# Invariable generation and the Chebotarev invariant of a finite group ${ }^{\text {th }}$ 

W.M. Kantor ${ }^{\text {a,* }}$, A. Lubotzky ${ }^{\text {b }}$, A. Shalev ${ }^{\text {b }}$<br>${ }^{\text {a }}$ University of Oregon, Eugene, OR 97403 , United States<br>${ }^{\text {b }}$ Institute of Mathematics, Hebrew University, Jerusalem 91904, Israel

## ARTICLE INFO

## Article history:

Received 21 October 2010
Available online 24 October 2011
Communicated by Ronald Solomon
Dedicated to Bob Guralnick in honor of his 60th birthday

## Keywords:

Invariable generation
Simple group
Chebotarev invariant


#### Abstract

A subset $S$ of a finite group $G$ invariably generates $G$ if $G=\left\langle s^{g(s)}\right|$ $s \in S\rangle$ for each choice of $g(s) \in G, s \in S$. We give a tight upper bound on the minimal size of an invariable generating set for an arbitrary finite group $G$. In response to a question in Kowalski and Zywina (2010) [KZ] we also bound the size of a randomly chosen set of elements of $G$ that is likely to generate $G$ invariably. Along the way we prove that every finite simple group is invariably generated by two elements.


© 2011 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

## 1. Introduction

For many years there has been a rapidly growing literature concerning the generation of finite groups. This has involved the number $d(G)$ of generators of a group $G$, or the expected number $E(G)$ of random choices of elements in order to probably generate $G$, among other group-theoretic invariants. In this paper we will study further invariants.

Dixon [Di1] began the probabilistic direction for generating (almost) simple groups, and later he also introduced yet another direction based on the goal of determining Galois groups [Di2]. This has led to the following notions:

[^0]Definition. Let $G$ be a finite group.
(a) A subset $S$ of $G$ invariably generates $G$ if $G=\left\langle s^{g(s)} \mid s \in S\right\rangle$ for each choice of $g(s) \in G, s \in S$ [Di2].
(b) Let $d_{I}(G):=\min \{|S| \mid S$ invariably generates $G\}$.
(c) The Chebotarev invariant $C(G)$ of $G$ is the expected value of the random variable $n$ that is minimal subject to the requirement that $n$ randomly chosen elements of $G$ invariably generate $G[K Z]$.

There have been several papers discussing (a) for specific groups (such as finite simple groups) [LuP,NP,Sh,FG1,KZ], but not for finite groups in general. Concerning (c), recall Chebotarev's Theorem that provides elements of a suitable Galois group G, where the elements are obtained only up to conjugacy in $G$; the interest in (c) comes from computational group theory, where there is a need to know how long one should expect to wait in order to ensure that choices of representatives from the conjugacy classes provided by Chebotarev's Theorem will generate G. This is discussed more carefully in [Di2,KZ].

Our main results are the next two theorems, which depend on the classification of the finite simple groups.

Theorem 1.1. Every finite group $G$ is invariably generated by at most $\log _{2}|G|$ elements.
This bound is best possible: we show that $d_{I}(G)=\log _{2}|G|$ if and only if $G$ is an elementary abelian 2-group. It is trivial that $d(G) \leqslant \log _{2}|G|$ using Lagrange's Theorem. However, $d_{I}(G)$ may be much larger than $d(G)$ : Proposition 2.5 states that, for every $r \geqslant 1$, there is a finite group $G$ such that $d(G)=2$ but $d_{I}(G) \geqslant r$. Theorem 3.1 contains a more precise statement of Theorem 1.1 involving the length and structure of a chief series of $G$.

Theorem 1.2. There exists an absolute constant $c$ such that

$$
C(G) \leqslant c|G|^{1 / 2}(\log |G|)^{1 / 2}
$$

for all finite groups $G$.
This bound is close to best possible: it is easy to see that sharply 2 -transitive groups provide an infinite family of groups $G$ for which $C(G) \sim|G|^{1 / / 2}$ (compare [KZ, Section 4]). In fact [KZ, Section 9] asks whether $C(G)=O\left(|G|^{1 / 2}\right)$ for all finite groups $G$ (which we view as rather likely).

For an arbitrary finite group it is interesting to compare $d_{I}(G)$ with $d(G)$, and $C(G)$ with $E(G)$. The upper bounds for $d_{I}(G)$ and $d(G)$ are identical, although (as stated above) these quantities may be very different. On the other hand, $E(G) \leqslant e d(G)+2 e \log \log |G|+11=O(\log |G|)$ [Lu], which is far smaller than the bound in Theorem 1.2.

We will need the following result of independent interest.
Theorem 1.3. Every non-abelian finite simple group is invariably generated by 2 elements.
In fact, for proofs of Theorems 1.1 and 1.2 we will need slightly stronger results on simple groups involving automorphisms as well (cf. Theorems 5.1 and 5.5 ). The same week that we proved these results about simple groups essentially the same result as Theorem 5.1 with a roughly similar proof was posted in [GM2].

Dealing with simple groups uses the rather large literature of known properties of those groups. The fact that, for finite simple groups $G, d_{I}(G)$ and $C(G)$ are bounded by some (unspecified) constant $c$ follows for alternating groups from [LuP] (cf. [KZ]), and for Lie type groups from results announced in [FG1] related to "Shalev's $\epsilon$-Conjecture", which concerns the number of fixed-point-free elements in simple permutation groups (cf. Section 4).

The proof of Theorem 1.2 uses bounds in [CC] and [FG1] on the number of fixed-point-free elements of a transitive permutation group, together with a recent bound on the number of maximal
subgroups of a finite group [LPS]. We note that an explicit formula for $C(G)$ is given in [KZ, Proposition 2.7], but we have not been able to use it since it appears to be too difficult to evaluate its terms for most groups $G$.

The proofs of Theorems 1.1, 1.2 and 1.3 are given in Sections 3, 4 and 5, respectively. Section 2 contains the aforementioned result on the non-relationship of $d(G)$ and $d_{I}(G)$, as well as a characterization of nilpotent groups as those finite groups all of whose generating sets invariably generate.

This paper is dedicated to Bob Guralnick, who has made fundamental contributions in the various areas involved in this and other papers of ours.

## 2. Preliminary results and examples

Unless otherwise stated, we assume that the group $G$ is finite. If $X, Y \subseteq G$, we say that $Y$ is similar to $X$ if there is a function $f: X \rightarrow Y$ such that $f(X)=Y$ and, for each $x \in X, f(x)$ is conjugate in $G$ to $x$. Thus $X$ invariably generates $G$ if and only if $\langle Y\rangle=G$ for each $Y \subseteq G$ that is similar to $X$.

Let $\operatorname{Max}(G)$ denote the set of maximal subgroups of $G$. Let $\mathcal{M}=\mathcal{M}(G)$ be a set of representatives of conjugacy classes of maximal subgroups of $G$.

If $M \in \operatorname{Max}(G)$, write

$$
\tilde{M}=\bigcup_{g \in G} M^{g} \quad \text { and } \quad v(M)=\frac{|\tilde{M}|}{|G|} .
$$

Clearly $\widetilde{M_{1}}=\widetilde{M_{2}}$ if the maximal subgroups $M_{1}, M_{2}$ are conjugate in $G$. Also, $\widetilde{M}$ is the set of elements of $G$ having at least one fixed point in the primitive permutation representation of $G$ on the set $G / M$ of (left) cosets of $M$ in $G$.

Lemma 2.1. A subset $X \subseteq G$ generates $G$ invariably if and only if $X \nsubseteq \widetilde{M}$ for all $M \in \mathcal{M}$.
Proof. If $X \subseteq \widetilde{M}$ for some $M \in \mathcal{M}$ then each element of $X$ is conjugate to an element of $M$, and hence $X$ does not generate $G$ invariably. Conversely, if $X$ does not generate $G$ invariably, then there exists a set $Y$ similar to $X$ such that $\langle Y\rangle \neq G$. Hence (using the finiteness of $G$ ) there exist $M \in \mathcal{M}$ and $g \in G$ such that $\langle Y\rangle \subseteq M^{g}$, and hence $X \subseteq \widetilde{M}$.

