Effect of a Mass Merchandiser on Traditional Food Retailers

Oral Capps, Jr. and James M. Griffin

Non-traditional retailers such as warehouse club stores, discount drug stores, and discount mass merchandisers are new competitors for traditional food retailers. It is expected that non-traditional retailers will account for roughly 14 percent of total grocery sales by the turn of the century. The impact of a particular discount mass merchandiser (Wal-Mart) on the sales of a conventional retail grocery outlet (David's Supermarket, Inc.) located in the rural areas surrounding the Dallas/Ft. Worth metroplex is analyzed. In this case study, Wal-Mart alone is responsible for about a 21 percent reduction in sales.

Background

Non-traditional grocery outlets have grown noticeably in the past few years. These outlets include warehouse club stores, deep discount drug stores, and discount mass merchandisers. Although these non-traditional retailers do not typically offer a comparable array of grocery food and non-food products as found in supermarkets, they do market specific high-volume categories of dry grocery products, paper products, frozen foods, limited perishable produce and meat products, health and personal care products, and general merchandise. Low-operating margins provide a low-price appeal to consumers while ensuring high-volume shipments by suppliers.

Do non-traditional grocery retailers provide a source of competition to traditional food retailers? According to a survey of 2,300 food chain store managers conducted by Progressive Grocer in 1992, this question is of utmost importance to food retailers. Evidence for concern on the part of the traditional food retailers is exhibited in Figure 1, a look at sales of grocery products by warehouse club stores and supercenters (Kaufman). Club stores currently account for a major share of non-traditional grocery sales, registering \$21.4 billion in 1993 and \$22.6 billion in 1994. Club stores are projected to reach about \$37 billion by the turn of the century. Supercenter formats such as those in operation by Wal-Mart, K-Mart, and Target, had sales of \$5.1 billion and \$6.7 billion respectively in 1993 and 1994. Projections of sales from supercenter formats range from \$9.5 billion in 1995 to \$32.6 billion in 2000 (Kaufman). According to a Food Marketing Institute (FMI) report on alternative store formats, nontraditional retail outlets accounted for 6.2 percent of all grocery related sales in 1991. The combined grocery products sales of non-traditional retailers is forecasted to reach almost \$70 billion in 2000 — amounting to roughly 14 percent of total grocery product sales. Most of the growth of nontraditional outlets has occurred over the past 10 years.

Warehouse club stores primarily serve consumers who buy in bulk. A FMI study concluded that prices for grocery-related items averaged 26 percent lower in these stores than in traditional grocery stores (Food Marketing Review). Grocery-related products are one of the fastest growing segments of deep discount drugstores such as Phar Mor, Drug Emporium, and F&M. Mass merchandisers have extended their product lines to expand the array of food and non-food grocery products in supercenter formats. Both mass merchandisers and warehouse club stores use locational and product mix strategies to obtain greater sales volume. To illustrate, mass merchandisers have developed their formats in low-density, rural areas where large-scale competitors are essentially non-existent. Three retailers, Wal-Mart, K-Mart, and Target, account for roughly 70 percent of total sales from discount mass merchandisers (Food Marketing Review).

The purpose of this paper is to examine the impact of one mass merchandiser (Wal-Mart) on the sales of a traditional retail grocery outlet (David's Supermarket, Inc.) located in the rural areas surrounding the Dallas/Ft. Worth metroplex. To date, no studies have quantified the magnitude of the effect of mass merchandisers on sales of traditional grocery retailers. In this way, this paper makes a contribution to the literature. Data for this

Professor, Department of Agricultural Economics, and Professor, Department of Economics, Texas A&M University.





analysis correspond to the 30 stores from David's Supermarket, Inc. covering monthly periods from 1987 to 1994. These data indeed are proprietary and come from the accounting firm of Coopers and Lybrand, LLP.

Model Specification

This analysis rests on the development of an econometric model for retail grocery sales. As mentioned previously, sales correspond to those from David's Supermarket, Inc. over the period 1987 to 1994. This firm consists of 30 stores located on the rural/urban fringe in the Dallas/Ft. Worth area. A list of the various stores, together with their competitors, is exhibited in Table 1.

From Table 1, the principal competitor for David's Supermarket, Inc., clearly is Wal-Mart. Competition from Wal-Mart is evident in 22 of the 30 stores listed in Table 1. The first Wal-Mart supercenter opened in 1988, but it was not possible to separate regular Wal-Mart discount stores from superstores in this study. Competition also is evident from local traditional food competitors. In this analysis, attention is centered on measuring the impact of the presence of Wal-Mart on sales from David's Supermarket, Inc., after accounting for other factors.

To accomplish this task, we employ the following model specification:

where

SALES_{it} = real grocery sales of store i in time period t;

- SEASONALITY = set of dummy variables corresponding to particular months (base month, December)
- POPULATION DENSITY_{it} = population of the city in which store i is located divided by the square miles of the county in which store i is located;
- INCOME_{it} = real per capita income in time period t of the county in which store i is located;
- WAL-MART_{it} = 1 if Wal-Mart is a competitor for store i in time period t; 0 otherwise;
- NMAJCOMP_{it} = number of major competitors for store i in time period t;
- NMINCOMP_{it} = number of minor competitors for store i in time period t;
- SALES_{it-1} = lagged grocery sales of store i in time period t; and
- $LBO_t = 1$ if time period after January 1990; 0 otherwise.

The model links seasonality, store characteristics, population density, income, the presence of Wal-Mart, the number of major and minor competitors, lagged sales, and a structural change associated with a leveraged buyout (LBO) to retail grocery sales of David's Supermarket, Inc. The LBO took place in February 1990; a LBO is the purchase of the common stock of a company through debt-financing, while pledging with the assets of the new company as collateral.

