Analysis of calcium-induced calcium release in cardiac sarcoplasmic reticulum vesicles using models derived from single-channel data

Alexandra Zahradniková *, Ivan Zahradnık

Institute of Molecular Physiology and Genetics, Slovak Academy of Sciences, Vlárska 5, 833 34 Bratislava, Slovak Republic

Received 9 December 1998; received in revised form 12 February 1999; accepted 22 February 1999

Abstract

The planar lipid bilayer and vesicle release experiments are two alternative approaches used to study the function of the ryanodine receptor (RyR) channel at the subcellular level. In this work, we combine models of gating (Zahradniková and Zahradnık, Biophys. J. 71 (1996) 2996–3012) and permeation (Tinker et al., J. Gen. Physiol. 100 (1992) 495–517) of the cardiac RyR channel to simulate calcium release experiments on sarcoplasmic reticulum vesicles. The resulting model and real experimental data agreed well within the experimental scatter, confirming indistinguishable properties of the RyRC in the vesicle preparation and in the planar lipid bilayer. The previously observed differences in calcium dependencies of the release and the gating processes can be explained by binding of calcium within the RyRC conducting pore. A novel method of analysis of calcium dependence of calcium release was developed and tested. Three gating models of the RyRC, showing, respectively, an increase, no change, and a decrease in calcium sensitivity over time, were compared. The described method of analysis enabled determination of temporal changes in calcium sensitivity, giving potential for detection of the adaptation/inactivation phenomena of the RyRC in both vesicle and in situ release experiments. © 1999 Elsevier Science B.V. All rights reserved.

Keywords: Calcium release; Ryanodine receptor; Permeation; Gating; Modeling; Cardiac muscle

1. Introduction

Three principal approaches, differing in their divergence from in vivo conditions, were used in studies of the machinery providing for calcium release from intracellular stores in heart muscle: (1) measurements of calcium transients in skinned or living cells [1–4] with minimal perturbation of in vivo conditions; (2) measurements of 45Ca2+ release from isolated vesicles of sarcoplasmic reticulum [5–9] in which native membrane composition is retained; or (3) measurements of single-channel activity of release channels incorporated into planar lipid bilayers [6,8,10–14]. Reconstitution of the channels into the artificial environment of the bilayer provides unrivaled time resolution and exceptional control of the experimental conditions, but the physiological relevance of the results has been questioned.

Bilayer experiments aided with rapid changes of Ca2+ in the vicinity of the single cardiac ryanodine receptor channel (RyRC) have revealed temporal changes in the channel activity [11,15–20], termed adaptation [15], which are accompanied by changes in the distribution of modes of channel activity [21,14]. The techniques for rapid Ca2+ concentration changes in the vicinity of a bilayer membrane still

* Corresponding author. Fax: +421 (7) 5477-3666; E-mail: umfgzahr@kramare.savba.sk

0005-2736/99/$ – see front matter © 1999 Elsevier Science B.V. All rights reserved.
PII: S0005-2736(99)00036-X
suffer from technical limitations. Therefore, there is a continuing dispute whether the decrease in the RyRC sensitivity to Ca$^{2+}$, observed within seconds after channel activation [15], is a genuine property of the cardiac ryanodine receptor or a technical artifact [22–24]. The problem could not be addressed by measuring calcium release using stopped-flow techniques for the lack of a method of data analysis capable of resolving temporal changes in calcium sensitivity of release.

Another unresolved problem is the Ca$^{2+}$ dependence of cardiac RyRC activity at high Ca$^{2+}$ concentrations. In skinned cardiac Purkinje cells, Fabiato [1] has found that the extent of calcium release is a bell-shaped function of the free cytosolic calcium concentration. Also in isolated cardiac SR vesicles, the measured rate of passive $^{45}$Ca$^{2+}$ efflux was a bell-shaped function of the extravesicular calcium concentration [6–9], although the half-inhibiting Ca$^{2+}$ concentration was an order of magnitude higher than that reported by Fabiato [1] in skinned myocytes. These observations were interpreted as evidence for a direct inhibitory action of calcium ions on cardiac Ca release via reduction of the open probability of the channel (Ca-dependent inactivation). However, this interpretation is at odds with the results of most single-channel experiments, in which the activity of cardiac calcium release channels was found to be inactivated, under similar conditions, by cis (cytosolic) calcium either at extremely high Ca$^{2+}$ concentrations [13], or not at all [8,11,12]. It was attempted to avoid these contradictions by postulating that a hypothetical diffusible factor – supposedly lost during incorporation of the RyRC into the bilayer [8], or by treatment of the RyR channel with CHAPS during protein purification, or by high concentrations of Cs$^+$ [13] – mediates calcium-induced inactivation.

Recent development in understanding of RyRC gating and permeation provides the means to interpret single-channel activity of the channel and the kinetics of macroscopic release on common grounds. In this work, we show how the mathematical descriptions of channel open probability and ion fluxes through the open pore of the channel can be combined to provide a unified model of calcium release. Using this approach, we will explore a hypothesis integrating the experimental observations obtained with the techniques of planar lipid bilayers and vesicle release experiments. According to this hypothesis, the experimentally observed time- and calcium-dependence of calcium release arise from the modal behavior of the release channel, and from the permeation properties of its conducting pore. This work is based on mathematical modeling with the use of the minimal gating model of cardiac RyRC developed by us [25], and with the use of the single ion permeation model of this channel described by Tinker et al. [26].

We introduce a new method for quantitative analysis of the Ca release data and, using three different models of RyR gating, we demonstrate that it can reliably detect temporal changes in the sensitivity of the RyRC to the activating ligands.

2. Materials and methods

Simulations of the calcium release fluxes from SR vesicles via RyRC were performed with a set of differential equations describing the three processes involved: the channel gating, the ion fluxes through the open channel, and the material balance of the system.

