Ultra low dose aerosol challenge with *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* leads to divergent outcomes in rhesus and cynomolgus macaques

Sally Sharpe a,*, Andrew White a, Fergus Gleeson b, Anthony McIntyre b, Donna Smyth a, Simon Clark a, Charlotte Sarfas a, Dominick Laddyc, Emma Rayner a, Graham Hall a, Ann Williams a, Mike Dennisa

a Public Health England, Porton Down, Wiltshire, UK
b The Churchill Hospital, Headington, Oxford, UK
c Aeras, Rockville, MD 20850, USA

**ARTICLE INFO**

Article history:
Received 19 August 2015
Received in revised form 2 October 2015
Accepted 6 October 2015

Keywords:
Tuberculosis
Non-human primate
Aerosol challenge
Low dose

**SUMMARY**

Well characterised animal models that can accurately predict efficacy are critical to the development of an improved TB vaccine. The use of high dose challenge for measurement of efficacy in Non-human primate models brings the risk that vaccines with the potential to be efficacious against natural challenge could appear ineffective and thus disregarded. Therefore, there is a need to develop a challenge regimen that is more relevant to natural human infection. This study has established that ultra-low dose infection of macaques via the aerosol route can be reproducibly achieved and provides the first description of the development of TB disease in both rhesus and cynomolgus macaques following exposure to estimated retained doses in the lung of less than 10 CFU of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. CT scanning in vivo and histopathology revealed differences in the progression and burden of disease between the two species. Rhesus macaques exhibited a more progressive disease and cynomolgus macaques showed a reduced disease burden. The ability to deliver reproducible ultra-low dose aerosols to macaques will enable the development of refined models of *M. tuberculosis* infection for evaluation of the efficacy of novel tuberculosis vaccines that offers increased clinical relevance and improved animal welfare.

Crown Copyright © 2015 Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

1. Introduction

Tuberculosis (TB) is a major global health problem, with 9 million new cases and nearly 1.5 million deaths annually [1]. With a third of the world's population estimated to be infected, and the effects of TB infection compounded by the emergence of multi-drug resistant strains and HIV co-infection, there is an urgent need for improved interventions, including a vaccine. The only currently available vaccine is *Mycobacterium bovis* Bacille Calmette Guerin (BCG) which protects children from developing severe TB disease [2], but it is unsuitable for use in people whose immune system is compromised, and has mostly failed to protect against pulmonary TB in adults [3].

The lack of a defined immunological correlate of protection for TB means that, in order to assess efficacy, candidate TB vaccines must enter large clinical trials involving thousands of at-risk individuals in endemic countries [4]. Therefore, preclinical animal models that can accurately predict the effectiveness of vaccines in humans through challenge studies are critical to achieving the goal of an improved TB vaccine. Because of their close similarity to humans, non-human primates (NHP) are excellent potential models of tuberculosis [5–7]. Reviews of published studies using the TB NHP model [5–7] reveal that the selection of model parameters, including the macaque species and route and size of the challenge dose, can affect the outcome of experimental TB exposure in NHPs. Both rhesus [8–15] and cynomolgus macaque species [11,16–19] are used to evaluate the efficacy of new TB vaccine candidates. Both species recapitulate aspects of human TB but which provides the most appropriate model for vaccine evaluation is a subject of debate.

The quantity of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* administered to evaluate vaccine efficacy is critical to the outcome of an efficacy study. The dose needs to be sufficient to induce a consistent and
measureable disease burden in all exposed animals but not so large as to overwhelm any protection provided by the host response. The readouts used routinely to measure the efficacy of new TB vaccines in NHP models such as changes in clinical parameters, bacterial burden and qualitative gross pathology and histopathological scoring systems have limited sensitivity [20]. This has necessitated the use of high doses of TB for challenge, which far exceed the estimated doses encountered during natural exposure, and bring the risk that potentially useful vaccines could be disregarded. Consequently, there is a growing view that a lower challenge dose (less than 10 infectious bacilli) that more closely resembles natural infection is required to refine the vaccine assessment process. The physical properties of \( M. \) \( \text{tuberculosis} \) (e.g. clumping) create difficulties in generating inocula containing very few bacilli from high titre stocks but the process of aerosolisation disrupts bacterial aggregates and generates aerosol particles which mostly contain single bacteria. Measurement of the outcome of very low dose challenge requires improved tools to provide more sensitive readouts of disease burden such as those offered by advanced in vivo imaging [21–23].

