Tuberculosis

[Tuberculosis 93 \(2013\) 538](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tube.2013.05.002)-[547](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tube.2013.05.002)

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Tuberculosis

journal homepage:<http://intl.elsevierhealth.com/journals/tube>

IMMUNOLOGICAL ASPECTS

Pathways of IL-1 β secretion by macrophages infected with clinical Mycobacterium tuberculosis strains

Nitya Krishnan ^a, Brian D. Robertson ^a, Guy Thwaites ^{b,}*

a MRC Centre for Molecular Bacteriology and Infection, Department of Medicine, Imperial College London, South Kensington Campus, London SW7 2AZ, UK ^b Centre for Clinical Infection and Diagnostics Research, Department of Infectious Diseases, King's College London, Guy's and St. Thomas' Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust, London SE1 9RT, UK

article info

Article history: Received 28 February 2013 Received in revised form 25 April 2013 Accepted 14 May 2013

Keywords: Mycobacteria Interleukin-1b Macrophages Serine proteases Caspase-1

SUMMARY

The pro-inflammatory cytokine IL-1 β is a key mediator of inflammation and plays an important role in the host resistance to Mycobacterium tuberculosis infections. To date, most studies have examined the mechanisms of IL-1 β secretion using laboratory strains of M. tuberculosis and the findings may not be widely applicable to contemporary clinical strains. Here, we investigated the primary pathways of IL-1 β secretion in macrophages infected with a panel of 17 clinical M. tuberculosis isolates, representing Euro-American, Indo-Oceanic and East-Asian/Beijing lineages. Our aim was to dissect the pathways involved in M. tuberculosis induced IL-1^b secretion and to determine whether they are common to all clinical isolates. We found that the isolates were capable of eliciting variable concentrations of IL-1 β from infected murine macrophages, but this phenomenon could not be attributed to differential IL-1b mRNA transcription or pro-IL-1 β accumulation. We demonstrate that viable bacteria are required to induce IL-1 β secretion from macrophages, but IL-1 β secretion was only partially abrogated by caspase-1 inhibition. Almost complete IL-1b secretion inhibition was produced with combined caspase-1 and some serine protease inhibitors. Taken together, these findings demonstrate that clinical strains of M. tuberculosis employ a unique caspase-1 independent pathway to stimulate IL-1 β secretion from macrophages.

© 2013 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. Open access under [CC BY license.](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/)

1. Introduction

Mycobacterium tuberculosis is a complex pathogen capable of subverting the immune response and establishing life-long persistent infection in the host.¹ Detailed understanding of the host-pathogen interaction still remains to be delineated. Macrophages, the primary host cells for mycobacteria, respond to M. tuberculosis infection by up regulating a variety of cytokines including TNF- α , IL-6 and IL-1 β . Murine models of tuberculosis provide compelling evidence for the importance of IL-1 β signalling in the host resistance to M. tuberculosis infection. IL-1 receptor $(IL-1R)$ and IL-1 β knock-out mice are more susceptible to M. tuberculosis infection, exhibiting high bacterial burden in the lungs and increased mortality early in infection. $2-5$ $2-5$ $2-5$

The processes involved in the transcription, processing and release of IL-1 β from macrophages are tightly controlled (summarised in [Figure 1\)](#page-1-0). Control of gene expression is mediated by a number of processes including negative regulation of IL-1 β by type I interferons, which are induced by *M. tuberculosis*.^{[6,7](#page-8-0)} The engagement of pathogen associated molecular patterns (PAMPs) with pattern recognition receptors (PRRs) such as toll-like receptors (TLRs) acts as a primary signal leading to the synthesis of the inactive 31-kDa pro-IL-1 β in macrophages.⁸ Primary signalling via TLRs is insufficient to stimulate the release of active IL-1 β . Additional microbial danger signals are required for the processing and release of the mature form of IL-1 β . Cleavage of pro-IL-1 β into the biologically active 17 kDa IL-1 β protein requires the activation of the inflammasome, a multi-protein complex which stimulates caspase-1 activation to promote the processing and secretion of pro-inflammatory cytokines. The inflammasome provides a platform for the conversion of caspase-1 precursor into its active form in response to signalling via the nucleotide oligomerization domain (NOD) receptors and danger associated molecular patterns such as ATP.^{[9,10](#page-8-0)} Activated caspase-1 cleaves pro-IL-1 β into the mature biologically active 17 kDa form that is then rapidly secreted out of the cell via an incompletely understood mechanism. A recent study

^{*} Corresponding author. Tel.: $+44$ (0)20 7188 7188x52775; fax: $+44$ (0)20 7188 3146.

E-mail addresses: n.krishnan@imperial.ac.uk (N. Krishnan), [b.robertson@](mailto:b.robertson@imperial.ac.uk) [imperial.ac.uk](mailto:b.robertson@imperial.ac.uk) (B.D. Robertson), guy.thwaites@btinternet.com (G. Thwaites).

^{1472-9792 © 2013} The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. Open access under [CC BY license.](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/) <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tube.2013.05.002>

Figure 1. Diagram illustrating the different signalling pathways of IL-1 β induction in macrophages. The transcription, translation and processing of IL-1 β is a highly regulated process comprising of three major steps: i) synthesis of pro-IL-1 β regulated by pattern recognition receptors like TLRs, ii) cleavage of pro-IL-1 β by caspase-1 resulting in the mature form of IL-1b and iii) release of mature IL-1b into the external environment. Activation of the inflammasome by secondary signals in the form of microbial ligands, Nigericin, ATP and other danger signals (e.g. silica, uric acid crystals) induces activation of caspase-1.

has elegantly shown that nitric oxide produced by IFN- γ stimulated macrophages regulates the processing of pro-IL-1 β by directly acting on the inflammasome. 11 11 11 In other cell types like dendritic cells, mycobacteria are reported to activate the caspase-8 dependent inflammasome.[12](#page-8-0) The control of processing and secretion of IL- 1β seems to be complex process dependent on multiple sensors and effectors.

