

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com**SciVerse ScienceDirect**

South African Journal of Botany 82 (2012) 67–74

SOUTH AFRICAN
JOURNAL OF BOTANYwww.elsevier.com/locate/sajb

Heavy metals in medicinal plant products — An African perspective

R.A. Street *

Traditional Medicine Laboratory, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Howard College Campus, Durban, South Africa, 4000

Available online 11 August 2012

Abstract

Heavy metal toxicity related to the use of traditional medicines has been reported worldwide. Heavy metals may be introduced into medicinal plant products through contaminated agricultural resources and/or poor production practices. Deliberate addition of heavy metals for alleged medicinal value has been documented in numerous cultural groups. Poisoning from heavy metal contamination of medicinal plant products has caused countless health implications including liver and kidney failure and even death. African natural plant-based products have evolved to incorporate various synthetic products such as heavy metals for alleged medicinal properties. This review emphasizes the main areas in agriculture and production where contamination may occur. At the same time it highlights the cultural uses and poisonings related to heavy metals in traditional medicines. Adequate regulatory measures and quality control of African herbal products for toxic heavy metals are required.

© 2012 SAAB. Published by Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

Keywords: Contamination; Heavy metals; Traditional medicine; Herbal products; Medicinal plants

1. Introduction

Heavy metals of non-anthropogenic origin are always present at a background level with their occurrence in soils being related to weathering of parent rocks and pedogenesis (Ghiyasi et al., 2010). However the concentration of several heavy metals has increased dramatically in certain ecosystems due to anthropogenic activities (Sarma et al., 2012). Heavy metals frequently occur as cations which strongly interact with the soil matrix and can become mobile as a result of changing environmental conditions (Qishlaqi and Farid Moore, 2007). Plants can amass trace elements, especially heavy metals, in and on their tissues due to their ability to tolerate potentially toxic ions in the environment (Kabata-pendias, 2001). Heavy metal uptake by plants can increase the potential of certain toxic elements entering the food chain thus understanding how these elements progress through food webs, and the effects of such elements on organisms, is the topic of considerable interest (Boyd, 2009).

The adverse effects of heavy metals on human health have been known for a long time nevertheless exposure to heavy metals continues and is even increasing in some areas (Jarup,

2003; Kaushik et al., 2009). Due to the high prevalence of heavy metals in the environment, their residues also reach and are assimilated into medicinal plants (Sarma et al., 2012). There are three key mechanisms that have been proposed to explain heavy metal contamination of medical plant-based products; contamination during cultivation, inadvertent cross-contamination during processing and/or the purposeful introduction of heavy metals for alleged medicinal purposes (Denholm, 2010). The research presented in this paper reviews the various sources of heavy metal contamination, the effect on medicinal plant quality as well as highlights adverse effects to humans.

2. Heavy metal accumulation by medicinal plants

There is now extensive interest in heavy metal transport by metal-tolerant plants (metallophytes) because of the repercussions for phytoremediation (Iqbna Lone et al., 2008; Sarma, 2011). The use of plants to remediate polluted soils is seen as having great promise compared to conventional, civil-engineering methods (Rascio and Navari-Izzo, 2011). A copious number of plants have been explored for phytoremediation (Padmavathamma and Li, 2007; Sarma, 2011) however the accumulation of heavy metals in edible and medicinal plants need thorough investigation to prevent elevated concentrations of

* Tel.: +27 33 260 4128; fax: +27 33 260 4650.

E-mail address: street@ukzn.ac.za.

heavy metals reaching the consumer (Sharma et al., 2009; Steenkamp et al., 2000). Heavy metal origin and content as well as their possible interaction with soil properties are priority objectives in environmental monitoring (Qishlaqi and Farid Moore, 2007). This is due to the fact that apart from the source of heavy metals, the physicochemical properties of soil may also affect the heavy metal concentration (Aydinalp and Marinova, 2003; Qishlaqi and Farid Moore, 2007). Numerous abiotic factors influence the availability of metal to plants including pH, temperature, redox potential, cation exchange capacity and organic matter (Gregor, 2004). Furthermore, the interactions of soil-plant roots-microbes play vital roles in regulating heavy metal movement from the soil to edible plant parts (Islam et al., 2007). The accumulation of metals by both roots and leaves increases with increasing available metal concentration in the external medium (Gregor, 2004). Factors such as reduced biomass, root length and shoot length are common indicators of heavy metal toxicity (Houshmandfar and Moraghebi, 2011; Siddhu et al., 2008). Changes at the cell, tissue and organ level are either a result of a direct interaction between the metal and structural components at the sites or a consequence of changes in signal transduction and/or metabolism (Solanki and Dhankhar, 2011). Plant responses to heavy metals should be investigated for the particular soil-plant environment (Kabata-pendias, 2001). The term “hyperaccumulator” describes plant species that have the ability to grow on metalliferous soils and to accumulate extraordinarily high levels of heavy metals (in comparison to the majority of species) without displaying phytotoxic effects (Rascio and Navari-Izzo, 2011). However hyperaccumulators are habitually confined to metal-enriched soils such as those soils found on serpentine outcrops and other metalliferous rocks (Reeves, 2002).