(1) Gating of the cardiac Ca release channel was described by a six-state scheme illustrated in Fig. 1A, which was shown to be the minimal gating scheme of the RyRC [25]. The rate constants of the model were the same as in [25]. The model predicts a transient increase in the channel open probability upon binding of a single Ca$^{2+}$ ion to the activation site (Fig. 1B). It should be noted that the decrease of the channel activity in time is not a consequence of another Ca$^{2+}$ ion binding to a site on the channel, occupation of which would cause channel transitions to the inactivated state. Rather, inactivation involves spontaneous, slow, kinetically controlled transitions of the channel to modes having a lower open probability than the mode in which the channel resides during activation. Modeling was performed in the environment of the Mathematica program (Version 2.2, Wolfram Research, USA) running on a Pentium computer as described previously [25]. The time courses of open probabilities after application of a step change in cis calcium concentration, such as the example in Fig. 1B, were calculated by solving a
system of ordinary differential equations of channel kinetics, using the set of rate constants estimated in our previous work [25]. The apparent activation constant $K_{\text{app}}(t)$ of the channel open probability $P_o(t)$ at the time $t$ after a step change of Ca$^{2+}$ was estimated by fitting the dose–response equation to the calculated open probabilities at a given time.

(2) The single-ion channel pore model [26] depicted in Fig. 1C was solved in Mathematica running on a Pentium computer, using a set of steady-state equations for state probabilities as described in Cooper et al. [27], allowing for a maximum of four different permeant ions. The model was applied here to calculate the RyR single-channel conductances (simulated bilayer experiments), and the flux of $^{45}$Ca$^{2+}$ through the open RyR channels (simulated vesicle experiments).

(3) The time course of $^{45}$Ca$^{2+}$ release from vesicles was solved in Mathematica running on IBM RISC/6000 machine. The differential equations for channel gating [25] were combined with Eqs. 1 and 2 for non-steady state flux through the open pore of the single-ion channel [27]. These equations were derived assuming that in the closed channel no transitions of ions between channel pore wells can occur.

\[
\frac{dW_{M_i}(t)}{dt} = P_o(t)\cdot (-W_{M_i}(t) \sum_{j \neq i} k_{M_{ij}} + k_{M_{ii}} W_{E}(t) [M_i](t)) \tag{1}
\]

\[
\frac{dW_{E}(t)}{dt} = P_o(t)\cdot (-W_{E}(t) \sum_{i} k_{M_{ei}} [M_i](t)) + \sum_{i} k_{M_{ie}} W_{M_i}(t) \tag{2}
\]
The indices i,j denote the position of the ion in one of the three wells (R, C, L); \([M_j](t)\) is the free concentration of ion M in the compartment neighboring with the well i, i.e. intravesicular compartment (right well) or extravesicular compartment (left well); \(k_{M_{ij}}\) are the rate constants of the transition of the ion M from the well i to the well j or into/out of the channel \(k_{M_{ce}} = k_{M_{ec}} = 0\) by definition; \(W_M(t)\) is the probability of the channel pore energy well i to be occupied by the ion M, \(W_E(t)\) is the probability of all the channel energy wells being empty.

The equations of material balance (Eqs. 3–6); Ca\(^{2+}\) and \(^{45}\)Ca\(^{2+}\) were considered different species) were solved for the transport of ions between the compartments and for the complexation of calcium by the chelator EGTA (ethylene glycol bis-\(\beta\)-aminoethyl ether-N,N,N',N'-tetraacetic acid). The rate constants \(k_{on}\) and \(k_{off}\) for binding of calcium to EGTA were taken from Smith et al. [28]. Binding of other ions by EGTA is weak and was not considered. The initial conditions for EGTA complexation were solved based on the dissociation constants reported by Smith and Miller [29]. In simulations where the extravesicular compartment was assumed to behave as an infinite sink, i.e. the extravesicular concentration of \(^{45}\)Ca\(^{2+}\) was not influenced by the efflux, the right sides of Eqs. 3–6 were set to zero.

\[
\frac{d[M_R](t)}{dt} = P_o(t)\frac{n}{V_R}(k_{M_{RE}}W_{M_R}(t) - k_{M_{ER}}W_E(t)[M_R](t))
\]

\[
\frac{d[M_L](t)}{dt} = -\frac{V_R}{V_L}\frac{d[M_R](t)}{dt} - k_{on}[\text{EGTA}](t)[M_L](t)
+ k_{off}[M\text{EGTA}](t)
\]

\[
\frac{d[\text{EGTA}](t)}{dt} = -k_{on}[\text{EGTA}](t)\sum_m[M_L](t) + k_{off}\sum_m[M\text{EGTA}](t)
\]

\[
\frac{d[M\text{EGTA}](t)}{dt} = k_{on}[\text{EGTA}](t)[M_L](t) - k_{off}[M\text{EGTA}](t).
\]

Here, \(n\) is the total number of RyR channels, \(V_R\) is the total vesicular volume, \(V_L\) is the total extravesicular volume.

The buffering of intravesicular calcium by calsequestrin was considered to be instantaneous, and the free calcium concentration was calculated as in [30]:

\[
[\text{Ca}^{2+}] = \frac{1}{1 + \left(\frac{K_D c_{\text{Ca}}}{[\text{Ca}^{2+}]}\right)^2}
\]

where [\text{Ca}^{2+}] is the intravesicular concentration of free Ca\(^{2+}\), \(K_D = 0.5\) mM [31] is the dissociation constant for Ca binding to calsequestrin binding sites, \(c_{\text{Ca}}\) is the concentration of these sites, and \(c_{\text{Ca}}\) is the total intravesicular calcium concentration.

In the case when the effect of open probability inhibition by calcium on release was considered, the inhibition was assumed to be independent of activation, and \(P_o\) in Eqs. 1–3 was then multiplied by the inhibitory dose–response function.

