Full length article

Influence of the composition and viscosity of volcanic ashes on their adhesion within gas turbine aeroengines

J. Dean, C. Taltavull, T.W. Clyne*

Department of Materials Science & Metallurgy, Cambridge University, 27 Charles Babbage Road, Cambridge CB3 0FS, UK

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Article history:
Received 10 January 2016
Received in revised form 2 February 2016
Accepted 5 February 2016
Available online 5 March 2016

Keywords:
Gas turbines
Volcanic ash
Viscosity
Composition
Deposition

A B S T R A C T

This paper presents experimental investigations into adhesion characteristics of four types of (Icelandic) volcanic ash (VA). Firstly, powder (~5–50 μm) was injected into a modified vacuum plasma spray set-up and the fractional mass of particles that adhered to a substrate was measured. Secondly, large (~6 mm), dense pellets of each ash were heated and projected at a substrate, with their impact response monitored via high speed photography. The four ashes fall into two groups of two, one with high Si content (>20%) and the other containing less Si, but higher levels of lower valence cations (such as Ca, Mg & Fe). The glass transition temperatures were all relatively low (~650–750 °C), favouring particle adhesion on surfaces in gas turbines. All of the ashes tended to adhere, especially with higher gas temperatures and impingement velocities. However, this tendency was much greater for the two ashes with high levels of the lower valence cations. The high speed photography confirmed that this was due to these two ashes having much lower viscosities (at high strain rates). This behaviour could not have been predicted solely on the basis of Tg or glass content values. However, these cations act as “network-modifiers” in silica-based glasses, effecting sharp reductions in melt viscosity, so inferences about the danger of specific VA may be possible from simple compositional analysis. In any event, it’s clearly important for VA being generated during any particular eruption to be sampled (presumably by drones) and analysed, rather than relying solely on remote measurement of atmospheric ash levels.

© 2016 Acta Materialia Inc. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

1. Introduction

Gas turbine aeroengines can be seriously and rapidly damaged by ingested ceramic particles, especially ones that are likely to melt, or at least soften, in flight, and then adhere to solid surfaces on impact. Much ingested particulate has a relatively high softening temperature (>1300 °C), but this is not the case [1–4] for most types of volcanic ash (VA), which is therefore perceived as particularly dangerous. It’s certainly true that a high fraction of ingested particles adhering inside the turbine will lead to serious problems. Even at the VA particle concentration currently classed as “safe” by the CAA (2 mg m⁻³), a large turbofan engine at full power will ingest more than 1 g s⁻¹. One gram of adhered particulate, corresponding to ~100 million particles of radius 10 μm, could quickly cause extensive physical damage (blockage of cooling channels etc.), and even much lower levels than this are likely to cause problems such as premature spallation of thermal barrier coatings [5–8].

Of course, there have been increasing levels of concern over the past 20 years about this hazard [9–12], with much attention being devoted to advanced techniques for monitoring concentrations of VA in the atmosphere [13–16]. However, it’s clear that not all suspended particulate, and not all types of VA, are equally hazardous. The particle size is one issue, with particles in the range of ~5–50 μm being of most concern – since they are both large enough to give a Stokes number [2,17–19] that ensures frequent impact with solid surfaces and small enough to become substantially heated during passage through the combustion chamber [4]. Unfortunately, particles in this size range are likely both to remain suspended in the air for long periods (partly due to the relatively low density of most volcanic ashes) and also to enter the combustion chamber of an aeroengine [20,21] (rather than being centrifuged into the by-pass air). Furthermore, VAs can vary substantially in composition (depending primarily on the geology of...
ranging from about 5 μm to around 50–60 μm. A typical size distribution, referring in that case to the Laki ash, is shown in a previous publication [4]. The chemical compositions of the four ashes, obtained from EDX data, are shown in Fig. 1. It can be seen that the concept of there being two groupings is reinforced by this plot, with Laki and Eldgja being similar, as are Hekla and Askja, but with significant differences between the two pairs. The Laki and Eldgja ashes contain only about 15% Si, plus another 20% or so of various other cations, while the Hekla and Askja ashes contain over 20% Si, but less than 15% of the other cations. This is broadly consistent with the concept of material from the Hekla and Askja eruptions being more viscous, since these (low valance) cations are known to act as “network-modifiers” in inorganic glasses, breaking up the linkages between the silica coordination octahedra and hence reducing the viscosity, whereas high silica glasses are expected to be more viscous [36,37]. The higher contents of the divalent (Fe, Ca and Mg) ions in Laki and Eldgja are particularly noticeable.

The phase constitutions of these ashes were investigated using X-ray diffraction. The spectra are shown in Fig. 2, together with indications of the phase proportions that they represent. It can be seen that both Hekla and Askja are fully amorphous, while the other two contain significant proportions of two crystalline phases (It was confirmed in a previous publication [4] that most individual particles in the Laki ash are either amorphous or partially crystalline and this is also the case for the Eldgja ash: indexing of the crystalline peaks in Fig. 2 is also included in that paper).

