# THE 'ACCOMPANYING SPOUSE DEPENDENT VISA STATUS': CHALLENGES AND CONSTRAINTS FACED BY ZIMBABWEAN IMMIGRANT WOMEN IN INTEGRATION INTO SOUTH AFRICA'S FORMAL LABOUR MARKET

## RUJEKO SAMANTHIA CHIMUKUCHE



UNIVERSITY OF
KWAZULU-NATAL

## COLLEGE OF HUMANITIES: SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for a PhD in Gender Studies at the

University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa.

**SUPERVISOR: DR. J. MUTHUKI**

# DECLARATION

I, Rujeko Samanthia Chimukuche, declare that:

The research reported in this thesis, except where otherwise indicated, is my original research.

2. This thesis has not been submitted for any degree or examination at any other university.

3. This thesis does not contain other persons' data, pictures, graphs or other information, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other persons.

4. This thesis does not contain other persons' writing, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other researchers. Where other written sources have been quoted, then:

a. Their words have been re-written, but the general information attributed to them has been referenced.

b. Where their exact words have been used, then their writing has been placed in italics and inside quotation marks and referenced.

5. This thesis does not contain text, graphics or tables copied and pasted from the Internet, unless specifically acknowledged, and the source being detailed in the thesis and in the reference sections.

**Student name: Rujeko Samanthia Chimukuche**

**Signature:**

**Supervisor:  Dr Janet Muthoni Muthuki**

**Signature:**

**Date:**

# DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to you my two sons, Aiden Tinashe and Tinaye Alden Chidawanyika. Both of you have given me tremendous strength to persevere and to excel in all the obstacles I went through. May this work be proof that you can accomplish anything that you aspire to do, and the Lord Almighty God always gives you the grace and strength to pursue your dreams.

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

# LIST OF ACRONYMS

| | |
|---|---|
| AU | African Union |
| AfCFTA | African Continental Free Trade Agreement |
| BAMF | Federal Office for Migration and Refugees |
| CEDAW | Convention on Elimination of All forms of Discrimination against Women |
| DHA | Department of Home Affairs |
| ECOWAS | Economic Community of West African States |
| EU | European Union |
| GAD | Gender and Development Approach |
| GAP II | European Union Gender Action Plan |
| IOM | International Organisation for Migration |
| ILO | International Labour Organisation |
| MNC | Multinational companies |
| MIPEX | Migrant Integration Policy Index |
| NGO | Non-governmental organisation |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development |
| OECD-DAC | OECD-Development Assistance Committee |
| SADC | Southern African Development Community |
| SAMP | Southern African Migration Programme |
| SDG | Sustainable development goal |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNCTAD | United Nations Conference on Trade and Development |
| UNDESA | United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs |

UNHCR                United Nations Refugee Agency

UNDP                United Nations Development Programme

USA                  United States of America

VFS                  Visa Facilitation Centre

WAD                Women and Development

WID                 Women in Development

# ABSTRACT

Transboundary migration at both regional and continental levels has become the defining feature of the 21st century. Among other issues, poverty and economic strife, regional conflict and extreme environmental disasters have been cited as key factors motivating global migration patterns. A holistic address to the current migration challenges, coupled with other key development issues such as gender, health and education can contribute significantly towards attaining the Sustainable Development Goals. The recent global migration crisis due to economic strife and war brings back to the fore an old age problem, but with fresh challenges. Migration and forced displacement are issues that require long-term solutions. In South Africa for example, whilst much attention has been placed on xenophobic attacks and other issues at the nexus of immigrant and indigenous communities, limited focus has been placed on the integration, specifically formal labour integration of immigrant communities and the gender inequalities that are prevalent. Despite noble efforts by South Africa hosting several immigrants, several challenges arise in integrating the migrants into society as it is often difficult to harmonize the interests of indigenous communities and those of foreign nationals.

This research study has aimed to fill in the gaps by analyzing how stringent immigration and visa regulations prevent skilled migrant women spouses from employment which often results in several societal vices including domestic abuse,

minimum or no access to important services such as healthcare, education, social welfare among others. Using a qualitative approach, the study analyzed South Africa migration and labour policies in terms of mainstreaming the gender needs of skilled migrant women. Secondly, the study highlighted the migratory experiences and constraints of skilled Zimbabwean women migrant spouses in South Africa labour integration. The experiences of these women have shown the gender inequalities of the migratory policies. Thirdly, Zimbabwean women opportunities and/or challenges in integration into South African formal labour market were explored. Lastly, practical interventions to support the integration of skilled migrant women spouses into South Africa's formal labour market were suggested. Key findings show that gender dynamics are pivotal in migration patterns and the mainstreaming of gender in migration policies is important. This study has therefore contributed to the fields of gender and migration by examining ways in which gender rights of skilled migrant women spouses can be incorporated in labour integration policy making.

**Keywords: gender, migration, Zimbabwean women, Accompanying Spouse Visa, labour integration**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**Contents**

# CHAPTER ONE

# INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Background and outline of research

Migration, defined as the permanent transboundary movement of people, has been defined as the most dominant global challenge of the 21$^{st}$ century. That being so, many women spouses are still attached to the migratory status of their partners as they accompany them to employment abroad. The types of international migration are largely context dependent based on the economic and political status of the donor and recipient countries. In most cases, migration falls under two categories namely forced and voluntary migration. Forced migration in Africa is largely a consequence of hardships such as famine and natural disasters such as flooding or drought. Civil conflict in war torn regions of Africa has also substantially contributed to forced migration with many displaced communities ending up as refugees in neighbouring countries. This is the case with the Horn and rest of East Africa where most displaced people from South Sudan have flocked to Uganda, Ethiopia and Sudan. Sporadic conflicts in Central and East African region in countries such as Central African Republic, Democratic Republic of Congo, Burundi, Mali and Somalia have also resulted in mass exodus into neighbouring countries and even down south into South Africa (Ndubuisi, 2016).

In the case of global voluntary migration, gendered patterns of migration are increasingly becoming evident where women migrate to high income earning countries to seek employment in domestic and care work. In Africa, feminised migration is also increasing as more women now seek transboundary work opportunities whilst within or out of matrimony (Adepoju, 2004; Piper, 2008). Globally, women comprise almost half of all migrants, in contrast to historical patterns where men

were dominant (Sharpe, 2001; Morrison et al., 2007; Thompson, 2016). Women in South Africa include 42.7% of the total cross border migration (International Organisation of Migration, 2013). However, there is a substantial number of migrant women who still have their migration status attached to their husbands resulting in the undermining of their rights to citizenship and formal employment (Oleksy, 2011; Chisale, 2015). Migration and citizenship policies regulate and restrict access to the formal labour markets, determining the integration of skilled migrants (Raghuram et al., 2002; Anderson, 2015). Across the European Union for example, permits carrying different rights and entitlements outline the duration of stay, chances of being employed in the labour market and the likelihood of applying for citizenship or permanent residence. In that regard, access to the labour market of other categories of migrants may be restricted. A 2013 study on Switzerland multinational companies' expatriate and spouse adjustment, showed that there is great difficulty for women spouses of multinational companies' (MNC'S) professionals to pursue their careers because of cultural and language hinderances, and non-recognition of foreign credentials (Ravasi et al., 2013).

Human transboundary migration involves movement of people for temporary or permanent residence usually within alien political boundaries (Reubenstein and Bacon, 1990). Although migration is not new, the levels of humans seeking residence in alien territories has drastically increased in recent years (Castles and Davidson, 2000; Castles and Miller,2003). Due to these booming global migration numbers, there has been increasing research interest on gender-based needs of women migrants (Pedraza, 1991; Ojong, 2002; Strum and Tarantolo, 2002; Nawyn, 2010; Chisale, 2015; Thompson, 2016). Despite international legislation protecting human rights for migrants, many nations poorly implement such policies.

For female migrants, migration that is tied to the family is the most common form of entry into many countries (Kofman, 2004). Globally, a significant number of migrant women have been employed in formal labour markets of host countries, but increased attention is now being given to different categories of women migrants such as spouses. Women migrant spouses have difficulties in accessing employment mainly due to the migratory and labour policies of host countries (Thompson et al., 2016). Migrant integration into the society of destination countries requires institutional and policy support that ensures inclusion at various social levels (Bosswick and Heckman, 2006; Pasetti 2014; Hellgren, 2015).

Integration indicators such as employability, social inclusion, access to education and citizenship are key in revealing the status of immigrants relative to locals (Junge, 2013; Charsley, 2016). Labour market integration is vital because of the mutual role it may play in improving the lives of immigrants whilst they also contribute to economic development of host country (Garcés-Mascareñas, 2014, 2014; Hellgren, 2015). European Union countries have adopted a Migrant Integration Policy Index (MIPEX) which evaluates government policies on their progress in the promotion of integration for migrants (Huddlestone and Sanchez-Montijano, 2015). By using MIPEX, European nations have made strides in facilitating immigrant integration in their countries (Bursell, 2012). As a result, EU countries have even been able to tackle other societal vices such as racial discrimination using the same tool to ensure better integration on the job market (Hellgren, 2015).

However, in light of the recent mass migration to the European Union (EU), migration policies are in crisis and Britain has voted for its exit from the EU. EU member states in 2015 adopted migration policies to open their boarders and accept refugees from war-torn countries. Britain has overtly expressed that it could not continue to accept and integrate large numbers of EU migrants as it

negatively affects its labour market and public finances. However, at the moment it is difficult to determine whether migration flows into Britain would be lower if the new policy barriers are introduced (Lisenkova and Sanchez-Martinez, 2016).

In USA and Canada, the integration of women migrant spouses is also hampered by similar barriers as in the EU (Kontos, 2009). A 2014 study in Canada unveiled that 'dependent applicant immigrants'faced challenges in employment outcomes because of their visa status (Banerjee and Phan, 2015). Skilled women immigrants in USA with the H-4 migration status attached to their husbands also face the predicament of unemployment and dependency on the sole provider (Bragun, 2008).

For Africa, cross boarder migration is increasingly becoming important. However, policy frameworks lag behind due to disharmony among policies between sending and recipient countries. The Migration Policy Framework for Africa (MPFA) was drafted by the African Union in 2001 to urge its member states to formulate policies to manage and bind migration integration for the development of the continent (African Union, 2006; Nshimbi and Fioramonti, 2014). Although the policy framework is not legally binding, African states can borrow aspects that are applicable to their migration situations. SADC however faces a drawback in enhancing labour integration in the region because of apparent unwillingness to endorse the free movement of people within the region (Oucho and Crush, 2001). The region therefore lacks a formal framework regarding labour migration because members are not ready to endorse the MPFA in their countries (Nshimbi and Fioramonti, 2014). Lack of SADC regional policy frameworks that facilitate labour integration negatively affect migrants' access to regional employment opportunities, including the female spouses of labour migrants. This is the predicament of many migrant women in South Africa, the top migrant destination within the region.

Although research has been done internationally on labour market integration of skilled migrant women spouses, little has been done in Africa. Studies on migration and profile of skilled female migrants are scarce. The role and potential that skilled migrant women possess has been disregarded and more focus has been on the unskilled and less-skilled migrant women and the challenges they potentially face during their migration experience such as sexual exploitation and abuse. As a result, a general stereotype has been created, that migrant women are mainly unskilled, lack education, have rural backgrounds and migrate as dependent family members. Most migratory research in South Africa has concentrated on the role of female migrants in the informal labour sector (McDonald, 2000; Crush et al., 2012; Muzvidziwa, 2012). Women joining their families in South Africa, are regarded as dependant 'accompanying spouses' which has more recently been categorised as 'visitor with multiple entries' (Department of Home Affairs, 2014). Even though the tenure of the women`s visas will be similar to those of their husbands they merely enjoy privileges that are not different from those of the children as they are merely dependents (Thompson, 2016).

According to Kofman (2009), there is a dominant perception that female migrants accompanying their husbands do not possess adequate skills that contribute meaningfully to the host countries' labour force. As the 'Accompanying spouse dependent visa' itself unwittingly suggest that the women are mere dependents. The visa status does not entitle the wife to study, work, or open a business or even a bank account in South Africa (Department of Home Affairs, 2014). In circumstances such as these, the spouse's skills are overlooked unless they pursue alternative routes (Chisale, 2015). The 'Accompanying spouse dependent visa', has since been categorised under the visitor's visa in 2014, but the conditions for the spouses have not changed.

The increase in migration flows of Zimbabweans in South Africa mainly attributed to poor economic performance in their original country is well documented (Zinyama, 2002; Bloch, 2006;

Ngwenya, 2010; Muzvidziwa 2012, Mutambanengwe 2012). This research is focused on Zimbabwean women spouses because of the high influx of skilled migrants to South Africa who settle with their families. During the past two decades, the economic and political situation in Zimbabwe has resulted in emigration of both skilled and unskilled citizens. The political turmoil in Zimbabwe and poor policy decisions have increased hyperinflation, unemployment and political oppression in the country thereby increasing the migration influx into South Africa. The Southern African Migration Programme Report (SAMP, 2012) states that movement streams from Zimbabwe to South Africa have changed with passing time. Prior to the 1990's migration trends involved Zimbabwean male workers who migrated and worked in South African goldmines and farms for short periods, accumulated resources and returned to their country of origin. In the 2000's Zimbabwean migrants were now staying longer in South Africa, leading to an increase in marital spouse migration and family structures. This migratory trend has also been noticed recently post 2010, with more Zimbabwean professionals migrating and settling in South Africa accompanied by their spouses and children (Chisale, 2015).

Gender needs of immigrants have however arguably not been satisfactorily incorporated into South African migration policies. The recent 2016 UN Summit for Refugees and Migrants highlighted the call to solve the distinct needs of migrant women and girls so as to develop meaningful policies and programmes that cater for them (UN, 2016). International gender organisations notably the UN Women and the International Organisation for Migration called on member states on the 2016 summit, to make migration policies that work for women because the process of migration should be empowering, promoting gender equality for women and girls migrating (UN Women and International Organisation for Migration, 2016).

Moreso, it is worth noting that seemingly afrophobia is deeply entrenched in South Africa's migratory policy framework where migration policies tend to be more restrictive towards African immigrants rather than those of European or Asian origin (Flahaux and Dehaas, 2016; Murunga 2015). This is largely evident in the ease at which African immigrants tend to struggle to regularise their stay in South Africa compared to their European counterparts. An employer is not allowed to employ a foreign national within South Africa without a valid work permit and when in possession of the accompanying spouse visa which does not grant the spouse the right to work. The Statistics South Africa's Quarterly Labour Force survey of 2012, a household survey concluded that legal foreigners are being employed in South Africa's labour force, but women are still discriminated against (Landau, 2012). As previously highlighted, little research on labour market integration in Africa has been done. Most research in South Africa has been done on the role of female migrants in the informal labour sector as researched by McDonald, (2000); Crush et al., (2012) and Muzvidziwa, (2012). This research, however, is different in that it focuses on South Africa's formal labour market integration of skilled women accompanying their husbands the primary visa applicants, an area that has not been previously researched.

The current research focuses on Zimbabwean skilled women migrants in Pietermaritzburg, South Africa highlighting challenges they face in securing employment. Pietermaritzburg falls under the Msunduzi Municipality in KwaZulu-Natal South Africa. It has a population size of around 700 000. Being the second largest city in this province, it is a home to a number of key industrial activities notably timber, dairy and aluminium processing despite the public sector being the largest employer. It is a fairly top destination for African migrant workers, skilled or not, with Zimbabweans perhaps having the largest contingent. However, to my knowledge, no accurate demographic statistics on the Zimbabweans, together with other African immigrants in Pietermaritzburg, are currently available. The Apostolic Faith Mission in Pietermaritzburg was

used as a focal point to meet the women because it has a large attendance of Zimbabweans. It was therefore envisaged that the sampling population will be representative of the Zimbabwean women currently residing in South Africa. It also assumed that the Zimbabwean women who are used as a case study are largely representative of most African immigrants in South Africa. Logistically, it was also easy to have them as the target population as they have become one of the largest groups settling in South Africa for employment since the economic meltdown in Zimbabwe (Shumba et al., 2012).

The current research has delimitations which are characteristics that define the limits of the research study. These limitations were under the control of the researcher. The findings were only limited to the experiences of skilled Zimbabwean women spouses. It provides snapshot views from only one nationality. The study would perhaps have had even more far reaching implications if further research was also done on migrant women spouses from other diverse African nationalities that migrated to South Africa.

## 1.2 Research problem and objectives

The research therefore critically examines the experiences in integration of skilled migrant women spouses in South Africa's formal labour markets. The research highlighted how the accompanying dependent visa status blankets all women spouses as not skilled and therefore not employable. In so doing, the study will show the gender gaps in the migration and labour policies of South Africa.

In order to fulfil the overarching aim of the research project, the study has the following key objectives;

i.    To analyse South Africa migration and labour policies in terms of mainstreaming the gender needs of skilled migrant women

ii.   To examine Zimbabwean women experiences of migration as accompanying spouses

iii.  To identify and explore Zimbabwean women opportunities and/or challenges in integration into South African formal labour market

iv.   To recommend practical interventions that assist the integration of skilled migrant women spouses into South Africa's formal labour market.

*Key questions asked:*

Under this section, the researcher aims to guide and ask the following research questions:

a.    What are the experiences of skilled Zimbabwean women spouses on migration to South Africa?

b.    What opportunities do they have within the formal labour market?

c.    What challenges do they encounter in being integrated into the formal labour market?

d.    What are the existing support systems in place for Zimbabwean women migrants?

e.    How does the South African migration policy integrate gender needs of skilled migrant women?

f.    How do the labour policies integrate the gender needs of skilled migrant women?

g. What recommendations can be made to further improve these policies?

## 1.3 Significance of the Study

The study investigated in-depth the labour integration of skilled migrant women, an area that has not received much attention in Africa. This is despite growing evidence that planned deliberate integration of skilled migrant can enhance the country`s productivity in many facets of the economy. This is evident in countries such Australia and New Zealand where immigration and integration of skilled workers, including women, substantially contributes to their economy. The research outputs and the migratory experiences of women migrant spouses in this research can be used in the South Africa gender migration policy making, incorporating women rights in the migration process. Gender incorporation in migration policy will promote gender equality, where South Africa is party to various international and regional women rights instruments fostering women rights.

The research has also contributed to the understanding of gendered patterns of migration. There is a detailed scope on how gender is related to the decisions to migrate and the experiences of immigration. Understanding the causes of migration from a gender perspective is essential because gender influences the experiences and integration of migrants in the host country. Understanding whether migration itself facilitates or increases gender disparities or it has resulted from gender inequality is important in the formulation of migration policies and creates procedures to address the specific needs of the women who migrate.

The research will also contribute in the migration and development nexus from a gender perspective. Labour integration of women migrant spouses in destination countries facilitates employment and an increase in remittances sent back home. A gender perspective is greatly needed

in the emerging field of migration and development. Lack of gender inclusion results in the implementation of policies or programs that are ineffective in strengthening the migration-development nexus. Usually, such policies do not necessarily decrease gender inequalities in their objectives and may further increase existing inequalities. The research has therefore shed some light on measures that can be taken to improve labour integration, not only of skilled migrant women but other migrants too. These possible interventions can be used to address the gender needs of migrant women spouses whilst creating better societies that harmonise both the indigenous communities and foreigners.

## 1.4 Structure of the thesis

### i.    *Chapter 1-Introduction*

Here the chapter outlines the background to the research problem defining and explaining the reasons why the topic was chosen as well the research objectives. Chapter 1 further states the significance of the study outlining its contribution to gender and migratory research.

### ii.    *Chapter 2- Literature review and Theoretical framework*

This is a comprehensive look at prior research done on South Africa labour integration and migration policies. The chapter highlighted gaps on previously conducted research about migration and labour integration. Chapter 2 gave an in-depth look at Zimbabwe's political and economic crisis contributing to high migration influx. Labour market trends and the gender inequalities that are present in labour market are highlighted globally, in Africa and South Africa. Chapter 2 clearly shows the recent women labour participation statistics and the gender disparities or gaps that are present. It further outlines the inclusion of women migrants in South Africa labour market. The

chapter concludes by outlining the theories that were used in conducting the research. These theories were social inclusion, gender geographies of power and its concepts geographical scales, social location, social imaginary and the gender and development approach (GAD).

iii.    *Chapter 3- Research methodology*

Chapter 3 looks at the nature of the research describing the research design, sampling techniques, data collection techniques and the data analysis. Chapter 3 gives a detailed account of the challenges I encountered in data collection including time constraints and resistance of participants to conduct interviews during the time period of xenophobic tensions in the country. Lastly Chapter 3 highlights the ethical considerations made in the study.

iv.    *Chapter 4- The migration experiences of skilled Zimbabwean women on an accompanying spouse dependent visa*

This chapter examines the migration experiences of skilled Zimbabwean women on an accompanying visa to South Africa. This chapter also includes the challenges faced by the women spouses in integration in the formal labour market.

v.    *Chapter 5- A gender analysis of South Africa migration and labour policies in the area of migrant women's integration into the formal labour market*

This chapter analyses the migration and labour policies in terms of mainstreaming gender needs of skilled migrant women. Chapter 5 gender analysis of migration and labour policies gives an insight into the inclusion of women into South Africa's migration policies. The chapter gives an in-depth look at how gender mainstreaming has been included in policy for successful labour integration.

Gender analysis in Chapter 5 shows inclusion or lack of inclusion of gender needs in migration and labour policies and the extent to which gender rights are incorporated in South Africa's migration policies.

vi.    *Chapter 6-Possible interventions in integrating skilled accompanying women spouses into the formal labour market*

This chapter proposes some practical interventions that can be used to support skilled migrant women spouses entering South Africa to gain employment based on the findings of the study.

vii.    *Chapter 7- Conclusions and Recommendations*

Based on the findings, interventions and recommendations are drafted on how to address challenges that skilled Zimbabwean women spouses face in job-seeking and how their needs can be incorporated.  The chapter also makes recommendations for future research.

## CHAPTER TWO

## LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

### 2.1 Introduction

This chapter gives context and background on gender and migration dynamics, and outlines the theories used in the study. The literature in this chapter is drawn from journals, books, published and unpublished thesis / dissertations and electronic material to show how this research fits in the existing body of knowledge. The social inclusion, gender geographies of power and gender and development theories are described in their application to this study in the theoretical framework.

### 2.2 International Migration

Human migration involves movement of people to another with the intention of taking up temporary or permanent residence usually across boundaries (Reubenstein and Bacon, 1990). Several definitions of migration have been stated, notably Kok et al., (2003), who stated that migration involves changing of residence and the crossing of political boundaries. It is therefore definitely not a new phenomenon because it has always been there, but the number and scale of migrants and their global impact is now different in this era (Castles and Davidson, 2000). Castles and Miller (2003), state that migration has become significant in the global change and millions of people seek new homes and places of safety outside their countries in many forms. In this regard, migrants use different routes to enter the host country, ranging from provisional migration, long-term migration, asylum, refugee, student migration to family related migration which involves reunification of family members or accompanying family members of labour migrants (Kofman, 2009).

International migration has become a global phenomenon that has grown in both complexity and scope. There is an increase in the volume of global migration and diversification of destinations. Migration is both a cause and a result of development processes making it an essential feature in the 21st century. Migration significantly adds to the development and sustainable economic growth of a country given that it is supported by strong policies in both home and host communities (United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division, 2017). Migration host countries largely gain from migration because migrants are employed and address labour gaps, pay taxes and are engaged in the informal sector as entrepreneurs. Migrants can be influential members of the host society by significantly contributing to civic participation, research in science and technology and inspiring their destination communities by contributing some cultural variety (United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division, 2017).

The rise in global mobility, the increasing migratory patterns and their influence on migrants, families, host countries have all contributed to international migration becoming a significance in the global community. Globalisation has impacted greatly on the pattern of migration by increasing the flow of migrants and information across borders. Globalisation facilitates the cross-border connectedness at a large scale with limited resources and time. Hein De Haas and Czaika (2013), state that globalisation facilitates ease of communication between migrants and countries of origin strengthening migratory networks, allowing people to communicate with those that have migrated. This interconnectedness has encouraged people to access information about "greener pastures" abroad thereby increasing the need or desire to migrate.

In 2015, international migrants reached 244 million, with women accounting for 48% of the population; the highest ever recorded (International Organisation for Migration, 2015, United Nations, 2016). An estimated 150 million of international migrants in 2013 are believed to be

Page | 15

economic migrants searching for employment (International Labour Organisation, 2015). In Europe the proportion of international female migrants increased from 51.6% in 2000 to 52.4% in 2015. The same trend was observed in North America where women migrant's percentage among all international migrants increased from 50.5% - 51.2% in 2015. In Asia the female migrant's percentage decreased from 45.6% - 42% an indication of a high concentration of male migration. Africa has experienced a growth in male migrants at 42% as compared to women migrants at 37% from 2000-2015. By contrast, as the statistics state above, in Europe, North America and Oceania the female migration trend has grown more rapidly than male. In Africa however most women migrate within the region, although a steady increase in migration to Europe and North America is now being noted.