To inspect \(^{45}\)Ca\(^{2+}\) efflux without contribution of the channel time dependent behavior on the kinetics of release, the open probability \(P_o\) in Eqs. 1–3 was calculated using the dose–responses of activation [25] for the peak or the steady-state open probability.

For testing the performance of the procedure for determination of the sensitivity of the channel to activation by Ca\(^{2+}\) as a function of time, three models differing in the time dependence of \(K_a\) were considered.

As Model 1, a representative of models in which \(K_a\) decreases as a function of time, we used the minimal gating model as described above. The time constant of \(K_a\) equilibration is \(\sim 1\) s in the activating Ca\(^{2+}\) range of about 1–10 \(\mu\)M.

As Model 2, a representative of models in which \(K_a\) does not change in time, we used a gating model with instantaneous activation to

\[
P_o = \frac{\text{Ca}^{2+}}{\text{Ca}^{2+} + K_a}
\]

and the value of \(K_a = 2.4\) \(\mu\)M.
As Model 3, a representative of the models in which \( K_a \) increases as a function of time, we used a gating model with the following calcium- and time-dependence of open probability:

\[
P_o = \frac{[Ca^{2+}]^n}{[Ca^{2+}]^n + (K_a(t))^{n_H}}
\]

\[
K_a(t) = K_a(0) - \Delta K_a \left( 1 - e^{-\frac{t}{\tau_{Ca}}} \right),
\]

The parameter values were: \( K_a(0) = 0.3 \mu M \), \( K_a(\infty) = 2 \mu M \), \( \Delta K_a = K_a(\infty) - K_a(0) \), \( \tau_{Ca} = 1 s \); \( n = 4 \).

This model is approximately equivalent to the model of Keizer and Levine [32].

The rate of release was estimated from the time courses of intravesicular \( 45^{Ca^{2+}} \) concentration using three procedures, mimicking real experimental techniques: (1) the initial release rate method – as the slope of the release curve calculated with 50 ms time resolution (or 1 ms, to avoid the low sampling rate errors); (2) the cumulative release method – as the amount of calcium released within 5 s; and (3) the half-time method – as the reciprocal value of the release half-time. The values of efflux rates are given in relative units, as the channel density in the release experiments is not known.

3. Results

3.1. Calcium dependence of the RyRC open probability

The calculated calcium dependence of the steady-state open probabilities is compared to the experimental data of Chu et al. [8], Győrke et al. [11], and Laver et al. [13] in Fig. 2. All these data were obtained in the absence of \( Mg^{2+} \) and ATP, and using \( Cs^{+} \) as the charge carrier. It is obvious that the theoretical calcium dependence of the steady-state curve (solid line) is a good approximation of the measured values up to 1 mM \( Ca^{2+} \) concentration. Approximation of all published data in the range below 1 mM with a dose–response function provided the activation constant \( K_a = 1.22 \pm 0.21 \mu M \) and the slope \( n_H = 1.16 \pm 0.20 \). These values are almost identical to the theoretical predictions of the model of 0.97 µM and 1.0 for \( K_a \) and \( n_H \), respectively. For calcium concentrations above 1 mM, only few data are available. The results of Laver et al. [13] differ from the other two reports by observation of a decline in \( P_o \). Inclusion of these data into the fit did not change the activation parameters. Additionally, it provided the inhibition parameters \( K_i = 10.4 \pm 1.3 \mu M \) and \( n_i = 1.26 \pm 0.20 \) for the calcium dependent open probability inhibition (dashed line), close to the reported values of \( K_i = 15 \mu M \) and \( n_i = 1.7 \) [13]. The contribution of the calcium-dependent inactivation to the open probability is less than 10%, i.e. well within the experimental error, up to 2 mM \( cis Ca^{2+} \).

3.2. Ion permeation through the RyR channel

Fig. 2. Calcium dependence of the open probability of the RyR channel. The experimental data are replotted as solid symbols with corresponding error bars (circles, Chu et al. [8]; squares, Győrke et al. [11]; triangles, Laver et al. [13]). Dashed line, a fit to all the experimental data (with the product of the activatory and inhibitory dose–response functions). Solid line, theoretical steady-state open probability as a function of \( Ca^{2+} \) concentration. Both the calculated and the experimental data are normalized for comparative purposes.

Our implementation of the permeation model of Tinker et al. [26] was tested by calculation of the single-channel current–voltage curves for the mixed solutions of \( K^+ \) with \( Ca^{2+} \) or \( Ba^{2+} \), of the limiting conductances, and of \( K_D \) constants for monovalent and divalent ions. The calculated values (Table 1) were almost identical to the original data published.
Table 1
Conduction parameters of the ryanodine receptor channel for monovalent and divalent cations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ion</th>
<th>$K_D$ (mM)</th>
<th>$g_{\text{max}}$ (pS)</th>
<th>$g_{210}$ (pS)</th>
<th>$P_{\text{M}^{2+}}/P_{\text{K}^-}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cs$^+$</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34 (34)</td>
<td>644</td>
<td>555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K$^+$</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23 (20)</td>
<td>852</td>
<td>767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Na$^+$</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15 (18)</td>
<td>539</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li$^+$</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>7.4 (9.1)</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tris$^+$</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ca$^{2+}$</td>
<td>0.121</td>
<td>0.116</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>109$^a$ (94$^b$)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ba$^{2+}$</td>
<td>0.172</td>
<td>0.163</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>205$^a$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sr$^{2+}$</td>
<td>0.127</td>
<td>0.123</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>195$^a$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mg$^{2+}$</td>
<td>0.090</td>
<td>0.086</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>137$^a$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The numbers in boldface are solutions of our implementation of the permeation model; the numbers in parentheses are their experimental data. $K_D$, the binding constant of the ion to the channel pore; $g_{\text{max}}$, the limiting conductance; $g_{210}$, conductance in symmetrical 210 mM solution of the respective chloride salt; $P$, the ionic permeabilities.