A Netzsch dilatometer was used to explore the “softening” behaviour (glass transition temperature and “melting point”) of these ashes. Again, details of the procedure used, which involves the actuation rod applying a small pressure to a powder compact while it is heated, are given in the previous paper [4]. The four plots of displacement against temperature (being increased at 5 °C min⁻¹) are shown in Fig. 3. Initially, the powder compact expands on heating, but then a contraction is observed (on passing through the glass transition temperature, Tg), as the amorphous fraction softens, so that powder particles start to deform and the compact becomes denser. For the partially crystalline powders, contraction accelerates when the crystalline phases finally melt at Tm. It can be seen from Fig. 3 that all of the Tg values are in the approximate range 650–750 °C, while Tm is ~1000–1100 °C for the Laki and Eldgja.

Fig. 1. Compositions of the four ashes, as obtained by EDX (excluding the oxygen content). The expected (predominant) valence states of these cations are indicated.

Fig. 2. XRD spectra from the four ashes, with indications of the approximate glass contents (obtained by Rietveld analysis). The crystalline peaks in the Eldgja and Laki plots are all from two phases, clinopyroxene (~60%) and plagioclase (~40%).
sprinkling some particles onto a metallic substrate, followed by sputter coating with gold to prevent charging. A CAMSCAN SEM was used, with a 10 kV accelerating voltage. Representative micrographs are shown in Fig. 4. It can be seen that the particles all exhibit rather irregular morphologies. (Of course, these morphologies are not necessarily representative of those exhibited by ash particles in the air after eruptions.)

2.2. Particle heating and projection towards a substrate

The factors affecting adhesion of these VA particles were explored using a modified vacuum plasma spray system, in which powder was injected into the front of a plasma torch directed into an open cylindrical tube, at the end of which a substrate was located. The details of this set-up, and of the experimental conditions employed, are presented in the previous publication [4], together with the outcome of CFD modelling work to establish relationships between the operating conditions and the impact velocities and temperatures of individual particles. Three different sets of operating conditions were employed (A, B & C), listed in Table 1 together with corresponding measured temperatures and velocities of the gas and the temperature of the substrate. These experiments all involved stainless steel substrates with a surface finish of 1200 grit, although their temperature and inclination angle were different for different cases. The SEM micrographs in Fig. 5 show the appearance of these substrates after such experiments under one of these sets of conditions, for each of the four ashes, and for two substrate inclination angles. As expected, the normal steel barrel was replaced by a ceramic tube. The pellet was located within the tube, which contained an inserted graphite sleeve acting as a susceptor that coupled well to the induction field. This field was created using a Cheltenham Induction Heating Ltd system, operating at a frequency of about 140 kHz, with a typical power level of about 0.9 kW. The pellets were heated mainly via radiation from the graphite sleeve. The relationship between induction heating parameters and the thermal history of the pellets was established via experiments in which a thermocouple was located in a small hole drilled into a pellet. This allowed the temperature of the pellets to be pre-programmed for the ballistic experiments (during which thermocouples could not be used).

The high speed photography was carried out using a Phantom camera, details of which are available elsewhere [43]. The frame speed was 9348 fps, the exposure time was 5 μs and the image resolution was 1280 × 536 pixels. A number of experimental runs were carried out. The ejection velocities of the pellets were ~100 m s⁻¹, which is of the same approximate magnitude as the impact velocities of the particles during the adhesion experiments [4] - see Table 1.

3. VA particle deposition characteristics

The mass fraction of incident particles adhering to the substrates is plotted in Fig. 7, as a function of substrate temperature, for all four ashes, and for two substrate inclination angles. As expected, higher substrate temperatures (and the associated higher gas temperatures and velocities) and higher (closer to normal incidence) angles both favour higher rates of adhesion. It was shown in the previous paper [4], using CFD modelling of particle thermal and trajectory histories, that these adhesion rate tendencies tend to become substantial as the temperature of the particles in the size range of primary interest (~5–50 μm) start to rise above Tg.

This was shown in the previous paper only for the Laki ash, but a
similar outcome also applies to the Eldgja ash. However, it can be seen in Fig.7 that the Hekla and Askja ashes behave rather differently. Although they have similar $T_g$ values (Fig.3), their rates of deposition are noticeably lower. Of course, there is invariably some scatter in the results obtained during this type of experiment, but nevertheless this trend is very clear. The effect is also illustrated by the micrographs shown in Fig.5, which relate to a case for which all of the deposition rates are relatively low, but those of Laki and Eldgja are clearly higher than those for the Hekla and Askja (see Fig.7). That this is related to differences in the viscosity of these two different types of ash (in the high strain rate regime that is relevant to impact deformation) is confirmed by the high speed photography results presented in the next section.