With the ultimate aim to establish an NHP model for vaccine assessment based upon ultra-low dose infection the present study was set up to provide proof of concept for the reproducible delivery of an ultra-low dose (ULD) of \( M. \) \( \text{tuberculosis} \) to macaques by the aerosol route; to characterise the outcome of ULD aerosol exposure; and compare the resulting disease in the two macaque species. Furthermore the potential benefit of computed tomography (CT) to provide sensitive measures of disease burden that could be used as readouts for evaluation of vaccine efficacy following low dose challenge was investigated.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Experimental animals

Eight male rhesus macaques and eight male cynomolgus macaques, aged 3–4 years, were obtained from established UK breeding colonies. Genetic analysis of these colonies has previously confirmed the rhesus macaques to be of the Indian genotype and cynomolgus macaques of Indonesian genotype. Absence of previous exposure to mycobacterial antigens was confirmed by a tuberculin skin test and screening using an ex-vivo IFN-\( \gamma \) ELISPOT (MabTech, Nacka, Sweden) to measure responses to PPD (SSI, Copenhagen, Denmark), and pooled 15-mer peptides of ESAT6 and CFP10 (Peptide Protein Research LTD, Fareham, U.K.).

Animals were housed in compatible social groups, in accordance with the Home Office (UK) Code of Practice for the Housing and Care of Animals Used in Scientific Procedures (1989), (now updated to Code of Practice for the housing and Care of Animals Bred, Supplied or Used for Scientific Purposes, December 2014, and the National Committee for Refinement, Reduction and Replacement (NC3Rs), Guidelines on Primate Accommodation, Care and Use, August 2006 (NC3Rs, 2006)). Animals were sedated by intramuscular (IM) injection with ketamine hydrochloride (Ketaset, 100 mg/ml, Fort Dodge Animal Health Ltd, Southampton, UK; 10 mg/kg) for procedures requiring removal from their housing. None of the animals had been used previously for experimental procedures. All animal procedures were approved by the Public Health England Ethical Review Committee, Porton Down, UK, and authorised under an appropriate UK Home Office project license.

2.2. Clinical procedures

Animals were monitored daily for behavioural and clinical changes. Behaviour was evaluated for contra-indicators including depression, withdrawal from the group, aggression, changes in feeding patterns, breathing pattern, respiration rate and cough. Prior to blood sample collection, aerosol challenge and euthanasia, animals were weighed, examined for gross abnormalities and body temperature measured. Red blood cell (RBC) haemoglobin levels were measured using a HaemaCue haemoglobinometer (Haemacue Ltd, Dronfield, UK) to identify the presence of anaemia, and erythrocyte sedimentation rates (ESR) were measured using the Sediplast system (Guest Medical, Edenderry, UK) to detect and monitor inflammation induced by infection with \( M. \) \( \text{tuberculosis} \).

2.3. \( M. \) \( \text{tuberculosis} \) challenge strain

The Erdman K01 stock (HPA-Sept 2011) used for challenge was prepared from stocks of the \( M. \) \( \text{tuberculosis} \) Erdman strain K 01 (BEI Resources). A stock suspension was initially prepared from a 5 ml bacterial starter culture originally generated from colonies grown on Middlebrook 7H11 supplemented with oleic acid, albumin, dextrose and catalase (OADC) selective agar (BioMerieux, UK). A liquid batch culture was then grown to logarithmic growth phase in 7H9 medium (Sigma–Aldrich, UK) supplemented with 0.05% (v/v) Tween 80 (Sigma–Aldrich, UK). Aliquots were stored at \(-80 \, ^\circ C\). Title of the stock suspension was determined from thawed aliquots by enumeration of colony forming units cultured onto Middlebrook 7H11 OADC selective agar.

2.4. Aerosol exposure

2.4.1. Apparatus and procedure

The methodology and apparatus used to deliver \( M. \) \( \text{tuberculosis} \) via the aerosol route was as previously described [14,20,24]. In brief, the aerosols were generated from a suspension of \( M. \) \( \text{tuberculosis} \) at a pre-determined concentration (see below) using a 3-jet Collison nebuliser (BGI) and delivered, using a modified Henderson apparatus [25] controlled by an AeromP (Biara) control unit [26], to the nares of each sedated animal via a modified veterinary anaesthesia mask. A ‘head-out’, plethysmography chamber (Buxco, Wilmington, North Carolina, USA) enabled the aerosol to be delivered simultaneously with the measurement of respiration rate.