$^a$The figures given are obtained for ionic conditions of 60 mM Ca$^{2+}$ trans, 125 mM Tris cis [26].

by Tinker et al. [26]. The small differences might be due to the higher (30-digit) numerical precision of the Mathematica program used here.

Calculations of the single-channel current amplitudes, $I$-$V$ curves, and conductances to be used for simulation of bilayer experiments were performed for 250 mM Cs methanesulfonate and variable CaCl$_2$ in the cis compartment, and 50 mM Cs methanesulfonate and 3 mM Ca$^{2+}$ in the trans compartment, to match the experimental conditions used in the only report [8] that directly compares results of the single-channel and release experiments. The amplitudes of single-channel currents were calculated for the voltage range of −60 to +60 mV at different activating cis Ca$^{2+}$ concentrations ranging from 0.1 mM to 100 mM. From these data, the conductances of the RyR channel at different levels of cis Ca$^{2+}$ were calculated as the slope of the respective $I$-$V$ curves in the linear range from −60 to +20 mV and normalized to the value at 1 mM cis Ca$^{2+}$. The calcium dependence of the normalized channel conductance, predicted by the pore model (i.e. not fitted to the experimental data), is given in Fig. 3 (upper panel, solid line). The simulated RyR open channel conductance hyperbolically decreases with Ca$^{2+}$ with $K_i=2.83$ mM and $n_H=1.0$. The predictions of the model, which was derived from sheep cardiac RyRC data [26], is in good correspondence with the experimental data reported for the canine channel ($K_i=5.4$ mM and $n_H=0.8$; [8]), replotted in Fig. 3 (upper panel).

3.3. Simulations of $^{45}$Ca$^{2+}$ efflux

The currents depicted in the upper panel of Fig. 3 are mostly carried by Cs$^+$ ions. The simulation approach allows calculating the ionic currents and unidirectional fluxes through the open RyRC for Ca$^{2+}$ ions as well. We have used slightly different ionic conditions for this calculation, in order to compare these data with the results of release flux experiments. Ionic conditions were chosen according to those employed in the report of Chu et al. [8] (in mmol/l): 100 KCl, 20 K$_2$HEPES, 0.1 MgCl$_2$, 5 K$_2$EGTA, variable CaCl$_2$ for the extravesicular, and 100 KCl, 20 K$_2$HEPES, 2 CaCl$_2$ for the intravesicular compartment. The calcium current through a single RyRC at 0 mV is depicted in Fig. 3 (lower panel) as a solid line. The initial amplitude of $I_{\text{Ca}}$ carried by 2 mM Ca$^{2+}$ ions was −2.2 pA. As the concentration of Ca$^{2+}$ in the cis compartment increased, the current decreased and reversed sign at cis Ca$^{2+}=2$ mM. On the other hand, the unidirectional efflux of Ca$^{2+}$ from the trans compartment decreased sigmoidally, starting from the initial 2.2 pA, with a $K_i$ of 3.26 mM (the dashed line in Fig. 3, lower panel).

The published experimental data on calcium dependence of calcium release from cardiac SR vesicles [6-9] are shown in Fig. 4. To allow for a direct comparison, only data obtained in the absence of ATP and utilizing passive $^{45}$Ca$^{2+}$ loading were included.
The data are significantly scattered, despite the fact that experiments were performed under relatively similar conditions. The first question was, what is the relationship between the experimental data and the theoretical predictions, and the second, whether the model can explain the differences between the experiments.

To answer the first question, calculations of $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ efflux curves were performed first using idealized conditions, namely: the approximation that the extravesicular compartment behaves as an infinite sink; time resolution of 1 ms; and the initial rate method of analysis. Ionic conditions were again chosen according to those employed in the report of Chu et al. [8] (in mmol/l): 100 KCl, 20 K$_2$HEPES, 0.1 MgCl$_2$, 5 K$_2$EGTA, variable CaCl$_2$ for the extravesicular, and 100 KCl, 20 K$_2$HEPES, 2 $^{45}$CaCl$_2$ for the intravesicular compartment. Interactions of Ca$^{2+}$, $^{45}$Ca$^{2+}$, K$^+$, and Mg$^{2+}$ with the channel pore were taken into account. The time course of $^{45}$Ca$^{2+}$ efflux was calculated for extravesicular Ca$^{2+}$ concentrations from 0.001 μM to 100 mM (at least three points per decade), and for a channel density (1 nmol RyR per 1 l of intravesicular volume) providing a half-time of 0.3 s at the Ca$^{2+}$ concentrations (10$^{-10}$ to 100 μM) that evoked the fastest release. This value is well in the range of the experimentally observed efflux rates. The results are shown normalized to the maximal rate of release in Fig. 4A.

In the Ca$^{2+}$ concentration range from 0.001 to 100 μM, the relative release rate estimated from these simulated data increases as a sigmoidal function of log [Ca$^{2+}$], following the calcium dependence of the channel peak open probability (for details see [25]), and gives 50% activation of release at 4.8 μM extravesicular Ca$^{2+}$. The experimental release data, although of similar shape, are mostly to the left of the theoretical predictions. At Ca$^{2+}$ concentrations higher than 100 μM, the relative release rates estimated from the simulated data decline, following the calcium dependence of the channel permeation (see Fig. 3, top panel), with half inhibition of release at 1.8 mM Ca$^{2+}$. In the high calcium concentration range, the experimental release rate data are mostly to the left of the simulated data. Although the extent of errors was not reported with the experimental data, the decline of release is obvious. The decrease of the simulated release rate at high Ca$^{2+}$ is fully due to a decrease in the efflux through the open channel, as in the model neither the peak nor the steady-state open probability decline at high calcium concentrations.

