# Mesoderm formation in response to *Brachyury* requires FGF signalling

## S. Schulte-Merker and J.C. Smith

Laboratory of Developmental Biology, National Institute for Medical Research, The Ridgeway, Mill Hill, London NW7 1AA, UK.

**Background:** The Brachyury (T) gene is required for the formation of posterior mesoderm and for axial development in both mouse and zebrafish embryos. In these species, and in Xenopus, the gene is expressed transiently throughout the presumptive mesoderm, and transcripts then persist in notochord and posterior tissues. In Xenopus embryos, expression of the Xenopus homologue of Brachyury, Xbra, can be induced in presumptive ectoderm by basic fibroblast growth factor (FGF) and activin; in the absence of functional FGF or activin signalling pathways, expression of the gene is severely reduced. Ectopic expression of Xbra in presumptive ectoderm causes mesoderm to be formed. As Brachyury and its homologues encode sequence-specific DNA-binding proteins, it is likely that each functions by directly activating downstream mesoderm-specific genes.

**Results:** We show that expression in *Xenopus* embryos of RNA encoding a dominant-negative FGF receptor

inhibits the mesoderm-inducing activity of *Xbra*. We demonstrate that ectopic expression of *Xbra* activates transcription of the embryonic FGF gene, and that embryonic FGF can induce expression of *Xbra*. This suggests that the two genes are components of a regulatory loop. Consistent with this idea, dissociation of *Xbra*-expressing cells causes a dramatic and rapid reduction in levels of *Xbra*, but the reduction can be inhibited by addition of FGF.

**Conclusion:** Formation of mesoderm tissue requires an intact FGF signalling pathway downstream of *Brachyury*. This requirement is due to a regulatory loop, in which *Brachyury* activates expression of a member of the FGF family, and FGF maintains expression of *Brachyury*. The existence of this loop explains why embryos lacking an FGF signalling pathway appear similar to those mutant for *Brachyury*, and why over-expression of truncated FGF receptors seems to inhibit induction of *Brachyury* expression by activin.

### Current Biology 1995, 5:62-67

## Background

The Brachyury (T) gene is required for the formation of posterior mesoderm and for axial development in both mouse and zebrafish embryos [1-4]. In all vertebrates, the gene is initially expressed throughout the presumptive mesoderm, and transcripts then persist in notochord and in posterior tissue [5,6]. In Xenopus embryos, expression of Xbra, the Xenopus homologue of Brachyury, can be induced in presumptive ectoderm by the mesoderminducing factors basic (b) fibroblast growth factor (FGF) and activin [7]. If signalling in response to FGF or activin is inhibited by over-expression of truncated versions of the FGF or activin receptors, expression of Xbra in the intact embryo is severely reduced [8-10]. Expression of Xbra is also inhibited if cells of the Xenopus embryo are dispersed during cleavage and blastula stages, thereby disrupting cell-cell communication [11].

Over-expression of Xbra RNA in the presumptive ectoderm of Xenopus embryos causes ventral mesoderm formation [12], and co-expression of Xbra with the noggin gene, which encodes a secreted dorsalizing factor [13,14], leads to the formation of dorsal tissues, such as notochord and skeletal muscle [15]. Brachyury and its homologues encode sequence-specific DNA-binding proteins [16], suggesting that each exerts its mesoderm-inducing effects by directly activating downstream mesoderm-specific genes. In this study, however, we show that formation of both dorsal and ventral mesoderm requires an intact FGF

Correspondence to: J.C. Smith.

signalling pathway downstream of Brachyury. This requirement results from a regulatory loop, in which Brachyury activates expression of a member of the FGF family and FGF maintains expression of Brachyury. The existence of this regulatory loop may explain why embryos lacking a functional FGF signalling pathway [8] appear so similar to those mutant for Brachyury [1,3]. It also explains why over-expression of truncated FGF receptors in the animal caps of Xenopus embryos seems to inhibit the induction of Xbra expression by activin [17-19]. Our results show that Xbra expression is induced by activin under these circumstances, but that in the absence of a functional FGF signalling pathway, Xbra expression is not maintained. Finally, bearing this observation in mind, we discuss whether the apparent inhibition of Xbra expression in intact embryos that results from over-expression of truncated FGF receptors [9] similarly arises as a result of failure to maintain Xbra transcription, rather than failure to induce transcription.