Recent statistics from the International Migration Report of 2017 states that an estimated 258 million are living in a country outside their country of birth and this is a notable increase of 49% since 2000. The report further states that 3.4% of the world's population are international migrants. This shows another increase from the previously recorded 2.8% in the year 2000 (United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 2017). These figures underlie the ever-rising rate of migration around the globe in the past decades.

Benton (2013) illustrates that the increase in interconnectedness in the world today has made distinctions blur between country of origin, transit and destination. The overwhelming increase in the volume, geographical opportunity, diversity and density of international migration is mainly linked to developments in communication technology, advanced transport and generally to globalization (Czaika and De Haas, 2014b). Furthermore, these migration flows have become more diverse from the origin and the destination (Arango, 2000). Castles and Miller (2003) identify the main trends that characterize migration today. Firstly, that there is a global increase in countries of

origin and destination with more individuals migrating to and from major regions and secondly that since the 1960s, migration has become more feminized. (Castles and Miller, 2003). Modern transportation has made it easier to migrate while factors such as conflict, poverty, inequalities and lack of decent employment has further compelled people to move and look for better futures for themselves and families (UN, 2016). Migration and displacement are now 21st century global trends and the international community is struggling to come up with viable solutions. Migration when supported by appropriate policies in the destination country has many benefits for positive economic growth and sustainable development (UN, 2016). It remains a distinct option for people searching decent employment while escaping poverty, violence and persecution.

### 2.2.1 Migration Concepts

Migration involves several dynamics because once people decide to settle in other countries, their personal lives and families change economically, socially and culturally. These changes in societal expectations lead to transformations in identities. Identities that are expected and permitted in home cultures might not be the same in host society. These migration dynamics are affected by the host country's policies towards immigrants. Migration concepts such as assimilation, transnationalism, enculturation and integration tend to explain how migrants can be included and accepted in the host societies. Park and Burgess (1969) defined assimilation as a process of synthesis in which immigrants attain culture, opinions, attitudes and beliefs of the host natives so that they become more like the majority group in their destination country. Alba et al (2003) has criticized assimilation in migration since it involves full adoption of culture and the host society, to an extent of giving up past languages, identities and cultural practices. France has been recently criticized for continuing to demand assimilation that seeks to standardize all immigrants to a degree of 'Frenchness' (Paris, 2018). French authorities continuously demand immigrants to give up their

own identities and assimilate into a 'French culture and way of life' (Gest, 2015). This idea of assimilation is very different from that done in the United States where assimilation has evolved over the 20th century and now acknowledges, accommodates and even celebrates immigrants' native lands. The United States can be seen as a home for diverse religious minorities, which protects and embraces ethnic or religious differences, and does not allow the government to create and establish one national religion. On the other hand, France has been seen as prohibiting people including immigrants from any "showy" display of religion (Gest, 2015). For example, in France religious/ethnic symbolic clothes or overt demos are banned in public places. French laws do not favor affirmative action by prohibiting the funding for organisations with ties to a religious bodies (Pars, 2018). As part of improving its assimilation policies, France expanded anti-discrimination laws. This has brought the debate whether this demand for assimilation from immigrants in France will not create a fragmented society (Paris, 2018).

Acculturation involves socialization that happens whenever two different cultures intersect. Acculturation usually involves a two-way process of change although in migration, adjustments and adaptations in culture are mainly made by immigrants or refugees in response to their contact with the dominant majority (Kim, 2007). Notable changes are evident culturally, psychologically in the migrants' clothing, language, customs or practices. Population that has the main culture often adopt the elements of the smaller cultures that they engage with. Acculturation happens at all levels and is usually a result of individual contact or through mass media, arts or literature. However, despite claims that acculturation involves change in both ways evidence suggests that changes happen mostly in the minorities living inside a particular country rather than affecting the customs/traditions of the original population. This was clearly noted in a study done on Asian-Americans residing in the United States during the early 1990s. The immigrant community socialized to the traditions of the United States culture but maintained the norms of their indigenous

culture at the same period, a term referred to as enculturation (Kim, 2007). Enculturation is a migration concept where people acquire competences in their culture and maintain one's ethnic cultural norms. Another example is the adoption of Chinese, Mexican, and Indian type of cookeries and food items in the United States and the concurrent embracing of conventional American foods and meals by immigrants in the country (Kim, 2007).

Transnationalism on the other hand, according to Levitt (2007) involves a process where migrants maintain ties with country of origin, living several lives in more than one setting. Lima (2010) further explains transnationalism as the economic, social, political and cultural regular activities by foreign born residents that span across national borders as part of their daily routines. (Anwar 1979). Migrants are able to build their lives across borders, creating social, economic, cultural and political activities that maintain membership in both the destination country of choice and their country of origin (Salih, 2000). Both countries of origin and destination tend to encourage transnationalism where sending states consider maintained ties to emigrants as boosting financial remittances and investments in the country of origin. This phenomenon has only been encouraged by the sheer well advanced transportation and communication networks over the last two decades which were unavailable to generations of migrants before. Transnationalism varies across immigrant groups and differs in the scope and range of activities. Portes (2007) noted that migrants that are more educated or well established are the most likely to engage in transnational activities. A clear example of transnationalism is the Turkish population residing in Germany. From 2000, the process of obtaining the German citizenship did not embrace the Turkish population that has resided in the country for a long time (Huff, 2014). The majority of Turkish citizens had lived in Germany for many decades and looked-for dual citizenship. Citizenship was interpreted on the basis of political representation and ethnic identity by the Turks, this conflicted with the German citizenship, which combined citizenship with status. The Turkish minority was mainly concerned with Turkish

national identity and Muslim non secular identity, each aspect being foreign to the German citizenship. Germany's citizenship and status law were modified in 2000. Though twin citizenship was still prohibited, the laws concerning naturalization of foreign nationals were liberalized, and it absolutely was currently doable to attain German citizenship by birth (Huff, 2014). In this research however, an in-depth look at integration and gender-transnationalism will be given.

### 2.2.2 Feminisation of migration

Whilst largely a social movement, feminism can also be regarded as theoretical. It encompasses efforts to globally transform gender-based barriers that define the social status of women. A theoretical approach to feminism probes the existent relationships of power subordinates' women. The segmented interpretations of these definitions have been argued by some scholars as weakening and redefining the feminist movement (Bordo, 1990; Benhabib, 1995; Mackinnon, 2000). Despite these interpretations being divergent, it is now widely accepted that these views are complementary in what other scholars now refer as "multicentered feminism". This adaptive liberal framework offers comprehensive tools that allow for an understanding of feminism that considers the diversity of women (Jaggar, 1983; Sandoval, 2000). It takes into consideration factors such as race, culture, religion ethnicity and nationality in deciphering the factors underlying women societal behaviors and social standing (La Barbera, 2012).

In the context of migration, feminism has additionally been outlined in varied ways. A recent world interest in "feminization of migration" has inspired the international migration community to approach women migration differently recognizing the reality that more and more women are migrating on their own to enhance their economic status and improve their skills. In migration analysis the rising numbers of women migrants may be attributed to the recent shifts in women's

roles or their increased prominence in migrant populations. Some scholars also state that feminisation as the increasing proportion of women among all migrants (Donato and Gabbacia, 2016). The increase in the feminisation of migration has mainly stemmed from the demand for gender biased professions and services such as domestic workers, teachers, nurses and other jobs typically dominated by women. It is now sufficient to understand the causes and the consequences of this migration pattern. More studies are now drawn to gendered migration since the experiences are different between males and females (Pedraza, 1991; Ojong, 2002).

There is a substantial increase in female migration over the years, where women are now seeking other opportunities across national boundaries than staying behind at home while the men migrated (Adepoju, 2004). The traditional pattern of male-dominated migration globally is increasingly characterized by some form of feminised migration as more women now seek better living conditions as sole household providers or, in most cases, as partners in matrimonial or family units headed by males (Piper, 2008; Sharpe, 2001). A substantial proportion of these women are independent individuals who are seeking to improve their own economic status rather than joining husbands or families. Shifting gender roles in countries of origin result in more independence for women, enabling them to migrate and work than before. Scholars have declared this gendered pattern of migration as a core dimension to international migration and globalisation (Piper, 2008; Donato and Gabbacia, 2016). Adejopu (2004) describes the male dominated traditional pattern of migration as increasingly becoming feminised.

### 2.2.3    Gender and Migration

Earlier studies on migration research solely focused on male migrants, viewing them as economic players whilst the women were passive companions (Kandiyoti, 1988; Mahler and Pessar, 2001).

There was an erroneous view that migrants are principally male, but global categories by sex since the 1960s have confirmed that the number of female migrants across borders is virtually equal to male, actually the percentage of women migrants has been increasing with women comprising the majority of international migrants (Jolly et al., 2005; UN Women, 2016). Later realisation that women do not just migrate as passive companions to their migrant husbands and their migration experience is different from men changed this male bias in migration studies. Research has shown that more women are migrating independently as heads of households (Fall, 2007). African women are involved in numerous typologies of migration, including circular migration, cross-border trade, temporary and longer-term settlement migration. In South Africa, some forms of female migration have been categorized as 'multi-purpose', encompassing employment and informal trade (Dodson and Crush 2004). More focus has then been put on women migrants through one of the commitments put forward by International Organisation of Migration in 1995 on gender mainstreaming the needs of migrant women.

Migration, to a great extent is a gendered phenomenon (O'Neil et al., 2016). Cultural gender customs, unequal gender rights and power relations all determine migration choices and experiences of women and men. Several factors interplay contributing to the woman's decision to migrate mainly based on state or community settings, individual or family circumstances. Impoverishment, need to support families, increased labour demand in the country of destination, unemployment in country of origin, limited economic and social opportunities are all strong migration pull factors that encourage women to move into another country (Kofman et al., 2009). Such female migration creates gender empowerment and equality for women because it gives them economic freedom, status and self-esteem. Migrant women become more assertive because of the newly found opportunities that are made available to them promoting their rights and autonomy.

Regarding female migrants, migrating with the family is the most common form of entering many countries (Kofman, 2004). It has been observed for example, that more women migrate into the United States to reunite with their partners than men and this trend has been observed in several countries such as Australia, Canada, Europe and New Zealand (Ghosh, 2009; Balgamwalla, 2014; Thomson, 2016). A significant number of these migrant women have their migration status attached to their husbands (Bragun, 2008; Chisale, 2015). Globally, there has been an increasing interest in research concerning these dependent spouse visa holders and how they are culturally and socially integrated in the host countries (Ravasi et al., 2013; Timmerman et al., 2015; Thompson et al., 2016). Ravasi (2013) did a research study on Switzerland multinational companies' expatriate and spouse adjustment and discovered that there was great difficulty for women spouses of multinational companies' (MNC'S) professionals to pursue their careers due to cultural and language barriers, and non-recognition of foreign credentials. Another study done by Thompson et al (2016) in Australia showed how the skills of women migrant spouses are being underutilised because of lack of migration documents that hinder them from labour and social integration in the country. The two research studies highlighted above differ from this particular study done in Africa where little has been researched on migrant spouse labour integration. Furthermore, this research focuses more on how migration policies can be improved to assist in labour integration of migrant women spouses which is one of the objectives of this study.

At a global scale, there has been increasing focus on gender and migration particularly the needs of foreign women (Pedraza, 1991; Ojong, 2002; Strum and Tarantolo, 2002; Nawyn, 2010; Chisale, 2015; Thomson, 2016). Gender has become the core principle in migration as it shapes the process and the experiences of migrants in different social locations (Mahler and Pessar, 2001). Understanding gender and migration improves migration policies, incorporating the needs and rights of women. Several global instruments have been outlining human rights for global migrants,

yet many nations are still characterised by weak governance and inabilities to ensure women rights. The Global Commission on International Migration report (2005), recommendations were made to pay particular attention to the empowerment and the protection of migrant women guaranteeing that they are involved and included in the creation of migration policies. The 2016 UN Summit for Refugees and Migrants highlighted the call to solve the distinct needs of migrant women so as to develop meaningful policies and programmes that cater for them (UN, 2016). UN Women and the International Organisation for Migration called on member states on the 2016 UN Summit for Refugees and Migrants, to make migration policies that work for women because the process of migration should be empowering, promoting gender equality for the women and girls migrating (UN Women and International Organisation for Migration, 2016).

### 2.2.4    Gender and Transnationalism

Transnationalism according to Glick (1999) involves a process where political, social and cultural processes transcend beyond boarders of a particular state.  Hingston (2014) in her study clearly articulates that migrants can move across international borders whilst maintaining social relations with their country of origin. Transnational practices are embodied in migrant social networks where social ties are usually developed and sustained to their localities of origin (Pessar, 2003). Technology has enabled migrants and their families to travel back and forth, maintain relations with others and do business simultaneously in distant places (De Haas, 2005). Network theories also emphasize the importance of networks, where discussions about the necessity to migrate stimulate and sustain migration (Boyd and Grieco, 2003). Research has shown that women migrants have their social networking with other women and tend to use these networks when they decide to migrate or to settle in the destination country (Boyd and Grieco, 2003). Another example is shown in a study done by Winters et al (2001) migrants community networks and their families in United

States-Mexico migration assist in the migration decision and settlement in the destination country. Where there is high migrant networking in the United States influences where people prefer to migrate to (Winters et al, 2001). Migrant communities are regarded as transnational when the migrants maintain extensive cultural, economic and social ties with both the country where they come from and the destination. A study done on Morocco migrant women in Italy showed that they had ties in the country of destination but enjoy their nationality from their country of origin (Salih, 2001; Charrad 1990). Their activities were also conditioned based upon cultural gender roles both in Morocco and Italy.

Mahler and Pessar (2006) introduced gender into transnationalism in their theory 'gender geographies of power', bringing gender as a central point in understanding the extent to which gender identities and roles are constantly challenged as migrants attempt to adapt to life in the host country. An examination of gender under transnational migration is crucial because it is the core principal that facilitates and constrains movement whilst enabling smooth adaptation to the new country. Erel (2012) furthermore stated that gender relations are formed and challenged by the relationships that are kept between individuals, families, and social networks within transnational spaces. A study done by Shalih (2000) on Moroccan migrant women's transnational practices in Italy and Morocco showed that gender identity constructions of migrant women at the national level are often interlocked with transnational identifications that stretch beyond national borders.

### 2.2.5    Migration in Africa

Migration in Africa is not new; it predates colonialism and has its origins in forms of domestic survival involving hunting and gathering, pastoralism, seasonal ecologically driven migration and slavery (Cohen, 1987). For example, linguistic origins and patterns reflect movement of people

across the continent. Nilo-Saharan languages are used in several countries from Sudan to the Lake Chad area and Bantu languages which came from Cameroon 5000 years ago are now being spoken in the Natal region in South Africa (Castles et al., 2014). The languages of native inhabitants have combined to form linguistic diversity over time through migration. In pre-colonial times migration in Africa was part of normal lives. It included searches for new lands, seasonal and circular migration for agriculture, hunting and trading (Castles et al., 2014).

African migration studies have shown that there is diversity in migration trends influenced by colonial times with formerly colonised African states influencing the migration processes (Castles et al., 2014). Contemporary migration patterns within and from Africa have been majorly influenced by the slave trade, colonial occupation and the existence of forced labour (Cohen, 1987). In the colonial liberation period, Africans in countries such as Kenya and Angola would flee conflicts with colonial powers reluctant to give up control and in Zimbabwe and South Africa; white settler groups were reluctant to give up their white privileges (Castles et al., 2014). Decolonisation of these countries and state formations did not guarantee peace, as political tensions and economic pressures continued. These drivers have continuously forced people to migrate, to find better living conditions. However, after the 1980s, migration patterns have diversified, not directed towards Europe but people are migrating more to other African nations (Sander and Maimbo, 2003; Schoumaker et al., 2015; Flahaux and De Haas, 2016).

Migration in Africa has been mainly driven by push factors that include economic problems, violent conflict, environmental degradation, poverty and pull factors, mainly better opportunities at the destination countries (Flahaux and De Haas, 2016). Migration studies in Africa have also shown that most Africans migrate for the sake of their families, for work and study (Shoumaker et al., 2015). These social processes drive mobility, therefore, they should not be neglected in migration

research (Bakewell and Bonfiglio, 2013). Africa has dominant migration flows that include refugee migration flows in East Africa, labour migration flows to West Africa and Southern Africa (Flahaux and De Haas, 2016). Although these trends are high it is worth noting that state policies have contributed significantly in migration flows on the continent. Border restrictions of African countries are increasing thereby decreasing the intensity of intra African migration. In 2013 for example, an average of 78 % of African migrants require a visa for entry into another African country (Czaika and De Haas, 2014a). Visa restrictiveness confirms that African states are rather hesitant to open their boarders and facilitate the free movement of migrants as compared to other continents. West African states have shown that there are more acceptable to African migration on average, largely because of the free migration and travel within ECOWAS countries unlike in East and Southern Africa. An increase in visa restrictiveness has diversified migration trends from colonial patterns (Flahaux and De Haas, 2016). Furthermore, African immigration restrictions have reduced return and circulation migration thereby influencing migrants to settle permanently in the country of destination.

Women in Africa are increasingly migrating either to meet their economic desires or to join their husbands and families. Men who accompany their wives in search of employment are few in Africa because of the dominance of patriarchy and unequal gender relations (Chisale, 2015). It is usually the wife who migrates with a husband who is the main holder of a work/critical skills permit (Chisale, 2015). Migration decisions in households mainly prioritizes the husbands' career over the wife therefore, most African women spouses are forced to abandon their careers in pursuit of their partners' careers (Halfacree and Boyle, 1993).

### 2.2.6 Migration into South Africa

Migration research has shown more movement of migrants and refugees into South Africa from 1990 (Rogerson, 1999; Posel 2003). The end of apartheid in South Africa, political instability across Africa and the drastic aftermath of the Structural Adjustment Programs has led to a large volume of migrants from Africa into South Africa (Ojong, 2012). The major attraction is the economic strength that the country still has in Africa (Ngwenya, 2010). Most of these migrants are from SADC countries although a significant increase from countries in the region farther afield has been noted (Kalitanyi and Visser, 2010). Several studies have been done on migration into South Africa, for example cross boarder migrants by Dodson (1998) and Muzvidziwa (2001) who studied how African immigrants are involved in informal trading in South Africa and Isike and Isike (2012), who analysed African immigration into South Africa. Isike and Isike (2012) noted an increase in regular skilled professionals and labour migration to South Africa. Refugee migration into South Africa has also increased from conflict countries such as Angola, Burundi, DRC, Rwanda, Somalia, Sudan and Zimbabwe. For example, Amisi and Ballard (2005) researched on the struggles that Congolese refugees face in Durban, due to lack of citizenship, Greyling's (2016) study on the wellbeing of refugees and asylum seekers from across Africa in Johannesburg, and Uzodike et al (2012) researched on the different types of movement and transnational experiences of conflict escapees such as the refugees based in Pietermaritzburg, South Africa. Voluntary migration consists of one`s own initiative based on several push and pull factors other than conflict or famine. In Southern Africa the evidence of such voluntary immigration is witnessed on the Zimbabwean migrants who flock neighbouring countries such as South Africa and Botswana for employment. Although seemingly voluntary, it is paradox as most have certainly emigrated not by choice but due to the economic strife in Zimbabwe. Other major immigrants of South Africa include Malawi, Mozambique, Ethiopia, Somalia, Nigeria and Ghana.

Post-1994 South Africa, although it is also a sending country, is now a foremost receiving country of African migrants mainly from the Southern African region. South Africa has also been a destination country for many migrants from West Africa. A study done by Hingston (2014) showed that the declining economic and political state in West African countries for example in Nigeria has influenced the increase in migration of Nigerians to South Africa. Nigerian immigrants to South Africa have come to continue with higher education or seek employment (Hingston, 2014).

Ngwenya (2010) agrees that while migration from the neighboring countries remains the main source of immigrants to South Africa, a good proportion of African migrants originate from outside the Southern African Development Community (SADC) region. It has also been noted that there is an increase in foreign African academics that have come into South Africa looking for higher institutions of learning that are innovative and illustrate democratic principles that are different from other countries in the region. Research study done by Otu (2012) highlighted how academics have migrated to South Africa from various countries such as Cameroon, Nigeria, Ghana, Zambia, Malawi and Kenya and are using their transnational experiences to expand African scholarship within and beyond South Africa.

### 2.2.7 Zimbabwe migration into South Africa

The end of apartheid, which was a South African system that was created to alienate native Africans, created flexibility in cross boarder movement (Crush et al., 2005). Inclusion of South Africa into the SADC increased legal and undocumented cross boarder flows into the country (Crush et al., 2005). Migration flows from Zimbabwe increased over the years with migratory experiences in South Africa well documented such as Bloch, (2006) on the economic life of Zimbabwean migrants, Mutambanegwe, (2012) on Zimbabwean post migration experiences, Muzvidziwa (2012), on

Zimbabwean cross boarder migrants, Ngwenya, (2010) on the relationship that migrants have with their sending state and Zinyama (2002) on the perspectives of Zimbabweans who migrate.

Over the last twenty years, the political and economic situation in Zimbabwe has increased migration outflows where both professional and unprofessional individuals are leaving in search of better lives. The Southern African Migration Programme Report (SAMP), 2012 states that migration streams from Zimbabwe to South Africa has changed over the years. According to the report, prior 1990s, migration trends involved Zimbabwean male workers who migrated and worked in South African goldmines and farms for short periods, accumulated resources and returned back home.

Early 1990s saw a dramatic shift in these migratory trends, as Zimbabwe was faced with an economic downturn that was influenced by the Economic Structural Adjustment Programme that reduced the public expenditure, reduced budgetary subsidies on health and social services and downsizing public services (SAMP, 2012). During this period two main migration streams were noticed. According to the SAMP (1997) report, men went to search for jobs in South Africa but there also emerged a gendered pattern where women independently migrated to trade in the informal sector (Tevera and Zinyama, 2002). Cross border trade was dominated by women who wanted to improve their economic situation by income generation. Cross border migration to Zimbabwe during this period was highly temporary and circular in nature where the majority of migrants were breadwinners. Migrants neither stayed in South Africa for long duration of times. Illegal boarder entries were also on the rise as South Africa only issued work permits to highly skilled Zimbabweans (Crush et al., 2012). Visitors permits were issued that extended for a short period although most migrants would overstay (Crush et al., 2012).

Shifts in migration trends from Zimbabwe to South Africa were further noted during the period 2000-2010 (SAMP, 2012). Most Zimbabwean professionals considered emigration from the country citing economic and political reasons (Tevera and Crush, 2003). Legal entries into South Africa also rose with a substantial number entering South Africa on work and study permits. According to Crush et al 2012, the number of migrants with work permits arose from 3500 in 2001 to 9000 in 2009. After the 2002 Immigration Act, it was easier for South Africa to employ Zimbabweans. The 2005 SAMP survey showed that feminisation of migration intensified with proportion of women migrants increasing from an estimated 39% in 1997 to 44% in 2005. Migration into South Africa from Zimbabwe changed from being completely male to families that included dependents post 2010 (Chisale, 2015). United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 2017 data showed an increase in the total number of women migrants to South Africa on an average of 44.4% of the total population (UNDESA, 2017). Zimbabwean migrants are now staying longer in South Africa, leading to an increase in marital spouse migration and family structures (Chisale, 2015).

### 2.2.8    Integration into the host country

Integration involves a process where immigrants can participate fully in the destination country as the natives of that country or involvement of immigrants in the organisations and social institutions of destination countries (Bosswick and Heckman, 2006; Hellgren, 2015). Integration can be calculated by assessing whether immigrants have the same access to and can fully participate in the receiving country's resources and organisations (Rudiger and Spencer, 2003). In this instance, sole focus is drawn towards the unequal relation between immigrants and the ethnic majority's contribution and participation in the society. Integration also regarded process that involves two parties where both the natives and the migrants would have to accommodate each other with overall

social cohesiveness (Ireland, 2004). Integration of minority immigrant population is a major concern in global migration where countries have been faced by challenges. Integration theories however tend to ignore the gender aspect of the whole process, assuming that the problems of integration are universal for both sexes (Tastsoglou and Preston, 2005). Studies have proven that integration is different for men than women and is particularly more challenging for the latter (Miedema and Wachholz, 1998). In 2015, the majority of Germany's refugees were women and they faced difficulties in integration and settling in the country. According to statistics compiled by the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees (BAMF), women make up almost 40 % of asylum applicants in Germany.