Several studies have stressed the importance of the mycobacterial region of difference-1 (RD-1) locus in modulating the secretion of IL-1 β by infected cells. M. marinum Δ RD-1 and M. bovis BCG lack functional ESX-1 secretion systems and are impaired in their ability to induce secretion of mature IL-1 β in vitro.^{[13](#page-8-0)–[15](#page-8-0)} A functional ESX-1 secretion system has been implicated in the transfer of bacterial products like the early secreted antigen-6 (ESAT-6), a known stimulator of caspase-1[.16](#page-8-0) Effector proteins secreted via the ESX-1 secretion system are thought to be involved in triggering a potassium ion efflux which is necessary for the activation of caspase-1 during M. tuberculosis infection.¹⁴

The contribution of cell death to the regulation of immune pathways during M. tuberculosis infection is not clear. Studies have reported the occurrence of both apoptotic and necrotic cell death during M. tuberculosis cellular infection. Apoptotic cell death may limit the spread of intracellular bacteria^{[17,18](#page-8-0)}; while, necrotic cell death may aid in the escape and dissemination of the bacteria into new host cells. Induction of necrotic cell death closely correlates with bacterial burden and virulence of the infecting M. tuberculosis strain, $19,20$ with evidence that necrosis may be mediated by ESX-1 activation of the inflammasome $-$ NOD-like receptor family, pryin domain containing 3 (NLRP3). 21 Under conditions of extreme inflammatory stress, increased levels of cell death contributes to plasma membrane damage which can lead to the rapid release of bioactive IL-1 β from immune cells.^{[22](#page-8-0)}

Increasingly, genetic diversity in M. tuberculosis is understood to influence aspects of the host-pathogen interaction, including virulence, immune modulation and clinical outcomes.^{[23,24](#page-8-0)} Most studies to date have examined the mechanisms of IL-1β secretion
using laboratory strains of M. tuberculosis like H37Rv.^{5,6,25} Here, we investigated the primary pathways of IL-1 β secretion in macrophages infected with a panel of clinical isolates of M. tuberculosis. In this study, we report that the ability of M. tuberculosis strains to induce secretion of IL-1 β in murine macrophages is dependent on both caspase-1 and serine proteases. Additionally, we report that IL-1 β secretion during M. tuberculosis infection is independent of cell death in infected macrophages.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Bacterial strains and culture conditions

M. tuberculosis strains were selected using the criteria previ-ously outlined.^{[23](#page-8-0)} We selected isolates representative of the three major lineages including seven East Asian/Beijing strains (strains 119, 345, 212, 649, 374, 333, 411), four Indo-Oceanic strains (strains 346, 232, 372, 281) and six Euro-American strains (strains 293, 173, 355, 318, 440, 639).

Strains were cultured in Middlebrook 7H9 liquid medium (Becton Dickinson, United Kingdom) supplemented with 0.2% glycerol, 0.05% Tween 80 and 10% oleic acid-albumin-dextrose-catalase (OADC; Becton Dickinson, United Kingdom). For growth on solid medium, Middlebrook 7H10 plates were supplemented with 0.5% glycerol and

10% OADC. Heat-killed strains were prepared by boiling mid-log phase cultures for 20 min before removing from the BSL3 lab.

2.2. Isolation of mouse bone marrow macrophages

Bone marrow cells from 8 to10 week old female BALB/c mice were isolated and differentiated into macrophages for 7 days in RPMI 1640 (Lonza, United Kingdom) supplemented with 1 mM sodium pyruvate (Lonza, United Kingdom), 2 mM L-glutamine (Lonza, United Kingdom), 0.05 M, 2-mercaptoethanol (Invitrogen, United Kingdom), 10% heat-inactivated fetal bovine serum (Biosera, United Kingdom) and 20% L-cell conditioned medium (a kind gift from Anne O'Garra, MRC National Institute for Medical Research, London). On day 4, cells were fed with an additional 10 ml of medium. After 7 days in culture, cells were washed with phosphatebuffered saline (PBS) and seeded into 24-well plates at 5×10^5 cells/well or in 48-well plates at 2 \times 10⁵ cells/well.

2.3. Cellular infection assays

Macrophages were infected with M. tuberculosis from mid-log phase cultures at a multiplicity of infection (MOI) of 5. Supernatants were removed at 24 and 48 h post-infection and filtered using 0.22 µm filters (Millipore, United Kingdom) before removing from the BSL3 lab. Concentration of cytokines in the supernatants was determined using an enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA) according to the manufacturer's instructions (E-bioscience, United Kingdom). Cell death was assayed using the cell death detection ELISA (Roche Diagnostics, United Kingdom). Briefly, macrophages were lysed following infection and apoptotic cell death was evaluated in the cytoplasmic fractions according to the manufacturer's instructions. Intracellular growth of M. tuberculosis was also determined in the lysed cells, once extracellular bacteria had been killed by the addition of streptomycin, for strains 411, 212, 333, 281, 232, 372, 355, 293, 318 over 7 days of infection.

For studies using inhibitors, macrophages were stimulated with the caspase-1 inhibitor, Ac-Tyr-Val-Ala-Asp-2,6-dimethylbenzoyloxymethyl ketone (Ac-YVAD-AOM; Merck Chemicals, United Kingdom) at a concentration of 20 μ M, serine protease inhibitor, N-tosyl-L-phenylalanine chloromethylketone (TPCK; Merck Chemicals, United Kingdom) at a concentration of 50 µM, N-tosyl-Lys-Chloromethyl Ketone Hydrochloride (TLCK; Merck Chemicals, United Kingdom) at a concentration of 50 µM, BAY 11-7082 (NF_KB inhibitor) at a concentration of 10 μ M, and Nigericin (Sigma-Aldrich, United Kingdom) at a concentration of 5 μ M. Each M. tuberculosis strain was assayed in triplicate in at least two independent experiments.