### Results

## *Xenopus Brachyury* function requires an intact FGF signalling pathway

Over-expression of Xbra RNA in animal caps of Xenopus embryos leads to formation of ventral mesoderm [12]. In preliminary experiments, Xbra RNA was injected into the animal pole regions of fertilized Xenopus eggs, either alone or in the presence of RNA encoding a truncated FGF receptor (XFD) [8] or a truncated activin receptor ( $\Delta 1XAR1$ ) [10]. Animal pole regions were dissected from these embryos at the mid-blastula stage, cultured, and assayed for extension movements. Explants derived from embryos injected with Xbra RNA alone, or with Xbra and  $\Delta 1XAR1$  RNAs, elongated slightly and differentiated into vesicles containing mesenchyme, mesothelium, and occasionally muscle. However, explants derived from embryos injected with Xbra and XFD RNAs showed no signs of mesoderm formation and differentiated into atypical epidermis. This suggested that the effects of Xbra require an intact FGF signalling pathway.

To investigate whether the same is true for Xbra function in dorsal mesoderm, the experiment was repeated in the presence of noggin RNA [13,14], which dorsalizes the response to Xbra [15]. Over-expression of RNAs encoding noggin, Xbra and HAVØ, a non-functional form of the FGF receptor, leads to elongation and the differentiation of muscle, notochord and neural tissue (Fig. 1). The same is true for explants derived from embryos injected with noggin, Xbra and  $\Delta 1XAR1$  RNAs (Fig. 1). In the presence of XFD, encoding the truncated, dominantnegative FGF receptor, however, explants do not elongate or form mesoderm, but differentiate into neural tissue and occasionally cement glands (Fig. 1). These tissue types are observed after over-expression of noggin RNA alone [15,20], and are also formed if noggin and XFD RNAs are co-injected with  $\Delta X bra$  RNA, encoding a non-functional form of Xbra (Fig. 1).

Consistent with the findings of these morphological and histological analyses, RNAase protection assays reveal that cardiac actin RNA is expressed in explants derived from embryos injected with Xbra, noggin and HAVØ, or Xbra, noggin and  $\Delta 1XAR1$  RNAs, but not in explants over-expressing Xbra, noggin and XFD, the truncated FGF receptor (Fig. 2). All explants injected with noggin RNA express the neural marker N-CAM (Fig. 2), indicating that XFD does not block noggin's function. Thus, in both ventral and dorsal presumptive mesoderm, a functional FGF receptor pathway, but not a functional activin receptor pathway, is required downstream of Xbra for normal Xbra function.

### Xbra and embryonic FGF induce each other's expression

The simplest interpretation of these results is that Xbra induces the expression of a member of the FGF family, and that this molecule is necessary for Xbra function. One potential target of Xbra is embryonic (e) FGF, zygotic expression of which begins shortly before gastrulation [21], with transcripts then restricted to posterior tissue in a pattern resembling the posterior expression of Xbra. To investigate whether Brachyury induces the expression of eFGF, RNA encoding Xbra or no tail (the zebrafish Brachyury homologue) was injected into the animal pole regions of Xenopus embryos at the one-cell stage. Animal caps were isolated at the mid-blastula stage, cultured until the early gastrula stage (stage 11) and assayed for expression of eFGF RNA by RNAase



**Fig. 1.** Xbra function is blocked by co-expression of RNA encoding a truncated FGF receptor (*XFD*), but not a non-functional FGF receptor (*HAVØ*) or a truncated activin receptor ( $\Delta 1XAR1$ ). Animal caps derived from embryos injected with the indicated combinations of RNA were assayed for elongation (left-hand column) and for differentiation of mesodermal cell types (right-hand column). Mesoderm formation in response to full-length Xbra RNA is inhibited by XFD but not by HAVØ or  $\Delta 1XAR1$ . The neural-inducing effects of noggin are not inhibited by XFD. Abbreviations: not, notochord; mus, muscle; neu, neural tissue; cg, cement gland; epi, atypical epidermis.

protection. Both Xbra (not shown) and no tail induced expression of eFGF (Fig. 3a).

