14th International Language, Literature and Stylistics Symposium

The Comparative study of quotation expression in Korean newspapers: focusing on the comparison of Hankyoreh and Chosunilbo

Juhyun Lee a, * 

*Yonsei University, Sinchon-dong, Seodaemun-gu, Seoul, 120-740, South Korea

Abstract

This study analyzed quotation patterns used in articles of the conservative newspaper the Chosunilbo and the progressive Hankyoreh. The subject of this study is articles related to the Korea superintendent election that was held on June 4, 2014. In this election, unlike in the past when conservative superintendents were dominant, a sizeable number of progressive candidates were elected. Based on quotations included in articles relating to Korea superintendent election, this study was focused on three aspects: anonymous speaker, speaker of actual name, and predicate in quotation. Both newspapers used anonymous speakers for indirectly revealing opinions against the opponent superintendent. Also, Hankyoreh tends to be more clear about speakers with actual name in comparison to Chosunilbo, and this seems to be because the former deals with more sensitive subjects than the latter and, therefore, attempts to establish more objectivity. The predicates most frequently used in the quotes were ‘to speak’ and ‘to reveal’ and these two predicates that suggest objectivity were in fact used for delivering remarks made by a superintendent whose political disposition corresponds to the newspaper.

Keywords: writing style of Korean newspapers; progressive superintendent; conservative superintendent; predicate in quotation; discourse analysis in newspaper; political disposition; ideological bias

1. Introduction

‘Newspaper’ text frequently uses ‘quotes’, due to the nature of the genre. Quotes in newspaper deliver speaker’s

* First author. Tel.: +82-10-7431-3031
E-mail address: juhyun.lee@yonsei.ac.kr
speech and, thereby, facticity of an event. However, are quotes in newspaper always used objectively? Does the words within quotation marks not reflect political disposition of news writers and the newspaper? Or, is there not any possibility that the intention of the speaker can be distorted?

Newspapers have unique writing style distinguished from other text genres. Among those characteristics, ‘quotes’ differentiate newspaper from other text genres. Quotes used in newspaper can be used for distorting an expression, depending on the editorial direction, and is called ‘the illusion of rhetoric’ (Van Dijk, 1988).

So far, in Korean academia, research on newspaper quotes was focused on sentence structure. However, in this study, the focus will be on how the same quotative clauses reveal political disposition of different newspapers. In Korean language, direct quotation uses quotation mark(“,”), and indirect quotation endings like ‘-ko’. The data used in this study did not show a significant difference in direct and indirect quotations, sentence structure and markers. In other words, the quotation structure was not different between the two politically opposite newspapers. Therefore, from Chapter 2, distinction was not made between direct and indirect quotes and sentence structures were not described.

There are many ways to reveal political ideals by using quotes.

1. “gyeolronjeogeulo amu geoddo eobsda” myeo bigwanjeog in taedoleul boveosda. (Kim, 2006)
   “In conclusion, there is nothing,” showing a pessimistic attitude.

2. ileum balhigi reul kkeolin gyeongnam jiyeog han junghaggyo gyosaneun “[…] amuli gyooyuggam dangseonjaga koib seonbal gosa pyejieul gongyaghaesdajiman , myeo dal namjido aneun siheomeul pyejihanenue geoseun olchi anda “ go malhaessda. <Hankyoreh 17-06-2014>
   A middle school teacher in Gyeongnam who chose not to reveal his name said, “[…] Even if the superintendent elect pledged to eliminate the high school entrance exam, it is not right to do so when the exam is only a few months away.”

The easiest strategy is indirectly criticize the attitude of the speaker by adding a subjective opinion of the news writer in the following clause, as shown in (1). While (1) used a predicate strategy in the sentence, (2) used the subject strategy in the sentence. The subject(speaker) can either reveal the actual name or be anonymous in the sentence. When quoting a speaker’s speech as in (2), is this speech to show a politically neutral opinion? Is there any possibility that this speech corresponds to the political disposition of the newspaper and news writer?

