Mechanisms of Immunization with a Replication-Defective Mutant of Herpes Simplex Virus 1

LYNDA A. MORRISON¹ and DAVID M. KNIPF²

Department of Microbiology and Molecular Genetics, Harvard Medical School, 200 Longwood Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02115

Received February 2, 1996; accepted April 26, 1996

We have investigated the mechanisms by which subcutaneous immunization of mice with a replication-defective mutant of herpes simplex virus 1 protects against infection of the eye and latent infection of the trigeminal ganglion following corneal challenge. First, we have shown that immunization reduces the number of trigeminal ganglion neurons in challenged animals that express the latency-associated transcript. This indicates that the reduction in the incidence of latent infection by challenge virus is likely due to immune mechanisms and not saturation of the potential sites of latent infection by the immunizing mutant virus itself. Second, the duration of protective immunity against acute infection, keratitis, and latent infection was similar in mice immunized with replication-defective or -competent virus; thus, the replication-defective mutant virus is able to induce durable immunity apparently without spread in the host. Third, although the mutant virus showed no evidence of replication *in vivo,* it was present in footpad tissue in an infectious form for several days. This surprising observation raises the possibility that continued infection events by input virus over an extended period of time may have a boosting effect on the developing immune response which could explain, at least in part, the capacity of these replicationdefective mutant viruses to elicit a robust and durable immunity despite their inability to spread within the host. \circ 1996 Academic Press, Inc.

Herpes simplex virus (HSV) is a common human (Meigner *et al.*, 1987) and human trials (Mertz *et al.*, 1984)
pathogen that causes significant morbidity in its various
disease manifestations, which include encephalitis, ke pervious to elimination by the host immune response.

Periodic reactivation from latency leads to recurrent epi-

sodes of disease that can be debilitating, as in the case

of keratitis, the second most common cause of cor

have been tried, including inactivated virus, live attenu-
ated virus, glycoprotein subunits, and heterologous virus
vectors expressing HSV glycoproteins (reviewed in ited by their poor immunogenicity in vaccinia-immune
Bu

INTRODUCTION humoral and cellular immune responses, but these have been shown to decline with time in both animal studies of HSV infection, effective vaccination will require the

induced immune response to intervene in the establish-

ment of latent infection as well as reduce the severity of

acute disease. Third, the immunity must be long-

Replication-impaired mutant HSV strains have also ¹ Current address: Department of Molecular Microbiology and Immu-
nology, Saint Louis University School of Medicine, 1402 S. Grand Ave.,
St. Louis, MO 63104.
St. Louis, MO 63104. ² To whom correspondence and reprint requests should be ad- advantage of expressing virus proteins in an endoge-

dressed. Fax: (617) 432-0223. E-mail: dknipe@warren.med.harvard.edu. nously synthesized form to stimulate broader immune

responses, while possessing the safety of an inactivated strain is a replication-defective mutant of the KOS1.1 vaccine. One form of replication-impaired virus lacks a strain bearing a deletion in the UL29 gene encoding ICP8 viral gene product essential for progeny virus production (Gao and Knipe, 1989). This virus expresses products of (Gao and Knipe, 1989; Rice and Knipe, 1990). These mu- α , β , and γ 1 gene classes in infected normal cells but tants express viral proteins in infected cells but cannot cannot replicate and must be propagated on a cell line, replicate in the host, and must be propagated *in vitro* on S2, which is stably transformed with the UL29 gene. a cell line that complements the defective gene product. Stocks of all viruses were prepared by inoculating Vero We had previously observed that mice immunized twice or S2 cell monolayers at low multiplicity of infection (0.1 subcutaneously with *d*301, a replication-defective virus PFU/cell) and incubating at 34° in 199 medium containing containing a deletion in the gene encoding ICP8 (Gao 1% FCS. Cells were collected when rounded and deand Knipe, 1989), mount an immune response similar to taching and pelleted at 300 *g* for 10 min at 4°. Cell pellets that seen in mice immunized with the wt parental strain, were resuspended in culture supernatant plus an equal KOS1.1 (Morrison and Knipe, 1994). When challenged 1 volume of sterile nonfat milk (0.9 \times), frozen at -80° , month later by corneal inoculation of a virulent HSV-1 thawed, and disrupted by sonication (Heat Systems, Farstrain, the mice were completely protected from develop- mingdale, New York) three times for 30 sec each on ice. ment of keratitis and encephalitis and from latent infec- Lysates were clarified by centrifugation at 300 *g* for 10 tion of the nervous system (Morrison and Knipe, 1994). min, and aliquots were stored frozen at -80° . Lysate of A second form of mutant HSV-1 lacking gH, and therefore uninfected Vero cell monolayers was prepared as a concapable of undergoing a single round of replication in trol (control cell lysate). Partially purified KOS1.1 was infected cells, has been shown to protect against disease prepared by harvesting the culture medium of infected in a mouse skin model (Farrell *et al.,* 1994) and a guinea Vero cell monolayers, subjecting the supernatant to low pig genital model (McLean *et al.,* 1994). speed centrifugation to remove detached cells, and then