The experiment described above indicates that *Brachyury* activates expression of eFGF, a member of the FGF family. A reciprocal influence of FGF family members on *Xbra* expression might occur at either of two stages of development. The first of these is before gastrulation. The FGFs might act as mesoderm-inducing factors; treatment of animal caps with bFGF is already known to induce expression of *Xbra* [7] and we show here that eFGF has the same effect (Fig. 3b). We also demonstrate that *no tail* can induce expression of *Xbra*; animal caps derived from embryos injected with *no tail* RNA go on to express *Xbra* (Fig. 3b). This observation confirms previous results:

Brachyury can induce its own expression [22]. The autoinduction is likely to occur indirectly, through induction of eFGF expression, rather than by direct interaction of the *no tail* product with the Xbra promoter, because animal caps derived from embryos over-expressing *no tail* in



the presence of XFD RNA do not activate transcription of Xbra (our unpublished observations).

#### Maintenance of Xbra transcription requires FGF signalling

The second time during development at which FGF family members might influence expression of *Brachyury* is during gastrulation. Animal pole tissue loses the ability to respond to FGF at the onset of gastrulation [23,24]. This loss of ability is correlated with the loss of functional FGF receptors from animal pole cells at this time [25]. FGF receptors persist in presumptive mesoderm, however, and particularly in posterior tissue, where *Xbra* is expressed [26]. This observation, together with the data presented above, suggests that FGF signalling may be involved in *Xbra* function at these stages. To investigate this possibility, ventral and dorsal marginal zone tissue was dissected from *Xenopus* embryos at the early gastrula stage (stage 10.5), after the onset of *Xbra* expression [7].



Fig. 2. Animal caps derived from embryos injected with the indicated combinations of RNA were assayed for expression of muscle-specific cardiac actin RNA by RNAase protection. Cardiac actin gene expression in response to full-length Xbra RNA injection is inhibited by XFD, but not by HAVØ or  $\Delta 1XAR1$ . The same RNA samples were also probed for expression of N-CAM. All explants derived from embryos injected with noggin RNA express N-CAM, confirming that XFD does not block the function of noggin.

**Fig. 3.** Induction of eFGF expression by *Brachyury* and induction of *Xbra* expression by FGF family members and *no tail*. (a) Animal caps derived from embryos injected with *no tail* RNA express eFGF, whereas caps derived from uninjected embryos or from embryos injected with RNA encoding a truncated form of *Xbra* ( $\Delta Xbra$ ) show no signal. (b) Animal caps derived from embryos injected with RNA encoding eFGF or with *no tail* RNA express *Xbra*. Exposure of animal cap explants to 20 U ml<sup>-1</sup> soluble bFGF served as a positive control (see [29] for definition of a unit of mesoderm-inducing activity), whereas animal caps from control-injected and uninjected embryos were used as negative controls.



**Fig. 4.** FGF is required for the maintenance of *Xbra* expression. Intact ventral and dorsal marginal zone tissue maintains *Xbra* expression after culture to gastrula stages, whereas dissociated marginal zone cells maintain expression only in the presence of  $20 \text{ U m}^{-1}$  bFGF. Marginal zone regions were dissected at stage 10.5 and cultured to stage 12, either intact or in a dissociated state.

The tissue was then cultured intact or, in an effort to dilute the effects of endogenous FGF, as dissociated cells. Samples were collected 90 minutes after complete dissociation of the explants (stage 12). Expression of *Xbra* persisted in the intact marginal tissue, but had fallen almost to undetectable levels in dissociated cells (Fig. 4). Addition of bFGF to the dissociated cells, however, maintained expression of *Xbra* (Fig. 4).

# Activin-mediated induction of *Xbra* does not require FGF signalling

The observation that the FGF signalling pathway is required for maintenance of *Xbra* expression sheds light on experiments in which animal pole explants derived from *XFD*-injected embryos are exposed to activin [17-19] or the mature region of the Vg1 signalling protein [19]. Such explants do not exhibit extension movements, and the induction of some mesodermal markers, such as *Xbra*, seems to be inhibited. One interpretation of this result is that the activin and Vg1 signal transduction pathways require components of the FGF signalling pathway. An alternative explanation, however, is that induction of *Xbra* expression occurs in response to activin, but that, in the absence of FGF signalling, this expression of *Xbra* is only transient.

