OsteoArthritis and Cartilage (2007) **15**, 493–505 © 2006 Osteoarthritis Research Society International. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

doi:10.1016/j.joca.2006.10.009



Agonists of peroxisome proliferators-activated receptors (PPAR) α , β/δ or γ reduce transforming growth factor (TGF)- β -induced proteoglycans' production in chondrocytes

P. E. Poleni M.Sc., A. Bianchi Ph.D., S. Etienne M.Sc., M. Koufany B.Sc., S. Sebillaud B.Sc., P. Netter M.D., Ph.D., B. Terlain Pharm.D. and J. Y. Jouzeau Pharm.D., Ph.D.* *Laboratoire de Physiopathologie et Pharmacologie Articulaires (LPPA), UMR 7561 CNRS-UHP Nancy 1, Avenue de la Forêt de Haye, BP 184, 54505 Vandœuvre-lès-Nancy Cedex, France*

Summary

Objective: To investigate the potency of selective agonists of peroxisome proliferators-activated receptors' (PPAR) isotypes (α , β/δ or γ) to modulate the stimulating effect of transforming growth factor- β 1 (TGF- β 1) on proteoglycans' (PGs) synthesis in chondrocytes.

Method: Rat chondrocytes embedded in alginate beads and cultured under low serum conditions were exposed to TGF- β 1 (10 ng/ml), alone or in combination with the following agonists: Wy14643 for PPAR α , GW501516 for PPAR β/δ , rosiglitazone (ROSI) for PPAR γ , in the presence or absence of PPAR antagonists (GW6471 for PPAR α , GW9662 for PPAR γ). PGs' synthesis was evaluated by radiolabelled sulphate incorporation and glycosaminoglycans' (GAGs) content by Alcian blue staining of beads and colorimetric 1.9 dimethyl-methylene blue assay after beads' solubilization. Phosphorylation of Extracellular Signal-related Kinase1/2 (ERK1/2), Smad2/3 and p38-MAPK was assessed by Western Blot and production of prostaglandin E₂ (PGE₂) by Enzyme immuno-assay (EIA). Levels of mRNA for PPAR target genes [acyl-CoA oxidase (ACO) for PPAR α ; mitochondrial carnitin palmitoyl transferase-1 (CPT-1) for PPAR β/δ and adiponectin for PPAR γ], aggrecan, TGF- β 1 and genes control-ling GAGs' side chains' synthesis were quantified by real time polymerase chain reaction and normalized over RP29 housekeeping gene.

Results: ACO was selectively up-regulated by 100 μ M of Wy14643, CPT-1 by 100 nM of GW501516 and adiponectin by 10 μ M of ROSI without cell toxicity. TGF- β 1 increased PGs' synthesis by four-fold, GAGs' content and deposition by 3.5-fold and six-fold, respectively, while inducing aggrecan expression around 10-fold without modifying mRNA levels of GAGs' controlling enzymes. PPAR agonists inhibited the stimulating effect of TGF- β 1 by 24–44% on PGs' synthesis and over 75% on aggrecan, GAGs' content and deposition with the following rank order of potency: ROSI > GW501516 > Wy14643. TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3 and ERK1/2 was reduced by ROSI over GW501516 but not by Wy14643 whereas stimulated PGE₂ production was inhibited by Wy14643 over GW501516 but not by ROSI. The effect of PPAR agonists on PPAR target genes and TGF- β 1-induced aggrecan expression was reversed selectively by PPAR antagonists.

Conclusion: In chondrocytes' beads, PPAR agonists reduced the stimulating effect of TGF- β 1 on PGs by inhibiting TGF- β 1-induced aggrecan expression in an isotype-selective manner. Thus, PPAR agonists could be deleterious in situation of cartilage repair although being protective in situation of cartilage degradation.

© 2006 Osteoarthritis Research Society International. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Key words: PPAR, TGF-β1, Chondrocytes, Proteoglycans, Smads, ERK1/2, PGE₂, Alginate system.

Introduction

Transforming growth factor- β (TGF- β) is a multifunctional cytokine that plays an important role in immunomodulation, inflammation and tissue repair¹. In articular cartilage, TGF- β is a potent stimulator of chondrocytes' proliferation and differentiation², stimulates synthesis of cartilage-specific collagen type II or aggrecan³ and modulates matrix metalloproteases' (MMPs) activities by increasing synthesis of their natural tissue inhibitors⁴. Therefore, TGF- β is thought to play a crucial role in the maintenance and repair of articular cartilage, all the more that it counteracts the suppressive effect of inflammatory cytokines on proteoglycans' (PGs)

*Address correspondence and reprint requests to: Prof Jean-Yves Jouzeau, Pharm.D., Ph.D., UMR 7561 CNRS-Université Henri Poincaré Nancy 1, Avenue de la Forêt de Haye, BP 184, 54505 Vandœuvre-lès-Nancy Cedex, France. Tel: 33-(3)-83-68-39-50; Fax: 33-(3)-83-68-39-59; E-mail: jouzeau@medecine. uhp-nancy.fr

Received 29 June 2006; revision accepted 14 October 2006.

synthesis⁵, promotes the replenishment of PGs in arthritic conditions⁶ and stimulates PG synthesis more actively in OA than in healthy cartilage⁷. Despite its beneficial effects on the turnover of matrix components, TGF- β may have a pathological role in OA. Indeed, intra-articular administration⁸ or joint overexpression⁹ of TGF- β is inflammatory and fibrotic with appearance of chondrogenesis in the synovial lining. As a common finding, repeated injection¹⁰ or sustained expression⁹ leads to the synovial-layer-dependent formation of osteophytes. Finally, TGF- β can induce the expression of aggrecanase-1 in human synovial fibroblasts¹¹ and chondrocytes¹² with the subsequent release of matrix-derived neo-epitope, demonstrating its contribution to cartilage breakdown. Thus, this growth factor has a complex pathophysiological role in joint diseases depending variably on cartilage protection, bone remodelling and synovial inflammation.

Peroxisome proliferators-activated receptors (PPAR) are ligand-activated nuclear transcription factors belonging to the nuclear hormone receptor superfamily¹³. PPAR bind,

as a heterodimer with retinoid X receptor, to peroxisome proliferator-response elements (PPRE) located in the promoter of numerous genes involved in glucose and lipid homeostasis, and regulate their expression upon activation by agonists. PPAR consist of three mammalian subtypes, PPAR α , PPAR β/δ and PPAR γ , that are encoded by separate genes and differ in their tissue distribution¹⁴ and ligand specificity¹⁵. As a major component of their specificity for one receptor isotype, PPAR ligands differ greatly in their binding affinity between endogenous compounds and synthetic agonists. Thus, arachidonic acid metabolites, as leukotriene B₄ for PPAR α , prostaglandin I₂ for PPAR β/δ or 15-deoxy-prostaglandin J_2 (15d-PGJ₂) for PPAR γ^{15} are much less potent than pyrixinic acid (Wy14643) or fibrates for PPARa, GW501516 for PPAR β/δ or thiazolidinediones for PPAR γ^{16} . Albeit there is some overlapping, activation of PPAR isotypes is associated with major functions including oxidation of fatty acids in liver (mainly PPARa) and skeletal muscle (mainly PPARβ/δ) or differentiation of adipocytes in adipose tissue (mainly PPAR γ), opening insight to the treatment of metabolic syndrome and cardiovascular diseases¹⁷. PPAR are also implicated in the control of the inflammatory response¹⁸ and of epithelial repair pathways, with a key contribution of PPAR β/δ and PPAR γ to skin wound healing and liver or kidney fibrosis, respectively¹⁹. PPAR are expressed in articular cells²⁰ and their activation is associated with a reduced production of inflammatory cytokines and less activation of MMPs²¹ in cell culture systems or experimental arthropathy²². Although most studies were done with the endogenous PPARy agonist 15d-PGJ₂ or with thiazolidinediones, recent studies demonstrate that agonists of other PPAR isotypes may also have pathological relevance to joint cells. Thus, interleukin-1 (IL-1)βinduced expression of IL-1Ra was promoted by PPARa agonists in rabbit chondrocytes²³ while being potentiated by activation of PPAR β/δ in rat synovial fibroblasts²⁴. PPAR agonists may act therefore through activation of one or other PPAR isotype in joint cells.

Beside their classical cytokines' suppressive and metalloproteases' regulatory properties, PPAR agonists can inhibit the synthesis of extracellular matrix components in several cell types. Collagen synthesis is inhibited by thiazolidinediones in mesangial cells from diabetic rats²⁵ and by Wy14643 in hepatic stellate cells from rats with cholestatic liver fibrosis²⁶. Similarly, fibronectin synthesis is inhibited by pioglitazone in human kidney fibroblasts²⁷ whereas expression of decorin induced by non-esterified fatty acids is reduced by darglitazone, another thiazolidinedione, in human smooth muscle cells²⁸. In these cell types, PPAR agonists suppress also the stimulatory effect of TGF- β on collagens²⁹⁻³¹ and fibronectin³² synthesis. Such inhibition of extracellular matrix synthesis by PPAR agonists contributes to their preventive effect on fibrosis in skin³⁰, lung³¹ kidney³³ or liver²⁶. Thus, activation of PPAR is associated with a reduced synthesis of matrix components, which has therapeutical relevance in clinical situations of extracellular matrix overload but may be deleterious in diseases characterized by extracellular matrix depletion, such as advanced OA.

