

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com**ScienceDirect**

Procedia Food Science 7 (2016) 17 – 20

Procedia
Food Science

9th International Conference on Predictive Modelling in Food

Contribution of *Enterobacteriaceae* to sensory characteristics in soft cheeses made from raw milk

Magnus Westling^{a*}, Marie-Louise Danielsson-Tham^a, Jana Jass^b, Asgeir Nilsen^a, Åsa Öström^a, Wilhelm Tham^a

^aHospitality, Culinary Arts and Meal Science, Örebro University, Sörålgsvägen 1–2, 712 60 Grythyttan, Sweden

^bSchool of Science and Technology, Örebro University, Fakultetsgatan 1, 701 82 Örebro, Sweden

Abstract

Microbiological and sensory methods were used to analyze 22 soft cheeses, of which 19 were made from raw milk, one was made from both raw and pasteurized milk and two were made from pasteurized milk. Moderate correlations (r-value 0.5–0.6 and p-value <0.01–0.05) were found between the levels of *Enterobacteriaceae* at 37 °C and the intensity of the sensory characteristics “bitter”, “metallic”, “pungent”, “manure” and “ammonia”. The present study indicates that it is possible to predict high levels of *Enterobacteriaceae* in soft cheeses made from raw milk using only the human senses (odor and taste).

© 2016 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license

(<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

Peer-review under responsibility of Department of Food Science, Faculty of Food Engineering, University of Campinas.

Keywords: soft cheeses; pasteurization; sensory profile; *Enterobacteriaceae*; raw milk.

1. Introduction

Soft cheeses made from raw milk contribute a diversity of flavors that some consumers perceive positively [1] and also associate with artisanal production [2]. However, several food-borne outbreaks have been traced back to such cheeses [3, 4, 5]. Microbiological limits are used to determine if the food is satisfactory from a public health perspective. The European Union (EU) has set limits for the number of coagulase-positive staphylococci per gram of cheese for cheeses made from raw milk [6]. There are also limits for the number of *Listeria monocytogenes* – up to 99 colony-forming units (CFU) per gram of food is generally accepted [6].

Cheeses made from raw milk have a higher flavor intensity than cheeses made from pasteurized milk [7, 8, 9]. Furthermore, numerous studies have shown that the production of volatile compounds varies considerably between bacterial isolates and is strain dependent [10, 11, 12, 13]. Cheese made from raw milk is therefore particularly complex due to the varying composition of microbes [14, 15]. Most of the studies that compare flavor compounds and bacteria in cheese use chemical analytical instruments such as gas chromatography and mass spectrometry [12]. In contrast, our study is based on quantitative descriptive sensory methods. Sensory methods study the sensory attributes of products, e.g. cheese, giving a profile consisting of basic taste, flavor and/or texture for the analyzed product. This profiling is carried out by selected and trained assessors, which form a panel with the purpose of

* Corresponding author. Tel.: +46 (0)19-30 20 14; fax: +46 (0)591-144 43.

E-mail address: magnus.westling@oru.se

objectively evaluating the products [16].

The formation of flavor compounds due to microbial metabolism during ripening may be grouped into primary and secondary metabolic pathways. The primary metabolic pathways include lipolysis, proteolysis and metabolism of residual lactose, lactate and citrate [17]. Free fatty acids can be precursors to flavor compounds such as ketones, acids, alcohols and esters [10]. These flavors are especially important in soft cheeses [18]. Peptides and amino acids do not generally impact the flavor characteristics in cheese, other than the basic tastes such as bitter [18]. Further conversion is required for flavor formation [19]. Metabolism of residual lactose and of lactate and citrate is a rapid process during the early stages of ripening [17]. Further conversion can contribute to various flavor compounds such as acetaldehyde, diacetyl, acetoin and acetate [19]. These flavors are especially important in yoghurt [18]. The secondary metabolic pathways include metabolism of fatty acids and of amino acids [17]. Amino acids are degraded through transamination reactions and various flavor compounds are then produced from one or two additional reactions [20]. The flavor compounds resulting from this process have significant impact on the resulting flavor in cheese [13]. For example, some acids can contribute to the sensory characteristics “rancid”, “putrid” and “sour”, which contribute to the perception of ripened cheese [20].

The aim of the present study was to test the hypothesis that it is possible to predict the number of *Enterobacteriaceae* using human senses.

