

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com



Procedia Environmental Sciences 18 (2013) 657 - 665

Procedia Environmental Sciences

2013 International Symposium on Environmental Science and Technology (2013 ISEST)

Immobilization of Pb and Cd in contaminated soil using nanocrystallite hydroxyapatite

Mao He^a, Hui Shi^{a,*}, Xinyue Zhao^a, Ya Yu^a, Bo Qu^b

^aThe school of Environmental and Municipal Engineering, Xi'an University of Architecture and Technology, Xi'an 710055, China ^bSchool of Resource and Environmental Engineering, Mianyang Normal University, Mojiatown, Mianyang 621000, China

Abstract

The efficiency and mechanism of nano-hydroxyapatite (nHA) in immobilizing Pb and Cd in contaminated soil were assessed in this work. The X-ray diffraction analysis indicated that the key mechanisms for Pb/Cd immobilization in the soil involve both surface complexation on the surface of nHA and dissolution of the nHA amendments and precipitation of Pb/Cd-containing phosphates. We tested the effects of different nHA dose (the molar ratio of P/(Pb+Cd)) on the water extraction of heavy metals, and phytoavailability of soil metals. The nHA application could significantly reduce water soluble Pb with 72% and Cd with 90%, bioaccessible Pb with a reduction of 12.5-27.5% and Cd with a reduction of 17.66-34.64%, respectively. The nHA reduced phytoavailability of Pb and Cd with 65.3% and 64.6% in contaminated soil, respectively. In addition, the treatment efficiency increased along with the nHA dose (based on the molar ratio of P/(Pb+Cd)) increased, and most effective ratio was molar ratio of P/(Pb+Cd) at 5:1. The results in this study showed that nHA can immobililize Pb and Cd in contaminated soil effectively.

© 2013 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. Open access under CC BY-NC-ND license. Selection and peer-review under responsibility of Beijing Institute of Technology.

Keywords: Nano-hydroxyapatite; Lead; Cadmium; Immobilization; Bioaccessibility; Phytoavailability

1. Introduction

Soil contamination with heavy metals is a worldwide problem. Accumulation of heavy metals in soils can adversely affect soil ecology, agricultural productivity, quality of agricultural products and water resources, human and animal serious health problem [1]. Lead (Pb) and cadmium (Cd) are ubiquitous heavy metal pollutants in soils due to their use widely. The primary sources of Pb contamination include industrial activities such as mining, smelting of metals, and the use of Pb-containing products such as paints, lead-acid batteries, bullets, gasoline and pesticides [2, 3]. It can damage human nervous (especially children) and reproductive systems (agency for toxic substances and disease registry) [4].

^{*} Corresponding author. Tel.: +86-29-82202519 ; fax: +86-29-82202729.

E-mail address: shihui06@126.com.

Cadmium has been widely used in batteries, metal plating, plastic, nonferrous mining and the cause of Itai-Itai disease [3]. The high concentration of Pb and Cd in the soil poses risks to human and animal health by the leaching of metals from the soil into water and the consumption of edible plants grown in the contaminated soil. Therefore, proper remediation is necessary to reduce metal availability in soil for protecting human health.

Among available remediation technologies, in situ immobilization of heavy metals using a chemical amendment can be a cost-effective and environmentally sustainable remediation approach for the immobilization of heavy metals by reducing the mobility and availability. This immobilization technique may provide a long-term remediation solution if low solubility minerals and/or stable precipitates are produced in situ [5]. Therefore, the choice of the soil amendments need that the amendments must reduce heavy metals transfers from contaminated soils to the surface water or groundwater and uptake by plants and organisms. Up to now, soil amendments, for example lime [6, 7], organic matter [8], calcium carbonate [9, 10], red-mud [11], bone meal [10, 12], fly ash [10] and so on, added to the contaminant soil may decrease leachable concentrations of contaminants and thus reduce the detrimental effects of heavy metals on environmental receptors, such as microorganisms, plants, animals, water bodies and humans [13].