We examined this possibility by applying activin to animal pole explants derived from XFD-injected embryos (expressing the truncated FGF receptor) and assaying for expression of Xbra at intervals thereafter (Fig. 5). Expression of Xbra was consistently observed 200 minutes after exposing caps to activin, demonstrating that activin can induce expression of Xbra in the absence of a functional FGF signalling pathway. Transcripts became undetectable within 60 minutes, however, indicating that, under these circumstances, Xbra RNA undergoes very rapid turnover. This rapid turnover may account for the low initial level of expression of Xbra observed in these experiments (Fig. 5).

## Discussion

Our data indicate that *Xbra* and eFGF are components of a regulatory loop, in which each can induce expression of the other, and in which eFGF (or another member of the FGF family) maintains expression of *Xbra*. This loop is required for the mesoderm-inducing effects of *Xbra*, because if it is disrupted, by interfering with FGF signalling, mesoderm formation is blocked. These results are consistent with data recently reported by Isaacs and colleagues [27], who also demonstrated that *Xbra* induces eFGF expression and that dissociation of marginal zone tissue causes a decline in levels of *Xbra*. Our data add to theirs, however, by demonstrating that expression of



Fig. 5. The FGF receptor pathway is required for maintenance, but not for initiation, of activin-induced expression of Xbra. Animal caps derived from embryos injected with XFD or HAVØ at the one-cell stage were incubated in 12 U ml<sup>-1</sup> activin from stage 8 and harvested at the indicated times (see [29] for the definition of a unit of mesoderminducing activity). As a negative control, animal caps were dissected from uninjected embryos and cultured in the absence of activin. Activin causes persistent expression of Xbra in animal caps derived from embryos injected with HAVØ RNA, but only transient expression in caps derived from embryos injected with XFD RNA. This experiment has been performed three times, with identical results.

eFGF is a very rapid response to Xbra, and that levels of Xbra decline precipitously if FGF signalling is inhibited. Furthermore, co-expression of Xbra mRNAs with XFD, encoding the truncated dominant-negative FGF receptor, enables us to demonstrate unequivocally that FGF signalling is a downstream requirement for Xbra function. These results raise several issues.

#### FGF and the Brachyury mutant phenotype

The existence of the regulatory loop described in this paper may explain, at least in part, why the phenotypes of embryos lacking components of the FGF signalling pathway are similar to those mutant for *Brachyury* or its homologues [1,3,8]. In both cases, embryos lack a differentiated notochord and posterior structures, although head structures are unaffected. But *Xenopus* embryos expressing truncated FGF receptors usually have no somites [8], whereas mutant mouse embryos have seven somites [1] and mutant fish embryos have 17–19 somites [3]. Whether the complete absence of somites in *Xenopus* embryos represents a species difference, or whether FGF signalling is also required for the formation of the most anterior somites, remains to be seen.

The proposed regulatory loop involving *Brachyury* and a member of the FGF family would also be disrupted by the absence of functional *Brachyury* protein, and we note that in both mouse and zebrafish embryos mutant for *Brachyury*, levels of *Brachyury* RNA are reduced [4,5]. It will be important to examine whether a homologue of *Xenopus* eFGF exhibits reduced levels of expression in *Brachyury* mutant mouse and zebrafish embryos.

## Implications for other experiments involving truncated FGF receptors or dissociation procedures

Our conclusion that FGF signalling is required for the maintenance of activin-induced expression of Xbra, but not for the initial activation of the gene, has several implications. First, as discussed above, it suggests that the activin signal transduction pathway does not require components of the FGF signalling pathway. In addition, the finding affects the interpretation of several recent experiments involving the dispersal of embryonic cells. Lemaire and Gurdon [11], for example, have shown that Xbra transcripts cannot be detected in cells derived from embryos that are kept dissociated from the morula stage to the early gastrula stage. By contrast, expression of goosecoid and Xunt-8 does occur. This may mean that expression of goosecoid and Xwnt-8 is controlled differently from the expression of Xbra, but an alternative explanation is that activation of Xbra occurs in these experiments, but in the absence of cell-cell contact, and therefore of FGF signalling, this expression is weak and transient.

