DISCUSSION PAPERS
Institute of Economics
University of Copenhagen

05-01

Credit Constraints and Determinants of the Cost of Capital in Vietnamese Manufacturing

John Rand

Credit Constraints and Determinants of the Cost of Capital in Vietnamese Manufacturing.*

John Rand

University of Copenhagen and DERG

December 2004

Abstract

This paper examines the extent to which borrowing constraints restrict firm access to credit and identifies individual, firm, and loan characteristics, which determine the cost of capital in Vietnamese manufacturing. Using direct information from a Vietnamese enterprise survey I show that 14 percent of the enterprises are credit constrained, and these enterprises would increase their debt holdings by 34 percent if borrowing constraints were relaxed. Moreover, it emerges that informal credit markets play an important role for fast growing firms. Enterprises do not appear to have the necessary time to go through the many administrative difficulties in the formal credit system if they want to "seize the day". Finally, collateralized loans face larger interest rates, explained by the significant influence of "policy lending" in Vietnamese credit markets.

Keywords: O16, O53

JEL Classifications: Financial markets, credit constraints, Vietnam

1   Introduction

A former Vietnamese Secretary General once stated that Vietnam has, in principle, three problems related to future economic development: "Capital, capital and capital" (see MPDF ,1997). According to a recent survey by MPDF (1997) the private small and medium scale enterprises (SMEs) share this view in the sence that they perceive their main obstacles to growth as "Credit, credit and credit". In the early 1990s concern among donors and Vietnamese officials about the malfunctioning of financial markets gave rise to the promotion and establishment of formal credit institutions targeted at the poor. Moreover, the government announced that policy-induced lending by State Owned Commercial Banks (SOCBs), primarily to State Owned Enterprises (SOEs), would be phased out. However, the SOCBs continued to serve mainly the SOEs, and doubt regarding the ability of public banks and the financial system in general to fulfil the growing demand for credit from the fast growing private sector emerged.

Previous studies on credit constraints have due to lack of direct measures of credit constraints typically identified unconstrained firms by dividing the sample under consideration according to the ratio of financial assets to the market value of the firm (Fazzari *et al.*, 1988).[1] In this paper a more direct approach is applied. I categorize firms as being credit constrained based on replies to direct questions about whether the firm applied for credit and if they applied whether they were denied access. I then use information for the non-constrained firms to get an estimate of actual debt demand, and use this estimate to measure desired debt for constrained firms, based on observed individual firm specific characteristics. This paper therefore has two main objectives. First, using a Vietnamese enterprise survey conducted in 2002 I identify credit constrained SMEs directly, determine whether there exists a gap between desired debt and observed debt, and establish an estimate of the magnitude of borrowing constraints. Second, I use information on

---

[1]See Schiantarelli (1996) for an overview of the problems faced when using the q-type and the Euler equation approaches.

1

credit access and interest rates to identify determinants of credit access and the cost of capital facing Vietnamese SMEs.

Credit constraints and establishing the magnitude hereof have important policy implications. Differences in the cost of internal and external financing can influence the way in which the effects of fiscal policy and monetary policy are perceived. As summarized in Hubbard (1998) contractionary monetary policy raises the cost of external financing relatively more for constrained firms, both in terms of higher interest rates and as a larger spread between internal and external funds. Consequently, investment tends to be lower, than in unconstrained firms. Moreover, identifying characteristics of credit constrained firms can help policy makers to target firms which are more likely to face binding credit constraints, such as young non-household firms.

The main results are that only 14 percent of Vietnamese SMEs are credit constrained, and these enterprises would increase their debt holdings 34 percent if borrowing constraints were relaxed. The data furthermore suggest that larger firms have access to cheaper credit, and although male entrepreneurs obtain credit more frequently, there seems to be no discrimination against women. The probability of accessing credit is higher in rural areas, but rural firms at the same time experience larger credit constraints, indicating that demand for external funds is significantly higher in rural areas than in the three larger urban cities, Ho Chi Minh City (HCMC), Hanoi and Haiphong. Moreover, non-household enterprises often face larger credit constraints, suggesting that a shift in the present policy focus from the smaller household firms towards supporting larger private and limited liability companies maybe justified. Finally, borrower-lender relationships reduce interest rates, suggesting that relationship lending provides important information about borrower quality in the segmented Vietnamese credit market.

The remainder of the paper is organized as follows. Section 2 identifies the characteristics of credit constrained SMEs in Vietnam and estimates the magnitude of these constraints. Section 3 put focus on the firms, which get access to credit, and examines the empirical determinants of credit availability and the interest rate

on the most recent loan. Section 4 concludes.

2 Identifying credit constrained firms

Most of the empirical literature concerning firm credit constraints focuses on either q-models of investment or on an Euler equation approach (for excellent overviews see Hubbard, 1998 and Schiantarelli, 1996). As an example, the latter approach relies on the Euler equation to describe the firm's choice of capital stock in modeling investment decisions. To check whether credit constraints are present over-identifying restrictions are added to the Euler equation and tests for model misspecification are carried out. According to Bigsten *et al.* (2003) most studies find significant effects of such restrictions, leading to the conclusion that firms are credit constrained. I take a more direct approach, using survey data for SMEs in Vietnam to identify liquidity constrained firms.