replication-defective mutant viruses induce protective im- pellets were resuspended in 199 medium containing 15% munity against latent infection by challenge virus or, in glycerol, sonicated for 15 sec, and stored at -80° . Wildgeneral, how live viruses induce protective immunity type KOS1.1 and mP strains were titered on Vero cells, against persistent infection. The studies in this report and *d*301 was titered on S2 cells. Although titered on address three questions regarding these mechanisms. Vero cells, KOS1.1 grows equally well on Vero and S2 First, does immunization with replication-defective mu- cells (Gao and Knipe, 1991). Because inactivated virus tant HSV reduce establishment of latent infection by the particles are not effective for induction of immune rechallenge virus or merely its ability to reactivate? A re- sponses in this system (Morrison and Knipe, 1994), the lated issue is whether the mutant virus establishes la- number of viral genomes capable of entering cells is tency in the neurons and interferes with establishment a more valid comparison of different viral stocks than of latent infection by the challenge virus, as hypothesized particle:PFU ratios. Cells exposed to equal numbers of for the live attenuated SIV vaccine viruses in T lympho- PFU's of KOS1.1 wt and *d*301 contain approximately cytes (Rud *et al.,* 1994). Second, is the immunity induced equal amounts of viral DNA at 1 hr postinfection (hpi) by the replication-defective mutant virus durable? Live (Gao and Knipe, 1993). Thus, the two viral stocks seemed viruses are known to elicit long-lived immunity in the to be comparable in terms of genomes capable of enterhost while killed or subunit vaccines elicit a less durable ing host cells. immunity. Replication-defective mutant viruses share properties with each of these two forms of vaccine in Animals and inoculations that they infect cells and express endogenous viral antigens like a live virus but fail to spread within the host Female BALB/c mice, 6 weeks of age, were purchased similar to an inactivated or subunit vaccine. Thus, it is from the National Cancer Institute (Fredericksburg, MD) not apparent how durable the immune responses to repli- or Taconic (Germantown, NY) and were acclimated 1 cation-defective mutant viruses would be. Third, how can week before use. The mice were housed in accordance a replication-defective virus induce an immune response with institutional policies and National Institutes of that is comparable to that induced by a virus that spreads Health quidelines (Committee on Care and Use of Labowithin the host? **ratory Animals**, 1985). For immunization, hair on the left

croplaque (mP) (Hoggan and Roizman, 1959) strains of identical fashion. HSV-1 were grown on Vero cell monolayers. The $d301$ At 1, 4, or 7 months after the final immunization, groups

Little is known about the mechanisms by which the pelleting the virus at 27,000 *q* for 45 min at 4°. Virus

rear flank of each mouse was trimmed and 2×10^6 PFU MATERIALS AND METHODS of *d*301 or wt KOS1.1 virus, or an equivalent amount of control cell lysate, were inoculated by subcutaneous
Cells and viruses (s.c.) injection of a 20-µl vol using a 26-gauge needle. The wild-type (wt) KOS1.1 (Knipe *et al.,* 1982) and mi- Secondary immunizations were given 4 weeks later in

of six to nine mice were anesthetized and challenged by section was collected and hybridized with a ³⁵S-labeled inoculation onto the scarified corneas of 1×10^5 PFU/ DNA probe, pIPH (Leib *et al.,* 1989), to detect LAT. *In* eye of the HSV-1 mP strain as previously described (Coen *situ* hybridization was performed as previously described *et al.,* 1989), except that the volume of the inoculum was (Haase *et al.,* 1984; Stroop *et al.,* 1984; Leib *et al.,* 1989). $5 \mu l$.

Statistical analyses Clinical observations and keratitis scoring

for clinical signs of encephalitis: ruffled fur, hunched posture, ataxia, and anorexia. Keratitis scores, representing tion of latently infected trigeminal ganglia between mice
hoth severity and extent of disease were determined for inoculated with control cell lysate and those imm both severity and extent of disease, were determined for inoculated with control cell lysate and those immunized
heach eve of challenged mice as described previously in with d301 or KOS1.1. The significance of differences each eye of challenged mice as described previously (Morrison and Knipe, 1994). The number of LAT⁺ neurons per section was determined

Assays of acute and latent infection

To assess acute replication at various times after cor- Determination of neutralizing antibody titers meal challenge, the eyes of each mouse were individually
swabbed with moistened cotton-tipped applicators. The
two swabs from each mouse were placed together in
vials containing 1 ml assay medium (PBS containing 0.1% Sera

groups of mice were injected s.c. in the footpad with 1
 \times 10⁶ PFU of *d*301 or KOS1.1 virus. At 5 min after inocula-

tion footpad tissue was collected from a pair of animals glutamine. Aliquots of 25 μ of each d tion, footpad tissue was collected from a pair of animals
to assess the amount of recoverable virus. Then at 4 hr with an equal volume of partially purified virus in medium
and 1.2 and 3 days after inoculation, pairs of m and 1, 2, and 3 days after inoculation, pairs of mice were
sacrificed and footpad tissue was collected into vials
containing 1 ml assay medium and stored at -80° . Viral
tions in the tissues were determined by plaque as

For assessment of reactivating virus indicative of latent For a suspension of trypsinized infection, trigeminal ganglia were removed from animals $\frac{V}{V}$ Vero cells at $4 \times 10^5/ml$, and $100 \mu l$ were added to infection, trigeminal ganglia were removed from animals
28 days after corneal challenge and the tissue was enzy-
28 days after corneal challenge and the tissue was enzy-
matically dissociated by incubation in trypsin and 11 days of incubation at 37° and 5% CO₂. Wells with no apparent CPE were collected, sonicated, and cultured on **Assays of T cell proliferation** fresh Vero cell monolayers to look for plaque formation.

expression in the trigeminal ganglia indicative of latent cytes from two pooled spleens for each immunization infection, trigeminal ganglia removed from mice immu- group were determined at various times after immunizanized twice with *d*301 or control cell lysate and then tion, as described previously (Morrison and Knipe, 1994), challenged 1 month later were frozen and serially sec- except that partially purified virus and control supernationed at $8 \mu m$ using a cryostat microtome. Every other tant of uninfected cells were used as the *in vitro* stimuli.