2.4.2. Quantification of ultra-low aerosol dose

The number of bacilli deposited and retained in the lungs of macaques cannot be measured directly and the quantification of the dose must be calculated from the concentration of viable organisms in the aerosol (\( C_{\text{aero}} \)) and the volume of aerosol inhaled by the animal. This ‘presented dose’ (PD) is the number of organisms which the animals inhale. \( C_{\text{aero}} \) is either measured directly using air sampling within the system or may be calculated using the concentration of organisms in the nebuliser (\( C_{\text{nub}} \)) and a ‘spray factor’ which is a constant derived from data generated for the specific organism with identical aerosol exposure parameters. The calculations to derive the PD and the retained dose (the number of organisms assumed to be retained in the lung) have been described previously for high/medium aerosol doses [20,24]. Direct measurement of \( C_{\text{aero}} \) would not be possible for an ultra-low dose challenge and therefore the dose calculations were based upon \( C_{\text{nub}} \) and the spray factor.

Aerosol challenge data from previous experiments were used to develop and verify the calculation which would predict the retained dose, and a nebuliser concentration was selected to result in a retained dose of approximately 5 viable bacilli.

2.4.3. Macaque aerosol exposure

Four rhesus and four cynomolgus macaques (group A) were exposed to aerosols of \( M. \) \( \text{tuberculosis} \) five weeks before the second
group of four rhesus and four cynomolgus macaques (group B) (Figure 1). The study was conducted in two phases to allow evaluation of the reproducibility of the aerosol delivery system.

2.5. Computed tomography (CT) imaging

CT scans were collected from animals using a 16 slice Lightspeed CT scanner (General Electric Healthcare, Milwaukee, WI, USA), three, eight and eleven weeks after aerosol exposure to M. tuberculosis (Figure 1) as described previously [27,28]. In order to enhance visualisation of lesions and lymph nodes, Niopam 300 (Bracco, Milan, Italy), a non-ionic, iodinated contrast medium, was administered intravenously (IV) at 2 ml/kg body weight. Scans were evaluated for the number and distribution of pulmonary lesions across lung lobes and the presence of nodule cavitation, consolidation, consolidation as an indicator of alveolar pneumonia and a ‘Tree-in–bud’ pattern as an indicator of bronchocentric pneumonia. The lung-associated lymph nodes were assessed for enlargement and the presence of necrosis.

2.6. Immune response analysis: Interferon-gamma (IFN-γ) ELISpot

The M. tuberculosis-specific immune response was evaluated at two weekly intervals throughout the study (Figure 1). Peripheral blood mononuclear cells were isolated from heparin anticoagulated blood using standard methods. An IFN-γ ELISpot assay was used to estimate the numbers and IFN-γ production capacity of mycobacteria-specific T cells in PBMCs using a human/simian IFN-γ kit (MabTech, Nacka, Sweden), as described previously [29].

2.7. Necropsy

The necropsies were conducted either, four weeks (Group A) or 12 weeks (Group B) after aerosol exposure to M. tuberculosis (Figure 1). Animals were anaesthetised and clinical data collected. Blood samples were taken prior to euthanasia by intra-cardiac injection of a lethal dose of anaesthetic (Dolelethal, Vetoquinol UK Ltd, 140 mg/kg). A post-mortem examination was performed immediately and gross pathological changes were scored using an established system based on the number and extent of lesions present in the lungs, spleen, liver, kidney and lymph nodes, as described previously [20]. Samples of spleen, liver, kidneys and tracheobronchial, inguinal and axillary lymph nodes were removed and sampled for quantitative bacteriology. The lung, together with the heart and attached tracheobronchial and associated lymph nodes, were removed intact. The lymph nodes were measured and examined for lesions. These were fixed by intra-tracheal infusion with 10% neutral buffered formalin (NBF) using a syringe and 13CH Nelaton catheter (J.A.K. Marketing, York, UK). The catheter tip was inserted into each bronchus in turn via the trachea; the lungs were infused until they were expanded to a size considered to be normal inspiratory dimensions, and the trachea ligated to retain the fluid. The infused lung was immersed in 10% NBF. In addition, samples of kidneys, liver, spleen, and sub clavicular, hepatic inguinal and axillary lymph nodes were fixed in 10% NBF.

2.8. Thoracic lymph node evaluation

At necropsy, eight thoracic lymph nodes (right and left cranial, carinal, sub-clavicular, para-tracheal) were measured and scored.
for enlargement according to the system in Table 1A. Nodes measuring 5 mm or more were considered to be enlarged. The enlargement scores attributed to each individual node were summed to provide a total score for the animal (maximum score = 24). In addition, the proportion of thoracic lymph nodes showing enlargement in each animal was calculated: number of lymph nodes measuring >5mm/8, where 8 = the number of lymph nodes evaluated.

2.9. Pathology studies

2.9.1. Gross examination following fixation

The fixed lungs were sliced serially and lesions counted as described previously [27]. Each lung lobe was evaluated separately and discrete lesions were counted in the parenchyma. Where lesions had coalesced, these were measured and recorded. Lung-associated lymph nodes, particularly around the tracheal bifurcation, were dissected and weighed. The remaining tissues were examined during trimming.