2.1 Data

The data were generated in an enterprise survey conducted in 2002, gathering information for the years 2000 and 2001, respectively. The survey covered over 1,600 enterprises in four provinces (Ha Tay, Long An, Quang Nam and Phu Tho) and three cities (HCMC, Hanoi and Haiphong), focusing on the non-state sector. In all the areas covered by the survey, the sample was stratified by ownership form to ensure the inclusion of all types of non-state enterprises, including household, private, co-operative firms, limited companies and share-holding companies. The stratification, ensured first, that household enterprises account for about 70 percent of the enterprises (Sakai and Takata, 2000) and, second, that the 30 percent non-household (and non-state) enterprises were divided according to GSO (2004): Private enterprises (39 percent), co-operatives (7 percent), limited companies (37 percent), joint-stock companies (4 percent) and foreign invested firms (4 percent). For reasons of implementation the survey was confined to specific areas in each

3

province/city. After data cleaning 1119 entries survived.[2]

Table 1 displays sample means for selected variables covering the whole sample and for sub-samples where firms hold debt and are unconstrained in their access to credit, respectively. In transpires, first of all, that Vietnamese firms have a relative low debt to assets share, confirming that a large part of investment financing by Vietnamese SMEs is done through retained earnings. Furthermore, only 14 percent of the enterprises in the data consider themselves credit constrained, while 54 percent hold positive debt.[3]

Firms that are unconstrained do not differ much from constrained firms in terms of size measured by average total assets and revenue. Moreover, it seems as if constrained firms are on average experiencing larger growth rates (measured as the growth in real revenue from 2000 to 2001) than unconstrained firms. From column two in Table 1 it can be seen that firms holding debt are often larger and grow faster than non-debt holders. Debt holders are often relatively young firms, and older firms are often on average less credit constrained than their younger counterparts.

Another group of variables includes characteristics of the owner. Enterprises are primarily owned by men (77.8 percent).[4] Male owned firms are more likely to hold debt, but on average there seems to be no gender discrimination in credit markets. Relatively more men are credit constrained. Regarding measures of the level of human capital, I combined information on average educational level of the enterprise owner and data on whether the owner had any longer-term formal or informal experience prior to establishing the firm. On this basis, skills were categorized as high, medium or low,[5] and it appears that a relatively large part of

---

[2]Further details on the survey and sampling procedures can be found in Rand *et al.* (2004).

[3]I identify whether or not a firm is credit constrained from replies to direct questions about whether firms were denied credit when they applied.

[4]This finding can be contrasted with Vijverberg and Haughton (2004) analysing non-farm enterprises in the Vietnamese Living Standards Survey (VLSS). They report that only 43% of the enterprises are male owned. However, this might reflect that the question posed in the VLSS is "Who among the household members is most knowledgeable about the activities of the enterprise", which is not directly a question about ownership.

[5]The owner was classified as being highly skilled if he had either more than 12 years of schooling or prior long-term formal experience in the line of business in question. Medium skilled owners have formal education between 8 and 12 years or prior long-term informal experience in the particular

the low skilled owners are debt holders. Regarding credit constraints there does not seem to be much difference between constrained and unconstrained groups in terms of educational level.

Table 1: Mean statistics

	Total Sample	Debt Holders	Unconstrained
Assets (log)	12.775	12.860	12.772
Revenue (log)	12.425	12.703	12.390
Revenue growth	0.101	0.122	0.091
Profitshare	0.165	0.170	0.160
Age	11.219	10.492	11.348
Gender	0.778	0.804	0.769
High skilled	0.298	0.271	0.292
Medium skilled	0.375	0.356	0.380
Low skilled	0.327	0.373	0.328
HCMC	0.154	0.119	0.166
Hanoi	0.163	0.130	0.169
Haiphong	0.163	0.125	0.169
Ha Tay	0.181	0.221	0.177
Long An	0.145	0.161	0.139
Phu Tho	0.101	0.130	0.097
Quang Nam	0.094	0.114	0.083
Household enterprise	0.734	0.691	0.753
Private firm	0.091	0.110	0.079
Cooperative	0.081	0.077	0.084
Limited/Share holding	0.094	0.122	0.083
Debt share	0.084	0.158	0.078
Unconstrained	0.857	0.844	1.000
Positive debt holders	0.534	1.000	0.527
Observations	1119	598	959

Table 1 also identifies a set of firm specific characteristics, related to ownership structure and location. Location is modelled using indicator variables representing each area. The 2002 survey covered three urban cities HCMC, Hanoi, and Haiphong, and four rural provinces Ha Tay, Long An, Phu Tho and Quang Nam, and it is noticeable that a relatively large part of the enterprises in rural areas are debt holders. Moreover, credit constraints seem to be relatively more prevalent in rural areas as well. Turning to ownership structure, private enterprises as well as limited

line of business. Finally, low skilled owners have either no prior experience or less than 8 years of schooling.

and share holding companies are relatively more credit constrained than household firms, as shown by the drop in the share from the total sample in column 1 to the unconstrained sample in column 3. Moreover, the proportion of household enterprises is lower in the debt holders group than in the entire sample. Finally, it seems as if reinvested profit is still a major source of firm financing in Vietnam, given the relative low debt to assets share (8.7 percent).