The "only if" part of the above lemma also holds for infinite groups. Moreover, the proof shows that $X \subseteq G$ generates an arbitrary group $G$ invariably only if $X \nsubseteq \widetilde{H}$ for all $H<G$. This enables us to show that some infinite groups are not invariably generated by any set of elements. For example, there are countable groups G all of whose nontrivial elements are conjugate [HNN] (and even 2generated groups with this property [Os]), so that $\widetilde{H}=G$ for every nontrivial subgroup $H$ and hence even $G$ itself does not generate $G$ invariably.

However, for finite groups there are no anomalies of this kind, since $\widetilde{H} \neq G$ for all proper subgroups $H$. In fact, if $k(G)$ denotes the number of conjugacy classes of (elements of) the finite group $G$, then we have

Lemma 2.2. For any finite group $G$ we have $d_{I}(G) \leqslant k(G)$. Moreover, $d_{I}(G)$ is at most the number of conjugacy classes of cyclic subgroups of $G$.

Proof. If $H$ is the subgroup of $G$ generated by a set of cyclic subgroups, one from each conjugacy class, then the union of all conjugates of $H$ is $G$, and hence $H=G$.

For $k \geqslant 1$, let $P_{I}(G, k)$ be the probability that $k$ randomly chosen elements of $G$ generate $G$ invariably.

Lemma 2.3. $\max _{M \in \mathcal{M}} v(M)^{k} \leqslant 1-P_{I}(G, k) \leqslant \sum_{M \in \mathcal{M}} v(M)^{k}$.

Proof. Let $g_{1}, \ldots, g_{k} \in G$ be randomly chosen. Given $M \in \mathcal{M}$, the probability that $g_{i} \in \widetilde{M}$ for all $i$ is $v(M)^{k}$. Both inequalities now follow easily from Lemma 2.1.

We next characterize nilpotent groups in terms of invariable generation.

Proposition 2.4. A finite group $G$ is nilpotent if and only if every generating set of $G$ invariably generates $G$.
Proof. Let $\Phi(G)$ denote the Frattini subgroup of $G$. Then a subset of $G$ generates $G$ if and only if its image in $G / \Phi(G)$ generates $G / \Phi(G)$.

Suppose $G$ is nilpotent. Then $G / \Phi(G)$ is abelian. Suppose $X \subseteq G$ generates $G$, and let $Y \subseteq G$ be similar to $X$. Clearly the images of $X$ and $Y$ in the abelian group $G / \Phi(G)$ coincide. Since the image of $X$ generates $G / \Phi(G)$, so does the image of $Y$. It follows that $Y$ generates $G$. We conclude that $X$ invariably generates $G$.

Now suppose $G$ is not nilpotent. We shall construct a generating set $X$ for $G$ that does not generate $G$ invariably using a theorem of Wielandt [Rob, p. 132]: if $G / \Phi(G)$ is abelian then $G$ is nilpotent. Then $G / \Phi(G)$ is not abelian, and hence some maximal subgroup $M$ of $G$ is not normal in $G$. Let $g \in G$ with $M^{g} \neq M$. Let $x \in M^{g} \backslash M$ and $X:=M \cup\{x\}$. Then $\langle X\rangle=G$ since $M$ is maximal, so that $M \cup\left\{x^{g^{-1}}\right\}=M$ is similar to $X$ and is proper in $G$. This implies that $X$ does not generate $G$ invariably.

In particular, for nilpotent $G$ we have $d_{I}(G)=d(G)$. For simple groups, by Theorem 1.3 we also have the same equality (with both sides 2). However, our next result shows that, in general, $d_{I}(G)$ is not bounded above by any function of $d(G)$ :

Proposition 2.5. For every $r \geqslant 1$ there is a finite group $G$ such that $d(G)=2$ but $d_{I}(G) \geqslant r$.
This group $G$ will be a power $T^{k}$ of an alternating group $T$. For this purpose we recall an elementary criterion in [KL, Proposition 6]:

Proposition 2.6. Let $G=T^{k}$ for a non-abelian finite simple group T. Let $S=\left\{s_{1}, \ldots, s_{r}\right\} \subset G$, so that $s_{i}=$ $\left(t_{1}^{i}, \ldots, t_{k}^{i}\right), t_{j}^{i} \in T$. Form the matrix

$$
A=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
t_{1}^{1} & \cdots & t_{k}^{1} \\
& \cdots & \\
t_{1}^{r} & \cdots & t_{k}^{r}
\end{array}\right) .
$$

Then S generates G if and only if the following both hold:
(a) If $1 \leqslant j \leqslant k$ then $T=\left\langle t_{j}^{1}, \ldots, t_{j}^{r}\right\rangle$; and
(b) The columns of $A$ are in different $\operatorname{Aut}(T)$-orbits for the diagonal action of $\operatorname{Aut}(T)$ on $T^{r}$.

Proof of Proposition 2.5. Fix $n$, let $T=A_{n}$ and let $k=k(n)$ be the largest integer such that $d(G)=2$, where $G:=G_{n}=T^{k}$. Then $k \geqslant n!/ 8$ ([KL, Example 2], obtained from Proposition 2.6).

Let $S$ be as in Proposition 2.6, and assume that $S$ invariably generates $G$. Then we can arbitrarily conjugate each $t_{j}^{i}$ independently and still generate $G$. Let $\mathbf{C}(T)$ denote the set of conjugacy classes of $T$. Project each column $\beta_{j}$ of $A$ to $\bar{\beta}_{j} \in \mathbf{C}(T)^{r}$. In view of conditions (a) and (b) in Proposition 2.6, the $\bar{\beta}_{j}$ are in different $\operatorname{Aut}(T)$-orbits of the diagonal action on $\mathbf{C}(T)^{r}$.

The number of conjugacy classes in $T$ is at most $c^{\sqrt{n}}$, so $|\mathbf{C}(T)|^{r} \leqslant c^{r \sqrt{n}}$. The number of projections $\bar{\beta}_{j}$ is $k$ (since $1 \leqslant j \leqslant k$ ), where $k \geqslant n!/ 8$. Then $c^{r \sqrt{n}} \geqslant n!/ 8$ by the Pigeon Hole Principle, so that $|S|=r \geqslant C \sqrt{n} \log n$.

## 3. Proof of Theorem 1.1

Let $l(G)$ denote the length of a chief series of $G$. The following is a stronger version of Theorem 1.1:
Theorem 3.1. Let $G$ be a finite group having a chief series with $a$ abelian chief factors and $b$ non-abelian chief factors. Then

$$
d_{I}(G) \leqslant a+2 b .
$$

In particular, $d_{I}(G) \leqslant 2 l(G)$, and if $G$ is solvable then $d_{I}(G) \leqslant l(G)$.

Proof. We use induction on $|G|$ (the case $|G|=1$ being trivial). Suppose $|G|>1$ and let $N \triangleleft G$ be a minimal normal subgroup of $G$. It suffices to show that

$$
d_{I}(G) \leqslant d_{I}(G / N)+c,
$$

where $c=1$ if $N$ is abelian and $c=2$ if $N$ is non-abelian. In the latter case our proof relies on Theorem 5.1 (proved below).

Let $X \subseteq G$ be a set of size $d_{I}(G / N)$ whose image in $G / N$ generates $G / N$ invariably.
Suppose first that $N$ is abelian. Let $x \in N$ be any non-identity element of $N$. We claim that $Y=X \cup\{x\}$ invariably generates $G$. Indeed, suppose $Z \subseteq G$ is similar to $Y$. Then the image of $Z$ in $G / N$ generates $G / N$ (by the assumption on $X$ ). Moreover, $Z$ contains a conjugate $z=x^{g}$ that is a non-identity element of $N$. Since $G / N$ acts irreducibly on $N,\langle Z\rangle \geqslant N$. It follows that $\langle Z\rangle=G$, so $Y$ generates $G$ invariably. Thus $d_{I}(G) \leqslant d_{I}(G / N)+1$ in this case.