This study began from these questions. For that reason, quotations in newspapers were analyzed in terms of discourse rather than syntax. Particularly the subject of the aforementioned sentence will be discussed in sections 3.1 and 3.2, and predicates in a sentence in section 3.3.

2. Method of Analysis

Chosunilbo and Hankyoreh are newspapers published in Korea in Korean language. Chosunilbo and Hankyoreh are well-known as a conservative and progressive newspaper respectively. So far, many studies in Korea compared these two newspapers that have opposite political dispositions. This study, too, began based on the different political views of the two newspapers.

The articles chosen from Chosunilbo and Hankyoreh were related to the Korea superintendent election held on June 4, 2014. In the 2010 election, only six progressive superintendents were elected in 16 cities and provinces in Korea. However, in the 2014 election, 13 progressive superintendents were elected from 17 metropolitan cities, cities, and provinces. This substantial change brought much attention to the 2014 election.

The conservative Chosunilbo is expected to report positive articles about conservative superintendents while the progressive Hankyoreh is likely to publish positive reports on progressive superintendents. Particularly, to research quotes that are dealt with in this study, it is necessary to analyze articles within a limited period.

(3) Period for article selection: June 3, 2014 ~ July 31, 2014
Articles chosen in this study were published during three days (June 3-5) including the election day (June 4); three days (June 16-18) including a particular event day (June 17); and, a month (July 1-31) from the date of inauguration of the superintendent (July 1). The reason articles published during six days (June 3-5 and 16-18) before the inauguration of superintendents on July 1 was as follows: Many articles were published before and after the election on June 4 because of the election result that was significantly different from the 2010 election. Articles before and after June 17 were reviewed because some of the progressive superintendents submitted a petition regarding Korean Teachers and Educational Workers’ Union to the court on June 17. Newspapers showed different interpretations according to their political disposition.

The following websites were used for collecting the articles: All articles published by the two newspapers relating to superintendents during these periods were collected. Simple interview and columns were excluded in order to avoid including opinions of people from the outside who have different political dispositions.

During these periods, *Chosunilbo* published 34 articles on superintendents while *Hankyoreh* published almost double with 67 articles. For that reason, when suggesting a figure, it will be based on relative frequency rather than absolute frequency. The difference in the number of articles seems to be because *Hankyoreh* is more politically vocal than *Chosunilbo* (See Chapter 3).

Table 1 shows analysis of the articles in the periods.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Hankyoreh</th>
<th>Chosunilbo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Article(total)</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentence(total)</td>
<td>1294</td>
<td>657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quotation expression(total)</td>
<td>490 (100%)</td>
<td>239 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quotation expression(analysis materials)</td>
<td>350 (71.42%)</td>
<td>175 (73.22%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There were total 1294 sentences in the 67 articles of *Hankyoreh*, and 490 of them were quotes. Likewise, in *Chosunilbo*, among 657 sentences, 239 sentences were quotes. In this study, 350 quote sentences from *Hankyoreh* and 175 from *Chosunilbo* were used. As stated in the introduction, there are various quotative markers found in Korean newspapers. However, because quotative markers recognized by Korean language school grammar (normative grammar) are such as ‘-ko, -rako’ this study was also based on quotations that used these markers.

Although the quotative clauses are almost the same in both newspapers, readers find different political dispositions from the two. This suggests that there is something that cannot be simply explained by quotative clauses alone. In this study, it is assumed that there is writing strategy that can be explained in terms of the structure of quotation.

In Chapter 3, this strategy will be examined in terms of subject (speaker) and predicate. How is the subject (speaker) selected for the same quotative clause? Is the selected speaker irrelevant with political disposition of the newspaper? Also, do the two newspapers use the same quotation expressions for the same event? Answers to these questions will be provided in Chapter 3 using 525 sentences.