2.4. Real-time PCR

Macrophages were lysed using TRIzol (Invitrogen, United Kingdom) and total RNA was isolated using Purelink RNA mini kit (Invitrogen, United Kingdom), according to the manufacturer's protocol. cDNA was generated from 1 µg total RNA using superscript III reverse transcriptase and random hexamers (Invitrogen, United Kingdom) according to the manufacturer's instructions. Reaction mixtures without reverse transcriptase were used as the negative control. The reaction mix was incubated at 25 \degree C for 10 min, 50 \degree C for 30 min, 85 \degree C for 5 min, followed by an incubation at 37 \degree C for 20 min, after the addition of RNase H to terminate the reaction. For the real-time PCR, each 10 μ l reaction mix contained 5 μ l TaqMan universal PCR master mix (Applied Biosystems, United Kingdom), 0.5 μ l TaqMan primers and probe, 1 μ l cDNA and 3.5 μ l of water (Invitrogen, United Kingdom), as recommended by the manufacturer. The reactions were performed on an ABI 7500 real-time PCR thermal cycler (Applied Biosystems, United Kingdom) and the samples were incubated at 95 \degree C for 20 s, followed by 40 cycles of 95 °C for 3 s and 60 °C for 30 s. Commercially available primers for 18s and IL-1 β were purchased from Applied Biosystems and used as recommended by the manufacturer. Each sample was assayed in duplicates on two biological replicates. Parallel reactions with no template controls and reverse transcriptase negative samples were included in each run. Standard curves were generated to calculate the relative copy numbers of each gene. For each gene, the calculated threshold cycle (Ct) of each cytokine transcript was divided by the Ct of the endogenous control, 18s to obtain a normalised number for the cytokine transcript for each strain. Fold change for each gene was calculated relative to the uninfected control. Under the conditions assayed the levels of 18s was constant and thus was chosen as the endogenous control.

2.5. Western blots

Macrophages were lysed using RIPA buffer (Sigma-Aldrich, United Kingdom) supplemented with complete protease inhibitor tablets (Roche Diagnostics, United Kingdom). The samples were boiled and separated on a 12% polyacrylamide gel (Invitrogen, United Kingdom) and transferred onto a nitrocellulose membrane (GE healthcare, United Kingdom). The membrane was probed with goat polyclonal antibody for pro-IL-1 β , mouse monoclonal antibody for pro-caspase-1 and mouse monoclonal antibody for b-actin. All antibodies were sourced from Santa Cruz Biotechnology, CA, USA. Stripping of the membrane was carried out using restore plus western blot stripping buffer (Thermo Fisher Scientific, United Kingdom) for subsequent probing with β -actin. Concentration of total protein was determined using the BCA protein assay kit (Thermo Fisher Scientific, United Kingdom).

2.6. Statistical analysis

All data are presented as mean \pm SD of two or three independent experiments. Data was combined and analysed using Mann Whitney U test and a p -value <0.05 was considered statistically significant. Correlation between IL-1 β and cell death was performed using the Spearman rank for correlation. All the statistical tests were performed using Graphpad Prism.

3. Results

3.1. M. tuberculosis clinical isolates induce differential IL-1 β secretion from macrophages

We first determined whether M. tuberculosis clinical isolates vary in their ability to induce IL-1 β secretion from macrophages. Macrophages were infected at a MOI of 5 over 72 h and the concentration of IL-1b was determined by ELISA. Strains of M. tuberculosis differed in their ability to promote secretion of IL-1 β , with a five-fold difference between the highest and lowest IL-1 β inducers [\(Figure 2\)](#page-3-0). These differences did not correlate with bacterial growth rate within macrophages. Intracellular bacterial growth was measured in 9 of the strains representative of the extremes of IL-1 β expression, and in two independent experiments. The growth rates varied between the strains over the first 48 h from 2.0 to 8.7 \times 10³ CFU/h, but there was no correlation between growth rate and IL-1 β expression (correlation coefficient -0.15 , $p = 0.71$).

In comparison to clinical isolates of M. tuberculosis, BCG was less effective at inducing IL-1 β , producing negligible amounts of the cytokine from macrophages. In addition, we also assessed the role of bacterial burden in the secretion of IL-1 β in strains 293, 212, 318,

Figure 2. M. tuberculosis genotype influences secretion of IL-1 β from macrophages. Bone marrow macrophages were infected with 17 clinical isolates of M. tuberculosis at a MOI of 5 for 72 h. Cytokine concentrations in the culture supernatants were determined by ELISA. Data shown are the means \pm SD of three independent experiments.

232, 372 and 411. A higher bacillary load (MOI 10) of M. tuberculosis was effective in stimulating higher concentrations of IL-1 β in comparison to a lower bacterial burden (MOI 1) (data not shown). The fold increased secretion of IL-1 β at a MOI 10 compared to MOI 1 was in the range $1.4-2.2$ with a median of 1.8 at 24 h and a fold increase in the range of $1.3-2.4$ with a median of 1.6 at 48 h. The increase in secretion of IL-1 β with MOI was consistent across all M. tuberculosis isolates tested in this study. Infections at MOI of 1 and 10 induced similar differential pattern of IL-1beta to MOI 5, although the inter-strain difference in expression was less marked (data not shown).

3.2. M. tuberculosis isolate-dependent IL-1 β induction is not due to altered IL-1 β transcription or increased expression of pro-IL-1 β

To investigate the possible mechanisms behind the differential IL-1 β expression we subdivided the isolates into those which induced low, moderate, or high IL-1 β levels, based on quartiles (Figure 2), and selected 3 isolates from each subdivision for further testing.

We first examined whether strains of M. tuberculosis induced different concentrations of IL-1 β through differential interactions with cell-surface pattern recognition receptors. M. tuberculosis infected macrophages rapidly transcribed IL-1 β mRNA as early as 2 h post-infection (data not shown) and sustained expression until 24 h ([Figure 3A](#page-4-0)). Additionally, we noted there was no obvious relationship between the fold increase in IL-1 β mRNA levels and the amount of IL-1 β detected by ELISA. Interestingly, expression of IL-1 β mRNA following BCG infection was comparable to some of the clinical M. tuberculosis strains. To determine whether post-transcriptional control of IL-1 β could account for the observed differences in IL-1 β secretion in the supernatants, we profiled the expression of pro-IL-1 β in whole cell lysates of macrophages at 6 h and 24 h post-infection by western blot. We found that all strains were capable of activating pro-IL-1 β in macrophages [\(Figure 3B](#page-4-0)), but pro-IL-1 β expression did not differ significantly between strains. These findings suggest that genotype-dependent differences in IL-1 β expression are not regulated by differential activation of pattern recognition receptors but via downstream pathways that mediate either the caspase-1-dependent or independent conversion of pro-IL-1 β to its active form ([Figure 1](#page-1-0)).