3.4. Analysis of release experiments

Although the overall reported experimental conditions for the data given in Fig. 4A were similar, several experimental details and the methods of anal-
ysis were different. The differences include: the buffering capacity of the extravesicular sink for the released calcium (EGTA concentration and dilution of vesicles), intravesicular calcium concentration (the extent of $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ loading), and the measure used for the release rate estimation (either the initial release rate, or the amount of $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ released per 5 s, or the reciprocal half-time of release). The approach of simulation is the ideal one to study the contribution of these factors to the experimental results. This might also help to understand, under which conditions the experimental errors can be minimized. Thus, to answer the second question mentioned above, we have set the parameters of the model to correspond to the conditions used in the reports of Meissner and Henderson [7], Chu et al. [8], or Mészáros et al. [9].

Fig. 4. Relative rate of calcium release from SR vesicles at different extravesicular $\text{Ca}^{2+}$ concentrations. (A) The reported experimental data with their standard errors (if reported) are plotted as: solid circles, Chu et al. [8]; open triangles, Mezsáros et al. [9]; crossed triangles, Rousseau et al. [6]; and crossed squares, Meissner and Henderson [7]. The ‘true’ initial rate of $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ release predicted by the model, normalized to that at optimal $\text{Ca}^{2+}$ concentration is plotted as solid line. (B) Simulations of the $\text{Ca}^{2+}$ dependence of the release rate for different experimental conditions: curve 1, using the half-time method, $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ loading of 200 $\mu$M, and infinite capacity of the extravesicular sink; curve 2, using the initial rate method with 50 ms time resolution, $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ loading of 2 mM, and infinite capacity of the extravesicular sink; and curve 3, using the cumulative 5 s release technique, $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ loading of 2 mM, 250 $\mu$M extravesicular EGTA and vesicle dilution 1:50.
resulting consequences for the calcium dependence of release are shown in Fig. 4B for comparison. It is to note that the resulting simulations are not fits to the experimental data, but they rather describe calcium release at a specific set of conditions.

The simulated curve for the half-time method, with infinite sink approximation and $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ loading of 200 µM (corresponding to [7]), is plotted in Fig. 4B as curve 1. The relative release rate peaks at a lower $\text{Ca}^{2+}$ concentration than does the theoretical curve, with half activation occurring at 3.8 µM $\text{Ca}^{2+}$, and half inhibition at 0.55 mM. The simulated curve for the initial rate method, with infinite sink approximation and $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ loading of 2 mM (corresponding to [8]), and 50 ms sampling period is shown as curve 2. In this case, 50% activation occurs at 3.8 µM $\text{Ca}^{2+}$ and 50% inhibition at 1.6 mM $\text{Ca}^{2+}$. A simulation using 250 µM EGTA, vesicle dilution 1:50, 2 mM $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$, and release rate defined as $^{45}\text{Ca}^{2+}$ released per 5 s (corresponding to [9]) is shown by curve 3. The ascending arm of the curve is substantially shifted to the left, providing 50% activation at 0.14 µM. The descending arm gives increased half inhibition value of 4.7 mM $\text{Ca}^{2+}$. This method provides estimate of the half activation of release which is in close correspondence with the reported data [9]. However, as it also shifts the declining part of the curve to the right, the use of the method of cumulative 5 s release cannot explain the reported partial reduction of release observed already at 100 µM $\text{Ca}^{2+}$ [9].

For deeper insight into the effect of experimental conditions and methods of analysis on the relative magnitude of the $K_a$ and $K_i$ values, we have performed simulations for combinations of the following conditions: intravesicular $\text{Ca}^{2+}$ of 0.2, 2.0, or 20 mM; the extravesicular sink either ideal or of 250 µM EGTA and vesicle dilution of 1:50; and the three above-mentioned methods of analysis. The gating model (Fig. 1) predicts that after rapid activation, the channel undergoes slow inactivation accompanied by a shift in the apparent $K_a$ from 4.8 to 1.0 µM $\text{Ca}^{2+}$. To account for the non-stationarity of $K_a$, the $K_a$ values were normalized to the prediction of the model for the time of their determination (i.e. 50 ms, 5 s, and the half-time at $\text{Ca}^{2+} = K_a$ for the three methods, respectively). The $K_i$ values were normalized to the values obtained at the respective intravesicular calcium concentrations with the initial rate method and 1 ms resolution, which was considered to be error-free. The results, plotted in Fig. 5, confirm that the initial release rate method provides the best estimates of the binding constants. However, for any of the employed methods, the values of $K_a$ tend to be underestimated, especially at high release rates and finite extravesicular sink. The differences are most apparent for the cumulative 5-s method,
with the error reaching almost one order of magnitude. The half-time method tends to underestimate $K_i$, while the cumulative 5-s method tends to overestimate it. The $K_i$ values are not dependent on the Ca\textsuperscript{2+} ion buffering capacity of the extravesicular sink.

Generally, from these simulations it can be concluded that the time resolution of the methods for release rate estimation significantly influences the estimated calcium dependence of release. Even the methods with the best time resolution, i.e., the half-time method and the initial rate method, provide systematic deviations from the expected values. This finding points to the importance of kinetic processes involved in the release of calcium, namely, the gating of the channel, and the depletion of the vesicles. The depletion effect will be minimized, if the loading of vesicles with calcium is substantially increased and if the rate of efflux is decreased. Then, the kinetics of the release will be controlled solely by the kinetics of the RyRC gating. Below we will describe a method of analysis of the time course of release, based on the above considerations, useful for estimation of a time-dependent change of the $K_a$ from real experimental data.