Given the availability of monthly data, it is possible to examine whether or not seasonality is evident in sales of this retail outlet. The individual stores are in different locations, may possess different characteristics, and may cater to different clientele. To account for differences among stores, we employ dummy variables corresponding to the various stores. All other things held constant, grocery sales are likely to be higher for more densely populated areas. As well, grocery sales are likely to be positively related to per capita income. Further, sales from this firm are expected to be negatively impacted by the presence of Wal-Mart; in addition, as the number of other major or minor competitors increases, sales are expected to decline. We examine whether or not the LBO influences sales of this retail outlet. Finally, to capture

customer loyalty, we include the lag of grocery stores. The use of a lagged dependent variable typically is associated with habit persistence. As such, we expect the estimated coefficient associated with this variable to be between 0 and 1.

Data

Data for this analysis cover monthly time periods from 1987 to 1994 for 30 stores from David's Supermarket, Inc. Not all stores have complete information over the period 1987 to 1994. Several stores closed before 1994, and several stores opened after 1987. The total number of observations available for analysis is 1959. To make adjustments for inflation, sales and income figures are deflated by the Consumer Price Index for all items (1982-84=1.00).

Descriptive statistics for selected variables in the econometric specification are exhibited in Table 2. Sales in 1982-84 dollars, on average, are \$217,370 per month, ranging from \$69,720 to \$662,130 per month. Population density is 116,280 persons per square mile on average, with a range of 8,920 to 1,418,200 people per square mile. Per capita income in 1982-84 dollars, on average, is \$16, 596 over this period, with a range of \$11,258 to \$26,805. Real per capita income, on average, is \$12,443, ranging from \$10,034 to \$18,451. Wal-Mart is a competitor for 22 of the 30 stores in the firm. But, over this period the presence of Wal-Mart occurs just over 50 percent of the time. Besides Wal-Mart, the average number of competitors to any store in David's Supermarket, Inc. is close to 2 with a range of 0 to 7.

Empirical Results

The econometric specification corresponds to a pooled time-series cross-sectional model. Given unequal numbers of monthly time periods within each of the 30 cross-sections (stores), the model technically is an analysis of covariance model. The estimation technique is simply ordinary least squares. The estimated coefficients and t-statistics associated with each of the variables in the model are exhibited in Table 3. The level of significance chosen in this analysis is 0.10. All variables in the model are statistically significant except for per capita income.