2. Materials and methods

This study included 19 raw milk cheeses, one cheese made from both raw milk and pasteurized milk and two cheeses made from pasteurized milk. The raw milk cheeses ($n = 19$) and the cheese made from both pasteurized and raw milk ($n = 1$) were purchased from a cheese store in Stockholm, Sweden. The cheeses made from pasteurized milk ($n = 2$) were purchased from a local grocery store in Grythyttan, Sweden. The cheeses were stored in refrigerators (+4 °C) at the School of Hospitality, Culinary Arts and Meal Sciences, Örebro University, until analysis. All cheeses were analyzed before the best-before date according to the cheeses' labels.

The cheeses ($n = 22$) were examined for aerobic microorganisms 30 °C, *Enterobacteriaceae* 37 °C, *Enterobacteriaceae* 44 °C, enterococci, staphylococci, *Bacillus cereus* and *Listeria monocytogenes* using the plate count method. The media used were tryptone glucose yeast extract agar, violet red bile glucose agar, Slanetz and Bartley agar, Baird-Parker agar, BACARA agar and Ottaviani Agosti agar (bioMérieux, France). Furthermore, four cheeses each contributed five typical *Enterobacteriaceae* 37 °C and 44 °C isolates, that is, a total of 10 isolates from each cheese. The total of 40 isolates were identified using API 20 E strips (bioMérieux, France). The results were recorded using the dedicated apiweb version 5.1 software (<https://apiweb.biomerieux.com> by bioMérieux, France), which yielded a profile and an identification rate in %.

The sensory evaluation by Quantitative Descriptive Analysis (QDA) [16] was conducted by a sensory panel of students ($n = 14$) at the School of Hospitality, Culinary Arts and Meal Sciences, Örebro University, who participated voluntarily. The assessors had experience in sensory evaluation with lectures in physiology of the senses, perception and sensory methods. The evaluation was carried out in a sensory laboratory conforming to ISO standards [21]. One training session prior to the evaluation was carried out to calibrate the assessors. They discussed and agreed on intensity levels of three different cheeses (two made from raw milk, one made from pasteurized milk). The sensory characteristics used ($n = 10$) were based on previous studies [9, 22, 23] and included the basic tastes “sweet”, “sour”, “salt” and “bitter” and the flavors “earthy”, “manure”, “mold”, “ammonia”, “metallic” and “pungent”. The intensity was assessed using line scales with labeled end points ranging from low intensity (1) to high intensity (9). The cheeses were evaluated in random order in replicates of one. Data collection was carried out using EyeQuestion version 3.9.7 software (Logic8 BV, The Netherlands). Univariate statistical methods were used to analyze the data. The analysis was performed using PanelCheck version 1.4.0 software (<http://www.panelcheck.com> by Nofima, Norway) for two-way ANOVA with samples and assessors as factors (two-way ANOVA, 1-rep) and for Principal Component Analysis with sensory characteristics (mean values) for all products.

Data from plate counting and QDA were compiled using Excel 2010 version 14.0 (Microsoft Corporation, USA). The statistical analysis was performed using Statistica version 12.0 software (<http://statsoft.com> by StatSoft, USA) for correlation (r -value and p -value) and visualized by scatter plots, with the levels of bacteria and the intensity of sensory characteristics as factors.

3. Results

Coagulase-positive staphylococci were detected in four of the 22 cheeses, *Bacillus cereus* was found in one of the cheeses and *L. monocytogenes* was not detected in any of the soft cheeses. The number of aerobic microorganisms cultured at 30 °C in the cheeses made from raw milk ranged from 6.5 to 9.5 colony-forming units (CFU log₁₀) per gram of cheese; the average value was 7.1 CFU log₁₀. The number of *Enterobacteriaceae* cultured at 37 °C in all of the cheeses made from raw milk ranged from 2.7 to 7.8 CFU log₁₀; the average value was 7.1 CFU log₁₀. The cheese made from both pasteurized and raw milk harbored relatively low levels of *Enterobacteriaceae* at 37 °C, specifically 1.3 CFU log₁₀. The levels of enterococci in all of the cheeses made from raw milk, except one, ranged from 4.7 to 7.1 CFU log₁₀; the average value was 6.5 CFU log₁₀.