The destination country, its organisational structure and its response to the migrants determines the results of the integration process rather than the immigrants (Pasetti 2014). The compulsory integration of migrants is broad and comprises of a range of aspects including acquisition of host country`s knowledge, societal norms and language as prerequisites for immigration and residency (Böcker and Tineke, 2011; Goodman and Wright, 2015). This is the case for many European countries including Germany where meeting the required integration requirements is needed before naturalization. Supporters for such integration believe that incentives and resources should be put in to promote naturalisation which presumably leads to rapid integration. It is believed that through integration, immigrants will begin to invest in the future of the country by undertaking various activities that contributes to the development of the economy (Koopmans, 2010). Indeed, naturalisation or the attainment of citizenship, is considered as a faster way of enhancing the integration of immigrants (Hainmueller et al., 2015). However, this is highly contentious as other scholars have a divergent view that the privilege of giving citizenship should be preserved for a few (Hainmueller et al., 2015). Furthermore, citizenship does not necessarily result in successful integration of immigrants (Hainmueller et al., 2015). This understanding stems from the fact that

naturalization may act as a disincentive for the ultimate integration since once immigrants are the host nation`s civil identification documents, therefore no further motivation for acquiring all the necessary knowledge in terms of cultural and social norms that enhance their contribution to the host country (Wright and Bloemraad, 2012). How the paradigms of this dichotomy contribute to successful integration therefore remains a source of debate (Böcker and Tineke, 2011).

Globally, there is now more focus on the receiving society and its role in integrating immigrants. For integration to be a success, there has to be a good interaction between migrants and the receiving society with existing structures and policies less rigid (Rudiger and Spencer, 2003). Once the receiving society resists any meaningful chance in its existing structures, there is integration failure in different sectors of the society. Different integration indicators such as employment, education, social involvement and citizenship should mark and indicate the degree and the social and economic situation of immigrants as compared to the overall population. Integration of immigrants has been a priority on the migration policy plan of EU and OECD countries mainly because of the large influx of migrants in the last two decades (Helbling, 2013; Helbling et al, 2015; OECD/EU, 2015). European host countries have faced debates regarding integration with ethnic discrimination of migrants reducing their chances of participating equally in their host countries (Peninx and Mascarenars, 2014).

As integration involves the process of being an accepted part of the society it is important to note that structures at different levels of the host society may hinder or facilitate the process. The receiving society's institutions, policies and attitudes of the majority of the population may either make the integration process easier or difficult. The legal status of an immigrant affects the process of integration either providing opportunities or obstacles. A sense of belonging is important for immigrants in the integration process. Here national identity and citizenship are rather crucial in

Page | 33

that the nationals should be welcoming and make immigrants identify with the state as well (Hellgren, 2015). Immigrants that live with temporary or discretionary legal statuses face migration policies that constrain their lives today and, in the future, as in America, where the legal status and citizenship of immigrants becomes increasingly important to integration (National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine, 2015). For example, migrants that hold permanent residence status and citizenship in America have significant constitutional rights and labour mobility therefore are easily integrated. All legal statuses that are short of citizenship are regarded temporary including family members and spouses therefore face challenges in employment search (Hagan, 2011).

In European countries such as Spain, which is facing migration crisis currently, legal boundaries exclude foreigners mainly due to irregular immigration, undocumented migrants and short-term residence permits. For example, in 2015, more than a million Syrian immigrants arrived in Europe fleeing the war (Fernández-Macías and Paniagua de la Iglesia, 2018). European countries struggled to handle this massive influx of people over such a short period of time, especially countries whose location made them points of arrival such as Greece and Italy (Fernández-Macías and Paniagua de la Iglesia, 2018). Germany responded more positively to the crisis and more refugees moved there and were integrated. Asylum seekers in Germany with good prospects residential prospects have access to integration courses. Furthermore, *'tolerated persons'* have access to integration structures (Konhle-Seidl, 2018). However, a large proportion of migrants and refugees remained in the destination countries or moved to other countries for example to Sweden and Austria (Fernández-Macías and Paniagua de la Iglesia, 2018).

Other European societies have different invisible boundaries of exclusion that hinder integration such as racism, language barriers, education skills and social differences (Junge, 2013; Charsley, 2016). These boundaries constrain social interactions between immigrants and natives affecting

Page | 34

them socially and individually. Failure to be nationally identified or 'denied belonging' is expressed in labour market exclusion where immigrants are not employed or are underemployed not matching their qualifications because of where they come from (Hellgren, 2015).

European Union countries have adopted a Migrant Integration Policy Index (MIPEX) an instrument which evaluates guidelines and governments on their progress in promoting the integration of migrants. The MIPEX has been the most reliable tool that is used to asses, compare and improve integration policy in labour market, education, family reunion, health and antidiscrimination of migrants (Huddlestone and Sanchez-Montijano, 2015). By using the MIPEX tool European nations have made strides with NGOs, civil societies and grassroots networks to facilitate immigrant integration in their countries. Furthermore, more work has been done on anti-racism awareness preparing immigrants for employment and against racial discrimination (Bursell, 2012).

However, in light of the recent mass migration to the European Union, several migration policies are in crisis and Britain has voted its exit. Britain has overtly expressed that it could not continue to accept and integrate large numbers of EU migrants as it negatively affects its labour market and public finances. EU member states in 2015 adopted migration policies to open their boarders and accept refugees from war torn countries. Britain's exit from the EU is likely to tighten migration requirements for EU and non-EU residents. However, at the moment it is difficult to argue whether migration flows into the country would be lower if the new policy barriers are introduced (Lisenkova and Sanchez-Martinez, 2016).

In Africa, calls have also been made to improve the integration of migrants on the continent. The Migration Policy Framework for Africa (MPFA) was drafted by the African Union in 2001 to urge its member states to create policies that bind and manage migration integration for Africa (African

Union, 2006). Although the policy framework is not legally binding, African states can borrow aspects that are applicable to their migration situations. SADC however faces a drawback in deepening labour integration in the region because of its refusal to endorse the free movement of people within the community (Pecoud and Gutchteneire, 2007). The region therefore lacks a formal framework regarding labour migration; therefore, members are yet prepared to adopt the MPFA in their countries (Nshimbi and Fioramonti, 2014). Lack of SADC regional policy frameworks that facilitate labour integration negatively affect migrants' integration into the South African labour force.

## 2.3 Labour market integration: a global perspective

Labour market integration involves a process of being employed and receiving an income that aligns with one's qualifications within the same timeframe equal to a national born in the host country with similar qualifications (Tastsoglou and Preston, 2005). Over the last decades, global research on formal labour market integration of immigrants has been focused solely on the 'economic migrant' with less emphasis on the 'non-economic migrant' such as family members, spouses, refugees and students that make up a significant proportion of migrant flow (Banerjee, 2014). This hidden workforce plays a significant role in the receiving countries workforce with skills that can be utilised therefore should be recognised as well. The restrictions of rights, citizenship and socio-economic opportunities for spouses of primary migrants negatively impacts on their labour market integration (Rudiger and Spencer, 2003). Women spouse migrants have low rates of employment in receiving countries mainly due to that fact that the host society does not fully recognize foreign degrees, the gender dynamics that influence women's employment, language hinderances and immigrant's restricted access to jobs (Kontos, 2009). Nonetheless, the proportion of women spouse migrants who have qualifications or other skills is almost at par with the migrant men, in fact women

who emigrate are usually more qualified than those left behind (Docquier and Rapoport, 2007; Phan and Banerjee, 2015).

The labour market is the most important area for immigrant integration because of the need for economic independence among foreigners (Hellgren, 2015). A study done by the United Nations Refugee Agency (UNHCR) on migrants revealed that they identified employment that involves training , as one of their priorities, in settling in the destination country and the other being housing (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).In the UNHCR study, most refugee respondents, stated that they will feel integrated when they have a job and it is imperative for them to be directed to channels that will lead to employment. Migrant countries need to create more employment opportunities because they are essential for labour market integration. Employment corresponds with other aspects of integration, such as networks, healthcare, access to housing and culture (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

Despite the high demand for skilled labour, globally, immigrants find consistent challenges to integrate in the host formal labour market (OECD/EU, 2015). Labour market integration happens over time and sorely depends on the host country's policies, immigrants' skills and the reason for migration (Pennix and Garcés-Mascareñas, 2014). Immigration and integration policies in the receiving country affect migrant's participation in the labour market by either regulating and restricting access to employment of different categories of immigrants (Anderson, 2010). The immigration of skilled workers has been important in the economic development and social cohesion of host countries (Thomson, 2016). Carlson et al 2012, states that although immigrants might be employed in host countries, highest percentage is in low-skilled jobs and upwards promotion is rare. High immigrant countries such as Canada and Sweden have been successful in

the labour market integration process of immigrants into their countries (Bursell, 2012). Sweden's integration policies have emphasised labour market incorporation. The country has created practical integration work by promoting labour market participation and policies that make it possible for migrants to work. During the mass migration to Europe in 2015, Sweden accepted more refugees and asylum seeker per head than most European countries (Robinson and Kappeli, 2018). The country has the best integration policy, according to the Migration Policy Index, the tool that benchmarks policies against high standards. Refugees that migrate to Sweden have good chances of acquiring employment, but their arrival still causes labour market problems because they have lower education levels thus increase the low skilled labour supply. However, from 2012, Syrian immigrants have been the largest share of refugees in Sweden and they tend to be higher educated. Swedish agencies are in the process of assimilating their skills to avoid "brain waste" (Robinson and Kappeli, 2018). Brain waste takes place when highly professional migrants who possess high skills are forced to take jobs that are lower than their qualifications. These jobs do not demand skills attained in the former jobs (Salt, 1997). This trend was observed in a study done by Markova and Black in 2007 where migrants who came from East Europe to United Kingdom were employed in menial jobs. In Denmark strides have also been done to improve migrant labour market integration. The Integration Act 2010 was implemented, where Danish legislature was adjusted enabling focus to be drawn on the needs of accompanying spouses, granting rights such as free Danish language lessons for certain periods (Junge, 2013).

Central to labour market integration is an elaborate framework for recognition of qualifications and competences of migrant workers. Countries such as Australia rely heavily on migrant workers in important sectors such as health.  This is achieved by rapid pathways for registration to work in the field. Rigorous competency tests are undertaken on immigrants to ensure quality of health delivery is not compromised. Such an approach ensures the skills of employable migrants can be tapped.

The favorable labour market incorporation in Australia is highly dependent at the caliber of immigrants that enter the country. The immigrant population possess higher educational qualifications on average than the natives and Australia has made impressive strides in its labour integration policy (Liebig,2007a).

Labour integration of immigrants improves the labour market and positively impacts on the income levels and public finances in recipient countries in the long term, especially in aging populated countries (International Labour Organisation et al, 2016b). Successful labour integration of immigrants elevates the income per capita of destination economies with notable increase in employment-to-population ratios and labour productivity (International Monetary Fund, 2016). Labour productivity is greatly enhanced through increasing the diversity of skills from immigrants and developing native labour by providing new opportunities.

### 2.3.1    Global labour market trends and gender dynamics

Empowering women economically cannot be successfully achieved unless gender gaps are bridged and addressed internationally (Hunt and Sarwar, 2018). The participation rate in labour is defined by ILO as a percentage of the working age in a country that is actively working or looking for employment. Labour force participation indicators look the size and availability of the labour supply that can be involved in production and services (International Labour Organisation, 2012).

Women engagement in labour has amplified rapidly over the last decade (Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2015). Despite this significant growth, gender disparities in the workforce are still a concern. On average, there is the likelihood that women participate less than men in the formal labour market, thereby widening the international gender gap in labour participation, so that whenever women participate, they are less likely to find formal employment

(International Labour Organisation, 2018). Statistics from 1995 to 2015 show that the international female labour market participation rate had reduced significantly from 52.4 to 49.6% and the figures for the males were 79.9 and 76.1% in the same period. The gender gap in labour market participation rate is over 50%, which is approximately double the global estimate (International Labour Organisation, 2018). These wide gaps in gender gap participation are mainly caused by extremities in the low rates of women participation in employment in certain regions. For example, in the Arab States the lowest globally at 18.9%, Northern Africa at 21.9% and Southern Asia at 27.6%. These low rates are mainly caused by numerous economic, cultural and social factors, which restrict and even hinder women's participation in the labour market (International Labour Organisation, 2018). Therefore, in many instances, female labour involvements remain lower than their male counterparts. Gender gaps in labour market participation are numerous in Northern Africa, Arab States and Southern Asia where culture plays a dominant factor with women more likely to be unemployed than men. Internationally, the chances of women being employed in the labour market is 27 % lower than males (Hunt and Sarwar, 2017).

Studies have shown that education is an important factor in determining the labour market participation rate. For example, Cameron et al (2001), in a research done in Asia, stated that women with tertiary education were 49% more employed in the labour market than those with no education. Another study on women's labour force participation done in Malaysia with 600 women within the working ages of 15-65 years, showed that higher education and better experience raised women's participation in the labour market (Nor' Aznin and Norehan, 2007). This relationship between education and employment has also been shown in a study of women in Indonesia, where having a university degree increases the likelihood of being employed in a decent job as compared to having a junior secondary education by 25.6% and possessing a senior secondary education increases it by 10.3% 2009 (Cazes and Verick, 2013).

Women who participate in the labour market also experience gender segregation in their profession, sector and type of job and this restricts quality employment for them. For example, in 2017, 82 % of women in the global south were employed in vulnerable employment, as compared to 72 % of men (International Labour Organisation, 2018). Increased labour market participation for females has not matched that of males in progress. There is need for more initiatives with increased employment prospects for women. In the United Kingdom for example, 75% of working age women are in employment, but where professions are high-earning and high-status, women are still severely under-represented (Razzu, 2014). These jobs tend to be highly gendered because they are perceived as masculine. Most of the female workforce is concentrated into a range of low status, semi-skilled and poorly paid occupations (Razzu, 2014).

African women are below the occupational pyramid in both forms of the labour markets (Tsikata 2009). When compared to their male counterparts, female labour has a higher percentage in the informal sector. Informal employment mainly includes non-agricultural work for females than for males in South Asia with 83 % of women and 82 % of men working, Sub-Saharan Africa has 74 % women and 61 % men; Latin America and the Caribbean has 54 % women and 48 % men while China has 36 and 30 % respectively working in the urban areas (Hunt and Sawar, 2017; Vanek et al, 2014). In Africa, 74% of women's nonagricultural work was mainly informal (International Labour Organisation, 2015). World Bank data indicates that fewer than 15% of women in Sub-Saharan Africa are working for a single employer (World Bank 2014). Rather, African women are frequently concurrently engaged in several types of income activity in the informal sector, which is characterized by Charmes (2005) as pluractivity.

Recent International Labour organisation reports 2016 and 2017 have put forward policies that aim to address gender gaps in the labour market, thereby making advances in achieving the Sustainable

Development Goals. Addressing the gender inequalities in the labour market for women will enable the achievement of not only the SDG 5 on gender equality, but will further address SDG 1 on reducing poverty and inequality and SDG 8 on increasing economic growth and decent work.

### 2.3.2      Women Empowerment

Women empowerment is often quoted as a key factor in the economic advancement of a country. Striving for women's economic empowerment has extensive profits and benefits across various sectors. The UN Secretary-General recently stated on Women's Economic Empowerment: "Economically empowering women is not only the "right thing" to do to honour the world's promises to human rights. It can also be seen as the "smart thing" to ensure progress and economic growth" (Klugman and Tyson, 2016). Female labour participation is important for measuring gender equality and is crucial to gender empowerment. It is vital to ensure gender equality exists in the labour market since it has significant positive developments in gross per capita income and economic growth (Klugman and Tyson, 2016). To illustrate this, statistics show that gender equality may likely increase the global gross domestic product (GDP) by 2025 from $12 trillion to $28 trillion (Hunt and Sarwar, 2017). Therefore, addressing and bridging the gender gaps mainly in employment and in education, positively affects economic growth, which is in turn heavily dependent on the growth of the labour market and its skills development.

Women's economic involvement and growth is important in achieving all the human rights. Closing the gender gaps and providing equal economic opportunities for both sexes is important in the accomplishment of women's human rights and globally approved policy frameworks such as the 2030 Agenda and Sustainable Development Goals (United Nations General Assembly, 2015). Women and girls must have equal rights and opportunities for empowerment, and this involves their inclusion in the labour market (Ackermann and Velelo, 2013). Female labour force participation is

the driving force for growth, and a country that has equal participation of women in its labour market has a greater potential for rapid growth. It is also important because in the global South, women's participation in labour is mainly a response to economic challenges they are facing in the household.

Generally, there is an imbalance in the quality and opportunities available for women and men, even in countries where the gender gap in labour force participation rate is marginal (International Labour Organisation, 2012). Women employed in most developing countries earn less than men, this is termed 'gender wage gap'. A large percentage of women work less-productive jobs and are more concentrated in either unpaid or vulnerable employment. Employment differentiation by gender is predominant globally (World Bank, 2012). Consequently, being employed in vulnerable, under paid work, is not necessarily empowering women, rather, it reflects the subordinate position of females in the household. Countries have made strides in encouraging women participation in labour. For example; South Africa has several policies and laws that encourage women's participation in labour. South Africa is also a party to several international instruments that encourage gender equality through the support of women labour force involvement. In addition, it has also made progress in the feminization of labour with its implementation of progressive gender policies.

### 2.3.3 The increasing feminisation of the labour force

The term "feminization of labour" is used mainly to describe two different features. Firstly, it refers to the distinct quantitative increase in paid work for females over the last twenty years, particularly in formal employment. Secondly, the term "feminization of labour" is used to describe the flexible jobs that characterise employment where more women are currently employed in previously 'male dominated' sectors of employment (Hoissan et al, 2013). Two important facts that can explain the

increase in feminisation, is economic globalization and free trade. This has increased demand for cheap labour and has flexible employment in various forms from full-time employment to temporal, part-time and home work. Women have been marginalised to informal and domestic work thus flexibility seems to offer them freedom to earn income and still perform their domestic responsibilities at home. Women have since then been the readily available source of labor (Morini 2007). Standing (1999) stated that women labour force is somewhat attractive to employers because it is cheap as they are prepared to work for less than men. Unlike men, women tend to be more loyal towards their employers. Women's skilful and soft nature are so often cited as being desirable traits to employers, as well as those in the textile and technology industries and are thus a reflection of the extent to which women are socialized and gendered in the society. Therefore, the feminization of labour encompasses a number of cultural, demographic, and economic factors (Arkosu, 2016).

Women's economic activity has been on the rise in the last three decades, although there are exceptions to this trend notably in Central and Eastern Europe, Asia, North Africa and the Middle East, where it still remains very low due mainly  to such traditional cultural barriers to paid employment as marriage and child bearing (Arkosu, 2016). Several studies have documented this rapid increase in feminisation of labour (Biljohn, 2018; Ozler, 2000). Women are a greater percentage of the working age (15-64 years) but the exact number of women who participate in the labour force is a little less than that of men. Statistics South Africa 2018 stated that women accounted for 43, 8 % of employment in the later part of 2018. Women are highly concentrated in the domestic field of employment as cleaners, technicians and clerks, while the rest have been occupied by men.

### 2.3.4 Women in the international labour market

International policy frameworks have been put forward to support women participation in the labour market. Several ILO treaties and endorsements related to women's labour participation have been approved by several countries, but their implementation internationally still remains inconsistent. An example is stated in the Beijing Platform and Declaration for Action BPfA's twelve critical areas of concern, that outlines 'Women and the economy', where the economic inequality of women and their concentration in low paid jobs with poor conditions is explained extensively. The BPfA states that economic affairs and policies directly affect the access to economic resources and equality by both males and females, and lack of proper gender analysis could result in women's efforts or lack thereof being under appreciated. In the BPfA the economic factors stated include 'all financial and labour markets, economics as an academic discipline, social infrastructure, social security systems and tax structures.' CEDAW includes several articles that are directly relevant to women's labour force participation. For example, CEDAW Article 10 describes equivalent rights to education for males and females, CEDAW Article 11 states that women have equal rights to work, income and labour safety, whether they are on maternity leave, marital status, or are pregnant. CEDAW Article 13 states that women have equal rights to family and financial services and benefits. Lastly CEDAW Article 15 guarantees male and female equity before the law (CEDAW, 1979). In 2016 the UN Secretary-General created a High-Level Panel on Women's Economic Empowerment, to check the progress made regarding the involvement of women in labour participation under the general global 2030 Agenda and SDGs. In 2016, the Panel highlighted challenges that arose in achieving women economic empowerment and presented its findings in the Agenda for Action. In 2015, the European Commission drafted the Gender Action Plan for 2016–2020 (GAP II), which included women's empowerment and their rights economically as one of the four 'pivotal areas' for drafted for action (Hunt and Sawar, 2017). The OECD-Development Assistance Committee (OECD-DAC), in 2016 defined women's economic growth as their

'capability to engage, participate in economic growth in ways that recognise and value their contributions, whilst respecting their dignity. In this way, the benefits of growth will be distributed in a fairer way'. The OECD- DAC published a report that issued assistance to women's labour market participation and it concluded that, 'Aid has been targeting women's economic empowerment, but the principal objective remains especially low, at USD 861 million in 2013–2014. This is just 2% of the aid allocated to the economic and production sectors a mere drop in the ocean' (OECD-DAC, 2016). The report further clarified that the proportion of aid given by EU institutions and mainly channeled towards gender equality was less than 20%.

Despite the progress made so far and the global commitments put in place to secure further improvement in women's employment, their participation in the labour market is still far from being equal to men's.  International Labour Organisation and the policy research network, Women in Informal Employment Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO), have produced statistics on the participation of women in the informal economy (International Labour Organisation, 2013). These statistics show that the informal economy is dominant in the Global South and an irregular source of employment for women (Charmes, 2012). For example, in countries such as Zimbabwe, experiencing political changes and economic crises, including hyperinflation or currency devaluation, the informal economy is then regarded as the predominant source of employment (Dodson, 1998; Skinner, 2016). World Bank (2012) Fin/Scope survey stated that in Zimbabwe, the informal sector was predominant, at 85% of small, medium and micro firms in the country (World Bank, 2012).

Recent International Labour Organisation statistics indicate that internationally, there are constant inequalities between the sexes in their access to labour, the conditions they face in employment and overall unemployment (International Labour Organisation, 2018). Its 2015, estimates state that 50%

of women are in the labour market as compared to their male counterparts at 77 %. Lesser participation rate has been recorded in Northern Africa, Western Asia, Southern Asia (World Bank Indicators, 2016). The international women's labour market participation rate in 2018 is at 48.5 % and is 26.5 % lower than that of males (International Labour Organisation, 2018). In western countries, the female proportion of workers has decreased over the last ten years, but in developing countries it is still high, at 42 % in 2018 as compared to 20 % of male employment. There is less hope of any progress by 2021. As a result, women are therefore more concentrated in the informal employment in global south countries.

In most low to middle income countries, most women involved in paid-work are in the informal sector. Women in Uganda have 95% of their paid employment outside agriculture in the informal economy. In Greece it is close to 4% (Ortiz-Ospina et al, 2018). A study carried out to analyze the low rates of female labour participation in Pakistan, revealed that women experience labour market discrimination and therefore forced to engage in lowly status and poorly paid jobs. This is mainly because Pakistan has stringent traditional, socio-cultural and religious values that have been shaped by the colonial ideas and creation of social institutions that hinder women from participating in the labour market (Sadaquat and Sheikh, 2011). As a result, a large proportion of women are concentrated in the informal jobs. Women are involved in jobs that are characterized by low productivity, low income and less job security coupled with their dual roles of home and employment. Government services offer employment to only a small percentage of women. In Pakistan, unemployment among females is continuously higher than males (Sadaquat and Sheikh, 2011). Despite refugee women migrating to the European Union over the last 10 years possessing better skills than the men, they continue to face challenges in integrating into the labour market. The employment rate of refugee women is at 30% (EU/OECD, 2016). For most migrant groups, more men are integrated into the labour market by 10-20% points. On the other hand, Sweden

refugee women appear to have overcome these barriers and are better employed than in any other EU State (EU-Commission/OECD, 2015). This trend is clearly observed in the high female employment rates of migrants. Further support is however needed for these refugee women such as mentoring programs, support, outreach, at the beginning of work as many migrant women become increasingly distant from the labour market after introductory activities (OECD, 2016).

In other countries, there is low participation in paid employment because women face structural barriers that hinder them from even migrating. The decreased participation of women in employment is explained by the patriarchal structure of the Nepalese society. Men are considered the primary breadwinners who only are allowed to migrate to provide for the families while women are limited to domestic duties (Kasper, 2005). Women in Nepal face restrictions on their mobility in public spaces and have low access to education and employment opportunities (Morgan and Niraula, 1996). Women are also assumed to be more vulnerable to sexual assault in foreign lands, hence their emigration is often restricted by the government (Oishi, 2005; Piper, 2009). The Nepalese government has been imposing and retracting various restrictions on women's migration because of 'increasing incidents of physical assault' on female migrants. In 2012, a temporary ban on migration to the Gulf region was placed on women younger than 30 years of age and later was extended to include women of all ages in 2014. Even though this restriction was partially relaxed in 2015 by reducing the minimum age for migration to 24, women's migration to most destinations is still under strict observation (Inernational Labour Organisation, 2015). Such regulations are influenced by the patriarchal ideology that seeks to 'protect' women by restricting their physical mobility (Bhadra, 2007). Men, however, face no such restrictions and state policies have systematically facilitated men's migration on the other hand. Such persistent gender inequalities embedded in societies and in institutions continue to contribute to the decreased labour participation of women in the global paid labour force.

