

# On the Minimal Solution of the Problem of Primitives

Benedetto Bongiorno<sup>1</sup>

*Department of Mathematics, University of Palermo,  
Via Archirafi 34, 90123 Palermo, Italy  
E-mail: bb@dipmat.math.unipa.it*

*Submitted by William F. Ames*

Received April 28, 2000

We characterize the primitives of the minimal extension of the Lebesgue integral which also integrates the derivatives of differentiable functions (called the  $C$ -integral). Then we prove that each BV function is a multiplier for the  $C$ -integral and that the product of a derivative and a BV function is a derivative modulo a Lebesgue integrable function having arbitrarily small  $L^1$ -norm. © 2000 Academic Press

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The question of providing a minimal constructive integration process which includes the Lebesgue integral and also integrates the derivatives of differentiable functions was solved in [1, 3] by the following Riemann-type integral (called the  $C$ -integral):

DEFINITION 1.1. Given a function  $f: [a, b] \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  we say that  $f$  is  $C$ -integrable on  $[a, b]$  if there exists a constant  $A$  such that for each  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is a gage  $\delta$  such that

$$\left| \sum_{i=1}^p f(x_i) |I_i| - A \right| < \varepsilon,$$

for each  $\delta$ -fine McShane partition  $\{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\}$  satisfying the condition

$$\sum_{i=1}^p \text{dist}(x_i, I_i) < 1/\varepsilon. \quad (1)$$

<sup>1</sup> Supported by MURST of Italy



The number  $A$  is called the  $C$ -integral of  $f$  on  $[a, b]$ , and we write  $A = \int_a^b f$ .

We recall that a gage  $\delta$  on  $[a, b]$  is a positive function defined on  $[a, b]$ , and that a  $\delta$ -fine McShane partition of  $[a, b]$  is a collection  $\{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\}$  of pairwise nonoverlapping intervals  $I_i \subset [a, b]$  and points  $x_i \in [a, b]$  such that  $I_i \subset (x_i - \delta(x_i), x_i + \delta(x_i))$  and  $\sum_{i=1}^p |I_i| = b - a$ .

A first descriptive characterization of  $C$ -primitives was obtained by Bruckner et al. [7]. They proved that a function  $F$  is a  $C$ -primitive if and only if it is the limit in variation of a sequence of absolutely continuous functions. Note that, in general,  $F$  is not a function of bounded variation; however, its associate variational measure is absolutely continuous with respect to the Lebesgue measure. This follows from the trivial observation that a  $C$ -primitive is also a Denjoy–Perron primitive and by [4, Theorem 3].

In effect the last mentioned theorem gives a characterization of Denjoy–Perron primitives. The idea of considering appropriate variational measures to characterize the primitives of some integral has been also used in [2, 8, 9] for many multidimensional integrals and in [5] for the Henstock-dyadic integral and for the Henstock-symmetric integral.

In this paper we define a useful variational measure that allows us to extend [4, Theorem 3] to the  $C$ -integral (theorem 4.1). The resulting characterization is then used to prove that each BV function is a multiplier for our integral (Theorem 4.2), and consequently the product of a derivative, and a BV function is a derivative modulo a Lebesgue integrable function having an arbitrarily small  $L^1$ -norm (Theorem 4.3).

## 2. PRELIMINARIES

$\mathbf{R}$  denotes the set of all real numbers. Given a Lebesgue measurable set  $E \subset \mathbf{R}$ ,  $|E|$  denotes the Lebesgue measure of  $E$ . For a function  $F$  and for an interval  $I = [\alpha, \beta]$ , we use the notation  $F(I) = F(\beta) - F(\alpha)$ . A  $\delta$ -fine McShane partial partition of  $[a, b]$  is a collection  $\{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\}$  of pairwise nonoverlapping intervals  $I_i \subset [a, b]$  and points  $x_i \in [a, b]$  such that  $I_i \subset (x_i - \delta(x_i), x_i + \delta(x_i))$ .

LEMMA 2.1. *If  $f$  is a  $C$ -integrable function on  $[a, b]$ , then given  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists a gage  $\delta$  such that*

$$\sum_{i=1}^p \left| f(x_i) |I_i| - \int_{I_i} f \right| < \varepsilon,$$

for each  $\delta$ -fine McShane partial partition  $\{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\}$  satisfying the condition  $\sum_{i=1}^p \text{dist}(x_i, I_i) < 1/\varepsilon$ .

The proof follows by standard techniques (see [11, Lemma 9.11]).