Store is Store is 1 Grandview 2 Alvarado 3 MidlothianCompetitors May Mark 17 to 12/94 Mark 11/97 to 12/94Competitors Gardview Fast Stop Low Gardview Fast Stop Low Gardview Fast Stop Low Gardview Fast Stop Low Gardview Fast Stop Mark 11/97 to 12/947Whitney HillWal-Mart (1/97 to 12/94) Winn-Dixienone7Whitney HillWal-Mart (1/97 to 12/94) Winn-DixieCircle Eight Enterprises Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood Kemp-Tex Inc. Lively Grocery Level Food Center, Inc. Triad Foods, Inc. none May 111Hamilton Hamilton Macrea Macrea Mark 11/97 to 12/94Nather God Stores Randall Lee Wood Kemp-Tex Inc. Triad Foods, Inc. none Mayer's Food Mart FIR, Inc. E-Z Way Convenience Stores none Mark 11/87 to 12/9415Acton Hood StephenvilleHeB Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Level Food Center, Inc. CS Food Mart Fullerton Grocery Co. Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)16Stephenville StephenvilleSomervell Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Level Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket Fullerton Grocery & Market HEB20Joshua Johnson Princeton Colin Wal-Mart (1/99 to 5/92)None Randall's Princeton Princ		Disco	Country	Major Competitors	Minor Competitors
1 Grandview Johnson Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Grandview rast subp 3 Midlothian Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) DJC Food Center, Inc. 4 Mabank Kaufman Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) DJC Food Center, Inc. 5, 10 Clebum Johnson HEB Osborne Grocery Co. 6 Granbury Hood Kroger Circle B Order Eight Enterprises 7 Whitney Hill Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Bonanza Supermarket 8 Clifton Bosque none Circle Bight Enterprises 9 Seven Points Navarro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Bonanza Supermarket 11 Hamilton Hamilton Mainton Invel Mart Food Stores 12 McGregor McLenan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 14 Temple Bell HEB Mayer's Food Mart 14 Temple Bell Malemart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Food Stores 15 Acton	Store #	riace	County	Wal Mad (1/97 to 10/04)	Grandview Fast Stor
2 Alvarado Johnson Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Level Food Center, Inc. 3 Midlothian Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) DIC Food Stores, Inc. 4 Mabank Kaufman Wal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) none 5, 10 Cleburn Johnson HEB Osborne Grocery Co. 6 Granbury Hood Kroger Circle B 7 Whitney Hill Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Boanaz Supermarket 8 Clifton Bosque none Circle Eight Enterprises 9 Seven Points Navarro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Randall Lee Wood 11 Hamilton Hamilton none Triaft Mart Food Stores 12 McGregor McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triaft Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triaft Foods, Inc. 14 Temple Bell HEB Mayer's Food Mart 14 Temple Bell Mal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 15 Acton Hood none none	1	Grandview	Johnson	Wal-Mart (1/8/ to 12/94)	Grandview Fast Stop
3 Midlothian Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc. Kroger DIC Food Stores, Inc. Kroger 4 Mabank Kaufman Wal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) Winn-Dixie none 5, 10 Cleburn Johnson HEB Osborne Grocery Co. Kroger Pedgos West 6 Granbury Hood Kroger Circle B Circle Bight Enterprises 7 Whitney Hill Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood 8 Clifton Bosque none Thrift Mart Food Stores 9 Seven Points Navarro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Rone 11 Hamilton Hamilton Naverro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none Naver's Food Mart 14 Temple Bell HEB Osborne Grocery Co. Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 14 Temple Bell HEB Osborne Grocery Co. Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 15 Acton Hood none none Level Food Center, Inc.	2	Alvarado	Johnson	Wal-Mart (1/89 to 12/94)	Level Food Center, Inc.
4MabankKaufmanWain-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) Winn-Dixienone5, 10CleburnJohnsonHEBOsborne Grocery Co. KrogerPedgos West6GranburyHoodKrogerCircle B7WhitneyHillWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood8CliftonBosquenoneThrift Mart Food Stores9Seven PointsNavarroWal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94)Kemp-Tex Inc. Lively Grocery11HamiltonHamiltonnoneLevel Food Stores12McGregorMcLennanWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triat Foods, Inc.13ItalyEllisWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triat Foods, Inc.14TempleBellHEBMayer's Food Mart15ActonHoodnonenone16StephenvilleFrathMart (1/87 to 12/94)none17Glen RoseSomervellnoneNone18MineralPalo PintoWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Evel Food Center, Inc.18MineralPalo PintoWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Evel Food Center, Inc.20JoshuaJohnsonnoneCS Food Stores21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89)Fulletton Grocery & Market23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (1/90 to 12/94)none24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (1/90 to 6/	3	Midlothian	Ellis	Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)	DJC Food Stores, Inc.
4MabankKaufmanWai-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) winn-Dixienone5, 10CleburnJohnsonHEB Winn-DixieOsborne Grocery Co. Fredgos West6GranburyHoodKroger Winn-DixieCircle B Circle Eight Enterprises7WhitneyHillWai-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood8CliftonBosque Seven PointsNavarroWal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94)Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood9Seven PointsNavarroWal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94)Kemp-Tex Inc. 				Minyard Food Stores, Inc.	
4 Mabank Kaufman Wai-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) Winn-Dixie none 5, 10 Cleburn Johnson HEB Kroger Osborne Grocery Co. Pedgos West 6 Granbury Hood Kroger Winn-Dixie Circle B 7 Whitney Hill Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood 8 Clifton Bosque none Thrift Mart Food Stores 9 Seven Points Navarro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triat Good Stores 11 Hamilton Hamilton none Triat Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triat Foods, Inc. 14 Temple Bell HEB HEB Mayer's Food Mart 14 Temple Hod none none 15 Acton Hood none none 16 Stephenville Frath HEB Osborne Grocery Co. 18 Mineral Palo Finto Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 19 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>Kroger</td> <td></td>				Kroger	
NinomaNameNinomaWinn-DixieOsborne Grocery Co. Pedgos West5, 10CleburnJohnsonHEB Kroger Osborne Grocery Co. Pedgos West6GranburyHoodKroger Circle Eight Enterprises7WhitneyHillWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Bonanza Supermarket 	4	Mahank	Kaufman	Wal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94)	none
5, 10 Cleburn Johnson HEB Kroger Winn-Dixie Osborne Grocery Co. Pedgos West 6 Granbury Hood Kroger Winn-Dixie Circle Eight Enterprises 7 Whitney Hill Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood 8 Clifton Bosque none Thrift Mart Food Stores 9 Seven Points Navarro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Kroger Kroger 11 Hamilton Hamilton none Level Food Center, Inc. 12 McGregor McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 14 Temple Bell HEB Albertson's FIR, Inc. 15 Acton Hood none Level Food Center, Inc. 16 Stephenville Food Ninn-Dixie Datemat (3/91 to 6/93) 17 Glen Rose Somervell Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Stores 18 Mineral Johnson none Level Food Center, Inc. 18 Mineral Palo Pinto Wal-M	-	muounx	Tuumun	Winn-Divie	
5,10 Cleburn Joinson HDB Good Sectron Good Sectron 6 Granbury Hood Kroger Pedgos West Pedgos West 7 Whitney Hill Wain-Dixie Circle Eight Enterprises 8 Clifton Bosque none Thrift Mart Food Stores 9 Seven Points Navarro Wail-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Kemp-Tex Inc. 11 Hamilton Hamilton none Lively Groocery 12 McGregor McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 14 Temple Bell HEB Mayer's Food Mart 15 Acton Hood none none 16 Stepitenville Frath HEB Osborne Grocery Co. 18 Mineral Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Nore 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none <t< td=""><td>5 10</td><td>Claharm</td><td>Tahnson</td><td>UED</td><td>Osborne Grocery Co</td></t<>	5 10	Claharm	Tahnson	UED	Osborne Grocery Co
Kroger Winn-DixieFeugos West6GranburyHoodKroger Winn-DixieCircle B Circle Eight Enterprises7WhitneyHillWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood8CliftonBosque NavarononeThrift Mart Food Stores9Seven PointsNavaroWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Kemp-Tex Inc. Level Food Center, Inc.11Hamilton HamiltonHamilton Noe moteNoneLevel Food Center, Inc.13ItalyEllisWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)noneNone14TempleBellHEB Mal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)moneLevel Food Center, Inc.15Acton HoodHood nonenonenoneNone16StephenvilleErath HEBHEB Winn-DixieOsborne Grocery Co.17Glen Rose WellsSomervellWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)CS Food Stores19Corsicana VellsNavaroWal-Mart (1/88 to 5/89)Fullerton Grocery co. Winn-Dixie20JoshuaJohnson PrincetonNoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little Elm DentonDentonWal-Mart (1/99 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none23CerinaCookeWal-Mart (99 to 6/92) Randall's Grocery Lavel Food Store, Inc.None24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (990 to 6/92) Randall's Grocery Randall's Grocery Lavel Food Store, Inc.No	5, 10	Clebum	JOIIIISOII	ned Variation	Badges West