2.2 Empirical model

Joint analysis of the desired level of debt and credit constrained firms can be performed using a two step sample selection model, which has only been used in analysing credit constrained households in the US (see Cox and Jappelli, 1993, and Duca and Rosenthal, 1993). In this approch it is recorded whether enterprises with positive debt holdings are credit constrained and conditional on being a credit constrained firm, holding positive debt, I estimate the desired level of debt of the individual firm. Assume that the desired level of debt to assets ratio, d, for firm i, is a linear function of a vector of observables x_{1i}.

$$d_i = x_{1i}\beta_1 + \varepsilon_{1i} \tag{1}$$

where ε_{1i} is a random component for firm i. The underlying estimation problem is that the desired debt to asset share for firm i (described by d_i) is only observed if the demand for debt is positive ($b_i = 1$) and the firm is not credit constrained ($n_i = 1$). A direct estimate of equation 1 is therefore likely to be biased, if the variables which determine whether a firm is credit constrained or has debt also affect the level of desired debt. Given that some firms prefer not to hold debt, equation 2 controls for the fact that debt holdings are truncated from below by zero.

$$b_i = 1[x_{2i}\beta_2 + \varepsilon_{2i} > 0] \tag{2}$$

where b_i is a binary variable, which takes the value of one if the firm holds

positive debt, x_{2i} contains proxies for the convenience of having debt, and ε_{2i} is a firm specific error term.

Direct measures of credit constraints have generally not been available in previous studies, and Jappelli (1990) show that the indirect proxies used often generate large errors when classifying unconstrained individuals. This highlight the advantages of identifying directly whether or not a firm is credit constrained as done in the present study. The underlying latent variable credit constraint model is given by equation 3

$$n_i = 1[x_{3i}\beta_3 + \varepsilon_{3i} > 0] \tag{3}$$

where n_i is a binary variable, which takes the value of one if the firm is non-constrained, x_{3i} is a vector of credit constraint proxies, and ε_{3i} is a random error term for firm i.

The inverse Mills ratios from the estimates of equations 2 and 3 are used to correct for selection bias, ensuring consistent estimates of the debt demand in equation 1. The equation for d_i for the selected sample is therefore

$$E(d_i|b_i = 1, n_i = 1) = x_{1i}\beta_1 + E(\varepsilon_{1i}|b_i = 1, n_i = 1) \tag{4}$$

Following Cox and Jappelli (1993) I assume that the error terms are normally distributed with mean zero and variance σ_1, σ_2 and σ_3, respectively. I also use the standard probit normalization ($\sigma_2 = \sigma_3 = 1$) to obtain consistent estimates of β_2 and β_3. Estimating debt demand therefore boils down to

$$d_i = x_{1i}\beta_1 + \frac{\phi(b_i)}{F(b_i)}\gamma_2 + \frac{\phi(n_i)}{F(n_i)}\gamma_3 \tag{5}$$

where $\frac{\phi(b)}{F(b)}$ and $\frac{\phi(n)}{F(n)}$ are the inverse Mill's ratios, and $\phi(*)$ and $F(*)$ are the probability and cumulative distribution function, respectively.

2.3 Credit demand and constraints

A reduced form firm debt demand function can be estimated using only unconstrained firms that hold positive debt. Table 2 presents the regressions for being unconstrained and for holding positive debt, respectively. It is clear that the probability of being unconstrained is larger in the urban areas HCMC, Hanoi and Haiphong than in the rural provinces of Ha Tay, Long An, Phu Tho and Quang Nam. This is in accordance with Van de Walle and Cratty (2004), who state that post-reform government policies in terms of access to credit has tended to favour urban areas. Furthermore, private firms as well as limited and share holding companies are less likely to be unconstrained. This is contrary to the general perception that financing constraints are more binding for smaller firms, which have a higher probability of going bankrupt (the positive relationship between size and survival).[6]

Results from the estimation of the debt incidence equation indicate that the probability of holding debt increases with revenue earnings. Moreover, holding debt is negatively related to age. Older firms are often more settled and less likely to engage in activities that require capital demanding initiatives, which is in accordance with findings that older firm are less innovative. Higher levels of education reduce the probability of having positive debt. This finding is somewhat surprising given the expectation that higher education should affect investment possibilities and thereby increase the probability of holding debt.

Table 3 report results for both the unadjusted generalized tobit estimation and the debt equation corrected for the two sources of selection bias (column 2 and 3 are without and with exclusion restrictions, respectively). Total assets and revenue earnings exert opposing effects on the demand for debt, where increasing assets lower the desired debt share by around 3-4 percent, and larger revenue earnings increase desired debt share by approximately 8 percent. In the unadjusted case age comes out insignificant, however adjusting for the selection bias it turns out that older firms have lower demand for debt than their younger counterparts. A

---

[6]The results reported here are consistent with Hansen *et al.* (2004), who document that the positive correlation between firm size and survival is not present in these data.