### 2.3.5    Women in the African labour market

Most African governments have made significant progress in the legal and policy framework to improve women's participation in the formal labour market (Gonzales et al., 2015).  These efforts have resulted in a substantial increase in labour participation over the years. For example, in 2006, Lesotho approved the Legal Capacity of Married Persons Act 9 which allowed women spouses to own property and access labour markets. This law was endorsed as a result of Lesotho's commitment to the CEDAW in 1995 and the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa, 2004 (African Development Bank, 2005).

The proportion of women participation in African labour markets has been a major source of concern and has gained new political attention with the Africa Union Youth and Women Employment. One of the six key areas of the AU Declaration and Plan of Action on Employment, Poverty Eradication and inclusive development encourages more participation of women in employment (African Union, 2015). The Africa Union Aspiration 6 of the Agenda 2063 emphasizes gender equality in all aspects of life including the labour market. Women comprise the majority of the adult working age both unemployed and underemployed. Therefore, all policies and strategies that encourage progress on women's access to decent jobs are beneficial in achieving the AU Agenda 2063 targets (Africa Union, 2015).

Even though there have been considerable calls to improve the labour market participation of women, their participation is still low (Africa Union, 2015). Africa has a high percentage of the informal labour market, although with significant variations across the regions. Sub-Saharan Africa, apart from South Africa, has higher rates of women participation in the informal labour market (Chen, 2008). Men are more dominant in formal labour market than women. Africa has great proportions of women street merchants and informal market dealers. Cross-border trading remains

a significant part of informal trade, for both sexes, especially in countries that are economically unstable. In Zimbabwe, it is estimated that a fifth of every woman involved in the informal economy mainly participates in cross-border trade (Dodson, 1998; Skinner 2016). The women traders buy merchandise from the Southern African region and overseas from Dubai and China to sell/ resell back home.

Gender inequality is predominant in Africa and is largely reflected in several aspects that influence women's involvement in the labour market. For example, African women have less education rights, less access to formal employment, low or unfair political representation, and less bargaining power in the household. These unequal gender factors tend to contribute to low formal labour market participation (World Development Report, 2012).

In Africa, education and skills contribute positively to labour market outcomes and income for both sexes. The education levels of women and girls have improved significantly in developing countries in recent decades. The gender disparities contribute to the progress on the women participation in labour (Verick, 2014). There is a correlation between educational achievement and engagement of women in the labour force in many developing countries. Uneducated or unskilled women in poor countries are the most likely to engage in informal employment and subsistence forms of income generation. After acquiring more skills beyond the secondary school certificates, women tend to join the labour force for higher wages, particularly if the appropriate jobs are obtainable (Verick, 2014). Women who possess primary school certificates were less likely to be employed. The more educated one is, the lower the level of gender inequalities in labour income, as gender disparities in income usually vary with the level of education (World Development Report, 2012). Therefore, the prevailing gender inequalities and gaps in education contribute to the disadvantage of women in formal labour market participation and employment (World Development Report, 2012).

### 2.3.6    Labour market integration in Africa

Countries in the Global South have become increasingly involved in migration management and labour integration of migrants, seeking to gain from either forced and or irregular migration processes. Labour migration issues are entrenched in the different regional integration instruments developed in Africa such as West African, ECOWAS and SADC. However, their actual and potential contribution to successful labour integration is not sufficiently acknowledged. The most recent advancement that encourages successful labour integration has been introduced by the African Union with the creation of the African Continental Free Trade Agreement (AfCFTA) that tends to provide more substantial international cooperation and strong regional organisations in labour recruitment and trade (United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, 2016). The agreement encourages free cross-border labour flows across African countries (United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, 2016).

### 2.3.7    South African labour force

South Africa has made progress in both economic and social development in the last two decades (Anand et al, 2016). Social assistance and economic growth averaging 3.3% since 1994, has resulted in 40% increase per capita and a 10% age point decrease in the poverty rate. Even though there has been positive economic growth, South Africa continues to face crucial challenges namely: high levels of unemployment and inequality (Statistics South Africa, 2018). Statistics show an increase in the working age group by 153 000 in 2018 as compared to figures in 2017 (Statistics South Africa, 2018). The rise in both employment by 206 000 and unemployment over the years has led to an increase in labour market participation rate from 58, 8% to 59,3% (Statistics South Africa, 2018). However, not everyone in the working age group is part of the labour force and only 36% of the entire population forms part of the labour pool. Furthermore, it is vital to note that the labour

force includes not only employed individuals but also those who are unemployed; in other words, all who offer their labour in the labour market.

Post-apartheid South Africa has struggled to create employment and has therefore seen a significant growth in the informal labour market (Barchiesi, 2011). There has been flexibility in the type of labour markets that have emerged. Labour flexibility introduces non-traditional work arrangements and employment occupied by less skilled professionals who are employed in part time jobs as an economic necessity (Chang, 2009; Arnold and Bongiovi, 2012). Castells and Portes (1989) also stated that immigrants in South Africa participate more in the informal sector as compared to formal employment. De Soto (2000) further claims that immigrants are mainly drawn to income generating projects or activities that are familiar to them in the host countries. Research has shown that the low social and economic state of immigrants in destination countries usually makes them vulnerable and likely to be employed in informal work. (De Oliveira and Roberts, 1994; Rogerson, 2000).

Women in South Africa are more concentrated in informal type of employment. This is mainly because of the history of discrimination they faced during the apartheid period. Previous studies have recognized the high percentage of women in the South African informal economy rather than the formal economy (Sethuraman, 1998). Studies have also explored why women are most likely to engage in the informal sector (Sethuraman, 1998; Chen et al, 2006; Carr et al., 2000). The income generated from informal work, which is largely operated by women, is not inadequate. The informal economy requires little money investment, no skills or little skills training and offers lesser prospects for expansion into practical businesses. The informal sector is driven by poverty and offers a safety net for short term financial income (Rogerson, 2000). Other studies argue that women are more comfortable with informal work because it is compatible with domestic work (Moser, 1978; Portes and Sassen-Koob, 1987; Osirim, 1992). Hart (1991) argues that more women prefer to work in the informal employment because it is flexible, unlike formal employment which fails

to adequately accommodate their numerous household tasks. Women can be greatly encouraged to participate in the informal sector because of social and cultural practices that prevent them from obtaining the mandatory formal education (Leach, 1996).

### 2.3.8 Labour market integration in South Africa

South Africa has experienced an influx of different types of migrants with several migration channels over the last fifty years. The Southern Africa Development Community treaty of 1992 provided a foundation for the integration of the Southern African States establishing the Community as common market. There were various steps taken toward this ambitious objective, but it should be noted that theory and practice are different. A lot remained to be done to accomplish the internal market and to affect the free trade of goods and services, labour and investments within SADC (UNECA, 1997). Several factors constrain labour integration in Southern Africa notably government restrictions, restrictive practices in professional organisation, imperfect labour market information and failure to recognize qualifications obtained in partner countries among others.

In the apartheid period, South Africa depended on the regular source of less skilled migrant labour from the neighboring countries for its mining and agriculture areas (McDonald, 2000; Crush, 2001). Since then, South Africa has become an economic and political stable destination for migrants coming from the region and international (Isike, 2012). Due to the influx of migrants, South Africa is now a destination to foreigners in diversity including asylum seekers, temporary migrants, refugees and undocumented migrants (Jinnah 2013).

Before 1994, South Africa's immigration policies were used as channels of racial control and up until the year 1991, being an immigrant meant complete assimilation into the white population (Crush, 2001). After the establishment of the 1994 post-apartheid government, South Africa struggled to formulate a concrete migration policy and attitudes towards immigration both of

government representatives and the public were channeled towards immigrants versus national interests or of xenophobia and racism on the other hand. However, South African government's position on migration has changed substantially with several milestones achieved. These milestones include the Immigration Act of 2002 and the Act amendment in 2004 (Muzumbukilwa, 2007). There was recognition that a clearer immigration policy was required. The creation of the Joint Initiative for Priority Skills Acquisition (JIPSA) has been to organize the progress of various government institutions regarding skill search. The rise in skills shortages has prompted these developments and this can be solved by encouraging immigration of skilled workers. South Africa has seen changes economically and politically between 1994 and now. The constitutional changes have opened a debate identifying migration issues as priority. Recently, the 1999 White Paper on International migration was amended with the release of the 2016 Green Paper on International migration. The currently amended 2016 Green Paper takes a holistic approach in improving South Africa's role in global migration stating that the country should harness economic opportunities that come with migration whilst managing it proactively and strategically (Department of Home Affairs, 2016).

However, despite legal frameworks offering migrants more freedom and rights, their situations regarding human right abuses and exclusion are evident, nevertheless. Xenophobic violence against foreign nationals has worsened with migrants being targeted and attacked for allegedly taking jobs of the native population. Xenophobia according to Bealy (1999), *"is a fear and hatred of foreigners that is manifested in the harassment of minority ethnic groups"* (Bealy, 1999). Overt hostility among foreigners is not just present in South Africa but it is a global phenomenon. As highlighted by studies such as Donnelly (2015), xenophobia is also present in America where local citizens fear Mexican migrants and other nations bordering from the South because they are considered to be taking work opportunities and threatening American cultures. Hai (2005), illustrated the hostility

foreigners face in China, despite migrants playing an indispensable role in the economic growth and development of the country. In Germany, protests have increased against the increase in migrants from the Arab and Middle East fearing terror attacks (Haqopian, 2015).

The South African Migration Project (SAMP) survey (2001) stated that South African nationals have an extremely restrictive view towards migrants as compared to international standards. The survey revealed that 21% wanted a complete ban of foreigners entering the country and 64 % requested stringent limits to be placed on the statistics of migrants who enter the country. South African respondents were also asked to what extent did they believe someone was foreign and the percentage of illegal migrants in the country. The responses were 26.9% and 47.9 % respectively, showing that South African perception of foreigners is xenophobic (Crush and Pendleton, 2004)

In South Africa, outbursts of violence show the deep resentment that natives have towards black African foreigners rather, a phenomenon known as Afrophobia (Waiganjo, 2017). Unlike xenophobia, afrophobia on the other hand, includes the notion of hostility towards 'the black or African other'. Mudimbe (1988) stated that colonialism had a negative consequence on Africans including the tendency by some to despise other black Africans from other countries within the continent. For example, in South Africa, the vicious structures of colonialism, racial separation and apartheid cultivated negative hatred and sentiments towards *fellow Africans from beyond the Limpopo'* (Koenane and Maphunye, 2015). This hatred mainly comes from a few South Africans that understand the socio-economic and political lifestyles of fellow Africans beyond the Limpopo. These South Africans therefore see no reason why they should 'share' their country with foreigners. It is a manifestation of distrust and envy towards black foreigners who are seen as a threat because they reside in the black communities, stealing the jobs and women of South African men. South Africa nationals appear to welcome foreigners who contribute positively economically, and

xenophobic attitudes of hatred are mostly directed towards those who *'take away'* their jobs (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013). This explains why xenophobia is mainly channeled to other Africans (afrophobia), as the rest of Africa is seen as poverty-stricken, backward and has a large number of 'failed states' (Fine and Bird, 2003). This feeling of being superior to other African states is also influenced by South African economic stability on the African continent and the fact that South African citizens have little or no contact with foreigners, this allows stereotypes to be created. The word 'African' has become merged used interchangeably with 'Black' such that national and racial classes in the population have mixed. Fine and Bird (2003), state that *"South Africans hold negative attitudes towards foreigners and they likewise have readily accessible stereotypes with which they use to justify or rationalise their negative attitudes* (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013). Furthermore, Neocosmos stated that: *"It is these assumptions that have led South Africans to believe that 'fortress South Africa' must be defended against 'masses of illegal immigrants' or barbarians that are waiting to flood the country"* (Neocosmos 2006). This image has provided the basis for xenophobia in South Africa and is greatly enhanced by the discriminatory way in which migration issues are portrayed in the media.

It is important to also note that Afrophobia is also deeply entrenched in South Africa's migratory policy framework where migration policies tend to be more restrictive towards African immigrants rather than European or Asian (Flahaux and Dehaas, 2016; Murunga 2015). An employer is not allowed to employ a foreign national within South Africa without a valid work permit and when in possession of the accompanying spouse visa which does not grant the spouse the right to work (DHA, 2014). Employers use these restricted labour laws and are stricter on black African immigrants than other foreign nationals (Murunga, 2015).

Afrophobia in South Africa is overtly shown in various behaviors, from exclusion in employment, to the understated and indirect social exclusion of refugees from integrating or assimilating expressively within their communities, to outright violent attacks on refugees (Murunga, 2015; Waiganjo, 2017). This form of violence is present in the daily life of foreigners with organisational discrimination, being verbally abused and facing public hostility that overtly show the negative attitudes that South Africans have against foreigners (Muzumbukilwa, 2007). Results from a survey by the South African Migration Project showed that 87% of native South Africans believed that the country was accommodating a lot of many foreigners (Segale, 2004). It is difficult to comprehend why Africans that currently face such hatred and exclusion come from the same countries that protected and facilitated the liberation struggle by providing food, shelter and education to the exiled comrades of the African National Congress who are today's South Africa heroes (Nyamnjoh 2006).

The manifestation of xenophobia and afrophobia in South Africa undermines peaceful co-existence with other African states, disrupting social cohesion and creates human/migrant right violation. Furthermore, South Africa is a signatory to the international human rights and treaties, specifically on refugees and asylum seekers therefore responsibilities to fight xenophobia are legal and moral. As a South Africa has a high level of democracy that is involved with the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD), SADC and the AU, South Africa is barely in an ethical or economical stance to prevent people from entering its borders. These institutions were created to encourage association and more regional integration and cooperation. The idea of having South Africa allow its nationals to act xenophobic towards other African citizens, will eventually destroy the regional cooperation, peace and harmony that the country is signatory to (Crush and Pendleton, 2004). Given the above background, integration of migrants in South Africa's formal labour market has been challenging especially now that economic performance for South Africa has largely been

Page | 57

stagnant or declining resulting in stiff competition for jobs and increased hostile treatment of foreign nationals.

### 2.3.9    Position of women in the labour market

Women's labour participation is a vital factor in empowerment, yet internationally, most women are either unemployed or underemployed; which means they are working for fewer hours than they desire.  Researched data from Hunt and Sarwar (2017), stipulated that from 2015, 25% of women in the working age group were underemployed as compared to their male counterparts at 19%. This trend is mainly seen in the younger groups where estimated underemployment figures are 42 % women and 36 % men (Hunt and Summan, 2016). The  International Labour Organisation (2015) defines decent work as 'comprising of opportunities for work that deliver a fair income whilst being productive, opportunities that offer security at the workplace and offer social protection for families, encourage personal growth and social integration, offer freedom to express individual concerns, and opportunities that make people participate in the decisions that affect them personally whilst providing equality and treatment for all women and men'. Women can only have a good or decent job, which is able to provide fair and stable income if they are economically empowered. Formal employment which provides the opportunities stated above is more likely to be termed 'decent' as stated by Kabeer (2012). The integration of women and their position in the labour market differs across regions and depends significantly on the socio- cultural factors they are exposed to. Gender roles and the pressure to conform to these roles differ for women across global regions, religions and households. For example, one way women feel pressure to conform to gender roles is evident in their marital status. In emerging economies, women that have spouses or partners are not likely to be employed in any job that offers them income; neither would they be actively seeking work. This is because the economic stability of one's partner's income usually reinforces the "male breadwinner" bias in some marital arrangements. In the global south countries, the opposite is

usually the case. Economic needs faced in the region offer women fewer choices but to work despite their marital statuses. Women feel the need to be included in paid formal employment, but persistent socio-economic barriers tend to hinder them from being incorporated into the workforce. It is necessary for policies to identify such barriers and develop responses that could eliminate them. Minimising gender gap in the labour force is not only beneficial for women and their households, but for the global economy in general.

Another example is labour market outcomes in Europe that are mainly influenced by gender dynamics. Women migrants enter the labour market in mainly low skilled jobs and a significant number of those previously employed and those who were students before leaving their countries of origin all become inactive when they migrate to Europe (Castagnone, 2013). Women's integration into the labour market is therefore hampered by an increase in their inactivity.

### 2.3.10 Women migrant spouse integration in formal labour markets

Women migrant spouses have difficulties in accessing jobs mainly due to the migratory and labour policies that are in place in host countries (Thomson et al., 2016). Gender inequalities still exist in incorporating these women migrant spouses in the labour market and in immigration policies (Boyd, 1995). In most families that are traditional, the husband is the principal migrant, and the wife is the dependent or secondary migrant that has her migration status attached to the husbands' (Banerjee and Phan, 2015). Regardless of being secondary migrants, most of the spouses had careers in their countries of origin and aspire to integrate into the host country's labour pool after entry however; integration of women spouses in employment has been met with difficulties and barriers other than education levels (Phan and Banerjee, 2015).

Women migrant spouses face discrimination and are vulnerable to abuse in accessing the labour market based on immigration and labour laws, nationality, ethnicity, gender and religion (Fleury, 2016). In the United States, migrant women spouses are trapped by laws that prohibit them to work in the labour market (Bragun, 2008). Structural inequalities in the immigration laws and visa systems have negative implications on dependent spouses, as they restrict the women spouses to participate fully as citizens of the state (Balgamwalla, 2014). A study done on spousal visa holders in the United States, showed that H-4 visa holders who are categorised as dependent spouses are not authorised to work and apply independently for legal permanent residence (Bragun, 2008; Balgamwalla, 2014). These women are confined to the home by the immigration laws, deprived of the enjoyment of their rights in social participation and equality. Even though the professional immigrants and their spouses have legal immigration status to stay in the United States, only the professional spouses have a right to employment. Inability to access employment causes a chain of other impediments that challenge the successful integration of women spouses. Spousal dependency brews other forms of abuse both psychologically and physically.

The United States immigration policy has also seen new rules being implemented on visa regulations as part of a broad push by the current Trump administration to stop illegal immigration and to tighten restrictions on legal immigration. The Trump administration has also taken several additional measures to reduce the visas being issued (Pierce et al, 2018). These include the administration plans and announcements to make alterations to the H-1B program, that refers to the temporary visa used by employers in recruiting highly skilled employees. The Trump administration is making changes by redefining the criteria for visa qualification and ending the related H-4 program that permits work authorization to dependent partners of H-1B visa holders (Pierce and Gelatt, 2018). The administration has also announced that it intends to put stringent measures for immigrants in securing green cards or extend visas if their dependents use any benefits

and tax credits that they are qualified for. Such changes are likely to make integration of spouses more difficult (Pierce et al, 2018).

Across the EU for example, a variety of permits carrying different rights and entitlements outline the duration of stays, access to the labour pool and likelihood in applying for citizenship or permanent residence. In that regard, labour market access for categories of migrants for example, spouses may be restricted. A 2013 study on Switzerland multinational companies' expatriate and spouse adjustment, showed that there is great difficulty for women spouses of multinational companies' (MNC'S) professionals to pursue their careers due to culture and language hinderances, and non-recognition of foreign credentials (Ravasi et al., 2013). A research survey done in Denmark in 2013, 'Accompanying spouses in a welfare state', showed that 98% of migrant women spouses had a higher education but only 22% were employed in the labour market mainly because of language barriers (Junge, 2013). According to Charlsey et al 2016, recent barriers on marriage related immigration/integration in the UK have been supported by poor policy developments. The research study done on British ethnic minority groups, found out that there are policy structural barriers to Pakistani Muslims and Indian Sikh migrant spouses in obtaining employment because their qualifications are not recognized in the UK labour market (Charlsey, 2016).

South African migration has since moved from being characterized by completely male demographic to including families with women and children (Chisale, 2015). The women spouses are given the accompanying spouse visa which only permits them to enter and reside in South Africa. One has to acquire other permits that allow them to work or study (Department of Home Affairs, 2014). Recruitment policies have become stringent where companies hire foreigners on permanent residence permits or work permits. These permits are difficult to acquire because they take long to be processed and are expensive (Chisale, 2015).

### 2.3.11    Women in the South African labour market

In the past decade, South Africa has observed a distinct rise in female labour market participation in both the formal and informal markets. These goals for achieving gender equality are guided by South Africa`s aspirations for human rights which embrace equal and unchallengeable rights for both sexes. This idea is the main principle in the Bill of Rights of The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 (Act 108 of 1996). The bill seeks to promote the dignity of individuals regardless of such social classifications as race and gender. However, cultural practices which foster patriarchal tendencies sometimes manifest in several facets of the society, including employment, specifically for migrant women. For native South Africans, several measures have been taken to ensure cultural norms are dominating in the workplace. Indeed, South Africa has become a shining example of gender empowerment in Africa with many women not only obtaining employment but also assuming top positions in both private and public spheres. This trend is largely due to the provisions of the working Gender Policy Framework which prescribed important national guidelines that ensured a redress of the cultural connotations that subordinated women in many spheres of society.

The Gender Policy Framework is based on a few assumptions. First, is the assumption that a large percentage of the population of South Africans live in abject poverty despite the country being categorized as a middle to high income earning country under many global indicators. Among these poor, the majority are women residing in peri-urban and rural areas. Therefore, the Gender Policy Framework uses what has been termed the "basic needs" program which is a holistic strategy that seeks to meet the basic needs of women with the long-term goal of ensuring equality and empowerment. Second, it is assumed that an inter-sectorial implementation of this approach is necessary if the needs of women are to be effectively addressed. Hence, resources and opportunities will have to be mobilized across various sectors to address a diverse range of the needs of women.

Third, the "women's empowerment" approach also focuses on practical needs which in many ways are assumed to be complementary to the "basic needs" approach. Fourth, the framework also assumes a "Gender and Development" (GAD) approach which prioritizes 'strategic needs,' guided by the pursuit of gender equality. This stems from the realization of the inequalities among males and females in South Africa, particularly from a cultural perspective. Hence the Gender Policy Framework seeks to empower women through an integrated address of basic and practical needs. Therefore, the policy also draws a lot of inspiration from Beijing Platform of Action in its entirety.

It has however been debated whether this has been a true indication of socio-economic empowerment for women. Women's equality and empowerment is included in the 17 Sustainable Development Goals, but also fundamental to all dimensions of sustainable development. In summary, most SDGs rely on the sole achievement of Goal number 5. Separately, SDG 5 that obligates all states to initiatives that 'Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls' is termed the stand-alone gender goal. SDG 5 alone has nine targets and four of them directly address women's economic empowerment/ involvement in the labour market placing value on unpaid care work, enabling women to participate at various stages of leadership and decision making, safeguarding women's rights to financial resources and encouraging the use of technology to advance women (UN Women, 2016). However, even with these enabling laws and policies standing, there is still a large task at hand in ensuring that the legal and regulatory frameworks put in place are effectively enforced, implemented, monitored and evaluated. South Africa is striving towards better living conditions for all citizens, and this includes empowering women. It is generally recognized that economically empowering women is important; it achieves gender rights and other development achievements such as economic growth, health, eradicating poverty and the attainment of skills (Kabeer, 2012). Given the provisions of the elaborate provisions of the Gender

Policy Framework for South Africa, it is unlikely that the immigration act still excludes women on the Accompanying Spouse visa category from working.

South African women, mainly black, were victims of institutional discrimination that relegated them from financial freedom and structures. In 1994, with the abolishment of apartheid the government sought to revise and improve the status of women in the labour market through correcting the procedures that were in place (Ntuli, 2009). The government created new policies that embraced international treaties and promoted gender equality in labour and the society. As South Africa matured in democracy since attaining its independence in 1994, the last three decades have been characterized by prioritized upholding of human rights. The improved constitution encouraged non-discrimination. Rectifying the racial discrimination of the past, included prioritizing women participation/ involvement in politics. The Employment Equity Act (No. 55 of 1998) was the most significant regulations passed regarding labour laws and encouraged no discrimination and an improvement in gender equity. As a result, more women could now access more jobs and they demanded equal pay (Ackermann and Velelo, 2013). Disadvantaged groups such as African women were now in a favourable place.

According to Statistics South Africa, the percentage of females in the workforce is high, but males participate higher in the labour market than females (Statistics South Africa, 2018). Women labour market proportion has not changed over the last ten years and has even deteriorated in some aspects. The informal sector comprises 17,4 % of employment and provides a vital role for population that is unskilled and are not employed in the formal sector. It is dominantly concentrated in trade. Statistics show that are more women in the informal sector estimated at 47, 6 % than 30,6 % of men (Statistics South Africa, 2018).  In 2018, statistics showed that a third of females were employed in

the informal economy with only 9.6% of males. Males employed in the sector were engaged in transport and construction.

However, females engaged in the informal economy still remain outnumbered by their male counterparts (Barker, 2000). Over the last four decades, there has been a notable rise in female labour employment, mainly attributed to several factors. Barker (2007) attributed this rapid feminisation of labour to an increase in labour income and increased accessibility to employment resulting from reduced gender inequalities, increase in women accessing education, reduced birth statistics and changes in societal views about the role and position of women.