LEMMA 2.2. *If  $F$  is a function differentiable at  $x$ , then given  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exist  $\delta(x) > 0$  such that*

$$|F(I) - F'(x)|I|| < \varepsilon (\text{dist}(x, I) + |I|),$$

for each interval  $I \subset (x - \delta(x), x + \delta(x))$ .

*Proof.* By the existence of  $F'(x)$  there is  $\delta(x) > 0$  such that

$$|F(y) - F(x) - F'(x)(y - x)| < \frac{\varepsilon}{2}|y - x|,$$

for each  $y \in (x - \delta(x), x + \delta(x))$ .

Therefore, given  $I = (\alpha, \beta) \subset (x - \delta(x), x + \delta(x))$  we have

$$\begin{aligned} &|F(\beta) - F(\alpha) - F'(x)(\beta - \alpha)| \\ &\leq |F(\beta) - F(x) - F'(x)(\beta - x)| + |F(\alpha) - F(x) - F'(x)(\alpha - x)| \\ &< \frac{\varepsilon}{2}|\beta - x| + \frac{\varepsilon}{2}|\alpha - x| \\ &< \frac{\varepsilon}{2} \text{dist}(x, I) + \frac{\varepsilon}{2} (\text{dist}(x, I) + |I|) \\ &= \varepsilon (\text{dist}(x, I) + |I|). \end{aligned}$$

■

### 3. THE VARIATIONAL MEASURE

For a given function  $F$  on  $[a, b]$ , a gage  $\delta$ , a set  $E \subset [a, b]$ , and a positive  $\varepsilon$  we denote

$$\begin{aligned} V_\varepsilon(F, \delta, E) = \sup \{ \sum_i |F(I_i)| : \{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\} \text{ is a } \delta\text{-fine} \\ \text{McShane partial partition of } [a, b] \\ \text{such that } x_i \in E, i = 1, 2, \dots, p, \text{ and} \\ \sum_{i=1}^p \text{dist}(x_i, I_i) < 1/\varepsilon \}. \end{aligned}$$

We also denote

$$\begin{aligned} V_0(F, \delta, E) = \sup \{ \sum_i |F(I_i)| : \{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\} \text{ is a } \delta\text{-fine} \\ \text{McShane partial partition of } [a, b] \\ \text{such that } x_i \in I_i \cap E, i = 1, 2, \dots, p \}. \end{aligned}$$

It is clear that

$$V_0(F, \delta, E) \leq V_{\varepsilon_1}(F, \delta, E) \leq V_{\varepsilon_2}(F, \delta, E) \quad \text{whenever } \varepsilon_1 > \varepsilon_2. \quad (2)$$

Then we define

$$V_C F(E) = \sup_\varepsilon \inf_\delta V_\varepsilon(F, \delta, E)$$

and

$$V_0 F(E) = \inf_\delta V_0(F, \delta, E).$$

From (2) it follows that

$$V_0 F(E) \leq V_C F(E). \quad (3)$$

By the same argument used in [18] for proving Theorems 3.7 and 3.15, we can show that the extended real-valued set functions  $V_0 F$  and  $V_C F$  are *Borel regular measures* in  $[a, b]$ .

#### 4. MAIN RESULTS

**THEOREM 4.1.**  *$F$  is an indefinite  $C$ -integral if and only if the variational measure  $V_C F$  is absolutely continuous with respect to the Lebesgue measure.*

*Proof.* Let  $F(x) = F(a) + \int_a^x f(t)dt$  be the indefinite  $C$ -integral of  $f$  on  $[a, b]$ , and let  $E \subset [a, b]$  with  $|E| = 0$ . Without loss of generality we can assume  $f(x) = 0$  for each  $x \in E$ . Then by Lemma 2.1, given  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists a gage  $\delta$  such that

$$\sum_{i=1}^p |F(I_i)| < \varepsilon$$

for each  $\delta$ -fine partial McShane partition  $\{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\}$  with  $x_i \in E$ ,  $i = 1, 2, \dots, p$ , and  $\sum_{i=1}^p \text{dist}(x_i, I_i) < 1/\varepsilon$ . Then  $V_\varepsilon(F, \delta, E) \leq \varepsilon$  and by (2), we have  $V_C F(E) = 0$ .

Conversely, if  $V_C F$  is absolutely continuous, then by (3), so is  $V_0 F$ . Therefore by [4, Theorem 2], the function  $F$  is differentiable almost everywhere in  $[a, b]$ .