Now suppose $N$ is non-abelian. Then $N=T_{1} \times \cdots \times T_{k}$, where $k \geqslant 1$ and the $T_{i}$ are non-abelian finite simple groups such that the conjugation action of $G$ on $N$ induces a transitive action of $G / N$ on the set $\left\{T_{1}, \ldots, T_{k}\right\}$.

The group $A:=N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right) / C_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$ is an almost simple group with socle $T_{1}^{\star}:=T_{1} C_{G}\left(T_{1}\right) / C_{G}\left(T_{1}\right) \cong T_{1}$. By Theorem 5.1, there are elements $x_{1} \in T_{1}^{\star}, x_{2} \in A$ such that $\left\langle x_{1}^{a_{1}}, x_{2}^{a_{2}}\right\rangle \geqslant T_{1}^{\star}$ for all $a_{1}, a_{2} \in A$. Let $y_{1} \in T_{1}, y_{2} \in N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$, be pre-images of $x_{1}, x_{2}$, respectively. We claim that $Y:=X \cup\left\{y_{1}, y_{2}\right\}$ invariably generates $G$.

To see this, let $Z$ be a set similar to $Y$, so $Z=X^{\prime} \cup\left\{y_{1}^{g_{1}}, y_{2}^{g_{2}}\right\}$ where $X^{\prime}$ is similar to $X$ and $g_{i} \in G(i=1,2)$. We need to show that $Z$ generates $G$. Let $K=\langle Z\rangle$ and $H=\left\langle X^{\prime}\right\rangle$. Since $X$ invariably generates $G$ modulo $N$ we have $H N=G$. Hence $H$ acts transitively (by conjugation) on $\left\{T_{1}, \ldots, T_{k}\right\}$.

Moreover, $T_{1}^{g_{1}}=T_{i}$ and $T_{1}^{g_{2}}=T_{j}$ for some $i, j$. By the transitivity of $H$ there are elements $h_{1}, h_{2} \in$ $H$ such that $T_{i}^{h_{1}}=T_{1}$ and $T_{j}^{h_{2}}=T_{1}$. Then $g_{1} h_{1}, g_{2} h_{2} \in N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$.

Clearly $y_{1}^{g_{1} h_{1}} \in T_{1}^{g_{1} h_{1}}=T_{1}$ and $y_{2}^{g_{2} h_{2}} \in N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)^{g_{2} h_{2}}=N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$. Then $y_{1}^{g_{1} h_{1}}$ and $y_{2}^{g_{2} h_{2}}$ induce automorphisms of $T_{1}$ by conjugation. In view of our choice of $x_{1}$ and $x_{2},\left\langle y_{1}^{g_{1} h_{1}}, y_{2}^{g_{2} h_{2}}\right\rangle$ induces all inner automorphisms of $T_{1}$. In particular, the conjugates of the element $y_{1}^{g_{1} h_{1}} \in T_{1}$ under this group generate the simple group $T_{1}$. Thus, $K \geqslant\left\langle y_{1}^{g_{1} h_{1}}, y_{2}^{g_{2} h_{2}}, H\right\rangle \geqslant T_{1}$, so that $K \geqslant T_{i}$ for all $i$ and hence $G=K N=K$, as required.

We see that $d_{I}(G) \leqslant d_{I}(G / N)+2$ in the non-abelian case. This completes the proof of the first assertion in the theorem. The last two assertions follow immediately.

We can now complete the proof of Theorem 1.1. Let $G, a, b$ be as above. Every abelian chief factor of $G$ has order at least 2 , while every non-abelian chief factor has order at least 60 . This yields $|G| \geqslant 2^{a} 60^{b}$, so that

$$
\log _{2}|G| \geqslant a+\left(\log _{2} 60\right) b \geqslant a+2 b \geqslant d_{I}(G),
$$

as required. Moreover, if $d_{I}(G)=\log _{2}|G|$ then we must have $b=0$, and all chief factors of $G$ have order 2. Thus $G$ is a 2-group, so that $d_{I}(G)=d(G)=\log _{2}|G|$ by Proposition 2.4. Now $d(G)=\log _{2}|G|$ easily implies that $G$ is an elementary abelian 2-group.

Note that the bound in Theorem 3.1 is tight both for non-abelian simple groups and for elementary abelian $p$-groups.

## 4. Proof of Theorem 1.2

The main result of this section is the following.

Theorem 4.1. For any $\epsilon>0$ there exists $c=c(\epsilon)$ such that $P_{I}(G, k) \geqslant 1-\epsilon$ for any finite group $G$ and any $k \geqslant c|G|^{1 / 2}(\log |G|)^{1 / 2}$.

Proof. For $M \leqslant G$ let $M_{G}=\bigcap_{g \in G} M^{g}$ denote the core of $M$ in $G$, the kernel of the permutation action of $G$ on the set of conjugates of $M$.

Divide the set $\mathcal{M}$ of representatives of conjugacy classes of maximal subgroups of $G$ into three subsets $\mathcal{M}_{1}, \mathcal{M}_{2}, \mathcal{M}_{3}$ as follows. The set $\mathcal{M}_{1}$ consists of the subgroups $M \in \mathcal{M}$ such that the primitive group $G / M_{G}$ is not of affine type. The set $\mathcal{M}_{2}$ consists of the subgroups $M \in \mathcal{M}$ such that the primitive group $G / M_{G}$ is of affine type and $|G: M| \leqslant|G|^{1 / 2} /(\log |G|)^{1 / 2}$. Finally, $\mathcal{M}_{3}$ consists of the remaining subgroups in $\mathcal{M}$, namely the subgroups $M$ such that $G / M_{G}$ is affine and $|G: M|>|G|^{1 / 2} /(\log |G|)^{1 / 2}$.

By [LPS, Theorem 1.3], for any finite group $G$ we have $|\operatorname{Max}(G)| \leqslant c_{1}|G|^{3 / 2}$, where $c_{1}$ is an absolute constant. In particular, for $i=1,2,3$,

$$
\left|\mathcal{M}_{i}\right| \leqslant|\mathcal{M}| \leqslant c_{1}|G|^{3 / 2}
$$

Fix $k \geqslant 1$ and let $g_{1}, \ldots, g_{k} \in G$ be randomly chosen (we will restrict $k$ in later parts of the proof). By Lemma 2.1,

$$
1-P_{I}(G, k) \leqslant P_{1}+P_{2}+P_{3}
$$

where $P_{i}$ is the probability that $g_{1}, \ldots, g_{k} \in \tilde{M}$ for some $M \in \mathcal{M}_{i}(i=1,2,3)$. It suffices to show that, for $k$ as in the statement of the theorem, $P_{i}<\epsilon / 3$ for $i=1,2,3$.

We bound each of the probabilities $P_{i}$ separately. By increasing the constant $c$ we may assume that $|G|$ is as large as required in various parts of the proof.

The set $\mathcal{M}_{1}$. To bound $P_{1}$ we use [FG1, Theorem 8.1]: the proportion of fixed-point-free permutations in a non-affine primitive group of degree $n$ is at least $c_{2} / \log n$, for some absolute constant $c_{2}>0$. This shows that, for $M \in \mathcal{M}_{1}$,

$$
v(M) \leqslant 1-c_{2} / \log |G: M| \leqslant 1-c_{2} / \log |G|
$$

By Lemma 2.3 and its proof,

$$
P_{1} \leqslant \sum_{M \in \mathcal{M}_{1}} v(M)^{k} \leqslant\left|\mathcal{M}_{1}\right|\left(1-c_{2} / \log |G|\right)^{k} \leqslant c_{1}|G|^{3 / 2}\left(1-c_{2} / \log |G|\right)^{k}
$$

Since $(1-x)^{k} \leqslant \exp (-k x)$ for $0<x<1$, for any $c_{3}>\log c_{1}+3 / 2$ the right-hand side is bounded above by $\exp \left(c_{3} \log |G|-c_{2} k / \log |G|\right)$. If $k>c_{4}(\log |G|)^{2}$ for a suitable absolute constant $c_{4}$, then the latter expression tends to zero as $|G| \rightarrow \infty$, and hence so does $P_{1}$. In particular we have $P_{1}<\epsilon / 3$ for $|G|$ large enough.