The gap between men and women regarding access to and attainment of education in South Africa is narrowing, with more of the latter now educated. Even though black South African women consist a greater proportion of women with no formal schooling, it is also within this group that rapidly changing trends are being noticed (Serumaga-Zake and Kotze, 2004). Noteworthy is the increasing enrolment of women in institutions of higher education, (Department of Basic Education, 2009). This puts women in a better position to access employment once they have completed their schooling (Serumaga-Zake and Kotze, 2004).

Another important factor is that more South African women are choosing to have fewer children for various reasons, and now able to exercise this choice (Swartz, 2002). South Africa's birth rate has declined over the years. Having fewer children may enable women to participate in the labour force more willingly. Studies have shown that women with five or more children have low probability in gaining meaningful employment (Serumaga-Zake and Kotze, 2002; Ackermann and Velelo, 2013). Therefore, women who can control this aspect of their lives can be employed whenever they choose to do so.

In addition, women who have previously chosen not to work formally are now being forced to join the labour force in order to provide for their families due to increasing divorce and singlehood rates (Casale and Posel, 2002). Studies have shown a link between one marriage standing and employability, where divorced women were more likely than any other group of South African women either (married, single, co-habiting or widowed) to be employed. Females are greatly being forced to be employed mainly because of loss of the main source of traditional income coming from their male counterparts. Household poverty increases women's participation in the labour force. Kabeer (2012), supports this in stating that there is a correlation between poverty and an increase in female labour market engagement. Rising unemployment levels of South African males further explains why more women are now forced into the labour market (Casale and Posel, 2004; Kabeer, 2012). Women are now forced to become breadwinners because their male partners are suddenly unemployed and no longer fending for their families.

In summary, an increasing number of South African women now participate in formal education, have lower birth rates and are supported by a government that promotes gender equality. Furthermore, as stated above, rising cases of divorce and increase in joblessness among men is forcing more women into employment. A combination of the above social factors has resulted in increased expectations of the position of women in society, their participation in labour market and as family bread winners.

### 2.3.12     Gender disparities in South African labour

Despite the various labour reforms  put forward to support females engagement in labour in South Africa namely: the Employment Equity Act (1998) , the Skills Development Act  (l998), the Promotion of Equality and the Prevention of Unfair Discrimination (2000), the Broad Based Black

Economic Empowerment Act (2003), women have broken through the labour force which was hitherto predominantly patriarchal. Prior to independence and transition to democracy in 1994, all South African women had been victims of various forms of ill-treatment in both private and public forms of employment. Women were subjected to both racial and gender discrimination. In general women had been more oppressed in relation to men.

Theoretically, post-apartheid South African legislation put a stay on gender oppression and inequality and various policies were drafted to address sexism at the workplace. These included the Basic Conditions of Employment Act (No. 75 of 1997), which addresses direct discrimination in employment (Republic of South Africa, 2002), Employment Equity Act (No. 55 of 1998), which institutionalized affirmative action for women and addressed discrimination (Republic of South Africa, 2008), Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act (No. 4 of 2000) which addresses illegal unfair treatment of women based on their sex and pregnancy (Republic of South Africa, 2000), Protection from Harassment Act (No. 17 of 2011), which ensures that women are protected from physical or psychological violence at the workplace (Republic of South Africa, 2011). Even though these policies have been put forward to make sure that the overt ill treatment of women in the workplace is eliminated, their implementation remains at the discretion of employers. More vigilant monitoring and enforcement of the policies is required to lower persistent gender disparities in the labour market.

### 2.3.13 Women migrants in the South African labour market

There is a growing inflow of female migrants into South Africa. A growing proportion is travelling to the country independent of spouses or partners (Mbiyozo, 2018). Legal work permits in South Africa are given to skilled migrants from outside the region. For example, between 2001 and 2014,

South Africa issued 96 000 work permits, and slightly fewer than 25% were granted to Zimbabweans. While the Zimbabwe special permit processes were open to women, no gender considerations were applied. It is unclear how many women applied for, or received the special permits, as gendered data is unavailable (Mbiyozo, 2018; Bimha, 2017).

Skilled women migrants in South Africa that have acquired the Zimbabwe special dispensation visa, critical skills visa and the permanent residence permit are eligible to work in the formal economic market and have meaningfully been participating in the economy. According to the Organisation of Economic Cooperation and Development and International Labour Organisation, 2018, between 2001 and 2011, the South African labour market observed positive developments in terms of key labour market indicators with increasing economic activity of legally employed women migrants.

However, such positive developments in labour migration are hampered when we look at other visa statuses such as spousal/family residence visas which sometimes do not allow the holder to be employed and migrants holding temporary work permits for employment purposes are not permitted to have their partners or dependents reside with them in the host country. Labour, like migration, has gender connotations, with particular areas in employment aligned to either male or female. The number of economically active women entering the South African labour market is rising. Professional women migrate to South Africa for better "greener pastures" and better economic opportunities. Skilled and professional women are migrating in large numbers, but certain government policies in South Africa could hinder them from being properly integrated. As highlighted in the chapters above, migrant women without a specific profession are more involved in informal cross-border trade from the neighbouring countries (Dodson, 1998). Structural barriers

such as labour integration policies need to be improved, to increase migrant engagement in formal employment.

## 2.4 Gaps in literature

A gap still exists in migration research regarding skilled women spouses' labour integration in Africa and South Africa. Labour integration of women spouses in the formal labour market is under researched. This research study aims to fill the gap by contributing knowledge regarding migrant spouse labour integration. My research will shed more light on the gender inequalities that still exist in migration labour policies regarding formal labour integration of skilled migrant women spouses, a marginalized group of immigrants. It is important to understand this migratory phenomenon using existing theories and knowledge to gain a better understanding and to suggest possible intervention ideas that can be used to address or improve labour integration. Whilst similar studies have been done in other top migrant destinations in the world like United States of America, such studies have never been done in South Africa.

## 2.5 Theoretical Framework

A theoretical framework is a system of concepts that try to explain and understand the challenges associated with a phenomenon, connecting the researcher to existing knowledge (Jarvis, 1999). The framework guides the research, indicating how problems are defined and provides viable solutions. There is an increasing interest on gender in migration studies and several theories have been used to understand women in migration better. In this research, the social inclusion, the gender geographies of power and gender and development theories will be used to gain a better understanding of the challenges that skilled Zimbabwean women spouses experience in securing employment with regards to their visa status in South Africa. All the theories used in this research

were relevant to the study, the social inclusion theory explains the relevance of integrating the women migrants in formal labour, the gender geographies of power explains the gendered nature of migration in transnational spaces and the gender and development approach explains the importance of including women in development policies through gender mainstreaming.

### 2.5.1    The social inclusion theory

According to this theory, migrants can effectively and efficiently contribute both economically and socially to the host society. The social structure of a society functions effectively if all diverse communities engage. The social inclusion theory further states that individuals have the capacity to engage in the production and consumption of a society once they have been fully accepted and integrated. UNESCO (2012) defines social inclusive societies as *"societies where all individuals have a role to play. This society is based on the values of equality, social justice and human rights and the principles of tolerance, embracing diversity"*.

The migration and settlement of foreigners alone might not cause a threat to social institutions in the receiving society, but discrimination and lack of migration policies that support integration results in the process being problematic (Dumont, 2010). The extent to which these foreigners are accepted or alienated contributes immensely to their welfare. Therefore, the social inclusion theory is used in cases where a group or individual is alienated or excluded from participation and integration in the society. The social inclusion approach has been used in Canada to improve the integration of immigrants in the adopted society through information provision. Information providers and policy makers have disseminated information to both immigrants and nationals that enables social inclusion of new immigrants into the socio-economic and labour market systems (Caidi and Allard, 2005).  The provision of information regarding the value/importance of

immigrants in the society and the opportunities that are available to foreigners has contributed immensely in successful integration of foreigners in all sectors. The social inclusion theory has also been used by the European Union member states to promote equal participation of migrants and their descendants in the society so that they can contribute to EU's inclusive growth (European Agency for Fundamental Rights, 2017). In this research, the theory will be used to investigate the opportunities and challenges that the Zimbabwean women on the Accompanying dependent visa have in the formal labour market.

### 2.5.2 Gender geographies of power theory

Gender geographies of power posited by Mahler and Pessar (2001) is a conceptual theory that has been developed to try and explain gendered nature of migration in transnational spaces at micro, meso and macro level (Pessar et al., 2003). Gender geographies of power theory include concepts of geographic scales, social location, power geometries and social imaginary. According to the gender geographies of power theory, transnational migration and gender are intertwined in shaping individual experiences and understanding their position in the society. The framework highlights the gendered aspects of social agency given an individual's positioning in multiple power hierarchies. All these concepts have been used in this research study.

### 2.5.1 Geographic scales

The concept of geographic scales tends to explain how gender is evident on different scales namely the body, family and the state (Fluri, 2009, 2015). It is within these scales that gender ideologies are affirmed and configured. The concept examines how gender identities and subjectivities are created in different contexts. The concept of geographic scales shows the gender complexities of the lives of skilled migrant women spouses who renegotiate their status by migrating into South
Page | 71

Africa. Geographic scales will be used to explain how the migration process negatively affects migrant spouses individually (the body) and on a family level. Psychologically, it affects the migrant wives due to career interruptions and exclusive focus on their husbands' careers at the expense of their own professional interests. These skilled women spouses also become economic dependents to their husbands. Such overdependence on husbands is widely known for being a precursor to violent abusive marriages in Africa (Hiralal et al., 2017). Indeed, domestic violence is rampant among immigrants not only in South Africa but the globe. Reports from as far as North America and Europe have also reflected a linked pattern between migration and intimate partner violence with alternation of gender responsibility in the migration process as the chief contributing factor to conflict.

### 2.5.2 Social location

The concept of social location states that a person's power within hierarchies is affected by their geographic location. According to Pessar, *"social location refers to a woman's position within interconnected power hierarchies created by political, economic or geographic factors"* (Pessar et al., 2003; Aitchson, 2010). Gender operates at various levels and different power hierarchies such as class, race, sexuality, nationality and ethnicity are determined by the social location. Social location theory states that people are born into different situations that are either advantageous or disadvantageous to them. Social locations are not fixed but changes with time. Pessar and Mahler (2003) state that regardless of their personal efforts, people are positioned in locations that they have never constructed. The ability of anyone to act is based upon their social location. Migrants are exposed to power hierarchies irrespective of their own efforts. The social location concept enabled me to highlight the migratory experiences of skilled migrant women spouses by virtue of relocating to South Africa. The theory helped in explaining the difference in personal experiences

for these migrants from home countries and the destination country. The skilled Zimbabwean women are not homogenous; they have different individual social locations and experiences in job searching. For example, different social class standings in the study group affect access to resources and mobility that assist them in job search. Some women have financial security through their husbands to assist them in various job searches and other women on the other hand do not have the finances.

### 2.5.3     Social imaginary

Social imaginary concept states that the role of cognitive processes is essential in migration decision making. Various forms of imagination shape the way people think about and act toward migration (Pessar et al., 2003; Aitchson, 2010). Social imaginary is therefore a concept which captures the creative, individual dynamic imagination that shapes the envisaged social and lifestyle changes in the target host country thereby motivating the migration process. It is particularly important for what is regarded as lifestyle migration which is a stark contrast from other disposition of migration such as forced migration in response to strife like war (O`Reilly, 2014). It has been argued that, in the former, ambition and romanticisms are the chief drivers for migration. Such may be the case with Zimbabwean immigrants who in most cases are holders of professional qualifications and left jobs due to poor remuneration. Hence, positive expectations of the life across borders influenced their migratory decision. Indeed, migratory experiences are usually based or fore grounded by imagining, strategizing and planning the life one expects at the destination country. The process involves planning the life at the host country from acquiring travel papers to securing accommodation. This element is important because practically migration cannot be successful without proper planning and securing resources that would ease the journey and settlement in the destination country. The imagining concept either promotes or hinders mobility (Pedraza, 1991).

This concept was important in analyzing the expectations that the skilled migrant women had before they migrated to South Africa. Nevertheless, social imaginary may also play a role under forced migration. For example, Shaffer et al., (2017) outlined the usefulness of location and channels in the protracted displacement of Somalis in the Somali War which displaced over 1 million of them (Hammond et al., 2011). That study employed an ethnographic approach among Somalis residing in South Africa and the USA, reflecting on the personal perceptions and realities of the migrants in the determination possible destinations, timing and mode of migration, even in forced-migration circumstances. The study reported the importance of positive economic flows of remittances in shaping the perspectives of migrants. The study showed the fluidity of migration processes where even once perceived final destinations may become temporary and end up only saving as springboards to destinations elsewhere. Although many of the refugees remain in East African countries such as Kenya and Ethiopia, a large number of migrants have gone to other destinations through help from resettlement programs led by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), or through their onward migration guided by social imaginary. This is to a large extent the same with Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa, despite confessing fears of xenophobic attacks and outright uncertainty.

### 2.5.3     Power geometry of gender in transnational spaces

Migration constitutes clearly defined spatial changes in uses and social constructs of space among humans. It is therefore far from merely a binary exchange between sending and receiving countries as the post-migration impacts on the host country and the migrants, although localised, can have profound consequences. Transnational spaces for migrants are defined by confluences of interacting factors involving culture and the dynamics of the new settled communities (Voigt-Graf, 2004). In these confluences, different degrees of power the post-migration socially constructed networks create power geometry in the transnational space.

Power geometry is therefore a concept that explains the initiatives that people exercise in their different social locations (Pessar and Mahler, 2003). According to Massey (1993, 2009) people are placed in various locations that have different power flows and interconnectedness and they exert power over these forces differently. Some take advantage of these forces and others are imprisoned by them. Even though migration paths are mainly patriarchal, women are not passive victims, they are able to exercise a form of agency along the migratory way. Massey (1993) further states *"that people's social locations affect their access to resources across transnational spaces, but people can exercise agency and be initiators, transformers and refiners in these locations"*. To better understand gender in transnational spaces therefore requires an application of the "gendered geographies of power" model, developed and first outlined by Pessar and Mahler (2003). It consists several building blocks including first, a spatial reference "geographies" which covers the dynamics of gender on several scales such as the body, the family, the state across boundaries. Pessar and Mahler (2003) uses the Haitian migrant women to illustrate the geographic dynamics. They note that, across transnational spaces, the women strive to renegotiate their status reinforcing the currently operative system in Haiti as it is linked to their identity despite evidence of the subordination of women. In this case, transnational spaces fortify the asymmetrical gender relations despite the elimination of the state.

Another important component of the gender geographies of power model is the social location. It refers the persons' positions across power hierarchies created through social stratifying factors such as historical, political, economic, geographic and kinship based. The third component of the model covers the level and degree of agency people have exercised in any environment in line with the classical power geometry constructed by Massey (1993). Hence "gendered geographies of power" *"is a tool for examining people's social agency either corporal and cognitive, given their own initiatives and their positioning within multiple hierarchies of power operative within and across*

*many terrains",* (Pessar and Mahler, 2003). It is therefore an important tool for comprehensive analyses of gender in transnational spaces for research and in other investigations. Hence power geometry and gendered geographies of power were useful conceptual frameworks for disentangling the points of contention in the migratory experiences of skilled women spouses of Zimbabwe in this study.

### 2.5.4    Gender and Development (GAD) Approach

Several gender approaches to development have been created over the years to try and include women in the development framework. The Women in Development (WID) approach was created early 1970s. In this approach, the subordination in the treatment of women was attributed to poverty therefore income inequality was to blame (Momsen, 1991). The strategy was created to include 'women specific activities' which would improve their status (Charlesworth, 2005). Women were seen as a marginalised group that need assistance such as income generating projects and credit facilities. The WID approach failed mainly because the role of gender relations in restricting women's access to resources in the first place was not addressed therefore did not change the existing policy paradigm (Porter and Sweetman, 2005). Women still did not have the power or resources and there was no equality (Shahrashoub and Miller, 1995).

The Women and Development (WAD) approach was brought forward in 1970s as a reaction to WID approach from activists and theorists from the South. WAD approach argued that the benefits of modernisation were not trickling down to benefit women and gender oppression had intensified with capitalism and colonisation. The approach still tried to emancipate women but as a separate entity. The main critique of the WAD approach was that the women specific activities did not include women from the global south. Even though women had been included in the development process, they were incorporated in an exploitative way that maintained discrimination by not

addressing the major causes of gender inequality (Rathgebeger, 1989). Furthermore, WAD approach did not address the differences among women particularly along racial and ethnic lines therefore inequalities still prevailed among women.

Gender and Development (GAD) approach originated in the 1980s by socialist feminism as a transitioning point where feminists had understood development. Unlike the previous approaches, GAD places importance on the vital role that the state plays in facilitating women's liberation. It was not an integrative approach where women were just 'added' in the development process (Rathgebeger, 1989). Rather, GAD approach challenged existing social, political and economic structures to incorporate women. GAD approach viewed women as a diverse group that requires full access/control over resources and benefits derived from personal and family work. It assumes that people should be agents of their own development with full involvement of women (Reeves and Baden, 2000). GAD gives a clearer picture than other development approaches because it emphasises reproduction of women and the production role they play in the society. GAD approach argues that it is the state's responsibility to support these roles that are highly done by women. As such, the approach treats development as a process highly influenced by several factors than as a stage of development. GAD sees development as the economic, social and mental wellbeing of a person and regards that aspect as important. Women's subordinate position can limit their access to resources such as employment/income earning opportunities, cash/credit and employable/income earning skills. In some cases, women can have access to resources but no control. Such restricted access and control limits women's ability for full involvement and positive gain from development activity. GAD approach views women as active agents of change and one of the major strategies that were developed in this approach was Gender mainstreaming.

### 2.5.3.1 Gender mainstreaming

Gender mainstreaming is a relatively new concept which has received considerable debate. Generally, it is an upgrade of traditional feminism where key concepts of the later have been substantially modified in both gendered political and policy practice as a modern gendered strategy for theory development (Walby, 2005). Gender mainstreaming has been defined by the United Nations as *"the process in examining the implications for women and men of any action that involves policies and programmes, in any sector and at various levels. It involves creating a method that prioritises the concerns and experiences of both sexes, making them an important part of the design, execution, evaluation of guidelines in all areas so that women and men equally benefit and inequality is not encouraged. The goal (of mainstreaming) is to achieve gender equality'* (United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Statistics Division, 1997). The gender mainstreaming strategy was created because earlier development tools did not adequately address gender gaps. These earlier development strategies mainly focused on women by giving them more resources and used specific initiatives. These gender development approaches were well intended but it was evident that gender inequalities were going to be resolved through processes of change at policy and institutional level.

The overall goal of gender mainstreaming is the promotion of gender equality whilst redressing mainline policies that lacked gender sensitivity in formulation, implementation and inevitably outcomes. Due to the broadness of this definition, there are various interpretation of gender mainstreaming. Nevertheless, in theory, it is widely accepted that it seeks improve key concepts that establish gender and development. It is therefore in sharp contrast from the 'separatist gender theory' which, by definition, posits that feminist opposition to patriarchy can only be achieved through separation of women from men (Frye, 1996, 2000). Thus, in practice, gender

Page | 78

mainstreaming is an essential tool for transformative policy making that addresses historical challenges brought by the traditional separatist interpretation of the feminist theory whilst addressing gender equality (Behning and Pascual 2001; Beveridge et al. 2000; Mazey 2000; Woodward, 2003, Walby, 2005). Gender mainstreaming strategy is used in areas where the principal objective includes not only gender equality but achievement of other goals, such as, health development, poverty eradication, environmentally sustainable development, migrant integration and economic development. Gender mainstreaming assumes that gender equality aims are relevant in analysis and ensures that the priorities of both sexes are met. The goal of gender equality should be incorporated into research and policy and in operations.

Given the arguments stated above, it is evident that gender mainstreaming is essential in being used as a tool in the GAD approach. This approach was initially put forward as an international movement in the advancement of gender-equality at the Beijing Platform for Action in 1995 (UN, 2000; Walby, 2005). Rees (1998) proposed and stated three gender equality approaches that can be used in gender mainstreaming. Tinkering, tailoring and transformation can be used to achieve gender mainstreaming in policies (Grimson and Roughneen, 2009; Geber, 2011). Tinkering refers to equal treatment of both sexes in legislation and affairs of the state. However, equal treatment of sexes does not necessarily lead to equal outcomes and opportunities therefore, the second approach, tailoring is needed to attend to special needs raised by both sexes (Grimson and Roughneen, 2009). Lastly, the transformation strategy involves changing existing structures incorporating the special needs of the sexes to achieve gender equality (Rees, 1998).

Gender mainstreaming therefore involves bringing the perceptions, experiences, interests and knowledge of women and men into policy making, decision making and planning. It is a process that includes gender equality issues at the focal point of analyses, integrating them in the planning

and implementation of a country's policies or programs (Daly, 2005; UN, 2000). Gender mainstreaming involves an inclusion of gender perspectives to different policies whilst outlining what these policies are. In all sectors, gender representation and responsive content should be considered in the policy process. Where there is an unbalance in sexes, the outcome is affected, and it impacts negatively on both women and men. Policies tend to benefit more when perspectives are drawn from both sexes and different situations may improve decision-making and the general results. Gender mainstreaming addresses more gender inequalities evident in the society through policies. Once policies address equal representation in organisations, the gender aspect of structures and work policies are also addressed. Using this theory, this study examines how South African immigration and labour market policies integrate women migrants and gender needs in their planning. The policies in South Africa need to increase migrant women's equitable access to and their control over resources.

In this research, Zimbabwean skilled women spouses have little access to employment because of the accompanying visa status that South Africa gives them. There is a greater need for gender mainstreaming in migration and labour policies to increase the level of empowerment and social justice for these migrant women. Instead of depending on their husbands for sustenance, these women should be formally employed as migrants according to their skills. By using the GAD approach and the gender mainstreaming concept, an in-depth look needs to be done on the South African migration and labour policies to assess if gender has been or not mainstreamed in them. Gender mainstreaming in migration and labour policies will increase skilled migrant women spouses' resource accessibility thus becoming agents of change rather than victims of their circumstances.

## 2.6  Conclusion

This chapter gives a review on the body of literature around migration, integration and gender. Migration trends are highlighted to give explicit background to the increase of women spouse migration and integration challenges they face. A literature background on integration and labour market dynamics has been given to gain a better understanding on the migration dynamic. South Africa is not exempt from the gender dynamics that arise in labour. Even though policies are in place to support women's involvement in labour, social norms still hinder women from entering formal labour markets, and even when they do, gender disparities still exist. There are gaps in the labour market between men and women with the latter mainly concentrated in the informal sector. It is against this background that skilled Zimbabwean women migrant spouses immerse and try to be integrated. The social inclusion, the gender geographies of power and gender and development theories have been used as a framework in examining the challenges skilled Zimbabwean women spouses have in formal market integration. The next chapter will describe the research methodology used in this research.

# CHAPTER THREE

# RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND METHODS

## 3.1 Introduction

This chapter outlines the approach I used to answer the research questions. It describes the research paradigm and the research design and protocol that was followed during data collection. A description of the sampling procedures during data collection and the statistical analyses that was used is given. Details of the ethical procedures and the trials I faced during data collection in the field are also stated. Lastly, Chapter 3 concludes with a short description of the potential limitations of the study.

## 3.2 Research Methodology

In the field of social sciences, 'the scientific method' is regarded as the understanding of the principals of how research was done (Kothari, 2004). Broadly, research methodology is classified under two categories namely quantitative and qualitative research. Quantitative research involves the generation of numerical data through quantification of any defined variables including attitudes, opinions and behaviors in order to draw conclusions (Berg, 2004; Lawrence, 2013). Hence, measurable data is a prerequisite for quantitative research and large sample sizes are usually necessary for definitive conclusions (Lawrence, 2013).

Qualitative research is primarily exploratory where an in-depth description and an understanding of an event is given in order to draw conclusions or hypotheses for testing (Denzin and Lincoln, 2013). It is naturalistic and involves studying people in their natural settings and interpreting

phenomena from the meanings people bring. Qualitative research brings out the 'human side' of the research highlighting the opinions, beliefs and behaviors of individuals. The researcher's personal experiences and insights are also very important in the inquiry and understanding of certain phenomena (Patton, 2002). Qualitative research explores social and personal experiences and the role of context in shaping these. This type of research tends to give a voice to participants that are ordinarily silent and whose perceptions are not considered (Skovdal and Cornish, 2015). Qualitative research offers a thorough understanding of a phenomenon or a program and its effects on a certain population. It is good in investigating sensitive topics where it involves deep immersion in people's perceptions and views taking cognizant on self-awareness of the researcher. Qualitative research takes a full understanding of the dynamic picture of the study where important patterns, interrelationships or themes are discovered. Unlike quantitative research which is more structured, qualitative research involves data collection methods that are semi-structured or unstructured and can be used in small sample sizes.