Let  $N = \{t \in [a, b] : F \text{ is not differentiable at } t\}$  and let

$$f(t) = \begin{cases} F'(t) & \text{if } t \in [a, b] \setminus N, \\ 0 & \text{if } t \in N. \end{cases}$$

We prove that  $F$  is the indefinite  $C$ -integral of  $f$ . To this end, let  $0 < \varepsilon < 1/(b-a)$  and let  $x \in [a, b]$ . For each  $t \in [a, b] \setminus N$  there exists (by Lemma 2.2)  $\delta_1(t) > 0$  such that

$$|f(t)|B| - F(B)| < \frac{\varepsilon^2}{4}(\text{dist}(t, B) + |B|),$$

for each interval  $B \subset (t - \delta_1(t), t + \delta_1(t))$ .

Moreover, since  $V_C F(N) = 0$ , there exists a gage  $\delta_2$  such that

$$\sum_{i=1}^p |F(B_i)| < \frac{\varepsilon}{2},$$

for each  $\delta_2$ -fine McShane partial partition  $\{(B_1, x_1), \dots, (B_p, x_p)\}$  with  $x_i \in N, i = 1, 2, \dots, p$ , and  $\sum_{i=1}^p \text{dist}(x_i, I_i) < 1/\varepsilon$ .

Let

$$\delta(t) = \begin{cases} \delta_1(t) & \text{if } t \in [a, b] \setminus N, \\ \delta_2(t) & \text{if } t \in N, \end{cases}$$

and let  $\{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\}$  be a  $\delta$ -fine McShane partition of  $[a, x]$  satisfying condition (1). Then

$$\begin{aligned} & \left| \sum_{i=1}^p f(x_i)|I_i| - (F(x) - F(a)) \right| \leq \sum_{i=1}^p |f(x_i)|I_i| - F(I_i)| \\ & < \sum_{x_i \in N} |F(I_i)| + \frac{\varepsilon^2}{4} \sum_{x_i \notin N} (\text{dist}(x_i, I_i) + |I_i|) \\ & < \frac{\varepsilon}{2} + \frac{\varepsilon}{4} + \frac{\varepsilon^2}{4}(b - a) < \varepsilon. \end{aligned}$$

By the arbitrariness of  $\varepsilon$ , the function  $f$  is  $C$ -integrable on  $[a, x]$ ,

$$\int_a^x f(t)dt = F(x) - F(a),$$

and by the arbitrariness of  $x \in [a, b]$ , the function  $F$  is the indefinite  $C$ -integral of  $f$  on  $[a, b]$ . ■

Recall that a function  $g: [a, b] \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is said to be a BV function whenever there exists a function of bounded variation  $\tilde{g}: [a, b] \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  such that  $g = \tilde{g}$  a.e. in  $[a, b]$ .

**THEOREM 4.2.** *Each BV function is a multiplier for the C-integral.*

*Proof.* Let  $f$  be a  $C$ -integrable function and let  $F$  be its primitive. If  $g$  is a BV function, then by [17, Chap. 8, Theorem 2.5],  $fg$  is Denjoy–Perron integrable, and for each  $x \in [a, b]$ ,

$$(DP) \int_a^x fg dt = [Fg]_a^x - (L) \int_a^x F dg; \tag{4}$$

here  $(DP) \int$  and  $(L) \int$  denote the Denjoy–Perron and Lebesgue integrals, respectively. Let  $\Phi(x) = (DP) \int_a^x fg dt$ ,

$$E = \{x \in [a, b] : \Phi'(x) = f(x)g(x)\},$$

and observe the set  $N = [a, b] \setminus E$  is negligible. Without loss of generality we can assume that  $f(x) = 0$  for each  $x \in N$ , and that  $g(x)$  is increasing and positive on  $[a, b]$ .

Now fix an  $0 < \varepsilon < 1/(b-a)$ . By Lemma 2.2, for each  $x \in E$  there exists  $\delta_1(x) > 0$  such that

$$|f(x)g(x)|I| - \Phi(I)| < \frac{\varepsilon^2 (\text{dist}(x, I) + |I|)}{6}, \quad (5)$$

for each interval  $I \in (x - \delta_1(x), x + \delta_1(x))$ . As the variational measure  $V_C F$  is absolutely continuous by Theorem 4.1, there exists a gage  $\delta_2$  such that