Mice were observed daily in the period postchallenge

r clinical signs of encephalitis: ruffled fur hunched pos-

determine the significance of differences in the proporby the two sample *t* test for independent samples.

time of assay. Viral titers were determined by standard
plaque assay on Vero cells (Knipe and Spang, 1982).
To assess replication *in vivo* of mutant and wt virus,
groups of mice were injected s.c. in the footpad with 1 DM titers in the tissues were determined by plaque assay
on S2 cells after samples were thawed and disrupted by
sonication for 30 sec each.
For assessment of reactivating virus indicative of latent
for a suspension of trypsin

For assessment of latency-associated transcript (LAT) HSV-specific T cell proliferative responses of spleno-

a Mice were immunized twice with 2 x 10⁶ PFU of *d*301 or an equivalent amount of uninfected cell lysate and then underwent corneal challenge. One month later, trigeminal ganglia were collected and tissue sections were hybridized to a probe for LATs.

virus. Mechanism of protection against latent infection by

challenge virus
We had shown previously that immunization of mice
with replication-defective virus with replication-defective virus
with replication-defective mutant viruses reduces the incidence of latent infection of the trigeminal ganglia by the Because replication-defective viruses possess properwt challenge virus as assayed by reactivation following ties of both inactivated or subunit vaccines and live virus explant cocultivation (Morrison and Knipe, 1994). This vaccines, it was unclear how durable the immune rereduction could be due to decreased establishment of sponses to a replication-defective mutant virus would be. latent infection or to decreased frequency of reactivation. Of particular interest to infection with HSV is protection To distinguish between these two possibilities, we mea- against latent infection because reduction in latency is sured the numbers of trigeminal ganglion neurons ex- crucial to lessening the severity of recurrent disease and pressing the LAT, a marker of latent infection (Stevens the possibility for transmission. We could not measure *et al.,* 1987; Croen *et al.,* 1987), in animals immunized the duration of responses to inactivated virus because twice with the replication-defective mutant virus *d*301 or UV-inactivated virus had not protected against latent ininoculated with control cell lysate and challenged with fection by challenge virus or elicited detectable neutralizvirulent virus by corneal inoculation. At 28 days postchal- ing antibody titers in our previous studies (Morrison and lenge, the trigeminal ganglia were removed from the ani- Knipe, 1994). As a consequence, we compared the duramals and tissue sections from the ganglia were pro- bility of the immune response induced by *d*301 and its cessed for *in situ* hybridization using a probe specific replication-competent parental wt virus, KOS1.1 in profor LAT (Leib *et al.,* 1989). The control animals showed tecting against disease and acute and latent infection, approximately 20 LAT-positive neurons per section (Ta- as outlined in Fig. 1. Groups of BALB/c mice (which are ble 1) while the *d*301-immunized animals showed a LAT- susceptible to HSV-mediated keratitis and latent infecpositive neuron in only about one in four sections (Table tion (Harbour *et al.,* 1981; Foster *et al.,* 1986)) were immu-1). These results allowed two conclusions about the $\frac{1}{2}$ nized s.c. in the rear flank with 2×10^6 PFU of *d*301, mechanism of protection against latent infection. First, KOS1.1, or an equivalent amount of control cell lysate, immunization with *d*301 reduced the number of LAT-posi- and were immunized again 1 month later. Sera were tive neurons ($P < 0.01$) and therefore likely reduced the collected after each immunization to assess primary and number of neurons that are latently infected by challenge secondary HSV-specific, neutralizing antibody responses. virus. Thus, the protective effect was not simply a reduc- At 1, 4, and 7 months after the second immunization, tion in the ability of the latently infected neurons to reacti- sera were again collected, and a cohort of mice was vate, the parameter measured previously (Morrison and sacrificed to assess the HSV-specific, T cell proliferative Knipe, 1994). Second, as evidenced by the lack of LAT- response. Subsets of the mice were then challenged by positive neurons, *d*301 did not spread from the site of inoculation of virulent HSV-1 onto scarified corneas in immunization and establish latent infection in the trigemi- an amount equivalent to 5 to 15 times the dose required nal ganglion neurons, thereby saturating the reservoir of to produce encephalitis in 50% of the mice. The eyes of sites for latent infection in the trigeminal ganglion. In-
the mice were swabbed daily through 4 days postchalstead, the mechanism of protection seemed to be based lenge to determine viral titer in the tear film as a measure

RESULTS on the immune response of the host to the *d*301 mutant

FIG. 1. Schematic representation of the experiment designed to test duration of immune responses and protection. The upper horizontal time line shows the full time course of the experiment. The lower horizontal line shows expanded view of procedures surrounding each challenge at 1, 4, or 7 months after the final immunization. Imm., s.c. immunization; Ab, serum collection for determination of neutralizing antibody titers; T, assessment of splenic T cell proliferative responses in cohort animals; challenge, corneal inoculation of challenge virus; eye swabs, daily sampling of tear film for determination of viral titer; keratitis scores, periodic examination of eyes for signs of disease (also indicates time period of evaluation for signs of encephalitis); react, explant and coculture of dissociated trigeminal ganglia for determination of latent infection.

of acute replication. The mice were also monitored at but then remained constant through the following 7-

Duration of immune responses. Sera collected from munization (Fig. 2B). five or six mice of each immunization group were tested To examine the durability of a T cell memory response, for HSV-specific neutralizing antibody in a CPE inhibition we examined T cell proliferative responses at various assay. Titration of complement-dependent neutralizing times after immunization. We detected a strong T cell antibodies (Fig. 2A) showed a primary antibody response proliferative response from splenocytes of either mutant 21 days after the first immunization with mutant or wt or wt virus-immunized mice at 1, 4, and 7 months after virus. The titers were augmented greatly and to similar immunization (Fig. 3). The response was HSV-specific in extents by secondary immunization with the mutant or that control supernatant placed in culture stimulated only wt virus. The titers in both mutant and wt virus-immunized low levels of incorporation compared to responses to mice declined by 60-75% during the ensuing 3 weeks HSV-infected lysate (Figs. 3A and 3B), except that back-

regular intervals for signs of encephalitis and keratitis. month period (Fig. 2A). Complement-independent neu-Surviving mice were sacrificed 28 days after challenge to tralizing antibody titers of these same sera were lower assess the presence of latent infection in the trigeminal but were also similar for wt and mutant-infected mice ganglia. and remained roughly constant for 1 – 7 months after im-