For my study, qualitative research with its emphasis on lived experiences was suitable for understanding the challenges that skilled women spouses under the 'Accompanying spouse dependent visa' faced in employment search. Qualitative design has been suitable for this research because I wanted to fully explore the personal experiences and perceptions of Zimbabwean women under the dependent visa regarding employment search in South Africa. Hence my data collection methods included semi-structured methods in order to gather detail about the viewpoints of the research participants.

### 3.3 Research Paradigm

      i.     Interpretivism

This being a qualitative study, the research was done in an interpretivist theoretical paradigm. Interpretivism paradigm is where the researcher understands the experiences of respondents whilst identifying main themes from the respondents (Goldkhul, 2012). Interpretivism derives its concepts from a thorough scrutiny of a phenomenon of interest. Reeves and Hedberg (2003) states that interpretive paradigm views phenomenon from the subjective experiences of individuals. The paradigm puts value on the meaning of responses and views rather than numerical measurement methodologies in data collection, such meanings are derived in-depth from participant observation or interviews. Research respondents socially construct knowledge by their individual experiences. It is from these experiences that certain phenomenon is deduced. Interpretivists state that the meaning of phenomena is changing and may be influenced by societal, cultural and historical factors (Cantrell, 1993).

Denzin and Lincoln, (2003) state that with interpretivism there are several viewpoints. Knowledge in the paradigm involves understanding people's values, perceptions while the researcher contributes to the meaning by bringing their own values that are inherent throughout the research process. In this research paradigm, a researcher can interpret meanings regarding human behavior by researching about people in their social contexts using cooperative relationship. This relationship involves a dialogue between the researcher and the respondents through interviewing or analysis of texts. Hussey and Hussey, (1997) state that "*such an approach enables the researcher to study social phenomena from the perspectives of research participants and the meanings and*

*interpretations that they assign to their own actions"*. At the same time, interpretivist researchers also acknowledge their potential own subjectivity during the research process (Darke et al 1998).

ii.    Self-Reflexivity

The research was mainly structured by my own subjectivity as a Zimbabwean woman who is skilled but has faced challenges in acquiring a job because of the Accompanying spouse dependent visa which I previously possessed. Hence, being a Zimbabwean woman helped immensely in formulating, contextualizing and executing my research. I managed to create great rapport with the respondents by also sharing my own experiences whilst creating a comfortable platform for respondents to share their own. I could understand the women respondents better because of high appreciation of the background of the study and understanding of the culture and economic struggle of the Zimbabwean people. My gender was also perhaps an advantage in accessing and building relationships with the women maybe because female interviewees are less intimidated when discussing gender-sensitive information with females. I could also easily attend the women church gatherings at Apostolic Faith Mission Pietermaritzburg, and interview the women there, after the service. Hence, being a familiar face at the gatherings facilitated the interview process because of the rapport created. It was also easier to approach the other respondents as a female researcher in hairdressing salons and at market stalls after referrals from the church.

As a researcher, I faced resistance with some respondents mainly because of social class issues and the power asymmetries that emerged. I had to consider how my position as a researcher may have affected the willingness of research participants to participate in this study. I as a researcher had to be conscious and careful how I present my research to participants and make sure that the women participate on a willing basis and not feel pressured.  The women initially felt inferior and slightly

intimidated with the idea of an interview conducted by a Zimbabwean PhD student whilst they were not formally employed themselves. It was important that I took note and considered the power relations/asymmetries involved between me and the research respondents. I reflected on how these power axes influenced the data collection and writing of the research results. Therefore, to eliminate bias, during the data collection, I made sure as a researcher I created a conducive environment for participation making sure that rapport was built between me and the women respondents. I had to do introspection on myself inorder to clearly understand my role as an interviewer. It was important for them to view me as a Zimbabwean woman who went through the same experience and was willing to help them through this research instead of a researcher looking for information. I also managed to eliminate bias in my research work by working together with my supervisor who could advise me where I made assumptions or over emphasized facts.

The women respondents were also initially reluctant to participate in issues regarding immigration because of the sensitivity that the topic brings in South Africa today. Using self-reflexivity was helpful because I understood their situation and therefore shared my own experience. This enabled the women respondents to open up and be more flexible.  It was very significant that this research be a truthful representation of the respondent's experiences and not mine. By using self-reflexivity, my experiences were included whilst engaging with the participants whilst maintaining an accurate account of the experiences of the respondents.

### 3.4 Sampling techniques and sampling size

Sampling involves the process of selecting a representative subset of a specific targeted population so as to understand the phenomenon of the whole population. It can comprise units such as organisations or people of interest so that, by studying the sample, one can draw generalizations

that reflect the entire population. Patton, (1990) states that *"sample size is determined by the objectives of the research, time available and the resources"*. The number of participants recruited for this research was mainly influenced by the theoretical principle of saturation developed by Glasser and Strauss (1967). The researchers stated that qualitative samples may be large enough to make sure that most important insights of the participants are revealed, but it is important to take note that if the sample is too big, information collected can become repetitive leading to data saturation. To avoid this, a total sample of forty skilled women spouses was selected. In the church group, 29 skilled women spouses were found. Snowball sampling was used later to access 11 other skilled Zimbabwean spouses who did not attend this church.

Sampling has two types probability and non-probability sampling. In this research I used non-probability sampling. Non-probability sampling takes an indepth look at human characteristics rather than oversimplification of the research outcome (Marshall, 1996). Subjective methods can be used to understand which essentials can be included in the sample (Battaglia, 2011). Non-probability sampling is divided into quota, purposive and convenience sampling. Purposive sampling seeks to produce a sample that is representative of the target population. The selection of a purposive sample is often done with a purpose in mind, selecting the sample with prior knowledge regarding the target population (Battaglia, 2011). Purposive sampling was ideal initially for this research because I had an overall purpose of selecting only people with direct relevance to the research questions. The use of purposive sampling enabled me to target participants that had the required attributes (skilled but on accompanying spouse visa) and wanted to participate in the study. The Apostolic Faith Mission in Pietermaritzburg was also selected because of the large contingence of married Zimbabwean women.

Snowball sampling or 'chain-referral sampling' was also used in the study. Snowball sampling was done after initial contact with the Zimbabwean spouse church group in Pietermaritzburg who later referred me to other women who fitted the profile which was subjected to the study but not part of their congregation. Muthuki (2010) suggests that the snowball sampling method is useful for studies that involve social networks therefore is most effective for people who are likely to be in contact with one another. This sampling technique, therefore, enabled me to select Zimbabwean migrant women spouses who were willing to participate in the study but did not attend Apostolic Faith Mission, Pietermaritzburg. This approach may also have enabled me to eliminate potential confounding factors that may be brought by only interviewing women who were part of this church.

## 3.5 Methods of data collection

The research study used qualitative research methods in data collection. In-depth interviews were conducted to gather the relevant information needed. Interviews are an interactive process between the researcher and the respondents meant to gather information about specific topics. The purpose of research interviews is to investigate the opinions and views of the research participants on specific matters providing a deeper understanding on social phenomenon (Wisker, 2007). For the presented study, the in-depth interviews included both structured and semi-structured questions. Semi-structured interviews include a guide where questions and topics are covered. This type of interviewing is used when the researcher wants to have a deeper understanding of a certain phenomenon and to clearly understand the participants responses (Harrell, 2009). The research participants were willing to participate, therefore signed the informed consent documents.

An interview schedule with a list of open-ended questions was administered to the respondents. I engaged on a one to one interview with each participant using an interview guide because whilst

giving an allowance for more questions to be asked. The interview schedule provided a guideline and the interviewer would allow the respondents to answer freely expressing their own views in their terms. Hence, the interview guide enabled me to be in control of the interview without any disturbances or hinderances (Holloway and Wheeler, 2002). The guide helped me to adapt the questions depending on the interview flow thereby suiting each respondent.

The semi-structured approach helped me to capture views and opinions of the respondents whilst sustaining the conversation and focusing on the specific issues that needed answers (Patton, 1980; Bryman and Bell, 2007). The interview guide was flexible, and it helped me ask questions in a specific order for each research participant. This made sure there was similarity and consistency in coverage where all the research questions and objectives were answered in a systematic manner (Bryman and Bell, 2007). Semi-structured interviews were flexible and gave the respondents freedom to talk about their migratory experiences. Giving participants this opportunity to talk about their labour integration issues encouraged the women to overtly share their experiences about the challenges they are facing in the migration process with me.

The research interviews took place at the Apostolic Faith Mission, Pietermaritzburg church premises because it was easier to talk with the women before or after the women church meeting. Other respondents were interviewed at various venues through snowball technique at hair salons, dressmakers' stalls and market places. The interview was conducted mostly in English, the formal language although Shona, a Zimbabwean local language, was used by respondents for clearer narration and emphasis. All these were noted and considered during data analysis.

Prior to the data collection, I established a good rapport with my respondents through regular attendance at the women marriage group at Apostolic Faith Mission, Pietermaritzburg, which gave

me the advantage to probe easily to elicit more information. An interview schedule was used to gain information as it enabled the participants to express themselves more. It is notable that the open-ended questions in the schedule gave room for reflection making sure that the research respondents to give detailed experiences of their formal labour integration process or lack thereof. Although the respondents were hesitant to participate at first, enquiring if any positive changes would be made at all in the South African migration and policies, they finally complied and agreed to the interview.

Each interview was approximately 10-20 minutes long and there were no repeat interviews because the participants were willing to give their narratives. After I sought consent to record an interview, I clarified to the respondents that their names will not feature in any recording. Interviews were being recorded so that I will remember important information. I used my cellphone to record the interviews. I also wrote down important facial responses, laughs, notable gestures or silences that would help in explaining further a response. These small gestures from the respondents were noteworthy because they enriched the data collected. A total of forty respondents were interviewed. Using in-depth interviews was beneficial because I got detailed insights from participants that they would not have shared in a group environment.

### 3.6 Skill profile of the respondents

A total of forty skilled women spouses participated in this study in Pietermaritzburg, South Africa. The country of birth for the respondents is Zimbabwe. The women spouses migrated into South Africa with their skills and have resided in the country on an Accompanying Spouse dependent visa. The skills of the respondents have been recorded below under pseudonyms to protect their identities since their interview excerpts were used in the research results. According to the critical

skills list that was published by Department of Home Affairs in 2014, the skilled women spouses in the sample matched the following categories in their skills:

i. Business Economics and Management

ii. Engineering

iii. Health professions and related clinical sciences

iv. Professionals and associated professionals and

v. Postgraduate. (Republic of South Africa, Department of Home affairs, 2014).

### 3.7 Demographic information of the participants and their skill categories

| Participant Pseudonym | Age | Years residing in South Africa | Qualification | Prior-migration Occupation | Post-migration Occupation |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| *Business Economics and Management Skills* | | | | | |
| Chido | 38 | 6 | Marketing Diploma | Bank Teller | Informal Sector jobs |
| Tariro | 30 | 9 | Accounting Diploma | Student | Informal catering business |
| Grace | 40 | 5 | Marketing Diploma | Graduate | Unemployed |
| Ruth | 35 | 6months | Human Resources Diploma | HR Officer | Unemployed |
| Rudo | 47 | 6 | International Marketing diploma | Marketing Officer | Unemployed |

| Lynette | 33 | 8 | Bachelor Degree in Management and Entrepreneurship | Graduate | Operates an indigenous tuck shop |
|---------|----|---|--------------------------------|----------|----------------------------------|
| Sandra | 37 | 8 | Masters in Accounting | Graduate | Markets Avon[1] products |
| Miri | 35 | 2 | Bachelor Degree in Economics | Officer Foreign Affairs | Unemployed |
| Kaira | 32 | 4 | Bachelor Degree in Accounting | Accountant | Unemployed |
| Yana | 39 | 7 | Bachelor Degree in Commerce | Post-graduate | Operates a hair salon |
| Marlene | 27 | 1 | Diploma Marketing Level7 | Student | Unemployed |
| Una | 40 | 5 | Tertiary Diploma in Accounting and Bank teller courses | Bank Officer | Domestic cleaner |

***Engineering Skills***

| Lyn | 43 | 8 | Mechanical Engineering | Technician | Tailoring |
|-----|----|---|-----------------------|------------|-----------|
| Patie | 32 | 7 | Btech Chemical Engineering | Engineer | Informal clothing market |

---

[1] Avon products are beauty bath and body cosmetics skin care fragrances and lotions

*Health professions and related clinical sciences*

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Jackie | 33 | 6 | Bachelor Honours Degree in Psychology | Law officer | Unemployed |
| Tamara | 39 | 8 | Bachelor of Medicine and Surgery | Graduate | Informal market trader |
| Vai | 35 | 4 | Masters Psychology | Graduate | Unemployed |
| Natsayi | 37 | 5 | Bachelor Degree in Nursing Science | Hospital matron | Unemployed |
| Brenda | 42 | 5 | Nursing Diploma | Post-graduate | Unemployed |

*Professionals and associated professionals*

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Dudzai | 34 | 12 | Bachelor of Laws Honours Degree | Graduate | Unemployed |
| Ratidzai | 35 | 10 | Computer Science with statistics | Analyst Programmer | Informal hair braiding |
| Sandy | 28 | 4 | Masters in Library Information | Administrator | Informal laundry business |
| Mimi | 26 | 4 | Bachelor in Education | Compliance officer | Sells Forever Living Products |
| Avery | 46 | 8 | Education Diploma | Teacher | Domestic worker |
| Emily | 29 | 5 | Diploma Education | School teacher | Operates market stall |
| Diana | 28 | 2 | Diploma Education | School teacher | Unemployed |

| Name | Age | | Qualification | | |
|------|-----|---|---------------|---|---|
| Joy | 40 | 4 | Diploma Technical graphics | Teacher | Unemployed |
| Lana | 36 | 7 | Diploma Interior Designing | Tailoring | Informal designer |
| Rutendo | 34 | 3 | Diploma Adult Education | Tutor | Unemployed |
| Precious | 38 | 8 | Bachelor of Law | Magistrate | Laundry |
| Ruvhe | 42 | 2 | Bachelor of Arts General | Educator | Tutor |
| Led | 41 | 6 | Diploma Education Planning | High School Teacher | Operates Fruit and Veg stall |
| Martha | 30 | 2 | Diploma in counselling | Part time counsellor | Unemployed |
| Tara | 26 | 3 | Bachelor of Science Hons Psychology | Marketing Officer | Unemployed |

*Postgraduate Skills*

| Name | Age | | Qualification | | |
|------|-----|---|---------------|---|---|
| Carla | 29 | 7 | Bachelor of Arts | Graduate | Hairdresser |
| Rufaro | 34 | 9 | Bachelor Degree in Computer Science | Graduate | Operates a mini vegetable garden |
| Maita | 45 | 8 | Bachelor of Arts | Postgraduate advertising | Markets African print |
| Nelly | 34 | 6 | Diploma Information Technology | Graduate | Sells Tupperware products |
| Annie | 35 | 5 | Diploma in Horticulture | Postgraduate | Bakes and sells birthday cakes |

### 3.8 Research Ethics

Ethical approval to do the research study was given from University of Kwa-Zulu Natal Research Ethics office. After I received the ethical clearance, I started collecting the data through in-depth interviews. At the start of each interview, I introduced myself, stating my name, background and the aim of the research study. I expressed to the respondents that taking part in the research study was on a willing basis, and they were allowed to stop the interview any time they wanted to. To further protect the respondent's autonomy, I made sure that I collected, analyzed and reported the findings without compromising the identity of the participants. I made sure I did not ask personal questions that could reveal their identities such as number of children or their ethnic background. Confidentiality was emphasized to make sure that no harm would fall on these study participants.

An informed consent form was administered to the participants before the start of the interview. Informed consent is a process where research participants are fully informed about the purpose, methods and possible risks that are involved in the study (Wiles et al., 2005; Smith-Tyler, 2007; Nijhawan et al., 2013). Informed consent involves a process where the participant decides whether to take part in a research study despite possible risks and costs that are involved. Informed consent encourages transparency about the study (Skovdal and Cornish, 2015). On the informed consent form, there were details about who is conducting the research, permission to record the interview, purpose of research, length of time participation will require, right to stop the interview at any time and what will be done with the research information gathered. The informed consent form also outlined the terms of the interview expressing anonymity and confidentiality. Informed consent was signed on a written form. Consent was given without any form of coercion or influence. I made sure that the respondents clearly understood the purpose of the study, the time and duration the

interview was going to take, the potential benefits this study had on the participants and the society. The informed consent document further clarified voluntary participation where research participants must participate voluntarily with no coercion and can withdraw anytime. During the interview there was no pressure to participate. Informal discussions pertaining the informed consent and confidentiality were also ongoing after the form was signed to improve trust and rapport with the respondents and to remind them that participation is voluntary. Further steps were taken to protect participant's identity by protecting the data collected. Since the data involved expression of private experiences from the respondents, clarity was made to the respondents on how it would be stored and disposed.

Assurance was further given to the respondents that the results of the research would not make the traits of individuals identifiable (deductive disclosure) so as to prevent stigmatization of participants in any way. I sought consent from the respondents to record these interviews so that I would capture the important detail in their narratives. The respondents were told that pseudonyms will be used to protect their identity as data excerpts from their conversations were used. Approaching the respondents with the data I intended to publish was essential so that they are well informed and agree on how their input will be portrayed in the final research results.

### 3.9 Data Analysis

Data analysis in qualitative research involves a process of coding, categorizing data, which is moving from raw data collected in the research to interpretation and understanding of the phenomenon under study. Qualitative data analysis makes the rich data accessible to the researcher and the participants in a meaningful way. In this research, the interview responses together with the consent forms were stored together to document that all my participants were properly consented.

Identifying information was not stored because the participants were anonymous. Data was stored in a safe space which I could only access for reference. The data was analyzed qualitatively. The data analyses began while interviewing, where I would write down similar trends that were emerging from the respondent's narrations. Attention was also paid to non-verbal expressions such as laughter, sighs and silence. One interview would take approximately a day to transcribe it into written form. I made sure that I do not store a lot of interviews in my phone for a long time. After transcribing the interviews, I started coding the data. This involved a process of organizing and sorting data to facilitate analysis. Coding was essential in capturing nuances in the data. Data that was coded was reviewed using thematic, narrative and document analysis.

Thematic analysis is widely used qualitative data analysis. It focuses on identifying, analyzing and reporting patterns within data sets, in this case on the information gathered on interview responses (Braun and Clarke, 2006). Thematic analysis involves a process of carefully reading through data and categorizing it into themes. Using thematic analysis, I was able to familiarize myself with the data first, searching for themes that had broader patterns of meaning. First, it was developed to focus on specific broad areas contained in the topic guides, and, second, themes were generated from the narratives. Key patterns were identified that were informed by the original aims of the study, checking if they answer my research questions. I made sure that recurring views and experiences were identified.

Narrative analysis was also done where the narrations of the respondents were observed, and similar patterns were deducted. A narrative analysis is where the investigator listens to the experiences of the research respondents and aims to understand the associations between the respondents and the questions asked (Owen, 2014). Narrative analysis was essential in this research because it gave me a clear understanding of the respondents' situation and was able to deduce more key themes.

Document analysis in qualitative research involves analyzing texts, policy documents and literature to gather facts, highlighting particular trends and themes. Bowen (2009) states that document analysis involves a process where documents including public records, annual reports, policy manuals, journals, literature books are construed by the researcher to understand a particular topic/phenomenon. Document analysis was used in this research where South Africa's migration and labour policies were assessed to find out whether gender mainstreaming is evident or lack thereof.

## 3.10    Challenges and limitations of the research study

Limitations are probable weaknesses in research that are out of the control of the investigator (Simon, 2011). During data collection, I had to attend the Pietermaritzburg Apostolic Faith Mission church group for married women, where the Zimbabwean women assembled. I had to approach the church administration and brief them the purpose of my research. I faced a challenge because I was conducting migration research at a time when xenophobia was rife and a sensitive topic in South Africa. It was a topic that migrants were not comfortable in engaging with. After explaining clearly, the aims of the study and the potential that this research has in assisting these migrant women, permission was then granted to conduct data collection at the church.

Another limitation I faced in this research was time constraints. The study was done over a limited period and is a snapshot of the challenges in labour integration that migrant women spouses were facing during that particular time. I faced challenges in recruiting the forty respondents within the time period I had. I also had financial challenges therefore I could not travel out of town. Collection of data was slow because I had to set appointment dates on Sundays when the women met after church and interview them during the week when they felt comfortable. Sometimes the times and

venues that the participants gave me was not suitable and ideal since I had to use my personal finances to go into town frequently since I had no bursary or financial assistance from the university to conduct these interviews. I resolved this by interviewing most respondents at the church after the Sunday service. This enabled me to efficiently maximize the time I had at a low-cost budget. Even though it was tedious, I persevered and completed.

### 3.11    Conclusion

This chapter has outlined the methodology that was used in this research and explains the interpretivist paradigm that was central in the research. Using interpretivist paradigm, I was able to fully understand the labour integration experiences of the skilled women without imposing meaning but being a co-creator of meaning.  Chapter 3 also describes the self-reflexivity approach that I used in collecting data. Self-reflexivity broadened my view and knowledge concerning the gendered nature of migration. The sampling procedure and techniques used in the research, the data collection process using interview schedules as a data collection tools were described. Chapter 3 further gives a profile of the research respondents giving an insight into their background and the skills they possess. The research ethics procedure and data analysis are described. Lastly, a reflection of the research process is given. Chapter 4 will outline the migratory experiences of the women respondents.

**CHAPTER FOUR**

**THE MIGRATION EXPERIENCES OF SKILLED ZIMBABWEAN WOMEN IN SOUTH AFRICA ON ACCOMPANYING SPOUSE DEPENDENT VISA**

## 4.1 Introduction

This chapter will outline the migrant experiences of Zimbabwean women spouses with the 'Accompanying spouse dependent' visa using the gender and migration theories highlighted in the theoretical framework. The gender geographies of power theory and its concepts is used to explain the gendered nature of migration in transnational spaces and its effects on women on a micro, meso and macro level. The migratory experiences stated in this chapter, encapsulate the notion of the 'trailer spouses' where migrant women spouses are not incorporated and considered as valuable skilled individuals that could contribute significantly in South Africa's labour market. The professional identity of the women migrant spouses is concealed in their residence status therefore they are not considered as potential employees (Kofman, 2006). From the research findings, women migrant spouses face numerous barriers integrating into the formal labour market, and sometimes are forced to accept lowly skilled informal jobs or change their career trajectory to earn a living. Generally, the respondent's interviewed had almost similar migratory experiences and key themes emerged concerning their formal labour integration in South Africa as outlined below.

## 4.2 Expectations before migration into South Africa

The social imaginary concept from the theory of 'gender geographies of power' states that cognitive processes have a great positive impact on the decision to migrate. Social imaginary concept captures the imagination of a better life in a destination country therefore motivates the migration process.

This phenomenon was observed in this study where the women respondents stated that they imagined and expected an improved life in South Africa. The skilled Zimbabwean women spouses hoped for advancement in their careers and substantial incomes that would help them send remittances back home. The positive expectation of a better life in the destination country greatly influences the migratory decision (Pessar et al., 2003). A 2016 study done on migrants moving from the Philippines to Winnipeg, Canada showed that the respondents imagined their life in the country of destination before migration and developed specific expectations about their arrival and settlement (Allard, 2016). The respondents stated that they used social networks, socially circulating narratives and media to picture their life in Winnipeg and it made their decision to migrate easier (Allard, 2016). Another recent study done by the International Organisation for Migration Iraq in 2015 on Iraq migration to Europe also illustrated how the concept of social imaginary encourages mobility. Eighty-six Iraqi migrants stated that life in Europe is idealized back home from friends who are settled in the country. Many participants in the research study selected Europe and decided to migrate because of the information they obtained from friends and relatives about the ease in obtaining residence permits and better cost of living. However, the migrants were shocked upon arrival because the country of destination was completely different from their expectations and what they imagined pre-migration (International Organisation Migration Iraq, 2016).

The economic downfall experienced in Zimbabwe pushed most families to look for better pastures beyond boarders because the salaries could not sustain their families. The positive expectations in the respondents' minds before migration, made the decision to move easier for them. Therefore, the migration choice for South Africa was simple and straightforward mainly because of the positive outlook. One interviewee said:

*"When I came to South Africa I had high hopes for a better life than the one we had in Zimbabwe. I felt that I could advance my career since I thought jobs in banking with my Marketing diploma were easy and life was better. I was hoping for a good life…"* Chido.

Jackie expressed that her views regarding her career were positive but once she migrated there were far from that:

*"I thought that with my Bachelors' Degree in Psychology from Zimbabwe I was going to pursue Social Work and Counseling. We always had this idea that employment was better in South Africa since academics from home have been migrating to South Africa for good incomes. When I got here I got disappointed, not only was I not eligible for employment because of my visa, but I could not also advance my degree..."*

Other respondents reiterated their positive expectations about South Africa as a good destination:

*"Back home we were told life in South Africa is rosy from our friends and relatives. We are told there is good life and no struggling. It was different for me. I think those that have secured good jobs and have the money live a good life..."* (Sandy).