6GranburyHoodKroger Winn-DixieCircle B Circle Eight Enterprises7WhitneyHillWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood8CliftonBosquenoneThrift Mart Food Stores9Seven PointsNavarroWal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94)Kemp-Tex Inc.11HamiltonHamiltonnoneLevel Food Center, Inc.12McGregorMcLennanWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triad Foods, Inc.13ItalyEllisWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)none14TempleBellHEBMayer's Food Mart Albertson's15ActonHoodnonenone16StephenvilleErathHEBOsborne Grocery Co.17Glen RoseSomervell 				Kroger	reugos west
6 Granbury Hood Winn-Dixie Kroger Winn-Dixie Circle E B Circle E B Sonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood 7 Whitney Hill Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Bonanza Supermarket Randall Lee Wood 8 Clifton Bosque none Thrift Mart Food Stores 9 Seven Points Navaro Wal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) Kemp-Tex Inc. 11 Hamilton Hamilton none Level Food Center, Inc. 12 McGregor McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 14 Temple Bell HEB Mayer's Food Mart 15 Acton Hood none none 16 Stephenville Frath HEB Osborne Grocery Co. 17 Glen Rose Somervell none Level Food Center, Inc. 18 Mineral Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Surgermarket 19 Corsicana Navaro Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) none 21 Little Elm Denton Wal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89)				Winn-Dixie	
7WhitneyHillWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Circle Eight Enterprises7WhitneyHillWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Bonanza Supermarket8CliftonBosquenoneThrift Mart Food Stores9Seven PointsNavaroWal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94)Kemp-Tex Inc.11HamiltonHamiltonnoneLevel Food Center, Inc.12McGregorMcLennanWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triad Foods, Inc.13ItalyEllisWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)none14TempleBellHEBMayer's Food Mart15ActonHoodnonenone16StephenvilleErathHEBOsborne Grocery Co.17Glen RoseSomervellnoneLevel Food Center, Inc.18Mineral Palo PintoWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94)CS Food Stores19CorsicanaNavaroWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94)Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89)Fulleton Grocery & Market22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (1/97 to 12/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (1/97 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.26Ferris <td>6</td> <td>Granbury</td> <td>Hood</td> <td>Kroger</td> <td>Circle B</td>	6	Granbury	Hood	Kroger	Circle B
7WhitneyHillWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Bonaras Supermarket Randall Lee Wood8CliftonBosquenoneThrift Mart Food Stores9Seven PointsNavarroWal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94)Kemp-Tex Inc. Lively Grocery11HamiltonHamiltonnoneLevel Food Center, Inc.12McGregorMcLennanWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triad Foods, Inc.13ItalyEllisWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)none14TempleBellHEBMayer's Food Mart15ActonHoodnonenone16StephenvilleErathHEBOsborne Grocery Co.17Glen RoseSomervellnoneLevel Food Center, Inc.18Mineral WellsPalo PintoWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)CS Food Stores19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89)Fullerton Grocery & Market21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.25GainesvilleCockeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92)Scivally's Grocery26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92)Scivally's Grocery27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 12/94)North Town Foods28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.29 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>Winn-Dixie</td> <td>Circle Eight Enterprises</td>				Winn-Dixie	Circle Eight Enterprises
8Clifton Seven PointsBosque Navarronone Wal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) Winn-DixieRandall Lee Wood Thrift Mart Food Stores Kemp-Tex Inc. Lively Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.11Hamilton McGregor McLennannone McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Lively Grocery Triad Foods, Inc. none12McGregor McLennanWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Mal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triad Foods, Inc. none13Italy EllisBell HEB Albertson's Wal-Mart (1/87 to 9/92)none E-Z Way Convenience Stores none15Acton StephenvilleHood FrathnoneLevel Food Center, Inc. FJR, Inc.16StephenvilleFrath HEB Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieLevel Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19Corsicana VellsNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market HEB20JoshuaJohnson CollinnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket21Little Elm Princeton CollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)none23Princeton CookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. Piggly Wiggly24Whitesboro CookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyAverett & Associates, Inc. United Supermarkets, Inc. North Town Foods Scivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. North T	7	Whitney	Hill	Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)	Bonanza Supermarket
8 Clifton Seven Points Bosque Navarro none Thrift Mart Food Stores 9 Seven Points Navarro Wal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) Winn-Dixie Lively Grocery 11 Hamilton Hamilton Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Food Center, Inc. 12 McGregor McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 14 Temple Bell HEB Mayer's Food Mart 14 Temple Hood none none 16 Stephenville Erath HEB Osborne Grocery Co. 17 Glen Rose Somervell none Level Food Center, Inc. 18 Mineral Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) CS Food Stores 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) Fullerton Grocery & Market 12 Little Elm Denton Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) none 23 Princeton Collin Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Gilber Food Store, Inc. 24 Whitesboro Cocke<		-			Randall Lee Wood
9Seven PointsNavarroWal-Mart (1/94 to 12/94) Winn-DixieKemp-Tex Inc. Lively Grocery11HamiltonHamiltonnoneLevel Food Center, Inc.12McGregorMcLennanWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triad Foods, Inc.13ItalyEllisWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)none14TempleBellHEBMayer's Food Mart15ActonHoodnonenone16StephenvilleErathHEBOsborne Grocery Co.17Glen RoseSomervellnoneNone18Mineral WellsPalo PintoWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94)Uevel Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94)Sofod Center, Inc. CS Food Stores21Little Elm Palo PintoNavarroWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94)Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little Elm PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none23Princeton CollinCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc. North Town Foods24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's 	Q	Cliffon	Bosque	none	Thrift Mart Food Stores
9 Seven Folds Navarlo War-Nation Winn-Dixie Lively Grocery 11 Hamilton Hamilton none Lively Grocery 12 McGregor McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 14 Temple Bell HEEB Mayer's Food Mart 15 Acton Hood none none 16 Stephenville Erath HEB Osborne Grocery Co. 17 Glen Rose Somervell none none 18 Mineral Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Level Food Center, Inc. 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) Fullerton Grocery & Market 20 Joshua Johnson none B&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc. 21 Little Elm Denton Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) none North Town Food Store, Inc. 23 Princeton Collin Wal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94) Gilbert Food Store, Inc. North Town Foods 2	0 0	Seven Bointa	Noverro	Wal-Mart $(1/94 \text{ to } 12/94)$	Kemp-Tex Inc
11HamiltonHamiltonMill-DikleLevel Food Center, Inc.12McGregorMcLennanWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triad Foods, Inc.13ItalyEllisWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)Triad Foods, Inc.14TempleBellHEBMayer's Food Mart15ActonHoodnonenone16StephenvilleErathHEBOsborne Grocery Co.17Glen RoseSomervellnonenone18MineralPalo PintoWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)CS Food Stores19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89)Fullerton Grocery & Market20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Oith Town Foods27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrattWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrattWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none	9	Seven Founds	Inavallo	Winn Divio	Lively Grocery