3.3. Live bacteria are required to induce optimum IL-1 β expression from macrophages

Next, we tested whether IL-1 β secretion is dependent on live, viable M. tuberculosis. Macrophages were stimulated with heat-killed mycobacteria and the level of IL-1 β protein in the supernatant was quantified by ELISA and in the whole cell lysates by western blots. Dead bacteria were less efficient at stimulating secretion of mature IL-1 β into the supernatants ([Figure 4](#page-4-0)A) and the differential effect of bacterial genotype on IL-1 β expression was lost. In comparison, the viability of the bacteria had no effect on the expression of pro-IL-1 β in macrophages ([Figure 4B](#page-4-0)). This suggests that viable M. tuberculosis cells actively modulate pro IL-1b maturation pathways to control IL-1b secretion in macrophages.

3.4. M. tuberculosis driven IL-1 β secretion is only partially dependent on caspase-1

We hypothesised that differential IL-1 β expression may arise due to strain-dependent differences in the activation of caspase-1. First, we compared the expression of pro-caspase-1 between the isolates and found little difference, with the inactive form of caspase-1 being constitutively expressed in macrophages ([Figure 5](#page-5-0)A). We then treated M. tuberculosis infected macrophages with caspase-1 inhibitor (YVAD) for a period of up to 48 h, which decreased but did not completely inhibit IL-1 β secretion by all the isolates [\(Figure 5B](#page-5-0) and C).

Potassium efflux is a common upstream trigger for the activation of the inflammasome, which is required for the activation of caspase-1.^{[10,26](#page-8-0)} Therefore, we assessed if the stimulation of an artificial potassium efflux can rescue IL-1 β secretion in macrophages treated with the caspase-1 inhibitor. Macrophages were treated with Nigericin, a known potassium ionophore, and the level of IL-1 β was determined in the culture supernatants. There was increased secretion of IL-1 β from infected macrophages in response to stimulation with Nigericin at early time points, 6 h [\(Figure 5](#page-5-0)B) however, this trend was no longer observed at 48 h ([Figure 5C](#page-5-0)). Following the addition of YVAD, there was approximately a 4-fold reduction in the level of IL-1 β release following stimulation of macrophages with Nigericin ([Figure 5B](#page-5-0)). The addition of Nigericin had no effect on the secretion of other pro-inflammatory cytokines such as TNF- α from M. tuberculosis infected macrophages (data not shown). These data demonstrate that Nigericin induces the secretion of IL-1 β by caspase-1 alone; however, the failure of caspase-1 inhibition to completely inhibit IL-1 β secretion suggests M. tuberculosis may utilise other caspase-1 independent pathways to induce optimal secretion of IL-1 β from macrophages.

3.5. Some serine protease inhibitors block M. tuberculosis induced secretion of IL-1 β in macrophages

A number of proteases in addition to caspase-1 have been linked to the maturation of IL-1 β including serine proteases, which are known to be involved in the alternative-processing pathway leading to the maturation of $IL-1\beta$,^{[27](#page-8-0)} We therefore tested inhibitors of series proteined from serine proteases for their capacity to block IL-1 β secretion from M. tuberculosis infected macrophages [\(Figure 6](#page-6-0)A). These included serine protease inhibitors TPCK, TLCK and AEBSF. Some of these agents can also inhibit NFkB, therefore we also assessed their effect in comparison to formal NF κ B inhibition and TNF- α expression ([Figure 6B](#page-6-0)). Treatment of macrophages with TPCK following M. tuberculosis infection led to a significant decrease in IL-1 β secretion, especially in the low and moderate IL-1 β -expressing strains ([Figure 6A](#page-6-0)). This level of inhibition was further enhanced by

Figure 3. Expression of IL-1 β mRNA and pro IL-1 β in macrophages is not influenced by the genotype of M. tuberculosis. Macrophages were infected with M. tuberculosis at a MOI of 5 and (A) expression of IL-1 β mRNA at 6 h and 24 h post-infection was determined using real-time PCR. Fold change represents increased IL-1 β transcript expression over uninfected cells (B) Levels of pro IL-1ß was assayed by western blot at 6 h and 24 h in the lysates of M. tuberculosis infected macrophages. For the real-time PCR experiments, data represents means \pm SD of two independent experiments.

the addition of TPCK in combination with YVAD, which markedly reduced the secretion of IL-1 β with all the *M. tuberculosis* isolates tested [\(Figure 6](#page-6-0)A).

The inhibitory effect of TPCK and to a lesser extent TLCK on IL- 1β secretion was partially dependent on NFKB inhibition, as they also reduced the release of TNF- α from infected macrophages. However, the inhibitor AEBSF specifically inhibited release of only IL-1 β [\(Figure 7A](#page-6-0)) and not TNF- α [\(Figure 7B](#page-6-0)); suggesting AEBSF may specifically target an alternative, protease-dependent pathway of IL-1 β expression from M. tuberculosis-infected macrophages.

3.6. IL-1 β production in M. tuberculosis infected macrophages does not correlate with host cell death

Cell death is an effective innate immune response to M. tuberculosis infection. To measure the association between cell death and IL-1b release, we quantified histone associated DNA complexes in the cytoplasmic fraction to determine apoptosis. The supernatant from M. tuberculosis infected macrophages was used to quantify necrotic DNA release by ELISA. Strains of M. tuberculosis were varied in their ability to cause cell death in macrophages. However, neither the apoptotic (correlation

Figure 4. Heat-killed strains of M. tuberculosis stimulate less IL-1 β secretion from macrophages than viable bacteria. Bone marrow macrophages were stimulated with nine heatkilled strains of M. tuberculosis and BCG for 48 h. IL-1 β concentrations in the supernatants were determined by ELISA (A). Levels of pro-IL-1 β in the cell lysates were assayed by western blot at 6 h and 24 h (B). The cytokine data represents mean \pm SD of three independent experiments.

Figure 5. IL-1 β secretion is partially dependent on caspase-1. Macrophages were infected with M. tuberculosis at a MOI of 5 and (A) levels of pro-caspase-1 were measured by western blot at 6 h and 24 h. Infected macrophages were treated with 20 µM caspase-1 inhibitor (Ac-YVAD-AOM) or treated with 5 µM Nigericin individually or in succession. Cytokine concentrations for IL-1 β was analysed in the supernatants by ELISA at 6 h (B) and 48 h (C). The absolute values of IL-1 β are expressed as a fold change over control strains.

coefficient $= -0.552$ and p-value $= 0.123$) nor the necrotic cell death (correlation coefficient = 0.067 p-value = 0.865) correlated with the amount of IL-1 β released from infected macrophages ([Figure 8](#page-7-0)A and B).