Amounts of works have been made to evaluate the effectiveness of phosphates on in situ immobilization of contaminated water and soils [2, 3, 14-19]. The mechanisms include precipitation, surface complexation, adsorption, dissolution of apatite followed by coprecipitation, or an ion exchange process at the surface of phosphate minerals. Owing to nano-material with higher reactivity and sorption ability than the same material of normal size, some nano-material had been used for soil amendmentation with high heavy metal concentration. Nano-hydroxyapatite (nHA) is a less soluble phosphate, and would be an ideal material for the immobilization of heavy metals because of its high sorption capacity for heavy metal, low water solubility, high stability under reducing and oxidizing conditions, availability and cost-effect. However, there is limited information about heavy metal immobilization by nano-hydroxyapatite [3, 14], especially in soil. The purpose of this study was to evaluate the effectiveness of nano-hydroxyapatite in immobilizing Pb and Cd in contaminated soil. The specific objectives were to: (1) determine nHA-induced metal transformation in soil using X-ray diffraction, scanning electron microscopy and sequential extraction method; (2) estimate the availability of Pb and Cd after nHA-induced using water extraction, plant metals uptake, and a simple Physiologically Based Extraction Test (PBET) [11, 20].

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Experimental materials

Soil was collected from the surface layer (0-20cm) of agricultural land in Duling, south Xi'an, China. After air-dried, the soil simple was passed through a 2mm sieve. The physico-chemical properties of the soil were given in Table 1.

Table 1. Selected physicochemical	properties	of the soil.
-----------------------------------	------------	--------------

	pН	CEC	ОМ	Sand (%)	Silt (%)	Clay (%)	Pb (mg kg ⁻¹)	Cd (mg kg ⁻¹)
soil	6.0	12.6	1.58	52.3	25.4	31.7	20.6	0.097

The soils contaminated by Pb and Cd were prepared by artificially mixed in this research. According to the polluted condition in soils near smelter plant, the Pb and Cd concentration in experimental soil were determined as 800mg Pb and 40mg Cd per kilogram air-dried soil, respectively. The dosages of Pb

and Cd were calculated by lead nitrate and cadmium nitrate. The homogenous mixed lead nitrate and cadmium nitrate amount with 1.3 kg soils was loaded in plastic pot (15cm diameter,18cm height), and was then equilibrated for two month with frequent thorough mixing at room temperature.

Nano-hydroxyapatite (nHA) used in this study (purity 99.9%) was purchased from DK nano-material company (Beijing, China). The chemical composition and the specific surface area of the nHA were in Table. 2. The crystalline structure and particle size of nHA were determined with X-ray Diffraction (Rigaku, Ultima IV, Japan) and Scan Electron Microscopy (SEM, JSM-6510LV), respectively. The average particle size of nHA was 20 nm. TEM results illustrated that the nHA material was nano-rod structure, with dimensions of 40 nm (wide) \times 200 nm (length). The Ca/P molar ratio of nHA was 1.67 using XRF methods. The specific surface area of nHA was calculated as 50 m² g⁻¹ by the BET method.

Table 2. Chemical composition and specific surface area of HA.
--

	Sulfate (W %)	Chloride (W %)	Heavy metals	Mg (W %)	Na (W %)	Fe (W %)	Al (W %)	Ca/P	specific surface area (m ² g ⁻¹)
HA	0.035	0.02	6.5ppm	0.4	0.1	0.07	0.03	1.67	50

2.2. Pb/Cd immobilization experiment

NHA was applied to soils at molar ratios of P/(Pb+Cd) such as 2:1, 3:1, 4:1 and 5:1. Non-nHA soil was used as the control. The nHA was thoroughly mixed with the soil to obtain homogeneity, and was then equilibrated for 60 d, during which soil moisture was maintained with 16-18% (mass percent), and the soils were thoroughly mixed at weekly intervals. Digestion of soil sample was performed using HCl, HNO_3 , HF and $HClO_4$ hot block digestion procedure [21]. Concentrations of Pb and Cd in the digested solution were measured using ICP-MS (PE, ELAN DRC-e).

2.3. Mineralogical characterization

To identify the mineral phases in soils, the clay fractions of selected soil samples were sieved, where the contaminant metals are more likely concentrated [22]. This metal-rich fraction was then characterized using X-ray diffraction (XRD, Ultima IV, Rigaku) with Cu K α radiation (40kv, 40mA) and PDXL2 software with ICDD (2012). Samples were scanned at room temperature by using start angle 10°, end angle 45°, step size 0.02° with a scanning speed 2° m⁻¹. Selected soil clay was also observed using a scanning electron microscopy (SEM, JSM-6510LV).