$$\sum_{i=1}^p |F(I_i)| < \frac{\varepsilon}{3(\|g\|_\infty + 1)} \quad (6)$$

for each  $\delta^2$ -fine McShane partial partition  $\{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\}$  with  $x_i \in N$ ,  $i = 1, 2, \dots, p$ , and  $\sum_{i=1}^p \text{dist}(x_i, I_i) < 1/\varepsilon$ . Choose a  $\sigma > 0$  so that

$$|F(x) - F(y)| < \frac{\varepsilon}{6(\|g\|_\infty + 1)} \quad (7)$$

for each  $x, y \in I$  with  $|x - y| < \sigma$ , and define a function  $\delta$  by the formula

$$\delta(x) = \begin{cases} \delta_1(x) & \text{if } x \in E, \\ \min(\delta_2(x), \sigma) & \text{if } x \in N. \end{cases} \quad (8)$$

Let  $\{(I_1, x_1), \dots, (I_p, x_p)\}$  be a  $\delta$ -fine McShane partition of  $[a, b]$  satisfying condition (1). Then

$$\begin{aligned} & \left| \sum_i f(x_i)g(x_i)|I_i| - \Phi([a, b]) \right| \\ & \leq \sum_i |f(x_i)g(x_i)|I_i| - \Phi(I_i)| \leq \sum_{x_i \in E} + \sum_{x_i \in N}. \end{aligned} \quad (9)$$

An estimate of  $\sum_{x_i \in E}$  follows from (5):

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{x_i \in E} |f(x_i)g(x_i)|I_i| - \Phi(I_i)| \\ & < \frac{\varepsilon^2}{6} \sum_{x_i \in E} (\text{dist}(x_i, I_i) + |I_i|) < \frac{\varepsilon^2}{3} \cdot \frac{1}{\varepsilon} = \frac{\varepsilon^2(b-a)}{6} < \frac{\varepsilon}{3}. \end{aligned} \quad (10)$$

Next we estimate  $\sum_{x_i \in N} f(x_i)$ . Note that  $f(x_i) = 0$  for  $x_i \in N$ . Using (4) and letting  $I_i = [\alpha_i, \beta_i]$ , we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{x_i \in N} &= \sum_{x_i \in N} |\Phi(I_i)| \\ &= \sum_{x_i \in N} \left| (F(\beta_i)g(\beta_i) - F(\alpha_i)g(\alpha_i) - (L) \int_{\alpha_i}^{\beta_i} F dg) \right| \\ &= \sum_{x_i \in N} |(F(\beta_i) - F(\alpha_i))g(\beta_i) \\ &\quad + F(\alpha_i)(g(\beta_i) - g(\alpha_i)) - F(\xi_i)(g(\beta_i) - g(\alpha_i))| \\ &\leq \sum_{x_i \in N} |(F(\beta_i) - F(\alpha_i))g(\beta_i)| \\ &\quad + \sum_{x_i \in N} |F(\alpha_i) - F(\xi_i)|(g(\beta_i) - g(\alpha_i)), \end{aligned} \tag{11}$$

where  $\xi_i \in [\alpha_i, \beta_i]$ . By (6),

$$\sum_{x_i \in N} |(F(\beta_i) - F(\alpha_i))g(\beta_i)| \leq \frac{\varepsilon}{3(\|g\|_\infty + 1)} \cdot \|g\|_\infty < \frac{\varepsilon}{3}, \tag{12}$$

and by (7) and (8),

$$\sum_{x_i \in N} |F(\alpha_i) - F(\xi_i)|(g(\beta_i) - g(\alpha_i)) \leq \frac{\varepsilon}{6(\|g\|_\infty + 1)} \cdot 2\|g\|_\infty < \frac{\varepsilon}{3}. \tag{13}$$

Summing up the inequalities (10), (12), and (13) and taking into account (9) and (10), we obtain

$$\left| \sum_i f(x_i)g(x_i)|I_i| - \Phi([a, b]) \right| < \varepsilon,$$

which completes the proof. ■

**THEOREM 4.3.** *The product of a derivative and a BV function is a derivative modulo a Lebesgue integrable function of an arbitrarily small  $L^1$ -norm.*