2.9.2. Histopathological examination

A representative samples from each lung lobe (seven per animal) and other organs, were processed to paraffin wax, sectioned at 3–5 μm and stained with haematoxylin and eosin (HE). For each lung lobe, tissue slices containing obvious lesions were chosen for histological examination. Where gross lesions were not visible, a sample was taken from a pre-defined anatomical location from each lobe to establish consistency between animals. Sections of lung-associated lymph nodes (trachea-bronchial at the bifurcation and cranial and caudal to the bifurcation) and other tissues were evaluated for the presence of tuberculosis lesions. Lesions in the lung parenchyma were identified, categorised and counted as described previously [27]. Briefly, lesions defined as “unorganised” (Types 1–3) were those lacking a peripheral cuff of lymphocytes, while “organised” lesions were those with a cuff of lymphocytes (Types 4 and 5). In one HE stained section from each lung lobe, granulomas types, as those with a cuff of lymphocytes (Types 4 and 5). In one HE stained section from each lung lobe, granulomas types, as described in Table 1B, were counted and recorded. Furthermore, additional, morphological features were recorded: airway invasion, lymphatic inflammation/involvement, arterial wall inflammation by inflammatory cells and granulomas in bronchovascular, connective tissue. To evaluate the degree of necrosis in tracheobronchial lymph nodes, an HE stained section of an enlarged node from each animal, was scanned digitally (3D Histotek Panoramic 250) using “Panoramic Viewer software” Version 1.15.2 SP 2 (3D Histotek Ltd, Budapest). The necrotic areas within the scanned sections were defined and the resulting surface area divided by the total surface area of the lymph node, then multiplied by 100 to give a percentage.

2.10. Bacteriology

The spleen, kidneys, liver and tracheobronchial lymph nodes were sampled for the presence of viable M. tuberculosis post-mortem as described previously [14]. Weighed tissue samples were homogenised in 2 ml of sterile water, then either serially diluted in sterile water prior to being plated, or plated directly onto Middlebrook 7H11 OADC selective agar. Plates were incubated for 3 weeks at 37 °C and resultant colonies were confirmed as M. tuberculosis and counted.

2.11. Statistical analyses

Comparison of ex-vivo ELISpot assay responses was completed using the area under the curve (AUC) of each animal’s response calculated using Sigmaplot version 10 (Systat Software Inc, Hounslow, UK). AUC values were compared between test groups using the non-parametric Mann–Whitney U test, Minitab version 15 (Minitab Ltd, Coventry, UK). Differences in the qualitative pathology scores were compared between species and test groups using the non-parametric Mann–Whitney U test, Minitab version 15 (Minitab Ltd, Coventry, UK). The Spearman correlation test was used to determine the level of correlation between study parameters using GraphPad Prism, version 5.01 (GraphPad Software Inc, La Jolla, California, USA).

3. Results

3.1. Reproducible aerosol delivery of ultra-low doses of M. tuberculosis

Exposure to ULD aerosols of M. tuberculosis resulted in an established infection in all challenged animals. The presented and estimated retained aerosol doses (Table 2) were consistent across the rhesus and cynomolgus macaque species and between study groups A and B which received aerosol challenge five weeks apart. Whether grouped by species or study group, the average presented dose was calculated as 24 or 25 cfu and the estimated retained dose in the lung was 3 or 4 cfu.

The inoculum delivered by aerosol was also quantified as lesion forming units (LFU) defined as the number of TB-induced nodules counted from CT scans collected 3 weeks after aerosol exposure, and was assumed to provide a measure of primary lesions. The number of TB-induced nodules counted from CT scans collected three weeks after aerosol exposure (LFU) was similarly low and consistent across species (range: 1 to 10) with a median of six nodules for all animals in the study and medians of six nodules for rhesus and four nodules in cynomolgus macaques. The number of LFU counted in animals in group A were not significantly different to the number counted in animals in group B for either species (rhesus macaque, p = 0.2857; cynomolgus macaque, p = 0.0857).

3.2. Clinical assessment post exposure

All macaques controlled disease after ULD aerosol challenge. None of the animals of either species exhibited abnormal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pathology scoring systems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Thoracic lymph node enlargement score</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size (mm)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5–10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;10–20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Lung parenchyma lesion categorisation system</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesion type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

S. Sharpe et al. / Tuberculosis 96 (2016) 1–12
behaviour, signs of respiratory disease or coughing. However both rhesus and cynomolgus macaques had minor losses in body weight (<4% peak post exposure weight) over the first 4 weeks after aerosol exposure. A trend for more, but non-significant (<10% peak post challenge weight) weight loss was seen in rhesus macaques at week 12, with three animals showing losses of between 2 and 8%; by contrast, weight losses of <2% were seen in the cynomolgus macaques. Body temperature, red blood cell haemoglobin concentrations and levels of inflammatory markers (ESR) remained within normal range throughout the study period.