The set $\mathcal{M}_{2}$. We next bound $P_{2}$. Here our main tool is the theorem that the proportion of fixed-point-free elements in any transitive permutation group of degree $n$ is at least $1 / n$ [CC]. This implies that, if $M \in \mathcal{M}_{2}$, then

$$
v(M) \leqslant 1-|G: M|^{-1} \leqslant 1-(|G| / \log |G|)^{-1 / 2} .
$$

Therefore

$$
P_{2} \leqslant \sum_{M \in \mathcal{M}_{2}} v(M)^{k} \leqslant\left|\mathcal{M}_{2}\right|\left(1-(|G| / \log |G|)^{-1 / 2}\right)^{k} \leqslant c_{1}|G|^{3 / 2}\left(1-(|G| / \log |G|)^{-1 / 2}\right)^{k} .
$$

As before the right side is bounded above by $\exp \left(c_{3} \log |G|-k(|G| / \log |G|)^{-1 / 2}\right)$ for suitable $c_{3}>3 / 2$. This in turn tends to zero as $|G| \rightarrow \infty$ for any $k>c_{5}|G|^{1 / 2}(\log |G|)^{1 / 2}$, for arbitrary $c_{5}>c_{3}$. Therefore $P_{2} \rightarrow 0$ for such $k$, and $P_{2}<\epsilon / 3$ for all sufficiently large $|G|$.

The set $\mathcal{M}_{3}$. Finally we bound $P_{3}$. If $M \in \mathcal{M}_{3}$ then $G / M_{G}=V \rtimes H$, where $V$ is an elementary abelian $p$-group for some prime $p$, acting regularly on the set of cosets of $M$ in $G$, and $H$ is a pointstabilizer acting irreducibly on $V$.

Fix a chief series $\left\{G_{i}\right\}$ of $G$. Fix $M \in \mathcal{M}_{3}$, and let $\pi: G \rightarrow G / M_{G}$ be the canonical projection. The series $\left\{\pi\left(G_{i}\right)\right\}$ of normal subgroups of $\pi(G)=G / M_{G}$ descends from $G / M_{G}=V \rtimes H$ to 1 . If $i$ is minimal such that $\pi\left(G_{i+1}\right)=1$, then $\pi\left(G_{i}\right)$ is a minimal normal subgroup of $G / M_{G}$, and hence is $V$, the unique minimal normal subgroup of $G / M_{G}$. In this situation we shall say that $M$ uses $G_{i} / G_{i+1}$, in which case $G_{i} / G_{i+1} \cong V$. (For, since $\pi\left(G_{i}\right)=\pi\left(G_{i}\right) / \pi\left(G_{i+1}\right)$ is a nontrivial $G$-homomorphic image of $G_{i} / G_{i+1}$ it is isomorphic to $G_{i} / G_{i+1}$.) We have seen that every $M \in \mathcal{M}_{3}$ uses $G_{i} / G_{i+1}$ for a unique $i$. Moreover, since $M \in \mathcal{M}_{3}$,

$$
\left|G_{i}: G_{i+1}\right|=|V|=|G: M|>(|G| / \log |G|)^{1 / 2} .
$$

We claim that, if G is sufficiently large, then it has at most two abelian chief factors used by any maximal subgroups in $\mathcal{M}_{3}$. Indeed, if there were (at least) three such chief factors, appearing at places $i>j>l$ in our chief series, then we would obtain the contradiction

$$
|G| \geqslant\left|G_{i}: G_{i+1}\right|\left|G_{j}: G_{j+1}\right|\left|G_{l}: G_{l+1}\right|>\left((|G| / \log |G|)^{1 / 2}\right)^{3} .
$$

Fix an abelian chief factor $V=G_{i} / G_{i+1}$ of $G$ as above. Then each $g \in G_{i} \backslash G_{i+1}$ acts fixed-pointfreely on the cosets of any $M$ that uses $G_{i} / G_{i+1}$ (since $g M_{G} \in V \backslash\{1\}$ ). For each such $M$ we have $\widetilde{M} \subseteq G \backslash\left(G_{i} \backslash G_{i+1}\right)$. Since

$$
\left|G: G_{i}\right| \leqslant|G| /\left|G_{i}: G_{i+1}\right|=|G| /|V| \leqslant(|G| \log |G|)^{1 / 2}
$$

by the definition of $\mathcal{M}_{3}$, the proportion of elements $g \in G_{i} \backslash G_{i+1}$ inside $G$ is at least $\frac{1}{2}\left|G: G_{i}\right|^{-1} \geqslant$ $\frac{1}{2}(|G| \log |G|)^{-1 / 2}$. Since the union of $\widetilde{M}^{k}$ over all $M$ using $G_{i} / G_{i+1}$ is contained in $\left(G \backslash\left(G_{i} \backslash G_{i+1}\right)\right)^{k}$, it follows that the probability that randomly chosen elements $g_{1}, \ldots, g_{k}$ of $G$ all lie in $\widetilde{M}$ for some such $M$ is at most $\left(1-\frac{1}{2}(|G| \log |G|)^{-1 / 2}\right)^{k}$. Although there may be many choices for $M$ in $\mathcal{M}_{3}$, there are at most two choices for the chief factor $G_{i} / G_{i+1}$. Thus,

$$
P_{3} \leqslant 2\left(1-\frac{1}{2}(|G| \log |G|)^{-1 / 2}\right)^{k} \leqslant 2 \exp \left(-\frac{k}{2}(|G| \log |G|)^{-1 / 2}\right),
$$

where the right-hand side is less than $\epsilon / 3$ for $k \geqslant c(|G| \log |G|)^{1 / 2}$ for some $c=c(\epsilon)$.
Our bounds on the three probabilities $P_{i}$ complete the proof.

Remark. Recall that the $\epsilon$-conjecture, posed by the third author of this paper, states that there exists an absolute constant $\epsilon>0$ such that the proportion of fixed-point-free elements in any finite simple transitive permutation group is at least $\epsilon$. This amounts to saying that $v(M) \leqslant 1-\epsilon$ for any finite simple group $G$ and any $M \in \operatorname{Max}(G)$. This conjecture holds for alternating groups [LuP] and for Lie type groups of bounded rank [FG1, Sections 3 and 4]. Moreover, in [FG1, Theorem 1.3] it is announced that the $\epsilon$-conjecture holds in general, and proofs in some additional cases appear in [FG2]. When $M \in \mathcal{M}_{1}$ our proof of Theorem 4.1 uses [FG1, Theorem 8.1], which in turn relies on the $\epsilon$-conjecture. However, we now show that Theorem 5.5 below easily yields a weaker version of [FG1, Theorem 8.1] that still suffices for our purpose.

The set $\mathcal{M}_{1}$ revisited. Namely, we claim that there exists $c_{2}>0$ such that

$$
v(M) \leqslant 1-c_{2}(\log |G|)^{-2}|G|^{-1 / 3},
$$

where $G$ is any non-affine primitive permutation group and $M$ is a point-stabilizer. For, if $s_{1}, s_{2}$ generate $G$ invariably, and if $M \in \operatorname{Max}(G)$, then $\widetilde{M} \cap s_{i}^{G}=\emptyset$ for $i=1$ or 2 , in which case $v(M) \leqslant 1-\left|s_{i}^{G}\right| /|G|$. Then $v(M) \leqslant 1-\frac{1}{2}|G|^{-1 / 3}$ for each sufficiently large finite simple group $G$ and each such $M$, by Theorem 5.5. This implies that, for all finite simple groups $G$ and all $M \in \operatorname{Max}(G)$, we have $v(M) \leqslant$ $1-c_{3}|G|^{-1 / 3}$ for some constant $c_{3}>0$.