When considering the anti-fibrotic effect associated with PPAR activation in many organs and the stimulatory effect of TGF- β on extracellular matrix synthesis in cartilage, we investigated the ability of synthetic agonists of the three PPAR isotypes (α , β/δ or γ) to affect TGF- β 1-induced changes in PGs' synthesis in rat chondrocytes embedded in alginate beads. Using a panel of PPAR target genes and control experiments with isotype-selective antagonists,

we demonstrated that Wv14643. GW501516 and rosiglitazone (ROSI) induced preferentially PPARα, PPARβ/δ and PPAR_Y-dependent responses, respectively. In our culture system, we showed that the stimulating effect of TGF-B1 on PG synthesis and deposition was reduced by all PPAR agonists, with major changes for ROSI. Genes encoding enzymes involved in glycosaminoglycans' (GAGs) side chains' synthesis were poorly affected by TGF- β 1 and PPAR agonists, suggesting that PGs' depletion by PPAR agonists was supported mainly by inhibition of core protein expression. We demonstrated further that PPAR agonists affected differently several signalling pathways known to control aggrecan gene expression, with early TGF-B1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3 and ERK1/2 being reduced by ROSI over GW501516 but not by Wy14643 and late $TGF-\beta1$ -induced prostaglandin E_2 (PGE₂) production being inhibited by Wy14643 over GW501516 but not by ROSI. We demonstrated finally that the inhibitory effects of PPAR agonists occurred in an isotype-selective manner since inhibition of TGF- β 1-induced expression of aggrecan was reversed by a PPARa antagonist for Wy14643 and a PPARy antagonist for ROSI, without consistent effect of either antagonist on GW501516.

Materials and methods

CHONDROCYTE ISOLATION AND CULTURE IN ALGINATE

Normal articular cartilage was obtained from femoral heads of Wistar male rats (150-175 g; Charles River, L'Arbresle, France) killed under dissociative anaesthesia [ketamine (Mérial, Lyon, France) and acepromazine (Sanofi Santé Animale, Libourne, France)] in accordance with national animal care guidelines, after approval by our internal ethics committee. Chondrocytes were isolated by sequential enzymatic digestion of head caps using 0.15% pronase and 0.2% collagenase B (Roche Molecular Biochemicals, Meylan, France), then washed two times in phosphate buffered saline (PBS) and cultured to confluence in 75 cm² flasks at 37°C in a humidified atmosphere containing 5% CO₂. The medium used was Dulbecco's Modified Eagle's Medium (DMEM) supplemented with L-glutamine (2 mM), penicillin-streptomycin (50 µg/ml), amphotericin B (0.5 µg/ ml) and 10% heat-inactivated foetal calf serum (FCS) (InVitrogen, Cergy Pontoise, France). After two passages, chondrocytes were encapsulated in alginate beads as follows: cells were suspended in a 1.2% sterile solution of medium viscosity alginate (Sigma-Aldrich, Saint Quentin-Fallavier, France) at a concentration of 5×10^6 cells/ml and dispensed drop-wise into a 102 mM CaCl₂ solution via a 22gauge needle attached to a syringe. After instantaneous gelation, beads were allowed to further their polymerization for 15 min in CaCl₂ solution before three washes in sterile 0.15 M NaCl solution followed by two washes in complete culture medium. The beads were maintained in complete culture medium for 7 days at 37°C in a humidified atmosphere of 5% CO₂ before experiments.

STUDY DESIGN

After 7 days of culture, beads were transferred into culture medium containing 1% FCS and were maintained under low FCS conditions throughout the experiments.

In a first experiment, synthetic PPAR agonists were added to chondrocytes' beads to check for their selectivity profile using isotypes-specific PPAR target genes: acyl-CoA oxidase (ACO) for PPAR α , mitochondrial carnitin

palmitoyl transferase-1 (CPT-1) for PPAR β/δ , and adiponectin for PPAR γ . The compounds used were ROSI (1–10 μ M; Cayman Chemical, Ann Arbor, MI) as representative of PPAR γ agonists, Wy14643 (Wy, 30–100 μ M; Calbiochem, Meudon, France) as representative of PPAR α agonists and GW501516 (GW, 0.1–100 nM; Alexis Biochemicals, Paris, France) as representative of PPAR β/δ agonists. The dependency on PPAR isotype was controlled in the presence of specific antagonists GW6471 (10 μ M; Tocris Bioscience, Paris, France) for PPAR α and GW9662 (10 μ M; Cayman Chemical) for PPAR γ . PPAR ligands were dissolved in Dimethyl-Sulfoxide, which was also added as vehicle to control cells at a final concentration of less than 0.2% (v/v).

In a second set of experiments, the effect of selected concentrations of PPAR agonists [ROSI (10 μ M), Wy14643 (100 μ M) or GW501516 (100 nM)] was studied on TGF-\beta1-induced (10 ng/ml; Peprotech Tebu, Le Perrey en Yvelines, France) changes in PGs' metabolism and signalling events. In all experiments, agonists were added 2 h before TGF-\beta1. PGs-related responses were studied 48 h (gene expression) or 72 h (matrix metabolism) after addition of TGF-\beta1. After preliminary kinetic studies, phosphorylation of Smad2/3 or ERK1/2 and production of PGE₂ were studied 1 h and 24 h after addition of TGF-\beta1, respectively.

In a third set of experiments, the contribution of each PPAR isotype to agonists-induced changes in PGs' metabolism, namely TGF- β 1-induced expression of aggrecan and TGF- β 1, was controlled with the specific antagonists GW6471 and GW9662 added at the same time as PPAR agonists.

ASSAY FOR CHONDROCYTE VIABILITY

Cell viability was assessed by the mitochondrial-dependent reduction of 3-(4,5-dimethylthiazol-2-yl)-2,5-diphenyltetrazolium bromide (MTT, Sigma-Aldrich) into formazan. Briefly, cells were incubated for 48 h at 37°C in the presence or absence of TGF-B1 and/or PPAR agonists (added 2 h before TGF-β1 when co-incubated) in low FCS (1%) culture medium. Chondrocytes' beads were incubated further with MTT (1 mg ml⁻¹ final concentration) for 4 h at 37°C. After removal of culture medium, beads were solubilized in citrate-Ethylenediaminetetraacetate (EDTA) buffer (55 mM/50 mM; pH 6.8) and chondrocytes' viability was assessed after addition of lysing buffer (20% w/v of sodium dodecyl sulphate [SDS] in a 50% aqueous solution of dimethyl formamide (DMF), pH 4.7). After 24 h of incubation at 37°C, solubilization of formazan crystals was quantified by measurement of absorbance at 580 nm on a Multiskan® microplate reader (Labsystems, Montigny-le-Bretonneux, France).

REGIONAL LOCALIZATION OF GAGS IN BEADS

After stimulation with TGF- β 1, in the presence or absence of PPAR agonists, alginate beads were fixed for 4 h at 20°C in a 4% paraformaldehyde solution (pH 7.4) (Sigma–Aldrich) containing 100 mM sodium cacodylate and 10 mM CaCl₂, then washed overnight in 100 mM sodium cacodylate buffer containing 50 mM BaCl₂. Samples were dehydrated in graded solutions of ethanol, then embedded in paraffin and cut into sections (5 µm thickness), before staining with Alcian blue (Sigma–Aldrich) (1% w/v in acetic acid 3%) for the visualization of PGs' deposition. Sections (n = 5beads per condition) were observed on three different areas at a magnification 100× with a photonic microscope (Nikon type 104, Tokyo, Japan) and staining intensity was analysed using NIH Image software (NIH/ImageJ, http://rsb.info.nih.gov).

ASSAY FOR GAGS IN FURTHER REMOVED MATRIX (FRM)

After stimulation with TGF- β 1, in the presence or absence of PPAR agonists, alginate beads (50 per condition) were dissolved in citrate-EDTA buffer (55 mM/50 mM; pH 6.8) for 10 min at 37°C. The suspension was centrifuged for 15 s at 10,000 rpm to separate the cells surrounded by "cell-associated-matrix" (CM, the pellet) from components originating predominantly from the "interterritorial matrix" further removed from the cells (FRM; alginate supernatants) as described³⁴. Alginate supernatants were further incubated for 2 h at 60°C in papain buffer [NaH₂PO₄ (0.2 M), EDTA (0.001 M), dithiotreitol (0.001 M) and papain (5 U/ml)] to prevent non-specific interactions of 1.9-dimethyl-methylene blue (DMB, Sigma-Aldrich) with proteins, and enzymatic digestion was stopped by addition of sodium mono-iodoacetate (Merck, Nogent-sur-Marne, France) at a final concentration of 10 mM. Then, GAGs were extracted from supernatants with an equal volume of 8 M guanidine-HCl (GuHCl, Sigma-Aldrich) in 0.05 M sodium acetate buffer pH 5.8 for 48 h at 60°C, followed by centrifugation at 10,000 rpm for 20 min at 4°C. The supernatants were discarded and the pellets were washed successively five times with PBS 1× (for optimal reduction of alginate's interference with GAGs) then with ethanol 70% (for eliminating the interference of GuHCl with GAGs). The washed pellets containing GAGs were dried for 20 min at room temperature before solubilization in 500 µl Tris/HCl buffer (50 mM, pH 8). The metachromatic reaction of GAGs with DMB was performed by adding 40 µl of each diluted sample (1/40eme) to 960 µl of DMB solution [32 mg of DMB, 5 ml ethanol 70° and 4 ml formic acid solubilized in 1 L formate buffer 0.4% (w/v)]³⁵. The rapid measurement of absorbance at 525 nm on a UV1601[®] spectrophotometer (Shimadzu, ScienceTech, Paris, France) was used to calculate the amounts of GAGs in the samples using shark chondroitin-6-sulphate (Sigma-Aldrich) as a standard and cell free alginate beads as a blank.