Table 2: Non-constrained firms holding positive debt

| | Unconstrained | | Debt Incidence | |
	Coefficient	t-statistics	Coefficient	t-statistics
Assets (log)	−0.012	(0.86)	−0.007	(0.31)
Revenue (log)	0.000	(0.03)	0.104***	(5.57)
Revenue growth	−0.037	(1.45)	−0.002	(0.05)
Profit share	−0.119*	(1.89)	−0.061	(0.53)
Age	0.000	(0.07)	−0.006**	(2.50)
Gender	−0.029	(1.12)	0.062	(1.57)
High skilled	0.002	(0.08)	−0.191***	(4.46)
Medium skilled	0.018	(0.75)	−0.133***	(3.43)
Hanoi	−0.055	(1.22)	0.078	(1.36)
Haiphong	−0.069	(1.57)	0.076	(1.31)
Ha Tay	−0.200***	(3.99)	0.368***	(6.84)
Long An	−0.188***	(3.63)	0.283***	(4.96)
Phu Tho	−0.213***	(3.54)	0.378***	(6.41)
Quang Nam	−0.235***	(3.72)	0.352***	(5.55)
Private	−0.127***	(3.00)	0.061	(1.01)
Coop	−0.034	(0.72)	0.039	(0.58)
Limited/Share holding	−0.198***	(3.59)	0.105	(1.54)
Observations	1119		1119	
Pseudo R-sq	0.07		0.12	

Probit estimates, marginal effects. *, **, *** indicate significance at a 10%, 5% and 1% level, respectively. Base: Low skilled, HCMC, household enterprise. All regressions included a constant term. The probit for holding debt and the probit for being unconstrained may have correlated errors. A bi-variate probit was therefore estimated. The correlation between the errors in the two equations was not significantly different from zero, so estimation proceeded, treating the two equations as independent selection criteria.

plausible explanation is that firms over the lifecycle increase the probability of self-financing and over time get less innovative, thereby reducing their demand for external funds. Moreover, the negative gender effect in the unadjusted equation disappears when including the two selection terms. This finding, combined with the results in Table 2, suggests that there is no direct discrimination against women in Vietnamese credit markets. This is contrary to the findings in Fafchamps (2000) for the manufacturing sector in the African region where a gender bias is found, suggesting the existence of regional differences. The coefficients on the demographic variables are quite clear. Highly skilled owners have significantly lower demand for debt in the adjusted estimations, supporting the somewhat surprising results described above. The demand for debt is relatively high in rural areas. The fast demise of the credit cooperative system in the first phase of the Doi Moi reform may be responsible for the unfulfilled credit demand and the credit constraints facing rural areas.

Finally, Table 3 shows that the demand for debt is significantly higher among private firms, cooperatives, limited and share holding companies as compared to household enterprises. Not surprisingly limited liability and share holding companies demand 52 percent more external funds as compared to household enterprises, and they also have the highest rates of unsuccessful loan applications (not reported, see Rand et al., 2004 for details).

2.4 The credit gap

The credit gap can be defined as the difference between the average desired level of debt, d (the sum of constrained firms' desired debt d_c and unconstrained firms desired debt d_{uc}), and the average actual debt d^a (the sum of constrained firms' actual debt d_c^a and the actual debt of unconstrained firms d_{uc}^a). Therefore for firms that are not credit constrained $d_{uc} = d_{uc}^a$. The average gap between desired and acual debt can be written as

Table 3: Debt demand

	Unadjusted		Selectivity adj		Selectivity adj. (identified)	
	Coeff.	t-stats	Coeff.	t-stats	Coeff.	t-stats
Assets (log)	−0.041***	(3.58)	−0.027**	(1.93)	−0.039***	(4.20)
Revenue (log)	0.026***	(2.81)	0.084***	(3.40)	0.081***	(3.32)
Revenue growth	0.051***	(2.65)	0.112***	(3.71)	0.091***	(4.17)
Profit share	−0.053	(1.11)	0.097	(1.04)		
Age	−0.001	(1.42)	−0.005***	(3.04)	−0.005***	(2.85)
Gender	−0.039**	(2.24)	0.044	(1.28)	0.025	(0.90)
High Skilled	0.017	(0.90)	−0.099**	(2.15)	−0.085**	(1.98)
Medium skilled	0.012	(0.85)	−0.094**	(2.33)	−0.075**	(2.23)
Hanoi	−0.097***	(3.28)	0.006	(0.13)	−0.017	(0.44)
Haiphong	−0.077**	(2.43)	0.036	(0.70)	0.005	(0.14)
Ha Tay	−0.048*	(1.65)	0.408**	(2.38)	0.308**	(2.49)
Long An	0.007	(0.23)	0.390***	(2.66)	0.305***	(2.88)
Phu Tho	0.008	(0.23)	0.495***	(2.69)	0.391***	(2.88)
Quang Nam	−0.042	(1.09)	0.456**	(2.43)	0.344**	(2.55)
Private	0.052**	(2.01)	0.267***	(3.00)	0.202***	(3.76)
Coop	0.130***	(3.91)	0.212***	(4.42)	0.192***	(4.54)
Limited/Share holding	0.216***	(6.26)	0.520***	(3.97)	0.433***	(5.32)
Non-constrained			−0.909**	(2.22)	−0.603***	(2.72)
Debt incidence			0.422**	(2.55)	0.374**	(2.44)
Observations	505		505		505	
R-squared	0.27		0.29		0.28	

Dependent variable: Total debt to assets share. Generalized tobit estimates, marginal effects.
*, **, *** indicate significance at a 10%, 5% and 1% level, respectively. Base: Low skilled,
HCMC, household enterprise. All regressions included a constant term. Estimates in column
3 are based on Mills ratios calculated using estimates where revenue growth is excluded in
the debt incidence equation, and log revenue is excluded in the unconstrained equation.