Consequently, if $G$ is an almost simple group with socle $T$ then, since $|\operatorname{Out}(T)| \leqslant c_{4} \log |T|$ (cf. [GLS, Section 2.5 ]), we easily obtain

$$
v(M) \leqslant 1-c_{5}(\log |G|)^{-1}|G|^{-1 / 3}
$$

for all $M \in \operatorname{Max}(G)$ not containing $T$, for some $c_{5}>0$. Our claim follows by combining this inequality with the reduction to almost simple groups given in the proof of [FG1, Theorem 8.1].

Thus, if $M \in \mathcal{M}_{1}$, then the above claim yields

$$
P_{1} \leqslant \sum_{M \in \mathcal{M}_{1}} v(M)^{k} \leqslant c_{1} \log |G|\left(1-c_{2}(\log |G|)^{-2}|G|^{-1 / 3}\right)^{k} .
$$

The right-hand side tends to zero when $k \geqslant c_{6}(\log |G|)^{3}|G|^{1 / 3}$; but for the proof of Theorem 4.1 we can assume the stronger inequality $k \geqslant c_{7}|G|^{1 / 2}(\log |G|)^{1 / 2}$. Consequently $P_{1} \rightarrow 0$, as required.

Completion of proof of Theorem 1.2. Apply Theorem 4.1 with $\epsilon=1 / 2$ and let $c=c(1 / 2)$. Let $k=$ $\left\lceil c|G|^{1 / 2}(\log |G|)^{1 / 2}\right\rceil$. Then $k$ randomly chosen elements of $G$ invariably generate $G$ with probability at least $1 / 2$. This implies that

$$
C(G) \leqslant 2 k \leqslant(2 c+1)|G|^{1 / 2}(\log |G|)^{1 / 2} .
$$

## Corollary 4.2.

(a) If $G$ is a finite group without abelian composition factors, then $C(G)=O\left((\log |G|)^{2}\right)$.
(b) If $G$ is an almost simple group, then $C(G)=0(\log |G| \log \log |G|)$.

Proof. We have already seen (a) in our first treatment of the non-affine case ( $M \in \mathcal{M}_{1}$ ) of Theorem 4.1.

To prove (b) we first note that, for some $c>0$ and all $M \in \mathcal{M}$, we have $v(M) \leqslant 1-c / \log |G|$. Indeed, if $M$ has trivial core then this follows from [FG1, Theorem 8.1] (and hence from the correctness of the $\epsilon$-conjecture stated above). Otherwise, $M$ contains the simple socle $T$ of $G$, and $|G / T| \leqslant|\operatorname{Out}(T)| \leqslant c_{4} \log |T| \leqslant c_{4} \log |G|$ as noted above. In this situation, if $g \in G$ acts fixed-pointfreely on the cosets of $M$ in $G$, so do all the elements of $g T$, so that $v(M) \leqslant 1-c_{4}^{-1} / \log |G|$.

By [GLT, Theorem 1.3], $|\mathcal{M}| \leqslant c_{1}(\log |G|)^{3}$ when $G$ is almost simple. This yields

$$
\sum_{M \in \mathcal{M}} v(M)^{k} \leqslant c_{1}(\log |G|)^{3}(1-c / \log |G|)^{k} \leqslant c_{1}(\log |G|)^{3} \exp (-c k / \log |G|) .
$$

The right-hand side tends to zero as $|G| \rightarrow \infty$ when $k \geqslant c_{2} \log |G| \log \log |G|$. This proves part (b).
We observe that the bound in (b) is almost best possible, up to the $\log \log |G|$ factor. To show this we use the following example [FG1, p. 115]. Fix any prime $p$. Let $G=\operatorname{PSL}\left(2, p^{b}\right) . b$, the extension of the simple group by the group $B$ of $b$ field automorphisms, where $b$ is a prime not dividing $p\left(p^{2}-1\right)$. Let $G$ act on the cosets of the maximal subgroup $N_{G}(B)$ of $G$. Then all fixed-point-free elements are contained in the socle of $G$, so their proportion is less than $1 / b$. Therefore $v(M) \geqslant 1-1 / b$.

Hence, by Lemma 2.3, $P_{I}(G, k) \leqslant 1-(1-1 / b)^{k}$, so that for sufficiently large $b$ we obtain

$$
P_{I}(G, k) \leqslant 1-\left(1-c_{1} / \log |G|\right)^{k} \leqslant 1-\exp \left(-c_{2} k / \log |G|\right),
$$

where $c_{1}, c_{2}$ are suitable constants. Thus $P_{I}(G, k) \leqslant 1 / 2$ for all $k \leqslant c_{3} \log |G|$, where $c_{3}>0$ is an absolute constant. The probability that it takes at least $k+1$ random choices of elements to invariably generate $G$ is $1-P_{I}(G, k)$. By the definition of the expectancy $C(G)$ we have $C(G) \geqslant(k+1)(1-$ $\left.P_{I}(G, k)\right)$. If $k=\left[c_{3} \log |G|\right]$ then $1-P_{I}(G, k) \geqslant 1 / 2$ and $k+1 \geqslant c_{3} \log |G|$. This yields $C(G) \geqslant(k+$ $1)(1 / 2) \geqslant\left(c_{3} / 2\right) \log |G|$.

## 5. Simple groups

We will prove the following slightly stronger version of Theorem 1.3:
Theorem 5.1. Let $G$ be a finite simple group.
(a) If $G$ is not one of the groups $\mathrm{P} \Omega^{+}(8, q), q=2$ or 3 , then there are two elements $s_{1}, s_{2} \in G$ such that $G=\left\langle s_{1}^{g_{1}}, s_{2}^{g_{2}}\right\rangle$ for each choice of $g_{i} \in \operatorname{Aut}(G)$.
(b) If $G$ is $P \Omega^{+}(8, q), q=2$ or 3 , and if $G \leqslant G^{\star} \leqslant \operatorname{Aut}(G)$, then there are elements $s_{1} \in G, s_{2} \in G^{\star}$ such that $G \leqslant\left\langle s_{1}^{g_{1}}, s_{2}^{g_{2}}\right\rangle$ for each choice of $g_{i} \in G^{\star}$.

Of course, Theorem 1.3 is just (a) using inner automorphisms. This theorem is also obtained in [GM2, Theorem 7.1], along with the fact that $\mathrm{P} \Omega^{+}(8,2)$ is an actual exception.

We begin with the easiest case:
Lemma 5.2. Theorem 5.1 holds for each alternating group $A_{n}, n \geqslant 5$.
Proof. If $n \neq 6$ then $\operatorname{Aut}\left(A_{n}\right)=S_{n}$. For even $n>6$ use the product of a disjoint 2-cycle and ( $n-2$ )cycle, and the product of a disjoint $p$-cycle and ( $n-p$ )-cycle for a prime $p \leqslant n-3$ not dividing $n$; it is easy to check that such a prime exists. These two elements generate a group $H$ that is readily seen to be transitive and even primitive. Since $H$ contains a $p$-cycle, $H=A_{n}$ by a classical result of Jordan [Wie, Theorem 13.9].

If $n$ is odd then an $n$-cycle and a $p$-cycle can be used in the same manner, for an odd prime $p \leqslant n-3$ not dividing $n$.

Finally, $A_{6}$ is generated by any elements of order 4 and 5 .
For groups of Lie type we will use the knowledge of all maximal overgroups $M$ of a carefully chosen semisimple element $t_{1}$. Then, by Lemma 2.1, we only need to choose an Aut $(G)$-conjugacy class of elements that does not meet the union of the corresponding sets $\widetilde{M}$. Our arguments differ from those in [GM2] primarily due to that paper using [GM1] whereas we rely more on the earlier paper [MSW].