3. Analysis

3.1. Patterns of Speaker: anonymous speaker

The first strategy for indirectly expressing political disposition in newspapers is related to the subject of a sentence, i.e. quoted sentence. There are two possibilities when quoting someone’s speech through direct or indirect quotations: the speaker can either reveal his or her actual name or be anonymous. The subjects(speakers) of the articles in this are shown in Table 2.
Table 2 shows the number of cases when the speakers of quotes were specifically revealed and when they were not. In Hankyoreh, 297 out of 350 sentences specifically suggested the actual names of speakers. By contrast, in Chosunilbo, 113 out of 175 sentences did so. While Hankyoreh revealed the speakers’ name in 84.85% of the cases, the figure was 64.57% in case of Chosunilbo. Revealing actual names of speakers in quotes is to increase objectivity of the quotation. Chosunilbo frequently uses passive forms such as boinda ‘seem’, chujeongdoenda ‘be assumed’, Hankyoreh uses much more active forms, while Hankyoreh reveals clear resources instead of relying on ambiguity of objectivity as the newspaper deals with different fields of National Security Law including anti-government organizations and praises and glorification much more frequently than Chosunilbo(Song, 2007).

The two newspapers quote speech of anonymous speakers at the proportions of 15.14% and 35.42% respectively. Does quotation of anonymous speakers deliver objective and neutral opinions? In this study, it is not. The news writer reflects political disposition even quotations of anonymous speakers that seem to be objective statements. Read the following articles from Hankyoreh and Chosunilbo published on the same day, June 17, 2014.

(4) [...] Gyoyuggam dangseonjadeuldo [...] tanwonseoleul bonaessda. Le daehae gyoyugbu gwangyejaneun [...] “nonlani doeneun saane daehae dangseonjadeuli imgiga sijagdoegido jeone jibdanhaengdongeul haneun geoseun ulveoseuleobda” go malhaessda. <Chosunilbo 2014-06-17>

[...] superintendent elects also sent [...] petition. A source from Ministry of Education said, [...] “it is concerning that the elects are engaged in a group activity for such a controversial issue even before their inauguration.”

(5) Kimseojun busansi gyoyuggam dangseonjaneun “[...] aideuli jeulgeobge gongbuhal su issneun haggyoleul mandeuleo dallaneun geosi gugmindelu guiyoueossdago saenggaghandu” myeo “ileul silhyeonsikigi wihaeseon gyoyugyeui anjeongi mueosboda jungyohada” go gangjohaessda. <Hankyoreh 2014-06-17>

Seokjun Kim, the superintendent elect in Busan, said,“[…] I believe it was the public’s demand that we create schools where children can happily study,” and “to realize this demand, stabilizing the education field is more important than anything else,” he emphasized.

(4-5) are articles relating to the same event, i.e., submission of a petition for Korean Teachers and Educational Workers’ Union by progressive superintendent elects before their inauguration. Eight out of 13 progressive superintendents elected in this election formerly belonged to Teachers’ Union (Korean Teachers and Educational Workers’ Union), which explains their cooperation.

Despite the same subject, in (4), an anonymous source from Ministry of Education was quoted to indirectly reveal the negative opinion that the group activity by the progressive superintendents before their inauguration was concerning. By contrast, Hankyoreh quotes a progressive superintendent who revealed his actual name to argue that it was a just action based on the demand from the public. This suggests that quotation from an anonymous speaker can be used to argue against the opponent’s speech, according to the political disposition.

In (6), also, a positive review on the policy of a progressive superintendent elect in Gyeonggido was made by quoting a public servant.

(6) Gyeonggidocheongui han gongmuwoneun “ildaneun sinseonhago ilvejeogida. [...]”go malhaessda. <Hankyoreh 03-07-2014>

A public servant at the Gyeonggi Provincial Government said, “for now, it is refreshing and unusual. [...]”

3.2. Patterns of speaker: Speaker with actual name
Then, is quotation from a speaker whose actual name is specifically revealed used regardless of political disposition? How are these speakers with actual name selected and used by the newspapers? In Table 2, Hankyoreh revealed the speakers’ names in 297 sentences, and Chosunilbo in 113 sentences. Among the 297 sentences, 164 were from progressive superintendents and 21 from conservative superintendents. Among the 113 sentences in which Chosunilbo revealed the speakers’ names, 47 were from progressive superintendents and 8 from conservative superintendents. There was no significant difference in proportion of quotations from progressive superintendents in the two newspapers.