11

$$GAP = d_c \frac{f_c}{f} + d_{uc} \frac{f_{uc}}{f} - d^a = x_c \beta_1 \frac{f_c}{f} + d_{uc} \frac{f_{uc}}{f} - d^a \qquad (6)$$

where f_c is the number of constrained firms, and f_{uc} is the number of unconstrained firms, so $f = f_c + f_{uc}$. The vector x_c contains the means of observables for the constrained firms, and $\hat{\beta}_1$ is the estimate of β_1 taken from Table 3. The average desired debt to asset share was estimated to be 34 percent larger than the actual debt to asset share for constrained Vietnamese firms. These results indicate that even though rejected applicants and discouraged borrowers amount to only 14 percent of the sample, Vietnamese SMEs would acquire on average 7 percent more debt if credit constraints were removed.

3 The cost of capital

In this section I take the analysis one step further and focus on the group that at some point in time were able to obtain credit from either formal or informal sources. Table 4 gives an overview of enterprises having accessed credit even though they consider themselves credit constrained. As reported above 14 percent of the enterprises are credit constrained, and 53 percent hold positive debt. However, during the 1994-2002 period 45 percent (72 out of 160) of the constrained firms managed to get access to some external funds. Moreover, 61 firms out of the 582 that did not get credit access during the 1994-2002 period had debt obtained before 1994. Only 48 percent of the non-constrained firms applied for and got a loan, confirming that many SMEs use internal funds to finance new investments.

Table 5 reports sample means of selected variables for the enterprises that have accessed credit, and for sub-samples divided by source of credit. First, the monthly interest rate charged is 0.6 percent on average and collateral was required in only 42 percent of the cases. Dividing by informal (private moneylender and friends and relatives) and formal segments (private and government banks, enterprises and poverty alleviation and job creation programmes)[7] it can be seen that the informal

---

[7]Vietnam Bank for Social Policies (VBSP) took over the functions of the Vietnam Bank for

Table 4: Debt, Credit Access and Constraints

	Positive debt	No debt	Total
Constrained	93	67	160
Not constrained	505	454	959
Total	598	521	1119
	Credit accessed	No credit accessed	Total
Constrained	72	88	160
Not constrained	465	494	959
Total	537	582	1119
	Credit accessed	No credit accessed	Total
Positive debt	537	61	598
No debt	0	521	521
Total	537	582	1119

sector makes up around 30-35 percent of the credit market, depending on whether the measure is divided by source or by amount of credit.[8] Government banks (State Owned Commercial Banks, SOCBs)[9] provide approximately 40 percent of the credit, whereas private banks only make up for 5 percent of the total credit extended to manufacturing firms in Vietnam. Compared to the results reported in McMillan and Woodruff (1999a), where most private firms are excluded from formal financial markets (only 21 percent received formal bank loans), it seems as if formal credit possibilities have increased since 1995-96.

Informal credit is characterized by loans where no collateral is required, but the interest rate ranges between 0 percent and as high as 6 percent per month, depending on whether the source of credit is a private moneylender (average 1.9

---

the Poor and the People's Credit Fund network. VBSP concentrates its government subsidized lending to poor households and businesses in remote areas. (World Bank, 2003)

[8] Duong and Izumida (2002) analyse credit issues for households in Vietnam. They report that the informal sector only accounts for around 20% of total loans. However, my estimates are more in line with those reported in McMillan and Woodruff (1999a) where the informal credit system and trade credits play the most important role in supplying credit to SMEs.

[9] The four largest SOCBs are The Vietnamese Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development (VBARD), the Industry and Commerce Bank of Vietnam (Incombank), Foreign Trade Bank of Vietnam (Vietcombank) and the Vietnamese Bank for Investment and Development (VBID). These are the leading banks in the banking system with more than 230 branches in all cities and provinces in Vietnam. In 1999 the outstanding loan volume of the four SOCBs accounted for 73 per cent of all loans in the economy (Kovsted *et al.*, 2004). Among the SOCBs it is mainly Vietcombank and VBARD that have an extensive branch network at the district and village levels. They are therefore the main lenders to private enterprises.

Table 5: Mean Statistics

	Credit access	Money-lender	Friends and rel.	Private bank	Govern. bank	Enter-prise	Prog-ramme
Revenue growth	0.121	0.267	0.115	0.049	0.134	0.039	0.133
Interest rate (monthly, percent)	0.599	1.867	0.301	1.085	0.902	0.087	0.255
Loan amount (log)	10.299	10.402	9.899	9.789	10.844	11.079	9.520
Collateral	0.419	0.000	0.011	0.815	0.895	0.059	0.147
Relationship	0.654	0.600	0.733	0.778	0.524	0.941	0.667
Share of total credit supply	1.000	0.028	0.328	0.050	0.391	0.063	0.140
Observations	537	15	176	27	210	34	75

percent) or friends and relatives (average 0.3 percent). Note also that 73 percent of friends and relatives did not charge any interest. This corresponds to the findings in McMillan and Woodruff (1999a) where interest rates paid by private manufacturing firms in informal credit markets in Vietnam are as high as 4 percent to 7 percent per month. One feature of the data is that firms obtaining loans from private moneylenders experience relatively large revenue growth rates. Formal loans often involve time-consuming procedures in fulfilling applications and other administrative difficulties that slow down the loan approval processes. Firms which experience increased demand for their products and wish to expand production may not have the time to go through administrative difficulties in the formal credit system if they want to "seize the day". It is therefore possible that private moneylenders make fast growing firms able to meet increasing demand.