Table 1
Classical groups.

| Quasisimple $G$ | $\left\|t_{1}\right\|$ | $t_{1}$ on $V$ | $\left\|t_{2}\right\|$ | $\left(q_{2}\right.$ on $V$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $\mathrm{SL}(n, q), n$ odd | $\left(q^{n}-1\right) /(q-1)$ | $n$ | $\left(q^{n}-1\right) /(q-1)$ | $(n-1) \oplus 1$ |
| $\mathrm{SL}(n, q), n \geqslant 4$ even | $\left(q^{n-1}-1\right) /(q-1)$ | $(n-1) \oplus 1$ | $\operatorname{lcm}\left(q^{m-1}+1, q+1\right)$ | $(2 m-2) \perp 2$ |
| $\mathrm{Sp}(2 m, q), m \geqslant 2$ | $q^{m}+1$ | $2 m$ | $\left(q^{m}-1\right) / 2$ | $(m \oplus m) \perp 1$ |
| $\Omega(2 m+1, q), q$ odd | $\left(q^{m}+1\right) / 2$ | $2 m^{-} \perp 1$ | $\operatorname{lcm}\left(q^{n^{\prime}-2}+1, q^{2}+1\right) / \delta_{2}$ | $(n-4)^{-} \perp 4^{-}$ |
| $\Omega^{+}(4 k, q), n=2 n^{\prime}=4 k$ | $\left(q^{n^{\prime}-1}+1\right) / \delta_{1}$ | $(n-2)^{-} \perp 2^{-}$ | $\left(q^{-}\right)$ | $n^{\prime} \oplus n^{\prime}$ |
| $\Omega^{+}(4 k+2, q), 2 n^{\prime}=4 k+2$ | $\left(q^{n^{\prime}-1}+1\right) / \delta_{1}$ | $(n-2)^{-} \perp 2^{-}$ | $\left(q^{n^{\prime}}-1\right) / \delta_{2}$ | $(n-2)^{+} \perp 2^{-}$ |
| $\Omega^{-}(4 k, q), n=2 n^{\prime}=4 k$ | $\left(q^{\left.n^{\prime}+1\right) / \delta_{1}}\right.$ | $n^{-}$ | $\left(q^{n^{\prime}-1}-1\right) / \delta_{2}$ | $4 k^{-} \perp 2^{+}$ |
| $\Omega^{-}(4 k+2, q)$ | $\left(q^{2 k+1}+1\right) / \delta_{1}$ | $(4 k+2)^{-}$ | $\left(q^{2 k}+1\right) / \delta_{2}$ | $2 m$ |
| $\mathrm{SU}(2 m, q)$ | $q^{2 m-1}+1$ | $(2 m-1) \perp 1$ | $\left(q^{2 m}-1\right) /(q+1)$ | $n-1 \perp 1$ |
| $\mathrm{SU}(2 m+1, q)$ | $\left(q^{n}+1\right) /(q+1)$ | $n$ | $q^{n-1}-1$ |  |

Lemma 5.3. Theorem 5.1 holds for each classical simple group other than $\mathrm{P} \Omega^{+}(8, q)$.
Proof. We will consider the corresponding quasisimple linear group $G$, using semisimple elements $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ in Table 1 that decompose the space as indicated in the table. (Here $\delta_{i}$ is 1 or $2, n$ is the dimension of the underlying vector space $V$, and $n^{\prime}=n / 2$. If an entry involves $\operatorname{lcm}\left(q^{i}+1, q^{j}+1\right)$ for some $i, j$, then $t_{2}$ induces irreducible elements of order $q^{i}+1$ or $q^{j}+1$ on the indicated subspaces of dimension $2 i$ or $2 j$.)

In each case, $t_{1}$ is the element called " $s$ " in [MSW, Theorem 1.1]; if there is a 1 - or 2 -space indicated then it is centralized. For each group G, all maximal overgroups of $t_{1}$ are listed in [MSW, Theorem 1.1]. Until the end of the proof we will exclude the case $G=\operatorname{Sp}(4, q)$. Then all automorphisms of $G$ act on $V$, preserving the underlying geometry [GLS, Section 2.5]. It follows that all $\operatorname{Aut}(G)$-conjugates of $t_{i}$ act on $V$ as $t_{i}$ does (for $i=1,2$ ). We always use conjugates of $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ that have no assumed relationship to one another, so if the two elements studied generate $G$ then they invariably generate $G$.

If $G$ is not $\operatorname{SL}(2, q), \operatorname{Sp}(4, q)$ or $\operatorname{Sp}(8,2)$, then $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ invariably generate $G$ by [MSW, Theorem 1.1]: all of the exceptions in that theorem do not arise here due to the behavior of both $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ on $V$. If $G=\operatorname{Sp}(8,2)$ then we replace $t_{2}$ by another element, as follows. Let $f \in G$ have order 5 and centralize a nondegenerate 4 -space. Then $C_{G}(f)=\langle f\rangle \times \operatorname{Sp}(4,2)$. Let $c=(1,2)(3,4,5,6) \in S_{6} \cong$ $\operatorname{Sp}(4,2)<C_{G}(f)$. Then $c \notin S_{5} \cong \Omega^{-}(4,2)$, and hence $f c$ is not in an overgroup $\Omega^{-}(8,2)$ of $t_{1}$. Since its order implies that $f c$ is also not in any of the other maximal overgroups of $t_{1}$ [MSW, Theorem 1.1], it follows that $t_{1}$ and $f c$ invariably generate $G$.

Case $\operatorname{SL}(2, q)$. When $q$ is 4,5 or 9 , see Lemma 5.2 . When $q=7$, elements of order 7 and 4 invariably generate $G$. For all other $q \geqslant 4$, the same $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ as indicated in the table (but with $t_{1}$ acting irreducibly on each 1 -space) invariably generate $G$ by [Di, Ch. XII].

Case $\operatorname{Sp}(4, q)$. We may assume that $q \geqslant 4$ since $\operatorname{Sp}(4,2)$ is not simple and $\operatorname{PSp}(4,3) \cong \operatorname{PSU}(4,2)$. We again use $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ as in the table, such that $t_{2}$ induces an element of order $q+1$ inside the $\mathrm{Sp}(2, q)$ produced by each factor in the decomposition $4=2 \perp 2$. Once again $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ invariably generate $G$ by [MSW, Theorem 1.1].

We note that classical groups were considered in [NP, Section 10] from a probabilistic point of view: a large number of pairs of elements was described that invariably generate various classical groups. The group $\mathrm{GL}(n, q)$ was also handled in [Sh] for large $n$. All groups of Lie type also were dealt with probabilistically, at least for bounded rank, in [FG1, Theorem 5.3].

Lemma 5.4. Theorem 5.1 holds for $\mathrm{P} \Omega^{+}(8, q)$.
Proof. Once again we will consider the corresponding linear group $G=\Omega^{+}(8, q)$, using the properties of $\operatorname{Aut}(G / Z(G))$ contained in [GLS, Section 2.5]. We have $G / Z(G) \leqslant G^{\star} \leqslant \operatorname{Aut}(G / Z(G))$.
(a) Suppose first that $q>3$. We will use the same $\left\langle t_{1}\right\rangle$ as above $\left(\bmod Z(G)\right.$ ), of order ( $q^{3}+$ $1) /(2, q-1)$. It acts on our space as $8^{+}=6^{-} \perp 2^{-}$, centralizing the 2 -space.