Numerous medicinal plants have the ability to accumulate heavy metals when grown under natural conditions. Medicinally used *Senecio coronatus* (Thunb.) Harv. (Asteraceae) is one of the nine nickel (Ni) hyperaccumulating plants in Africa (Przybylowicz et al., 1995). Similarly, two African medicinally used *Datura* species are metallophytes namely *Datura metal* L. (Solanaceae), an accumulator of cobalt (Co) and Ni and recommended as a phytomonitor (Bhattacharjee et al., 2004), and *Datura innoxia* Miller, Gard., a metal tolerant species (Kelly et al., 2002). Likewise *Helichrysum candolleianum* H. Buek (Asteraceae) and *Blepharis diversispina* (Nees) C.B. Clarke (Acanthaceae) are also able to tolerate high concentrations of metals (Nkoane et al., 2005). The levels of heavy metals in 27 medicinal plant species collected from their natural habitat in Ghana were studied in order to evaluate their health implications (Annan et al., 2010). Cadmium (Cd) was present in all samples and some species, especially *Ocimum canum* (Lamiaceae), *Clausena anisata* (Rutaceae) and *Rauwolfia vomitoria* (Apocynaceae) had levels of iron (Fe) which could cause Fe toxicity. Despite the popular use of the above mentioned African medicinal plant species, ongoing evaluation of heavy metal uptake by these species with regards to consumer safety is not considered.

Cultivation of medicinal plants, as opposed to collection from the wild, will allow for controlled growth and monitoring of potentially hazardous parameters (Canter et al., 2005; Sparg

et al., 2005). Nonetheless many agro-chemicals contain heavy metals such as Cd and lead (Pb) which enter the soil due to fertiliser impurities thus heavy metal contamination in soils is often caused by repeated use of metal-enriched fertilisers (He et al., 2004). As a result soil and water sources (both primary and secondary) need to be monitored periodically under Good Agricultural and Collection Practice (GACP). This is the first phase in good quality assurance upon which the safety and efficacy of plant-based medicinal products directly depend (WHO, 2003). Site selection should be based on contaminant free soil and irrigation supply. So far only the European Union and a few other countries, such as China and Japan have developed regional specific and national guidelines for GACP for medicinal plants (WHO, 2003). Such guidelines are regulated and monitored to make certain that the correct plant material is collected and/or cultivated and that soil and irrigation water are within the limits, or free from, unsafe heavy metals and toxicologically hazardous substances. In developing countries, regulations such as GACP are infrequently implemented and rarely enforced.

3. Effect of heavy metals on secondary metabolites

Mineral elements are involved in the structure of some secondary metabolites, yet can also have undesirable effects on their regulation (Poutaraud and Girardin, 2005). Nonetheless, few studies have addressed the effects of heavy metals on the ultramorphological characteristics and the therapeutically active constituents in medicinal plant parts (Nasim and Dhir, 2010). Plants exposed to heavy metal stress show varying degrees of secondary metabolite response (Table 1). Chromium (Cr)-stress induced the production of eugenol, a major component of essential oil of *Ocimum tenuiflorum* (Lamiaceae) (15, 25, 17, 4% more eugenol from 10, 20, 50 and 100 μM Cr exposed plants, respectively) (Rai et al., 2004). Similarly the therapeutically active compounds, phyllanthin and hypophyllanthin, were enhanced at certain levels of Cd stress in *Phyllanthus amarus* Schum and Thonn (Phyllanthaceae). On the contrary, heavy metal pollution of soil and air at a distance of 400 m from the source of pollution suppressed the growth of *Mentha piperita* L. (c v T u n d z a and C l o n e No 1) (Lamiaceae) and *Mentha arvensis* var *piperascens* Ma l inv. (c v M e n t o l n a - 1 4) and the yield of essential oil by up to 14% compared to the control. This however did not negatively affect the essential oil content and its quality (Zheljazkov and Nielsen, 1996). It is debatable whether screening medicinal plants by means of *in vitro* assays is the most effective approach to validation (Verpoorte, 1998) though, in Africa, the active compound(s) of so few medicinal plants have been identified that simply screening of medicinal plant extracts using biological assays is the norm (Jäger and Van Staden, 2005; Light et al., 2005). Nevertheless reporting on biological activity of crude plant extracts without the isolation and identification of an active compound raises concern, as the activity may be due to the presence of toxic substances (Elgorashi et al., 2004). A recent study investigated Cd accumulation and its effect on COX-1 and COX-2 anti-inflammatory activity in *Eucomis autumnalis* (Hyacinthaceae) and *Eucomis humilis* (Street et al., 2009). When treated with Cd 2 mg L⁻¹, *E. humilis* bulbous extracts

Table 1
Examples of studies on heavy metal stress affecting secondary metabolite production.

Plant species	Main findings relating to secondary metabolites	Reference
<i>Hypericum perforatum</i> L.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the presence of Ni, the plant completely lost the ability to produce or accumulate hyperforin and demonstrated a 15–20-fold decrease in the concentration of pseudohypericin and hypericin 	Murch et al., 2003
<i>Ocimum tenuiflorum</i> L.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cr stress induced the production of eugenol 	Rai et al., 2004
<i>Dioscorea bulbifera</i> L.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The occurrence of Cu stimulated diosgenin production 	Narula et al., 2005
<i>Phyllanthus amarus</i> Schum. and Thonn	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Phyllanthin and hypophyllanthin was enhanced by Cd stress 	Rai et al., 2005
<i>Bacopa monnieri</i> L.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The level of bacoside-A increased due to increased Fe in the media 	Sinha and Saxena, 2006
<i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> L.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cd and Co increased diosgenin levels however Cr and Ni inhibited its production 	De and De, 2011

exhibited lower inhibitory activity than the control for both COX-1 and COX-2 whilst *E. autumnalis* bulbous extracts had greater COX-1 activity compared to the control with suppressed COX-2 activity. The study cautioned researchers to be cognizant of the consequence of environmental contaminants when reporting on biological activity of crude plant extracts.