FIG. 2. Neutralizing antibody titers in sera from immunized mice. Sera were collected from groups of six mice at the indicated times after immunization, and HSV-specific neutralizing antibody titers of pooled sera were determined in a CPE inhibition assay. Titers shown represent a statistical approximation of the reciprocal of the highest serum dilution giving 50% inhibition of CPE. CL, control cell lysate. (A) Complementdependent titers; (B) complement-independent titers.

from two mice per group were collected and pooled and depleted of B
cells at (A) 1, (B) 4, and (C) 7 months after immunization. The remaining
mononuclear cells compared to unaffected eyes
mononuclear cells were placed in c the mean cpm \pm SD of [3H]thymidine on Day 4 of culture.

3C). Furthermore, the proliferative response of spleno- compared with control mice at all times although there cytes from mutant virus-immunized mice was maintained was some evidence of waning protection by 7 months at a level nearly equivalent (1 month) or equivalent (4 in both wt and mutant virus-immunized mice. and 7 months) to that seen in mice immunized with wt *Duration of protection against latent infection.* We asvirus. These results indicated that mice immunized with sessed whether the immune response to replication-dereplication-defective virus maintained neutralizing anti- fective virus maintained over time its capacity to debody and T cell proliferative responses as well as mice crease latent infection of the nervous system by chal-

immunized with wt virus through at least 7 months after immunization, and that HSV-specific immunity existed in the mutant virus-immunized mice at each time of challenge.

Duration of protection against acute viral replication in the eye. We assessed whether the immune response elicited by immunization with replication-defective virus maintained over time the capacity to reduce viral replication at the initial site of infection in the eye. Less virus was shed in the tear film of mice immunized with mutant virus than in mice inoculated with control cell lysate when both groups of mice were challenged 1 month later (Fig. 4A). This capacity of the immune response to reduce viral titer in the eye was maintained in mice challenged at 4 or 7 months after the final immunization (Figs. 4B and 4C). Differences in viral eye titer of 1 to 2 log between control and immunized mice were apparent as early as 1 day after infection. Mice immunized with mutant or wt virus showed similar reductions in eye titer at 1 and 4 months, and the reduction was strikingly equivalent at 7 months (Fig. 4).

Duration of protection against encephalitis and keratitis. By 5 days postchallenge, mice inoculated twice with control cell lysate uniformly developed signs of encephalitis when challenged at 1, 4, or 7 months after immunization: 88, 100, and 86% of the mice eventually succumbed to infection at the three times, respectively. In contrast, mice immunized twice with replication-defective or wt virus showed no signs of encephalitis whether challenged at 1, 4, or 7 months after immunization. Severe keratitis with stromal lesions also was observed in mice inoculated with control cell lysate, with mean keratitis scores reaching $3+$ after challenge at all three times (Fig. 5). Immunization with mutant or wt virus completely protected mice challenged at 1 or 4 months from development of stromal disease (Figs. 5A and 5B) and protected most mice challenged at 7 months (Fig. 5C). However, at 7 months, focal lesions of the cornea were seen in three of the eyes of both mutant and wt virus-immunized mice beginning 14 days after challenge. In 2/14 or 1/12 eyes from mutant or wt-immunized mice, respec-FIG. 3. T cell proliferative response in immunized mice. Splenocytes tively, these lesions increased in severity to $3-4+$. Histomediated by viropathologic or immunopathologic mechanisms could not be determined. Thus, there was less acute replication of challenge virus in the eyes of mutant ground proliferation was much higher at 7 month (Fig. virus-immunized mice and lower incidence of disease

FIG. 4. Reduction of challenge virus replication in the eye. Mice were challenged at: (A) 1, (B) 4, or (C) 7 months after final immunization. Samples of tear film were collected daily, and titer of infectious virus as a measure of acute replication was assessed by standard plaque assay. All samples contained infectious virus, and the values shown represent the mean titer of samples from five or six mice per group ${\pm}$ SEM.

lenge virus. Twenty-eight days after challenge, the trigeminal ganglia of surviving mice were assayed for the
presence of latent, reactivatible virus by tissue explant,
dissociation, and coculture with permissive cell mono-
dissociation, and coculture with permissive cell m regarded as the most sensitive means of assessing la- cates death of the majority of mice.

tent infection with the capacity for reactivation (Leib *et al.,* 1991; Jacobson *et al.,* 1993). When challenged at 1 month after immunization, none of the ganglia from wt virus-immunized mice and only 17% of ganglia from mutant virus-immunized mice contained reactivating challenge virus. Cultures of all ganglia from surviving mice inoculated with control cell lysate showed evidence of

layers. The dissociation assay was used because it is mean score of all eyes in each immunization group. The asterisk indi-

reactivating virus (Table 2, Expt 1), consistent with previ- footpads was truly input mutant virus. The persistence ous observations (Morrison and Knipe, 1994). Mice chal- of the mutant virus in an infectious form may prolong the lenged at 4 months after immunization also were appar- period of time during which infection and expression of ently protected from latent infection of the trigeminal gan- viral gene products occurs, thereby increasing the host glion by challenge virus: 0 and 10% of ganglia from immune response to the replication-defective virus even mutant and wt virus-immunized mice, respectively, con- if the virus does not spread from the primary cells it tained reactivating virus. These data from the 4-months infects. time point could not be compared with time-matched controls, however, because all mice inoculated with con- **DISCUSSION**

stimulating long-term immunity because its genetic de-
fect was somehow complemented *in vivo*, rendering it
 $\frac{1}{2}$ Mechanism of protection against latent infection replication-competent. Mice were inoculated with mutant Our experiments show that animals immunized with or wt virus in the footpad (as a form of s.c. immunization), the replication-defective mutant virus and challenged