11 Hamilton none none Triad Foods, Inc. 12 McGregor McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Triad Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 14 Temple Bell HEB Mayer's Food Mart 15 Acton Hood none none 16 Stephenville Erath HEB one 17 Glen Rose Somervell none Level Food Center, Inc. 18 Mineral Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (8/91 to 6/93) Diamond Food Markets, Inc. 18 Mineral Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) Level Food Center, Inc. 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) Fullerton Grocery & Market 20 Joshua Johnson none B&W Grocery Level Food Store, Inc. 21 Little Elm Denton Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) none none 22 Frisco Collin Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94) none North Town Foods 23 Princeton Colke <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>TT 11.</td><td>w lilli-Dixie</td><td>Level Food Center Inc</td></td<>			TT 11 .	w lilli-Dixie	Level Food Center Inc
12 McGregor McLennan Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Iriad Foods, Inc. 13 Italy Ellis Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) none 14 Temple Bell HEB Mayer's Food Mart 14 Temple Bell HEB Mayer's Food Mart 15 Acton Hood none none 16 Stephenville Erath HEB Osborne Grocery Co. Winn-Dixie Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) Kevel Food Center, Inc. 18 Mineral Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) CS Food Stores 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) Fullerton Grocery & Market 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) none 21 Little Elm Denton Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) none 23 Princeton Collin Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94) Gilbert Food Store, Inc. 24 Whitesboro Cooke Wal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Scivally's Grocery 24 Whitesboro Cooke Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92) Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.	11	Hamilton	Hamilton	none	Level Food Center, Inc.
13Italy TempleEllis BellWal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94) HEB Albertson's 	12	McGregor	McLennan	Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)	Triad Foods, Inc.
14 Temple Bell HEB Albertson's Wal-Mart (1/87 to 9/92) Mayer's Food Mart FIR, Inc. 15 Acton Hood none FIR, Inc. 16 Stephenville Erath HEB Wal-Mart (8/91 to 6/93) E-Z Way Convenience Stores none 17 Glen Rose Wells Somervell none Level Food Center, Inc. 18 Mineral Wells Palo Pinto Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) CS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket 19 Corsicana Navarro Wal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) Fullerton Grocery & Market 20 Joshua Johnson none B&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc. 21 Little Elm Denton Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) none 23 Princeton Collin Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) none 24 Whitesboro Cooke Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94) Gilbert Food Store, Inc. 25 Gainesville Cooke Wal-Mart (10/91 to 5/92) North Town Foods 27 Graham Young Wal-Mart (19/91 to 5/92) United Supermarkets, Inc. 28 Celina Collin Wal-Mart (19/91 to 5/92) <td>13</td> <td>Italy</td> <td>Ellis</td> <td>Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)</td> <td>none</td>	13	Italy	Ellis	Wal-Mart (1/87 to 12/94)	none
Albertson's Wal-Mart (1/87 to 9/92)FJR, Inc. E-Z Way Convenience Stores none15ActonHood ErathnoneE-Z Way Convenience Stores none16StephenvilleErathHEB Wal-Mart (8/91 to 6/93)Osborne Grocery Co.17Glen Rose WeilsSomervell Palo Pinto WellsnoneLevel Food Center, Inc.18Mineral WellsPalo Pinto Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieLevel Food Center, Inc.19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieCS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market HEB20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little Elm Princeton CollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none23Princeton CookeCollin Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc. North Town Foods24Whitesboro CookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. Piggly Wiggly26Ferris Celina CollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc. None27Graham Young Wal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none28Celina CollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Mai-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30Everman TarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none <td>14</td> <td>Temple</td> <td>Bell</td> <td>HEB</td> <td>Mayer's Food Mart</td>	14	Temple	Bell	HEB	Mayer's Food Mart
15ActonHood FrankNone noneNone noneNone none16StephenvilleErathHed Frathnone HEB Winn-Dixie Wal-Mart (8/91 to 6/93)Soborne Grocery Co.17Glen Rose WeilsSomervell Palo PintononeLevel Food Center, Inc.18Mineral WellsPalo Pinto Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieLevel Food Center, Inc.19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little Elm PrincetonDenton CollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none23Princeton ColkeCollin Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)none24Whitesboro CookeCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. North Town Foods26Ferris Graham YoungEllis Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc. None27Graham Graham YoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc. None29Pottsboro GraysonGraysonWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none30Everman TarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none		•		Albertson's	FJR, Inc.
15Acton StephenvilleHood Erathnone HEB Winn-Dixie Wal-Mart (8/91 to 6/93)none Osborne Grocery Co.17Glen Rose Mineral WellsSomervell Palo Pintonone Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieLevel Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieFullerton Grocery & Market HEB20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little Elm PrincetonDenton CollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none23Princeton CollinCollin Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)B&W Grocery Level Food Store, Inc. North Town Foods Scivally's Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods Scivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. Piggly Wiggly26Ferris Celina CelinaEllis Young Young Wal-Mart (10/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc. United Supermarkets, Inc. North Town Foods Scivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. Piggly Wiggly26Ferris Celina CollinEllis Wal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Wal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc. United Supermarkets, Inc. none none27Graham Young Wal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none none29Pottsboro Grayson TarrantWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.30Everman TarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.				Wal-Mart (1/87 to 9/92)	E-Z Way Convenience Stores
15ActorHoodHeatOsborne Grocery Co.16StephenvilleErathHEBOsborne Grocery Co.17Glen RoseSomervellnoneLevel Food Center, Inc.18Mineral WellsPalo PintoWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94)CS Food Stores19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89)Level Food Center, Inc.20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 6/92) Randall'sScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) North Town FoodsNorett Associates, Inc.27Graham YoungYoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Nal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94) Mal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minvard Food Stores, Inc.none	15	Acton	Hood	none	none
10StephenvineFlainWinn-Dixie Wal-Mart (8/91 to 6/93)17Glen Rose Mineral WellsSomervell Palo PintononeLevel Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores18Mineral WellsPalo Pinto Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieLevel Food Center, Inc. Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19CorsicanaNavarro HEBWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market HEB20JoshuaJohnson nonenoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little Elm PrincetonDenton CollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none Gilbert Food Store, Inc.23Princeton CollinCollin Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc. Clinnons Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods24Whitesboro CookeCooke Wal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. Piggly Wiggly26Ferris Celina CollinEllis Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92) Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc. United Supermarkets, Inc. none28Celina CollinCollin Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minvard Food Stores, Inc.North none30Everman TarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minvard Food Stores, Inc.none	15	Stephenville	Frath	HFB	Osborne Grocery Co.
17Glen Rose Maineral WellsSomervell Palo PintoWal-Mart (8/91 to 6/93) none Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieLevel Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94) Market (6/93 to 12/94)none none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94) Mal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minward Food Stores, Inc.none	10	Stephenvine	Liau	Winn Divie	