To examine if the cell death was dependent on caspase-1, we treated macrophages with a caspase-1 inhibitor and determined cell death in response to M. tuberculosis infection. We found that cell death was independent of caspase-1 signalling pathway ([Figure 8C\)](#page-7-0). These results suggest that virulence determinants in the strains tested are unlikely to contribute to the differential secretion of IL-1 β by manipulating the level of cell death in macrophages.

4. Discussion

There is substantially more genetic variation amongst clinical isolates of *M. tuberculosis* than previously considered, 28 28 28 which may contribute to the longstanding appreciation that some strains are more virulent than others, although the mechanisms underpinning this have proved elusive. Macrophages secrete IL-1β in response to
M. tuberculosis infection,^{[2,4](#page-8-0)} but most of the published work used the laboratory strain H37Rv,^{[6,25](#page-8-0)} which was isolated from a patient with tuberculosis in 1905 and is therefore of questionable relevance to currently circulating clinical isolates of M. tuberculosis. Indeed, the variable ability of clinical isolates of *M. tuberculosis* to induce IL-1 β secretion from macrophages has not been described.

In this study, we report that clinical isolates of M. tuberculosis vary in their capacity to induce IL-1 β secretion from macrophages in vitro. In agreement with previous reports our data also suggests

that IL-1 β secretion is dependent on a functional ESX-1 secretion
system since BCC failed to induce IL-18 secretion $6,13,14$ An overview system since BCG failed to induce IL-1 β secretion.^{[6,13,14](#page-8-0)} An overview
of the panel of screened isolates shows groups of strains that could of the panel of screened isolates shows groups of strains that could induce high, moderate or low levels of IL-1 β from macrophages. The synthesis of pro-IL-1 β and the release of its mature form is a highly regulated multi-step process that includes transcription of the IL-1 β gene and its translation into pro-IL-1 β , conversion of pro-IL-1 β into the mature form, which is finally released into the external environment.^{[29,30](#page-8-0)} It has been reported that the primary pathway of IL-1 β induction is regulated at the level of microbial recognition by PRRs involving TLR2/6 and NOD2 signalling pathways.³¹ Our findings reveal that all isolates of *M. tuberculosis* tested are able to up regulate the transcription of the IL-1 β mRNA in macrophages, although the levels of the 31 kDa immature form of IL-1 β present are similar. Hence it is likely that the difference noted in the secretion of active IL-1 β is not regulated by PRRs but by secondary pathways involving the inflammasome and caspase-1 activation.

Secretion of IL-1 β is dependent on the viability of the bacteria as heat-killed strains had a substantially reduced capacity to induce secretion. In contrast, it has been reported by others that both heatkilled and viable M. tuberculosis H37Rv induced similar levels of IL- 1β from infected peripheral blood mononuclear cells.^{[31](#page-8-0)} Conversely, heat-killed *M. marinum* was impaired in its ability to induce IL-1 β secretion from bone marrow derived macrophages.^{[13](#page-8-0)} This discrepancy could be explained by differences in experimental setup such as of the mycobacteria used, bacterial burden, and the cell type. Despite these discrepancies, our results strongly support the idea that live M. tuberculosis actively modulates signalling

Figure 6. Reduced IL-1ß and TNF-a secretion from M. tuberculosis infected macrophages in the presence of some serine protease inhibitors. M. tuberculosis infected macrophages were treated with 50 µM TPCK, 50 µM TLCK and 20 µM caspase-1 individually or in tandem. Cytokine concentrations for IL-1 β (A) and TNF- α (B) were analysed in the supernatants by ELISA at 48 h. The absolute values of cytokines are expressed as a fold change over control strains. Data represents mean \pm SD of two independent experiments.

Figure 7. The protease inhibitor AEBSF specifically inhibits IL-1 β secretion from M. tuberculosis infected macrophages. M. tuberculosis infected macrophages were treated with 100 µM AEBSF and 20 µM caspase-1 inhibitor. Cytokine concentrations for IL-1 β (A) and TNF- α (B) were analysed in the supernatants by ELISA at 48 h. The absolute values of cytokines are expressed as a fold change over control strains. Data presented is from one experiment only.

Figure 8. IL-1β secretion from M. tuberculosis infected macrophages does not correlate with cell death. Bone marrow derived macrophages were infected with M. tuberculosis at a
MOI of 5 for 48 h. The amount of necrotic DN Infected macrophages were stimulated with 20 µM caspase-1 inhibitor (YVAD) or treated with 5 µM, Nigericin. After 48 h cell death was measured using ELISA (C). Data represents mean \pm SD of three independent experiments.

pathways downstream of pro-IL-1 β formation, to ensure IL-1 β secretion into the external environment.

Caspase-1 is a cysteine protease known to play an important role in the cleavage of pro-IL-1 β to mature IL-1 β .^{[32](#page-9-0)} In our study, inhibition of caspase-1 led to a decrease in U-18 production by inhibition of caspase-1 led to a decrease in IL-1 β production by macrophages, consistent with previous studies.^{5,25} However, this inhibition was only partial suggesting a role for an upstream caspase-1 independent pathway for optimal secretion of IL-1b. These findings suggest an incomplete but vital role for caspase-1 in the release of IL-1 β in vitro. In vivo, caspase-1, ASC and NALP3 are shown to be dispensable for the host resistance to M. tuberculosis infection.[5,33,34](#page-8-0) Hence, it seems likely that caspase-1 independent pathways play a prominent role in the secretion of IL-1 β . An attempt to rescue the partial inhibition of IL-1 β by the addition of Nigericin, a known inducer of potassium efflux in macrophages, was unsuccessful. Thus, virulent M. tuberculosis activates a potent potassium efflux, which cannot be further enhanced by an external stimulus. Consequently the observed variability of IL-1 β secretion from M. tuberculosis-infected macrophages cannot be accounted for by the inability of some isolates to induce a potassium efflux.

A marked inhibition of IL-1 β release was achieved using the serine protease inhibitors, TPCK, TLCK and AEBSF. Published reports show that the inhibitors TPCK and TLCK are also able to block the activation of NF_KB by inhibiting the phosphorylation of I_KB ^{35,36} Our results support these observations since the addition of TPCK and to a lesser extent TLCK, led to a decrease in TNF- α secretion, which is also dependent on NFkB activation. Interestingly the protease inhibitor AEBSF had no effect on TNF-a secretion from M. tuberculosisinfected macrophages, making it plausible that other serine proteases, independent of caspase-1, play a role in the processing of pro-IL-1b. Further experiments using more targeted approaches such as siRNA will be required to determine the involvement of serine proteases in the processing of pro-IL-1 β .

