



Available at  
[www.ElsevierMathematics.com](http://www.ElsevierMathematics.com)

POWERED BY SCIENCE @ DIRECT®

Discrete Mathematics 280 (2004) 219–223

DISCRETE  
 MATHEMATICS

[www.elsevier.com/locate/disc](http://www.elsevier.com/locate/disc)

Note

## Directed triangles in directed graphs

Maurits de Graaf

*CWI, Kruislaan 413, Amsterdam 1098 SJ, The Netherlands*

Received 27 October 2002; received in revised form 3 October 2003; accepted 10 October 2003

---

### Abstract

We show that each directed graph (with no parallel arcs) on  $n$  vertices, each with indegree and outdegree at least  $n/t$  where  $t = 2.888997\dots$  contains a directed circuit of length at most 3. © 2003 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

*Keywords:* Girth; Digraph; Degree condition; Directed triangle

---

In this paper, directed graphs have no loops or parallel arcs. It is an intriguing conjecture of Cacetta and Häggkvist [2] that any directed graph on  $n$  vertices, each with outdegree at least  $\lceil n/k \rceil$  contains a directed circuit of length at most  $k$ . Surprisingly, the special case for  $k = 3$  is still open.

Instead of proving the conjecture, one may look for values of  $s$  so that any directed graph on  $n$  vertices with minimum outdegree at least  $n/s$ , contains a directed triangle. The highest value of  $s$  is due to Shen [6], who obtained the value

$$s = \frac{1}{3 - \sqrt{7}} = 2.8228757\dots \quad (1)$$

Shen's result improved approximations by Cacetta and Häggkvist [2] and Bondy [1].

It is not even known whether any directed graph on  $n$  vertices, each with both indegree and outdegree at least  $n/3$ , contains a directed triangle. Again, one may look for values of  $t$  so that any directed graph on  $n$  vertices, each with both indegree and outdegree at least  $n/t$  contains a directed triangle. The best result on this problem is in

---

*E-mail address:* [mauritsdegraaf@euronet.nl](mailto:mauritsdegraaf@euronet.nl) (M. de Graaf).

[3], where using (1) it is shown that  $t = \left(22 - 2\sqrt{7} + (1 + \sqrt{7})\sqrt{45 - 17\sqrt{7}}\right)/6 \approx 2.875$ . This improved the results obtained by Cacetta and Häggkvist [2] and Li and Brualdi [4].

In this note we use Shen's approximation (1) to show the following:

**Theorem 1.** *Any directed graph on  $n$  vertices, each with both indegree and outdegree at least  $n/t_0$  where*

$$t_0 = \frac{1}{72} \left( 241 - 17\sqrt{7} + 2\sqrt{4064 - 1522\sqrt{7}} \right) \cos \alpha,$$

where  $\alpha = \frac{1}{3} \arctan \left( 18\sqrt{1262428404\sqrt{7} - 1131169991}/1367549 \right)$  contains a directed triangle.

Note that  $t_0 \approx 2.8889971$ .

The theorem is proved by extending the approach of [3]. Before doing so, we introduce some notation. For each  $v \in V$  let  $E_v^+$  and  $E_v^-$  denote the sets of outneighbours and inneighbours of  $v$ , respectively. For  $u, v, w \in V$  let

$$E_{uv}^+ = E_u^+ \cap E_v^+, E_{uv}^- = E_u^- \cap E_v^-.$$

Moreover let

$$\varepsilon_v^+ = |E_v^+|, \quad \varepsilon_v^- = |E_v^-|, \quad \varepsilon_{uv}^+ = |E_{uv}^+|, \quad \varepsilon_{uv}^- = |E_{uv}^-|.$$

We recapitulate a number of earlier results in the following proposition.

**Proposition 2** (de Graaf et al. [3]). *Let  $D = (V, A)$  be a directed graph on  $n$  vertices with no directed triangle, where for each vertex  $v \in V$   $\varepsilon_v^+ \geq k$  and  $\varepsilon_v^- \geq k$ , such that deletion of any arc would violate this assumption. Then*

- (1) *there exists a vertex  $v'$  with both indegree and outdegree equal to  $k$ ,*
- (2) *if  $(u, v), (v, w), (u, w) \in A$  then  $\varepsilon_{uv}^- + \varepsilon_{vw}^+ \geq 4k - n$ ,*
- (3) *for each arc  $(u, v)$  of  $D$ :  $\varepsilon_{uv}^- \geq (3k - n)s$  and  $\varepsilon_{uv}^+ \geq (3k - n)s$ .*

Now we are in a position to prove Theorem 1. With respect to [3], the stronger inequality in this paper is obtained because instead of showing that the total number of arcs in one of the graphs induced by  $E_{v'}^+, E_{v'}^-$  exceeds  $k^2/2$ , we use the lower bound on the number of triangles in an undirected graph established by Moon and Moser [5].

