial h}{\partial y} N(x_a,y_a) \}, \qquad (14)$$

the following statements are evident.

- (i) If the value of (14) is positive, the trajectory at  $(x_a, y_a)$  is directed so as to climb the contour, toward increasing values of K of (13).
- (ii) If the value of (14) is negative, the trajectory at  $(x_a, y_a)$  is directed so as to descend the contour, toward decreasing values of K of (13).
- (iii) If the value of (14) is zero, the trajectory at  $(x_a, y_a)$  is tangent to the contour.

Equation (13) is called an identifying function.

Remark 2: Suppose that  $(x_0, y_0)$  is a regular point in a domain of attraction of the origin. Consider a trajectory T starting from a point  $(x_1, y_1)$  such that it reaches  $(x_0, y_0)$  and the time interval for this transition of the solution is finite. Then any point on T, including  $(x_1, y_1)$ , is a point in the domain of attraction due to the uniqueness of the solution and the definition of asymptotic stability. For this purpose, it is necessary and sufficient that T includes no singular point between  $(x_0, y_0)$  and  $(x_1, y_1)$ , and and that the distance between these two points is finite along T.

#### III. FUNDAMENTAL THEOREM

Assume that  $\Omega$  is a know subset of D.

6

Theorem 3: Let (a) L be a line segment in  $\Omega$ , (b) P be a trajectory not necessary within  $\Omega$  such that it reaches a point  $(x_{\Omega}, y_{\Omega})$  on L, and (c) h(x,y) = k be an identifying function which intersects both L and P at l and  $\rho$ , as in figure 2. Assume all distances between intersecting points along each of the segments are finite. Denote the domain surrounded by these three segments plus the boundary as D<sub>s</sub>, a closed domain. Then (i) if h(x,y) under (7) is sign definite for all points on the segment between  $\rho$  and l and including  $\rho$ , and (ii) D<sub>s</sub> does not include any singular point, then

D C D



Proof: By assumption,  $D_s$  satisfies the conditions of Theorem 2. Hence any trajectory in  $D_s$  must reach some boundary point of  $D_s$ in a finite time. But no trajectory can leave  $D_s$  at a point on P between  $\rho$  and  $(x_0, y_0)$  except possibly at  $(x_0, y_0)$ . Also no trajectory can leave  $D_s$  at a point on the identifying function between  $\ell$  and  $\rho$  due to the sign definiteness of the derivative of the identifying function. Thus any trajectory which includes points in  $D_s$  must also include a point on the segment L between  $\ell$  and  $(x_0, y_0)$ . As L is included in D, and from Remark 2,  $D_s \subset D$ .

(15)

Consider a modification of Theorem 3 for a similarly defined L and h(x,y) = k. Let  $D_s'$  be defined as a domain surrounded by L and h(x,y) = k, and two trajectories  $P_1$  and  $P_2$  starting from different points  $\rho_1$  and  $\rho_2$  on h(x,y) = k and reaching points  $\ell_1$  and  $\rho_2$  on L, as shown in figure 3. All distances between intersecting points  $\rho_1$ ,  $\rho_2$ ,  $\ell_1$  and  $\ell_2$  along each of the segments are assumed finite.

- 7

Lemma: (i) If h(x,y) is sign definite at all points on h(x,y) = k between  $\rho_1$  and  $\rho_2$ including  $\rho_1$  and  $\rho_2$ , and (ii) if  $D'_s$  does not include any singular point, then

 $D_s' \subset D.$ 





#### IV. METHOD OF APPROXIMATING THE DOMAIN OF ATTRACTION

Theorem 3 and the Lemma can be used routinely to develop D for a given system (7). The process is described as finding or constructing:

- 1. a line segment L which is a subset of D,
- 2. a trajectory P (or  $P_1$  and  $P_2$ ) to reach a point on L,

3. an identifying function h(x,y) = k to construct a domain  $D_s$  (or  $D'_s$ ); then

4. the condition of Theorem 3 or the Lemma is checked for

$$D_{s} \subset D$$
 (or  $D'_{s} \subset D$ ),

and the process is repeated for a new  $D_{s}$ .

It is necessary for the nonlinearity of (7) to statisfy the condition of Theorem 1; if this fails, the origin cannot be asymptotically stable.

Remark 3: To identify a line segment L in D, it is sufficient to find a Liapunov function V(x,y) to prove the asymptotic stability of the origin. This defines a region  $\Omega$ 

$$\Omega; \quad V(x,y) \leq \alpha \qquad (\alpha > 0: \text{ const}), \qquad (16)$$

where V is negative definite. Define

$$L_{...} V(x,y) = \alpha.$$

Then

L<sub>v</sub>CD

and can be used initially as a segment L. Using  $L_v$  for L also simplifies later calculations, as all trajectories reach  $L_v$  from the external side of  $\Omega$ .

To find V(x,y), any of the many suggested construction methods for an autonomous system can be employed. For machine computation, Rodden's method [3], based on a Zubov theorem, may be used if necessary. As  $\Omega$  is only required to initiate the procedure, the magnitude of  $\Omega$  is of little consequence.

Remark 4: Relative to step 2, finding a trajectory to reach a point  $\ell$  on  $L_v$ , a reverse time trajectory from some point on  $L_v$  is appropriate. The reverse time system of (7) is defined by

 $\begin{cases} \mathbf{\dot{x}} = -\mathbf{y} \\ \mathbf{\dot{y}} = -\mathbf{N}(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}). \end{cases}$ 

(18)

(19)

(17)

Remark 5: Simple identifying functions are worth considering. Observe the cases when

$$h_1(x,y) = x = k$$
, a constant,

$$h_2(x,y) = y = 0.$$

From (7) and Remark 1, (19) becomes

$$\dot{h}_{1}(x,y) \Big|_{x=k} = \dot{x} = y > 0 \quad \text{in the upper half plane,} \qquad (21) \\ < 0 \quad \text{in the lower half plane.} \qquad (21')$$

Alternately (20) is

and

and

$$\dot{h}_{2}(x,y)\Big|_{y=0} = \dot{y}\Big|_{y=0} = N(x,0).$$
 (22)

which is sign definite on each segment of the x axis between singular points. If the origin is asymptotically stable, (22) is negative on the x axis between the origin and the nearest singular point to the right and positive on the x axis between the origin and the nearest singular point to the left (Theorem 1). Therefore the existence of appropriate iden-

tifying functions such as (19) or (20) is sufficient to satisfy part of the conditions of Theorem 3 on the domain  $D_s \subset D$ .

To systematically construct domains  $D_s$  using identifying functions (19) and (20), suppose a  $\Omega$  and  $L_s$  have been found as shown in figure 4. Define in this figure  $C_0$ : the intersection between

 $L_v$  and the x axis in the right half plane.

q<sub>0</sub>: the intersection between

 $L_{v}$  and the x axis in the left half plane.