2.4. Water extraction Pb/Cd content and bioavailability test

The effect of nHA on contaminant extractability was evaluated using de-ionized water (DW) 2.5 g soil were added to 25mL DW in 50mL polypropylene centrifuge tubes, which were then shaken for 1h on a wrist-action shaker, centrifuged for 20 min at $1,1000 \times g$, and then filtered through a 0.22-µm pore-size Millipore filter.

The bioaccessibility to the human gastrointestinal (GI) system of Pb and Cd in ingested soil was measured using the modified physiologically based extraction test (PBST) procedure [24]. 0.5g soil was shaken (30rpm) with syntentic gastric solution (50ml 0.4 mol/L glycine, pH 2±0.5) for 1h at 37 °C. When extraction was complete, the solution was immediately passed through at 0.22- μ m pore-site Millipore filter and measured using ICP-MS. Pb and Cd bioaccessibility were expressed as percentage of metal mass extracted by PBET with respect to the metal mass in soil.

2.5. Pb/Cd forms by sequential extraction

Sequential extraction method of Tessier was used in this study [23]. The extraction was carried out in 50 ml polypropylene centrifuge tubes with an initial mass of 0.5 g samples. The five heavy metal forms were divided in the following fractions: exchangeable form (EX), carbonate-bound form (CB), Fe/Mn oxide-bound form (OX), organic matter/sulfide-bound form (OM), residual form (RS). Sequential extraction scheme for Pb and Cd in contaminated soils as described in Table.3. After each successive extraction, separation was accomplished by centrifugation at 8000 r/min for 10 min.

Table 3.	Sequential	extraction	scheme	for Pb	and	Cd in	contaminated-soils.
----------	------------	------------	--------	--------	-----	-------	---------------------

Step	Fraction	Extraction procedure
1	Exchangeable form	10ml 1M MgCl ₂ PH 7 (1h, 250rpm, room temperature)
2	Carbonate-bound form	15ml 1M CH ₃ COONa (PH 5with CH3COOH 6h, 250rpm, room temperature)
3	Fe/Mn oxide-bound form	$15ml~0.04M$ NH_OH·HCl (PH 2 with CH_3COOH, 5h, 250rpm, 96 $^\circ C$)
4	Organic matter/sulfide- bound form	5ml 0.02M HNO ₃ , 5ml 30%H ₂ O ₂ (2h, 85°C)
		Then 5ml 30%H ₂ O ₂ (2h, 85°C), Finally, 5ml 3.2M CH ₃ COONH ₄ in HNO ₃ (20%, V/V) for 0.5h at room temperature (250rpm)
5	Residual form	HCl, HNO ₃ , HF and HClO ₄ digestion

2.6. Pb/Cd Phytoavailability test

In order to examine the effect of the addition of nHA on the phytoavailability of heavy metals, corn was selected as experimental plant, prepared as described following: Corn seeds soaked in the water for 15 minutes initially, then tiled them into a plate and placed in the incubator (30° C) for germination. After germination, the seedlings were transplanted into wet sawdust with daily watering. After 3 d, the corns grew to 5cm high approximately, then transplanted them into contaminated soils (2 plants/pot, 3 pots per treatment). The trials were conducted under controlled greenhouse conditions (temperature $25-35^{\circ}$ C, relative humidity $60-70^{\circ}$) with daily watering. After 40 d, the corns were harvested, rinsed with deionized water, and dried at 80° C for a constant weight. Corn shoot samples were digested with HCl, HNO₃, HF and HClO₄, and the resultant solutions were filtered through a 0.22-µm membrane filter, and analyzed for the heavy metals using ICP-MS.

2.7. Statistical analyses

Experimental data, including the Pb and Cd concentrations in soils and in corn shoots and plant biomass, were expressed as mean of three replicates. Statistical analyses were conducted using SPSS 11.5. Treatment effects were determined by analysis of variance of SPSS. Significance was tested at the 0.05 probability levels.