3.3. CT evaluation of pulmonary disease

Assessment of the number and distribution of TB-induced nodules in the lungs from the CT scans at 3, 8 and 11 weeks after aerosol exposure to *M. tuberculosis* showed an increase in nodule numbers over time, which tended to be greater in rhesus macaques. Aerosol delivery led to the development of nodules in multiple lung lobes by week 3; lesions were more prevalent in the right lung lobes (14 of the 16 macaques in the study) than in the left lung lobes (8 of 16 macaques in the study), and distribution was similar between the species (Figure 2). Nodules were detected at similar frequencies in both species at weeks 3 and 8. In rhesus macaques, nodules were detected throughout the study to evaluate the lesion forming number 3 weeks post-aerosol exposure. Responses to CFP10 and ESAT6 were not significantly different between the species during the first four weeks after infection. However, by 12 weeks, responses to ESAT6 in rhesus macaques were significantly higher than the responses in the cynomolgus macaques ($p = 0.03$).

When all animals in the study were evaluated as a single group, a significant correlation was found between the number of pulmonary nodules identified on CT scans three weeks after aerosol exposure and the AUC of the PPD-specific response measured during the four weeks after infection ($p = 0.01, r = 0.61$), and a correlation that approached significance was seen with the response to ESAT6 ($p = 0.06, r = 0.548$). The number of nodules counted on the eighth week CT scans positively correlated with the AUC of the responses made in the eight week period after exposure, although only the correlation with the CFP10-specific response reached significance ($p = 0.0315, r = 0.7807$). Correlations that reached significance were not seen between the AUC of the PPD, CFP10 or ESAT6-specific responses measured during the first 12 weeks after infection in all study animals and the number of nodules counted from the CT scans collected at week 12 (PPD, $p = 0.08$, $r = 0.67$; ESAT6, $p = 0.097, r = 0.6386$; CFP10, $p = 0.152, r = 0.5663$). When relationships were evaluated in the rhesus and cynomolgus species separately correlations between the AUC of the responses measured in the four, eight or 12 week periods after exposure, and nodule numbers from the CT scans at weeks three or 11 after exposure, did not reach significance.

3.5. Pathological evaluation of disease burden

Disease burden was evaluated four weeks after aerosol exposure in four rhesus and four cynomolgus macaques, and 12 weeks after exposure in the remaining eight animals. The gross pathology score system did not reveal significant differences between the level of

---

**Table 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exposure group</th>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Animal identification number</th>
<th>Presented dose (cfu)</th>
<th>Estimated retained dose (cfu)</th>
<th>Lesion forming units 3 weeks post-aerosol exposure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group A</td>
<td>Rhesus</td>
<td>T7</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>T21</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>T26</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>T41</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cynomolgus</td>
<td>980BEAA</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>978ABJ</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>970CDA</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>545ACEA</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group B</td>
<td>Rhesus</td>
<td>T51</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>T59</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>T64</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>T75</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cynomolgus</td>
<td>044HAFC</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>031 MN</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>406ADM</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>980ABAGB</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>980ABAGB</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

An *ex-vivo* ELISpot assay was applied at two weekly intervals throughout the study to evaluate the *M. tuberculosis*-specific immune response to infection. Response kinetics were similar in the two macaque species with peak responses detected six weeks after infection. However, the frequency of IFNγ secreting cells specific for TB antigens detected in rhesus macaques was higher than the frequencies seen in cynomolgus macaques (Figure 3). AUC analysis confirmed the difference in the PPD-specific response between the species to approach significance in the first four week period ($p = 0.05$) and for the response to be significantly higher in rhesus macaques during the 12 weeks ($p = 0.03$) after aerosol exposure. Responses to CFP10 and ESAT6 were not significantly different between the species during the first four weeks after infection. However, by 12 weeks, responses to ESAT6 in rhesus macaques were significantly higher than the responses in the cynomolgus macaques ($p = 0.03$).