*"When you are back in Zimbabwe you hear good things about better living in South Africa, this always urges you to migrate and have that life for your family…"* (Tamara).

*"I always thought South Africa was better than home. But I am sure if you have the required documents life is easier…."* (Tariro).

*"As teachers, we heard that they were being employed in South Africa. I had so much hope of being employed too…"* (Avery).

From the responses in the interview as highlighted by some above, there were very high expectations of greener pastures for the women migrant spouses in South Africa. These high hopes and imaginations positively influenced their migratory decision as illustrated by the social imaginary concept of the gender geographies of power theory. Once the women arrived, it was far from the positive viewpoint they had prior to migration. Their hopes were shattered. Not only were the expectations for a better quality of life far from reality, it was exacerbated by the hindrance to employment and lack of formal labour integration for these skilled women spouses.

## 4.3 Reasons for migration to South Africa

De Jong, (2000) states that gender has an influence on the initial steps in the migration journey determining the migration choice. Gender roles combined with family migration norms all influence the women's decision to either migrate or stay. Lee (1966) and Pedraza (1991) stated that women usually agree to migrate for family even if they are being removed from their comfort environments. Family migration norms such as spousal reunification, embedded in the society push women to migrate (De Jong 2000). Norms are opinions and values that form the way people understand particular behaviors accepted in the society (Portes 2006). Hondagneu-Sotelo (1994) stated that: *"spousal reunification is not always a "household" decision, because in traditional patriarchal families, the decision is taken unilaterally by the migrant husband"*. In many patriarchal settings, family reunion is the migration route that usually facilitates female migration and it is uncommon for males to migrate following their wives (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 1994; Toma and Vausse, 2014).

A study done by Salih on Moroccan women migrants to Italy showed that their migration to Italy was encouraged by their families and society and contrasted with their aspirations. In the study, a young woman from Rabat stated that she was compelled to migrate since she could no longer cope

with the social pressures and rumors that began to affect her reputation as a result of the fact that she initially had decided against following her husband to Italy (Salih, 2000). This aspect of family making the decisions for the women to migrate is also seen in Senegal, where women independent migration is not encouraged especially when they are travelling long distances without family members escorting them or waiting for them at the destination country (Castagnone, 2013). Senegalese migration is traditionally done by males with females heavily depending on their families to decide when and where they migrate and to arrange the migration process for them. This process has eventually influenced the creation of successive labour routes in Europe (Castagnone, 2013).

In labour migration, several social-cultural norms affect women's decision. Gender norms that are embedded in marital relations between husband and wife affect decisions to migrate. Gender norms influence who travels first, whom the they travel with, which country they are migrating to and the employment aspects at the host country. Grasmuck and Pessar's (1991) analysis focused on social networks and households in migration. They demonstrated that gender norms are central to household decision-making. They emphasized that the household (mainly the man) is the dominant figure that decides whether migration takes place, who migrates in the households, whether household income is dedicated to the migration (Grasmuck and Pessar, 1991). The men of the household also decide what payments/ family members are expected to return, and if the migration is going to be temporary/ permanent (Grasmuck and Pessar, 1991). These decisions are mainly directed by the relatives, gender roles and by the individuals that possess influence or power within the household (Grasmuck and Pessar, 1991). An example is in the Dominican Republic, where sons were sponsored and encouraged to emigrate because there were no longer valuable assets in subsistence farming due to the increase in commercial farming. Women also emigrated to get away from over depending on their husbands. Therefore, both husbands and wives decide to migrate

because of social imaginary aspect of expecting autonomy from their parents and husbands. (Pedraza, 1991).

A similar theme of family reunion emerged from the respondents' answers to this question. The women spouses migrated to South Africa to reunite with their husbands who were already working in the country. The women stated that the migration decision in their marriages was made by the husband as the head of the home in keeping with traditional patriarchal social norms. The women had to oblige so that they would keep families together, something that women with children emphasized the most. For example, Chido stated that:

*"The major reason I migrated to South Africa was to safeguard my marriage. Relatives back home pressure you to go and join your husband so that your marriage stays strong".*

Hazvi also reiterated the same viewpoint:

*"When your husband migrates, as a wife you are expected to follow him. Everyone in the extended family encourages you to do so".*

*"We are encouraged to migrate together as a family. Its part of culture, to stay together…"* (Carla).

From the responses cited above it is evident that the major reason for migration was for family reunion. This is mainly driven by socio-cultural gender norms that suppose that the husband should be the decision-maker and the bread winner whilst the wife is submissive and obey. The patriarchal socialization that these women are exposed to greatly influences the roles, responsibilities and decision making within households. The women respondents are forced to accept the decision to

Page | 105

migrate, as and when the husband decides to. In this study, the women respondents were forced to abandon their careers in Zimbabwe to reunite with their husbands in migration to protect their marriages.

Some of the women in the study stated they were left in Zimbabwe while the husband migrated first to settle, then they followed later as stated below:

*"My husband came here first to settle in his Master's programme and I stayed in Zimbabwe for about 4-5 months before I followed him"* (Ratidzai).

*"My husband had to secure money for our visa and travel requirements, so he came here first, and I followed with the children after six months…"* (Joy).

*"I migrated after three months later because I had to serve a notice period at the bank I was working at…"* (Una).

This initial separation was usually done for the husband to secure more finances for travel documents for the family. The women, who were actively working in Zimbabwe highlighted that they needed to give notice periods at their employment before migrating to South Africa, therefore were left behind for a while. From a feminist view, the women expressed the submissive role they were socialized into by valuing their roles as wives thereby protecting their marriages by migrating to reunite with their husbands.

Another common reason cited by the respondents as their reason for migration was the potential for employment. A study done by Idemudia et al (2013) on Zimbabwean immigrants to South Africa discovered that the hope for employment and income has been a major driver for immigrants to

come to South Africa. In this particular research, although the women respondents cited reunification with their husbands as a major priority, they also highlighted hope for better employment Mimi stated that as shown below:

*"I had high hopes for employment here in South Africa since I hold a BA in Education from home. It would have been an added advantage to work close to my husband"*

Grace also expressed the same view:

*"Before migrating to SA, I heard that jobs and incomes are better in the advertising and marketing field. I have a marketing diploma, so I thought I would work here with my husband".*

Tara cited that they had career prospects in mind before migration to further their profession in Psychology.

*"I wanted to reunite with my husband so that my son would not grow with an absent dad. But I also was excited because I wanted to further my studies in Psychology".*

By using the social imaginary concept, the migrant women imagined a future in South Africa, where they would further their careers. The skilled migrant women as stated above have also been driven to migrate with the hope of furthering their careers, challenging the trailer spouse concept of just following their husbands. The hopeful expectations of the Zimbabweans in the study were not however met post arrival as cited in the responses above. Instead of securing employment they were faced with labour integration barriers that have left them jobless regardless of their skills.

Another interesting theme that emerged among the respondents on the reason to migrate to South Africa was safeguarding their marriages from infidelity and promiscuity that could lead to

HIV/AIDS. Research has shown that labour migrants are at a greater risk/ vulnerability to HIV/AIDS (UN/AIDS 2008). Anglewicz et al (2016) stated that there is a strong association between the prevalence of HIV/AIDS and migration. HIV/AIDS rates among migrants is higher because they are engaged in greater HIV risk behavior than non-migrants (Cassels et al., 2003). Given this higher prevalence, migrants are considered a high HIV risk group and their mobility fuels the spread HIV (Anglewicz et al., 2016). HIV/AIDS risk has been associated with social vulnerability where labour migrants are mostly detached from their partners, relatives and children. Studies have shown that risky behavior increases after migrants are released from rigid social norms in pre-migration settings (Cassels et al., 2003; Kwena et al., 2013; Setel, 1999). Furthermore, labour migrants have little socio-support links and are pushed to associate with external cultures, traditional beliefs and their languages. These factors may facilitate the rise in HIV risk among migrants. Previous research on Mexican-United States migrants has shown that United States Mexican labor-migrants are at a high risk for HIV infection and may be the population that causes high HIV/AIDS rates in the country of origin, rural Mexico (Martinez-Donate, 2015).

Migration changes the cultural environment that immigrants are used to thereby exposing them to different values and behavior. In reference to the behavioral ecological model, behaviors are influenced by several factors including individual aspects, proximal context and institutional factors (Hovell et al, 2009). The proximal context includes the socio-physical environments that people are exposed to. The broader environment is the cultural, socio-economic and political institutions that individuals are exposed to. Mexican migrants mainly comprise of young males, with low levels of education and skills and studies state they also have inadequate HIV/AIDS prevention familiarity and knowledge about condom use (Albarrran et al, 2011; Organista, 2007). HIV/AIDS rise in infection among in Mexican migrants may be the correlation between personal factors and the major institutional aspects in migration in the two countries (Kissinger et al, 2012). The majority and over

dominance of males in the migration channels, partner separation, disturbance of established cultural ways that encourage socio-behavioral control, and a sense of obscurity in migrants encourage risky sexual practices (Alaniz, 2002). In the United States, migrant workers have increased vulnerability. Majority of immigrants come into the United States with no proper legal papers, seeking employment, therefore they live clandestine and mobile lifestyles. Most migrants come from poor backgrounds, are exposed to language hinderances and migrate alone (Organista, 2007). Separation from their partners and relatives coupled with being away from accustomed environments usually leads to loneliness. Migrants fill this void by creating new social systems that that either encourage/discourage risky behaviors (Organista, 2007). These behaviors can be increased in new receiving communities that lack the structure to help safeguard/ prevent these changes. In this research the women respondents echoed the same fear of HIV/AIDS risk for their spouses because of the separation from their husbands. Below are some of the views that were expressed by the respondents:

*"Separating from your husband can cause promiscuity and there are many diseases out there. I do not want my husband to contract HIV, that's why I came here..."* (Avery).

*"Men need us women around. I do not want any risk of STIs or AIDS in my marriage..."* (Ruvhe).

*"There is a risk of promiscuity if you are far away. It was difficult to leave my job at the bank but in this HIV time, I would rather stay close to my husband..."* (Chido).

*"I wanted to come to my husband because we recently got married. I did not want him to be tempted to get a girlfriend..."* (Miri).

*"With most men having affairs I would rather be close to my husband…"* (Lyn).

*"I wanted to be close to him so that he does not get tempted and get a girlfriend. AIDS is real…"* (Led).

From this research it is evident that the women respondents were willing to safeguard their marriages from promiscuity by reuniting with their families. This decision can also have been ignited by the socio-cultural factors that women are exposed to. These factors have shaped rigid beliefs regarding the characteristics of men, that there is a possibility of promiscuity when they are separated from their partners. Therefore, these oppressive justifications of men's behavior push women migrants to reunite with their partners in fear of adultery and HIV/AIDS.

## 4.4 Experiences of seeking employment

Employment is a priority as a migrant because the ability to secure long term income enables the migrants to establish and settle better in the destination country and to send incomes to the country of origin (International Organisation for Migration, 2015). However, studies have also shown that family migration destroys females' careers and their ability to generate income after migration more than their male counterparts (Clark and Huang, 2006; Withers and Clark, 2006).

Almost all of the respondents that were interviewed were actively looking for formal employment. The women interviewed had mixed expectations about finding employment. They had been optimistic on the time of arrival, but as time went on their expectations started to dwindle. The findings in this research have shown that the experience of securing employment for many Zimbabwean migrant women on the 'Accompanying spouse dependent' visa is solitary and frustrating. The research respondents stressed that the lengthy unsuccessful job hunting was filled

with irritation, stress and worry after a period of being convinced that they will not be employed in a job that suits their skills. Some respondents upon arrival thought it would be easy since they had the necessary skills but realized after a period of time they realized how difficult it was to integrate into the formal labour market with the 'Accompanying spouse dependent' visa status attached to them. Ratidzai stated how optimistic she had been to start work immediately upon arrival as stated below:

> *"I had high expectations to start work immediately with my statistics background. But the visa does not allow me to pursue my studies and work..."* (Ratidzai).

Other respondents were fully apprised by family and friends of the difficulties of accessing the job market upon arrival but had kept their hopes high. The women now had a more conservative approach when looking for jobs and understood that the dependent visa had restricted them. This was clarified by one lady:

> *"My friend at church who was staying here told me South Africa is not easy to find a job as a foreigner. One needed to have a good work or residence permit to have an opportunity. It is survival, come with your husband and take your chances..."* (Sandra).

> *"I was recently married and my cousin who stays here in SA told me the difficulty she was having in securing a job. She advised me to delay in resigning my job at Foreign Affairs, but I wanted to come close to my husband, so I resigned my job and migrated..."* (Miri).

Other respondents felt they would not find employment because their qualifications were not recognized here in South Africa:

*"I want to be a lawyer in South Africa, but they keep telling me that my Bachelor of Laws Honors Degree cannot practice here, and I need to add another South African qualification to practice. I cannot pursue this because my Accompanying Spouse Dependent Visa does not allow me to study…"* (Dudzai).

One respondent stated that her career prospect was also shaped by the husband's career as well:

*"I hope to find a job that is here in Pietermaritzburg because my family is based here. My husband is a researcher and my child attends school here. I would not want to move away from them given that any opportunity arises, if it ever rises..."* (Jackie).

This study revealed that the process is often trial and error as they search endlessly for reliable information relevant to their qualifications and their unemployment situation. The women respondents had tried several avenues to secure work including sending out curriculum vitas, cold calling employers and applying jobs advertised on job portals on the internet with no success. Women respondents also used social and religious networks in the search for employment but most jobs require work visas as seen by the respondent below:

*"My friend at church who was staying here told me South Africa is not easy to find a job as a foreigner. One needed to have a good work or residence permit to have an opportunity. It is survival, come with your husband and take your chances..."* (Sandra).

*"At church we discuss ideas as women of where we can get employment or try to make an income but most leads require work permits, unless you want to do jobs like selling or hairdressing that do not use your certificates…"* (Jackie)

The respondents repeatedly found that time coupled with finances were wasted looking for employment agencies and provisional services if available, to assist them in acquiring jobs. All the women respondents stated that they are constantly rejected in work placements or their applications simply ignored. In the end, the skilled migrant spouses are unemployed, dependent on their husbands, financially insecure therefore are prepared to work in unskilled temporary, casual and informal jobs that erode their gained skills, a term referred to as deskilling. Although the research participants are faced with these constraints, the findings discovered that the respondents are relentless, they continuously seek suitable jobs that are equal to their work experience, job-skills and educational-qualifications in the foreign labour market.

## 4.5 Barriers to finding employment

The successful employment of migrants depends on a number of factors including visa requirements, job-skills of the migrants, the local employment sector conditions and the willingness of employers to recruit the immigrants. Research has shown that migration reduces employment engagement and economic position of wives (Boyle et al., 2001; Shauman and Noonan, 2007). Addressing these barriers is critical in increasing migrant employment (Moody, 2006). The respondents highlighted that their visa excluded them from working or studying.  The visa attachment to their husband permit had restricted them from gaining employment. The respondent highlighted below also stated that changing the visa status to a work permit required a lot of finances that the women did not have, and which husbands may not afford. The visa permit restricted her from accessing employment and an income:

*'The visa permit I was given when I arrived has caused numerous problems for me. I cannot be employed or further my education. It is expensive to change visa status, we don't have the money…'* (Ratidzai).

The gender geographies of power theory concept of social location was used to explain the different 'classes' that the women respondents had. Some of the respondents were able to approach employers by using their husband's financial resources. These women were somehow at an advantageous situation and had the ability to act by using the husbands' resources. The women respondents who approached employers stressed the lack of empathy they received as a barrier to employment. Job searching becomes very difficult because the employers do not understand migrant rights to work as stipulated in several international labour instruments that South Africa is signatory to. These employers do not offer any help to these skilled migrant spouses. Employers seem to lack understanding regarding the women migrant rights to employment therefore they turn them away or simply ignore their applications. One respondent stated below, felt that if she had been given a chance to meet an employer she could have pleaded her case and stated how suitable she was for the job. However, once employers discovered that the applicant held an 'Accompanying Spouse Dependent' visa, they did not entertain or offer any help. Chido states:

*"I have approached employers to present my skills and expertise and they asked me if I had a valid work permit. When I said I do not have one, I have an Accompanying Spouse dependent visa, they said we cannot help you..."*

Another barrier faced was the lack of more relevant visa categories on online applications for example, temporary work visas. The employers miss eligible candidates for jobs because online

systems only have work permit/ permanent residence categories to fill in the drop-down lists. These visa categories are limiting for job seekers.

Dudzai's experience highlights some of the barriers:

> *"Skills and expertise haven't been helpful. They either say my qualification is not helpful here or online they ask if I have PR (Permanent Residence Permit) or Work permit..."*

Another barrier to employment that the women raised was lack of professional networking. The social inclusion theory was used to explain this phenomenon. Skilled women spouses in this study have not been fully included in professional immigrant networks that could make the employment search better. The creation of professional immigrant networks for migrant women spouses both personal and professional is hampered by family responsibilities, childcaring and domestic duties that restrict them at home. The women felt that they need forums here in Pietermaritzburg, where they can meet and learn more about the formal labour market as skilled Zimbabwean migrant women. At the moment, such professional forums amongst skilled Zimbabweans are not there and the women migrants expressed urgency in their creation for more information.

The local government in different municipalities can be involved in the creation of such forums to assist in labour migration/ integration and women rights pertaining employment. Studies have shown that decentralization in migration policy implementation tends to be more effective as done in countries such as Denmark and Sweden (Jorgesen, 2012). The Danish central government, for example, designs the integration policy framework whist local municipalities implement and manage integration. Government support in creating such networks would greatly assist women migrants in broadening their knowledge about labour integration and their rights whilst sharing their experiences with other migrant spouses in the same predicament.

Zimbabwean women respondents contributed more to their migration challenges due to lack of social groups and networking within their nationality. The significance and importance of social networks in migration channels is now extensively recognized and researched more (Boyd, 1989; Palloni et al., 2001; Winters and Sadoulet, 2001; Garip, 2008). Interactive bonds connecting migrants, non-migrants or former migrants facilitate international migration and assist newcomers to integrate into the destination country (Massey et al., 1993). Scholars argue that immigrant social networks are consistent institutions that offer help and lead to an increase in migration from countries of origin (De Haas, 2010). Other nationalities in South Africa have formally registered social networks where they support each other, share business and professional ideas, for example, Nigerians residing in South Africa have the Nigerians in the Diaspora (NIDO), West rand Nigerian Association and the Nigerian Union of South Africa (Segatti, 2012). Studies have also shown that social networks enhance immigrant's employment (Amuedo-Dorantes and Mundra, 2004; De Haas, 2010). A study done on Mexican immigrants show that better job matches usually are a product of extended job searches supported by social networks. They give the needed support and assurance against negative migration experiences such as unemployment (Amuedo-Dorantes and Mundra, 2004).

Professional networks amongst migrants are essential because apart from the information they provide, they also offer mentorship and career advice to women migrants (Thomson, 2016). These networks have social support systems for people who are facing domestic issues, which can be helpful for these skilled women spouses. Professional networks can partner with non-profit organisations to offer career advice and training services for migrant women spouses who need to improve their skills, thus assisting them to reach their employment goals (Thomson, 2016). These networks can facilitate connections between immigrants and employers thereby creating volunteering opportunities for skilled migrant women in employment improving their job search

chances. Once these professional networks are established for immigrants, they can challenge structural restrictions through advising the necessary stakeholders for adequate policy interventions in labour integration. In Canada, the Regional Immigrant Employment Councils facilitates professional networking by supporting companies to connect with skilled immigrants and refugees. They further offer networks for the companies that are part of this programme (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018). The Toronto Region Immigrant Employment Council creates networks for immigrant's business in the Greater Toronto Area. The sole mandate for these networks is to promote harnessing of skills from migrants. The Toronto Region Immigrant Employment Council guides companies involved in the migrant employment recruitment, gives mentoring lectures and provides e-learning courses on cultural-diversity administration for these employers (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

## 4.6 Implications of unemployment

Unemployment can have dire psychological consequences on an individual. For migrant communities, factors such as language, cultural, religious, human capital, skills demand and structural barriers such as government policies can all contribute to unemployment. These effects of unemployment can even be exacerbated the period of unemployment increases. It is known that health and general wellbeing often deteriorates as a result of lack or loss of income (Sidorchuck et al., 2017). Inevitably, migrant communities or gender groups facing highest rates and prolonged periods of unemployment will be most affected by its negative consequences. For instance, research done in Sweden reported that women refugees from low-income countries are at higher of clinical stress, partly due to lack of employment (Hollander, 2011; Hollander et al, 2013). This is in addition to several other studies (e.g. Pharr et al., 2012; Hollander et al., 2013; Guruge and Butt, 2015;

Page | 117

Nørredam, 2015; Johnson et al., 2017; Pampati et al., 2018) documenting the deterioration of mental health among migrants, particularly women, partly due to unemployment and lack of independence. All these studies showcased examples under European and American settings. In Africa, similar studies were done in South Africa were findings of poor mental health were also corroborated (Thela et al., 2017). Host countries should therefore endeavor to understand and create enabling environment for employment in order to promote social cohesion and human wellbeing. It is widely known that the unemployment of some migrants can bring with it several vices including crime and prostitution.

For migrant women, unemployment among skilled women migrant spouses has a significant negative effect on their psychological health and welfare. Employment is often correlated with high self-confidence and positive mental health. It enables migrants to be successfully integrated into the society (Auster 1996). Studies about migrant integration have shown that lack of employment has been an important factor in the risk of mental disorders (International Organisation of Migration, 2012). Studies done in the United States on Iraqi immigrants have shown that lack of employment among immigrants has effects on their health and social wellbeing (Jamil et al., 2012).

The social location concept and geographic scales helped to explain the differences in personal experiences these women migrants faced from their home country and the destination country. All the respondents in this research study, experienced a shift in their occupational status after they arrived in South Africa. Before arrival they were working as professionals or students and, upon entry into South Africa, they became unemployed. Respondents highlighted that employers never replied to their job applications. This was stated by one woman below:

*"My expectations haven't been met. I thought I would be employed by now. Employers simply ignore my applications..."* (Tamara).

*"I have sent countless applications with no reply..."* (Jackie).

*"Employers hardly reply, it's a struggle..."* (Grace).

### 4.6.1 Lack of financial autonomy

Economic independence is a situation where men or women have access to resources that can positively improve their own lives and those of their dependents. Economic independence acknowledges that women are significant economic players who contribute immensely to income generation in the household and therefore should profit from it equally with the husbands (Chavan, 2008). Mincer (1978), stated that migration economically impacts negatively on women, with wives most likely being the 'tied movers'. The larger a wife's contribution towards household income means less mobility and more attachment to her job. Many women have expressed shame in asking their husbands for money even for the smallest items. Jackie highlighted:

*"I am embarrassed to think that I need to ask money for my toiletries and underwear from my husband. He sees me as nothing now, a liability. Sometimes he tells me I am nothing..."*

*"I just want my own income now to be able to budget..."* (Kaira)

*"It's hard to ask for everything from your husband. That is when problems start..."* (Grace)

*"Being financially dependent is hard. Some things I do not even ask anymore..."* (Avery)

*"It strains the marriage, arguments start when you keep asking for finances…"* (Ruvhe).

Women respondents in this study, as cited above, have been positioned in a location that has made them less accessible to steady incomes in comparison to them being employed in their home country. In this regard, the gender geographies of power concept of social location can adequately explain how these women are not contributing more finances to their households since they are now unemployed in their current location. Prior leaving Zimbabwe the women respondents in this study had busy working lives, earning their own money and having financial autonomy, contributing significantly to their family's income. Upon arrival to South Africa, the situation changed, with the women becoming overly financially dependent on their husbands. Dependency on financial resources on the husband has significantly reduced their decision-making ability in the household. The lack of financial autonomy has reduced their self-esteem, increased marital conflicts and domestic violence as highlighted in some responses above.

### 4.6.2 Lack of access to credit and banking facilities

Dependent spouse visa holders face several challenges unlike other visa holders and that includes lack of access to financial credit and bank loans (Balgamwalla, 2014). Without work authorization, an Accompanying Spouse dependent visa holder cannot open a bank account or apply for financial assistance. The immigration system seems to favor the requirements of the dominant visa holder, which is the husband who is allowed to open bank accounts or apply for a loan (Bragun, 2008). The women below echoed this view in their responses as highlighted below:

*"I cannot access credit loans to start a small business since I do not have a bank account. I am ready to start something that gives me money to apply for a work permit..."* (Tariro).

*"Not being able to have a bank account or income takes away my freedom"* (Tara).

*"I would like to do some savings in a bank account. But I can't open one"* (Precious).

Lack of access to credit and banking facilities for women further constraints economic opportunities for them both personally and their households deepening gender inequalities (Chavan, 2008). Financial empowerment for women increases economic growth and the bargaining power of women at household level allowing investments in child-nutrition, education and health. Financial freedom for women leads to more gender equality and social safety (Sanusi, 2012). Women's wellbeing improves their own lives and the society at large. For women to be successful in this role depends on the support they are given in their development by the society.