All *Enterobacteriaceae* 37 °C isolates were identified as *Hafnia alvei*. All *Enterobacteriaceae* isolates at 44 °C in three of the cheeses were identified as *Escherichia coli*, and four isolates in one cheese were identified as *Klebsiella pneumoniae*. Three of the four cheeses harbored *H. alvei* at levels exceeding 7.0 log₁₀ CFU per gram of cheese. One of the four cheeses harbored *E. coli* at a level of 3.0 log₁₀ CFU per gram of cheese.

All the descriptive words have a p-value of <0.001 except for the sensory characteristics “sweet” and “earthy”, which were excluded from further analysis. Moderate correlation (r-value 0.6 and p-value <0.01) was found between the levels of *Enterobacteriaceae* at 37 °C and the intensity of the sensory characteristics “bitter” and “metallic”. Moderate correlation (r-value 0.5 and p-value <0.05) was also found between the levels of *Enterobacteriaceae* at 37 °C and the intensity of the sensory characteristics “pungent”, “manure” and “ammonia”.

4. Discussion

To our knowledge, there are no similar studies that suggest the use of a sensory method to predict high levels of *Enterobacteriaceae* in soft cheeses. The bacterial family *Enterobacteriaceae* also includes environmental species, as well as pathogenic bacteria. Therefore, Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005 on microbiological criteria for foodstuffs [6] states that “*Enterobacteriaceae* can be used for routine monitoring, and if they are present testing of specific pathogens can be started”. Furthermore, the same regulation states that “food business operators should have the possibility to use analytical methods other than reference methods, in particular more rapid methods, as long as the use of these alternative methods provides equivalent results”. According to Giammanco et al. [24], the quality of the cheese milk, as well as the hygienic status during manufacturing, packaging and handling of cheese, can be assessed by analyzing the amount of *Enterobacteriaceae* in cheese samples.

Different *Enterobacteriaceae* species have the ability to decarboxylate both lysine and ornithine, which leads to the production of the biogenic amines cadaverine and putrescine [25, 26, 27, 28]. This was not a property of other bacteria (enterococci, *Lactobacillus* and *Leuconostoc*) tested by Pircher et al. [28]. There are, however, substantial intra-species differences in putrescine and cadaverine production [28]. Ardö [29] states that cadaverine and putrescine contribute to fecal and putrid off-flavors. These odors relate to the sensory characteristics “manure” and “ammonia”, respectively. In Camembert cheese, cadaverine has been reported as tasting distinctly bitter [30].

5. Conclusion

The present study indicates that it is possible to predict high levels of *Enterobacteriaceae* in soft cheeses made from raw milk using the human senses (odor and taste) alone. However, it was not possible to identify the species of *Enterobacteriaceae* in the tested soft cheeses made from raw milk using only the human senses (odor and taste). Based on these results, it was not sufficient to use this as an alternative method to ensure hygienic quality. Further studies with different combinations of *Enterobacteriaceae* species and mixtures would need to be evaluated to ensure equivalent and standardized results.

Acknowledgement

Funding from Stadsveterinär Billströms stipendiefond is acknowledged.