Activation of caspase-1 is dependent on a multi-protein structure, the inflammasome, which is activated by microbial ligands and danger signals. The downstream consequences of inflammasome activation include release of IL-1 β /IL-18 and pyroptosis, a form of cell death considered to be dependent on caspase-1 activation.³⁷ We demonstrate that IL-1 β secretion is accompanied by cell death in macrophages during M. tuberculosis infection. Furthermore, the form of cell death observed in our model was unlikely to be pyroptosis, as inhibition of caspase-1 by YVAD had no significant effect on the cell death induced in macrophages; an observation in agreement with previous reports.[25,38](#page-8-0) Based on our observation of the enrichment of oligonucleosomes in the cytoplasmic fraction of cell lysates, we suggest that it is apoptotic cell death. Macrophage apoptosis represents a key component of the host immune response to M. tuberculosis infection, which leads to a decrease in mycobacterial viability, a mechanism favoured by the host to remove and clear the pathogen. However, we found infection of macrophages with M. tuberculosis also led to increased levels of necrotic DNA in the supernatant. Previous studies have reported that bacterial burden is a crucial factor that determines the type of cell death induced in M. tuberculosis infected macrophages^{25,39}; it is likely that key factors such as the genetic background of the infecting bacterial strain also influence the type of cell death.^{40,41} Overall, the findings suggest that cell death accompanies the release of IL-1 β but it is unlikely to be the determining factor for the differential induction of IL-1 β observed in M. tuberculosis infected macrophages.

ESX-1 substrates like ESAT-6 are reported to be involved in the activation of caspase-1.¹⁶ From sequencing analysis, we could not detect any sequence variation in esxA (Rv3875) or esxB (Rv3874), the genes encoding ESAT-6 and CFP-10 (unpublished data). This observation agrees with two recent studies that assessed the genetic diversity in a large collection of clinical isolates of M. tuberculosis. These studies reported that the lack genetic variation in esxA and esxB likely confirms the conserved nature of these proteins.[42,43](#page-9-0) Consequently, it is unlikely that strain-dependent differences in IL-1b secretion observed here are due to changes in EsxA or EsxB.

Enzymes other than caspase-1 have been reported to cleave pro-IL-1 β into the mature form. Neutrophil derived serine proteases, aspartyl proteases from Candida albicans and cysteine proteases from *Streptococcus pyogenes* all directly cleave IL-1 β .^{[44,45](#page-9-0)} Thus, it is
plausible that mycobacterial proteases might also be capable of plausible that mycobacterial proteases might also be capable of processing pro-IL-1 β , and future studies will address this possibility.

In conclusion, we demonstrate that macrophages infected with a panel of clinical isolates of M . tuberculosis secrete IL-1 β . The pathways that control secretion of IL-1 β are dependent on both caspase-1 and serine proteases. Although cell death is an important consequence of M. tuberculosis infection of macrophages, it does not seem to play a role in the differential secretion of IL-1 β . Further delineation of the protease-dependent pathways will provide an insight into the complex regulatory mechanisms that control IL-1 β secretion in M. tuberculosis infected macrophages.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank the Hospital for Tropical Diseases and Pham Ngoc Thach Hospital for Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam, who provided the clinical isolates. We also thank Douglas Young for invaluable discussions.

This work was supported by the Wellcome Trust (078126), United Kingdom.

Funding: Wellcome Trust.

Competing interest: None declared.

Ethical approval: Not required.

References

- 1. [Huynh KK, Joshi SA, Brown EJ. A delicate dance: host response to mycobacteria.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref1) [Curr Opin Immunol](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref1) 2011;23:464-[72](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref1).
- 2. [Juffermans NP, Florquin S, Camoglio L, Verbon A, Kolk AH, Speelman P, van](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref2) [Deventer SJ, van Der Poll T. Interleukin-1 signaling is essential for host defense](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref2) [during murine pulmonary tuberculosis.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref2) J Infect Dis 2000;1[8](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref2)2:902-8.
- 3. [Fremond CM, Togbe D, Doz E, Rose S, Vasseur V, Maillet I, Jacobs M, Ryffel B,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref3) [Quesniaux VF. IL-1 receptor-mediated signal is an essential component of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref3) [MyD88-dependent innate response to](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref3) Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. [J Immunol](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref3) 2007;179:1178-[89.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref3)
- 4. [Sugawara I, Yamada H, Hua S, Mizuno S. Role of interleukin \(IL\)-1 type 1 re](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref4)[ceptor in mycobacterial infection.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref4) Microbiol Immunol 2001;45:743-[50.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref4)
- 5. [Mayer-Barber KD, Barber DL, Shenderov K, White SD, Wilson MS, Cheever A,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref5) [Kugler D, Hieny S, Caspar P, Nunez G, Schlueter D, Flavell RA, Sutterwala FS,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref5)

[Sher A. Caspase-1 independent IL-1beta production is critical for host resis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref5)tance to Mycobacterium tuberculosis [and does not require TLR signaling in vivo.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref5) [J Immunol](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref5) 2010;184:3326-[30.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref5)