As  $\Omega$  is a subset of D, it cannot include any singular point, except



(20)



the origin. By Theorem 1,

N(x,0) < 0 for all x between the origin and  $C_0$ , (23)

N(x,0) > 0 for all x between the origin and  $q_0$ . (23')

(1) Consider a reversed time trajectory  $T_1$  from  $C_0$ .  $T_1$ necessarily becomes more negative than  $q_0$  in the upper half plane, by (23) and Remark 1. As shown in figure 5, define  $D_s^1$  as the domain surrounded by  $L_v$ ,  $T_1$ ,  $x = k < q_0$ , and the x axis between  $q_0$  and (k,0), where k is otherwise an arbitrary value. If there exists no singular point between  $q_0$  and (k,0) on the x axis, then Theorem 3 insures

 $D_s^1 \subset D.$ 

(2) As long as the reverse time trajectory  $T_1$  remains in the upper half plane, the domain  $D_s^1$ can be extended until a singular point appears between  $q_0$  and

#### Figure 5

(k,0). Assume such a singular point at  $(\alpha_1,0)$ , as in figure 6. Then the domain surrounded by  $L_v$ ,  $T_1$ ,  $x = \alpha_1 + \varepsilon_1$  and the x axis between  $q_0$  and  $(\alpha_1 + \varepsilon_1, 0)$  can be identified as  $D_s^1$ , where  $\varepsilon_1$  is a small positive value. In the vicinity of the singular point  $(\alpha,0)$ , there occur two possible initial states of reverse time trajectories of a new subdomain of D. These are  $(\alpha_1 + \varepsilon_1, \delta_1)$  and  $(\alpha_1 + \varepsilon_1, 0)$ , where  $\delta_1$  is defined in the following.

(3) Consider a second reverse time trajectory  $T_2$ , starting from  $(\alpha_1 + \epsilon_1, \delta_1)$ , as shown in figure 6. Call the first inter-



#### Figure 6

section of  $T_2$  and the x axis  $q_2$  (if it exists) and assume the nearest singular point to the left of  $q_2$  to be at  $(\alpha_i, 0)$ . If  $T_1$ remains in the upper half plane above the singular point  $(\alpha_i, 0)$ , consider the domain  $D_s^2$  as that surrounded by  $T_1$ ,  $T_2$ ,  $x = \alpha_1 + \epsilon_1$ , the segment of the x axis between  $q_2$  and  $(\alpha_i + \epsilon_i, 0)$  and  $x = \alpha_i + \epsilon_i$ , where  $\epsilon_i$  is an arbitrary small positive value. Since by assumption there exists no singular point on the x axis between  $q_2$  and  $(\alpha_i + \epsilon_i, 0)$ , y = N(x, 0) on the x axis between  $(\alpha_i + \epsilon_i, 0)$ and  $q_2$  is sign definite and the Lemma insures

$$D_s^2 \subset D$$
.

If a very small value is chosen for  $\delta_1$ , e.g.,  $\delta_s$  as in figure 6, the reverse time trajectory  $T_2'$  from  $(\alpha_1 + \epsilon_1, \delta_s)$  may enter the

lower half plane without passing over the singular point  $(\alpha_1, 0)$ . Then the construction of a new subdomain of D using  $T_1$  will fail in the upper half plane. Therefore,  $\delta_1$  must be chosen so that the reverse time trajectory  $T_2$  passes over the singular point and be a lower-bound positive value satisfying this restriction.

If, additionally,  $T_1$  intersects the x axis at  $q_3$ , as in figure 7, and no singular point exists between  $q_2$  and  $q_3$ ,  $D_s^2$  is reduced to the domain surrounded by  $T_1$ ,  $T_2$ ,  $x = \alpha_1 + \varepsilon_1$ , and the segment of the x axis between  $q_2$  and  $q_3$ . If  $T_2$  stays in the upper half plane forever,  $D_s^2$  can be identified as an infinite strip partially surrounded by  $T_1$ ,  $T_2$  and  $x = \alpha_1 + \varepsilon_1$ , as shown in figure 8.

(4) For a reverse time trajectory which starts from  $(\alpha_1 + \epsilon_1, 0)$  and is directed to the right in the lower half plane, as shown in figure 6 as  $T_3$ , arguments similar to those considered in (1)-(3) can be applied. Let  $D_s^3$  be the domain surrounded by  $T_3$ , the segments of the x axis between  $(\alpha_1 + \epsilon_1, 0)$  and  $q_0$ , and between  $C_0$  and  $(\beta_1 - \epsilon'_1, 0)$ ,  $L_v$  and  $x = \beta_1 - \epsilon'_1$ .  $(\beta_1, 0)$  is assumed to be the nearest singular point to the right of the origin and  $\epsilon'_1$  is a small arbitrary positive value. Then the Lemma insures

$$D_s^3 \subset D.$$

There occur two possible initial states for reverse time trajectories  $T_4$  and  $T_5$  in the vicinity of the singular point, i.e.,  $(\beta_1 - \epsilon_1, -\delta_1)$  and  $(\beta_1 - \epsilon_1, 0)$ .  $\delta_1$  is a small positive so that  $T_5$  passes below  $(\beta_1, 0)$  for the same reason given for  $T_2$  in item (3).

(5) If  $T_1$  in figure 5 enters the third quadrant at point  $(q_1,0)$ , as shown in figure 9, with no singular point between  $(q_1,0)$  and the origin, then  $D_s^1$  is the domain surrounded by  $L_v$ ,  $T_1$  and the segment of the x axis between  $q_0$  and  $q_1$ , and  $D_s^1 \subset D$ .









Continuing these steps (1)-(5), based on any known subdomain of D, new subdomains of D can be sequentially developed. Note that constructed subdomains using reverse time trajectories can include no singular points. It is this characteristic combined with the identifying functions (19) and (20) that essentially simplify the foregoing procedure for the machine computation described in the next section.



Figure 9

#### V. MACHINE COMPUTATION

The steps given in the last section can be programmed for machine computation and the direct plotting of an approximation to the domain of attraction. Initially it is necessary to check the condition of Theorem 1 and determine a known segment in D, e.g., a Liapunov function as stated. For a machine program it is sufficient to calculate and plot reverse time trajectories to approximate D from selected initial states. The approximated domain is then identified visually, referring to the considerations of the previous section. A program has been assembled to sequentially: ( $C_1$ ) calculate reverse time trajectories from selected initial states, ( $C_2$ ) develop initial conditions for additional trajectories and ( $C_3$ ) end when all relevant trajectories are calculated. It is necessary to locate singular points of system (7). These exist on the x axis with x coordinates which are the real roots of

N(x,0) = 0.

Any standard method can be applied to solve this equation. In

(24)

the program which follows, all singular points are assumed to be identified for the computation and inserted as data input. The flow chart of the program appears in figure 10.

For  $(C_1)$ , the Runge-Kutta method was used to solve the time reversed trajectories approximated by connecting segments of infinitesimal time intervals. End points of a segment, say  $(x_n, y_n)$  for  $t = t_n$  and  $(x_{n+1}, y_{n+1})$  for  $t = t_n + \Delta t$ , are related [7] as

$$x_{n+1} = x_n + \frac{1}{6} (K_0 + 2K_1 + 2K_2 + K_3)$$
(25)  
$$y_{n+1} = y_n + \frac{1}{6} (L_0 + 2L_1 + 2L_2 + L_3),$$

(26)

where

$$K_{o} = -\Delta t \cdot y_{n}$$

$$L_{o} = -\Delta t \cdot N(x_{n}, y_{n})$$

$$K_{1} = -\Delta t \cdot (y_{n} + \frac{L_{o}}{2})$$

$$L_{1} = -\Delta t \cdot N(x_{n} \cdot \frac{K_{o}}{2}, y_{n} + \frac{L_{o}}{2})$$

$$K_{2} = -\Delta t \cdot (y_{n} + \frac{L_{1}}{2})$$

$$L_{2} = -\Delta t \cdot N(x_{n} + \frac{K_{1}}{2}, y_{n} + \frac{L_{1}}{2})$$

$$K_{3} = -\Delta t \cdot (y_{n} + L_{2})$$

$$L_{3} = -\Delta t \cdot N(x_{n} + K_{2}, y_{n} + L_{2}).$$

Each point  $(x_n, y_n)$  along the trajectories are punched out for subsequent machine plotting.