CHONDROCYTES' PGS' SYNTHESIS

After stimulation with TGF- β 1, in the presence or absence of PPAR agonists, alginate beads (five beads per well) were incubated in complete low FCS DMEM medium containing 10 μ Ci/ml of sodium sulphate ³⁵S[Na₂SO₄] for 4 h at 37°C in a 5% CO₂ humidified atmosphere. Alginate beads were washed five times with 0.15 M NaCl and solubilized overnight in citrate–EDTA buffer (55 mM/50 mM; pH 6.8). The ³⁵SO₄-labelled PGs' content was assessed on aliquots of digested samples by liquid scintillation counting (Packard, Rungis, France) with an LKB 1214 counter (Wallac, Perkin Elmer, Courtabœuf, Paris Cedex, France).

ASSAY FOR PGE₂

 PGE_2 levels were assessed in the same culture supernatants 24 h after addition of TGF- β 1, using a commercially available enzyme immunoassay kit (Assay Designs Inc, Ann Arbor, MI, USA), according to the manufacturer's instructions. This assay showed no significant cross-reactivity with other prostaglandins and the limit of detection was 39.1 pg/ml.

WESTERN BLOTTING FOR SMAD2/3, ERK1/2 AND P38-MAPK

After stimulation with TGF- β 1, in the presence or absence of PPAR agonists, alginate beads were dissolved in citrate-EDTA buffer (55 mM/50 mM; pH 6.8) for 10 min at 37°C, then centrifuged at 10,000 rpm for 15 s. The supernatants were discarded and the pellets were washed five times with PBS $1\times$ before suspension in 200 μ l of Laemmli buffer 1 \times (Sigma-Aldrich). Total DNA was sheared by sonication and pelleted by centrifugation at 3000 rpm for 10 min. The supernatants were further collected and 20 µl of each protein sample was analysed by SDS-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis (10% acrylamide) and electroblotted onto polyvinylidene difluoride membrane. After one night at 4°C in 5% (w/v) blocking buffer, membranes (Immobilon; Waters, St. Quentin-en-Yvelines, France) were blotted 2 h at room temperature with primary antibodies against phospho or non-phospho Smad2/3, p44/p42-MAPK (ERK1/2) or p38-MAPK (Cell Signaling, Beverly, MA), and against β -actin (Sigma). All antibodies were diluted 1:1000. After three washings with Tris buffered saline (TBS)-Tween [(pH 7.6, 50 mM Tris containing 150 mM NaCl and 0.1% Tween20 (v/v)], blots were incubated for 1 h at room temperature with horseradish peroxydase-conjugated secondary antibodies (Cell Signaling) diluted at 1:2000 in 1% (w/v) blocking buffer. After four washings with TBS-Tween, specific proteins were detected by chemiluminescence with the Phototope Detection system (Cell Signaling) according to the manufacturer's instructions. Densitometric scans were analysed using NIH Image software (NIH/ImageJ, http://rsb.info.nih.gov).

RNA EXTRACTION AND REAL TIME POLYMERASE CHAIN REACTION (PCR)

After stimulation with TGF- β 1, in the presence or absence of PPAR agonists, alginate beads were dissolved in citrate-EDTA buffer (55 mM/50 mM; pH 6.8) for 10 min at 37°C, then centrifuged at 10,000 rpm for 15 s. The supernatants were discarded and the pellets were washed five times with PBS before extraction of total RNA using an RNeasy minikit (Qiagen, Valencia, CA). Total RNA (500 ng) were reverse transcribed in a volume of 20 µl containing 4 µl of 5× First Strand Buffer, 20 µM hexanucleotides random primers, 1 µl of Recombinant Ribonuclease Inhibitor (RNA-se OUT 40 U/µl), 2 µl of dNTP (5 mM), 2 µl of dithiotreitol (0.1 M) and 1 µl of Moloney murine leukaemia virus (M-MLV; 200 U/µl) (Invitrogen) for 1 h 30 min at 37°C and 5 min at 95°C. To quantify aggrecan, xylosyl transferase-1, chondroitin-4-sulphate-transferase, chondroitin-6sulphate-transferase, TGF-B1, adiponectin, ACO, CPT-1

mRNAs expression, real time PCR was performed using the Lightcycler[®] Technology (Roche) and the SYBRgreen master mix system[®] (Qiagen, Courtabœuf, France). The sequences of the primers used and corresponding products' lengths are summarized in Table I. After amplification, a melting curve was plotted to determine the melting temperature of each PCR product; their sizes were checked on a 2% agarose gel stained with ethidium bromide (0.5μ g/ml). Each run included positive and negative controls. The transcript level of the housekeeping gene RP29 was determined in parallel for each sample and data are expressed as the normalized ratio of mRNA level of each gene of interest over the RP29 gene.

STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Data are expressed as mean \pm standard error of the mean (s.E.M.) of three to ten values obtained from one to three separate experiments. Comparisons were made by ANOVA, followed by Fisher's protected least significant difference test using StatView[®] 5.0 software (SAS Institute, Cary, NC). Statistically significant differences from the control are indicated as *, P < 0.05; **, P < 0.01; ***, P < 0.001, from TGF- β 1-treated cells as #, P < 0.05; ##, P < 0.01; ###, P < 0.001, and from "TGF- β 1 + PPAR agonists" or "PPAR agonists"-treated cells as \S , P < 0.05; \S §, P < 0.01; \S §§, P < 0.01; \S §§, P < 0.01.

Results

SELECTIVITY OF SYNTHETIC PPAR AGONISTS FOR PPAR TARGET GENES

Preliminary experiment using the MTT assay showed no loss of viability of rat chondrocytes exposed to PPAR agonists and/or antagonists in the concentration range tested (data no shown). In our experimental conditions, ACO mRNA level was increased moderately (around 1.4-fold) by Wy14643 (100 $\mu M),$ while being reduced strongly by ROSI (1 or 10 $\mu M)$ and GW501516 (only 100 nM) (Fig. 1). CPT-1 mRNA level was up-regulated by five-fold by GW501516 (100 nM) while being induced around two-fold by Wy14643 and ROSI (Table II). Adiponectin mRNA level was increased by ROSI in dose-related manner (3.9-fold at 10 µM), while being reduced marginally by GW501516 (100 pM) or the highest concentration of Wy14643 (100 µM) (Fig. 1). These data supported that, in our experimental conditions, Wy14643 behaved as a selective PPAR α agonist at 100 μ M, GW501516 as a selective PPAR β/δ agonist at 100 nM and ROSI as a selective PPAR γ agonist at 10 μ M.

Table I	
Primers used for real time PCR and corresponding products' leng	ths

Genes	Primer sequence, forward	Primer sequence, reverse	Tm (°C)	PS (pb)
RP29	5'-AAG ATG GGT CAC CAG CAG CTC TAC TG-3'	5'-AGA CGC GGC AAG AGC GAG AA-3'	59	67
Aggrecan	5'-ACA CCC CTA CCC TTG CTT CT-3'	5'-AAA GTG TCC AAG GCA TCC AC-3'	59	124
Xyl-transferase 1	5'-GTC GCA CCT CTG ACC TTC TC-3'	5'-CCA GGC TTC TAG TGC TGT CC-3'	61	201
C4S-transferase	5'-CAT GCC ACA TCC ACT ACG AC-3'	5'-AAC TCC GTG GTC ATC TCG TC-3'	60	151
C6S-transferase	5'-CCT CGG AGC AGT TTG AGA AG-3'	5'-GTT GGT GAG TGA GGC GGT AT-3'	60	131
TGF-β1	5'-CTG CTG ACC CCC ACT GAT A-3'	5'-TGA AGC GAA AGC CCT GTA TT-3'	57	103
ACO	5'CCAATCACGCAATAGTTCTGG-3'	5'-CGC TGT ATC GTA TGG CGA T-3'	58	362
Adiponectin	5'-AAT CCT GCC CAG TCA TGA AAG -3'	5'-TCT CCA GGA GTG CCA TCT CT-3'	58	433
CPT-1	5'-ATG ACG GCT ATG GTG TCT TCC-3'	5'-GTG AGG CCA AAC AAG GTG AT-3'	58	154



Fig. 1. Selectivity of synthetic PPAR agonists for PPAR target genes in chondrocytes. Rat chondrocytes, embedded in alginate beads $(5 \times 10^4 \text{ cells/bead})$ were exposed or not to Wy14643 (10–30 μ M, PPAR α agonist), GW501516 (0.1–100 nM, PPAR β/δ agonist) or ROSI (1–10 μ M, PPAR γ agonist) for 48 h. Data expressed as mean levels of mRNA of specific target genes normalized to RP29 (n=4-8): (A) ACO for PPAR α ; (B) CPT-1 for PPAR β/δ ; (C) adiponectin for PPAR γ .