### 3.5. Estimation of the $K_a$ shift from the release experiments

To isolate the effects of channel gating on release from those caused by vesicle depletion, in the following simulations the half-time of efflux at the optimal Ca\textsuperscript{2+} concentration was reduced from 0.3 to 18 s by decreasing the relative channel density (the $n/V_R$ ratio in Eq. 3). With this rate of release, more than 75% of \textsuperscript{45}Ca\textsuperscript{2+} was retained in the vesicles after 5 s of release.

We have compared three gating models, differing in their time dependence of calcium sensitivity: Model 1 is characteristic by a predicted decrease in $K_a$ as a function of time, as described in [25]. At the start of activation by an increase in Ca\textsuperscript{2+} concentration, all channels have a $K_a$ of 4.75 μM, and they equilibrate with a calcium-dependent time constant into the steady state with $K_a = 0.97$ μM; Model 2 has a time-independent value of $K_a = 2.4$ μM; and Model 3 is characteristic by an increase in $K_a$ as a function of time from the initial value of 0.3 μM to the equilibrium value of 2 μM.

The calcium dependence of release was determined for a set of times, $t_0 (0.05, 0.1, 0.2, 0.5, 1, 2,$ and 5 s), during which the channel relaxed from the peak of activity down to the steady-state level. The estimates of the apparent $K_a$ of the channels at any given time were compared to the respective theoretical values. As the measure of the release rate at the time $t$, the calculated amount of calcium released from the vesicles during the period from starting release until time $t$ was taken. This procedure is illustrated in Fig. 6, in which the calcium dependence of release rate is constructed for the time point $t = 1$ s.

For every studied period, the values obtained with

![Fig. 6. The method of analysis. The proportion of \textsuperscript{45}Ca\textsuperscript{2+} released at time $t$ (left) is plotted against calcium concentration that induced release (right). The apparent $K_{Ca}$ at time $t$ is determined by fitting this calcium dependence with a dose-response curve.](image)
the above procedure were normalized. The results for Models 1, 2, and 3 are plotted in Fig. 7A–C, respectively. In Model 1, progressively longer time periods of Ca$^{2+}$ efflux (lines labeled with the value of the period duration) provided the relative release rate curves shifting between the two theoretical limits from the right to the left. This shift resulted in an almost one order of magnitude difference in the estimated values of $K_a$ for release activation. The interrelation between the equilibration of the channels and the shift of apparent $K_a$ is documented in Fig. 7A by two curves for the approximation of time-invariant open probability. One represents the initial efflux rate for the channels at the peak open probability and the other stays for the channels at the steady-state open probability (all states are populated). It can be seen that the predicted calcium dependencies of release are of similar shape to the experimental data [8], and the curve at $t = 1$ s is closest to the experimental data points.

In Model 2, the different time periods produced values of $K_a$ that did not differ significantly from each other, nor from the theoretical value (Fig. 7B). The value of $K_a$ in the model was chosen to be close to the experimentally obtained value [8], and therefore this model also describes the experimental release data adequately.

In Model 3, the calcium dependencies of the initial and steady-state open probabilities are similar to those predicted by the model of Keizer and Levine [32]. The shift of $K_a$ values as a function of time, obtained from the release curves, was in agreement with the theoretical predictions, i.e. in the opposite direction as for Model 1. However, the value at 5 s of release was significantly lower than the predicted value (Fig. 7C). From Fig. 7C, it can also be seen that the slopes of the calcium dependence of release rate, predicted by Model 3, are much steeper than actually observed in the experiments [8], and there-

---

Fig. 7. The calcium dependence of calcium release at different times for the three employed models. The theoretical calcium dependencies of release at $t = 0$ and $t = \infty$ are plotted as thick lines. The calcium dependencies at different times (0.05, 0.1, 0.2, 0.5, 1, 2, and 5 s) are shown as thin lines and marked by the respective time. Insets: the calcium dependence of release replotted in linear scale. (A) Model 1. (B) Model 2. (C) Model 3. Solid circles are the experimental data from [8].
fore the experimental data cannot be adequately described by this model.

Altogether, Figs. 6 and 7 exemplify the method for evaluation of the time shifts in the channel affinity from experimental release data.

The relation between the apparent $K_a$ and the proportion of channels that entered the steady-state ($P_{SS}$) during the time course of release is evaluated in Fig. 8A for the case of Model 1. The time course of the estimated apparent $K_a$ reflects well the theoretical change in the apparent $K_a$ of the channel during progression to the steady state. The correlation between the two estimates of $K_a$ is very good ($r = 0.996$). For comparison, analogous result for Model 2 is also provided in Fig. 8A, to show that the artificial decrease of apparent $K_a$ would not exceed 20%.

In real experiments, high efflux rates can corrupt the estimated calcium dependencies. The relationship between the values of release half-time $t_{1/2}$ at optimal [Ca$^{2+}$] (inversely proportional to channel density; upper axis) and the estimate of the apparent $K_a$ is plotted in Fig. 8B for Model 1. Here, the values obtained at different times after starting release (solid symbols) are compared with the theoretical $K_a$ at these times (rightmost values). With fast release the absolute values of the $K_a$ are underestimated. For instance, at $t = 5$ s and $t_{1/2} = 0.3$ s, the apparent calcium sensitivity of release activation is 0.3 μM only, but the correlation between the estimated and theoretically predicted $K_a$ values is still very good ($r = 0.96$; not shown). The contribution of the vesicle depletion error to the shift in the estimated $K_a$ can be judged from the plot of the estimated $K_a$ values at different times as a function of $t_{1/2}$, using Model 2, in which the value of true $K_a$ is constant ($K_a = 2.4$ μM).

The results are plotted as open symbols in Fig. 8B. It can be seen that the best results are obtained if the optimal $t_{1/2}$ is more than four times the time constant of the $K_a$ change (which is 1 s in this case). However, the analysis can still be performed without a considerable systematic error when the rates of both processes are similar. In that case, only data for times $t$ shorter than twice the fastest release half time should be analyzed.