Figure 10

For  $(C_2)$ , the initial state for the first reverse time trajectory is predetermined as a point on L<sub>v</sub>. Initial states for other trajectories depend upon subsequent results but exist only in the vicinity of singular points. Generally, for a singular point to the immediate left of a subdomain boundary in the upper half plane, as  $(\alpha, 0)$  in figure 6, two possible initial states exist,  $(\alpha + \varepsilon, 0)$  and  $(\alpha + \varepsilon, \delta)$ .  $\varepsilon$  is an arbitrary small positive number and  $\delta$  is the lower-bound positive value so that the reverse time trajectory from  $(\alpha + \varepsilon, \delta)$  passes above  $(\alpha, 0)$ . Alternately, about a singular point  $(\alpha, 0)$  to the right of a subdomain boundary in the lower half plane, as  $(\alpha, 0)$  in figure 6,  $(\alpha - \varepsilon, 0)$ and  $(\alpha - \varepsilon, -\delta)$  are possible initial states of reverse time tra-jectories which pass below  $(\alpha, 0)$ . If a new possible initial state is found during the calculation from a trajectory passing over or under a singular point, this initial state is stored for the later calculations. For convenience, at the beginning of a reverse time trajectory calculation, an identifying trajectory number and the corresponding initial state are printed out.

The calculation of each trajectory is stopped when

- (i) it is extended so as to establish a subdomain of D,
- (ii) it is extended to a preselected limit value of the coordinates,
- (iii) it rotates many times about a singular point indicating an approach to a limit cycle, or
  - (iv) its extension becomes infinitesimal as it approaches a singular point.

For (ii), the calculation is stopped when the trajectory reaches the limits of the region

$$|\mathbf{x}| < P$$
,

where P is chosen arbitrarily but so that  $x = \frac{1}{P}$  are not singular points. When the computation of a trajectory is stopped for exceeding this limit, the statement "CHANGE OF TRAJECTORY DUE TO EXCESS VALUE OF X" is printed out. For (iii), the number of changes of sign for y is counted along each reverse time trajectory and is printed out as "NO. OF ROTATIONS \*  $\frac{1}{2}$ ". When this

(27)

number exceeds a preset value, the calculation is stopped and the statement "CHANGE OF TRAJECTORY DUE TO EXCESS ROTATION" is printed out. For (iv), the amount

$$\sum_{i}^{i+100} \max \{ |x_i - x_{i-1}|, |y_i - y_{i-1}| \}$$

is accumulated along the trajectory and if the average value of the maximum changes becomes

$$\frac{i+100}{\sum_{i} \max \{|x_{i} - x_{i-1}|, |y_{i} - y_{i-1}|\}}{\frac{1}{100}} \leq SK, \quad (28)$$

where SK is a predetermined value, the calculation is stopped and the statement "CHANGE OF TRAJECTORY DUE TO STEADY STATE" is printed out.

When the possible initial states for reverse time trajectories are exhausted in the region indicated by (27) and the last trajectory is terminated, the entire computation is complete.

The Fortran program assembled for this computation and used for the examples of the next section is listed in the Appendix. The output of the calculation is both printed and punched out, the latter then used for a standard plotting routine for a graphical result.

#### VI. EXAMPLES

Three examples demonstrate the method and illustrate numerically calculated domains of attraction. The identifying functions used were

$$\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{K}$$

and

y = 0.

The region for the search was arbitrarily restricted to the x coordinate. If a reverse time trajectory rotated more than four

(19)

(20)

times around the origin, the calculation was arranged to end, anticipating a limit cycle. At was assumed to be 0.01.

Example 1: The system is given as

(i) As

 $x \cdot N(x,0) = -x^2$ 

 $\begin{cases} \mathbf{\dot{x}} = \mathbf{y} \\ \mathbf{\dot{y}} = -\mathbf{x} - 6\mathbf{y} + 2\mathbf{y}^{3}. \end{cases}$ 

the condition of Theorem 1 is satisfied.

(ii) A singular point exists at the origin.

(iii) Assume

$$V(x,y) = x^2 + y^2$$

and the time derivative under (29) is

$$\dot{V}(x,y) = 2x\dot{x} + 2y\dot{y} = -4y^2(3 - y^2).$$

Therefore

$$\dot{V}(x,y) < 0$$
 if  $y^2 < 3$  and  $y \neq 0$ ,  
= 0 if  $y = 0$ . (30)

On the x axis,

$$\begin{cases} \mathbf{\dot{x}} = 0\\ \mathbf{\dot{y}} = -\mathbf{x} \end{cases}$$

and any trajectory terminates at the origin. From (30), it is possible to choose  $L_v$  as

$$x^2 + y^2 = (1.5)^2$$

which is completely included in D.

The computed result is shown in figure 11. Starting from (1.5,0) the calculation stopped after the reverse time trajectory

(29)



rotated four times around the origin. Thus there exists a limit cycle around the origin and the domain inside the limit cycle is recognized as the domain of attraction. For this example, the procedure does no more, in effect, than determine the domain of attraction by plotting a reverse trajectory.

Example 2: The system is given as

1

$$\begin{cases} x = y \\ y = -x - y - \frac{1}{4}x^{2}. \end{cases}$$

(i) As

$$x \cdot N(x,0) = -x^2(1 + \frac{1}{4}x),$$

the condition of Theorem 1 is satisfied, for example, in |x| < 0.125.

(ii) A singular point exists at the origin and x = -4.

(iii) Assume

$$V(x,y) = x^2 + y^2 + \frac{x^3}{6}$$

where the last term is included to insure V negative definite. A rough sketch of contours of (32) is shown in figure 12. For V <  $\frac{16}{3}$ they become concentric closed curves around the origin. The time derivative under (31) is

 $\dot{V}(x,y) = -2y^2 < 0$  if  $y \neq 0$ .

From (31), no solution terminates on the x axis except at the singular points. Thus (32) is a Liapunov function proving asymptotical stability of the origin [1]. Choose  $L_v$  somewhat arbitrarily as





(32)

(31)

$$x^{2} + y^{2} + \frac{x^{3}}{6} = (0.3)^{2},$$

which is completely included in D.

The result of a machine computation is shown in figure 13. The first reverse time trajectory,  $T_1$ , is started from (-0.3,0). After this trajectory passes over the singular point at (-4,0), the second trajectory,  $T_2$ , is started from (-4+ $\epsilon$ ,0). When  $T_2$ attains the preset maximum value of x, the third trajectory,  $T_3$ , is started from (-4+ $\epsilon$ , $\delta$ ). A magnification of  $T_2$  and  $T_3$  in the vicinity of (-4,0) is shown in figure 14. Finally the region surrounded by  $T_2$ ,  $T_3$ ,  $x = -4+\epsilon$  and x = -10.0 is recognized to be a subset of D.

For comparison, figure 15 shows a set of trajectories of (31) calculated from the time reversed system with arbitrary selected initial states of

$$(0.011,0), i = 5, 4, 3, 2, 1, -1, -2, -3, -4, -5.$$

As an approximation to the domain of attraction evidently cannot be found by straight-forward calculations of reverse time trajectories in this example, the efficiency of this procedure is noticeable. Figure 16 is the union of figures 13 and 15.

Example 3: Given

$$\begin{cases} \dot{x} = y \\ \dot{y} = -4x - \frac{1}{2}y + \frac{1}{4}x^{3}. \end{cases}$$

(i) As

$$x \cdot N(x,0) = \frac{-x^2}{4} (16 - x^2),$$

the condition of Theorem 1 is satisfied, e.g., if  $|x| \leq 1$ .

(33)



Figure 13







Figure 16

(ii) Singular points are at x = 4,0,-4.