REVERSION OF PPAR TARGET GENES' EXPRESSION BY PPAR ANTAGONISTS

The dependency on PPAR isotype was controlled with specific antagonists. Experiment showed that GW6471 suppressed selectively the inducing effect of Wy14643 on ACO expression, although it was itself inhibitory (-60%) on ACO expression and stimulatory (1.6-fold) on adiponectin expression (Fig. 2). Moreover, GW9662 reduced ROSI-induced expression of adiponectin below control level, although it reduced partly (-60%) the stimulating effect of GW501516 on CPT-1 mRNA level (Fig. 2). In basal conditions, GW9662 stimulated ACO expression by two-fold while reducing adiponectin expression by -45% (Fig. 2). These results were consistent with GW6471 acting as a PPAR α antagonist with a marginal potency to activate

PPAR γ , and GW9662 as a PPAR γ antagonist with a marginal potency to activate PPAR α . These data also confirmed the isotype selectivity of 100 μ M of Wy14643, 100 nM of GW501516 and 10 μ M of ROSI and led us to select these concentrations for subsequent experiments.

EFFECTS OF SELECTIVE PPAR AGONISTS ON TGF- $\beta 1\text{-INDUCED}$ CHANGES IN PG METABOLISM

Preliminary experiments in the MTT assay were consistent with a non-significant proliferating effect of TGF- β 1 (10 ng/ml) on chondrocytes embedded in beads (data not shown). In these conditions, TGF- β 1 stimulated the overall content in GAGs by 3.5-fold [Fig. 3(A)] and their deposition in the interterritorial matrix area by 6.2-fold without

Table II

Effects of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced expression of genes involved in PG synthesis in chondrocytes. Rat chondrocytes, embedded in alginate beads (5 × 10⁴ cells/bead), were exposed or not to Wy14643 (100 μ M), GW501516 (100 nM) or ROSI (10 μ M) for 2 h before stimulation with TGF- β 1 (10 ng/ml), alone or in combination with PPAR agonists, for 48 h. Normalized mRNA levels of aggrecan, xylosyl transferase-1 and chondroitin-(4 or 6)-sulphate-transferases quantified by real time PCR (n = 4). Data are expressed as mean \pm s.E.M. Statistically significant differences from the control are indicated as *, P < 0.05; **, P < 0.01; ***, P < 0.001 and from TGF- β 1-treated cells as #, P < 0.05; ##, P < 0.01; ###, P < 0.001

PPAR agonists	Genes/RP29	Aggrecan	Xylosyl transferase-1	Chondroitin-4-sulphate- transferase	Chondroitin-6-sulphate- transferase
None	w/o TGF-β1 + TGF-β1	$\begin{array}{c} 1.00 \pm 0.13 \\ 12.4 \pm 2.56^{***} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.00 \pm 0.06 \\ 1.44 \pm 0.08^{*} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.00 \pm 0.06 \\ 0.76 \pm 0.15 \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.00 \pm 0.11 \\ 0.68 \pm 0.08 \end{array}$
Wy14643	w/o TGF-β1 + TGF-b1	$\begin{array}{c} 0.45 \pm 0.20^{*} \\ 3.44 \pm 1.10 \# \# \# \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.72 \pm 0.18^{*} \\ 1.89 \pm 0.62 \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 2.73 \pm 0.14^{**} \\ 1.41 \pm 0.27 \# \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.51 \pm 0.02^{**} \\ 0.66 \pm 0.24 \end{array}$
GW501516	w/o TGF-β1 + TGF-β1	$\begin{array}{c} 0.70 \pm 0.11 \\ 3.40 \pm 0.73 \texttt{\#}\texttt{\#}\texttt{\#}\end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.30 \pm 0.15 \\ 1.23 \pm 0.17 \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 2.60 \pm 0.10^{**} \\ 1.64 \pm 0.21 \# \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.30 \pm 0.15 \\ 1.25 \pm 0.18 \# \end{array}$
Rosiglitazone	w/o TGF-β1 + TGF-β1	$\begin{array}{c} 0.48 \pm 0.07^{**} \\ 2.40 \pm 0.52 \# \# \# \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.14 \pm 1.05^{**} \\ 3.07 \pm 0.82 \# \# \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 3.00 \pm 0.53^{**} \\ 1.14 \pm 0.02 \# \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.48 \pm 0.18^{**} \\ 1.14 \pm 0.06 \# \end{array}$



Fig. 2. Reversion of PPAR target genes' expression by selective antagonists in chondrocytes. Rat chondrocytes, embedded in alginate beads (5 × 10⁴ cells/bead), were exposed or not to Wy14643 (100 μ M), GW501516 (100 nM), or ROSI (10 μ M), in the presence or absence of PPAR α (GW6471, 10 μ M) or PPAR γ (GW9662, 10 μ M) antagonists for 48 h. Data are expressed as mean ± s.E.M. of normalized mRNA levels for ACO, CPT-1 or adiponectin quantified by real time PCR (n = 4). Statistically significant differences from the control are indicated as *, P < 0.05; **, P < 0.01, ***, P < 0.001, and from "PPAR agonists"-treated cells as §, P < 0.05; §§, P < 0.01; §§§, P < 0.001.

modifying their pericellular localization [Fig. 3(B)]. Besides, PGs' synthesis was increased by approximately four-fold [Fig. 3(C)] and the mRNA level of aggrecan was increased by 12.5-fold without marked changes in the expression level of xylosyl transferase-1, chondroitin-4 and -6 transferases (Table II).

In the presence of PPAR agonists, the MTT assay was not significantly reduced except for the highest dose of ROSI (data not shown). The stimulating effect of TGF- β 1 on GAGs' content was suppressed from 90% for GW501516 to below basal level for ROSI [Fig. 3(A)] and their deposition in interterritorial matrix was reduced dramatically (from -73% for Wy14643 to -95% for ROSI) [Fig. 3(B)]. The enhancing effect of TGF- β 1 on PG synthesis was also reduced by PPAR agonists (from -24% for Wy14643 to -44% for ROSI), but the basal rate of radiolabelled sulphate incorporation was slightly increased by Wy14643 while being slightly reduced by ROSI [Fig. 3(C)]. TGF- β 1-induced expression of aggrecan was inhibited from -76% for Wy14643 to -83% for ROSI, but all PPAR agonists tended to decrease the basal level of aggrecan (Table II). In contrast, PPAR agonists increased moderately the basal levels of mRNA for xylosyl transferase-1, chondroitin-4 and -6 sulphate transferases except for Wy14643 on chondroitin-6 sulphate transferase, and a reproducible decrease was observed only for chondroitin-4 transferase in the presence of TGF- β 1 (Table II). For most TGF-_β1-induced responses, the maximal inhibitory effect was observed with ROSI [Fig. 3(A-C)], a finding consistent with its ability to decrease mitochondrial activity in the MTT assay.

EFFECTS OF SELECTIVE PPAR AGONISTS ON TGF- $\beta 1\text{-INDUCED}$ SIGNALLING PATHWAYS

Time course effect of Smad2/3, ERK1/2 and p38-MAPK phosphorylation by TGF-β1

In our experimental system, TGF- β 1 induced a fast phosphorylation of Smad2/3 which was maximal around 1 h, whereas no significant variation was observed on p38-MAPK [Fig. 4(A)]. TGF- β 1 promoted also the phosphorylation of p44- and p42-MAPK although the kinetics revealed an early (1–2 h) and a late (24 h) activation of this pathway [Fig. 4(A)]. This led us to study the effects of PPAR agonists on signalling events 1 h after the addition of TGF- β 1 and to consider only Smads and ERK pathways.

Effects of agonists on TGF-β1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3 and ERK1/2

In chondrocytes' beads, TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3 (4.5-fold) was reduced by -50% to -75% by GW501516 and ROSI, respectively, whereas Wy14643 was ineffective [Fig. 4(B)]. At the same time, TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of p44-MAPK (2.5-fold) was completely suppressed by GW501516 and ROSI while being reduced slightly by Wy14643 [Fig. 4(C)]. Similar results were observed on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of p42-MAPK (3.5-fold) with a -70% to -75% decrease obtained in the presence of GW501516 and ROSI, respectively [Fig. 4(C)].

EFFECTS OF SELECTIVE PPAR AGONISTS ON TGF- β 1-INDUCED PGE₂ PRODUCTION

In our experimental conditions, TGF- β 1 stimulated PGE₂ production by 3.9-fold at 24 h. This stimulating effect was abrogated by Wy14643 and inhibited by -68% by GW501516, whereas ROSI was marginally inhibitory (Fig. 5). Control experiment showed that the basal production of PGE₂ was decreased (-59%) by Wy14643 but stimulated (1.9-fold) by ROSI.