*Proof.* Let  $f$  be a derivative, and let  $g$  be a BV function. By [1, Teorema 1],  $f$  is  $C$ -integrable. According to Theorem 4.2,  $fg$  is also  $C$ -integrable. Thus by [3, Main Theorem], there exists a derivative  $f_1$  such that  $fg - f_1$  is a Lebesgue integrable function. Choose an  $\varepsilon > 0$ . The absolute continuity of the Lebesgue integral and Lusin's theorem imply that there is a continuous function  $h_1$  with

$$\int_a^b |fg - f_1 - h_1| < \frac{\varepsilon}{4}.$$

Let  $h_2$  be a continuous function such that  $h_2(a) = f_1(a) + h_1(a)$ ,  $h_2(b) = f_1(b) + h_1(b)$ , and  $\int_a^b |h_2| < \varepsilon/4$ . Moreover, let  $h_3$  be a continuous function for which  $h_3(a) = h_3(b) = 0$  and

$$\begin{aligned}\int_a^b h_3 &= \int_a^b (f_1 + h_1 - h_2) - \int_a^b fg \\ &= \int_a^b (f_1 + h_1 - fg) - \int_a^b h_2.\end{aligned}$$

Clearly, we may assume  $h_3 \geq 0$  or  $h_3 \leq 0$ . Thus

$$\begin{aligned}\int_a^b |h_3| &= \left| \int_a^b h_3 \right| \leq \int_a^b |fg - f_1 - h_1| + \int_a^b |h_2| \\ &< \frac{\varepsilon}{4} + \frac{\varepsilon}{4} = \frac{\varepsilon}{2}.\end{aligned}$$

Observe that the function  $h_\varepsilon = f_1 + h_1 - h_2 - h_3$  is a derivative, since a continuous function is a derivative and the sum of derivatives is a derivative. Furthermore,

$$\begin{aligned}\int_a^b |fg - h_\varepsilon| &\leq \int_a^b |fg - f_1 - h_1| + \int_a^b |h_2| + \int_a^b |h_3| \\ &< \frac{\varepsilon}{4} + \frac{\varepsilon}{4} + \frac{\varepsilon}{2} = \varepsilon.\end{aligned}$$

Consequently, the claim follows by the obvious identity  $fg = h_\varepsilon + (fg - h_\varepsilon)$ . ■

## REFERENCES

1. B. Bongiorno, Un nuovo integrale per il problema delle primitive, *Le Matematiche* **51**, No. 2 (1996), 299–313.
2. B. Bongiorno, L. Di Piazza, and D. Preiss, Infinite variation and derivatives in  $\mathbf{R}^n$ , *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* **224**, No. 1 (1998), 22–33.
3. B. Bongiorno, L. Di Piazza, and D. Preiss, A constructive minimal integral which includes Lebesgue integrable functions and derivatives, *J. London Math. Soc.*, to appear.
4. B. Bongiorno, L. Di Piazza, and V. Skvortsov, A new full descriptive characterization of Denjoy-Perron integral, *Real Anal. Exchange* **21**, No. 2 (1995/96), 656–663.
5. B. Bongiorno, L. Di Piazza, and V. Skvortsov, On variational measures related to some bases, *J. Math. Anal. Appl.*, to appear.
6. B. Bongiorno and V. Skvortsov, Multipliers for some generalized Riemann integrals in the real line, *Real Anal. Exchange* **20** (1994–95), 212–218.
7. A. M. Bruckner, R. J. Fleissner, and J. Foran, The minimal integral which includes Lebesgue integrable functions and derivatives, *Colloq. Math.* **50**, No. 2 (1986), 289–293.
8. Z. Buczolich and W. Pfeffer, On absolute continuity, *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* **222**, No. 1 (1998), 64–78.
9. L. Di Piazza, Variational measures in the theory of the integration in  $\mathbf{R}^m$ , *Czechoslovak Math. J.*, to appear.



10. R. A. Gordon, A descriptive characterization of the generalized Riemann integral, *Real Anal. Exchange* **15** (1989–90), 397–400.
11. R. A. Gordon, “The Integrals of Lebesgue, Denjoy, Perron, and Henstock,” *Studies in Mathematics*, Vol. 4, Am. Math. Soc., Providence, 1994.
12. R. Henstock, “The General Theory of Integration,” Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1991.
13. J. Kurzweil, Generalized ordinary differential equations and continuous dependence on a parameter, *Czechoslovak Math. J.* **7** (1957), 418–446.
14. E. J. McShane, A unified theory of integration, *Amer. Math. Monthly* **80** (1973), 349–359.
15. E. J. McShane, “Unified Integration,” Academic Press, New York, 1983.
16. W. F. Pfeffer, “The Riemann Approach to Integration,” Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, 1993.
17. S. Saks, “Theory of the Integral,” Dover, New York, 1964.
18. B. S. Thomson, “Derivatives of Interval Functions,” *Mem. Amer. Math. Soc.*, Vol. 452, Am. Math. Soc., Providence, 1991.