It is clear that heavy metal induced stimulation of medicinal plants is strongly influenced by several aspects including plant growth stage, concentration and duration of treatment, and composition of growth medium (Nasim and Dhir, 2010; Rajakaruna et al., 2002). As a result optimizing nutrient supply is a key factor in the quality of medicinal plants. It has been suggested that certain medicinal plants be grown in polluted soils for higher secondary metabolite yield (Rai et al., 2004) this will however depend on the plant part used as consumer safety needs to be first and foremost.

4. Heavy metals in medicinal plants and plant-based products

Numerous studies have been conducted worldwide to determine heavy metal levels in medicinal plants and plant-based products (Annan et al., 2010; Ebrahim et al., 2012; Maharia et al., 2010). Both developed and developing countries have shown high levels of potentially toxic heavy metals in products available to the public (Denholm, 2010; Garvey et al., 2001). Such products are not only from local sources but are often imported (Saper et al., 2008). A study examining heavy metal content in traditional Asian herbal remedies purchased in the United States, Vietnam and China revealed that the majority of products had detectable levels of heavy metals, with nearly 74% containing amounts greater than current recommended public health guidelines (Garvey et al., 2001). An effective solution to the importation of traditional medicines containing heavy metals presents a great challenge (Shaw, 1998; Saper et al., 2008). These products are expected to be imported in small quantities by numerous different routes, including via the postal service and with intercontinental travelers (Denholm, 2010). Formal labeling and packaging may be deceptive as it gives the public a false sense of product safety.

In Africa, formalization and registration of herbal products are not the norm and preparations often lack appropriate labeling such as contents, contraindications, place and date of manufacture and expiry date. Medicinal plant collection is often from the wild and locations are habitually undisclosed. Thus the traceability of medicinal plants which are sold at traditional

medicine markets is nonexistent. A study by Street et al. (2008) showed that South African medicinal plant parts harvested from a wide range of undisclosed locations by plant gatherers and sold at informal markets had multiple metal contamination. Lead and Ni were detected in all samples and elevated Fe and manganese (Mn) contents were recorded in certain plant species. The only way to ensure consumer safety is to periodically sample plants from the traditional medicine markets however even this is complicated due to the fact that plants of the same species are habitually collected from various sources and are added together in one storage container. It is nonetheless imperative that medicinal plants are tested for metal contamination as these plants are used as starting material for numerous herbal products. Correct post-harvest processing may also contribute to the minimization of heavy metals in the starting materials. A study by Abou-Arab and Abou Donia (2000) investigated Egyptian medicinal plants processed by two different methods to determine the behavior of their metal contents during processing. In general, boiling the plants in water led to extraction of higher amounts of the metal from the plant than submerging them in hot water however the investigated metals were transferred from the plant tissue into the used water at different ratios depending on the metal, the plant, and the method of extraction. A study regarding the concentration of arsenic (As), Cd, Pb and mercury (Hg) in 20 registered ready to use herbal products purchased randomly from the pharmacy shops in Lagos (Nigeria) revealed that none of the samples contained detectable Pb; however, all the samples contained a detectable quantity of one or more of the other metals of interest (Adepoju-Bello et al., 2012). Despite studies conducted to determine heavy metal levels in African medicinal plants and plant-based products (Table 2), with no regulatory guidelines or methods of enforcing limits, these studies simply illustrate the potential to cause hazard to human health without any resolve.

5. Intentional uses of heavy metals for medicinal purposes

Heavy metals are a regular and deliberate component of traditional remedies worldwide therefore the use of the term ‘contamination’ with respect to the occurrence of heavy metals in traditional remedies is disingenuous (Ernst, 2002). In traditional Chinese medicine, heavy metals have been used for numerous health complaints. For example, Hg is part of certain preparations under the terminology of ‘cinnabaris’ (mercury sulfide), ‘calomel’ (mercury chloride) or ‘hydrargyri oxydum rubrum’ (mercury oxide) (Ernst, 2002). Allopathic medical practitioners are skeptical

Table 2
Examples of heavy metal assessment of medicinal plant products from Africa.

Country	Elements assessed	Reference
Egypt	Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Pb, Ni, Mn, Fe, Sn, Zn	Abou-Arab and Abou Donia, 2000
Egypt	Cd, Cu, Pb	Dogheim et al., 2004
Egypt	Ca, Cu, Mg, Mn, Fe, K, Na, Se, Zn	Sheded et al., 2006
Ghana	Al, Br, Ca, Cl, Co, Cu, Cr, K, Mn, Mg, Na, Rb, Sb, Sc, Ta, V, Zn	Serfor-Armay et al., 2002
Ghana	Cd, Cu, Fe, Mn, Ni, Zn	Annan et al., 2010
Mali	Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Fe, Mn, Ni, Pb, Zn	Maiga et al., 2005
Nigeria	Ca, Cu, Mn, Mg, K, Fe, Pb, Zn	Ajasa et al., 2004
Nigeria	Cd, Cu, Fe, Ni, Se, Zn, Pb, Hg	Obi et al., 2006
Nigeria	Ca, Cd, Cr, Fe, K, Mn, Na, Mg, P, Pb, Zn	Abolaji et al., 2007
South Africa	Cu, Pb, Mn, Hg, Se, Zn	Steenkamp et al., 2000
South Africa	U	Steenkamp et al., 2005
Sudan	Cd, Cr, Cu, Fe, Hg, Pb, Mn, Mg, Se, Sn, Zn	Ebrahim et al., 2012

about the use of Hg for therapy — a perception not supported by traditional medicine practitioners (Kamath et al., 2012). In Indian traditional medicine, otherwise known as ayurveda, bhasma (calcified powder/ash) are herbo-mineral or herbo-metallic formulations. The segment of ayurveda which involves bhasma is referred to as 'Rasa Sastra'. Buddhist Philosopher Nagarjuna who was deemed the father of metallic medicine in India used metals and minerals in the form of bhasma as remedial agents from preceding 8th century A.D (Senthil Kumar et al., 2011). Metals mixed with organic compounds derived from plant extracts render them biocompatible according to ancient traditions (Kamath et al., 2012; Senthil Kumar et al., 2011). Recent studies have shown the scientific processes behind the detoxification of metals during processing of such herbo-metallic formulations (Kamath et al., 2012). Although heavy metal salts are an additive of African traditional medicines, no such epistemology has been documented to explain the alleviation of potentially toxic substances. However this is not to say that such a theory does not exist.