Will the speeches from progressive superintendents quote in the two newspapers be delivered to the readers in the same way? The day after the election, on June 5, Chosunilbo and Hankyoreh published 7 and 8 articles, respectively, relating to superintendents. Among the 8 articles of Hankyoreh, there were 17 quotations, all of which were from progressive superintendents who revealed their names. By contrast, Chosunilbo also used 15 sentences of quotation in 7 articles, and both actual names and anonymous speakers were used.

Here, Chosunilbo, as shown in the example (8), used a quotation from an anonymous speaker to express concern about the dominance of progressive superintendents.

(7) Sudogwon jiveog han gogyo gvosaneun “jeongyojoe daehanmingug gyoyugi neomeogassda” go pyohyeonhaessda. <Chosunilbo 05-06-2014>
A high school teacher in the Metropolitan Area said, “The Korean education is taken over by Teachers’ Union.”

By contrast, <Hankyoreh> only quotes speakers with actual names. Here, the speakers are either progressive superintendents or those who support progressive superintendents.

(8) Haninseob seouldae gvosuneum “johuiyeoneun jinsilhago, veoljeongjeogigo geuleomyeonseodo onyuhago gyeomsonhada […]” go haessda. <Hankyoreh 05-06-2014>
Inseop Han, a professor at Seoul National University, said “Heeyeon Cho is sincere, passionate, and, at the same time, gentle and humble […]”.

3.3. Patterns of predicate

Sections 3.1 and 3.2 were focused on the speaker (subject), and, in section 3.3, usage patterns of predicates in quotations will be discussed. Table 1 showed that Hankyoreh used 350 sentences and Chosunilbo 175. Table 3 shows predicate patterns in the two newspapers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predicate type</th>
<th>Hankyoreh</th>
<th>Chosunilbo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>say (85/24,28%)</td>
<td>reveal (77/22%), do (23), argue (14), say (58/33,14%), reveal (44/25,14%), do (20), argue (8), inform (3),…</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>350 (100%)</td>
<td>175 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows types of predicates used in the two newspapers in the order of frequency. Both newspapers used ‘say’ and ‘reveal’ most frequently. The combined frequency of these two predicates is half of the total predicates used in the two newspapers. While malhada ‘say,’ and balkida ‘reveal’ seem to objectively deliver speakers’ opinion, is it the case in newspapers as well?

First, look at Hankyoreh. Of 85 sentences in which ‘say’ was used as a predicate, the subject was a progressive speaker in 61 cases, neutral or anonymous in 23 cases, and conservative only in one case. Also, in case of Chosunilbo, of the 58 sentences that used ‘say’ as a predicate, the subject was a progressive speaker in 11 cases, conservative in 10 cases, and neutral or anonymous in 37 cases. It suggests that Hankyoreh is more partial than Chosunilbo in terms of ideology.
Another proof that Hankyoreh is more politically partial is found in 23 sentences. When an anonymous speaker is the subject, ‘say’, which seems more objective, was used to argue against the opponent (9a). Although not as frequently as Hankyoreh, Chosunilbo, also, used anonymous speakers and their speech to criticize progressive superintendents (9b).

(9) a. Ileum balhigileul kekoeun gyeongnam jiveog han junhaggyo gyosaneun “[…] amuli gyoyuggam dangseonjaga goib seonbalgosga pyejileul gong-yaghaesslerajiman, […] siheom-eul pyejihaneun geoseun olhi ahnda” go malhaessa. <Hankyoreh 2014-6-17>
A middle school teacher in Gyeongnam who asked for anonymity said, “[…] Even those the superintendent elect pledged to abolish the high school entrance exam, […] it is not right to do so.”
b. Seoul gangbugui han junhaggyo gyojangdo “[…] gyoyuggami ttoogoateun haengtaeleul banbhogni gyoyuggyewa jeongchipani daleun ge eobsda” go malhaessa. <Chosunilbo 2014-7-3>
A principal of a middle school in Gangbuk, Seoul, also said, “[…] superintendents repeat the same behavior. The education field is just like politics.”