17Glen Rose Mineral WellsSomervell Palo Pintonone Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieLevel Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieEverel Food Center, Inc. CS Food Stores20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little ElmDenton CollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyGilbert Food Storery, Inc. North Town Foods25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc. United Supermarkets, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (9/90 to 5/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyAverett & Associates, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Mart (6/93 to 12/94)None27Graham YoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Mal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)None28Celina CollinCollin Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)None29PottsboroGrayson GraysonWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minvard Food Stores, Inc.None30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minvard Food Stores, Inc.None				Willi-Dixie	
17Glen RoseSomervell Palo PintononeLevel Food Center, Inc.18Mineral WellsPalo PintoWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieCS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little Elm FriscoDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23Princeton CollinCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Randall's Piggly WigglyGilbert Food Store, Inc. Clinnons Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Wal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Scivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26Ferris CollinEllisWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc. United Supermarkets, Inc.26Ferris CollinEllisWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27Graham YoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Wal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none29Pottsboro GraysonGraysonWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none			~ "	wai-Mart (8/91 to 6/95)	Land Cantan Inc.
18Mineral WellsPalo Pinto Win-DixieWal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94) Winn-DixieCS Food Stores Diamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little Elm PrincetonDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none23Princeton CollinCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24Whitesboro CookeCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26Ferris ColinaEllis YoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92) Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc.26Ferris ColinaEllis YoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Wal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27Graham YoungYoung Wal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none29Pottsboro BoroGrayson TarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrant TarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none	17	Glen Rose	Somervell	none	Level Food Center, Inc.
WellsWinn-DixieDiamond Food Markets, Inc. Sam's Supermarket19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall'sScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none	18	Mineral	Palo Pinto	Wal-Mart (11/87 to 12/94)	CS Food Stores
19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBSam's Supermarket Fullerton Grocery & Market20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.27Graham YoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none		Wells		Winn-Dixie	Diamond Food Markets, Inc.
19CorsicanaNavarroWal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89) HEBFullerton Grocery & Market20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27Graham YoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Wal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none					Sam's Supermarket
19EditedHead of the second seco	19	Corsicana	Navarro	Wal-Mart (7/88 to 5/89)	Fullerton Grocery & Market
20JoshuaJohnsonnoneB&W Grocery Level Food Center, Inc.21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. Piggly Wiggly26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc. United Supermarkets, Inc.27Graham YoungWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none28Celina Food StoreGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30Everman Minyard Food Stores, Inc.Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none	17	Consteand	1141410	HFB	-
20JoshuaJoinsonHoneDeter Coord21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)none22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc.25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall'sScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/90 to 5/92) Randall'sUnited Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none	20	Tashua	Tohnson	none	B&W Grocery
21Little Elm FriscoDenton CollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23Princeton Val-Mart CollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24Whitesboro CookeCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26Ferris Graham CollinEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc.28Celina CollinCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Mal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none	20	Josnua	JOINISON	none	Level Food Center Inc
21Little ElmDentonWal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)Hole22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc.25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92)Scivally's Grocery26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/90 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none		~		M(1) M = 4 (A/00 + 10/04)	
22FriscoCollinWal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)none23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc.25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92)Scivally's Grocery26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/90 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none	21	Little Elm	Denton	Wal-Mart (4/89 to 12/94)	none
23PrincetonCollinWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)Gilbert Food Store, Inc.24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. Piggly Wiggly26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92) United Supermarkets, Inc.United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Nonenone29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none	22	Frisco	Collin	Wal-Mart (4/89 to 4/94)	none
24WhitesboroCookeWal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)Clinnons Grocery, Inc. North Town Foods25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc. Piggly Wiggly26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94) Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92) Wal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94) Nonenone29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) Minyard Food Stores, Inc.none	23	Princeton	Collin	Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)	Gilbert Food Store, Inc.
25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyNorth Town Foods Scivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none	24	Whitesboro	Cooke	Wal-Mart (5/90 to 12/94)	Clinnons Grocery, Inc.
25GainesvilleCookeWal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92) Randall's Piggly WigglyScivally's Grocery Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none					North Town Foods
25GamesvineGoodHar All's Piggly WigglyDicus Cash Super Market, Inc.26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)none	25	Gainesville	Cooke	Wal-Mart (9/90 to 6/92)	Scivally's Grocery
26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)noneMinyard Food Stores, Inc.Minyard Food Stores, Inc.None	23	Gamesvine	COOKO	Randall's	Dicus Cash Super Market, Inc.
26FerrisEllisWal-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averett & Associates, Inc.27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)noneMinyard Food Stores, Inc.	4			Diaghy Wiggly	
26FerrisEllisWai-Mart (10/91 to 12/94)Averet & Associates, inc.27GrahamYoungWai-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)United Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWai-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWai-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWai-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)noneMinyard Food Stores, Inc.Minyard Food Stores, Inc.None			****	Figgly wiggly $\frac{12}{04}$	Averatt & Associates Inc
27GrahamYoungWal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)Onited Supermarkets, Inc.28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)noneMinyard Food Stores, Inc.	26	Ferris	Ellis	wai-iviart $(10/91 \text{ to } 12/94)$	Listed Supermarkets, Inc.
28CelinaCollinWal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)none29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)noneMinyard Food Stores, Inc.	27	Graham	Young	Wal-Mart (9/91 to 5/92)	United Supermarkets, Inc.
29PottsboroGraysonWal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)none30EvermanTarrantWal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)noneMinyard Food Stores, Inc.	28	Celina	Collin	Wal-Mart (8/92 to 10/94)	none
30 Everman Tarrant Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94) none Minyard Food Stores, Inc.	29	Pottsboro	Grayson	Wal-Mart (6/93 to 12/94)	none
Minyard Food Stores, Inc.	30	Everman	Tarrant	Wal-Mart (7/93 to 12/94)	none
				Minyard Food Stores, Inc.	