While heavy metals have been detected in African traditional remedies (Table 2) few studies have documented the commonly available metals used in African traditional medicine or investigated the reason behind such usage. Hexavalent chromium (Cr(VI)), a class 1 carcinogen, is commonly used in South African traditional medicines and known locally as *ndonya*. A study by Sewram et al. (2010) revealed that 72% of traditional health practitioners (n=395) prescribed *ndonya*-containing medicines for healing purposes. A large number (50%) admitted to substituting *ndonya* with copper sulphate crystals if *ndonya* was not available. The issue of toxicity depended on method of preparation and mode of administration whilst the pharmacological effects were said to be altered by the food eaten as well as individual tolerance. The concentration of Cr(VI) in traditional medicine preparations varied considerably from 4 µg/L–53 g/L. Such results are cause for concern and warrants toxicity awareness.

6. Poisoning from heavy metal contamination of traditional medicine products

Medicinal plants have been shown to be both a rich source of essential metal ions and a potentially dangerous source of

non-essential metals (Narendhirakannan et al., 2005; Singh and Garg, 1997). Poisonings from traditional medicine products containing heavy metals is well documented (Dargan et al., 2008; Ernst, 2002). The toxic effects of heavy metals are due to their hindrance with the regular body biochemistry in normal metabolic processes (Duruibe et al., 2007). Arsenic, Cr and magnesium (Mg) are the heavy metals most frequently implicated in morbidity and death in South Africa (Steenkamp et al., 2002). An investigation of the Johannesburg forensic record over a period of 5 years (1991–1995) identified 206 cases in which a traditional remedy was either declared to be the grounds for death or was found to be present in a case of poisoning with an unidentified substance (Stewart et al., 1999). Heavy metals were responsible for 10% of these poisonings. A study by Steenkamp et al. (2000) on heavy metal concentrations in plants, plant-based remedies and urine from patients treated with traditional remedies concluded that out of the 12 concoctions investigated, copper (Cu) levels were extremely high in 4 of the concoctions. A large number of patients (34%) showed elevated zinc (Zn) concentrations. In one of the patients the Zn concentration was 10 times the upper limit of the reference range. After a week of vomiting with hepatomegaly, and dehydration, the patient died of hepatic failure. A further report revealed that a seven month old infant was hospitalised after the intake of a traditional medicine which resulted in a severe case of multiple metal poisoning (Steenkamp et al., 2002). It is known that numerous traditional medicines give rise to severe renal pathology, the mechanism of which is uncertain but which could be associated with heavy metal toxicity (Steenkamp et al., 2000). It has been suggested that potassium dichromate (K₂Cr₂O₇) toxicity should be suspected in cases of unexplained renal failure (Woods et al., 1990). Woods et al. (1990) reported seven cases of dichromate poisoning after the use of purgative solutions obtained from traditional healers. One patient who ingested dichromate died from massive gastro-intestinal hemorrhage. Six patients took dichromate solutions as rectal enemas, two were left with impaired renal function and one patient required a permanent colostomy caused by extensive peri-anal necrosis. Similar reports have indicated that Cr(VI)-containing traditional remedies have been the cause of poisonings and morbidity in young children (Steenkamp et al., 2002). In Nigeria, a study reported high levels of heavy metal

in blood from unknown sources (Ibeto and Okoye, 2010) and the introduction from African traditional medicines cannot be ruled out.

Unfortunately customarily African traditional medicine products do not contain details such as place of production/manufacture thus there is no accountability for adverse reactions. Strict regulations with regard to classification and labelling may prevent further poisonings. Moreover, certain substances should not be available to the general public for self-administration such as $K_2Cr_2O_7$. Regrettably adverse reactions and poisoning profile of traditional medicine is not well documented and substances are often inadequately categorised. For example, potassium permanganate which could be classified as a household chemical or anti-septic is also used in South African traditional medicine however this substance may be incorrectly profiled with regards to causative agents in acute and chronic poisonings (Balme et al., 2012).

7. International standards regarding heavy metals in traditional medicines

Health, safety and quality declarations are key features with respect to regulatory requirements and standards globally. However, there are immense discrepancies between countries regarding regulatory requirements to pledge safety and quality of plant-based products (Diederichs et al., 2006). Several regulations have already been established worldwide for medicinal plants and related marketed herbal products such as the US Pharmacopoeia (USP), Italian Pharmacopoeia (FUI), and European Pharmacopoeia (Ph. Eur.). Moreover, there are legal frameworks at national and/or regional levels that are designed to regulate the quality of plant-based products (Sarma et al., 2012). Before 1988, only 14 WHO Member States had regulations relating to herbal medicine products but by 2003, this had increased to 53 Member States (37%). Of those without laws/regulations, 49% declared that such regulations were in the process of being developed (WHO, 2005). Several countries, including Canada, China, Malaysia, Singapore and Thailand, have developed their own national guidelines to ensure satisfactory levels of heavy metals in medicinal plants and plant-based products (Table 3). The WHO (1998) recommends maximum permissible levels in raw materials for Cd and Pb which amount to 0.3 and 10 mg kg⁻¹, respectively. Even though certain essential elements can be toxic at high levels; the WHO limits for these metals have not yet been established.