**Theorem 3** (Moon and Moser [5]). *Let  $G = (V, E)$  be an (undirected) graph with  $|V| = n$ ,  $|E| = m$ . Then  $G$  contains at least  $m(4m - n^2)/3n$  (undirected)-triangles.*

**Proof of Theorem 1.** Suppose  $D = (V, A)$  is a directed graph with  $|V| = n$ , each with both indegree and outdegree at least  $k = \lceil n/t_0 \rceil$ , and without any directed triangle. We may assume that deleting any arc would give a vertex of indegree or outdegree less

than  $k$ . Let  $t = n/k$ . For future reference we note that

$$3 - \frac{2}{10} < s < t < t_0 < 3 - \frac{1}{10}, \tag{2}$$

where the lower bound for  $t$  follows from (1).

According to Proposition 2 there is a vertex with both indegree and outdegree equal to  $k$ . Let  $v'$  be such a vertex. Let  $u'$  be a vertex of minimum indegree in the subgraph induced by  $E_{v'}^-$  and let  $w'$  be a vertex of minimum outdegree in the subgraph induced by  $E_{v'}^+$ . So  $\varepsilon_{u'v'}^- \leq \varepsilon_{uv'}^-$  for all  $u \in E_{v'}^-$  and  $\varepsilon_{v'w'}^+ \leq \varepsilon_{v'w}^+$  for all  $w \in E_{v'}^+$ . By Shen's result we have

$$\varepsilon_{u'v'}^- < k/s \quad \text{and} \quad \varepsilon_{v'w'}^+ < k/s. \tag{3}$$

Without loss of generality we may assume that  $\varepsilon := \min\{\varepsilon_{u'v'}^-, \varepsilon_{v'w'}^+\} = \varepsilon_{u'v'}^-$ . Next, we consider the subgraph induced by  $E_{v'}^+$ .

By Proposition 2 we know that for all  $w \in E_{u'v'}^+$  we have

$$\varepsilon_{v'w}^+ \geq 4k - n - \varepsilon_{u'v'}^- = 4k - n - \varepsilon. \tag{4}$$

For all other  $k - \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+$  vertices in  $E_{v'}^+$  we have

$$\varepsilon_{v'w}^+ \geq \varepsilon_{v'w'}^+ \geq \varepsilon. \tag{5}$$

As  $n < 3k$  and  $\varepsilon < k/s$  it follows that  $4k - n - \varepsilon \geq k - \varepsilon \geq \varepsilon$ . By removing arcs if necessary, we may assume that in (4) and (5) equality holds.

For the number of arcs in  $E_{v'}^+$  we find, using  $n = tk$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} m &= \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+(4k - n - \varepsilon) + (k - \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+)\varepsilon \\ &= \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+((4 - t)k - 2\varepsilon) + \varepsilon k. \end{aligned}$$

Using Theorem 3 it follows that the number of transitive triangles  $T$  in the graph induced by  $E_{v'}^+$  is bounded from below according to

$$\begin{aligned} T &\geq -(1/3k)(\varepsilon(k - 2\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+) - k(t - 4)\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+) \\ &\quad \times (-4\varepsilon(k - 2\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+) + k(k + 4(-4 + t)\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+)). \end{aligned} \tag{6}$$

Let  $T_{\text{low}}(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t)$  denotes the lower bound for the number of transitive triangles given by the right-hand side of (6).

The number of transitive triangles is bounded from above by

$$\begin{aligned} T &\leq \sum_{w \in E_{v'}^+} \binom{\varepsilon_{v'w}^+}{2} \\ &= \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+ \binom{4k - n - \varepsilon}{2} + (k - \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+) \binom{\varepsilon}{2} \\ &\leq \frac{1}{2} \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+ ((4 - t)k - \varepsilon)^2 + \frac{1}{2} (k - \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+) \varepsilon^2. \end{aligned} \tag{7}$$

Let  $T_{\text{up}}(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t)$  denote the upper bound for the number of transitive triangles given by (7). Let  $U(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) = T_{\text{low}}(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) - T_{\text{up}}(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t)$ . We obtain

$$U(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) = c_0 + c_1 \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+ + c_2 (\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+)^2 \quad (8)$$

with  $c_0 = \varepsilon(5\varepsilon - 2k)k/6$ ,  $c_1 = (2\varepsilon + k(t-4))(k(14-3t) - 16\varepsilon)/6$  and  $c_2 = 4(2\varepsilon + k(t-4))^2/3k$ .

To conclude the proof, we will show that  $U(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) > 0$  for all  $(3-t)ks \leq \varepsilon < k/s$  and  $(3-t)ks \leq \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+ < k/s$  and for  $t$  in the interval defined by (2). This is simplified by the following lemma.