Table 1. Competitors to David's Supermarket, Inc. in Retail Grocery Sales.

 Table 2. Descriptive Statistics of Selected Variables

 in the Model.

		Stdrd.		
Variable	Mean	Dev.	Min.	Max.
SALES (\$)	\$217,370	\$85,125	\$69,720	\$662,130
POPDENS				
(000)	116.28	151.02	8.92	1,418.2
INCOME (\$)	\$12,443	\$1,945	\$10,034	\$18,451
WAL-MART	0.51	0.49	0	1
NMAJCOMP	0.71	1.07	0	4
NMINCOMP	0.97	0.79	0	3

About 86 percent of the variability in retail grocery sales is accounted for by the model. Seasonality is evident in sales. Real sales are highest in December; differences between the remaining months and December range from \$2,188 (March) to \$76,740 (January). In addition, differences in sales exist across stores. Differences between real sales from other stores and store 30 (base category) vary from \$106,280 (store 28) to \$300,640 (store 16). Relative to store 30, real sales from all remaining stores are higher.

Population density is a statistically significant factor affecting retail grocery sales. For every 1000-person change per square mile, sales change by \$155 for this firm. Income, on the other hand, is not a statistically important factor affecting sales of David's Supermarket, Inc. The sign associated with this variable also is negative, implying that as per capita income of consumers increases, shoppers may switch to other grocery outlets or shoppers may increase expenditures in the awayfrom-home market.

The presence of Wal-Mart is a key factor affecting sales. Real sales from this firm are \$46,129 per month less with Wal-Mart as a competitor than without the presence of this mass merchandiser. Given that average monthly real sales for David's Supermarket, Inc. over the time period 1987 to 1994 are \$217,370, Wal-Mart alone, ceteris paribus, is responsible for about a 21 percent reduction in sales. Thus, the presence of Wal-Mart is a noteworthy concern to this firm. The number of other major and minor competitors also impacts sales from David's Supermarket, Inc. For every unit change in the number of other major and minor competitors besides Wal-Mart, sales change by about \$35,675 and \$7,508 per month, respectively, in the opposite direction. So, the number of major competitors besides Wal-Mart is responsible for a 16 percent reduction in sales, while the number of minor competitors is responsible for a 3 percent reduction in sales on average.

Table 3. Empirical Res	sults Associated with	the
Econometric Specifica	tion.	