8. Conclusion

Heavy metals may enter medicinal plant-based remedies through both intentional and unintentional routes (Annan et al., 2010; Senthil Kumar et al., 2011). The external appearance of medicinal plants cannot guarantee safety from contamination especially when farming activities are carried out around contaminated areas (Olowoyo et al., 2012). Reliance on plants collected from the wild causes not only a threat to medicinal plant biodiversity (Grace, 2011) but also conjecture with regards to safety, as industrial encroachment has led to contamination of water tables and soil (Zhuang et al., 2009). Conscious site selection coupled with suitable soil management can reduce heavy metal uptake by medicinal plants (Chaiyarat et al., 2011).

Controlled growth (under GACP) and processing environments (under Good Manufacturing Practice) need to ensure that heavy metal contamination of medicinal plant material is kept to a minimum. For the medicinal plant industry, cultivated plant material is preferred as it is easier to control the supply chain plus contamination is nominal (Lubbe and Verpoorte, 2011). Numerous studies have shown the effect of heavy metals on plant growth and development of various African medicinal plant species grown under controlled environments (Lux et al., 2011; Street et al., 2009) however such studies rarely translate into field trials and therefore do not develop into comprehensive pragmatic guidelines for medicinal plant growers. The influence of heavy metals on secondary metabolite production needs thorough investigation as this may severely affect the quality of the end product (Rai et al., 2004; Zheljzkov and Nielsen, 1996). While the scientific literature regarding heavy metal accumulation in plants and the hazards these elements cause for humans is plentiful, information does not exist about biochemical mechanisms of transfer of these elements to primary and secondary consumers (Peralta-Videa et al., 2009). The influence of toxic manifestations includes chemical nature of the metal, route of administration, dosage, residence time within the body, pharmacokinetics and dynamics, bioavailability, metabolic transformations of the preparations, age, gender, physiology, nature and stage of disease and diet (Hung et al., 1997). Therefore careful risk analysis is needed to establish the risk involved in a given preparation (Kamath et al., 2012). Despite availability of metal salts in African traditional markets, information regarding herbo-metallic preparations is lacking. The combination of raw heavy metals and medicinal plants may alter the cell uptake, distribution

Table 3
Examples of national limits for heavy metals in herbal medicinal products (WHO, 2005).

		Arsenic (As)	Lead (Pb)	Cadmium (Cd)	Chromium (Cr)	Mercury (Hg)	Copper (Cu)	Lead (Pb)
Canada	Raw herbal materials	5 ppm	10 ppm	0.3 ppm	2 ppm	0.2 ppm		
	Finished herbal products	0.01 mg/day	0.02 mg/day	0.06 mg/day	0.02 mg/day	0.02 mg/day		
China	Herbal materials	2 ppm	10 ppm	1 ppm		0.5 ppm		20 ppm
	Finished herbal products	5 mg/kg	10 mg/kg			0.5 mg/kg		
Republic of Korea	Herbal materials							30 ppm
Singapore	Finished herbal products	5 ppm	20 ppm			0.5 ppm	150 ppm	
Thailand	Herbal material, finished herbal products	4 ppm	10 ppm	0.3 ppm				
WHO recommendations			10 mg/kg	0.3 mg/kg				

and elimination profile as well as the therapeutic properties; however no pharmacotherapeutic studies exist to analyse the effect of these herbo-metallic preparations (Kamath et al., 2012). It is imperative that potential risk factors of heavy metal intake from African traditional medicine products be addressed and that regulatory guidelines are not only carefully developed but also enforced.

Acknowledgements

The South African Medical Research Council, National Research Foundation (South Africa) and the University of KwaZulu-Natal are thanked for their financial assistance.