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Soil characterization after application nHA

The XRD analysis showed that no significant difference exit between nHA-treated soil and the control soil. However, two additional peaks at 2.89Å (2θ =30.90°) and 3.19Å (2θ =27.89°) were identified, which

may represent calcium lead phosphate hydroxide (Pb_xCa_{10-x} (PO₄)₆(OH)₂)) by ICDD (2012) (Fig.1). It was consistent with the study of Laperche *et. al.*. that they may represent mixed Ca-Pb phosphates [24]. Furthermore, the intensity of peaks at 2.52Å (2θ =35.53°), 2.49Å (2θ =36.01°) and 3.77Å (2θ =23.50°) increased in nHA-treated soil. They were lead dihydrogen phosphate, Pattersonite and lead phosphate, reapectively. This showed that one of the mechanism of metals immobilization by nHA was the dissolution of HA and the precipitation of new metal phosphate minerals.



Fig. 1. X-ray diffraction patterns of nHA-treated soil and control soil at the end of experiment.

As was shown by Ma et al. [25, 26], the mechanism of Pb immobilization in the contaminated soils by HA could be dissolution of HA (eq.1), and the precipitation of hydroxypyromorphite (eq.2). However, Shaskova posed another reaction mechanism [27]. Pb may be adsorbed first on the surface of the HA and then cation exchange would prompte Pb^{2+} ions substituting Ca^{2+} ions in soil solution, following reaction (eq.3) [28]. Furthermore, as indicated by this equation, the mechanism is controlled by the amount of exchangeable cation.

$$Ca_{10}(PO_4)_6(OH)_2 + 14H^+ \rightarrow 10Ca^{2+} + 6H_2PO_4^- + 2H_2O$$
 (1)

$$10Pb^{2+}+6H_2PO_4^{-}+2H_2O \rightarrow Pb_{10}(PO_4)_6(OH)_2+14H^+$$
(2)

$$Ca_{10}(PO_{4})_{6}(OH)_{2} + xPb^{2+} \rightarrow Ca_{10-x}Pb_{x}PO_{4}(OH)_{2} + xCa^{2+}$$
(3)

For Cd, isomorphic substitution (the last mechanism) appears more significant than precipitation substitution [29]. Cd^{2+} was first adsorbed onto the nHA surface and then substitute the Ca^{2+} described by the following eq.4 [34].

$$Ca_{10}(PO_4)_6(OH)_2 + xCd^{2+} \rightarrow Ca_{10-x}Cd_x(PO_{4)6}(OH)_2 + xCa^{2+}...$$
 (4)

This might be due to the fact that the ionic radius of Cd^{2+} (0.097 nm) is very close to that of Ca^{2+} (0.094 nm) [29]. But, no Cd minerals was detected by XRD (Fig.1), except peak at $2\theta=27.94^{\circ}$ (Cd, Pb hydroxylapatite) in the present study. This could be due to its relatively low concentration and the limited dissolution of the Cd-bearing minerals, which would reduce the formation of new phosphate phases [24, 31], or form some poorly crystalline mixed metal phosphates [32]. Besides, the precipitation of a new solid phase would need a long interaction time as reported by Cao who observed chloropyromorphite after 330 d of phosphate application [15]. SEM analysis showed that the soil particles after the nHA was added for 60 d present a smoother morphology than the un-treated soil (Fig. 2), which was consistent with Mignardi [19].



Fig. 2. Scanning electron microscopy images of control soil (a) and the nHA-treated soil(b) .

3.2. HA-induced Pb/Cd immobilization

Tessier sequential extraction has been extensively used to assess the mobility and bioavailability of heavy metals in soil and sediment [3, 15, 24, 33, 34]. The distribution of Pb and Cd in soils of the control and the nHA-treated was shown in Fig. 3. Initially, Pb was primarily associated with the CB (65.7%) while Cd was mainly of CB (49.7%) and RS (32.7%), respectively.