TABLE 2 determine viral titer. Titers of wt virus rose on Days 1 – Reduction of Latent Virus in Trigeminal Ganglia 3 postinoculation, but titers of mutant virus declined progressively in footpads of inoculated mice (Fig. 6). In addition, mutant virus is undetectable within 1 day after inoculation onto the cornea while wt virus titers increase by 4 logs (Babu *et al.*, 1996). These observations support the contention that the mutant virus, $d301$, is replicationdefective *in vivo* as well as in tissue culture (Gao and Knipe, 1989), and that its parent, the KOS1.1 strain, does

replicate in vivo even though it is attenuated for virulence.
A second important observation from these experiments was that in contrast to the cornea, where infectious replication-defective virus is rapidly cleared (Babu et al., 1996), the mutant virus was recovered in an infec-^a Assayed by cocultivation of dissociated ganglia.
^a Compared to control cell lysate-inoculated mice by Fisher's exact ^b Compared to control cell lysate-inoculated mice by Fisher's exact tion in a second experiment o *c* Not determined **that is a set of the CO** and the Titration on Vero cells of Day 1 and Day 3 samples from *d*301 mutant-infected mice showed no plaques (results not shown), confirming that the virus persisting in the

trol (I ysale died as a result of challenge virus. This work has addressed the mechanisms by which
tion. A separate depresent in which more control mice
survived the challenge confirmed the apparent protection
all control

and footpad tissue was collected at various times to with virulent HSV-1 bear approximately 80-fold fewer

FIG. 6. *In vivo* replication of KOS1.1 but not d301 in footpad tissue. Groups of mice were injected with 1×10^6 PFU per footpad of KOS1.1 or *d*301, and footpad tissue was dissected from subsets of the mice at the indicated times. Infectious virus in the tissue homogenate was titrated by standard plaque assay on S-2 cells. Values represent mean titer of four tissue samples per group \pm SEM. A and B show two separate experiments carried out for different periods of time.

fected cell extract and then challenged. We conclude lenged express LAT at 28 days after challenge. Furtherthat immunization with the mutant virus reduces the num- more, LAT-positive neurons were not observed in dorsal ber of latently infected cells and not merely the ability of root ganglia following inoculation of *d*301 into the footpad the latent virus to reactivate. It is conceivable that in (Morrison and Knipe, unpublished results). Therefore, the the immunized animals the challenge virus can establish protection induced by the mutant virus is not the conselatency but not express LAT. *In situ* hybridization tech- quence of saturation of the latent infection sites by a less niques have not been able to detect HSV DNA during virulent virus but rather appears to involve host immune latent infection, but a few recent studies have detected mechanisms. Other studies have, in fact, demonstrated HSV DNA during latent infection through the use of *in situ* that specific subsets of T cells are required for protection PCR techniques (Ramakrishnan *et al.,* 1994; Gressens *et* against latent infection by the challenge virus (L. A. Mor*al.,* 1994; Gressens and Martin, 1994; Mehta *et al.,* 1995). rison and D. M. Knipe, manuscript in preparation). These papers differ in their conclusions regarding the latently infected cells in that one reports that the number
of HSV DNA-positive neurons is 50- to 100-fold higher defective mutant virus than the number of neurons expressing LAT (Ramakrishnan *et al.,* 1994) while another concludes that the distri- The capacity to provide long-lasting, ideally life-long, bution of LAT-positive cells approximates the distribution protection is an important attribute of an effective vacof HSV DNA-positive cells (Mehta *et al.,* 1995). We are cine-induced immune response. Historically, live viral currently attempting to establish a reliable *in situ* PCR vaccines have induced a more long-lived immunity than method to address the question of whether immunization killed virus vaccines. A major concern about replicationreduces the number of neurons containing HSV DNA. If defective viruses has been that they might not induce a the number of latently infected cells is truly reduced by durable immunity because they could not spread to critiimmunization, the question remains as to whether the cal sites during infection of the host, much like killed viral genome is prevented from reaching the neuronal virus vaccines. Nevertheless, at the dose used in mice cell body or whether it reaches the neuronal cell body in this study, the duration of immunity induced by the but cannot establish a latent infection. mutant virus seemed comparable to the replication-com-

protect against the establishment of persistent infection nized as young adults at 6 and 10 weeks of age, and by a more virulent virus by occupying the cellular sites immunity was demonstrated to last until the mice are of latency and interfering with subsequent infection (Rud nearly 11 months old. For virgin, female BALB/c mice this *et al.,* 1994). Although it seemed unlikely that a replica- protection covers approximately 2/3 of their adult lifespan tion-defective mutant could populate trigeminal ganglion (Russell, 1966). The durability of immunity induced in neurons after inoculation in the rear flank, our experi- mice by the replication-defective HSV mutant appears ments rule out a form of latency involving LAT expression to approximate that of vaccinia vectors expressing HSV by the mutant virus in the trigeminal ganglion by demon- glycoprotein D (Rooney *et al.,* 1988; Wachsman *et al.,* strating that very few trigeminal ganglion neurons in the 1992) and may exceed that induced by glycoprotein sub-