References

- Abolaji, O.A., Adebayo, A.H., Odesanmi, O.S., 2007. Nutritional qualities of three medicinal plant parts (*Xylopiya aethiopica*, *Blighia sapida* and *Parinari polyandra*) commonly used by pregnant women in the western part of Nigeria. *Pakistan Journal of Nutrition* 6, 665–668.
- Abou-Arab, A.A.K., Abou Donia, M.A., 2000. Heavy metals in Egyptian spices and medicinal plants and the effect of processing on their levels. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry* 48, 2300–2304.
- Adepoju-Bello, A.A., Issa, O.A., Oguntibeju, O.O., Ayoola, G.A., Adejumo, O.O., 2012. Analysis of some selected toxic metals in registered herbal products manufactured in Nigeria. *African Journal of Biotechnology* 11, 6918–6922.
- Ajasa, A.M.O., Bello, M.O., Ibrahim, A.O., Ogunwande, I.A., Olawore, N.O., 2004. Heavy trace metals and macronutrients status in herbal plants of Nigeria. *Food Chemistry* 85, 67–71.
- Annan, K., Kojo, A., Asare, C., Asare-Nkansah, S., Bayor, M., 2010. Profile of heavy metals in some medicinal plants from Ghana commonly used as components of herbal formulations. *Pharmacognosy Research* 2, 41–44.
- Aydinalp, C., Marinova, S., 2003. Distribution and forms of heavy metals in some agricultural soils. *Polish Journal of Environmental Studies* 12, 629–633.
- Balme, K., Roberts, J.C., Glasstone, M., Curling, L., Mann, M.D., 2012. The changing trends of childhood poisoning at a tertiary children's hospital in South Africa. *South African Medical Journal* 102, 142–146.
- Bhattacharjee, S., Kar, S., Chakravarty, S., 2004. Mineral compositions of datura: a traditional tropical medicinal plant. *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis* 35, 937–946.
- Boyd, R.S., 2009. High-nickel insects and nickel hyperaccumulator plants: A Review. *Insect Science* 16, 19–31.
- Canter, P.H., Thomas, H., Ernst, E., 2005. Bringing medicinal plants into cultivation: opportunities and challenges for biotechnology. *Trends in Biotechnology* 23, 180–185.
- Chaiyarat, R., Suebsima, R., Putwattana, N., Kruatrachue, M., Pokethitiyook, P., 2011. Effects of soil amendments on growth and metal uptake by *Ocimum gratissimum* growth in Cd/Zn-contaminated soil. *Water, Air, and Soil Pollution* 214, 383–392.
- Dargan, P.I., Gawarammana, I.B., Archer, J.R.H., House, I.V., Shaw, D., Wood, D., 2008. Heavy metal poisoning from Ayurvedic traditional medicines: an emerging problem? *International Journal of Environment and Health* 2, 463–472.
- De, D., De, B., 2011. Elicitation of diosgenin production in *Trigonella foenum-graecum* L. seedlings by heavy metals and signaling molecules. *Acta Physiologicae Plantarum* 33, 1585–1590.
- Denholm, J., 2010. Complementary medicine and heavy metal toxicity in Australia. *WebmedCentral* 1, 1–6.
- Diederichs, N., Feiter, U., Wynberg, R., 2006. Production of traditional medicines: technologies, standards and regulatory issues. In: Diederichs, N. (Ed.), *Commercialising Medicinal Plants — A Southern African Guide*. Sun Press, Stellenbosch, pp. 155–166.
- Dogheim, S.M., Ashraf, E.M.M., Alla, S.A.G., Khorshid, M.A., Fahmy, S.M., 2004. Pesticides and heavy metal levels in Egyptian leafy vegetables and some aromatic medicinal plants. *Food Additives and Contaminants* 21, 323–330.
- Duruibe, J.O., Ogwuegbu, M.O.C., Egwurugwu, J.N., 2007. Heavy metal pollution and human biotoxic effects. *International Journal of Physical Sciences* 2, 112–118.
- Ebrahim, A.M., Eltayeb, M.H., Khalid, H., Mohamed, H., Abdalla, W., Grill, P., Micalke, B., 2012. Study on selected trace elements and heavy metals in some popular medicinal plants from Sudan. *Journal of Natural Medicine* 66, 671–679.
- Elgorashi, E.E., Stafford, G.I., Mulholland, D., Van Staden, J., 2004. Isolation of captan from *Cyranthus suaveolens*: the effect of pesticides on the quality and safety of traditional medicine. *South African Journal of Botany* 70, 512–514.
- Ernst, E., 2002. Toxic heavy metals and undeclared drugs in Asian herbal medicines. *Trends in Pharmacological Sciences* 23, 136–139.
- Garvey, G.J., Hahn, G., Lee, R.V., Harbison, R.D., 2001. Heavy metal hazards of Asian traditional remedies. *International Journal of Environmental Health Research* 11, 63–71.
- Ghiyasi, S., Karbassi, A., Moattar, F., Modabberi, S., Sadough, M.B., 2010. Origin and concentrations of heavy metals in agricultural land around aluminium industrial complex. *Journal of Food, Agriculture & Environment* 8, 1237–1240.
- Grace, O.M., 2011. Current perspectives on the economic botany of the genus *Aloe* L. (Xanthorrhoeaceae). *South African Journal of Botany* 77, 980–987.
- Gregor, M., 2004. Metal availability, uptake, transport and accumulation in plants. In: Prasad, M.N.V. (Ed.), *Heavy metal stress in plants — from biomolecules to ecosystems*. Springer-verlag, Berlin, pp. 1–27.
- He, P.P., Lv, X.Z., Wang, G.Y., 2004. Effects of Se and Zn supplementation on the antagonism against Pb and Cd in vegetables. *Environment International* 30, 167–172.
- Houshmandfar, A., Moraghebi, F., 2011. Effect of mixed cadmium, copper, nickel and zinc on seed germination and seedling growth of safflower. *African Journal of Agricultural Research* 6, 1463–1468.
- Hung, O.L., Shih, R.D., Chiang, W.K., Nelson, L.S., Hoffman, R.S., Goldfrank, L.R., 1997. Herbal preparation use among urban emergency department patients. *Academy of Emergency Medicine* 4, 209–213.
- Ibeto, C.N., Okoye, C.O.B., 2010. High levels of heavy metals in blood of the urban population in Nigeria. *Research Journal of Environmental Sciences* 4, 371–382.
- Iqbal Lone, M., He, Z., Stofella, P.J., Yang, X., 2008. Phytoremediation of heavy metal polluted soils and water: progress and perspectives. *Journal of Zhejiang University. Science. B* 9, 210–220.
- Islam, E.U., Yang, X., He, Z., Mahmood, Q., 2007. Assessing potential dietary toxicity of heavy metals in selected vegetables and food crops. *Journal of Zhejiang University. Science. B* 8, 1–13.
- Jäger, A.K., Van Staden, J., 2005. Cyclooxygenase inhibitory activity of South African plants used against inflammation. *Phytochemistry Reviews* 4, 39–46.
- Jarup, L., 2003. Hazards of heavy metal contamination. *British Medical Bulletin* 68, 167–182.
- Kabata-pendias, A., 2001. *Trace elements in soils and plants*. CRC Press, New York.
- Kamath, S., Pemiah, B., Sekar, R., Krishnaswamy, S., Sethuraman, S., Krishnan, U., 2012. Mercury-based traditional herbo-metallic preparations: a toxicological perspective. *Archives of Toxicology* 1–8.
- Kaushik, A., Kansal, A., Meena, S., Kumari, S., Kaushik, C.P., 2009. Heavy metal contamination of river Yamuna, Haryana, India: assessment by metal enrichment factor of the sediments. *Journal of Hazardous Materials* 164, 265–270.
- Kelly, R.A., Andrews, J.C., Dewitt, J.G., 2002. An X-ray absorption spectroscopic investigation of the nature of the zinc complex accumulated in *Datura innoxia* plant tissue culture. *Microchemical Journal* 71, 231–245.
- Light, M.E., Sparg, S.G., Stafford, G.I., Van Staden, J., 2005. Riding the wave: South Africa's contribution to ethnopharmacological research over the last 25 years. *Journal of Ethnopharmacology* 100, 127–130.