It is also possible that the apparent lack of *Xbra* expression in embryos over-expressing truncated FGF receptors [9] reflects a lack of maintenance of expression, rather than inhibition of the initial activation of the gene. If this were the case, there might be a brief period of expression of *Xbra* at early gastrula stages, followed by a rapid decline in transcript levels. We have investigated this question using the sensitive technique of RNAase protection, but at no stage do we observe complete extinction of *Xbra* expression. We do not know whether this is due to incomplete blockage of FGF signalling, or whether other mesoderm-inducing factors, such as activin, Vg1 or BMP-4, are inducing *Xbra* expression.

## Conclusions

The data in this paper show that the FGF receptor signalling pathway is required for maintenance of the expression of *Xbra*, and therefore for *Xbra* function. We provide evidence for a regulatory loop in which *Xbra* activates expression of a member of the FGF family and FGF maintains expression of *Xbra*. These findings add significantly to our understanding of the roles of *Brachyury* and its homologues, and of the FGF family of signalling molecules, in vertebrate early development, and will help in the interpretation of other experiments involving over-expression of dominant-negative FGF receptors, or experiments involving dissociation procedures.

### Materials and methods

### RNA injections and processing of explants

Various combinations of synthetic RNAs (1 ng Xbra; 0.6 ng  $\Delta Xbra$ ; 1 ng no tail; 100 pg noggin; 1 ng  $\Delta 1XAR1$ ; 1 ng XFD; 1 ng  $HAV\emptyset$ ) were injected into the animal pole regions of Xenopus embryos at the one-cell stage. Animal caps were dissected at stage 8 [28] and cultured to stage 15 for morphological analysis, stage 40 for histological analysis, or to the stages indicated in the text for RNAase protection analyses. Synthesis of RNA, microinjection, histological analysis and RNAase protection assays were carried out as described [19].

#### Dissociation of marginal zones

Marginal zone regions were dissected at stage 10.5 and dissociated. Dissociation was carried out in CMFME (44 mM NaCl, 2.5 mM sodium phosphate, pH 7.5, 0.1 mM KCl, 0.5 mM EDTA), and was complete by stage 11. Where appropriate, 20 U ml<sup>-1</sup> bFGF was added to the CMFME. Samples were collected after 90 min, when controls had reached stage 12. Intact marginal zones were cultured in 75 % normal amphibian medium (NAM [24]).

Acknowledgements: This work is supported by the MRC. We thank Wendy Hatton for expert histology, the NIMR photographic department for help with figures, Ena Heather for help in preparing the manuscript, and Rosa Beddington and members of our laboratory for helpful discussions. S.S-M. was supported by an EMBO long-term fellowship and by a fellowship from HFSPO. J.C.S. is an International Scholar of the Howard Hughes Medical Institute.

### References

- 1. Herrmann BG, Kispert A: The *T* genes in embryogenesis. *Trends Genet* 1994, **10**:280–286.
- Herrmann BG, Labeit S, Poustka A, King TR, Lehrach H: Cloning of the *T* gene required in mesoderm formation in the mouse. *Nature* 1990, 343:617–622.
- 3. Halpern ME, Ho RK, Walker C, Kimmel CB: Induction of muscle

pioneers and floor plate is distinguished by the zebrafish *no tail* mutation. *Cell* 1993, 75:99–111.