(iii) Assume

$$V(x,y) = x^{2} + \frac{y^{2}}{4} - \frac{1}{32}x^{4}.$$
 (34)

A rough sketch of contours of (34) is shown in figure 17. For V < 6, these are closed curves around the origin. The derivative under (33) is

$$V(x,y) = 2xx + \frac{y}{2}y - \frac{x}{8}x^3$$

$$= -\frac{y^2}{4} < 0$$
, if  $y \neq 0$ . (35)

From (33), no solution trajectory terminates on the x axis except at the singular points. Therefore (34) is a Liapunov function proving asymptotic stability of the origin [1]. Choose  $L_v$  for convenience as



$$x^{2} + \frac{y^{2}}{4} - \frac{1}{32}x^{4} = \frac{31}{32},$$

Figure 17

#### which is completely included in D.

The result of the computation is shown in figure 18. The first reverse time trajectory,  $T_1$ , is started on  $L_v$  at (-1.0,0). After  $T_1$  passes under the singular point at (4,0), the second trajectory,  $T_2$ , is computed from (4- $\varepsilon$ ,0). Subsequently,  $T_2$  passes over the singular point at (-4,0). When  $T_2$  attains a preset maximum, the third trajectory,  $T_3$ , is started at(-4+ $\varepsilon$ ,0) and likewise terminates at a maximum value of x. The fourth and fifth trajectories are started at (-4+ $\varepsilon$ , $\delta$ ) and (4- $\varepsilon$ ,- $\delta$ ) respectively. Finally, the domain surrounded by  $T_2 - T_5$ , x = 4- $\varepsilon$ , x = -4+ $\varepsilon$  and x = +8 is seen to be a subset of D.



#### VII. CONCLUSION

A procedure for determining an approximation to the domain of attraction of a general class of nonlinear differential equations (7) has been shown to be effective and efficient, and adaptable to machine assisted computation. This is illustrated by examples representing three types of domains of attraction.

The closeness of the approximation to the domain of attraction can be improved by choosing initial values for reverse time trajectories nearer to the singular points. This should be done with discretion, however, as the approximating domain can exceed the domain of attraction from accumulated errors in the trajectory computation, for a specific choice of  $\Delta t$ .

While the differential equations considered represent a limited class of second order equations, i.e., with the nonlinearity given as a finite order polynomial, it is expected that the procedure can be generalized somewhat. For other nonlinearities, the search for domains would have to be restricted to the regions where the uniqueness of the solution is guaranteed with the origin as an isolated singular point. The more general second order system

$$\dot{\mathbf{x}} = N_1(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y})$$
$$\dot{\mathbf{y}} = N_2(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y})$$

could similarly be considered; however, the computation would become more complicated for singular point identification as the locations of singular points are no longer guaranteed on the x axis. Extensions to higher order nonlinear equations are limited in part by problems of representation.

#### VIII. REFERENCES

- [1] LaSalle, J. and S. Lefschetz, Stability by Liapunov's Direct Method, Academic Press Inc., New York, N.Y., 1961, pp. 56-71.
- [2] Mogolis, S.G. and W.G. Vogt, Control Engineering Applications of V.J. Zubov's Construction Procedure for Liapunov Functions, IEEE Trans. on Automatic Control, AC-8:104, 1963.
- [3] Rodden, J.J., Applications of Liapunov Stability Theory, Doctoral Thesis, Stanford University, Stanford, California, 1964.
- [4] Weissenberger, S., Stability Boundary Applications for Relay Control Systems Via a Steepest Ascent Construction of Liapunov Functions, Journal of Basic Eng., 88:419, 1966.
- [5] Hahn, W., Theory and Application of Liapunov's Direct Method, Prentice Hall Inc., Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1963.
- [6] Minorsky, N., Nonlinear Oscillation, Van Nostrand, N.J., 1962, pp. 74-77.
- [7] Weeg, G. and G. Weed, Introduction to Numerical Analysis, Blaisdall Pub. Co., Waltham, Mass., 1966, pp. 82-85.

#### APPENDIX

An IBM 360/50 was used for the computation described for the examples. The program, constructed according to the flow chart in figure 11, is listed starting on page 33.

The data statement requires

D: a small positive number for the trial value of  $\delta$  in the vicinity of a singular point. As stated in item (3) of Section IV, the reverse time trajectory from  $(\alpha - \varepsilon, \delta)$ [or  $(\alpha + \varepsilon_{,-}\delta)$ ] must pass over (or below) the singular point To find the value of  $\delta$  for each trajectory, a trial (α.0). computation of a reverse time trajectory is made from  $(\alpha-\varepsilon,D)$  [or  $(\alpha+\varepsilon,-D)$ ] for 200 At segments. If the requirement for the trajectory cannot be satisfied, another trial computation is started from  $(\alpha - \varepsilon, 2D)$  [or  $(\alpha + \varepsilon, -2D)$ ]. The trial trajectory computations are continued sequentially from  $(\alpha - \varepsilon, kD)$  [or  $(\alpha + \varepsilon, -kD)$ ] for 200  $\Delta t$  segments until the requirements is satisfied, where k is a positive integer. Then  $\delta$  is identified as the lower-bound k to satisfy the requirement. The number of 200 At segments for the trial trajectory is arbitrarily assumed.

E: a small positive number for  $\varepsilon$ .

- H: a small positive number for  $\Delta t$  in equation (26).
- P: a positive number to restrict the region of the state plane, as in (27).
- SK: a small positive number for equation (28).
- NUP: a positive integer for rotation of trajectories for stopping the trajectory calculation if a limit cycle is found.
- NSN: the number of singular points, excluding the origin, in the left half plane of the search region.
- NTS: the number of singular points, excluding the origin, in the search region plus 2.
- SP(I): the x coordinate of the I<sup>th</sup> singular point in the search region. I, beginning from 2, is numbered for each singular point except the origin from left to right sequentially. Thus SP(2) is the x coordinate of the left most singular point, SP(3) is that of the next to the right, etc. For purposes of the program, SP(1) = -P and SP(NTS) = P, although these are not singular points.

- X0: the x coordinate of the initial state of the first reverse time trajectory.
- Y0: the y coordinate of the initial state of the first reverse time trajectory.

The compiling time of the program is about 4.50 seconds. Executing times of Examples 1-3 were as follows:

- (i) Example 1: 20.5 seconds with  $\Delta t = 0.01$  and P = 10.0.
- (ii) Example 2: 26.8 seconds with  $\Delta t = 0.01$  and P = 10.0.
- (iii) Example 3: 25.3 seconds with  $\Delta t = 0.01$  and P = 8.0.