So far, we have examined ‘say’, a predicate that suggests objective speech. Then, how about predicates with negative nuance? There were not many negative predicates found in the two newspapers. When Hankyoreh used ko binjeongdaeda/daekkuhada/ttajida ‘say sarcastically/rebuff/rebut’, the subject was related to the conservative superintendent candidate (Gyeongchan Kang), whose had the opposite political disposition.

(10) GangGyeongchan(62) huboneun i huboege “[…] geuleohan gyoyugeul han gyosaga issdamyeon eotteon jocheoleul hal geosinya” go malhaessa. <Hankyoreh 4-6-2014>
Candidate Gyeongchan Kang(62 years old) rebutted, to candidate Lee, “[…] what measure will you take if there is a teacher who provided such education?”

(10) is an article on a conversation between the candidates Seokmun Lee(conservative) and Gyeongchan Kang(progressive) and, for a question asked by candidate Kang to Lee, the news writer used predicates with negative nuance, such as molaseuda ‘corner’ and ttajida ‘rebut’ instead of jilmunhada ‘ask’. This strategy was used perhaps to indicate to the readers that the candidate Lee asked the questions for the purpose of putting Kang in a disadvantageous position.

Another strategy relates to the order of subjects that are quoted.

(11) […] Bosu hubo dueuleun “jinbo gyoyug 4 nyeon dongan hagsaengdeului sillyeogi jeohadwaessa” go jujanghaneun bannmyeon. jinbo hubo deuleun “[…] eogii jujang” ilamyeo […] gonggyoyugui gaehyeog eul jujanghanda. <Hankyoreh. 04-06-2014>
[… ] Conservative candidates argued, “the students’ performance deteriorated during the 4 years of progressive education,” while progressive candidates called it “a false claim,” […] and insisted on reform of public education.

In (11), argument of conservative candidates was shown before that of progressive candidates. Here, progressive candidates are presented as refuting the conservative’s claim, which implies that only the progressive candidates are insisting on true reform of public education.

4. Conclusion

In this study, quotations in the Korean newspapers Hankyoreh and Chosunilbo were examined. Particularly, the study focused on quotation expressions frequently found in newspaper text, and how newspapers reveal their political ideology by using them. For it, in this study, 524 quotation sentences in 101 newspaper articles written relating to the Korea superintendent election on June 4, 2014, were analyzed. While the majority of elects in the
2010 Korea superintendent election were conservative, in 2014, progressive superintendents dominated. This event perhaps has been reported differently according to the political disposition of newspapers.

In this study, three aspects of quotation expressions – when the subject(speaker) is anonymous, reveals the actual name, and predicate patterns – were examined. First, Hankyoreh specifically reveals speakers 85% of cases, in comparison to Chosunilbo. This seems to be because Hankyoreh attempts to increase their objectivity by revealing actual names of speakers as they deal with subjects like National Security Law more frequently than Chosunilbo does.

Both newspapers quote anonymous speakers, and, interestingly, anonymous speakers were used to either support a superintendent that has similar political disposition or refute the opponent. By contrast, speakers with actual names were used only in sentences that support opinion of superintendents with similar political disposition.

Lastly, as for predicates, the most frequently used predicates in Hankyoreh and Chosunilbo were malhada ‘say’ and balghida ‘reveal’. Although ‘say’ seems to suggest objective speech, in fact, it was used for supporting a political ideology or refuting the opponent. In other words, ‘say,’ when used for quotation in newspapers, cannot be considered as an objective or neutral predicate. In general, Hankyoreh is more politically partial than Chosunilbo. This is seen in how Hankyoreh always used predicates with negative nuance with speech of conservative superintendents.

So far, research on quotations in Korean domestic newspapers was conducted on syntactic / morphological levels, relating to quotative markers and clauses. However, based on the discussion of this study, even if the same quotative clauses are used, newspapers select different speakers and use different predicate patterns according to their political disposition

References