LAT-positive neurons than animals immunized with unin- animals immunized with the mutant virus and then chal-

It has been proposed that live, attenuated viruses can petent parental virus. The mice in this study were immu-

units (Meignier *et al.,* 1987) where immunity against intra- of the mutant virus to elicit strong, durable immunity in cerebral challenge waned with increasing time after im- the absence of spread within the host. Further dose studmunization. immunization. in the immune responses in the immune responses in the immune responses

months after immunization, disease prevention and ef- consistent with studies demonstrating that other replicafects on acute replication remained largely unchanged tion-defective mutant viruses, including canarypox vecfrom earlier times, but reduction of latent infection was tors (Cox *et al.,* 1993) and vaccinia virus vectors (Sutter *et* less dramatic. These results suggest two things. First, *al.,* 1994), elicit immunity similar to replication-competent protection against latent infection may be the most sensi- viruses. The survival of mutant virus in an infectious form tive indicator of the efficacy of long-term protection *in vivo* and continued primary infection may provide a against HSV infection. Consequently, even by the most way to reconcile current observations on the vaccine sensitive criterion, immunization with *d*301 was effective capabilities of replication-impaired mutant viruses with long-term in reducing challenge virus infection. Second, dogma about viral vaccines which holds that live forms while immune functions operating to reduce primary rep- of viral vaccines effectively stimulate immunity as a conlication in the eye are still intact, those necessary to sequence of virus replication and spread (White and Fenprevent virus spread to the nervous system and/or estab- ner, 1986; Mims *et al.,* 1993). lishment of latent infection may not be operating as effectively at late times after immunization. Conceivably, one **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS** component of the immune response may have a shorter life span. It is likely to be a T cell component because we thank R. Finberg for the gift of J11d.2 supernatant and T. Benjamin

neutralizing antibody titers remained steady through 7

months after immunization. We also ob breakthrough in protection against keratitis in a few of ship CRI 91MORR703 from the Cancer Research Institute. the mice challenged after 7 months, suggesting that some regulatory check on the activity of $CD4^+$ T (Newell REFERENCES *et al.,* 1989) cells may be lost over time. The question of long-term maintenance of various T cell subsets and their Babu, J. S., Thomas, J., Kanangat, S., Morrison, L. A., Knipe, D. M., and roles in latent infection and disease merits further de-

immunopathology by herpes simplex virus. J. Virol. 70, 101–107. immunopathology by herpes simplex virus. *J. Virol.* 70, 101 – 107. tailed analysis. Blacklaws, B. A., Krishna, S., Minson, A. C., and Nash, A. A. (1990).

hybridization in guinea pigs. *Virology* 181, 793-797.
Burke, R. L. (1992). Contemporary approaches to vaccination against fective and -competent viruses at the dose used raised herpes simplex virus. *Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol.* 179, 137 – 158. the possibility that there might be replication of the mu- Cantin, E. M., Eberle, R., Baldick, J. L., Moss, B., Willey, D. E., Notkins, A. L., and Openshaw, H. (1983). Expression of herpes simplex virus tant virus in correction of herpes simplex virus and protection of herpes simplex virus and protection of herpes simplex virus and protection of the footna pad tissue after subcutaneous inoculation in the footpad
(this report) or in eye tissue after corneal inoculation

7155–7159. (Babu *et al.*, 1996) showed no evidence for an increase in Coen, D. M., Irmiere, A. F., Jacobson, J. G., and Kerns, K. M. (1989). mutant virus indicative of replication. Surprisingly, mutant Low levels of herpes simplex virus thymidine-thymidylate kinase are virus is present in the footpad tissue in an infectious and limiting for sensitivity to certain antiviral drugs or for latency in form for sensitivity to certain antiviral drugs or for latency in form for sensitivity to ce form for several days. This may be in the form of free
virus particles or as virus particles sticking to cells and
the care and use of laboratory animals. 85-23. retaining infectivity, as documented for HIV with follicular Cooney, E. L., McElrath, M. J., Corey, L., Hu, S.-L., Collier, A. C., Arditti, dendritic cells in lymph nodes (Heath *et al.,* 1995). Re- D., Hoffman, M., Coombs, R. W., Smith, G. E., and Greenberg, P. D. gardless of the mechanism, this raises the possibility that (1993). Enhanced immunity to human immunodeficiency virus (HIV)
there is a prolonged series of primary infection events by envelope elicited by a combined vaccine there is a prolonged series of primary infection events by
the input mutant virus that could serve to boost the host
the input mutant virus that could serve to boost the host
ing with gp160 protein. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. immune response much as spread of live virus is thought Corey, L. (1991). Clinical studies with herpes simplex virus type 2 Curtis to boost the host immune response. This may help to strain vaccine. *Rev. Infect. Dis.* 13(Suppl. 11), S904-905. explain why, at the dose used, the replication-defective Cox, W. I., Targaglia, J., and Paoletti, E. (1993). Induction of cytotoxic
Thymphocytes by recombinant canarypox (ALVAC) and attenuated The The The Thymphocytes by r mutant virus induces an immune response similar to the
replication-competent virus. Nevertheless, other mecha-
nisms including prolonged antigen expression in the mu-
nisms including prolonged antigen expression in the mu-

It is interesting to note that in mice challenged 7 induced by these two types of virus, but our results are

-
- Immunogenicity of herpes simplex virus type 1 glycoproteins ex-
- **In vivo behavior of the replication-defective** pressed in vaccinia virus recombinants. *Virology* 177, 727–736.