Interest rate diversity in the formal credit market is also observed. Private and government banks charge on average the highest interest rates (monthly rates between 0.9-1.1 percent, on average) in the formal market, and in order to obtain a loan from either of these two sources the firms are often required to offer collateral (over 80 percent of the loans are collateralized). However, on average government banks offer larger loans than can be obtained in informal credit markets. In our sample, firms that obtain loans from private banks are characterized by being male owned, with low skill, and operating a household enterprise in rural areas. This also explains why the average loan amount from private banks in our sample is relatively

14

small. Government credit programmes are characterized by offering relatively small loans (often to household enterprises), but at a low interest rate and often without collateral requirements. Loans from other enterprises can in many cases be seen as a form of interfirm trade credit, which is often characterized by relatively low rates of interest and collateral requirements. Moreover, the loans obtained are relatively large, and in 94 percent of the cases the borrower has prior relations with the creditor.[10] This is in accordance with McMillan and Woodruff (1999b), who show that interfirm relationships are associated with larger credit, at a rate that diminishes with time. However, this form of interfirm credit relationships is more common among private enterprises, cooperatives, and limited and share-holding companies as compared to household SMEs.

3.1 Credit access and determinants of loan rates

Table 6 presents the results from analysing the determinants of credit access. Column 1 contains the full sample, whereas column 2 and 3 only consider constrained and non-constrained enterprises, respectively. As described above a total of 537 enterprises accessed credit out of the 1119 sampled.

Consistent with previous studies for both developed (Uzzi, 1999) and developing countries (Bigsten *et al.*, 2003) I find that firms are more likely to access credit if they are larger in terms of total real revenue. Moreover, the probability of accessing credit appears to be negatively related to firm age. This probably reflects that older firms finance investments using accumulated profits to a larger extent.

Turning to specific owner characteristics it appears that male owned firms obtain credit more frequently than female owned firms. Moreover, looking at the constrained sample the male entrepreneur is to a larger extent able to get access to external funds as compared to his female counterpart. Education seems to play an important role in the credit allocation process. The negative correlations between being high or medium skilled and accessing credit might reflect that owners with

---

[10]The relationship dummy takes on a value of one if the firm has borrowed from the creditor before and zero otherwise.

Table 6: Determinants of Credit Access

	All	Constrained	Non-constrained
Assets (log)	−0.003	−0.046	0.008
	(0.13)	(0.64)	0.35
Revenue (log)	0.094***	0.164***	0.079***
	(5.17)	(2.89)	(4.03)
Revenue growth	−0.006	−0.087	−0.003
	(0.15)	(0.98)	(0.06)
Profit share	−0.043	0.363	−0.074
	(0.38)	(1.15)	(0.61)
Age	−0.005**	−0.010*	−0.004
	(2.12)	(1.68)	(1.51)
Gender	0.073*	0.223*	0.063
	(1.85)	(1.82)	(1.46)
High skilled	−0.176***	−0.113	−0.179***
	(4.15)	(0.98)	(3.85)
Medium skilled	−0.129***	0.044	−0.153***
	(3.36)	(0.41)	(3.66)
Hanoi	0.134**	0.303	0.097
	(2.27)	(1.47)	(1.54)
Haiphong	0.123**	0.247	0.112*
	(2.07)	(1.17)	(1.78)
Hatay	0.410***	−0.010	0.448***
	(7.35)	(0.04)	(7.71)
Long An	0.323***	−0.046	0.359***
	(5.47)	(0.19)	(5.83)
Phu Tho	0.449***	−0.015	0.492***
	(7.47)	(0.06)	(7.88)
Quang Nam	0.324***	0.213	0.315***
	(4.68)	(0.87)	(4.19)
Private firm	0.067	−0.081	0.084
	(1.11)	(0.55)	(1.24)
Cooperative	0.047	−0.173	0.069
	(0.70)	(0.83)	(0.95)
Limited/Share holding	0.083	−0.226	0.132*
	(1.24)	(1.28)	(1.74)
Observations	1119	160	959
Pseudo R-squared	0.11	0.17	0.14

Probit estimates, marginal effects. *, **, *** indicate significance at a 10%, 5% and 1% level, respectively. Base: Low skilled, HCMC, household enterprise. All regressions included a constant term.

16

higher educational levels have lower demand for credit or that better educated owners are more likely to know when their application will be rejected and therefore refrain from applying.

Looking at firm characteristics it is clear that location is of significant importance in determining access to credit. In our sample the probability of accessing credit is higher in rural (Hatay, Long An, Phu Tho and Quang Nam) than in urban areas (HCMC, Hanoi, Haiphong). In previous sections I noted that the demand for credit is higher in rural areas and although rural areas also experience larger credit constraints, it seems as if some part of the credit demand in rural areas is successfully fulfilled. Moreover, most of government bank credit is allocated towards rural areas (not reported) confirming that local governments often are distinctly protective of firms in rural areas, which are more oriented towards serving local markets and therefore tend to escape some of the credit barriers inherent in larger, possibly more outward oriented markets. The ownership legal structure does not seem to be an important determinant for credit access in Vietnam. Only in the case of the non-constrained sample (column 3) is there an indication of limited liability and share-holding companies experiencing significantly higher access to credit than the smaller household enterprises.

