Meta-analysis on integrative medicine for the treatment of malignant ascites: a comparative study

Li Yuan, Lou Yanni, Deng Bo, Jia Liqun

Li Yuan, Lou Yanni, Deng Bo, Jia Liqun, Oncology Department of Integrative Medicine, China-Japan Friendship Hospital, Beijing 100029, China
Supported by Key Projects of Beijing Municipal Science and Technology Commission (No. #D131100002213004)
Correspondence to: Prof. Lou Yanni, Oncology Department of Integrative Medicine, China-Japan Friendship Hospital, Beijing 100029, China. louyanni@hotmail.com
Telephone: +86-18601327716
Accepted: February 28, 2014

Abstract

OBJECTIVE: To compare the efficacy of integrated Chinese and Western Medicine with that of only Western Medicine for the treatment of malignant ascites.

METHODS: All randomized controlled trials (January 2004 to March 2013) from the China National Knowledge Infrastructure Database, Chinese Biomedical Literature Database, and Wanfang Database were searched with keywords. Meta-analysis was conducted by combining the odds ratios of the individual studies. Review Manager 5.0 was used for the analysis.

RESULTS: One thousand one hundred and fifty-six patients from 19 randomized controlled trails were included. Of them, 630 patients were treated with integrated Chinese and Western Medicine (the integrative group), and 526 patients were treated with Western Medicine alone (the control group). The Meta-analysis showed that the total effective rate was 78.73% in the integrated group, and 59.13% in the control group. The effective percentage was significantly higher in the integrative group than that of the control group [OR = 2.85, 95% CI (2.16, 3.74), P < 0.01].

CONCLUSION: The short-term curative effect in the integrative group was better than that in the control group. Integrative medicine may be beneficial for malignant ascites.

Key words: Ascites; Integrative medicine; Treatment outcome; Meta-analysis

INTRODUCTION

Malignant ascites is a common complication of late malignant tumors. Ascites is a symbol of advanced cancer, and seriously affects patient quality of life. Patients in poor physical condition have numerous clinical symptoms, and often cannot tolerate chemotherapy or radiotherapy. Moreover, patients in the late stages of cancer are usually not sensitive to chemotherapy, radiotherapy, or other anti-tumor strategies, and survival time is usually only 3-6 months. Therefore, malignant ascites is a major problem in clinical oncology.

Many studies have investigated the treatment of malignant ascites with Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM). Therefore, therapeutic principles and effective prescriptions of Chinese medicine have been established. TCM plays an increasingly important role in treating malignant ascites. In the present study, we searched randomized controlled trials (RCTs) (published from January 2004 to March 2013 in China) for studies investigating TCM treatment of malignant ascites. In this Meta-analysis, we assessed the disease entities, syndrome differentiation, therapeutic principles and methods, and curative effects.
MATERIALS AND METHODS

Literature selection strategy

We reviewed all retrieved articles to find relevant statistics and analysis.

Inclusion criteria
Studies were included if: (a) they could be defined as controlled trials; (b) the patients in the study were diagnosed to have malignant ascites by cytology or pathology; (c) the general data between the groups in age, gender, stages, and pathological types were comparable.

Exclusion criteria
We excluded any non-controlled trials, theoretical discussions, literature reviews, and studies in which the data could not be used or was not in accordance with the inclusion criteria.

Therapeutic methods for malignant ascites
In the control group, only Western Medicine treatment was adopted, including abdominocentesis, ascites drawing, and cisplatin and/or interleukin 2 (IL-2) peritoneal perfusion. In the integrative group, conventional Western Medicine treatment was used plus TCM treatment. TCM treatments included decoctions for oral administration, external application, and peritoneal perfusion.

Criteria for short-term curative effect
Ascites was assessed by ultrasound in reference to Response Evaluation Criteria in Solid Tumors. Complete response: disappearance of ascites, confirmed at ≥ 4 weeks; partial response: ≥ 50% decrease from baseline, confirmed at ≥ 4 weeks; progressive disease: ≥ 25% increase from baseline; stable disease: met neither PR nor PD criteria, confirmed at ≥ 4 weeks. The total response rate was CR + PR.

Data extraction and statistical analysis
The following information was extracted from each of the eligible included publications: disease entities, TCM syndrome types, TCM therapeutic principles and methods, and curative effect. We performed a systematic review following recommendations of the Cochrane Collaboration (Higgins 2011) using Review Manager 5 (RevMan 2011), produced and updated by Cochrane Collaboration. The between-study heterogeneity was assessed using the Cochrane’s Chi-square test, if \( P > 0.05 \), a fixed-effect model was used; if \( P < 0.05 \), a random-effect model was used. The Meta-analysis was conducted by combining the odds ratios of the individual studies and followed the sensitivity analysis. Funnel plots were used to assess the potential publication bias.

Data synthesis
Data synthesis involved number of the patients, TCM syndrome types, Chinese herbal medicines used, and therapeutic effects.

RESULTS

Results of literature retrieval
Sixty-four references were collected initially, and 19 papers met all the inclusion criteria. All non-controlled trials were excluded, and TCM theoretical research, reviews, animal experiments, case reports, and nursing research were also excluded. A total of 1156 patients were reported in 19 studies, including 526 patients treated with Western Medicine (the control group) and 630 patients treated with integrated Chinese and Western Medicine (the integrative group). The control group was treated with abdominocentesis and ascites drawing, followed by IL-2 and/or cisplatin intraperitoneal injection. The integrative group was treated with Western Medicine and at the same time given Chinese herbal medicines for oral administration or external application.