- 6. [Novikov A, Cardone M, Thompson R, Shenderov K, Kirschman KD, Mayer-](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref6)[Barber KD, Myers TG, Rabin RL, Trinchieri G, Sher A, Feng CG.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref6) Mycobacterium tuberculosis [triggers host type I IFN signaling to regulate IL-1beta production in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref6) [human macrophages.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref6) *J Immunol* 2011;187:2540-[7.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref6)
- 7. [Dinarello CA. Biologic basis for interleukin-1 in disease.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref7) Blood 1996;87: $2095 - 147$ $2095 - 147$ $2095 - 147$
- 8. [Takeuchi O, Akira S. Pattern recognition receptors and in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref8)flammation. Cell 2010:140:805-[20.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref8)
- 9. [Franchi L, Eigenbrod T, Munoz-Planillo R, Nunez G. The in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref9)flammasome: a [caspase-1-activation platform that regulates immune responses and disease](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref9) [pathogenesis.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref9) Nat Immunol $2009:10:241-7$ $2009:10:241-7$.
- 10. Mariathasan [S, Weiss DS, Newton K, McBride J, O](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref10)'Rourke K, Roose-Girma M, [Lee WP, Weinrauch Y, Monack DM, Dixit VM. Cryopyrin activates the in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref10)flam[masome in response to toxins and ATP.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref10) Nature $2006:440:228-32$.
- 11. [Mishra BB, Rathinam VA, Martens GW, Martinot AJ, Kornfeld H, Fitzgerald KA,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref11) [Sassetti CM. Nitric oxide controls the immunopathology of tuberculosis by](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref11) inhibiting NLRP3 infl[ammasome-dependent processing of IL-1beta.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref11) Nat $Immunol$ 2012 \cdot 14 \cdot 52-[60.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref11)
- 12. [Gringhuis SI, Kaptein TM, Wevers BA, Theelen B, van der Vlist M, Boekhout T,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref12) [Geijtenbeek TB. Dectin-1 is an extracellular pathogen sensor for the induction](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref12) [and processing of IL-1beta via a noncanonical caspase-8 in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref12)flammasome. Nat [Immunol](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref12) 2012:13:246-[54.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref12)
- 13. [Koo IC, Wang C, Raghavan S, Morisaki JH, Cox JS, Brown EJ. ESX-1-dependent](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref13) [cytolysis in lysosome secretion and in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref13)flammasome activation during myco[bacterial infection.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref13) Cell Microbiol 2008;10:1866-[78](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref13).
- 14. [Kurenuma T, Kawamura I, Hara H, Uchiyama R, Daim S, Dewamitta SR, Sakai S,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref14) [Tsuchiya K, Nomura T, Mitsuyama M. The RD1 locus in the](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref14) Mycobacterium tuberculosis [genome contributes to activation of caspase-1 via induction of po](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref14)tassium ion effl[ux in infected macrophages.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref14) Infect Immun 2009;77:3992-[4001](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref14).
- 15. [Carlsson F, Kim J, Dumitru C, Barck KH, Carano RA, Sun M, Diehl L, Brown EJ.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref15) [Host-detrimental role of Esx-1-mediated in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref15)flammasome activation in myco[bacterial infection.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref15) PLoS Pathog 2010;6:e1000895.
- 16. [Mishra BB, Moura-Alves P, Sonawane A, Hacohen N, Grif](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref16)fiths G, Moita LF, Anes E. Mycobacterium tuberculosis [protein ESAT-6 is a potent activator of the](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref16) [NLRP3/ASC in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref16)flammasome. Cell Microbiol 2010;12:1046-[63](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref16).
- 17. Oddo [M, Renno T, Attinger A, Bakker T, MacDonald HR, Meylan PR. Fas ligand](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref17)[induced apoptosis of infected human macrophages reduces the viability of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref17) intracellular [Mycobacterium tuberculosis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref17). J Immunol 1998;160:[54](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref17)48-54.
- 18. [Molloy A, Laochumroonvorapong P, Kaplan G. Apoptosis, but not necrosis, of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref18) [infected monocytes is coupled with killing of intracellular bacillus Calmette-](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref18)Guerin. [J Exp Med](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref18) 1994;180:1499-[509.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref18)
- 19. [Hsu T, Hingley-Wilson SM, Chen B, Chen M, Dai AZ, Morin PM, Marks CB,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref19) [Padiyar J, Goulding C, Gingery M, Eisenberg D, Russell RG, Derrick SC, Collins FM,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref19) [Morris SL, King CH, Jacobs WR. The primary mechanism of attenuation of bacillus](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref19) [Calmette-Guerin is a loss of secreted lytic function required for invasion of lung](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref19) interstitial tissue. [Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref19) 2003;100:12420-5
- 20. [Lewis KN, Liao R, Guinn KM, Hickey MJ, Smith S, Behr MA, Sherman DR.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref20) Deletion of RD1 from [Mycobacterium tuberculosis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref20) mimics bacille Calmette-[Guerin attenuation.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref20) *J Infect Dis* 2003;187:117-[23](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref20).
- 21. [Wong KW, Jacobs Jr WR. Critical role for NLRP3 in necrotic death triggered by](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref21) [Mycobacterium tuberculosis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref21). Cell Microbiol 2011;13:1371-[84.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref21)
- 22. [Hogquist KA, Unanue ER, Chaplin DD. Release of IL-1 from mononuclear](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref22) [phagocytes.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref22) J Immunol 1991;147:2181-[6](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref22).
- 23. [Krishnan N, Malaga W, Constant P, Caws M, Tran TH, Salmons J, Nguyen TN,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref23) [Nguyen DB, Daffe M, Young DB, Robertson BD, Guilhot C, Thwaites GE.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref23) Mycobacterium tuberculosis lineage infl[uences innate immune response and viru](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref23)[lence and is associated with distinct cell envelope lipid pro](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref23)files. PLoS One 2011;6[:e23870.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref23)
- 24. [Portevin D, Gagneux S, Comas I, Young D. Human macrophage responses to](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref24) clinical isolates from the [Mycobacterium tuberculosis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref24) complex discriminate [between ancient and modern lineages.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref24) PLoS Pathog 2011;7:e1001307.
- 25. [Welin A, Eklund D, Stendahl O, Lerm M. Human macrophages infected with a](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref25) [high burden of ESAT-6-expressing M. tuberculosis undergo caspase-1- and](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref25) [cathepsin B-independent necrosis.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref25) PLoS One 2011;6:e20302.
- 26. [Franchi L, Kanneganti TD, Dubyak GR, Nunez G. Differential requirement of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref26) P2X7 receptor and intracellular K + [for caspase-1 activation induced by intra](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref26)[cellular and extracellular bacteria.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref26) J Biol Chem 2007;282:18810-[8.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref26)
- 27. [Joosten LA, Netea MG, Fantuzzi G, Koenders MI, Helsen MM, Sparrer H,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref27) [Pham CT, van der Meer JW, Dinarello CA, van den Berg WB. In](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref27)flammatory arthritis in caspase 1 gene-defi[cient mice: contribution of proteinase 3 to](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref27) [caspase 1-independent production of bioactive interleukin-1beta.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref27) Arthritis [Rheum](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref27) 2009;60:3651-[62](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref27).
- 28. [Comas I, Gagneux S. The past and future of tuberculosis research.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref28) PLoS Pathog 2009;5[:e1000600](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref28).
- 29. [Netea MG, Simon A, van de Veerdonk F, Kullberg BJ, Van der Meer JW,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref29) [Joosten LA. IL-1beta processing in host defense: beyond the in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref29)flammasomes. [PLoS Pathog](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref29) 2010;6:e1000661.
- 30. Mariathasan S, Monack DM. Infl[ammasome adaptors and sensors: intracellular](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref30) [regulators of infection and in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref30)flammation. Nat Rev Immunol 2007;7:31-[40](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref30).
- 31. [Kleinnijenhuis J, Joosten LA, van de Veerdonk FL, Savage N, van Crevel R,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref31) [Kullberg BJ, van der Ven A, Ottenhoff TH, Dinarello CA, van der Meer JW,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref31) Netea MG. Transcriptional and infl[ammasome-mediated pathways for the](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref31)