We also use an element $t_{3} \in G$ of order $\left(q^{3}-1\right) /(2, q-1)$. Here $t_{3}$ decomposes our space as $8^{+}=(3 \oplus 3) \perp(1 \oplus 1)$ using totally singular 3 - and 1 -spaces, inducing isometries of order $q-1$ on the subspace $1 \oplus 1$ and of order $q^{3}-1$ on the subspace $3 \oplus 3$, and hence acting irreducibly on the indicated 3 -spaces. Then $t_{3}$ fixes exactly two singular 1 -spaces, and two totally singular 4 -spaces in each $G$-orbit of such 4 -spaces (each of the latter fixed subspaces has the form $3 \perp 1$ ). If $\tau$ is any automorphism of $G / Z(G)$, then $t_{3}^{\tau}$ has the same properties. In particular, neither $t_{3}$ nor $t_{3}^{\tau}$ fixes any anisotropic 1- or 2 -space for any $\tau \in \operatorname{Aut}(G / Z(G))$. (N.B.-This requires that $q>3$ : if $q=3$ then the analogous element $t_{3}$ induces -1 on the $2^{+}$-space $1 \oplus 1$ and hence fixes all of its 1 -spaces.) However, by [MSW, Theorem 1.1] each maximal subgroup of $G / Z(G)$ that contains $t_{1}(\bmod Z(G))$ either fixes such a 1 - or 2 -space or its image under a triality automorphism behaves that way. Hence, there is no maximal subgroup containing $t_{1}$ and $t_{3} \bmod Z(G)$, and we have invariably generated $G / Z(G)$.
(b) From now on $q \leqslant 3$. First consider the case where $G^{\star}$ acts (projectively) on $V$ (this includes the situation in Theorem 1.3). We use elements $t_{3}$ and $t_{4}$ of $G / Z(G)$ of order $\left(q^{4}-1\right) /\left(4, q^{4}-1\right)$ arising from a decomposition $8^{+}=4^{-} \perp 2^{-} \perp 2^{+}$and from a decomposition $8^{+}=4 \oplus 4$ into totally singular 4 -spaces (the corresponding cyclic groups $\left\langle t_{i}\right\rangle$ are conjugate under $\operatorname{Aut}(G / Z(G))$ but not under $\left.G^{\star}\right)$. The Sylow 5 -subgroups of $\left\langle t_{3}\right\rangle$ and $\left\langle t_{4}\right\rangle$ behave differently on the vector space, and $\left\langle t_{4}\right\rangle$ is an element of order $\left(q^{4}-1\right) /\left(4, q^{4}-1\right)$ that acts fixed-point-freely on $V$. Hence, by $[\mathrm{KI}],\left\langle t_{3}, t_{4}\right\rangle$ is contained in no proper subgroup of $G$, so that $\left\langle t_{3}, t_{4}\right\rangle=G$.

Finally, suppose that $G^{\star}$ does not have any $\operatorname{Aut}(G / Z(G))$-conjugate that acts on $V$. Here we return to the original setting of the theorem, now letting $G$ denote the simple group $\mathrm{P}^{+}(8, q)$. Since $\operatorname{Out}(G) \cong S_{4}$ or $S_{3}$, we may assume that $G^{\star}$ contains a triality outer automorphism. Consequently, there is a subgroup $\mathbb{Z}_{3} \times \operatorname{SL}(3, q)$ of $G^{\star}$ that contains an element $t_{5}$ of order $3\left(q^{2}+q+1\right)$ such that $\tau=t_{5}^{q^{2}+q+1}$ is a triality automorphism and $t_{5}^{3}$ acts projectively on $V$ as $8^{+}=(3 \oplus 3) \perp(1 \oplus 1)$.

By [MSW, Theorem 1.1], $\left\langle t_{1}, t_{5}\right\rangle \cap G \geqslant\left\langle t_{1}, t_{5}^{3}\right\rangle$ is either $G, \Omega(7, q)$ or lies in $A_{9}<\Omega^{+}(8,2)$. Since $\left\langle t_{1}, t_{5}\right\rangle \cap G$ is invariant under $\tau$, only the first of these can occur (for example, $\left\langle t_{1}, t_{5}\right\rangle \cap G$ cannot be $A_{9}$ or $\left.\operatorname{PSL}(2,8)<A_{9}\right)$. Thus, $t_{1}$ and $t_{5}$ invariably generate $G\langle\tau\rangle$.

Completion of proof. In [GM1, Tables 6 and 9] there are lists of carefully chosen cyclic subgroups of exceptional and sporadic simple groups, as well as all of the maximal overgroups $M$ of those subgroups. It is straightforward to use those tables to handle these final cases of Theorem 5.1. This amounts to exhibiting an element order for $G$ not appearing in any of the listed subgroups $M$. We provide some details for the exceptional groups. Table 2 reproduces part of [GM1, Table 6]. Here $T_{1}$ is a cyclic maximal torus and $M$ runs through the isomorphism types of maximal overgroups of $T_{1}$. (Notation: $\epsilon= \pm 1, \Phi_{n}=\Phi_{n}(q)$ is the $n$th cyclotomic polynomial evaluated at $q, \Phi_{8}^{\prime}=\Phi_{8}^{\prime}(q)=$ $q^{2}+\sqrt{2} q+1, \Phi_{12}^{\prime}=\Phi_{12}^{\prime}(q)=q^{2}+\sqrt{3} q+1$ and $\Phi_{24}^{\prime}=\Phi_{24}^{\prime}(q)=q^{4}+\sqrt{2} q^{3}+q^{2}+\sqrt{2} q+1$.) In each case, the order of $t_{2}$ guarantees that it is not contained in any of the listed maximal overgroups $M$ (there are also other choices for $t_{2}$ ). Hence, a generator of $T_{1}$ together with $t_{2}$ behave as required in the theorem.

In Section 4 we needed a bit more information than in the preceding theorem for an alternative proof of Theorem 4.1 and hence of Theorem 1.2:

Theorem 5.5. For all sufficiently large $G$ in Theorem 5.1, the elements $s_{i}$ can be chosen so that $\left|s_{i}^{G}\right|>|G|^{2 / 3} / 2$ for $i=1,2$.

Proof. This is a straightforward matter of examining each part of the proof of Theorem 5.1. In each case we need to check that $\left|C_{G}\left(s_{i}\right)\right|<2|G|^{1 / 3}$ for $i=1,2$ and all sufficiently large $|G|$.

For alternating groups, when $n$ is even each of the groups $C_{G}(s)$ is the direct product of two cyclic groups, and hence has order satisfying the required bound. When $n$ is odd the same holds if we replace the $p$-cycle by the product of a disjoint $p$-cycle and an $(n-p)$-cycle (a power of which is a p-cycle).

In Lemma 5.3-excluding $\operatorname{SL}(2, q)$-we have $\left|C_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)\right| \sim q^{r}$ and $\left|C_{G}\left(t_{2}\right)\right| \sim q^{r}$, where $r$ is the rank of the corresponding algebraic group. (For example, for $\operatorname{SL}(n, q)$ we have $\left|C_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)\right|=\left(q^{n}-1\right) /(q-1)$

Table 2
Exceptional groups.

| G | $\left\|T_{1}\right\|$ | $M \geqslant T_{1}$ | Further max. | $\left\|t_{2}\right\|$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ${ }^{2} B_{2}\left(q^{2}\right), q^{2} \geqslant 8$ | $\Phi_{8}^{\prime}$ | $N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$ | - | $\Phi_{8}^{\prime}(-q)$ |
| ${ }^{2} \mathrm{G}_{2}\left(q^{2}\right), q^{2} \geqslant 27$ | $\Phi_{12}^{\prime}$ | $N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$ | - | $\Phi_{12}^{\prime}(-q)$ |
| $\mathrm{G}_{2}(q), 3 \mid q+\epsilon$ | $q^{2}+\epsilon q+1$ | $\mathrm{SL}^{\epsilon}(3, q) .2$ | $\operatorname{PSL}(2,13)(q=4)$ | $q^{2}-\epsilon q+1$ |
| $\mathrm{G}_{2}(q), 3 \mid q$ | $q^{2}+q+1$ | $\mathrm{SL}(3, q) .2$ | $\operatorname{PSL}(2,13)(q=3)$ | $q^{2}-q+1$ |
| ${ }^{3} D_{4}(q)$ | $\Phi_{12}$ | $N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$ |  | $\left(q^{3}+1\right)(q-1) /(2, q-1)$ |
| ${ }^{2} \mathrm{~F}_{4}\left(q^{2}\right), q^{2} \geqslant 8$ | $\Phi_{24}^{\prime}$ | $N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$ | - |  |
| $F_{4}(q)$ | $\Phi_{12}$ | ${ }^{3} D_{4}(q) .3$ | $\begin{aligned} & \operatorname{PSL}(4,3) \cdot 2_{2}, \\ & { }^{2} F_{4}(2)(q=2), \\ & \operatorname{PSL}(4,3) \cdot 2_{2}(q=2) \end{aligned}$ | $q^{4}+1$ |
| $E_{6}(\underline{q})$ | $\Phi_{9} /(3, q-1)$ | $\mathrm{SL}\left(3, q^{3}\right) .3$ | - | $(q+1)\left(q^{5}-1\right) /(6, q-1)$ |
| ${ }^{2} E_{6}(q)$ | $\Phi_{18} /(3, q+1)$ | $\mathrm{SU}\left(3, q^{3}\right) .3$ | - | $(q-1)\left(q^{5}+1\right) /(6, q+1)$ |
| $E_{7}(q)$ | $\Phi_{2} \Phi_{18} /(2, q-1)$ | ${ }^{2} E_{6}(q)_{s c} \cdot D_{q+1}$ | - | $\Phi_{7} /(2, q-1)$ |
| $E_{8}(q)$ | $\Phi_{30}$ | $N_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)$ | - | $\Phi_{24}$ |