When all animals in the study were evaluated as a single group, significant correlation was found between the number of pulmonary nodules identified on CT scans three weeks after aerosol exposure and the AUC of the PPD-specific response measured during the four weeks after infection ($p = 0.01, r = 0.61$), and a correlation that approached significance was seen with the response to ESAT6 ($p = 0.06, r = 0.548$). The number of nodules counted on the eighth week CT scans positively correlated with the AUC of the responses made in the eight week period after exposure, although only the correlation with the CFP10-specific response reached significance ($p = 0.0315, r = 0.7807$). Correlations that reached significance were not seen between the AUC of the PPD, CFP10 or ESAT6-specific responses measured during the first 12 weeks after infection in all study animals and the number of nodules counted from the CT scans collected at week 12 (PPD, $p = 0.08$, $r = 0.67$; ESAT6, $p = 0.097, r = 0.6386$; CFP10, $p = 0.152, r = 0.5663$). When relationships were evaluated in the rhesus and cynomolgus species separately correlations between the AUC of the responses measured in the four, eight or 12 week periods after exposure, and nodule numbers from the CT scans at weeks three or 11 after exposure, did not reach significance.

3.4. IFNγ response to infection

An *ex-vivo* ELISpot assay was applied at two weekly intervals throughout the study to evaluate the *M. tuberculosis*-specific immune response to infection. Response kinetics were similar in the two macaque species with peak responses detected six weeks after infection. However, the frequency of IFNγ secreting cells specific for TB antigens detected in rhesus macaques was higher than the frequencies seen in cynomolgus macaques (Figure 3). AUC analysis confirmed the difference in the PPD-specific response between the species to approach significance in the first four week period ($p = 0.05$) and for the response to be significantly higher in rhesus macaques during the 12 weeks ($p = 0.03$) after aerosol exposure. Responses to CFP10 and ESAT6 were not significantly different between the species during the first four weeks after infection. However, by 12 weeks, responses to ESAT6 in rhesus macaques were significantly higher than the responses in the cynomolgus macaques ($p = 0.03$).

When all animals in the study were evaluated as a single group, significant correlation was found between the number of pulmonary nodules identified on CT scans three weeks after aerosol exposure and the AUC of the PPD-specific response measured during the four weeks after infection ($p = 0.01, r = 0.61$), and a correlation that approached significance was seen with the response to ESAT6 ($p = 0.06, r = 0.548$). The number of nodules counted on the eighth week CT scans positively correlated with the AUC of the responses made in the eight week period after exposure, although only the correlation with the CFP10-specific response reached significance ($p = 0.0315, r = 0.7807$). Correlations that reached significance were not seen between the AUC of the PPD, CFP10 or ESAT6-specific responses measured during the first 12 weeks after infection in all study animals and the number of nodules counted from the CT scans collected at week 12 (PPD, $p = 0.08$, $r = 0.67$; ESAT6, $p = 0.097, r = 0.6386$; CFP10, $p = 0.152, r = 0.5663$). When relationships were evaluated in the rhesus and cynomolgus species separately correlations between the AUC of the responses measured in the four, eight or 12 week periods after exposure, and nodule numbers from the CT scans at weeks three or 11 after exposure, did not reach significance.
number of nodules in the lung.

¼ disease present in rhesus and cynomolgus macaques at either four
fi

Grey and rhesus (panel B) and cynomolus macaques (panel C) in group B (12 week study).

Number of TB-induced nodules counted from the CT scans collected from
species and the difference seen at week 12 approached signi-

± rhesus macaques the mean number of discrete (10.8 ± 7.8 to
14 ± 22.5) and coalesced (3.8 ± 0.8 to 4.3 ± 2.9) lesions noted
increased between four and 12 weeks post challenge and

Figure 2. Number of TB-induced nodules counted from the CT scans collected from
rhesus (panel A1) and cynomolgus macaques (panel A2) in Group A (4 week study),
and rhesus (panel B) and cynomolus macaques (panel C) in group B (12 week study).
Grey fills shows the number of lesions in each lung lobe and black fills show the total
number of nodules in the lung.

disease present in rhesus and cynomolgus macaques at either four
(p = 0.47) or 12 weeks (p = 0.06) after TB exposure (Figure 4A).
However, there was a trend for scores to increase over time in both
species and the difference seen at week 12 approached significance.

Gross lesion data following fixation and sectioning of the lung
lobes are summarised in Table 4, and supplementary table 2. In
rhesus macaques the mean number of discrete (10.8 ± 7.8 to
14 ± 22.5) and coalesced (3.8 ± 0.8 to 4.3 ± 2.9) lesions noted
increased between four and 12 weeks post challenge and
The mean volume of coalesced lesions increased from $9682 \pm 4602 \text{ mm}^3$ to $20,092 \pm 21,293 \text{ mm}^3$. By contrast, in the cynomolgus macaques, the mean number of discrete lesions decreased ($19.3 \pm 13.2$ to $10.3 \pm 7.2$) between four and 12 weeks post challenge. At four and 12 weeks post challenge, only three coalesced lesions were observed at each time point; however, the mean gross volume increased from $447 \pm 539 \text{ mm}^3$ to $1409 \pm 1307 \text{ mm}^3$.