NCY=0 KTR=1 PRINT211.LP.X0.YO 211 FORMAT(1H0.////.5X.12H TRAJECTORY=.13.5X. 211 FORMAT(1H0.////.5X.12H TRAJECTORY=.13.5X.	204 FORMAT(ZFI5.7) 204 FORMAT(ZFI5.7) SP(1)=-P SP(1)=-P DO 10 1=1.NTS ISP(1)=6 ISP(1)=7 I
	NCY=0 KTR=1 PRINT211.LP.X0.Y0 211 FORMAT(1H0./////SX.12H TRAJECTORY=.13.5X. 2125H WITH THE INITIAL STATE (.EI5.7.1X.EI5.7.1X.2H)///)

х к 4 х 7 г 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7	<pre>F(NT*EG*3) GO TO 2 F(NT*EG*4) GO TO 2 D TO 4 D1=X0 D TO 4 U1=X0 C F(KTR*EG*2) GO TO 5 F(KTR*EG*2) GO TO 5 RMAT(1H*27X*13*12X*110*2E30*7) DRMAT(1H*27X*13*12X*110*2E30*7) DRMAT(215*110*2F20*7) DRMAT(215*110*2F20*7)</pre>	
с 2 2 4 2 60 2 2 2 4 3 7 6 6 7 2 2 3 3 2 7 6 7 6 7 6 7 6 7 6 7 6 7 7 7 7 7 7 7	- (NT.EQ.4) GO TO 3 0 TO 4 51=X0 0 TO 4 01=X0 01=X0 - (KTR.EQ.2) GO TO 5 - (KTR.EQ.2) GO TO 5 - (KTR.EQ.2) GO TO 5 - (NT213,NCY.N.X0.Y0 0RMAT(1H.27X.13.12X.110.2E30.7) 0RMAT(215.110.2F20.7) 0RMAT(215.110.2F20.7) - N+1	
о с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с	0 T0 4 51=X0 0 T0 4 01=X0 7 (KTR•EQ•2) G0 T0 5 7 (KTR•EQ•2) G0 T0 5 7 (NT213•NCY•N•X0•Y0 0RMAT(1H•27X•13•12X•110•2E30•7) 0RMAT(1H•27X•13•12X•110•2E30•7) 0RMAT(215•110•2F20•7)	
с 220 220 220 220 270 270 270 200 70 70 70 70 70 70 70 70 70 70 70 70 7	0 TO 4 01=X0 - (KTR.EQ.2) GO TO 5 - (KTR.EQ.2) GO TO 5 - (KTR.1H.27X.13.12X.110.2E30.7) 0RMAT(1H.27X.13.12X.110.2E30.7) 0RMAT(215.110.2F20.7) 0RMAT(215.110.2F20.7)	
4 4 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	J1=X0 =0 7 (KTR+EQ+2) G0 T0 5 8 INT213+NCY+N+X0+Y0 DRMAT(1H+27X+13+12X+110+2E30+7) JNCH220+LP+NCY+N+X0+Y0 DRMAT(215+110+2F20+7) DRMAT(215+110+2F20+7)	
4 213 220 220 70 70 70 70 70 00	=0 = (KTR=EQ=2) GO TO 5 RINT213+NCY+N+X0+Y0 DRMAT(1H+27X+13+12X+110+2E30+7) UNCH220+LP+NCY+N+X0+Y0 DRMAT(215+110+2F20+7) =N+1	
213 213 220 70 70 70 70 70 70	7 (KTR+EQ+2) G0 T0 5 7 INT213,NCY+N+X0+Y0 0RMAT(1H+27X+13+12X+110+2E30+7) 0NCH220+LP+NCY+N+X0+Y0 0RMAT(215+110+2F20+7) =N+1	
213 213 220 70 5 0 70 70 70	RINT213,NCY,N,X0,Y0 DRMAT(1H,27X,13,12X,110,2E30,7) JNCH220,LP,NCY,N,X0,Y0 DRMAT(215,110,2F20,7) =N+1	
C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C A C C C C A C C C A C C C C A C C C C A C C C A C C C C A C C C C A C C C C A C C C C A C C C C C C A C	JRMAI (1H+2/X+13+12X+110+2E30+1) JNCH220+LP+NCY+N+X0+Y0 JRMAT (215+110+2F20+7) =N+1	
220 520 520 17= 70 70	UNCH220%LP*NCY*N*X0*Y0 DRMAT(215%110%2F20%7) =N+1	
C CA PO		
v v	-(KTR。EQ。2。AND。N。GE。200) GO TO 162	
Dd	ALCULATION OF SEGMENTS OF TRAJECTORY	فالتاسية بسيس مستعديهم بالهريات معاريحه فتكشيهم فتعاليت مستقسبا لمجاربته وتجليبا أستار بالحياب فالحاب فالمتعم
	)X=H*F1 ( AQ )	
00	JY=H*F(AP ∘AQ)	
Id	X=H*F1 (AQ+0•5*00Y)	a start a start of the start of
01	X=H*F ( AP+0 ° 5*POX ° AQ+0 ° 5*QOY )	
P2	2X=H*F1(AQ+0.55*Q1Y)	and a second
02	2Y=H*F(Ap+0。5*P1X。AQ+0。5*Q1Y)	
	3X=H*F1(AQ+Q2Y)	
n O	3Y=H*F(AP+P2X。AQ+Q2Y)	
XN XN	4#AF+(POX+2°0*F]X+2°0*FZ+F3X)/6°0	and a strain of the second
Z L	1=40+(00/+2°0*01/+2°0*02/+03/)/0°0	
	INTER CHANGE OF ALCH OF X	
ך ע רי נ	TECH CHANGE OF SIGN OF 1.	
μN		
дd	sint214,0N,XN,YN	a 🤉
214 FO	DRMAT(1H.42X.110.2E30.7)	
<b>60</b>	) TO 31	يستعينهم فيستعلم وسيستعد المارية والمرابق والمستعلمية المستعلمية مستعلم والمستعلم والمرابع والمستعام والمستعلم وستعلمهم
12 NT	rr=2	
00 00 0	DUNT CHANGES OF SIGN OF Y FOR TRAJECTORY .	11.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1
U I		
	-(NT¢EQ¢1) GO TO 18	strandom in the second second second research second second second second second second second second second se
	~(NCY.EQ.1) GO TO 13 ~(NCY.EQ.2.4NN.NT.ED.2) GO TO 16	son a serie de la construcción de A construcción de la construcción de
09	) TO 18	
13 IF	· (NT_EQ_2)_GO TO 14 the second states and the second	(i) any one of the second second second second s Second second s Second second se
<u>I</u> L	·(NT.EQ.3) GO TO 15	

	ND.J.LT.NTS) GO TO 31	• OR • NT • EQ • 1 • OK • NCY • GE • 3 • OK • XU*XN• L 1 • U • U • U • U • U • U • O • I • O • O	). Go. To 67, now address and a set and a set at the set of the se			F CALCULATION DUE TO EXCESS ROTATIONS.	F CALCULATION DUE TO EXCESS VALUE OF X.	LEeP) 60 TO 69 vous vous vous vous vous vous vous vous		46HCHANGE_OF_TRAJECTORY_DUE_TO_EXCESS_VALUE_OF_X++///)	AND.NCY.EQ.O) GO TO 62		AEHCHANGE OF TRA LECTORY DUE TO EXCESS ROTATIONS///		0) . G0, T0 . 64				and	NTS		GO TO 111		G0 T0 71	G0 T0 68					DF CALCULATION DUE TO STEADY STATE.	P).GT.ABS(YN-AQ)) GO TO 84						IS) •LT•SK) GO TO 87	
таларын	IF (JeGTeO.AND.)	IF(NTR.EQ.1.0R. IF(NT.EQ.2) GO	IF (NCY.EQ.1) GO	GO TO 61	IF (NCY.EQ.2) GO	CHECK END OF CA	CHECK END OF CA	IF (ABS(XN) LE P	PRINT215	FORMAT(1H0.46HC	IF (NT.EQ.2.AND.	GO TO 67	PRINT217	GO TO 67	IF (AQ.LT.O.O) G	DO 63 I=1, JK	I SP ( I ) =0	CONTINUE	GO TO 66	DO 65 1=JKINTS		CONTINUE	GO TO 151	IF (NT.EQ.I) GO	IF(IS.EQ.1) GO	IF (NT.EQ.2) 60	GO TO 131	IF (NT.EQ.2)_G0_	GO TO 91	CHECK END OF CA	IF (ABS(XN-AP) .G	S=S+ABS(YN-AQ)	COLICES			NS=NS+1	IF(S/(100*NS)•L	
and a the state of the state of the state of the state of the state	48	<b>51</b>	ու ո		52	U :				215		t a collection of the second second second second second of the second second second second second second secon	60		62	en en serente estante ( en 2000) en	a. Antidos de la seconda de la contra de una maria de la contra de la contra de la contra de la contra de la contr Antidos de la contra	63	and the second	64	المسترا سياديها الارتساس مستعملي سالما يدادنا الاراد الانتقاصين فلسب	0 0 0 0	مريالية والمراجع المراجع	67		والمنافع المراقبة المواقعة الموادعة المالية المحصصات المراقبات الماليات المالية الرائي معيد معين	-			<b>.</b>	69	يعاقبون والمراجع المعار المتراد والمحادث والمراجع المراجع والمراجع	C	10	Q	86	والمتعارض والمراجع والمعارض والمسترس والمسترسين والمراجع والمعارض	ta. Marina da Antonio da An