REVERSION OF THE ANTI-ANABOLIC POTENCY OF PPAR AGONISTS BY SELECTIVE ANTAGONISTS

Effects on aggrecan mRNA expression

TGF- β 1-induced increase in aggrecan mRNA level (ninefold increase) was neither affected by the PPAR α antagonist GW6471 (10-fold increase) nor by the PPAR γ antagonist GW9662 (11-fold increase) [Fig. 6(A)]. As observed previously, TGF- β 1-induced aggrecan expression was reduced by all PPAR agonists (from -77% for Wy14643 to below basal level for ROSI). In the presence of GW6471, the inhibitory potency of Wy14643 was relieved whereas those of GW501516 and ROSI remained unchanged [Fig. 6(A)]. Corollary, the inhibitory potency of ROSI was relieved in the presence of GW9662, whereas those of Wy14643 and GW501516 remained unaffected or poorly affected, respectively [Fig. 6(A)]. Control experiment showed that GW6471 and GW9662 did not modify the basal level of aggrecan mRNAs whereas most PPAR agonists were inhibitory (data not shown).

Effects on TGF-*β*1 mRNA expression

The stimulating effect of TGF- β 1 on the mRNA level of TGF- β 1 (6.3-fold increase) was neither affected by the



Fig. 3. Effects of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced changes in PG metabolism in chondrocytes. Chondrocytes, embedded in alginate beads (5 × 10⁴ cells/bead), were exposed or not to Wy14643 (100 μ M), GW501516 (100 nM) or ROSI (10 μ M) for 2 h before stimulation with TGF- β 1 (10 ng/ml), alone or in combination with PPAR agonists, for 72 h. (A) GAG content after solubilization of alginate beads (*n* = 10); (B) representative sections of Alcian blue staining of beads (*n* = 5); (C) PG synthesis by incorporation of radiolabelled sulphate (*n* = 5). Data are expressed as mean ± s.E.M. Statistically significant differences from the control are indicated as *, *P* < 0.05; **, *P* < 0.01; ****, *P* < 0.001 and from TGF- β 1-treated cells as #, *P* < 0.05; ##, *P* < 0.001.



Fig. 4. Effects of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced signalling pathways in chondrocytes. Rat chondrocytes, embedded in alginate beads (5 × 10⁴ cells/bead), were exposed or not to Wy14643 (100 μ M), GW501516 (100 nM) or ROSI (10 μ M) for 2 h before stimulation with TGF- β 1 (10 ng/ml), alone or in combination with PPAR agonists, for 1 h. Phosphorylation of Smad, ERK1/2 and p38-MAPK were evaluated by Western Blot (*n* = 3). (A) Time course effect of Smad2/3, ERK1/2 and p38-MAPK phosphorylation in response to TGF- β 1; (B) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3; (C) effect of selective PPAR agonists on TGF-

PPAR_α antagonist GW6471 (4.5-fold increase) nor by the PPAR_γ antagonist GW9662 (5.3-fold increase) [Fig. 6(B)]. As observed previously, TGF-β1-induced TGF-β1 expression was reduced by all PPAR agonists (from -59% for Wy14643 to below basal level for ROSI). In the presence of GW6471, the inhibitory potency of Wy14643 was relieved whereas those of GW501516 and ROSI remained unchanged [Fig. 6(B)]. Corollary, the inhibitory potency of ROSI was relieved in the presence of GW9662, whereas those of Wy14643 and GW501516 remained unaffected or poorly affected, respectively [Fig. 6(B)]. Control experiment showed that GW6471 and GW9662 did not modify the basal level of TGF-β1 mRNAs whereas ROSI was solely inhibitory (data not shown).

Discussion

In the present work, we investigated the potency of selective PPAR agonists to impair anabolic effect of TGF- β 1 on PGs in chondrocytes. Therefore, experimental conditions were selected to reproduce the tridimensional

environment of articular cartilage and to obtain an optimal response to TGF-B1. Alginate was chosen as culture system to maintain chondrocytes' phenotype³⁶ and produce aggrecan with a compartmentalization thought to reproduce the pericellular and territorial matrix areas and interterritorial compartment of articular cartilage, respectively³⁴. Chondrocytes' beads were used at a time suitable to overcome early cell death³⁷ and to assume a reproducible synthesis of extracellular matrix components in response to growth factors³⁴ without extensive cell proliferation³⁸. The latter point is of primary importance since PPAR agonists have wellknown antiproliferative effects in other cell types³⁹. We showed that, except for ROSI after 72 h of incubation, none of the agonists impaired the MTT assay supporting that our data were rather representative of changes in cell metabolism than in cell proliferation. Preliminary dose-ranging studies confirmed that optimal biosynthetic responses of rat cells were observed for 10 ng/ml of TGF-β1 in low (1%) FCS culture medium, as reported for bovine chondrocytes³⁶ or mouse cartilage⁴⁰. In these experimental conditions, TGF- β 1 stimulated [³⁵S]PGs and overall GAG content to a similar extent while favouring their deposition in the



Fig. 5. Effects of selective PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced PGE₂ production in chondrocytes. Rat chondrocytes, embedded in alginate beads (5 × 10⁴ cells/bead), were exposed or not to Wy14643 (100 µM), GW501516 (100 nM) or ROSI (10 µM) for 2 h before stimulation with TGF- β 1 (10 ng/ml), alone or in combination with PPAR agonists, for 24 h. PGE₂ level was measured by EIA assays in culture supernatants (*n* = 4). Data are expressed as mean \pm s.E.M. Statistically significant differences from the control are indicated as **P* < 0.05; **, *P* < 0.01; ***, *P* < 0.001 and from TGF- β 1-treated cells as #, *P* < 0.05; ##, *P* < 0.01; ###, *P* < 0.001.

interterritorial matrix of beads. Maximal changes were observed on aggrecan gene expression, which is a wellknown target gene of TGF- β 1⁴¹, whereas marginal changes were noted for genes involved in the formation of the GAGs' side chains. Thus, it is likely that PGs found in the beads' matrix were essentially neosynthesized. Thus, the anabolic effect of TGF- β 1 on PGs' metabolism was driven mainly by the transcriptional activation of the aggrecan gene in rat beads although increased C4S/C6S ratios were reported in human⁴² TGF- β 1-stimulated chondrocytes.

As many PPAR independent effects were reported for 15deoxy- $\Delta^{12,14}$ prostaglandin J₂ (15d-PGJ₂)⁴³, a natural agonist with a low binding affinity to PPAR gamma, we used only synthetic PPAR agonist with a high binding affinity for one PPAR isotype¹⁶ and confirmed their selectivity using a panel of PPAR target genes: ACO as representative for PPAR α^{44} , mitochondrial CPT-1 as representative for PPAR β/δ^{45} and adiponectin as representative for PPAR γ^{46} . In our culture system, the contribution of each PPAR isotype was further controlled by reversion experiments with the selective PPAR α antagonists GW6471⁴⁷ and the selective PPARy antagonist GW966248. Such pharmacological approach was developed as a convenient surrogate to classical gene reporter or dominant negative strategies^{49,50} which were poorly adapted to our culture system. Indeed, efficiency of non-viral transfection was low in primary rat chondrocytes compared to other species⁶⁹ and transgene expression was shown to decrease gradually with time in the alginate system⁵¹.

As expected, ACO expression was increased moderately by Wy14643 whereas adiponectin expression was stimulated more robustly by ROSI in rat chondrocytes. Expression of CPT-1 was induced by all PPAR agonists but with a maximal response for GW501516. This result agreed well with less restrictive dependency of CPT-1 towards PPAR isotypes⁵² and the influence of tissue environment on the response of a given target gene to PPAR agonists⁵³.



Fig. 6. Reversion of anti-anabolic potency of PPAR agonists by selective antagonists in chondrocytes. Rat chondrocytes, embedded in alginate beads (5×10^4 cells/bead), were exposed or not for 2 h with Wy14643 (100μ M), GW501516 (100 nM), or ROSI (10μ M), in the presence or absence of PPAR α (GW6471, 10μ M) or PPAR γ (GW9662, 10μ M) antagonists, before stimulation with 10 ng/ml TGF- β 1, alone or in combination with PPAR ligands, for 48 h. Data are expressed as mean \pm s.E.M. of normalized mRNA levels quantified by real time PCR (n = 4). (A) Aggrecan expression; (B) TGF- β 1 expression. Statistically significant differences from the control are indicated as *, P < 0.05; **, P < 0.01, ***, P < 0.001, from TGF- β 1-treated cells as #, P < 0.05; ##, P < 0.01; ###, P < 0.001 and from "TGF- β 1 + PPAR agonists"-treated cells as §, P < 0.05; §§, P < 0.01; §§§, P < 0.001.

The concentrations which were selected from this inducing profile on PPAR target genes were in the range of those used previously to study the effect of Wy14643⁴⁹, GW501516²⁴, or ROSI⁵⁴ in articular cells. However, they were far above those required for the transactivation of chimeric murine or human PPAR receptors in cell-based transfection assays⁵⁵ and PPAR-dependent activities were also reported at lower concentrations in rabbit chondrocytes^{23,50}. These higher concentrations are supported likely by species differences in the response of PPAR to a given agonist⁵⁶ and by the need to activate the whole cellular machinery after crossing of the alginate and extracellular matrix network³⁴.