Enlarged tracheo-bronchial and associated lymph nodes were seen in both macaque species at four and 12 weeks after exposure to ULD TB aerosols. Application of a qualitative scoring system to evaluate the level of enlargement during gross examination revealed non-significant trends for the enlargement to be greater in rhesus than in cynomolgus at both four and 12 weeks post—challenge, and to increase over time in both species (Figure 4B). The proportion of tracheo-bronchial lymph nodes showing enlargement was greater in rhesus than in cynomolgus at both

![Figure 3](image-url)
weeks four (p = 0.0360) and 12 (p = 0.102), and over time more tracheobronchial lymph nodes became enlarged in both species but differences did not reach significance (Figure 4C). Following fixation, the combined weights of the three heaviest, tracheobronchial lymph nodes in the rhesus macaques were 18.0 g and 20.8 g at four and 12 weeks post challenge, respectively. In cynomolgus macaques, the values were 10.6 g and 9.4 g, respectively.

Microscopic findings are illustrated in Figure 5. TB lesions were present in the lungs of all animals at four and twelve weeks post—challenge. In general, all lesion types were observed in the majority of animals at both time points, with Type 5 lesions being most frequent. In the cynomolgus macaques at four weeks post challenge, lesions were infrequent and often well demarcated (Figure 5A). By contrast, in rhesus macaques at the same time point, large, irregular areas of coalesced lesions with poorly demarcated borders were often noted (Figure 5B) as well as discrete lesion types. By 12 weeks post challenge, in the cynomolgus macaques, lesion size had generally decreased compared to the early time point (Figure 5C), although some coalesced lesions were still noted. However, in the rhesus macaques, large, coalescing areas were more prominent than at four weeks post challenge (Figure 5D), with scattered, discrete lesions also present. Small, cavitary lesions (Figure 5D) were noted infrequently involving the airways in two animals. Additional, microscopic features, comprising airway invasion (Figure 5B, D, E), lymphatic involvement/inflammation (Figure 5E), vascular wall invasion by inflammatory cells (Figure F), and the presence of granulomas in broncho-vascular connective tissue (Figure 5E and F), were present at both four and 12 weeks post challenge in the lungs of rhesus macaques, but with reduced frequency at the latter time point. In the cynomolgus macaques, these features were also observed at four weeks post challenge; however, by 12 weeks, evidence of airway invasion was absent and lymphatic involvement/inflammation and the presence of granulomas in broncho-vascular connective tissue was reduced. There was no difference in the frequency of vascular invasion by inflammatory cells between the species.

The tracheobronchial lymph nodes examined from all animals at both time points were enlarged, with marked effacement of normal, nodal architecture by granulomatous inflammatory cells and prominent, caseous necrosis. The percentage of the lymph node surface area showing necrosis increased with time in both species (Table 4, supplementary Table 2), and was higher in the rhesus macaques compared to the cynomolgus macaques, although these differences did not reach statistical significance.

The prevalence of disease in extra-pulmonary tissues was similar between the species. In the rhesus macaques four weeks post challenge, tuberculous lesions were noted in the spleen (two out of four), liver (three out of four) and subclavicular lymph node (three out of four). At 12 weeks, lesions were noted in the spleen (one out of four), liver (four out of four), kidneys (two out of four), subclavicular lymph node (two out of four) and parietal pleura (two out of two examined). In the cynomolgus macaques at four weeks post challenge, extra-pulmonary lesions were observed in the spleen (three out of four), liver (three out of four), subclavicular lymph node (two out of four), right axillary lymph node (two out of four) and hepatic lymph node (two out of two examined). At 12 weeks post challenge, lesions were seen in the spleen (two out of four), liver (one out of four) and subclavicular lymph node (one out of three examined). All other tissues examined were negative for the presence of tuberculous lesions.

### 3.6. Extra-pulmonary organ-specific bacterial burden

The level of bacterial burden was evaluated in the liver, spleen, kidneys and tracheobronchial lymph nodes in all animals. A similar frequency of isolation from tissues and level of bacterial burden was seen across the species at week four and twelve together with a trend for less frequent isolation from tissues collected from animals.
at week twelve than week four in both species (Table 5). M. tuberculosis was most commonly isolated from the tracheobronchial lymph nodes, which showed the highest cfu/g burden of the tissues assessed.