\$* • •₹	and and a set of the s	والمتعارية المتعارية والمتعارية والمتعارية والمتعارية والمتعارية والمتعارية والمتعارية والمتعارية والمتعارية	🖉 🖉 👘 🖉 🖉 🖉 🖉 🖉 🖉 🖉 🖉	S. S
newsymmetry wards and the second of the second s			, de manière de la sette de	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
and the second se	IF(SP(K).LT.TJI) GO TO 83			•
83 83	GO TO 82 IF(ISP(K).NE.5) GO TO 111	and a subscription of the foreign strategies of the subscription of the subscription of the subscription of the	na mana ana amin'ny faritr'o amin'ny faritr'o amin'ny faritr'o amin'ny faritr'o amin'ny faritr'o amin'ny faritr	
<ul> <li>A second of a standard st</li></ul>	JHK KNTHK	建氯化 使人的 医小学学家 法保证者的 人名法法马尔德 化分子橡胶 化合金 计算法		
a sourcementaries of the original strands and	CE=1.0 X0=SP(J)+CE*E	and and a second se		
and the second secon	Y0=0.00 NT=3			, pro a suj manamenta na mana a na 1970, strajni, mangan manamenta na mangan sa s
authough a daoine an ann an ann an ann an ann an ann an	- I SP(J) =4			
. 91	50 10 1 1F(TJ2°GE°0°0) GO TO 95		an de la companya de managera de la companya de la	an a
92	KENSN+K KEK-1 Tik i of to on			
an ann a chuir an ann an 1910. An ann an ann an 1910 an ann ann an 1910 an ann ann ann an ann an ann an ann an	IF (TG2°LE.00.0) GO TO 93			
an an an an an ann an an tha chair ann a' bhailtean an an ann an an an an an an an an an	<pre>…IF(SP(K)。GT。TJ2。AND。SP(K)。LT。0.0) GC G0 T0 92</pre>	) TO 94	a da manda ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang an	on the matter was made that the matter of a material state and state the state of the matter of the state of
	IF(SP(K)。GT。TJ2。AND。SP(K)。LT。TG2)。GC	o To 94	n na managana ana ang ang ang ang ang ang ang	straining to the second se
40 40	GO TO 92 IF(ISP(K)。EQ.0) GO TO 92	والمتعاوم معاولات محمد معادلتهم المعادم محمد والمعادمة المحمد المحمول المعامل المعادية المعادية المعادية	ал та да стратите и на стратите на стратите и стратите стратите расстояте и стратите на стратите на стратите на	an a
			and the second secon	an je se na naslavana se na naslavana se naslavana na se
Announce of the second s	X0=SP(K)+CE*E			
nanda yan da angala yang malayan mangalan nang malayan nang saka	NT=4	and a second		
اليك المستقدمات المستقدم المستقدم المستقد المستقد المستقد المستقد المستقد المستقد المستقد المستقد المستقد المست من المستقدم المستقدم المستقد ال	IS=1 KTR=2	na mana mana mana mana mana mana mana m	and and a second se	
56	G0 T0 161 J=KNT			
	UK=J CE=1.0	namente entre entre entre entre entre productionen entre		
and the second	X0=SP(J)+CE*E			
a substance and as a state mount of substance of the state of the stat	IS=1			
a series and series and the state of the function of the series of the ser	KTR=2 GO TO 161			
🚥 🚥 🖉 📕 🚺 na kanalanan na kanalan 👔 📑 🚺	۲ I Charles ( I SP ( NSN+2 ) • NE • ک) - GO • T O • I SI • I SI • NSN+2 K=NSN+2			
and a sub-standard of second sub-standard sub-standard sub-	J=NSN+1 A subject of the subject of			
a summaries a sum	and a substance of the state and an and an analysis of a substance of the state of the	a na analana ao amin'ny faritr'oana amin'ny faritr'oana amin'ny faritr'oana amin'na faritr'o amin'na amin'na am	a na manana ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang an	a management of the second
	الماليات الماليات المالياتين الماليات الماليات المالياتين المالياتين المالياتين المالياتين المالياتين الماليات	and a second	n na	da arrendar addinara a da su <mark>sanga na baranda</mark> ar danar arrendar 1

ند • • •		:
and the second s		and the first of the second states in the second states of the second st
		a dara sa kara na sa kara na sa kara sa kara sa
advanta energia - en antendra de 2 de construction - en ferra (2006) de energia entre entre entre entre entre e	CE=-1.0	
ويتري والمراجع المراجع والمراجع والمراجع المسترمين والمراجع والمراجع والمراجع والمراجع والمراجع والمراجع	-X0=SP(K)+CE*E	
. ·	ISP(K)=1	a mana internet inter
nan kantan kan borna na mana na		
n menja se njeko najve bajar i menendeko na mandeko na mandeko na serieta je na njema na njema na menendeko na		والمراجع والمراجع والمحارب والمحارب والمراجع والمراجع والمراجع والمحارفة
	GO TO 161	
	K=NSN+1.	
122	人 # 六 + 1	
on A summariant success a filmmariant active or success of states and an	· IF (K • GT • NTS) GO TO 151	and a subsection of the second second second
	IF(SP(K).6T.JI) GO TO 122	
123	IF(ISP(K), NE+5), 60-T0-151	and approximate standard standard and the standard state
124		a second in the second s
and the second	<pre>CL = 1.0 C X0=SP(K) +CE*E</pre>	
Υρονταιουστικά του στη την του		and the second se
	V0=0∘0	
يتريمهم والمتعاولات المرابع		
	I S=2	
на намениятельных расси. Со тор тор со ССФО из ССФОР и воловору, оконоски с ласс такожда и на торох торох на В	$\mathbf{k}$	And a lot of the second se
random ser and a series of the		and and the set of the
131	IF(TJ2+LE+0+0) GO TO 138	
المسترح المتسملينيس فتحاذلان الالمسأرة والمناسمينانية الالمارين والمحادية والمحافية والمستر		and the state of the
132		
a degrada a ser esta ser esta ser esta de deservação de servação de como de como como como como de servação de A	IF (K@GT@NTS), GO. TO. 138	and the second
•	IF(TG2. LT.00) GO TO 133	
y and second	IF (SP(K) •GT • TG2 • AND • SP(K) •LT • TJ2) G0 - T0 1 34	a substantia a succession de la constantia
	GO TO 132	
	IF(SP(K)。GT。0。0。AND。SP(K)。LT。TJ2)。G0 T0 134	
1.34		
		a de la comparación de
energy and the second		
an ann an an an an ann an an an an an an		
	N = 4	
and and an an an and an and an and an an an and an and an and		
	CA TA 121	•
and a subject of the subjects of the subject of the		
3	UTKNI-I IV-LVIT	<ul> <li>and state (1) and interview of spaces (2) and an and an and a space (2) and (2) a</li></ul>
		ومعاجبها والمراجع والمراجع والمتحالية المحافظ والمحافظ والمحافظ
. New permanent and benefit in with the second resolution of the control of the second resolution of the second resolutio		