Disease entity
Disease entities of the patients included liver cancer (426 cases), ovarian cancer (238 cases), colorectal cancer (154 cases), gastric cancer (145 cases), pancreatic cancer (32 cases), lung cancer (22 cases), breast cancer (11 cases), cervical cancer (5 cases), small intestinal cancer (3 cases), esophageal carcinoma (3 cases), bile duct carcinoma (2 cases), and other types of cancer (33 cases). Disease entities were not presented in one study that included 45 patients. Thirty-seven gastrointestinal cancer cases were reported in another study.

TCM syndrome types
No unified standards were used for differentiation of the TCM syndrome types. There were no TCM syndrome types listed in nine papers, especially for study of externally used Chinese herbs. The TCM syndrome types are generally: Qi stagnancy and toxin stasis syndrome (192 cases), Qi deficiency and blood stasis syndrome (185 cases), Qi deficiency and water retention syndrome (170 cases), spleen-kidney Yang deficiency syndrome (120 cases), deficiency of Yin and water-heat accumulation syndrome (80 cases), and damp obstruction because of spleen deficiency (61 cases).

Publication bias
The symmetry of the reversed funnel plot indicates no publication bias (Figure 1). The funnel plot is produced with OR as the X-axis, which represents the short-term effective rate of the integrative group versus the control group, and with log [OR] as the Y-axis. The included studies present a symmetrical funnel plot, indicating no publication bias.
The TCM therapeutic principles adopted were: tonifying Qi, strengthening the spleen, promoting diuresis, warming Yang, and activating blood. Six studies evaluated self-made oral prescriptions. Four studies evaluated modified oral prescriptions, including Zhenwu decoction (two studies), Zhuling decoction (one study), and Jiaweiwuling San (one study). Three studies evaluated Chinese patent medicines for peritoneal perfusion, including elemene injection, Kanglaite injection, and javanica oil emulsion injection combined with Kanglaite injection. Three studies evaluated self-made prescriptions for external application on the Shenque acupoint. Self-made herbal electuary ointment was used on the abdominal wall in two studies. One study evaluated Fufangkushen injection for intravenous infusion. The most commonly-used medicinal herbs were: Huangqi (Radix Astragali Mongolici), Baizhu (Rhizoma Atractylodis Macrocephalae), Guizhi (Ramulus Cinnamomii), Fuling (Poria), Zhuling (Polyporus), Zexie (Rhizoma Alismatis), Dafupi (Pericarpium Arecae), Danggui (Radix Angelicae Sinensis), and Ezhu (Rhizoma Curcumae Phaeocaulis).

Short-term curative effect

Curative effects in the integrative group and control group were presented in 19 studies (Figure 2). In the integrative group, 630 patients received TCM treatment combined with Western Medicine treatment. In the control group, 630 patients received only Western Medicine treatment. Heterogeneity was not found in these studies (heterogeneity $P = 0.67$), so the fixed-effect model was used. The results showed that the total effective rate was 78.73% in the integrative group, and 59.13% in the control group. The total effective rate of the integrative group was significantly higher than that of the control group ($OR = 2.85$, $95\% CI$ (2.16-3.74), $P < 0.01$). Therefore, the short-term curative effect of the integrative treatment was better than that of Western Medicine treatment.

DISCUSSION

Malignant ascites is a clinical manifestation of late-stage malignant tumors. Radiotherapy and chemotherapy cannot ameliorate malignant ascites. At present, Western Medicine treatments for malignant ascites mainly include diuresis, abdominal paracentesis, peritoneal drainage, chemotherapy or intraperitoneal chemotherapy, and intraperitoneal immunotherapy. These treatments have their advantages and shortcomings, so the total effects are limited. TCM treatments for malignant ascites include oral Chinese medicines, and Chinese medicinal preparations for external use or peritoneal perfusion. These treatments may reduce malignant ascites and ameliorate clinical symptoms. In addition, TCM treatments are convenient and cheap, and usually have fewer side effects. These medicines can therefore be used by all the patients in varying conditions.

We analyzed 19 clinical studies from China. The disease entities of patients in descending frequency were: liver cancer; ovarian cancer, gastric cancer, and colorectal cancer; lung cancer, breast cancer, and pancreatic cancer; and cervical cancer, small intestinal cancer, and esophageal carcinoma. These are in accordance with related clinical reports. TCM diagnosis and treatment are based on an overall analysis of the illness and the patient’s condition. This is the unique characteristic and advantage of TCM.
However, the TCM syndrome types, therapeutic principles, and methods are somewhat different in the 19 studies. Moreover, the preparations used are made by the researchers themselves with no unified standards. Therefore, the clinical outcomes are difficult to be popularize and standardize. Nevertheless, the most common TCM therapeutic principles are strengthening the spleen, tonifying Qi, and activating Qi to excrete water. Huangqi (Astragali Radix), Fuling (Poria Cocos), Zhuling (Polyopus Umbellatus), and Dafupi (Pericarpium Arcate) are the most commonly-used effective drugs for treating malignant ascites. Integrated Chinese and Western Medicine treatment was adopted in the integrative group. In this group, the therapeutic effects were much better than those in the control group. Therefore, TCM could be effective for treating malignant ascites. However, low quality studies are problematic in the consulted literatures. All 19 studies were single-centered with a non-blind method, and had relatively small sample sizes. The randomization methods were not illustrated, and no unified authoritative standards were used. A more convincing conclusion needs scientific and precise study design. Therefore, high-quality, multi-centered, and randomized controlled trials with large sample sizes are necessary.

REFERENCES