Reversion experiments demonstrated that GW6471⁴⁷ antagonized selectively the expression of ACO induced by Wy14643 and GW9662⁴⁸ the expression of adiponectin

induced by ROSI. In TGF-81-stimulated cells. GW6471 reversed also the inhibitory effect of Wy14643 on aggrecan and TGF-B1 expression whereas GW9662 reversed the inhibitory effect of ROSI on these parameters. These data were consistent with Wy14643 and ROSI controlling PPARa- and PPARy-dependent responses, respectively. both in the PPAR and aggrecan systems. The effect of GW501516 was suppressed partly by GW9662, as well on induction of CPT-1 as on the inhibition of TGF-β1-induced aggrecan expression. This could reflect a weak antagonism of PPARB/b in chondrocytes since GW9662 was shown to interfere possibly with isotypes other than γ in PPAR reporter cell lines^{57}. Nonetheless, this effect remained negligible compared to its covalent inhibition of PPAR γ^{48} which reproduced the effect of a dominant negative strategy in synovial fibroblast⁴⁹ while antagonizing the transcriptional activity of ROSI in SW-1353 chondrosarcoma cells⁵⁸. Although one cannot exclude that agonists may act on other intracellular pathways than PPAR, our data strongly supported that Wy14643, GW501516 and ROSI were responsible for PPAR α , β/δ and γ -dependent responses in rat chondrocytes, respectively.

In the present work, we showed for the first time that the stimulating effect of TGF-B1 on GAG content and deposition was reduced dramatically by PPAR agonists whereas the production of newly synthesized PGs was reduced by at least 25%. At the molecular level, TGF-B1-induced expression of aggrecan was inhibited by more than 75% by all PPAR agonists without marked changes on genes involved in GAGs' side chains' synthesis. This effect was seen independently of the selectivity for a given PPAR isotype, although with the following rank order of potency: ROSI > GW501516 \ge Wy14643. The higher potency of ROSI was not supported by a higher level of PPARy since we confirmed that all PPAR isotypes were expressed at the mRNA level in rat chondrocytes, with PPAR β/δ being the most abundant (data not shown). However, in contrast to our previous reports of a selective decrease of the γ isotype in response to pro-inflammatory cytokines^{20,24}, we observed that the expression of all PPAR isotypes was reduced significantly in response to TGF-B1 (data not shown). Thus, the ability of selective PPAR agonists to bind to a given isotype was comparable in resting and TGF-B1-stimulated chondrocytes. The inhibitory effect of ROSI on chondrocyte PGs was in line with the ability of PPAR_Y agonists to suppress decorin expression in human arteries²⁸ as well as TGF-B1-induced expression of other extracellular matrix components in mesangial cells³⁶, skin fibroblast³⁰ or in pulmonary myofibroblasts³¹. In contrast, no anti-fibrotic potency has been reported for PPAR β/δ agonists whereas PPARα agonists were unable to suppress TGF-β1induced collagen synthesis in pulmonary myofibroblasts³¹.

To clarify the contribution of either PPAR isotype to an anti-TGF- β 1 effect, we investigated the ability of agonists to impair TGF- β 1-induced signalling events thought to regulate aggrecan expression in chondrocytes⁵⁹. Interestingly, we demonstrated that early TGF- β 1-induced phosphorylation of Smad2/3 was reduced by ROSI and GW501516 but not by Wy14643. As overexpression of Smad7, a well-known inhibitory Smad, suppressed the stimulating effect of TGF- β 1 on PG synthesis in a murine chondrocyte cell line⁶⁰, it is likely that inhibition of the Smad pathway contributed to the inhibitory potency of ROSI and GW501516. However, further studies are required to investigate if these agonists were able to interact physically with Smad proteins as PPAR–ligands complexes⁶¹ or to regulate aggrecan expression at the level of Smad-dependent promoter activity

induced by TGF- β^{30} . We also demonstrated that the early phosphorylation of ERK1/2 was reduced by ROSI and GW501516 but not by Wy4643. Although its contribution was reported primarily in TGF-β-induced cell growth^{62,63} activation of ERK1/2 was shown to regulate TGF-β-induced aggrecan gene expression⁵⁹ and to interplay with other signalling pathways in chondrocytes^{59,63}. Interestingly, inhibition of ERK1/2 and Smad2/3 phosphorylation by ROSI and GW501516 was complementary and may reduce TGF-β-induced expression of aggrecan gene with a different time course⁵⁹. In contrast, we showed that TGF- β 1 failed to activate p38-MAPK in our culture system, a finding consistent with previous kinase assays on chondrocytes' monolavers⁶² which did not support its major contribution to PGs' synthesis. This result is at variance with the blunting effect of p38-MAPK inhibitors on TGF-β1-induced PGs' synthesis in human chondrocytes⁶⁴, but species dependent differences were reported for the contribution of p38-MAPK pathway in cartilage65.

We demonstrated finally that the stimulating effect of TGFβ1 on PGE₂ synthesis was reduced by Wy14643 and GW501516 but not by ROSI in chondrocytes' beads. TGFβ was reported to stimulate PGE₂ production in growth plate chondrocytes by activation of several enzymes of the arachidonic acid cascade⁶⁶⁻⁶⁸. Effect of PGE₂ on chondrocytes' functions depends strongly on differentiation and corresponding expression of EP receptors⁶⁹, with EP-1 and EP-2 being shown to promote cell growth and PGs' synthesis in growth plate-derived chondrocytes⁶⁷ and EP-2 to account for the growth of mature articular chondrocytes⁷⁰. TGF-β-dependent PG production was shown to involve a protein kinase C (PKC) signalling pathway^{66,67}, which was sensitive to EP-2-dependent activation of Protein kinase A (PKA) by PGE₂ in growth plate chondrocytes⁶⁷ whereas crosstalk between ERK, PKA and PKC was reported in mature cells⁶³. Although further studies are required to elucidate the direct modulation of each signalling pathway by PPAR agonists, our data suggested that inhibition of TGF-B1-induced PGE₂ synthesis by Wy14643 and GW501516 contributed to their inhibitory effect on PG synthesis. Taken together, our data were in favour of PPAR agonists being able to reduce TGF-B1-induced responses by distinct mechanisms ranging from inhibition of PGE₂ for Wy14643 to inhibition of ERK1/2 and Smad2/3 phosphorylation for ROSI, with GW501516 being effective on both. Such differences agreed well with the recent demonstration that clofibrate, a PPARa agonist, and ROSI, a PPARy agonist, were able to reduce IL-1-induced MMP-1 expression in rabbit chondrocytes by promoting sIL-1Ra production²³ or interacting on a compos-ite PPRE/AP1 site in the MMP-1 promoter⁵⁰, respectively.

From a physiopathological point of view, the inhibitory potency of PPAR agonists on TGF- β 1-induced PG synthesis could theoretically be viewed as a reduction of the repair capacity of articular cartilage. However, TGF- β has also a key role in extracellular matrix remodelling by regulating the balance between MMPs and their natural inhibitors⁴. Thus, TGF- β was shown to stimulate MMP-13 depending on the physiologic state of OA chondrocytes⁷¹ and to favour MMP-9⁷² or aggrecanase production¹² while limiting the catabolic potency of pro-inflammatory cytokines⁷³. PPAR α or γ agonists were demonstrated to down-regulate the cytokine-induced expression of several MMPs^{21,23,50} or aggrecanase⁷⁴ whereas n-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids, which are putative PPAR agonists⁵⁶, prevented the IL-1-induced release of PG metabolites from cartilage explants⁷⁵. Our data suggest that PPAR agonists could also interfere with TGF- β 1-induced degradation of PG. As a

consequence, due to their dual cytokines- and TGF- β -suppressive properties, PPAR agonists could protect cartilage PGs variably depending on the imbalance between these factors and/or the level of inflammation⁷⁶. This could explain part of the reduction of cartilage lesions that was reported for ROSI⁵ or fenofibrate⁷⁷ in experimental polyarthritis and for pioglitazone in the menisectomy model of OA²², since a decreased expression of pro-inflammatory cytokines was reported. Although, this must be confirmed *in vivo*, our data strongly suggest that PPAR agonists could be deleterious in situation of cartilage repair while being protective in situation of cartilage degradation.

Acknowledgements

The authors want to thank Drs Stéphane Pallu and Narayanan Venkatesan for helpful discussion of the manuscript. This work was supported in part by grants from the Région Lorraine and PRST Bioingénierie.

References

- Sporn MB, Roberts AB. Transforming growth factorbeta. Multiple actions and potential clinical applications. JAMA 1989;262:938–41.
- Goldberg AJ, Lee DA, Bader DL, Bentley G. Autologous chondrocyte implantation. Culture in a TGF-beta-containing medium enhances the re-expression of a chondrocytic phenotype in passaged human chondrocytes in pellet culture. J Bone Joint Surg Br 2005;87:128–34.
- Häuselmann HJ, Aydelotte MB, Schumacher BL, Kuettner KE, Gitelis SH, Thonar EJ. Synthesis and turnover of proteoglycans by human and bovine adult articular chondrocytes cultured in alginate beads. Matrix 1992;12:116–29.
- Gunther M, Haubeck HD, van de Leur E, Blaser J, Blender S, Gutgemann I, *et al.* Transforming growth factor beta 1 regulates tissue inhibitor of metalloproteinases-1 expression in differentiated human articular chondrocytes. Arthritis Rheum 1994;37:395–405.
- Van Beuningen HM, van der Kraan PM, Arntz OJ, van den Berg WB. *In vivo* protection against interleukin-1-induced articular cartilage damage by transforming growth factor-beta 1: age-related differences. Ann Rheum Dis 1994;53:593–600.
- Glansbeek HL, van Beuningen HM, Vitters EL, van der Kraan PM, van ben Berg WB. Stimulation of articular cartilage repair in established arthritis by local administration of transforming growth factor-beta into murine knee joints. Lab Invest 1998;78:133–42.
- Lafeber FP, van Roy HL, van der Kraan PM, van den Berg WB, Bijlsma JW. Transforming growth factorbeta predominantly stimulates phenotypically changed chondrocytes in osteoarthritic human cartilage. J Rheumatol 1997;24:536–42.
- Allen JB, Manthey CL, Hand AR, Ohura K, Ellingsworth L, Wahl SM. Rapid onset synovial inflammation and hyperplasia induced by transforming growth factor β. J Exp Med 1990;171:231.
- Bakker AC, van der Loo FA, van Beuningen HM, Sime P, van Lent PM, van der Kraan PM, *et al.* Overexpression of active TGF-beta-1 in the murine knee joint: evidence for synovial-layer-dependent chondroosteophyte formation. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2001;9: 128–36.