0         CE=-1.0           0         NTES           153         Keta           154         NEAL           155         NEAL           156         NEAL           157         NEAL           158         NEAL           159         NEAL           150         NEAL           151         NEAL           152         NEAL           153         NEAL           15	and the second	
Total         Comparison           0         135           135         135           135         010 13           135         010 13           135         010 13           132         132           132         132           133         132           134         131           135         132           136         133           137         154           138         154           139         154           150         153           151         154           153         154           154         155           155         155           155         155           155         155           155         155           155         155           155         155           156         157           157         156           158         157           159         156           150         157           151         157           152         156           153         156	na positiv prečejšna i naj na vijelje v dovađena krajučena positiv na positiv na na V	
0         1725           1182         01764           1182         01764           1181         1184           1181         1184           1181         1184           1182         1184           1183         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1185         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1184         1184           1185         1184           1184 <th></th> <th>CE=-1。O &gt; C = C C × C + 子 C E 冬 E</th>		CE=-1。O > C = C C × C + 子 C E 冬 E
KTR22 KTR22 C 0HCK FOR REMINING INITIAL STATES. 151 K=0 152 K=0 153 K=0 154 K=	40	
KTR=2         G0 T0 12         15       K=41         151       K=61         152       K=61         152       K=61         153       K=61         154       K         153       K         154       K         155       K         156       K         157       K         158       K         159       K         154       K         155       K         156       K         157       K         158       K         159       K         154       K         155       K	na na serie de la serie de La serie de la s	1522 - Enter and the second
C       Color (0) REMAINING INITIAL STATES.         132       Kext         132       Kext         132       Kext         141       FritsPetrames to 70 153         152       Kext         153       Kext         154       Color 10 153         154       Color 10 01 153         154       Color 10 153         155       Color 10 153         154       Color 153         155       Color 153         156       Color 153         157       Color 153         158       Color 153         159       Color 153         150       Color 153         151       Color 153         152       Color 153         153       Color 153         154       Color 153         155       Color 154         158       Color 10         158       Color 10         159       Color 10         151       Color 10         152       Color 10         153       Color 10         154       Color 10         155       Color 10         156       Color 10		
C       CHECK FOR REMAINING INITIAL STATES.         151       FE(ST)         152       FE(ST)         153       FE(ST)         154       FE(ST)         155       FE(ST)         151       FE(ST)         152       FE(ST)         153       FE(ST)         153       FE(ST)         154       FE(ST)         153       FE(ST)         154       FE(ST)         153       FE(ST)         154       FE(ST)         155       FE(ST)         154       FE(ST)         155       FE(ST)         154       FE(ST)         155       FE(ST)         156       FE(ST)         157       FE(ST)         158       FE(ST)         159       FE(ST)         151       FE(ST)         152       FE(ST)         153       FE(ST)         154       FE(ST)         155       FE(ST)         156       FE(ST)         157       FE(ST)         153       FE(ST)         154       FE(ST)         155	n de la secte d La secte de la s	
152       FEK461         154       FEK461         154       FEK461         154       FEK461         154       C=140         154       C=160         154       C=100         155       C=100         154       C=100         155       C=100         154       C=100         155       C=100         156       C=100         157       C=100         158       C=100         159       C=100         154       C=100         155       C=100         156       C=100         157       C=100         158       C=100         159       C=100         156       C=100         157       C=100         158       C=100         158       C=100         159       C=100         158       C=200         158       C=200         159       C=200         150       C=100         151       C=100         152       C=100         153       C=200         150 </th <th></th> <th>CHECK FOR REMAINING INITIAL STATES. K=0</th>		CHECK FOR REMAINING INITIAL STATES. K=0
If (ker): Nit):       Color 170         If (ker):       Color 170         If (sp(t):       Color 170         If (sp(t):       Color 153         If (sp(t):       Color 154         If (sp(t):       Color 154         If (sp(t):       Color 154         If (sp(t):       Color 154         If (sp(t):       Color 156         If (sp(t):       Color 156         If (sp(t):       Color 156         If (sp(t):       Color 156	152	
If (15) (K) * (51:00:0) GO TO 153         If (15) (K) * (15:00) (GO TO 164         If (15) (CE* (KN)-SE*(K)) * (15:00) (GO TO 164         If (16) (CE* (KN)-SE*(K)) * (15:00) (GO TO 164         If (16) (CE* (KN)-SE*(K)) * (15:00) (GO TO 164         If (16) (CE* (KN)-SE*(K)) * (15:00) (GO TO 164         If (16) (16) (16) (16) (16) (16) (16) (16)	and the second se	IF (KeGTeNTS) GO TO 170
Tit (5) (4) *67 * 0 * 0 * 10 * 133         CE = 1 * 0         1 * 1		IF(ISP(K),EQ,6,OR,ISP(K),EQ,0) GO TO 152
CEF1:0 151 152 153 154 157 157 157 157 157 157 158 158 158 158 158 158 158 158	rigen lighter our states <sup>1</sup> of the Original states and Original generated to states a <sup>1</sup> of the Alfred Community states	, IF (SP(K) ¢GT • 0 • 0) . GO . TO . 153
153       154         153       154         154       1554         157       157         158       157         157       157         158       157         157       157         158       157         157       157         158       157         159       157         159       157         159       157         151       152         152       153         151       152         152       152         153       15         154       153         155       154         156       155         157       156         158       157         159       157         150       156         150       157         150       157         150       157         150       150         150       150         150       150         150       150         150       150         150       150         151       1		CE=1•0
151       151         153       60 T0 154         154       157         157       157         158       157         157       157         158       157         159       157         151       157         152       157         154       157         155       157         154       157         155       152         156       151         157       122         158       101         159       101         162       101         163       164         164       163         165       164         164       164         164       164         164       164         164       164         164       164         170       164         164       164         170       164         170       164         170       170         170       170         170       170         170       170         170	en e	
153       60 T0 F4         J=K-1       J=K-1         J=K-1       J=K-1         154       X0=501K3+4C=KE         154       X0=501K3+4C=KE         154       X0=501K3+4C=KE         155       X0=501K3+4C=KE         154       X0=501K3+4C=KE         155       X0=501K3+4C=KE         154       X0=501K3+4C=KE         157       X0=501K3+4C=KE         161       J2=2040         162       J2=00         163       J2=00         164       V0=C2+41         165       J2=00         166       J2=00         167       J2=00         168       J2=00         169       J2=00         161       J2=00         162       J2=00         163       J2=00         164       K78=1         165       J2=0         166       J2=0         170       J4=10         170       PRINTIB         170       PRINTIB         170       PRINTIB         170       PRINTIB         170       PRINTIB         170       PRINTIB		