The time dependence of apparent $K_a$, determined from the release curves under different conditions is illustrated in Fig. 9 for Model 1. Fig. 9 shows the apparent $K_a$ values determined with different loading levels, with the approximation of infinite extravesic-
ular sink (Fig. 9A), and under conditions of low extravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) buffering (250 µM EGTA, vesicle dilution 1:50; Fig. 9B). The effect of RyRC density on the apparent value of \(K_a\) is shown in Fig. 9C. It can be seen that low \(^{45}\)Ca\(^{2+}\) loading and low buffering capacity of the extravesicular medium can distort the values of \(K_a\), but the differences between the initial and steady-state values are not impaired. Increase in receptor density also decreases the apparent values of \(K_a\) without changing the difference between initial and steady-state values appreciably.

The sensitivity of the apparent \(K_a\) values of Model 3 to receptor density under similar conditions is shown in Fig. 10. It can be seen that this model is much more sensitive to receptor density (Fig. 10A). This sensitivity is decreased if higher total intravesicular calcium concentrations are used (Fig. 10B). The sensitivity of the model is decreased also in the presence of calsequestrin, because the release is slowed down as the free intravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) is decreased, and at the same time, calsequestrin serves as a Ca\(^{2+}\) buffer.

Fig. 9. The apparent \(K_{Ca}\) at different times for Model 1 under different conditions of the experiment. The theoretical time course of \(K_{Ca}\) is plotted as line. (A) Approximation of infinite extravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) sink. RyR density 1 nmol/l SR. Intravesicular \(^{45}\)Ca\(^{2+}\) (mM): 20 (squares); 2.0 (circles); 0.2 (up triangles). (B) The effect of low extravesicular sink (250 µM EGTA, vesicle dilution 1:50). RyR density 1 nmol/l SR. Intravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) (mM): 20 (squares); 2.0 (circles); 0.2 (up triangles). (C) The effect of RyR density. Approximation of infinite extravesicular sink. Intravesicular \(^{45}\)Ca\(^{2+}\) 2 mM. RyR density (nmol/l SR): 0.05 (squares); 0.1 (circles); 0.2 (up triangles); 0.5 (down triangles); 1.0 (diamonds).

Fig. 10. The apparent \(K_{Ca}\) at different times for Model 3 under different conditions of the experiment. The theoretical time course of \(K_{Ca}\) is plotted as line. (A) Approximation of infinite extravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) sink. RyR density 1 nmol/l SR. Intravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) (mM): 20 (squares); 2.0 (circles); 0.2 (up triangles). (B) Effect of increasing intravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\). Intravesicular \(^{45}\)Ca\(^{2+}\) 2 mM; total intravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) 20 mM. RyR density (nmol/l SR): 0.01 (squares); 0.1 (circles); 1.0 (up triangles). (C) Effect of the presence of calsequestrin. Intravesicular \(^{45}\)Ca\(^{2+}\) 2 mM. 10 mM Ca\(^{2+}\) binding calsequestrin sites. Relative RyR density: 0.03 (squares); 0.3 (circles); 1.0 (up triangles); 3.0 (down triangles).
4. Discussion

The main finding of this work is that the presented complex model of the release experiments, derived solely from the single-channel characteristics of the ryanodine receptor channel, is able to reproduce the calcium dependence of calcium release observed in isolated vesicles of SR. In other words, the model that does not include calcium-dependent inactivation of the channel provides a calcium-dependent decline of the release in the millimolar range of calcium. Previously, decline of the release has been interpreted as reflection of a decrease in channel $P_o$ due to calcium-dependent inactivation [8,13]. However, it is obvious from Figs. 2 and 4 that the simulated release rate declines in the same $Ca^{2+}$ concentration range as was observed experimentally (with the exception of [9]), whereas for the same model the $P_o$ does not decline. It can be concluded that the reported decline of the release rate in the release experiments at millimolar calcium concentrations cannot be regarded any more as a proof of the calcium-dependent inactivation of the cardiac RyR channel.

Extrapolation of these results to the in situ conditions is not possible at present. Any progress in this direction will need a gating model for the RyRC activity in the presence of physiological modulators, such as ATP and Mg$^{2+}$, including regulation by luminal calcium [33–35]. In the report of Fabiato [1], the decrease of $Ca^{2+}$-induced $Ca^{2+}$ release was observed at calcium concentrations $\leq$10 $\mu$M. This cannot be achieved by the mechanism prominent in the release experiments, i.e. by the decrease in calcium flux through the open pore. From the data in planar lipid bilayers, it seems possible that under physiological concentrations of ATP and at low luminal $Ca^{2+}$, a low-affinity calcium inactivation site is operating with a $K_d$ between 0.1–0.5 mM [36]. However, this value is still larger than the value observed by Fabiato [1].

Another important outcome of this work is a new method which can be used to resolve the dispute on changes of the RyR channel affinity to calcium following activation [15–18,22–25]. We have found that any changes in channel affinity, if present, are reflected in the release curves, and can be quantitatively evaluated. The described method of analysis has the potential to confirm or refute authenticity of the shift of channel $K_a$ during adaptation [15]. The only condition is to use fast techniques, such as the rapid filtration, quenched flow, or stopped-flow in SR vesicle experiments. However, the application field of the method is more general. It might be useful to quantify the temporal changes in the sensitivity of any channel to agonists. Hot candidates are all channels that control the release of calcium from intracellular stores. In the case of the inositol trisphosphate receptor channel, such an analysis might be useful for understanding of the increment detection phenomenon and its modulation.

The analysis of the effects of experimental conditions and methods of analysis on the observed calcium dependence of release enabled us to pinpoint several factors, listed below, which might have pronounced effects on the results.