**Lemma 4.** *For  $(3-t)ks \leq \varepsilon < k/s$  and  $(3-t)ks \leq \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+ < k/s$ , and with  $t$  in the interval defined by (2), it holds that  $U(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) \geq U((3-t)ks, (3-t)ks, t)$ .*

This lemma will be proved at the end of this article. Using Lemma 4 we obtain the following inequality:

$$\begin{aligned} U(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) &\geq U((3-t)ks, (3-t)ks, t) = \frac{1}{6} k^3 s (3-t) \\ &\quad \times ((-58 + 675s - 1440s^2 + 864s^3) + (26 - 483s + 1248s^2 - 864s^3)t \\ &\quad + (-3 + 110s - 352s^2 + 288s^3)t^2 + (-8s + 32s^2 - 32s^3)t^3). \end{aligned}$$

Multiplying by  $3/s^4 k^3 (3-t)$  and substituting  $s = 1/(3 - \sqrt{7})$  leads to

$$\begin{aligned} &\frac{3}{s^4 k^3 (3-t)} (U((3-t)ks, (3-t)ks, t)) \\ &= (8\sqrt{7} - 32)t^3 + (361 - 103\sqrt{7})t^2 + (383\sqrt{7} - 1254)t + 1062 - 319\sqrt{7}. \end{aligned} \quad (9)$$

As  $t_0$  is a zero of the polynomial defined by (9), and, moreover, this polynomial is strictly positive on the interval for  $t$  defined by (2), it follows that  $T_{\text{low}}(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) > T_{\text{up}}(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t)$ . This contradiction finishes the proof of Theorem 1.  $\square$

**Proof of Lemma 4.** We first show that  $U(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t)$  (for fixed  $\varepsilon$  and  $t$ ) is an increasing function of  $\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+$ , by showing that the derivative with respect to  $\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+$  is strictly positive on the interval mentioned in Lemma 4.

$$\frac{dU(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t)}{d\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+} = \frac{2\varepsilon + k(t-4)}{6k} p(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t), \quad (10)$$

where

$$p(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) = -16\varepsilon(k - 2\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+) + k(k(14-3t) + 16(t-4)\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+).$$

As  $\varepsilon < k/s$  and  $t < 3$  the first term in (10) is negative. We proceed by showing that also  $p(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) < 0$ . As  $\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+ < k/s$  the coefficient of  $\varepsilon$  in  $p(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t)$  is negative. So  $p(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) \leq p((3-t)ks, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t)$  which is equal to

$$k^2(14-3t) - 16k^2s(3-t) + 16(2ks(3-t) + k(t-4))\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+. \quad (11)$$

As the coefficient of  $\varepsilon_{u'v'}^+$  in (11) is negative, we obtain:  $p((3-t)ks, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) \leq p((3-t)ks, (3-t)ks, t)$  where the latter equals

$$k^2 \left( -3 + \frac{169}{32-64s} + \frac{9}{64s} + 16s(2s-1) \left( t - \left( 3 - \frac{32s-3}{64s^2-32s} \right) \right)^2 \right).$$

As  $3 - (32s-3)/(64s^2-32s) < 3 - 2/10 < t < 3 - 1/10$ , we obtain

$$\frac{1}{k^2} p((3-t)ks, (3-t)ks, t) \leq \frac{1}{50} (265 + 8s(2s-21)) = \frac{77}{50} - \frac{6\sqrt{7}}{5} < 0.$$

This shows that  $U(\varepsilon, \varepsilon_{u'v'}^+, t) \geq U(\varepsilon, (3-t)ks, t)$ . Next, taking the derivative with respect to  $\varepsilon$  yields

$$6k \frac{dU(\varepsilon, (3-t)ks, t)}{d\varepsilon} = \varepsilon k^2 (10 + 64s(t-3) + 64s^2(t-3)^2) + 2k^3 q(t), \quad (12)$$

where  $q(t)$  only depends on  $t$ . As the coefficient of  $\varepsilon$  is negative on the considered interval for  $t$ , we find that the right-hand side of (12) is minimized when  $\varepsilon = k/2$ , which is a relaxation of  $\varepsilon < k/s$ . This leads to

$$6k \frac{dU(\varepsilon, (3-t)ks, t)}{d\varepsilon} \geq k^3 (3 + 2s(t-3)(-30 + 16s(-3+t)^2 + 11t)) > 0,$$

where the latter inequality follows by straightforward numerical evaluation using (2). This shows that

$$U(\varepsilon, (3-t)ks, t) \geq U((3-t)ks, (3-t)ks, t)$$

which finishes the proof of Lemma 4.  $\square$

## References

- [1] J.A. Bondy, Counting subgraphs: a new approach to the Cacetta–Häggkvist conjecture, *Discrete Math.* 165/166 (1997) 71–80.
- [2] L. Cacetta, R. Häggkvist, On minimal digraphs with given girth, in: F. Hoffman et al. (Eds.), *Proceedings of the Ninth Southeastern Conference on Combinatorics, Graph Theory, and Computing*, Congr. Numer. 21, Utilitas Math., Winnipeg, 1978, pp. 181–187.
- [3] M. de Graaf, A. Schrijver, P.D. Seymour, Directed triangles in directed graphs, *Discrete Math.* 110 (1992) 279–282.
- [4] Q. Li, R.A. Brualdi, On minimal regular digraphs with girth 4, *Czechoslovak Math. J.* 33 (1983) 439–447.
- [5] J.W. Moon, L. Moser, On a problem of Turán, *Publ. Math. Inst. Hungar. Acad. Sci.* 7 (1962) 283–286.
- [6] J. Shen, Directed triangles in digraphs, *J. Combin. Theory Ser. B* 74 (1998) 405–407.