- Van Beuningen HM, Glansbeek HL, van der Kraan PM, van den Berg WB. Differential effects of local application of BMP-2 or TGF-beta 1 on both articular cartilage composition and osteophyte formation. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 1998;6:306–17.
- 11. Yamanishi Y, Boyle DL, Clark M, Maki RA, Tortorella MD, Arner EC, *et al.* Expression and regulation of aggrecanase in arthritis: the role of TGF-beta. J Immunol 2002;168:1405–12.
- Moulharat N, Lesur C, Thomas M, Rolland-Yalognes G, Pastoureau P, Anract P, *et al.* Effects of transforming growth factor-beta on aggrecanase production and proteoglycan degradation by human chondrocytes *in vitro*. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2004;12:296–305.
- Desvergne B, Wahli W. Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptors: nuclear control of metabolism. Endocr Rev 1999;20:649–88.
- Braissant O, Foufelle F, Scotto C, Dauca M, Wahli W. Differential expression of peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor (PPARs): tissue distribution of PPAR-α, PPAR-β and PPAR-γ in adult rat. Endocrinology 1996; 137:354–66.
- Bishop-Bailey D. Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptors in the cardiovascular system. Br J Pharmacol 2000;129:823–34.
- 16. Wilson TM, Brown PJ, Sternbach DD, Henke BR. The PPARs: from orphan receptors to drug discovery. J Med Chem 2000;43:527–50.
- 17. Semple RK, Chatterjee VK, O'Rahilly S. PPAR gamma and human metabolic disease. J Clin Invest 2006;116: 581–9.
- Kostadinova R, Wahli W, Michalik L. PPARs in diseases: control mechanisms of inflammation. Curr Med Chem 2005;12:2995–3009.
- Michalik L, Wahli W. Involvement of PPAR nuclear receptors in tissue injury and wound repair. J Clin Invest 2006;116:598–606.
- Bordji K, Grillasca JP, Gouze JN, Magdalou J, Schohn H, Keller JM, *et al.* Evidence for the presence of peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor (PPAR) alpha and gamma and retinoid Z receptor in cartilage. PPARgamma activation modulates the effects of interleukin-1beta on rat chondrocytes. J Biol Chem 2000; 275:12243–50.
- Fahmi H, Di Battista JA, Pelletier JP, Mineau F, Ranger P, Martel-Pelletier J. Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma activators inhibit interleukin-1betainduced nitric oxide and matrix metalloproteinase 13 production in human chondrocytes. Arthritis Rheum 2001;44:595–607.
- Kobayashi T, Notoya K, Naito T, Unno S, Nakamura A, Martel-Pelletier J, *et al.* Pioglitazone, a peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma agonist, reduces the progression of experimental osteoarthritis in guinea pigs. Arthritis Rheum 2005;52:479–87.
- Francois M, Richette P, Tsagris L, Fitting C, Lemay C, Benallaoua M, *et al.* Activation of the peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor α pathway potentiates interleukin-1 receptor antagonist production in cytokine-treated chondrocytes. Arthritis Rheum 2006; 54:1233–45.
- Moulin D, Bianchi A, Boyault S, Sebillaud S, Koufany M, Francois M, *et al.* Rosiglitazone induces interleukin-1 receptor antagonist in interleukin-1β-stimulated rat synovial fibroblast *via* a peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor β/δ-dependant mechanism. Arthritis Rheum 2005;52:759–69.

- Routh RE, Jonhson JH, McCarty KJ. Troglitazone suppresses the secretion of type I collagen by mesangial cells *in vitro*. Kidney Int 2002;61:1365–76.
- 26. Miyahara T, Schrum L, Rippe R, Xiong S, Yee HF Jr, Motomura K, *et al.* Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor and hepatic stellate cell activation. J Biol Chem 2000;275:35715–22.
- 27. Zafiriou S, Stanners SR, Saad S, Polhill TS, Poronnik P, Pollock CA. Pioglitazone inhibits cell growth and reduces matrix production in human kidney fibroblasts. J Am Soc Nephrol 2005;16:638–45.
- Olsson U, Bondjers G, Camejo G. Fatty acids modulate the composition of extracellular matrix in cultured human arterial smooth muscle cells by altering the expression of genes for proteoglycan core proteins. Diabetes 1999;48:616–22.
- Zheng F, Fornoni A, Elliot SJ, Guan Y, Breyer MD, Striker LJ, *et al.* Up-regulation of type I collagen by TGF-beta in mesangial cells is blocked by PPAR gamma activation. Am J Physiol Renal Physiol 2002; 282:F639–48.
- 30. Ghosh AK, Bhattacharyga S, Lakos G, Chen S-J, Mori Y, Varga J. Disruption of TGF-β signalling and pro-fibrotic responses in normal skin fibroblast by PPAR-γ. Arthritis Rheum 2004;50:1305–18.
- Burgess HA, Daugherty LE, Thatcher TH, Lakatos HF, Ray DM, Redonnet M, *et al.* PPAR-γ agonists inhibit TGF-induced pulmonary myofibroblasts differentiation and collagen production: implication for therapy of lung fibrosis. Am J Physiol Lung Cell Mol Physiol 2005;288: L1146–53.
- 32. Guo B, Koya D, Isono M, Sugimoto T, Kashiwagi A, Haneda M. PPAR-γ ligands inhibit TGF-β1-induced fibronectin expression in glomerular mesangial cells. Diabetes 2004;53:200–8.
- Guan Y. Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor family and its relationship to renal complications of the metabolic syndrome. J Am Soc Nephrol 2004;15: 2801–15.
- 34. Van Osch GJ, van den Berg WB, Hunziker EB, Hauselmann HJ. Differential effects of IGF-1 and TGF beta-2 on the assembly of proteoglycans in pericellular and territorial matrix by cultured bovine articular chondrocytes. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 1998; 6:187–95.
- Goldberg RL, Kolibas LM. An improved method for determining proteoglycans synthesized by chondrocyte in culture. Connect Tissue Res 1989;24:265–75.
- Guo JF, Jourdian GW, McCallum DK. Culture and growth characteristics of chondrocytes encapsulated in alginate beads. Connect Tissue Res 1989;19: 227–97.
- 37. Binette F, McQuaid DP, Haudenschild DR, Yaeger PC, McPherson JM, Tubo R. Expression of a stable articular cartilage phenotype without evidence of hypertrophy by adult human articular chondrocytes *in vitro*. J Orthop Res 1998;16:207–16.
- Van Susante JL, Buma P, van beuningen HM, van den Berg WB, Yeth RP. Responsiveness of bovine chondrocytes to growth factors in medium with different serum concentrations. J Orthop Res 2000;18: 68–77.
- 39. Laurora S, Pizzimenti S, Briatore F, Fraioli A, Maggio M, Reffo P, *et al.* Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor ligands affect growth-related gene expression in human leukemic cells. J Pharmacol Exp Ther 2003;350:932–42.