[induction of IL-1beta production by](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref31) Mycobacterium tuberculosis. Eur J Immunol 2009;39[:1914](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref31)-[22.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref31)

- 32. Martinon F, Tschopp J. Infl[ammatory caspases: linking an intracellular innate](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref32) [immune system to autoin](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref32)flammatory diseases. Cell 2004 ; 117:561-[74.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref32)
- 33. Walter K, Holscher C, Tschopp J, Ehlers S, NALP3 is not necessary for early pro[tection against experimental tuberculosis.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref33) *Immunobiology* $2010;215:804-11$.
- 34. [McElvania Tekippe E, Allen IC, Hulseberg PD, Sullivan JT, McCann JR, Sandor M,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref34) [Braunstein M, Ting JP. Granuloma formation and host defense in chronic](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref34) Mycobacterium tuberculosis [infection requires PYCARD/ASC but not NLRP3 or](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref34) [caspase-1.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref34) PLoS One 2010;5:e12320.
- 35. [Ha KH, Byun MS, Choi J, Jeong J, Lee KJ, Jue DM. N-tosyl-L-phenylalanine chlor](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref35)[omethyl ketone inhibits NF-kappaB activation by blocking speci](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref35)fic cysteine [residues of IkappaB kinase beta and p65/RelA.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref35) Biochemistry 2009;48:7271-[8.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref35)
- 36. [Miyamoto S, Maki M, Schmitt MJ, Hatanaka M, Verma IM. Tumor necrosis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref36) [factor alpha-induced phosphorylation of I kappa B alpha is a signal for its](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref36) [degradation but not dissociation from NF-kappa B.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref36) Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A $1994.91.12740 - 4$ $1994.91.12740 - 4$ $1994.91.12740 - 4$
- 37. Miao EA, Leaf IA, Treuting PM, Mao DP, Dors M, Sarkar A, Warren SE, Wewers MD, Aderem A. Caspase-1-induced pyroptosis is an innate immune effector mecha-
[nism against intracellular bacteria.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref37) *Nat Immunol 2010;11:1136–[42](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref37).*
- 38. O'Sullivan MP, O'[Leary S, Kelly DM, Keane J. A caspase-independent pathway](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref38) [mediates macrophage cell death in response to](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref38) Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. [Infect Immun](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref38) 2007;75:1984-[93](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref38).
- 39. [Lee J, Remold HG, Ieong MH, Kornfeld H. Macrophage apoptosis in response to](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref39) [high intracellular burden of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref39) Mycobacterium tuberculosis is mediated by a novel [caspase-independent pathway.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref39) J Immunol 2006;176:4267-[74.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref39)
- 40. [Lasunskaia E, Ribeiro SC, Manicheva O, Gomes LL, Suffys PN, Mokrousov I,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref40) [Ferrazoli L, Andrade MR, Kritski A, Otten T, Kipnis TL, da Silva WD,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref40) [Vishnevsky B, Oliveira MM, Gomes HM, Baptista IF, Narvskaya O. Emerging](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref40) multidrug resistant Mycobacterium tuberculosis [strains of the Beijing genotype](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref40) [circulating in Russia express a pattern of biological properties associated with](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref40) [enhanced virulence.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref40) Microbes Infect 2010;12:467-[75](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref40).
- 41. [Sohn H, Lee KS, Kim SY, Shin DM, Shin SJ, Jo EK, Park JK, Kim HJ. Induction of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref41) [cell death in human macrophages by a highly virulent Korean isolate of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref41) Mycobacterium tuberculosis [and the virulent strain H37Rv.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref41) Scand J Immunol $2009;69:43-50.$ $2009;69:43-50.$ $2009;69:43-50.$ $2009;69:43-50.$
- 42. [Davila J, Zhang L, Marrs CF, Durmaz R, Yang Z. Assessment of the genetic di](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref42)versity of Mycobacterium tuberculosis [esxA, esxH, and fbpB genes among clin](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref42)[ical isolates and its implication for the future immunization by new](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref42) [tuberculosis subunit vaccines Ag85B-ESAT-6 and Ag85B-TB10.4.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref42) J Biomed Biotechnol 2010;2010[:208371.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref42)
- 43. [Uplekar S, Heym B, Friocourt V, Rougemont J, Cole ST. Comparative genomics](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref43) [of Esx genes from clinical isolates of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref43) Mycobacterium tuberculosis provides [evidence for gene conversion and epitope variation.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref43) Infect Immun 2011;79: $4042 - 9$ $4042 - 9$
- 44. [Beausejour A, Grenier D, Goulet JP, Deslauriers N. Proteolytic activation of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref44) [the interleukin-1beta precursor by](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref44) Candida albicans. Infect Immun 1998;66: [676](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref44)-[81](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref44)
- 45. [Kapur V, Majesky MW, Li LL, Black RA, Musser JM. Cleavage of interleukin 1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref45) [beta \(IL-1 beta\) precursor to produce active IL-1 beta by a conserved extra](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref45)[cellular cysteine protease from](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1472-9792(13)00097-8/sref45) Streptococcus pyogenes. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A $1993.90.7676 - 80$