4. Discussion

Well characterised animal models that can accurately predict the effectiveness of vaccines are critical to achieving the goal of an improved TB vaccine. There is a consensus that the challenge dose used to evaluate vaccine efficacy should be a balance between a dose sufficiently low to simulate natural human exposure to M. tuberculosis whilst retaining the ability to reliably infect all of the challenged animals. This study has established that ultra-low dose infection of macaques via the aerosol route can be reproducibly achieved. Following exposure to aerosols containing <28 cfu M. tuberculosis Erdman, animals were estimated to have retained a dose of three or four bacilli in the lungs. These estimates are supported by the findings from CT scans taken three weeks after exposure, that show a median number of six TB-induced nodules in the lungs of each animal in the group. As the aerosolisation process creates mono-dispersed particles, it can be assumed that TB bacilli

---

Figure 5. Examples of microscopic changes in the lung. (A) Animal 980BEEA (cynomolgus macaque, 4 weeks pc). Type 5 lesion with central necrosis; well demarcated from surrounding parenchyma. Calibration bar = 500 μm. HE. (B) Animal T7 (rhesus macaque, 4 weeks pc). Large, coalescing area of granulomatous inflammation with airway invasion (arrow). Calibration bar = 500 μm. HE. (C) Animal 044HAF (cynomolgus macaque, 12 weeks post challenge). Small, well demarcated, Type 5 lesion. Calibration bar = 500 μm. HE. (D) Animal T64 (rhesus macaque, 12 weeks post challenge). Irregular, large area of coalescing, granulomatous inflammation with airway invasion (arrow). Calibration bar = 500 μm. HE. (E) Animal 980BEEA (cynomolgus macaque, 4 weeks post challenge). Broncho-vascular, granulomatous inflammation with lymphatic involvement (asterisks) and airway invasion (arrow). Calibration bar = 200 μm. HE. (F) Animal T75 (rhesus macaque, 12 weeks post challenge). Granulomatous inflammation in broncho-vascular connective tissue, surrounding and infiltrating arteries. Calibration bar = 200 μm. Inset, arterial wall infiltration by inflammatory cells. Calibration bar = 50 μm. HE.
The difference in the disease burden during the course of an experimental infection. The correlation seen in this study between pulmonary lesion development measured as number of nodules on CT scans, and the early elevation of body temperature and levels of interferon-γ (IFN-γ) in infection that will be a valuable readout of vaccine efficacy. However, the macaques in this study did not exhibit abnormal behaviours or marked clinical signs when infection was initiated with very low numbers of bacilli. Therefore, in very low dose models, changes in clinical parameters may not be sufficiently discriminatory meaning that alternative, more sensitive approaches to evaluate disease burden are required.

Computed tomography allowed the identification of changes in vivo that provided the only clinical measure that was able to identify differences in disease development between the macaque species during this study, and thus provided a critical tool for evaluation of disease burden during the course of an experimental infection. The correlation seen in this study between pulmonary burden measured as number of nodules on CT scans, and the early IFN-γ response, supports the hypothesis that the initial response to challenge, as measured by ELISPOT, reflects the antigen load. Whilst computed tomography undoubtedly provides a sensitive measure of disease development, further work is required to determine whether the readout used in this study would be sufficient to provide a measure of vaccine efficacy, or whether the additional metabolic activity measures provided by PET-CT will be required [23]. The frequency of M. tuberculosis antigen-specific IFN-γ-secreting cells measured by ELISPOT in the rhesus macaques in this study were at similar levels to those measured after high dose challenge [14] and further supports the use of the ULD model for the study of potential immune correlates and biomarkers.

This study has established proof of concept for the reproducible delivery of very low dose aerosols of M. tuberculosis to rhesus and cynomolgus macaques and described differences in disease outcome between the species. This will enable the development of a more refined model of M. tuberculosis infection that will be a valuable addition to the portfolio of models already in use to evaluate the efficacy of novel tuberculosis vaccines and therapeutics. Such a model would have advantages over high dose challenge...


S. Sharpe et al. / Tuberculosis 96 (2016) 1–12

models not only due to its increased relevance to human infection, but also with regard to the improvement in the welfare of animals used in the efficacy studies through reduction of the disease burden.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by Aeras and the Department of Health, UK. The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the Department of Health. We thank the staff of the Biological Investigations Group at PHE Porton and the PHE macaque colonies for assistance in conducting studies; Tracy Benford and Faye Lanni for bacteriology and aerobiology support, Katie West for support with the immune response analysis, Professor Geoff Pearson for histopathology peer review and Laura Hunter for histology support and Aeras NHP Model Development Group for constructive discussions.

Funding: None.

Competing interests: None declared.

Ethical approval: All procedures described in this paper were conducted under the authority of a Home Office approved project licence that had undergone ethical review by the Institute’s Animal Welfare and Ethical Review Body as required under the UK Animals (Scientific Procedure) Act, 1986.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data related to this article can be found at http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tube.2015.10.004.

References