Burke, R. L., Hartog, K., Croen, K. D., and Ostrove, J. M. (1991). Detection

and characterization of latent
	-
	-
	-
	-
	-
	-
	-
- Cremer, K. J., Mackett, M., Wohlenberg, C., Notkins, A. L., and Moss, tant virus-infected cells could also explain the capacity B. (1985). Vaccinia virus recombinant expressing herpes simplex

- Croen, K. D., Ostrove, J. M., Dragovic, L. J., Smialek, J. E., and Straus, cine for herpes simplex type 2: Safety and efficacy. *Ann. Int. Med.* S. E. (1987). Latent herpes simplex virus in human trigeminal ganglia. 122, 889 – 898.
- glycoproteins gB or gD. *J. Med. Virol.* 17, 9 18. 2893 2900.
-
- Foster, C. S., Tsai, Y., Monroe, J. G., Campbell, R., Cestari, M., Wetzig, latency. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 88, 48 52.
- tion with recombinant adenovirus expressing herpes simplex virus vector. *J. Virol. 64*, 431-436.
glycoprotein B. *J. Infect. Dis.* 168, 622-629. Manservirus Manservirus R. Incorvaia C. I
-
- *Virol.* 63, 5258 5267. *Med. Virol.* 32, 148 154.
- simplex virus ICP8 DNA-binding protein mutants. *J. Virol.* 67, 876-
885. Markia A. Margianaelda J. R.
-
-
-
- tion of herpes simplex virus DNA sequences in disseminated neona

and RNA hybridization detection of herpes simplex virus sequences

Gressens, P., and Mattin, J. R. (1994). In situ polymerase chain reaction:

Cocalization
- Harbour, D. A., Hill, T. J., and Blyth, W. A. (1981). Acute and recurrent a herpes simplex virus type 2 glycoprotein vaccine in persons at
herpes simplex in several strains of mice. J. Gen. Virol. 55, 31–40.
Heath S. L. Te
- Heath, S. L., Tew, J. G., Szakal, A. K., and Burton, G. F. (1995). Follicular Mims, C. A., Playfair, J. H. L., Roitt, I. M., Wakelin, D., and Burton, G. F. (1995). Follicular Mims, C. A., Playfair, J. H. L., Roitt, I. M., dendritic cells and human immunodeficiency virus infectivity. Nature
- Hoggan, M. D., and Roizman, B. (1959). The isolation and properties and Mento, S. J. (1991). Native herpes simplex virus glycoprotein D
secine: Immunogenicity and protection in animal models. Vaccine and protection in anim of a variant of herpes simplex producing multinucleated giant cells vaccine: Immunogenees in the presence of antihody $Am + Hwa = 70$ 9, 147–153. in monolayer cultures in the presence of antibody. Am. J. Hyg. 70,
- Jacobson, J. G., Ruffner, K. L., Kosz-Vnenchak, M., Hwang, C. B., Wobbe, thymidine kinase and specific stages of latency in murine trigeminal
- Kennedy, P. G. E., Lisak, R. P., and McRaff. (1980). Cell type-specific B. T. (1989). Herpes simplex virus-induced stromal keratitis: Role of markers for human glial and neuronal cells in culture. *Lab. Invest.* T-lymphocyte subsets in immunopathology. *J. Virol.* 63, 769 – 775.
- coded by herpes simplex virus 1. *J. Virol.* 44, 736-741.
-
- virus type 1 glycoprotein D prevents latent herpes in mice. *Science* Langenberg, A., Burke, R. L., Adair, S. F., Sekulovich, R., Tigges, M., 228, 737 – 740. Dekker, C. L., and Corey, L. (1995). A recombinant glycoprotein vac-
- Detection of an immediate early gene "anti-sense" transcript by in Leib, D. A., Bogard, C. L., Kosz-Vnenchak, M., Hicks, K. A., Coen, situ hybridization. N. Engl. J. Med. 317, 1427-1432. D. M., Knipe, D. M., and Schaffer, D. M., Knipe, D. M., and Schaffer, P. A. (1989). A deletion mutant Dix, R. D., and Mills, J. (1985). Acute and latent herpes simplex virus of the latency-associated transcript of herpes simplex virus type 1 neurological disease in mice immunized with purified virus-specific reactivates from the latent state with reduced frequency. *J. Virol.* 63,
- Farrell, H. E., McLean, C. S., Harley, C., Efstathiou, S., Inglis, S., and Leib, D. A., Nadeau, K. C., Rundle, S. A., and Schaffer, P. A. (1991). The promoter of the latency-associated transcripts of herpes simplex type 1 mutant with an essential glycoprotein deleted. *J. Virol.* 68, virus type 1 contains a functional cAMP-response element: Role of 927 – 932. the latency-associated transcripts and cAMP in reactivation of viral
- R., Knipe, D. M., and Greene, M. I. (1986). Genetic studies on murine Manservigi, R., Grossi, M. P., Gualandri, R., Balboni, P. G., Marchini,
Susceptibility to herpes simplex keratitis. *Clin. Immunol. Immunopa* A. Rotol A., Rotola, A., Rimessi, P., Di Luca, D., Cassai, E., and Barbanti*thol.* 40, 313 – 325. Brodano, G. (1990a). Protection from herpes simplex virus type 1 Gallichan, W. S., Johnson, D. C., Graham, F. L., and Rosenthal, K. L.
(1993). Mucosal immunity and protection after intranasal immunizace constitutively expressed in human cells with a BK virus episomal constitutively expressed in human cells with a BK virus episomal
- glycoprotein B. *J. Infect. Dis.* 168, 622–629. Manservigi, R., Incorvaia, C., Di Luca, D., Rotola, A., Balboni, P. G.,
Gao, M., and Knipe, D. M. (1989). Genetic evidence for multiple nuclear Sebastiani, A., Rossi, A., and ao, M., and Knipe, D. M. (1989). Genetic evidence for multiple nuclear Sebastiani, A., Rossi, A., and Cassai, E. (1990b). Experimental kerati-
Sebastiani, A., Rossi, A., and Cassai, A., and Cassai, A., The Cassai, A., and functions of the herpes simplex virus ICP8 DNA-binding protein. *J.* tis in rabbits by human HSV-1 variants: Prevention and treatment. *J.* tis in rabbits by human HSV-1 variants: Prevention and treatment. *J.* Med Virol 3
- Gao, M., and Knipe, D. M. (1991). Potential role for herpes simplex virus
ICP8 DNA replication protein in stimulation of late gene expression. J. McLean, C. S., Erturk, M., Jennings, R., Challanain, D. N., Minson,
ICP8 DNA
- Mehta, A., Maggioncalda, J., Bagasra, O., Thikkavarapu, S., Saikumari,
Gressens, P., Langston, C., and Martin, J. R. (1994). In situ PCR localiza-
F., Valyi-Nagy, T., Fraser, N. W., and Block, T. M. (1995). In situ PCR
and
	-
	-
	-
	-
	- 377, 740–744.
Mishkin, E. M., Fahey, J. R., Kino, Y., Klein, R. J., Abramovitz, A. S.,
Sangan, M. D. and Roizman, B. (1959). The isolation and properties and Mento, S. J. (1991). Native herpes simplex virus glycoprotein D
	- 208 219.
Cobson J G Ruffner K J Kosz-Vnenchak M Hwang C B Wobbe defective mutants of herpes simplex virus type 1: Sites of immune K. K., Knipe, D. M., and Coen, D. M. (1993). Herpes simplex virus intervention in pathogenesis of challenge virus infection. *J. Virol.* 68, the intervention in pathogenesis of challenge virus infection. *J. Virol.* 68, th
	- ganglia. *J. Virol.* 67, 6903–6908. Newell, C. K., Martin, S., Sendele, D., Mercadal, C. M., and Rouse,
- 43, 342 351. Nguyen, L. H., Knipe, D. M., and Finberg, R. W. (1992). Replication-Knipe, D. M., Quinlan, M. P., and Spang, A. E. (1982). Characterization defective mutants of herpes simplex virus (HSV) induce cellular imof two conformational forms of the major DNA-binding protein en- munity and protect against lethal HSV infection. *J. Virol.* 66, 7067 –
- Knipe, D. M., and Spang, A. E. (1982). Definition of a series of stages Paoletti, E., Lipinskas, B. R., Samsonoff, C., Mercer, S., and Panicali, in the association of two herpesviral proteins with the cell nucleus. D. (1984). Construction of live vaccines using genetically engineered *J. Virol.* 43, 314-324. **poxviruses: Biological activity of vaccinia virus recombinants ex-**