Regressions that explain the variation in the interest rate quoted on the most recent loan are reported in Table 7. First, firms holding debt pay larger interest on current loans. However, when controlling for loan specific characteristics this effect disappears. Consistent with other studies (Petersen and Rajan, 1994, for the US), there is a statistically significant indication of firm size (measured by total assets) being negatively related to the cost of capital, but measured in terms of real revenue a positive effect emerges. The average combined effect of these two measures of size is negative. That is, larger firms get cheaper credit, which corresponds well with the results obtained in Uzzi (1999) for U.S. non-agricultural SMEs. Firm age does not seem to play a significant role as a determinant of cost of capital, which is contrary to the findings in Petersen and Rajan (1994).[11] Firms reputation measured by

---

[11]Squared terms were included, but gave no statistically significant outcome.

Table 7: Cost of Capital Determinants

	(1)		(2)		(3)	
	Coeff	t-stats	Coeff	t-stats	Coeff	t-stats
Assets (log)	−0.030	(0.80)	−0.103***	(2.90)	−0.082***	(2.90)
Debt share	0.341**	(2.56)	−0.175	(1.29)	−0.121	(0.96)
Revenue (log)	0.037	(1.28)	0.047*	(1.68)	0.051**	(2.16)
Revenue growth	−0.059	(1.11)	−0.048	(0.99)	−0.060	(1.14)
Profit share	0.191	(1.13)	0.126	(0.74)	−0.015	(0.11)
Age	−0.002	(0.62)	−0.000	(0.12)	0.001	(0.18)
Loan amount (log)			0.049**	(2.32)	0.023	(1.18)
Collateral			0.424***	(8.20)	0.153***	(2.96)
Relationship			−0.168***	(3.58)	−0.145***	(3.17)
Moneylender					1.092***	(2.86)
Friends and relatives					−0.403***	(6.01)
Private Bank					0.268***	(4.98)
Enterprise					−0.640***	(7.83)
Programme					−0.460***	(7.45)
Observations	537		537		537	
R-squared	0.17		0.28		0.50	

Robust t-statistics, marginal effects. *, **, *** indicate significance at a 10%, 5% and 1% level, respectively. Base: Government bank. All regressions included a constant term, owner characteristic, location and legal structure dummies. Loans were granted between 1994 and 2002. Time dummies for the year the loan was granted are therefore included. Only the most recent loan is considered.

the age of the firm therefore does not seem to influence the interest rates facing Vietnamese SMEs.

Turning to column 2 in Table 7, the size of the loan has a positive influence on the interest paid. However, this effect does not hold when controlling for source (column 3). Contrary to results normally found in the literature collateral is positively correlated with interest rates.[12] Explanations for this result may be found in the somewhat adverse lending criteria facing the State Owned Commercial Banks (SOCBs) in Vietnam. Although the government has announced that policy-induced lending is being phased out, "policy lending" has remained a defining characteristic of the SOCBs (Kovsted *et al.*, 2004). Other loan criteria than economic ones may therefore have a significant influence when evaluating loan applications and

---

[12] Analyzing the sub-sample where only strictly positive interest is charged does not change the overall picture reported in Table 5

Table 8: Government versus Private Banks

	Government Bank		Private Bank	
	Coeff	t-stats	Coeff	t-stats
Loan amount (log)	−0.008	(0.51)	−0.078***	(2.98)
Collateral	0.108**	(2.33)	−0.215***	(5.21)
Relationship	−0.019	(0.72)	0.139***	(5.05)
Observations	210		27	

Robust t-statistics, marginal effects. *, **, *** indicate significance at a 10%, 5% and 1% level, respectively. Base: Low skilled, HCMC, household enterprise. All regressions included a constant term, owner characteristic, firm characteristic, location, and time dummies.

given that government banks provide a major share of the credit the normal picture between collateral and interest rates may well be distorted. Table 8 gives an indication of the above argument. Looking strictly at private banks, larger loan amounts and loans based on collateral are charged with significantly lower interest rates, as found in most of the related literature. Government banks charge significantly higher interest rates on collateralized loans, indicating that government banks may use other/different criteria for determining interest rates.

As could be expected from the summary statistics in Table 4 a positive significant effect on the cost of capital exists when borrowing from private moneylenders, but also when borrowing from private banks as compared to loans obtained from government banks. Relatives, friends, other enterprises and government credit programmes charge significantly lower interest rates than government banks. Finally, from Table 7 it is clear that firms which have borrowed from the creditor before (Relationship), and have built up some kind of business relationship are faced with significantly lower costs of capital. This result is consistent with findings from the US (Berger and Udell, 1995, and Uzzi, 1999) where firms with longer banking relationships borrow at lower rates. However, note from Table 8 (in the case of private banks) that relationship lending is associated with larger interest rates.