- Schulte-Merker S, van Eeden FM, Halpern ME, Kimmel CB, Nüsslein-Volhard C: *no tail (ntl)* is the zebrafish homologue of the mouse *T (Brachyury)* gene. *Development* 1994, 120:1009–1015.
- Herrmann BG: Expression pattern of the Brachyury gene in wholemount T<sup>Wis</sup>/T<sup>Wis</sup> mutant embryos. Development 1991, 113:913–917.
- Schulte-Merker S, Ho RK, Herrmann BG, Nüsslein-Volhard, C: The protein product of the zebrafish homologue of the mouse T gene is expressed in nuclei of the germ ring and the notochord of the early embryo. Development 1992, 116:1021–1032.
- Smith JC, Price BMJ, Green JBA, Weigel D, Herrmann BG: Expression of a Xenopus homolog of Brachyury (7) is an immediateearly response to mesoderm induction. Cell 1991, 67:79–87.
- Amaya E, Musci TJ, Kirschner M: Expression of a dominant negative mutant of the FGF receptor disrupts mesoderm formation in Xenopus embryos. Cell 1991, 66:257–270.
- Amaya E, Stein PA, Musci TJ, Kirschner M: FGF signalling in the early specification of mesoderm in *Xenopus*. Development 1993, 118:477–487.
- Hemmati-Brivaniou A, Melton DA: A truncated activin receptor inhibits mesoderm induction and formation of axial structures in Xenopus embryos. Nature 1992, 359:609-614.
- 11. Lemaire P, Gurdon JB: A role for cytoplasmic determinants in mesoderm patterning: cell-autonomous activation of the goosecoid and Xwnt-8 genes along the dorsoventral axis of early Xenopus embryos. Development 1994, 120:1191-1199.
- Cunliffe V, Smith JC: Ectopic mesoderm formation in Xenopus embryos caused by widespread expression of a Brachyury homologue. Nature 1992, 358:427–430.
- Smith WC, Harland RM: Expression cloning of noggin, a new dorsalizing factor localized to the Spemann organizer in Xenopus embryos. Cell 1992, 70:829–840.
- Smith WC, Knecht AK, Wu M, Harland RM: Secreted noggin protein mimics the Spemann organizer in dorsalizing *Xenopus* ectoderm. *Nature* 1993, 361:547–549.
- Cunliffe V, Smith JC: Specification of mesodermal pattern in Xenopus laevis by interactions between Brachyury, noggin and Xwnt-8. EMBO J 1994, 13:349-359.
- Kispert A, Herrmann BG: The Brachyury gene encodes a novel DNA-binding protein. EMBO J 1993, 12:3211–3220.

- 17. Cornell RA, Kimelman D: Activin-mediated mesoderm induction requires FGF. Development 1994, 120:453–462.
- LaBonne C, Whitman M: Mesoderm induction by activin requires FGF-mediated intracellular signals. Development 1994, 120: 463–472.
- 19. Schulte-Merker S, Smith JC, Dale L: Effects of truncated activin and FGF receptors and of follistatin on the inducing activities of BVg1 and activin: does activin play a role in mesoderm induction? *EMBO J* 1994, **13**:3533-3541.
- Lamb TM, Knecht AK, Smith WC, Stachel SE, Economides AN, Stahl N, et al.: Neural induction by the secreted polypeptide noggin. Science 1993, 262:713–718.
- Isaacs HV, Tannahill D, Slack JMW: Expression of a novel FGF in the Xenopus embryo. A new candidate inducing factor for mesoderm formation and anteroposterior specification. Development 1992, 114:712-720.
- 22. Rao Y: Conversion of a mesodermalizing molecule, the Xenopus Brachyury gene, into a neuralizing factor. Genes Dev 1994, 8:39-947.
- Slack JMW, Isaacs HV, Darlington BG: Inductive effects of fibroblast growth factor and lithium ion on *Xenopus* blastula ectoderm. *Development* 1988, 103:581–590.
- Green JBA, Howes G, Symes K, Cooke J, Smith JC: The biological effects of XTC-MIF: quantitative comparison with Xenopus bFGF. Development 1990, 108:173–183.
- Gillespie LL, Paterno GD, Slack JMW: Analysis of competence: Receptors for fibroblast growth factor in early *Xenopus* embryos. Development 1989, 106:203–208.
- Ding X-y, McKeehan WL, Xu J, Grunz H: Spatial and temporal localization of FGF receptors in *Xenopus laevis*. *Roux's Arch. Dev. Biol.* 1992, 201:334–339.
- 27. Isaacs HV, Pownall ME, Slack JMW: eFGF regulates *Xbra* expression during *Xenopus* gastrulation. *EMBO J* 1994, **19**:4469–4481.
- Nieuwkoop PD, Faber J: Normal Table of Xenopus laevis. (Daudin) North Holland, Amsterdam; 1967.
- Cooke J, Smith JC, Smith EJ, Yaqoob M: The organization of mesodermal pattern in *Xenopus laevis*: experiments using a *Xenopus* mesoderm-inducing factor. *Development* 1987, 101:893–908.

Received: 6 October 1994; revised: 8 November 1994. Accepted: 23 November 1994.