With the increase of addition molar ratios of nHA, the EX, CB and RS changes greatly. The EX decreased from 5.5% (control) to 2.5% (5:1) for Pb and from 32.7% (control) to 18% (5:1) for Cd. The CB decreased from 65.7% (control) to 43.9% (5:1) for Pb and from 49.7% (control) to 39% (5:1) for Cd, while the RS was increased to 27% for Pb and increased to 8.3% for Cd respectively. In addition, the nHA decreased OX Pb by about 2.3% and Cd by1.5% across the treatment; the OM also decreased by about 3.5% (4:1) for Pb, while no obvious increase or decrease for Cd. This result reflected that nHA is less effective for immobilization of Cd than Pb. Though different fractional contents between previous studies and ours have been observed, the decline of EX and OB fractions and the increase of RS fractions were demonstrated after nHA exert. This result also indicated that the nHA-induced can effect immobilize heavy metals (Pb/Cd) in contaminated soil and reduced the bioavailable Pb/Cd to an acceptable level, thus reducing their environment risk.

3.3. Pb/Cd extractability and bioavailability

Metal mobility was closely associated with their water solubility; and metals with higher water solubility would pose higher risk of leaching into water, then threat the organism's health. As Table. 4 showed, the application of nHA had significantly reduced water soluble Pb with 72% reduction and Cd with 90% reduction in contaminated soil. Reduction of water soluble Pb and Cd in the nHA treatment was attributed to transformation of Pb/Cd from soluble Pb/Cd to insoluble.

Bioaccessible Pb/Cd in soil was determined using the PBET method (Table. 4). In the control soil, 52.4% of Pb and 69.33% of Cd on average were bioaccessible, respectively. The nHA significantly reduced bioaccessible Pb with a reduction of 12.5-27.5% and Cd with a reduction of 17.66-34.64%, respectively. Reduction of bioaccessible Pb/Cd may be attributed to high acidity (pH=2) in the PBET solution which would increase further dissolution of soil heavy metals and nHA to lead more calcium lead phosphate hydroxide formation.



Fig. 3. Percentage of Pb and Cd in each fraction after different levels of nHA.

	Т	Total	DW-ex	xtractable	PBET (%)		
	Pb	Cd	Pb	Cd	Pb	Cd	
Control	806 ± 16.4	42.7 ± 1.2	2.75 ± 0.17	1.07 ± 0.01	52.40	69.33	
2: 1	817 ± 15.6	38.6 ± 0.6	1.86 ± 0.19	0.49 ± 0.02	39.95	51.67	
3: 1	838 ± 9.8	41.3 ± 1.1	1.35 ± 0.14	0.34 ± 0.01	29.63	40.48	
4: 1	824±15.3	40.8 ± 1.5	0.96 ± 0.16	0.24 ± 0.02	26.92	35.52	
5: 1	797 ± 18.5	39.8 ± 3.1	0.78 ± 0.09	0.22 ± 0.03	24.92	34.69	

Table 4. Total DW-extractable heavy metal (mg/kg soil) and PBET with nHA addition.

3.4. Pb/Cd phytoavailability

At the end of the experiment, average concentrations of Pb and Cd in shoots of corns grown in the untreated soil (control) were 23.6 (\pm 2.4, n=3) mg kg⁻¹ DW and 14.4 (\pm 2.7, n=3) mg kg⁻¹ DW (Fig. 4). Compared with the control, concentrations of Pb and Cd in shoots of corns were reduced with the addition of nHA. Pb and Cd concentration in shoots were lowered by 65.3% and 64.6%, respectively for molar ratios of P/(Pb+Cd) at 5:1. Plant available Pb and Cd were highly correlateed with water soluble Pb and Cd (r=0.913 for Pb; r=0.952 for Cd; P<0.05). Therefore, we speculated that reduction of Pb/Cd water solubility may directly result the reduction of metal phytoavailability. Other studies have shown that metal phytoavailability is positively related to metal concentrations in soil solution [2, 11, 35]. In similar studies, reduced Pb concentration in St. Augustine grass and sudax were observed in contaminated soils with phosphate induced [15, 36]. Furthermore, following nHA added, P nutrient was elevated which would promote plant growth, increasing the biomass.



Fig. 4. Average concentration of Pb and Cd in shoots of corn.

4. Conclusions

This study investigated the effectiveness of different amount of nHA in immobilizing Pb, Cd in contaminnated soils. The nHA treatment reduced Pb/Cd availability in this study, showing a significant reduction of water soluble, bioaccessible and phytoavailable Pb/Cd by forming the Pb/Cd phosphate (e.g., hydroxypyromorphite-like mineral). The immobilization mechanism main involves both cation exchange and partial dissolution of the nHA amendment and precipitation of heavy metal-containing phosphates. Furthermore, treatment efficiency increased as the nHA dose (based on the molar ratio of P/(Pb+Cd)) increased, and it was observed that immobilization was the most effective when using the molar ratio of P/(Pb+Cd) at 5:1. The results in this study showed that nHA can immobililize Pb and Cd in contaminated soil effectively.