4 Conclusion

The aim of this paper was two fold. First, I used direct information to identify credit constrained firms, and found that approximately 14 percent of Vietnamese SMEs are financially constrained. Removal of this constraint was estimated to increase external debt by around 7 percent on average. At a first glance this might seem as a relatively small effect. However for the constrained group a removal of constraints would boost liabilities by around 34 percent. Second, I analysed firms, which get access to credit, and examined the empirical determinants of credit availability and the interest rate on the most recent loan. The analysis demonstrated that: a) Larger firms get cheaper credit. b) Informal credit markets play an important role for fast growing firms, suggesting that enterprises may not have the time to go through administrative difficulties in the formal credit system if they want to "seize the day". c) While the probability of accessing credit is higher in rural areas, rural firms experience at the same time larger credit constraints, indicating that demand for external funds is significantly higher in rural areas than in the larger urban cities. d) Non-household enterprises often face larger credit constraints, suggesting that a shift in policy focus from the smaller household firms towards supporting larger private and limited liability companies is needed. e) Borrower-lender relationships reduce interest rates, indicating that relationship lending gives important information about borrower quality in the segmented Vietnamese credit market. f) Finally, collateralized loans face larger interest rates, explained by the significant influence of "policy lending" in Vietnamese credit markets.

References

[1] Berger, A.N. and Udell, G.F. (1995). "Relationship Lending and Lines of Credit in Small Firm Finance", *Journal of Business*, 68, 351-381.

[2] Bigsten, A., Collier, P, Dercon, S., Fafchamps, M., Gauthier, B., Gunning, J.W., Oduro, A., Oostendorf, R., Patillo, C., Söderbom, M., Teal, F. and Zeufack, A. (2003). "Credit Constraints in Manufacturing Enterprises in Africa", *Journal of African Economies*, 12, 104-125.

[3] Cox, D. and Jappeli, T. (1993). "The Effects of Borrowing Constraints on Consumer Liabilities", *Journal of Money, Credit and Banking*, 25, 197-213.

[4] Duca, J.V. and Rosenthal, S.S. (1993). "Borrowing Constraints, Household Debt, and Racial Discrimination in Loan Markets", *Journal of Financial Intermediation*, 3, 77-103.

[5] Duong, P.B. and Izumida, Y. (2002). "Rural Development Finance in Vietnam: A Microeconometric Analysis of Household Surveys", *World Development*, 30, 319-335.

[6] Fafchamps, M. (2000). "Ethnicity and credit in African manufacturing", *Journal of Development Economics*, 61, 205-235.

[7] Fazzari, F.M., Hubbard, R.G. and Petersen, B.C. (1988). "Financing Constraints and Corporate Investment", *Brookings Papers of Economic Activity*, 1, 141-195.

[8] GSO (2004). "The Real Situation of Enterprises. Through the Results of Surveys Conducted in 2001, 2002, 2003", Statistical Publishing House, Hanoi.

[9] Hansen, H., Rand, J., and Tarp, F. (2004). "SME Growth and Survival in Vietnam: Did Direct Government Support Matter", Discussion Paper 04-13, Institute of Economics, University of Copenhagen.

[10] Hubbard, R.G. (1998). "Capital-Market Imperfections and Investment", *Journal of Economic Literature*, 36, 193-225.

[11] Jappelli, T. (1990). "Who is Credit Constrained in the U.S. Economy?", *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 105, 219-234.

[12] Kovsted, J., Rand, J. and Tarp, F. (2004). "From Monobank to Commercial Banking. Financial Sector Reforms in Vietnam", NIAS Publishing, Copenhagen.

[13] McMillan, J. and Woodruff, C. (1999a). "Dispute Prevention Without Courts in Vietnam", *Journal of Law, Economics and Organization*, 15, 637-658.

[14] McMillan, J. and Woodruff, C. (1999b). "Interfirm Relationships and Informal Credit in Vietnam", *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 114,1285-1320.

[15] MPDF (1997). "The Emerging Private Sector and the Industrialization of Vietnam", MPDF Private Sector Discussion Paper No. 1, Hanoi.

[16] Petersen, M.A. and Rajan, R.G. (1994). "The Benefits of Lending Relationships: Evidence from Small Business Data", *Journal of Finance*, 49, 3-37.

[17] Petersen, M.A. and Rajan, R.G. (1995). "The Effects of Credit Market Competition on Lending Relationships", *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 110, 407-443.

[18] Rand, J., Tarp, F., Dzung, N.H. and Vinh, D.Q. (2004). "Documentation of the Small and Medium Scale Enterprise (SME) Survey in Vietnam for the Year 2002", mimeo, Copenhagen. Download from www.econ.ku.dk/rand

[19] Sakai and Takata (2000). "Developing Small and Medium Scale Enterprises in Vietnam", NRI Papers No. 13, Nomura Research Institute.

[20] Schiantarelli, F. (1996). "Financial Constraints and Investment: Methodological Issues and International Evidence", *Oxford Review of Economic Policy*, 12, 70-89.

[21] Uzzi, B. (1999). "Embeddedness in the Making of Financial Capital: How Social Relations and Networks Benefit Firms Seeking Financing", *American Sociological Review*, 64, 481-505.

[22] Van de Walle, D. and Cratty, D. (2004). "Is the emerging non-farm market economy the route out of poverty in Vietnam", *Economics of Transition*, 12, 237-274.

[23] Vijverberg, W.P.M. and Haughton, J. (2004). "Household Enterprises in Vietnam: Survival, Growth, and Living Standards" in Glewwe, Agawal and Dollar "Economic Growth, Poverty, and Household Welfare in Vietnam", World Bank Regional and Sectoral Studies, World Bank, Washington, D.C.

[24] World Bank (2003). "Vietnam Development Report 2004: Poverty", World Bank, Hanoi.