Leonometric 5	pecification.	4	6
variable	estimated	t-statistic	f-statistic
	coefficient		(p-value)
Seasonality			104.15*
Seasonanty			(0.0000)
Jan	-76,740*	-20.36	
Feb	-53,573*	-14.98	
Mar	-2.188.4	-0.60	
Anr	-56 535*	-15 37	
May	-40 683*	-11.36	
Iviay	10,005	-11.50	
	-10,791*	-2.95	
Jui	-58,511+	-15.90	
Aug	-44,294*	-12.37	
Sep	-7,926.2*	-2.18	
Oct	-69,676*	-19.00	
Nov	-52.255*	-14.73	
	,		12 42*
Store			(0.0000)
1	152 1770	1 14	(0.0000)
1	192,1770	1.14	
2	182,450	1.33	
3	285,350*	2.01	
4	176,500	1.23	
5	152,380	1.12	
6	224,110	1.57	
7	236,570	1.59	
8	140 870	0.95	
0	107 380	1 22	
10	172,300	1.55	
10	237,970*	1.74	
11	155,600	1.04	
12	160,590	1.21	
13	153,790	1.08	
14	299,850*	2.24	
15	127,620	0.89	
16	300.640*	2.02	
17	148,330	1.01	
18	294 740*	1 97	,
10	170 050	1.22	
20	112 840	1.22	
20	113,040	0.65	
21	122,710	1.04	
22	169,590	1.46	
23	115,780	1.01	
24	185,810	1.25	
25	298,560*	2.01	
26	162.610	1.15	
27	194 990	1 30	
28	106 280	0.94	
20	190,200	1.29	
27 DODDENSE	160,200	1.20	
POPDENSE	155.59*	1.44	
INCOME	-2.7951	-1.21	
LAGSALES	0.5571*	29.48	
LBO	-29,790*	-13.26	
WAL-MART	-46,129*	-9.63	
Major	-35,675*	-9.13	
Competitors			
Minor	-7 508 1*	-1 32	
Competitors	-7,500.1	-1.32	
CONSTANT	11 264	0.24	
	41,304	0.20	
K = .864/			

* indicates statistical significance at the 0.10 level

The structural change attributed to the leveraged buyout also is a key factor affecting sales of this retail outlet. Real sales for this firm are lower by \$29,790 after the LBO compared to before the LBO. The LBO, alone, thus is responsible for about a 13 percent reduction in sales on average. Finally, the coefficient associated with lagged sales is in the unit interval (0.5571). This coefficient also is statistically different from zero. Thus, all other factors held constant, there appears to be customer loyalty or habit persistence in sales.

Concluding Remarks

Non-traditional retailers such as warehouse club stores, deep discount drug stores, and mass merchandisers indeed are new competitors for traditional food retailers. It is expected that nontraditional retailers will account for roughly 14 percent of total grocery product sales by the turn of the century. According to Kinsey and Senauer, traditional supermarkets are not only facing serious competitive challenges from club stores, drug stores, and mass merchandisers at the priceconscious end of the market but also from homemeal replacement providers at the convenienceoriented end. Indeed hypermarkets and convenience stores also are formidable competitors to traditional grocery outlets.

In this paper, the impact of a discount mass merchandiser (Wal-Mart) on the sales of a conventional retail grocery outlet (David's Supermarket, Inc.) located in the rural areas surrounding the Dallas/Ft. Worth metroplex was analyzed. In this case study, it was estimated that Wal-Mart alone is responsible for about a 21 percent reduction in sales. This result supports the contention that mass merchandisers (supercenters) are a notable source of competition to traditional food retailers.

Projections of sales in the year 2000 from mass merchandisers using supercenter formats are in the \$30 billion to \$35 billion range, up from \$10 billion currently. Supercenters are the prime retail growth vehicle, ranging in size from 100,000 to 200,000 square feet. They contain a complete discount general merchandise outlet and a large-scale, low-price supermarket under one roof. The theory that people won't shop for food and fashion merchandise at the same time apparently does not hold water.

Club stores are projected to reach about \$40 billion by the turn of the century, up from about

\$25 billion currently. Slower growth then is expected in warehouse clubs compared to mass merchandisers. The clubs expanded so rapidly that there exists, at present, cannibalization among club stores. Due in part to the "efficient consumer response" (ECR) initiative, traditional supermarkets are now generally more competitive with warehouse clubs.

What implications can we draw from this paper? Traditional grocery outlets will face heightened competition from mass merchants like Wal-Mart, K-Mart, and Target and at the same time, but to a lesser degree, from warehouse club and discount drug stores. Notable losers in terms of share of sales as a result of this competition are the superettes and mom and pop stores. To stabilize market share, traditional grocery outlets must make full use of the ECR initiative, especially in efforts to reduce prices and yet maintain profit margins. Also, the supermarket industry is highly unionized, and consequently, labor costs are high. Most mass merchandisers, on the other hand, have a non-union labor force. In order to lower their cost structure and improve their competitive position vis-à-vis K-Mart, Wal-Mart, and Target, supermarket companies must take tougher stances in union negotiations.

Additional research in this area will be of benefit to help us predict the future direction of the food system. To illustrate, replications of this research in other geographic areas are in order. With repeated measurements, one will be in position to ascertain the average impact of mass merchandisers like Wal-Mart on traditional food retailers. Additionally, the impacts of mass merchandisers are not likely to be evenly distributed across all departments within the traditional retail food establishment. To test this hypothesis, one must obtain sales information by department. This information was not available in this study. Without question, additional research will help in the understanding of the changes that are occurring in the way retail establishments deliver food to consumers.

References

- American Institute of Food Distribution, Inc. The Food Institute Report. Fair Lawn, New Jersey. Selected issues.
- Coopers and Lybrand, LLP. Personal communication.
- Food Marketing Review, 1994-95. U.S. Department of Agriculture, Economic Research Service, Agricultural Eco-

nomic Report Number 743, Washington, D.C. September 1996.

- Kaufman, P.R. "What's Driving Food Distribution Forces for Change," Journal of Food Distribution Research (February 1996): 25-29.
- Kinsey, J. and B. Senauer. "Consumer Trends and Changing Food Retailing Formats," American Journal of Agricultural Economics 78,5(December 1996):1187-1191.

Progressive Grocer. Selected issues.

U.S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics Consumer Price Indices, selected issues.