4. VA pellet impact behaviour

Figs. 8–11 show sets of video stills for the four ashes. In all of these cases, the initial pellet temperature was about 1200 °C. It may
be noted that this is above the $T_g$ and $T_m$ values in all cases, so these pellets are nominally expected to be liquids. In practice, they are liquids with relatively high viscosity (even under quasi-static conditions), so that they all remained at least approximately spherical while in the bore of the gas gun. However, it can be seen from these figures that the behaviour exhibited by the Laki and Eldgja pellets (Figs. 8 and 9) was noticeably different from that of the other pair (Figs. 10 and 11). In the former case, the pellets clearly broke up in flight and deformed substantially on impact. (None of these pellets or fragments actually adhered to the substrate, which is unsurprising in view of their large size, and also in view of the fact that the substrate was cold.) The Hekla and Askja pellets on the other hand, largely retained their spherical shape in flight and rebounded from the substrate in what appear to be largely elastic events, although some fracture did occur with the Hekla pellet. This is clearly an indication of a substantially higher viscosity (at these very high strain rates) for these two ashes, compared with that of the Laki and Eldgja. Of course, this is consistent with the behaviour exhibited by the powder particles, with the Hekla and Askja ashes exhibiting noticeably lower rates of adhesion. (The particle temperatures were somewhat lower in those experiments, but it seems reasonable to expect that these differences in viscosity between the two pairs of materials would be exhibited across a range of temperature.)

5. Conclusions

The following conclusions can be drawn from this work.

(a) Four ashes have been examined and these can be divided into two groups, one pair from typical strato-volcanoes...
Fig. 6. (a) Schematic plan view and (b) photo of the gas gun and high speed photography set-up.

Fig. 7. Particle adhesion data for the four ashes, showing the mass fraction of projected particles adhering to the substrate, as a function of the substrate temperature (reflecting the severity of the thermal and velocity fields), for angles between the incident particle trajectory and the substrate surface of (a) 90° and (b) 30°.

Fig. 8. Series of video stills for projection of a Laki pellet, with an initial temperature of 1200 °C, corresponding to times of (i) 0.75 ms, (ii) 1.60 ms, (iii) 2.46 ms, (iv) 3.21 ms and (v) 5.35 ms.
(Hekla and Askja), which are expected to have relatively high viscosities, and the other two (Laki and Eldgja) from a region characterised by extensive fissures and fluid near-surface magma. The compositions of Laki and Eldgja are relatively high in cations such as Ca$^{2+}$, Fe$^{2+}$ and Mg$^{2+}$, which are likely to act as “network-modifiers” in these glasses and hence reduce the viscosity. The other two ashes are silica-rich and contain lower levels of such cations. These compositions are therefore consistent with expectations based on the type of volcano from which they were obtained.

(b) While all of the ash types exhibited greater rates of particle adhesion in hotter gas streams, and for higher angles of incidence to the substrate, these rates were noticeably lower for the two ashes with the high silica content. This suggests that, in addition to $T_g$ being significant, the viscosity of the material (at the temperature concerned, and at high strain rate) can affect the likelihood of adhesion, and may be sensitive to ash composition.

(c) Relatively large, fully dense pellets of the four ashes were projected, at high velocity and high temperature, towards a cold substrate, with in-flight and impact behaviour being monitored by high speed photography. In these experiments as well, clear differences were observed between the two groups, with the high silica ashes behaving in a visco-elastic manner indicative of a high viscosity, while the other two types of pellet responded much more like conventional liquids, breaking up in flight and undergoing extensive deformation on impact with the substrate.

(d) In view of the observed sensitivity to composition, and consequent differences in (high strain rate) viscosity and hence in the likelihood of adhesion within gas turbines, it seems advisable for particulate volcanic emissions to be characterised in this way, in addition to particle size distribution. Evidently, (remote) monitoring of atmospheric levels of ash is insufficient. Fortunately, obtaining such samples (presumably via drones) and making such measurements (of PSD and composition) should be straightforward. These findings are apparently novel and further work is needed, particularly on the significance of (high strain rate) viscosity and the nature of the linkages to composition.
selected video files are available at www.ccg.msm.cam.ac.uk/publications/resources, and are also accessible via the University repository at http://www.data.cam.ac.uk/repository.

References


Acknowledgements

This work forms part of a research programme funded by EPSRC (EP/K027530/1). In conjunction with this project, a consortium of partners has been set up under the PROVIDA (“PROtection against Volcanic ash Induced Damage in Aeroengines”) banner and information about its operation is available at http://www.ccg.msm.cam.ac.uk/initiatives/provida. The invaluable assistance of Kevin Roberts (Materials Department in Cambridge) with operation of the plasma spray facility is gratefully acknowledged. The authors are also grateful to Mr. Max Burley, of the Materials Science Department in Cambridge, for helpful contributions to the high speed photography and gas gun work, and to Dr. Margaret Hartley, of the University of Manchester, for kindly collecting the ashes during field trips to Iceland (funded by Easyjet) and also for extensive and valuable discussions related to the science of the specific eruptions concerned, and more generally concerning the complex relationships between geological and rheological characteristics of volcanic magma and ash.

In compliance with EPSRC requirements, raw data in the form of

Fig. 11. Series of video stills for projection of an Askja pellet, with an initial temperature of 1200 °C, corresponding to times of (i) 1.60 ms, (ii) 2.25 ms, (iii) 2.89 ms, (iv) 3.96 ms and (v) 5.35 ms.