- 40. Livne E. *In vitro* response of articular cartilage from mature mice to human transforming growth factor beta. Acta Anat 1994;149:185–94.
- 41. Malemud CJ, Killeen W, Hering TM, Purchio AF. Enhanced sulfated-proteoglycan core protein synthesis by incubation of rabbit chondrocytes with recombinant transforming growth factor-beta 1. J Cell Physiol 1991;149:152–9.
- 42. Hickery MS, Bayliss MT, Dudhia J, Lewthwaite JC, Edwards JC, Pitsillides AA. Age-related changes in the response of human articular cartilage to IL-1alpha and transforming growth factor-beta (TGF-beta): chondrocytes exhibit a diminished sensitivity to TGF-beta. J Biol Chem 2003;278:53063–71.
- Boyault S, Bianchi A, Moulin D, Morin S, Francois M, Netter P, *et al.* 15-Deoxy-delta(12,14)-prostaglandin J(2) inhibits IL-1beta-induced IKK enzymatic activity and IkappaBalpha degradation in rat chondrocytes through a PPARgamma-independent pathway. FEBS Lett 2004;372:33–40.
- 44. Belury MA, Moya-Camarena SY, Sun H, Snyder E, Davis JW, Cunningham ML, *et al.* Comparison of dose-response relationships for induction of lipid metabolizing and growth regulatory genes by peroxisome proliferators in rat liver. Toxic Appl Pharmacol 1998; 151:254–61.
- 45. Dressel U, Allen TL, Pippal JB, Rohde PR, Lau P, Muscat GE. The peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor beta/delta agonist, GW501516, regulates the expression of genes involved in lipid catabolism and energy uncoupling in skeletal muscle cells. Mol Endocrinol 2003;17:2477–93.
- Iwaki M, Matsuda M, Maeda N, Funahashi T, Matsuzawa Y, Makishima M, *et al.* Induction of adiponectin, a fat-derived antidiabetic and antiatherogenic factor, by nuclear receptors. Diabetes 2003;52: 1655–63.
- 47. Xu HE, Stanley TB, Montana VG, Lambert MH, Shearer BG, Cobb JE, *et al.* Structural basis for antagonist-mediated recruitment of nuclear co-repressors by PPAR-alpha. Nature 2002;415:813–7.
- Leesnitzer LM, Parks DJ, Bledsoe RK, Cobb JE, Collins JL, Consler TG, *et al.* Functional consequences of cysteine modification in the ligand binding sites of peroxisome proliferator activated receptors by GW9662. Biochemistry 2002;41:6640–50.
- 49. Cheng S, Afif H, Martel-Pelletier J, Pelletier JP, Li X, Farrajota K, et al. Activation of peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma inhibits interleukin-1beta-induced membrane-associated prostaglandin E2 synthase-1 expression in human synovial fibroblasts by interfering with Egr-1. J Biol Chem 2004; 279:22057–65.
- 50. François M, Richette P, Tsagris L, Raymondjean M, Fulchignoni-Lataud MC, Forest C, *et al.* Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor-gamma down-regulates chondrocyte matrix metalloproteinase-1 via a novel composite element. J Biol Chem 2004;279: 28411–8.
- Stove J, Fiedler J, Huch K, Gunther KP, Puhl W, Brenner R. Lipofection of rabbit chondrocytes and long lasting expression of lacZ reporter system in alginate beads. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2002;10:212–7.
- 52. Ip E, Farrell GC, Robertson G, Hall P, Kirsch R, Leclercq I. Central role of PPARalpha-dependent hepatic lipid turnover in dietary steatohepatitis in mice. Hepatology 2003;38:123–32.

- Djouadi F, Aubey F, Schlemmer D, Bastin J. Peroxisome proliferator activated receptor delta (PPARdelta) agonist but not PPARalpha corrects carnitin palmitoyl transferase 2 deficiency in human muscle cells. J Clin Endocrinol Metab 2005;90:1791–7.
- 54. Fahmi H, Pelletier JP, Di Battista JA, Cheung HS, Fernandes JC, Martel-Pelletier J. Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma activators inhibit MMP-1 production in human synovial fibroblasts likely by reducing the binding of the activator protein 1. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2002;10:100-8.
- 55. Henke BR, Blanchard SG, Brackeen MF, Brown KK, Cobb JE, Collins JL, *et al. N*-(2-Benzoylphenyl)-L-tyrosine PPARgamma agonists. 1. Discovery of a novel series of potent antihyperglycemic and antihyperlipidemic agents. J Med Chem 1998;41:5020–3.
- 56. Krey G, Braissant O, L'Horset F, Kalkhoven E, Perroud M, Parker MG, *et al.* Fatty acids, eicosanoids, and hypolipidemic agents identified as ligands of peroxisome proliferator-activated receptors by coactivator-dependent receptor ligand assay. Mol Endocrinol 1997;11:779–91.
- Seimandi M, Lemaire G, Pillon A, Perrin A, Carlavan I, Voegel JJ, *et al.* Differential responses of PPARalpha, PPARdelta, and PPARgamma reporter cell lines to selective PPAR synthetic ligands. Anal Biochem 2005; 344:8–15.
- Mix KS, Coon CI, Rosen ED, Suh N, Sporn MB, Brinckerhoff CE. Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor-gamma-independent repression of collagenase gene expression by 2-cyano-3,12-diooleana-1,9-dien-28-oic acid and prostaglandin 15 deoxy-delta(12,14)J2: a role for Smad signaling. Mol Pharmacol 2004;65:309–18.
- 59. Watanabe H, de Caestecker MP, Yamada Y. Transcriptional cross-talk between Smad, ERK1/2, and p38 mitogen-activated protein kinase pathways regulates transforming growth factor-beta-induced aggrecan gene expression in chondrogenic ADTC5 cells. J Biol Chem 2001;276:14466–73.
- Scharstuhl A, Diepens R, Lensen J, Vitters E, van Beuningen H, van der Kraan P, *et al.* Adenoviral overexpression of Smad-7 and Smad-6 differentially regulates TGF-beta-mediated chondrocyte proliferation and proteoglycan synthesis. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2003;11:773–82.
- 61. Fu M, Zhang J, Zhu X, Myles DE, Millson TM, Liu X, et al. Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma inhibits transforming growth factor beta-induced connective tissue growth factor expression in human aortic smooth muscle cells by interfering with Smad3. J Biol Chem 2001;276:45888–94.
- Yonekura A, Osaki M, Hirota Y, Tsukazaki T, Miyazaki Y, Matsumoto T, *et al.* Transforming growth factor-beta stimulates articular chondrocyte cell growth through p44/p42 MAP kinase (ERK) activation. Endocr J 1999;46:545–53.
- 63. Hirota Y, Tsukazaki T, Yonekura A, Miyazaki Y, Osaki M, Shindo H, *et al.* Activation of specific MEK-ERK cascade is necessary for TGFbeta signaling and crosstalk with PKA and PKC pathways in cultured rat articular chondrocytes. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2000;8:241–7.
- Studer RK, Chu CR. p38 MAPK and COX2 inhibition modulate human chondrocyte response to TGF-beta. J Orthop Res 2005;23:454–61.
- 65. Bagder AM, Roshak AK, Cook MN, Newmann-Tarr TM, Swift BA, Carlson K, *et al.* Differential effects of SB

242235, a selective p38 mitogen-activated protein kinase inhibitor, on IL-1 treated bovine and human cartilage/chondrocyte cultures. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2000;8:434–43.

- 66. Sylvia VL, Schwartz Z, Dean DD, Boyan BD. Transforming growth factor- β 1 regulation of resting zone chondrocytes is mediated by two separate but interacting pathways. Biochim Biophys Acta 2000;1496: 311–24.
- 67. Rosado E, Schwartz Z, Sylvia VL, Dean DD, Boyan BD. Transforming growth factor-β1 regulation of growth zone chondrocytes is mediated by multiple interacting pathways. Biochim Biophys Acta 2002;1590:1–15.
- Tchetina EV, Antoniou J, Tanzer M, Zukor DJ, Poole AR. Transforming growth factor-beta2 suppresses collagen cleavage in cultured human osteoarthritic cartilage, reduces expression of genes associated with chondrocyte hypertrophy and degradation, and increases prostaglandin E(2) production. Am J Pathol 2006;168: 131–40.
- Clark CA, Schwarz EM, Zhang X, Ziran NM, Drissi H, O'Keefe RJ, *et al.* Differential regulation of EP receptor isoforms during chondrogenesis and chondrocyte maturation. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 2005;328: 764–76.
- Aoyama T, Liang B, Okamoto T, Matsusaki T, Nishijo K, Ishibete T, *et al.* PGE₂ signal through EP2 promotes the growth of articular chondrocytes. J Bone Miner Res 2005;20:377–89.
- Tardif G, Pelletier JP, Dupuis M, Geng C, Cloutier JM, Martel-Pelletier J. Collagenase 3 production by human osteoarthritic chondrocytes in response to growth factors and cytokines is a function of the physiologic state of the cells. Arthritis Rheum 1999;42: 1147–58.
- Thompson CC, Clegg PD, Carter SD. Differential regulation of gelatinases by transforming growth factor beta-1 in normal equine chondrocytes. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2001;9:325–31.
- 73. Hui W, Rowan AD, Cawston T. Modulation of the expression of matrix metalloproteinase and tissue inhibitors of metalloproteinases by TGF-beta1 and IGF-1 in primary human articular and bovine nasal chondrocytes stimulated with TNF-alpha. Cytokine 2001;16:31–5.
- 74. Sabatini M, Bardiot A, Lesur C, Moulharat N, Thomas M, Richard I, *et al.* Effects of agonists of peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma on proteoglycan degradation and matrix metalloproteinase production in rat cartilage *in vitro*. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2002;10:673–9.
- 75. Curtis CL, Rees SG, Little CB, Flannery CR, Hughes CE, Wilson C, *et al.* Pathologic indicators of degradation and inflammation in human osteoarthritic cartilage are abrogated by exposure to n-3 fatty acids. Arthritis Rheum 2002;46:1544–53.
- Cuzzocrea S, Mazzon E, Dugo L, Patel NS, Serraino I, Di Paola R, *et al.* Reduction in the evolution of murine type II collagen-induced arthritis by treatment with rosiglitazone, a ligand of the peroxisome proliferatoractivated receptor gamma. Arthritis Rheum 2003;48: 3544–56.
- 77. Okamoto H, Iwamoto T, Kotabe S, Momohara S, Yamanaka H, Kamatani N. Inhibition of NF-kappaB signaling by fenofibrate, a peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor-alpha ligand, presents a therapeutic strategy for rheumatoid arthritis. Clin Exp Rheumatol 2005;23:323–30.