or $q^{n-1}-1$, for $\operatorname{Sp}(2 m, q)$ we have $\left|C_{G}\left(t_{2}\right)\right| \leqslant\left(q^{m-1}+1\right)(q+1)$, and for $\Omega^{+}(4 k+2, q)$ we have $\left|C_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)\right| \leqslant\left(q^{2 k}+1\right)(q+1)$.) A straightforward calculation using $|G|$ verifies that these bounds are small enough for our purposes. When $G=\operatorname{SL}(2, q)$ we have $\left|C_{G}\left(T_{1}\right)\right|=q+1$, so that $\left|s_{i}^{G}\right|>|G|^{2 / 3} / 2$ and a denominator larger than 1 is essential.

Random generation. We conclude with remarks concerning the random generation of finite simple groups. All finite simple groups $G$ are generated by two randomly chosen elements with probability tending to 1 as $|G| \rightarrow \infty$ [Di1,KL,LS]. We claim that this does not hold for invariable generation: the probability that two-or any bounded number of-random elements of a finite simple group $G$ invariably generate $G$ is bounded away from 1 . To show this we need the following result that is implicit in [FG1].

Lemma 5.6. There exists an absolute constant $\epsilon>0$ such that any finite simple group $G$ has a maximal subgroup $M$ for which $v(M) \geqslant \epsilon$.

Proof. This is trivial for alternating groups $A_{n}$, where we take $M$ to be a point-stabilizer in the natural action, so $v(M) \sim 1-e^{-1}$. For groups $G$ of Lie type of bounded rank over a field with $q$ elements we may assume $q$ is large, and then the result follows with $M$ a maximal subgroup containing a maximal torus (see the discussion in [FG1, start of Section 4]). For classical groups of large rank the result follows from [FG1, Theorem 1.7]. Sporadic simple groups satisfy the conclusion trivially.

This lemma can be considered as a kind of weak analogue of the $\epsilon$-conjecture (stated above) but in the opposite direction.

We can now deduce

Corollary 5.7. There is an absolute constant $\epsilon>0$ such that $P_{I}(G, k) \leqslant 1-\epsilon^{k}$ for all finite simple groups $G$ and positive integers $k$.

Proof. This follows by combining the above lemma with Lemma 2.3.

In [FG1, p. 114] it is announced that, for any $\epsilon>0$, there is $c=c(\epsilon)$ such that $P_{I}(G, k) \geqslant 1-\epsilon$ whenever $G$ is a finite simple group of Lie type and $k \geqslant c$. The case of bounded rank is proved in [FG1, Theorem 4.4], and a similar result for alternating groups was proved earlier in [LuP].

Using these results it follows that, for any function $f: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ such that $f(n) \rightarrow \infty$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$ (even if arbitrarily slowly), we have $P_{I}(G, f(|G|)) \rightarrow 1$ for finite simple groups $G$ whose orders tend to infinity.

## References

[CC] P.J. Cameron, A.M. Cohen, On the number of fixed point free elements in a permutation group, Discrete Math. 106/107 (1992) 135-138.
[Di] L.E. Dickson, Linear Groups with an Exposition of the Galois Field Theory, Dover, New York, 1958 (reprint).
[Di1] J.D. Dixon, The probability of generating the symmetric group, Math. Z. 110 (1969) 199-205.
[Di2] J.D. Dixon, Random sets which invariably generate the symmetric group, Discrete Math. 105 (1992) 25-39
[FG1] J. Fulman, R.M. Guralnick, Derangements in simple and primitive groups, in: A.A. Ivanov, M.W. Liebeck, J. Saxl (Eds.), Groups, Combinatorics \& Geometry, Durham 2001, World Sci. Publ., River Edge, NJ, 2003, pp. 99-121.
[FG2] J. Fulman, R.M. Guralnick, Bounds on the number and sizes of conjugacy classes in finite Chevalley groups with applications to derangements, arXiv:0902.2238v1, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc., in press.
[GLS] D. Gorenstein, R. Lyons, R. Solomon, The Classification of the Finite Simple Groups, AMS, Providence, 1998 , Number 3. Part I. Chapter A. Almost simple K-groups.
[GLT] R.M. Guralnick, M. Larsen, P.H. Tiep, Representation growth in positive characteristic and conjugacy classes of maximal subgroups, arXiv:1009.2437.
[GM1] R.M. Guralnick, G. Malle, Products of conjugacy classes and fixed point spaces, arXiv:1005.3756v2.
[GM2] R.M. Guralnick, G. Malle, Simple groups admit Beauville structures, arXiv:1009.6183.
[HNN] G. Higman, B.H. Neumann, H. Neumann, Embedding theorems for groups, J. Lond. Math. Soc. 24 (1949) 247-254.
[Kl] P.B. Kleidman, The maximal subgroups of the finite 8-dimensional orthogonal groups $\mathrm{P} \Omega_{8}^{+}(q)$ and of their automorphism groups, J. Algebra 110 (1987) 173-242.
[KL] W.M. Kantor, A. Lubotzky, The probability of generating a finite classical group, Geom. Dedicata 36 (1990) 67-87.
[KZ] E. Kowalski, D. Zywina, The Chebotarev invariant of a finite group, arXiv:1008.4909v1.
[LPS] M.W. Liebeck, L. Pyber, A. Shalev, On a conjecture of G.E. Wall, J. Algebra 317 (2007) 184-197.
[LS] M.W. Liebeck, A. Shalev, The probability of generating a finite simple group, Geom. Dedicata 56 (1995) 103-113.
[Lu] A. Lubotzky, The expected number of random elements to generate a finite group, J. Algebra 257 (2002) 452-459.
[LuP] T. Łuczak, L. Pyber, On random generation of the symmetric group, Combin. Probab. Comput. 2 (1993) 505-512.
[MSW] G. Malle, J. Saxl, T. Weigel, Generation of classical groups, Geom. Dedicata 49 (1994) 85-116.
[NP] A. Niemeyer, C.E. Praeger, A recognition algorithm for classical groups over finite fields, Proc. Lond. Math. Soc. 77 (1998) 117-169.
[Os] D. Osin, Small cancellations over relatively hyperbolic groups and embedding theorems, Ann. of Math. 172 (2010) 1-39.
[Rob] D.J. Robinson, A Course in the Theory of Groups, Springer, New York, 1982.
[Sh] A. Shalev, A theorem on random matrices and some applications, J. Algebra 199 (1998) 124-141.
[Wie] H. Wielandt, Finite Permutation Groups, Academic Press, New York, London, 1964.


[^0]:    the authors acknowledge partial support from NSF grant DMS 0753640 (W.M.K.), ERC Advanced Grants 226135 (A.L.) and 247034 (A.S.), and ISF grant 754/08 (A.L. and A.S.). The first author is grateful for the warm hospitality of the Hebrew University while this paper was being written.

    * Corresponding author.

    E-mail addresses: kantor@uoregon.edu (W.M. Kantor), alexlub@math.huji.ac.il (A. Lubotzky), shalev@math.huji.ac.il (A. Shalev).