- of herpes simplex virus type 1 latency in the rat trigeminal ganglion 1056 –1059. established with a ribonucleotide reductase-deficient mutant. *J. Virol.* Stroop, W. G., Rock, D. L., and Fraser, N. W. (1984). Localization of stroop, W. G., Rock, D. L., and Fraser, N. W. (1984). Localization of the stro
- fifty percent endpoints. *Am. J. Hyg.* 27, 493 497. in situ hybridization. *Lab. Invest.* 51, 27 38.
-
-
-
- Dennis, M., Hall, G., and Cranage, M. P. (1994). A naturally attenuated virus challenge. *J. Gen. Virol.* 70, 2587 2594. SIVmac32H — Vaccine or Viral Interference. *In* "Vaccines 94" (E. White, D. O., and Fenner, F. J. (1986). "N
Norrby, F. Brown, R. M. Chanock, and H. S. Ginsberg, Eds.), p. 217. 283–303. Academic Press, New York. Norrby, F. Brown, R. M. Chanock, and H. S. Ginsberg, Eds.), p. 217. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press, Cold Spring Harbor, NY. Whitley, R. J. (1996). ''Virology'' (B. N. Fields, D. M. Knipe, and P. M.
- Ed.), 2nd ed., pp. 511-519. McGraw-Hill, New York. phia, PA.
- pressing the hepatitis B virus surface antigen and the herpes simplex Stevens, J. G., Wagner, E. K., Devi-Rao, G. B., Cook, M. L., and Feldvirus glycoprotein D. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 81, 193-197. man, L. T. (1987). RNA complementary to a herpesvirus alpha gene Ramakrishnan, R., Levine, M., and Fink, D. J. (1994). PCR-based analysis mRNA is prominent in latently infected neurons. *Science* 235,
- herpes simplex virus in the trigeminal and olfactory systems of the Reed, L. J., and Muench, H. A. (1938). A simple method of estimating mouse central nervous system during acute and latent infections by
- Rice, S. A., and Knipe, D. M. (1990). Genetic evidence for two distinct
transactivation functions of the herpes simplex virus alpha protein
ICP27. J. Virol. 64, 1704–1715.
Roizman, B. (1991). Introduction: Objectives of he
- vaccines seen from a historical perspective. Rev. Infect. Dis.

13(Suppl. 11), S892–S894.

Rooney, J. F., Wohlenberg, C., Cremer, K. J., Moss, B., and Notkins,

A. L. (1988). Immunization with a vaccinia virus recombinant
- and effect of revaccination. J. Virol. 62, 1530–1534.

Rud, E. W., Olgilvie, L., Clarke, B. E., Almond, N., Kent, K., Chan, L., B. T. (1989). Recombinant vaccinia virus expressing the herpes sim-

Page, M., Kitchin, P., St
	-
- Russell, E. S. (1966). "Biology of the Laboratory Mouse" (E. L. Green, Howley, Eds.), 3rd ed., pp. 2297-2342. Lippincott-Raven, Philadel-