(1) The effect of vesicle depletion on the calcium dependence of release activation. Due to the presence of a calcium binding site in the channel pore, the open channel flux is not proportional to the intravesicular $^{45}Ca^{2+}$ concentration. Rather, it is independent of the intravesicular $^{45}Ca^{2+}$ for concentrations above $\sim$100 $\mu$M. Therefore, during the time course of release the rate of decline of $^{45}Ca$ efflux depends on the rate of release in a more complex fashion than it would, had the flux been governed by diffusion. This effect is the most pronounced at the rising part of the calcium dependence curve. It results in shifting the relative release rate curve to the left with respect to the true initial release rate curve, when the initial release rate or cumulative Ca release per time unit are used as the measure of release. The effect is most critical when some or any combination of the following factors occurs: high receptor density, high open probability, low sampling rate, leaky vesicles, low $^{45}Ca$ loading.

(2) The effect of $^{45}Ca^{2+}$ loading on the calcium dependence of release inhibition. In addition to the effect mentioned above, calcium concentration in the vesicles, via competition between intra- and extravesicular calcium for the binding site in the channel pore, shifts the descending part of the curve to the right when the loading is increased, and to the left when it is decreased. This effect is relatively independent of other experimental conditions and the method of analysis.

(3) The effect of limited extravesicular calcium
buffering capacity (non-infinite extravesicular sink). Increase of the extravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) concentration during the time course of release results in excess activation of the release. Another consequence is dissipation of the \(^{45}\text{Ca}\) gradient across the vesicle membrane. The magnitude of this effect is most pronounced at about threshold concentrations of activating calcium. The effect is most critical when low Ca\(^{2+}\) buffering capacity (low EGTA concentration or low pH), and/or low dilution of vesicles occurs.

(4) The method of release rate determination. The \(K_a\) estimated by the reciprocal half-time method approaches the theoretical value with decreasing Ca\(^{2+}\) loading, while for the other two methods it does so with increasing Ca\(^{2+}\) loading. The reciprocal half-time method, although having the least demand on \(^{45}\text{Ca}\)\(^{2+}\), has two drawbacks: (a) the descending arm of the calcium dependence is always shifted to the left, giving a \(K_i\) value \(\sim 50\%\) lower than the true value; and (b) the time dependence of the \(K_a\) shifts cannot be evaluated. Therefore the method of choice is the initial rate method.

To assess possible contributions of the low-affinity, inactivating Ca\(^{2+}\) binding site proposed by Laver et al. [13] to the decline of Ca\(^{2+}\) release rate at high Ca\(^{2+}\) concentrations, we have performed the calculations also for a model which includes this low-affinity site (not shown). As expected, the differences from the model having only a single calcium binding site start to be apparent only at the highest Ca\(^{2+}\) concentrations. The relative release rate at 15 mM Ca\(^{2+}\) decreased from 0.05 in the absence to 0.025 in the presence of the inactivating site, an effect hardly seen in the release experiments. Explanation of the calcium flux ‘inactivation’ therefore does not necessarily require any distinct calcium-dependent inactivated state of the RyRC. The difference in the open channel flux can be the sole reason for the decline of the release rate under the ionic conditions used for passive release experiments. The inhibition of open probability of the RyRC by Ca\(^{2+}\) was detectable in the theoretical release curves, if it occurred at concentrations that did not affect Ca\(^{2+}\) flux significantly (data not shown). Such a high tendency for inhibition was observed in the presence of Mg\(^{2+}\) and ATP [36]. However, there are no available experimental release data under comparable conditions.

It has been pointed out that a decrease in calcium efflux with increasing extravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) might occur due to a decreased calcium gradient across the SR membrane [37]. With \(^{45}\text{Ca}\)\(^{2+}\) measurements specifically, however, increasing the extravesicular Ca\(^{2+}\) concentration does not affect the gradient for \(^{45}\text{Ca}\)\(^{2+}\). Therefore, without the presence of calcium binding sites in the channel pore, i.e. if the flux through the open channel is governed solely by diffusion, the \(^{45}\text{Ca}\)\(^{2+}\) efflux is independent of extravesicular (unlabeled) calcium concentration. The inhibition of \(^{45}\text{Ca}\)\(^{2+}\) efflux through the channel pore by extravesicular calcium, according to the presented model, is explained solely by the competition between intravesicular \(^{45}\text{Ca}\)\(^{2+}\) and extravesicular unlabeled Ca\(^{2+}\) for binding to the channel pore. Decreasing capacity of the extravesicular sink cannot significantly influence the concentration dependence of this inhibition.

This is, to our knowledge, the first report in which an explicit gating scheme and permeation model is used to reconstruct the time course of calcium release from the vesicles of cardiac sarcoplasmic reticulum. The time course of Ca\(^{2+}\) release from skeletal SR was modeled previously [38] using the approximation of diffusion-limited flux through the channel pore. Our results clearly demonstrate a large impact of the permeation properties of the channel on the time course and on the calcium dependence of release. We conclude that the planar lipid bilayer method can be viewed as a model of choice for studies on the ryanodine receptor channel, as its native properties are preserved after reconstruction to the same extent as in the isolated vesicles. On the other hand, the vesicle release experiments can be an invaluable tool for kinetic studies if conditions of experiment defined in this work are met. These conclusions are important for the design of future experiments, in which the single-channel and flux data may complement each other.

**Acknowledgements**

A.Z. was supported in part by an International Research Scholar’s award from the Howard Hughes Medical Institute and by Grant VEGA 5155, and I.Z. by Grant VEGA 5156. We are grateful to K. Ondraš and S. Győrke for helpful comments on an earlier version of the manuscript.
References


[33] R. Sitapesan, A.J. Williams, Regulation of the gating of the...
sheep cardiac sarcoplasmic reticulum Ca\textsuperscript{2+}-release channel by luminal Ca\textsuperscript{2+}, J. Membr. Biol. 137 (1994) 215–226.