Acknowledgements

This research was partly supported by Shaanxi Key Subject of Environmental Science and Engineering.

References

- Raicevic S, Kaludjerovic-Radoicic T, Zouboulis AI. In situ stabilization of toxic metals in polluted soils using phosphates: theoretical prediction and experiment verification. J Hazard Mater 2005; B117: 41-53.
- [2] Cao XD, Wahbi A, Ma LN, Li B, Yang YL. Immobilization of Zn, Cu, and Pb in contaminated soils using phosphate rock and phosphoric acid. J Hazard Mater 2009; 164: 55-564.
- [3] Zhang ZZ, Li MY, Chen W, Zhu SZ, Liu NN, Zhu LY. Immobilization of lead and cadmium from aqueous solution and contaminated sediment using nano-hydroxyapatite. *Environ Pollut* 2010; 158: 514-519.
- [4] Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR), 2007. Toxicological Profile for Lead. Atlanta, GA.
- [5] Vangronsveld J., Cunningham S.D. Introduction to the Concepts. Metal-Contaminated Soils: In-Situ Inactivation and Phytorestoration, 1998; pp: 1–15.
- [6] Geebelen W, Adriano D C, van der Lelie D, Mench M, Carleer R, Clijsters H, et.al. slected bioavailability assays to test the effect of amendment-induced immobilization of lead in soils. J lant Soil 2003; 49: 17–228.
- [7] Gray CW, Dunham SJ, Dennis PG, Zhao FJ, McGrath SP. Field evaluation of in situ remediation of a heavy metal contaminated soil using lime and red-mud. *J Environ Pollut* 2006; **142**: 530-539.
- [8] Brown S, Chaney R, Hallfrisch J, Ryan JA, Berti WR. In situ treatments to reduce the phyto- and bioavailability of lead, zinc and cadmium. J Environ Qual 2004; 33: 522–531.
- [9] Wang YM, Chen TC, Yeh K J, et al. Stabilization of an elevated heavy metal contaminated site, J. Hazard Mater 2001; 88: 63-74.
- [10] David Houben, Jonathan Pircar, Philippe Sonnet, Heavy metal immobilization by cost-effective amendments in a contaminated soil: Effects on metal leaching and phytoavailability, Journal of Geochemical Exploration (2011), doi:10.1016/j.gexplo.2011. 10.004.
- [11] Lee SH, Lee JS, Choi YJ, Kim JG. In situ stabilization of cadmium-, lead-, and zinc-contaminated soil using various amendments. J Chemosphere 2009; 77: 1069–1075.
- [12] Sneddon IR, Orueetxebarria M, Hodson ME, Schofield PF, Valsami- Jones E. Use of bone meal amendments to immobilise Pb, Zn and Cd in soil: A leaching column study. *Environ Pollut* 2006; 144: 816-825.
- [13] Lombi E, Zhao FJ, Zhang G, Sun B, Fitz W, Zhang H, McGrath S P. In situ fixation of metals in soils using bauxite residue: chemical assessment. J Environ Pollut 2002; 118: 435-443.
- [14] Xenidis A, Stouraiti C, Papassiopi N. Stabilization of Pb and As in soils by applying combined treatment with phosphates and ferrous iron. J Hazard Mater 2010; 177: 929-937.
- [15] Cao RX, Ma LQ. Phosphate-induced metal immobilization in a contaminated site. J Environ pollut 2003; 122: 19-28.
- [16] Hashimoto Y, Taki T, Sato T. Sorption of dissolved lead from shooting range soils using hydroxyapatite amendments synthesized from industrial byproducts as affected by varying pH conditions. *J Environ Manag* 2009; 90: 1782-1789.
- [17] Park JH, Bolan N. Comparative value of phosphate sources on the immobilization of lead, and leaching of lead and phosphorus in lead contaminated soils. J Sci Total Environment 2011; 409: 853-860.