133       CE=1.0         154       X5=K(x)=3         152       X5=K(x)=3         154       X5=K(x)=3         155       X5=K(x)=3         154       X5=K(x)=3         155       X5=K(x)=3         154       X5=K(x)=4         155       X7=3         154       X5=K(x)=4         155       X5=1         156       X5=1         151       X6=4         152       X5=4         153       X6=K(x)=2F(x))=(E=0.00.AB)+(E=X)+(E=0.00)         164       X7=1         170       PRINT218	n <mark>an januar ander en service en en</mark>	
U=K-1         15=2         15=4         15=60         NT=3         NT=3         NT=3         NT=4         NT=3         NT=4         NT=3         NT=4         NT=3         NT=4         NT=3         NT=4         NT=4         NT=4         NT=4         NT=4         NT=5         NT=4         N=4         N=4         N=4         N=4         N=4         N=4         N=4         N=4         N=4	15.4	60 10 104 CF=1 • 0
154       15-2         154       X0=20(K)+4CE*E         V0=000       V0=000         V1=3       V0=000         V1=3       V0=000         V1=3       V0=000         V1=2       V0=000         V1=2       V0=000         V1=2       V0=000         V1=2       V0=000         V1=2       V0=000         V1=2       V0=000         V0=000       V0=000         161       U=000         162       U=000         163       U=000         164       U=000         165       U=000         166       U=000         167       V0=000         168       IF(CE*(XN-SP(K))+6T+0000-AND+CE*VN+6E+000)         163       IF(CE*(XN-SP(K))+6T+000-AND+CE*VN+6E+000)         163       IF(CE*(XN-SP(K))+6T+000-0-AND+CE*VN+6E+000)         164       KTR=1         170       PRINTIA         170       PRINTIA         170       PRINTIA         170       PRINTIA         170       PRINTIA         170       PRINTIA	n formania a substance and formal and to substance a substance of the summer	
154       X0=SP(K)+CE*E         Y0=SP(K)+CE*E         Y0=SP(K)+CE*E         Y0=SP(K)+CE*E         XNT=X         KNT=K         KTR=1         Y2=P*CE         C       DETERNIATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA.         161       UC=0         162       UC=UC+1         163       UC=0C+1         164       UC=0         165       UC=VC+1         166       UC=0         167       UC=0         168       UC=0C+1         169       UC=0         160       UC=0         161       UC=0         162       UC=0         164       UC=0         165       UC=0         166       UC=1         167       UC=0         168       IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)))=L=0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0.0	արդիններ արդին երենները։ Աններությունը երենները երենները երենները։ Դունեները հետոներին։ Դունեները	
154 X0-SP(K)+CE*E X0-50:0 NT=X KNT=K KTR=1 T_2EP*CE C DETEMINATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA. C DETEMINATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA. 1 C DETEMINATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA. C DETEMINATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA. 1 C DETEMINATION O		ISP(K)=3
V0=0.0 V1=3 KNT=K KNT=K KNT=1 U2=P*CE C D0 T0 I C D0 T0 I 161 UC=0 162 UC=UC+D 162 UC=UC+D 162 UC=UC+D 162 UC=UC+D 00=V0 AD=X0	154	
NN TES KNTEK KTRE1 1.22PPXCE 6 OT 01 1.22PXCE 102 161 		
KNT=K KTR=1 1.22=PACE C DETERMINATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA. 161 JC=0 162 JC=JC+1 162 JC=JC+1 162 JC=JC+1 163 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K))).LE.0.00.AND.CE*XN.GT.0.0) G0 T0 164 163 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K))).CE.0.00.AND.CE*XN.GT.0.0) G0 T0 164 164 KTR=1 170 PRINT218 170 PRINT218	n en sense de la service de	
TU2=P*CE         Go TO I         Go TO I         I61 JC=0         I62 JC=JC+1         I62 JC=JC+1         V0=CE*JC*D         AD=x0         AD=x0 <tr< td=""><th>:</th><td>KNT=K Ktd=1</td></tr<>	:	KNT=K Ktd=1
C DETERMINATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA. 161. JC=0 162. JC=JC+1 2 C=JC+1 2 C=JC+1 162. JC=JC+1 AP=X0 AP=X	nan managanan ("An Indo'ina)" (an ''an '' (an '' an '' Anno) ann an A' Allandon - Anno ('Anno Ann	TJ2=P*CE
C DETERMINATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA. 161. JC=0 162 JC=JC+1 162 JC=JC+1 163 JC=SJC*D AD=YO AD AD=YO AD AD AD=YO AD AD AD AD AD AD AD AD AD AD AD AD AD A	و دینیان بیان این از این از این	GO TO 1
161 JC=0 162 JC=JC+1 70=CE*JC*D A0=Y0 A0=Y0 60 T0 4 153 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K))).6T.00.AND.CE*YN.6T.00) G0 T0 164 164 KTR=1 164 KTR=1 164 KTR=1 170 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.) 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.)	<b>U</b>	DETERMINATION OF VALUE FOR DELTA.
162 JC=JC+1 Y0=CE*JC*D AP=X0 AP=X0 A0=Y0 60 T0 4 163 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).LE.0.0.AND.CE*YN.GT.0.0) G0 T0 164 164 KTR=1 164 KTR=1 166 KTR=1 170 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.) 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.)	161	
Y0=CE*JC*D AP=X0 AQ=Y0 G0 T0 4 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).LE.00.0.AND.CE*YN.GT.0.0) G0 T0 164 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.0) G0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.0) G0 T0 164 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.0) G0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.0) G0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.0) G0 T0 164 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.0) G0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.0) G0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.00 G0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.00.00 G0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GT.000 S0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.000.0AND.CE*YN.GT.000 S0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.000.0AND.CE*YN.GT.000 S0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.000.0AND.CE*YN.GT.000 S0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.000 S0 T0 5 S0 T0 5 S0 T0 162 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.000 S0 T0 5 S0	162	
AP=X0 A0=Y0 G0 T0 4 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).LE.0.0.AND.CE*YN.GT.0.0) G0 T0 164 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.0.0.AND.CE*YN.GE.0.0) G0 T0 164 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.0.0.AND.CE*YN.GE.0.0) G0 T0 5 G0 T0 162 I64 KTR=1 G0 T0 162 I70 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.) 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.)	aanaan oo aanaan oo dhiriin oo dhiriin oo dhiriin oo oo ahaan ahaanaa ahaanaa ka ahaanaan	
<pre>60 T0 4 163 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).LE.0.0.AND.CE*YN.GT.0.0) G0 T0 164 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.0.0.AND.CE*YN.GE.0.0) G0 T0 164 G0 T0 162 164 KTR=1 164 KTR=1 170 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.) 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.)</pre>		AP=X0
<pre>163 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).LE.00.AND.CE*YN.GT.000) G0 T0 164 IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.000) G0 T0 5 G0 T0 164 KTR=1 164 KTR=1 170 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.) 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.)</pre>	remaining and the second s	60 T0 4
IF (CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.00.0AND.CE*YN.GE.0.0) GO TO 5 GO TO 162 I64 KTR=1 I70 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.) STOP	163	IF (CE*(XN-SP(K)) • LE • 0 • 0 • AND • CE*YN • GT • 0 • 0) GO TO 164
164 KTR=1 164 KTR=1 170 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0•24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE•) 210P STOP		IF(CE*(XN-SP(K)).GT.0.0.AND.CE*YN.GE.0.0) GO TO 5
164 KTR=1 60 TO 1 170 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.) STOP	ومحاويتها ومحاولاتها المحاوية ومحافظا والمحاور المحاور المحاوية والمحاوية المحاوية والمحاوية والمحاوية والمحاوية	
170 PRINT218 218 FORMAT(1H0.24HCALCULATION IS COMPLETE.) STOP	164	KTR=1 G0 T0 1
STOP	170	
	<b>6.10</b>	TURNAL (INU ¢ 24 MUALUULATION IS CUMPLETE ) A COMPLETE OF A CONTRACT CONTRACT OF A CON
	and a second	

and a state of an and a state of the state o	(a) Antipute (1, a) (1, a) and (1, a) (			
	ATA OF READZO1.) ATA OF READZO2.) ATA OF READZO3.) ATA OF READZO3.) ATA OF READZO3.)	351		
END	EDATA (INSERT D) (INSERT D) (INSERT D) (INSERT D) (EOJ	00000		
	* *	المحمد المحم المحمد المحمد		41