References

- [1] Colonna A, Durham C, Meunier-Goddik L. Factors affecting consumers' preferences for and purchasing decisions regarding pasteurized and raw milk specialty cheeses. *J Dairy Sci* 2011;**94**(10):5217–5226.
- [2] Licitra G. World wide traditional cheeses: Banned for business? *Dairy Sci Technol* 2010;**90**(4):357–374.
- [3] De Buyser, M-L, Dufour B, Maire M, Lafarge V. Implication of milk and milk products in food-borne diseases in France and in different industrialised countries. *Int J Food Microbiol* 2001;**67**(1–2):1–17.
- [4] Danielsson-Tham M-L, Eriksson E, Helmersson S, Leffler M, Lütke L, Steen M, Sjørgjerd S, Tham W. Causes behind a human cheese-borne outbreak of gastrointestinal listeriosis. *Foodborne Pathog Dis* 2004;**1**(3):153–159.
- [5] Oliver SP, Boor KJ, Murphy SC, Murinda SE. Food safety hazards associated with consumption of raw milk. *Foodborne Pathog Dis* 2009;**6**:793–806.
- [6] European Commission. Regulation (EC) No. 2073/2005 of 15 November 2005 on microbiological criteria for foodstuffs. *OJEU, L338*, 1–26.
- [7] Grappin R, Beuvier E. Possible implications of milk pasteurization on the manufacture and sensory quality of ripened cheese. *Int Dairy J* 1997;**7**(12):751–761.
- [8] Buchin S, Delague V, Duboz G, Berdague JL, Beuvier E, Pochet S, Grappin R. Influence of Pasteurization and Fat Composition of Milk on the Volatile Compounds and Flavor Characteristics of a Semi-hard Cheese. *J Dairy Sci* 1998;**81**:3097–3108.
- [9] Chambers DH, Esteve E, Retiveau A. Effects of Milk Pasteurization on Flavor Properties of Seven Commercially Available French Cheese Types. *J Sens Stud* 2010;**25**:494–511.
- [10] McSweeney PLH, Sousa MJ. Biochemical pathways for the production of flavour compounds in cheeses during ripening: A review. *Lait* 2000;**80**:293–324.
- [11] Curioni PMG, Bosset JO. Key odorants in various cheese types as determined by gas chromatography-olfactometry. *Int Dairy J* 2002;**12**(12):959–984.
- [12] Bos LDJ, Sterk PJ, Schultz MJ. Volatile metabolites of pathogens: a systematic review. *PLoS Pathog* 2013;**9**(5).
- [13] Steele J, Broadbent J, Kok J. Perspectives on the contribution of lactic acid bacteria to cheese flavor development. *Curr Opin Biotech* 2013;**24**:135–141.
- [14] Hassan FAM, Abd El-Gawad MAM, Enab AK. Flavour Compounds in Cheese (Review). *Res Precis Instrum* 2013;**2**(2):15–29.
- [15] Montel, M-C et al. Traditional cheeses: Rich and diverse microbiota with associated benefits. *Int J Food Microbiol* 2014;**117**:136–154.
- [16] Lawless HT, Heymann H. *Sensory Evaluation of Food: Principles and Practices*. New York, USA: Chapman and Hall; 2010.
- [17] McSweeney P. Biochemistry of cheese ripening. *Int J Dairy Technol* 2004;**57**(2/3):127–144.
- [18] Smit G, Smit BA, Engels WJM. Flavour formation by lactic acid bacteria and biochemical flavour profiling of cheese products. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* 2005;**29**:591–610.
- [19] Marilley L, Casey MG. Flavours of cheese products: metabolic pathways, analytical tools and identification of producing strains. *Int J Food Microbiol* 2003;**90**(2):139–159.
- [20] Yvon M, Rijnen L. Cheese flavour formation by amino acid catabolism. *Int Dairy J* 2001;**11**:185–201.
- [21] ISO. *ISO 8589 Sensory analysis - General guidance for the design of test rooms*. Geneva, Switzerland: ISO; 2008.
- [22] Carunchiawhetstine ME, Karagul-Yuceer Y, Avsar YK, Drake MA. Identification and Quantification of Character Aroma Components in Fresh Chevre-style Goat Cheese. *J Food Sci* 2003; **68**(8):2441–2447.
- [23] Drake MA. Invited Review: Sensory Analysis of Dairy Foods. *J Dairy Sci* 2007;**90**:4925–4937.
- [24] Giammanco GM, Pepe A, Aleo A, D'Agostino V, Milone S, Mammina C. Microbiological quality of Pecorino Siciliano “primosale” cheese on retail sale in the street markets of Palermo, Italy. *New Microbiol* 2011;**34**(2):179–185.
- [25] Marino M, Maifreni M, Moret S, Rondinini G. The capacity of *Enterobacteriaceae* species to produce biogenic amines in cheese. *Lett Appl Microbiol* 2000;**31**(2):169–73.
- [26] Durlu-Özkaya F, Ayhan K, Vural N. Biogenic amines produced by *Enterobacteriaceae* isolated from meat products. *Meat Sci* 2001;**58**:163–166.
- [27] Chaves-López C, De Angelis M, Martuscelli M, Serio A, Paparella A, Suzzi G. Characterization of the *Enterobacteriaceae* isolated from an artisanal Italian ewe's cheese (Pecorino Abruzzese). *J App Microbiol* 2006;**101**:353–360.
- [28] Pircher A, Bauer F, Paulsen P. Formation of cadaverine, histamine, putrescine and tyramine by bacteria isolated from meat, fermented sausages and cheeses. *Eur Food Res Technol* 2007;**226**(1–2):225–231.
- [29] Ardö Y. Flavour formation by amino acid catabolism. *Biotechnol Adv* 2006;**24**(2):238–242.
- [30] Kubíčková J, Grosch W. Evaluation of Flavour Compounds of Camembert Cheese. *Int Dairy J* 1998;**8**(1):11–16.