- Lubbe, A., Verpoorte, R., 2011. Cultivation of medicinal and aromatic plants for speciality industrial materials. *Industrial Crops and Products* 34, 785–801.
- Lux, A., Vaculik, M., Martinka, M., Liskova, D., Kulkarni, M.G., Stirk, W.A., Van Staden, J., 2011. Cadmium induces hypodermal periderm formation in the roots of the monocotyledonous medicinal plant *Merwillia plumbea*. *Annals of Botany* 107, 285–292.
- Maharia, R.S., Dutta, R.K., Acharya, R., Reddy, A.V.R., 2010. Journal of Environmental Science and Health, Part B: Pesticides, Food Contaminants and Agricultural Wastes 45, 174–181.
- Maiga, A., Diallo, D., Bye, R., Paulsen, B.S., 2005. Determination of some toxic and essential metal ions in medicinal and edible plants from Mali. *Journal of Agriculture and Food Chemistry* 23, 2316–2321.
- Murch, S.J., Haq, K., Rupasinghe, H.P.V., Saxena, P.K., 2003. Nickel contamination affects growth and secondary metabolite composition of St. John's wort (*Hypericum perforatum* L.). *Environmental and Experimental Botany* 49, 251–257.
- Narendhirakannan, R., Subramanian, S., Kandaswamy, M., 2005. Mineral content of some medicinal plants used in the treatment of diabetes mellitus. *Biological Trace Element Research* 103, 109–115.
- Narula, A., Kumar, A., Srivastava, P.S., 2005. Abiotic metal stress enhances diosgenin yield in *Dioscorea bulbifera* L. cultures. *Plant Cell Reports* 24, 250–254.
- Nasim, S.A., Dhir, B., 2010. In: Whitacre, D.M. (Ed.), *Heavy Metals Alter the Potency of Medicinal Plants Reviews of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology*. Springer, New York, pp. 139–149.
- Nkoane, B.B.M., Sawula, G.M., Wibetoe, G., Lund, W., 2005. Identification of Cu and Ni indicator plants from mineralised locations in Botswana. *Journal of Geochemical Exploration* 86, 130–142.
- Obi, E., Akunyili, D.N., Ekpo, B., Orisakwe, O.E., 2006. Heavy metal hazards of Nigerian herbal remedies. *The Science of the Total Environment* 369, 35–41.
- Olowoyo, J.O., Okedeyi, O.O., Mkolo, N.M., Lion, G.N., Mdkane, S.T.R., 2012. Uptake and translocation of heavy metals by medicinal plants growing around a waste dump site in Pretoria, South Africa. *South African Journal of Botany* 78, 116–121.
- Padmavathamma, P.K., Li, L.Y., 2007. Phytoremediation technology: hyperaccumulation metals in plants. *Water, Air, and Soil Pollution* 184, 105–126.
- Peralta-Videa, J.R., Lopez, M.L., Narayan, M., Saupé, G., Gardea-Torresdey, J., 2009. The biochemistry of environmental heavy metal uptake by plants: implications for the food chain. *The International Journal of Biochemistry & Cell Biology* 41, 1665–1677.
- Poutaraud, A., Girardin, P., 2005. Improvement of medicinal plant quality: a *Hypericum perforatum* literature review as an example. *Plant Genetic Resources* 3, 178–189.
- Przybylowicz, W.J., Pineda, C.A., Prozesky, V.M., Mesjasz-przybylowicz, J., 1995. Investigation of Ni hyperaccumulation by true elemental imaging. *Nuclear Instruments and Methods in Physics Research Section B: Beam Interactions with Materials and Atoms* 104, 176–181.
- Qishlaqi, A., Farid Moore, F., 2007. Statistical analysis of accumulation and sources of heavy metals occurrence in agricultural soils of Khoshk River banks, Shiraz, Iran. *American-Eurasian Journal of Agriculture & Environmental Science* 2, 565–573.
- Rai, V., Vajpayee, P., Singh, S.N., Mehrotra, S., 2004. Effect of chromium accumulation on photosynthetic pigments, oxidative stress defense system, nitrate reduction, proline level and eugenol content of *Ocimum tenuiflorum* L. *Plant Science* 167, 1159–1169.
- Rai, V., Khatoun, S., Bisht, S.S., Mehrotra, S., 2005. Effect of cadmium on growth, ultramorphology of leaf and secondary metabolites of *Phyllanthus amarus* Schum. and Thonn. *Chemosphere* 61, 1644–1650.
- Rajakaruna, N., Harris, C.S., Towers, G.H.N., 2002. Antimicrobial activity of plants collected from serpentine outcrops in Sri Lanka. *Pharmaceutical Biology* 40, 235–244.
- Rascio, N., Navari-Izzo, F., 2011. Heavy metal hyperaccumulating plants: how and why do they do it? And what makes them so interesting? *Plant Science* 180, 169–181.
- Reeves, R.D., 2002. Hyperaccumulation of trace elements by plants. In: Morel, J.-L., Echevarria, G., Goncharova, N. (Eds.), *Phytoremediation of metal-contaminated soils*. Springer, Dordrecht, pp. 25–52.
- Saper, R.B., Phillips, R.S., Sehgal, A., Khouri, N., Davis, R.B., Paquin, J., Thuppil, V., Stefanos, N., Kales, S.N., 2008. Lead, mercury, and arsenic in US- and Indian-manufactured ayurvedic medicines sold via the internet. *JAMA : The Journal of the American Medical Association* 300, 915–923.
- Sarma, H., 2011. Metal hyperaccumulation in plants: a review focusing on phytoremediation technology. *Journal of Environmental Science and Technology* 4, 118–138.