- [18] Thawornchaisit U, Polprasert C. Evaluation of phosphate fertilizers for the stabilization of cadmium in highly contaminated soils. J Hazard Mater 2009; 165: 1109-1113.
- [19] Mignard S, Corami A, Ferrini V. Evaluation of the effectiveness of phosphate treatment for the remediation of mine waste soils contaminated with Cd, Cu, Pb, and Zn. J Chemosphere 2012; 86: 354-360.
- [20] Geebelen W, Adriano DC, van der Lelie D, Mench M, Carleer R, Vangronsveld CH. Selected bioavailability assays to test the effect of amendment-induced immobilization of lead in soils. J Plant Soil 2003; 249: 217–228.
- [21] Soil quality—Determination of Lead,Cadmium—Graphite furnace atomic absorption spectrophotometry, GB/T 17141—1997. (in chinese)
- [22] LQ.Ma,G.N.Rao,Effects of phosphate rock on sequential chemical extraction of lead in contaminated soils, J. Environ. Qual. 1997; 26: 788-794.
- [23] Tessier A, Campbell PGC, Bisson M. Sequential extraction procedure for the speciation of particulate trace metals. Anal Chem 1979; 51: 844–851.
- [24] Laperche V, Traina SJ, Gaddam P, Logan T. Chemical and mineralogical characterizations of Pb in a contaminated soil: reactions with synthetic apatite. J Environ Sci Technol 1996; 30: 3321–3326.
- [25] Ma QY, Traina SJ, Logan TJ, Ryan JA. Effects of aqueous Al, Cd, Cu, Fe(II), Ni, and Zn on Pb immobilization by hydroxyapatite. J Environ Sci Technol 1994; 28: 1219–1228.
- [26] Ma QY, Traina SJ, Logan TL, Ryan JA. In situ lead immobilization by apatite. Environ Sci Technol 1993; 27:1803–1810.
- [27] Shaskova I, Rat KA, Kitikova N. Removal of heavy metal ions from aqueous solutions by alkaline-earth metal phosphates. *Colloids Surf A Physicochem Eng Asp* 1999; 160: 207–215.
- [28] Takeuchi Y, Arai HJ. Removal of coexisting Pb²⁺, Cu²⁺, and Cd²⁺ ions from water by addition of hydroxyapatite powder. J Chem Eng Jpn 1990; 23: 75–80.
- [29] Waterlot C, Pruvot C, Ciesielski H, Douay F. Effects of a phosphorus amendment and the pH of water used for watering on the mobility and phytoavailability of Cd, Pb and Zn in highly contaminated kitchen garden soils. J Ecolo Engineering 2011; 37: 1081–1093.
- [30] Mobasherpour I, Salahi E, Pazouki M. Removal of divalent cadmium cations by means of synthetic nano crystallite hydroxyapatite. *J Desalination* 2011; 266: 142-148.
- [31] Zhang P, Ryan JA. Formation of pyromorphite in anglesite-hydroxyapatite suspensions under varying pH conditions. *Environ Sci Technol* 1998; 32: 3318–3324.
- [32] Xu,Y., Schwartz, F.W., Traina, S.J. Sorption of Zn²⁺ and Cd²⁺ on hydroxyapatite suraces. *Environ.Sci.Technol*.1994; 28: 1472-1480.
- [33] Zhu R, Wu M, Yang J. Mobilities and leachabilities of heavy metals in sludge with humans soil. J Environ Sci 2011; 23: 247-254.
- [34] Ahmad M, Hashimoto Y, Moon DH, Lee SS. Ok YS. Immobilization of lead in a Korean military shooting range soil using eggshell waste: An integrated mechanistic approach. J Hazard Mater 2012; 209–210: 392–401.
- [35] Basta NT, Gradwohl R, Snethen KL, Schroder JL. Chemical immobilization of lead, zinc, and cadmium in smeltercontaminated soils using biosolids and rock phosphate. *J Environ Qual* 2001: 30: 1222–1230.
- [36] Brown SL, Chaney RL, Hallfrisch J, Ryan JA, Berti WR. In situ soil treatments to reduce the phyto- and bio-availability of lead, zinc, and cadmium. J Environ Qual 2004; 33: 522–531.