- Sarma, H., Deka, S., Deka, H., Saikia, R.R., 2012. Accumulation of heavy metals in selected medicinal plants. *Reviews of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology* 214, 63–86.
- Senthil Kumar, C., Moorthi, C., Prabhu, P.C., Benoto Jonson, B., Venkatnarayan, R., 2011. Standardization of anti-arthritic herbo-mineral preparation. *Research Journal of Pharmaceutical, Biological and Chemical Sciences* 2, 679–684.
- Serfor-Armay, Y., Nyarko, B.J.B., Akaho, E.H.K., Kyere, A.W.K., Osae, S., Oppong-Boachie, K., 2002. Multi-elemental analysis of some traditional plant medicines in Ghana. *Journal of Trace and Microprobe Techniques* 20, 419–427.
- Sewram, V., Street, R.A., Myers, J., Gqaleni, N., Connolly, C., 2010. The determination of hexavalent chrome content in South African traditional medicines used as enemas. Technical Report. South African Medical Research Council.
- Sharma, R.K., Agrawal, M., Marshall, F.M., 2009. Heavy metals in vegetables collected from production and market sites of a tropical urban area of India. *Food and Chemical Toxicology* 47, 583–591.
- Shaw, D., 1998. Risks or remedies? Safety aspects of herbal remedies in the UK. *Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine* 91, 294–296.
- Sheded, M.G., Pulford, I.D., Hamed, A.I., 2006. Presence of major and trace elements in seven medicinal plants growing in the South-Eastern Desert, Egypt. *Journal of Arid Environments* 66, 210–217.
- Siddhu, G., Sirohi, D.S., Kashyap, K., Ali Khan, I., Ali Khan, M.A., 2008. Toxicity of cadmium on the growth and yield of *Solanum melongena* L. *Journal of Environmental Biology* 29, 853–857.
- Singh, V., Garg, A.N., 1997. Availability of essential trace elements in ayurvedic Indian medicinal herbs using instrumental neutron activation analysis. *Applied Radiation and Isotopes* 48, 97–101.
- Sinha, S., Saxena, R., 2006. Effect of iron on lipid peroxidation, and enzymatic and non-enzymatic antioxidants and bacodise-A content in medicinal plant *Bacopa monnieri* L. *Chemosphere* 62, 1340–1350.
- Solanki, R., Dhankhar, R., 2011. Biochemical changes and adaptive strategies of plants under heavy metal stress. *Biologia* 66, 195–204.
- Sparg, S.G., Jager, A.K., Magwa, M.L., Van Staden, J., 2005. Cultivation of medicinal plant *Merwillia natalensis* as a crop: a small-scale farming approach. *Outlook on Agriculture* 34, 116–120.
- Steenkamp, V., Von arb, M., Stewart, M.J., 2000. Metal concentrations in plants and urine from patients treated with traditional remedies. *Forensic Science International* 114, 89–95.
- Steenkamp, V., Stewart, M.J., Curowska, E., Zuckerman, M., 2002. A severe case of multiple metal poisoning in a child treated with a traditional medicine. *Forensic Science International* 128, 123–126.
- Steenkamp, V., Stewart, M.J., Chimuka, L., Cukrowska, E., 2005. Uranium concentrations in South African herbal remedies. *Health Physics* 89, 679–683.
- Stewart, M.J., Moar, J.J., Steenkamp, P., Kokot, M., 1999. Findings in fatal cases of poisoning attributed to traditional remedies in South Africa. *Forensic Science International* 101, 177–183.
- Street, R.A., Kulkarni, M.G., Stirk, W.A., Southway, C., Van Staden, J., 2008. Variation in heavy metals and microelements in South African medicinal plants obtained from street markets. *Food Additives & Contaminants. Part A: Chemistry, Analysis, Control, Exposure & Risk Assessment* 25, 953–960.
- Street, R., Elgorashi, E., Kulkarni, M.G., Stirk, W., Southway, C., Van Staden, J., 2009. Effect of cadmium accumulation on anti-inflammatory activity in two *Eucomis* species. *Bulletin of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology* 83, 644–647.
- Verpoorte, R., 1998. Exploration of nature's chemodiversity: the role of secondary metabolites as leads in drug development. *Drug Discovery Today* 3, 232–238.
- WHO, 1998. Quality control methods for medicinal plant materials. Geneva.

- WHO, 2003. Guidelines on Good Agricultural and Collection Practices (GACP) for Medicinal Plants. Geneva.
- WHO, 2005. National policy on traditional medicine and regulations of herbal medicines. Geneva.
- Woods, R., Mills, P.B., Knobel, G.J., Hurlow, W.E., Stokol, J.M., 1990. Acute dichromate poisoning after use of traditional purgatives. A report of 7 cases. *South African Medical Journal* 77, 640–642.
- Zheljazkov, V.D., Nielsen, N.E., 1996. Effect of heavy metals on peppermint and cornmint. *Plant and Soil* 178, 59–66.
- Zhuang, P., Zou, B., Li, N.Y., Li, Z.A., 2009. Heavy metal contamination in soils and food crops around Dabaoshan mine in Guangdong, China: implication for human health. *Environmental Geochemistry and Health* 31, 707–715.