### 4.6.3    Exclusion from decision making at family level

Research studies have found out that women's decision-making power in marriages is related to their contribution to household income (Oishi, 2005). A demographic study done by Acharya et al (2010) in Nepal showed that women's self-sufficiency and decision-making in the household is greatly influenced by age, employment and the children they have. A correlation exists between economic dependence and the decision-making ability for females in marriages (Bhutta and Haider, 2013). The more the women contribute financially, the more decision-making power they have over the household. Economic dependency of women on their husbands in transnational marriages usually has a great influence in household finances and long-term decision-making. The husband tends to become the decision maker mainly because he is the breadwinner.

In this research study, the concept of geographic scales from gender geographies of power, helps to understand how negatively the migration process has affected the spouses and their families. This

has been proven in this research study where the majority of the respondents have cited lack of decision making in family finances because they have not contributed much financially since migrating to South Africa. Respondents cited below describe how they have no financial decision making in their home because they have no income that they contribute:

> *"I feel like a child being given money by my husband. Before I came here I made my own money, even more than him. I do not have freedom to decide and have control over the money he gives me. Of course, he gives me but I feel so dumb and inadequate..."* (Chido).

> *"Even though I am not happy about it I am not free to ask or suggest anything, I just feel that since more money comes from him he has the say in most stuff..."* (Ratidzai).

> *"I do not have control over what is bought and how the money is used..."* (Lana).

> *"We constantly argue that he is not open about finances. We do not budget together..."* (Nelly).

> *"It is psychologically burdening when my husband keeps saying I should work. It feels as if I am not an important part of this marriage..."* (Jackie).

From the data collected, lack of decision making in family finances can be tied to patriarchal tendencies and power asymmetries. The husbands express dominance and power mainly because of the financial contribution they make in the household. On the other hand, the women respondents feel inadequate and dependent on their partners. Geographic scales concept explains how unequal power asymmetries affect the women psychologically on a micro (individual) and meso (family) level.

### 4.6.4 Escalation in domestic disputes /abuses

The new gender identities, the experience of financial dependence for the migrant women spouses and the financial strain of relying on the salary of one partner has also led to other marital constraints leading to domestic disputes and abuses. According to the geographic scales concept, new gender identities such as economic dependents on their husbands has led to marital problems on a family level. Over half of the respondents noted that they had gone through marital disputes, heated arguments, anger and frustration. This has often led to domestic violence. The women respondents in this study felt that the appreciation that their spouses had for them had depreciated because of their loss of financial status. Reliance on their husbands for social and economic support has greatly increased insecurity among migrant women spouses. One woman stated that if she could work maybe her husband would respect her more and they will be less marital problems:

> *"It's hard not to be self-reliant. I don't enjoy my life. My husband tells me all I do is ask and ask. This is straining our marriage, if I can find something to do it would be better I know..."* (Ratidzai)

Studies have shown an increase in domestic violence in migrant families where there is lack of sufficient financial resources and lack of independence (Yoshihama, 2009). Women's lack of economic independence and financial autonomy leads to domestic abuses in migrant marriages. In Nepal, intimate partner violence and domestic abuse against female partners is encouraged because of patriarchy in the social system which is highly influenced by cultural factors that hinder women from leaving violent marriages (Atteraya et al, 2015). Women are more vulnerable to abuse because they have poor access to resources, low employment prospects and come from lesser financial backgrounds (Rawal, 2016). Ahmed et al., (2004) stated migrant marriages are faced with stressful

situations that cause vulnerable dependent wives, to be the victims of their husband's anger. Migrants face multitudes of difficulties and stress created by immigration. These include difficulties in cultural adaptation to the host country, language limitations, poor income, xenophobia, institutional ill-treatment, racism and social isolation (Bui, 2003; Han, 1986; Kim et al., 2007; Koh et al., 1986; Kuo, 1984; Yu, 1987; Waiganjo, 2017) Therefore, they are likely to face more stress that in turn increase the vulnerability of domestic violence. In fact, studies have shown that the higher the degree of stress the migrant husband faces, the greater chances of wife abuse (Kim and Sung, 2000). Studies done on domestic violence in immigrant marriages in the United States found out that there is an increase in wife battering from their husbands than United States native population because immigrants either come from cultural norms that support intimate partner violence, wife-beating norms or that they have little access to legal support structures than United States citizens (Orloff et al., 1995; Lee and Hadeed, 2009). Furthermore, immigrant abusers and their victims have the belief that United States laws and penalties do not apply to them (Orloff et al., 1995). Married migrant women experience more physical abuse than unmarried women (Dutton et al., 2000). Financial obstacles greatly influence in a woman migrant leaving an abusive marriage and it gets more difficult in-migrant communities. Furthermore, financial instability is the main reason why women easily comply to an abusers' attempt for reconciliation, mainly because of the limited choices available to her. (Lowe and Prout, 2011).

Different gender power relations are at interplay in these migrant marriages where men tend to misuse their status thereby subordinating their spouses. Abusive partners misuse their legal status by threatening their partners with deportation or can control them in any other way. The power and control exerted by these immigrant men is greatly encouraged by immigration laws and measures that allow legal residents with permits to control the application and filling of their wife's immigration documents (Dutton et al., 2000). Migrant women spouses on accompanying visa

statuses attached to their husbands are unclear of how legal structures operate and the legal support accessible to them. And even if they knew, they do not have the means to acquire legal aid since they depend on their husbands for finances (Tjaden and Thoennes, 2000). The respondents below echo sentiments of increased violence:

> *"When we are financially tied my husband shouts at me that at least he is doing something for the family, if it's not working for me I should go back to Zimbabwe...*" (Carla)

> *"My husband says he has contributed a lot for us to stay in South Africa including my wellbeing…"* (Led)

> *"We fight a lot concerning finances. He sometimes pushes me physically asking me what I want from him…"* (Sandy)

> *"He constantly shouts at me that if I get a job it's going to be easier…"* (Hazvi)

> *"My husband when stressed about the finances he drinks a lot and starts shouting at me. He once threw my phone against the wall…"* (Ruth)

> *"Fights increase a lot these days. I was once pushed in a wardrobe because I had asked about the money…* (Vai)

> *"He has just increased his drinking since we came to South Africa. This has led to many fights, he slapped me once...*" (Jackie)

From the experts cited above it is evident that migrant women spouses are vulnerable to intimate partner violence because they are inhibited from escaping domestic violence because of their legal

status. Migrant dependent spouses are more vulnerable to spousal abuse through patriarchal dominance causing psychological stress and poor wellbeing. Immigration laws and policies are considered a trap for these women as they actually increase spousal abuse (Erez et al., 2009).

### 4.6.5 Social Exclusion and Isolation

As cited in Chapter 2, social exclusion is the process whereby individuals or certain sections of the society are removed from full participation in the community they reside in (Rawal, 2008). According to the European Union: *"social exclusion refers to the multiple and varying factors resulting in people being excluded from the normal practices and rights of modern society. Poverty is one of the most apparent factors, but social exclusion also refers to the inadequate rights in education, housing, health and access to services"* (Chow and Lou, 2015). Social exclusion affects individuals/groups, who are segregated and discriminated. It accentuates weaknesses in social infrastructure and permits double societies to become established by default (Chow and Lou, 2015). Integration of migrants in destination countries take various systems. In different counties migrants are either legally integrated but socially segregated mostly because of language barriers. Their little knowledge about local customs tend to reduce their ability to integrate in the labour market successfully.  On the other hand, undocumented migrants may be excluded in the legal structures of destination countries but are well integrated in their ethnic societies and in the informal sector. In countries that seek labour migrants, if migrants possess temporary statuses, their labour integration may not be deemed highly relevant (Chow and Lou, 2015). Temporary migrants may become illegal because of the challenges they face in the duration of their stay and their segregation may be worsened (Chow and Lou, 2015). From the research findings, the respondents expressed that they did not have a sense of belonging in the host country since they are excluded from the

labour market and other services. One respondent clearly cited below that her skills were relevant in the employment sector but felt that the labour market was not ready to accept immigrants:

> *"I have a Bachelor in Law undergraduate degree which is relevant but employers tell me I cannot use it because I do not have a residence visa or work permit. They are also ready to employ a South African national with a lesser qualification than me…"* (Dudzai).

The research respondents also stated that unemployment in South Africa has resulted in limited economic resources for them therefore a reduction in social contacts, social commitments and independence. According to the social inclusion theory, women respondents in this study have not been fully accepted and integrated in the society therefore have a lower social significance in South Africa as compared to their country of origin, Zimbabwe. Recent migration studies support this viewpoint that migrants have a lower social standing in host countries than in their country of origin (Castles, 2014; Constable, 2009). From the research study, interviewees stated that they are secluding themselves, a term referred to as social isolation, from social circles because of their reduced social standing. Loss of confidence in social circles was now a noteworthy concern for all the respondents who participated in the study. Social isolation has resulted in loneliness for the Zimbabwean women migrant spouses since most of them do not have family and friends. Respondents below reflected on how lonely they have felt dealing with the emotional strain of unemployment:

> *"Here it's worse because there is no family support and encouragement. I have to deal with the emotional pain. Not working and studying has reduced me, I don't feel comfortable around other women anymore..."* (Grace).

> *"I keep to myself these days. It helps me to deal with the stress better…"* ( Kaira)

Halfacree and Boyle (1999), state that migration has high masculine concepts with unequal gender relations; men enjoy the benefits of the process while women suffer in the process. The separation from family which is part of any migration process affects the psychological health of all migrants, but females have a different experience from their male counterparts (Pedraza, 1991). Rogler et al (1987) stated that migration creates intense stresses that come from the challenges faced in entering different economic structures and culture, and furthermore altering one's personal ties. These strains are evident in the research findings, from emotional stress, lack of identity and poor well-being as highlighted in the responses above.

### 4.6.6        Reinforcement of traditional gender roles

Gender identities as described by the social location concept tend to shift in transnational spaces (Pessar, 2003). In this study, traditional gender roles for migrant women spouses are increased at the family level and their gender identities are now changed back to housewives. The sudden domestication of the women migrant spouses has led to the loss of their professional status and individuality leading to a decline in their physical and psychological health. This has resulted in psychosocial stress for the migrant women spouses thereby creating an unhealthy situation in their families. The skilled women spouses experience loss of dignity as they are now identified as housewives being unemployed. The women migrants stated that it has been an adjustment from the professional life they used to have back home in Zimbabwe. Without a job to go to, they are concentrating on managing the integration and care of their children until an opportunity arises. This experience has been mentally challenging for them as stated below:

> *"All I do is cleaning, laundry and cooking for the family. I had a good career in Zimbabwe. Now I feel like a house maid with no pay..."* (Avery)

*"It tends to be draining to just wake up and clean the house, when you know you are qualified for a good job…"* (Ratidzai)

*"I sometimes feel my skills are wasting away in the constant housework. But it must be done, an opportunity will come…"* (Tamara).

From the respondents views it seems migration to South Africa has reinforced traditional gender roles in the household with the '*male breadwinner model'* for employment. The respondents in this study mentioned that since their migration to South Africa the skilled women spouses have experienced an increase in their traditional duties as spouses and moms than as income earners. These views are explained in detail by the theory of gender geographies of power, social location concept and geographic scales where gender identities are changed in different contexts. There has been a significant increase in household and childcare responsibilities for the women migrants, mainly attributed to lack of support systems like family, friends and domestic help.

Other studies have supported this viewpoint. The increased research on skilled migrant females has noted the negative influence that migration has on the female's professions including reorientation away from previously skilled occupations to family and child-care, a term referred to as 're-domestication' (Yeoh and Willis 2005; Webb, 2015). Immigration statuses of dependent family members emphasize the gender roles played by both men and women in the traditional family (Balgamwalla, 2014). Immigration laws tend to define the role women play in the domestic field without valuing the significant contributions they also make in the destination countries' economy (Balgamwalla, 2014). Fineman (1995) describes this 'traditional family model' as the husband being the head of the house catering for the economic needs of his dependent wife and children.

### 4.6.7    Widening career gaps

A clear gender differentiation exists between married women and men's career profiles as the former makes less career progress than the latter (Garcia et al., 2003). Previous studies have discovered that men careers progress as their marriages move on while women careers do not develop considerably, eventually leading to stagnation after ten years of marriage (Garcia et al., 2003). Women not career progressing much in the same rate as men is a reflection of not actively participating in the labour market as men rather than their sex. A study done to assess career progression of National Health Service doctors by comparing men and women in the United Kingdom medical schools showed that women who have worked part time are dominant in general practice and are under stated in specialties substantially such as in the surgical and anesthetics (Taylor, 2009).

The career lag faced by women spouse migrants in mainly attributed to an increase in child-care and household responsibilities. Traditional gender norms assume the husband to be the breadwinner of his family therefore migration decisions in dual-career marriages prioritizes the demands of the husbands' career over the wife (Chisale, 2015). The respondents in the study stated that unemployment has created a gap in their career profiles as compared to their husbands. The skilled women spouses have been forced to choose their husbands career over their own personal and professional development. This means that the gender gap in careers between husband and wives among migrant marriages keeps increasing as long as the women continue to be domesticated while their husbands are progressing with their own careers. Ratidzai stated:

*"My husband's career is growing. He is now a good renowned researcher. Ever since I migrated to South Africa I have not improved my career at all, but we are all postgraduates..."*

The research found out that the unemployed skilled women migrants were not fully exercising their potential in the host country, yet they have essential skills that are deemed critical in South Africa (Chisale, 2015; Thompson, 2016). Skilled women migrants are an underutilized source of human capital (Thompson, 2016).

### 4.6.8    Underutilization of skills

The brain-wastage of skilled migrant workers is not new and is common among many leading economies in the world. Current literature is replete with cases of professionals assuming menial jobs just to eke a living (Stewart, 2007; Young 2007; Voicu and Vlase, 2014; Batalova et al., 2016). A study conducted in USA, for example, estimates the loss due to underutilization of skilled workers to run into several billions of dollars in unrealized potential tax revenue (Batalova et al., 2016). Apart from loss of potential tax revenue, lower or no wages due to job mismatches or non-employment, respectively, among highly skilled migrants result in very little disposable income. If such disposable income rises, a positive spin off can be realized among local businesses as the migrant buying power rises.

Batalova et al., (2016) also went on to argue that "differences in international education and training standards, as well as negative perceptions of the quality of education and work experience" limited employer interest. Furthermore, this poor credential recognition leads to hindrances in registration to professional bodies among foreign educated skilled migrants. When such professional registration is mandatory, it can be the limiting factor for access to employment. In addition,

language has also been cited as a barrier to employment among both English and non-English speaking developed countries (Pattni, 2007; Batlova et al., 2016). To counter this, countries such as the United Kingdom have launched innovative programs such as the Language2Work program in order to impart working language skills but also ensure social integration (Pattni, 2007).

Even though the above global cases apply to both male and female migrants, one can also draw parallels to the case of Zimbabwean women in South Africa. For example, many of the respondents cited registration to professional bodies as a challenge due to either prohibitive fees or outright non-recognition of their foreign qualifications. This is the case of Dudzai who stated that she intended to study further to attain a South African post graduate Law qualification in order to brighten her career prospects. However, not many are this fortunate, as the thought of studying further is made possible by her supportive husband who might spare money for funding her tuition. For many others, this is just a pipedream as families can barely spare enough outside basic necessities. Furthermore, other respondents stated that even when spousal salaries may be flexible to fund such, the will power and commitment may not be the same. Hence, women often end up at the mercy of their spouses or trying to apply for bursaries and scholarships which they are often excluded due to age or the mere fact that they are foreigners.

Analysing such scenario with a gender lens reveals an intervention point with regards to migrant women on accompanying visas. Overdependence on spouses shifts social dynamics in households leading to other social ills such as abuse which Chido stated below:

*"You are dependent on the man for everything. Even when you decided to emigrate back to Zimbabwe after marital conflicts or any other reason, you are still at the mercy of the man*

*as he may choose not to give you. It feels like I was trafficked under facilitation by the South African Government".*

Such is the farce which is the accompanying spouse visa as women with non-supportive or abusive husbands often suffer in silence. Chido in the excerpt above is reiterating the fact that dependents are forced to comply to what their husbands want since they are the bread winners. Her husband might choose to provide or not.

## 4.7 Unemployment and xenophobia experiences among the women spouses

Xenophobia in South Africa manifests itself in various behaviors including derogatory, dehumanizing and discriminatory remarks by the population and it can also be evident in the practices and policies by government that tend to exclude foreigners from public services that they are entitled to (Crush et al., 2017). Attitudinal surveys of the 2008 and 2015 xenophobic violence in South Africa discovered that locals' separate migrants by their nationalities and Zimbabweans are the least liked (Crush et al., 2017; Hungwe, 2014). The women respondents in this study also echoed the same sense of resentment from the South African locals and institutions. The women cited their inability to open bank accounts, yet they are legal residents in this country. Such requirements put by financial institutions display covert xenophobia towards immigrants. The constraints that the women face because of the migration policies placed in South Africa also display subtle xenophobia.

Language barriers also corelate with employment rates among migrants and facilitate xenophobic tendencies. In New Zealand, difficulties in acquiring employment are related to language problems. Migrants from North Asia faced employment barriers because of their inability to understand English. Migrants could only improve their English skills while employed or in a social context and

interacting with English speakers. The ability to talk fluent English and the rate of labour force participation is less influential for males but female migrants with 'poor and moderate' or 'good' English had less chances of being employed than other migrants. This phenomenon increased as migrants did not improve their English language overtime. Studies have shown that employers' have preconception for immigrants that have less local job experiences, or those immigrants that possess a foreign accent (Ho et al., 2000; Ip and Friesen, 2001). Migrant women are often stigmatized for not understanding the language. It is important to state that since South Africa`s official language is English, none of the recipients cited language as a hindrance to formal employment. However, local languages were mentioned as occasionally a hindrance to social integration and access to informal employment. This is also the case as in a study done on immigrants integrating into Canadian society on local level (Galiev and Masoodi, 2012). The majority of immigrants had difficulties integrating into the society since the country regards itself by being bilingual. Immigrants favour fluency in English rather than French in order to easily integrate in the predominantly English-speaking Alberta (Galiev and Masoodi, 2012).

Recent work on migration has shown how natives are moved to exclude immigrants based on their linguistic ability (Adida et al, 2017; Enos, 2014; Hainmueller and Hopkins, 2015), and these exclusionary attitudes apply toward refugees as well (Bansak et al, 2016; Karasapan, 2017). Xenophobia against immigrants in Europe occurs due to economic competition (Dancygier, 2010), and threats to one's cultural identity in the form of religious or linguistic differences can mobilize other individuals who are not inclined to immigrants (Sniderman et al, 2004). In Ojong's study, migrant women struggled to understand Afrikaans and IsiZulu and it had implications in how the society treated and perceived them (Ojong, 2002). Inability to understand the local language can result in failure to integrate easily in the host country. Migrant women in the study also faced xenophobia from the local nationals due to their inability to clearly understand and communicate

in South Africa's spoken language. Respondents from this study stated that if someone cannot speak Zulu they are treated as an outsider and cannot socialize.

*"You constantly have to try to fit in. Even if I can't have my job, I try to talk to local South Africans who can assist. But language is a problem"* Mimi.

*"I am not fluent in Zulu so I have problems trying to tell my counterparts I meet at the tuckshop I operate if they know of jobs..."* Lynette

*"With my tailoring I am trying to learn Zulu so that I get customers. I also try to talk to them about jobs in interior designing..."* Lana

**4.8 Women's Agency among the skilled Zimbabwean women migrants**

The concept of power geometry from the gender geographies of power theory, has been used in this study to examine the agency that the respondents displayed in their different social locations. Agency is the capability to make choices and change them into desired results (Ruiz and College, 1998). Amartya Sen (1985) defined agency as *'a person's choice in pursuit of whatever goals or values he or she regards as important. Agency incites an ability to question, overcome barriers or confront situations of oppression and deprivation. Agency can be an act of individuals and may involve influence in the society'.*

Women are able to exercise agency in their own personal environment or within certain groups or structures. Women agency can also be exercised in formal or informal institutions. Women's collective agency tend to promote changes in the policy and society. Individual women may have influence, but collective women call for changes in the law, policy, socio-cultural norms which
Page | 135

therefore positively influence individual agency. Greater female representation in emerging economies has amplified the importance of matters more related to female lives, including violence against women and migrant security (Caiazza, 2002). Studies have shown that women's agency can contribute greatly to their empowerment (Samman and Santos, 2009; Kabeer et al, 2011, Kabeer, 2013 and Alkire, 2013). An analysis done on the evolution of gender policies in 70 countries highlighted the significant role of agency in women movements from 1975 and its promotion of more democratic family laws and addressing violence against women (Htun and Weldon, 2008). An example is the greater representation of women in political institutions, as the panchayats in India, which has caused in greater allocations of some infrastructure and other services for women and their children needs. More participation of women in village gatherings has encouraged more gender-related crime reporting and more arrests (Ban and Rao, 2008).

Economic growth, markets, and formal institutions may either enable or constrain women's agency (World Development Report, 2012). In this research, the women respondents have exercised an ability to manage their unemployment situation for a better outcome regardless of the constraints and hindrances they faced concerning their visa status. Several respondents from this study have put some initiative in their situation and changed in their career trajectories, moving from one area of expertise to another. These skilled migrant women have exerted power over their location and situation as described in the gender geographies of power theory, concept of power geometries (Pessar et al., 2003). These women have initiated flow and movement in their career trajectories instead of staying unemployed and vulnerable. The women respondents have exercised agency by their ability to earn their own income in the informal market as a stepping stone into the formal sector.

The women could not find jobs in their professional field therefore opted to venture into the informal sector that includes domestic work, dressmaking and vending just to generate some form of income. Studies have shown that African migrant women develop survival strategies to contribute to the family's economic situation indicating some form of resilience (Teborg-Penn, 1996). It is through these informal jobs that the women hope to raise finances to secure proper study/work permits that can facilitate further education and formal employment.

Lyn, cited below, highlighted that she had responsibilities back home in Zimbabwe therefore had to send remittances:

*"I have a Bachelor's degree in Mechanical Engineering from Zimbabwe, looking for my dream job has been strenuous; no one hires me, so now I decided to follow my other passion that is sewing and dressmaking. I have given up on the formal sector employment and am now venturing into dressmaking so that I can get an income and send money home..."*

Other women respondents have resorted to start their own businesses that range from Avon product selling to Tupperware[2] sales representatives, in order to make ends meet instead of depending on their husbands for income. This was highlighted by Precious below:

*"I am doing my own business to source for money for my visa. I intend to study for a Master's in Law..."*

*"I am selling Avon products for income. I have customers here at church..."* (Tariro)

---

[2] Tupperware is a home product marketing venture that sells serving, preparation and storage products for the kitchen and home

*"I sell African prints; I buy them from my West African friends and resell them…"* (Natsayi)

*"I have enrolled to be a Tupperware representative, it's not much money but at least I can raise. I want a study visa and go back to study Law. Although I keep searching for formal employment, I also keep studying about Law. I instruct my husband to download journal articles for me at his work place about South African law and I read immensely at home..."* (Dudzai).

*"I am operating a market stall in the city center, for some money…"* (Led)

From the excerpts cited above it can be noted that migrant women use their own initiative to transform their financial situations. This was highlighted by a study done by Ojong (2002), where she researched on the lives of African migrant women in KwaZulu-Natal. From her findings, it was observed that migrant women learn to adjust and adapt to their environment because they have responsibilities back home. Ojong's study participants' and were successful in advancing their careers regardless of their immigration status by engaging in informal trading such as hairdressing and retailing of fabric. In a study done by Karaoud, (2018), Hassani women from Arab countries have played a pivotal role of building the community through various projects in refugee camps in South West Algeria. They have learnt to turnaround their refugee situation and sourced income in the refugee camps (Karaoud, 2018).

## 4.9 Zimbabwe Special Dispensation Permit

It is however important to note that there was an introduction of the Zimbabwe Special Dispensation permit by the South Africa Department of Home Affairs that could have assisted skilled women migrants in legally working in South Africa. In 2000, South Africa noticed the large number of

Page | 138

undocumented migrants from Zimbabwe (Crush, 2011). During this period there was heightened political and economic crisis in Zimbabwe (Sachikonye, 2011). South Africa faced domestic and international pressure to address illegal Zimbabwean migrants that are staying in the country. By the government's own admission, the 2002 Immigration Act of South Africa did not cater for all immigrants and its requirements were too high for unskilled or poor migrants to obtain a work permit or any other form of legal documentation. In 2009, South Africa Department of Home Affairs decided to give Zimbabweans residing in South Africa 12-month special dispensation permits. Issued under Section 31(2) (b) of the Immigration Act, the special permit gave immigrants permission to stay and be legally employed (CoRMSA, 2009). Regardless of the introduction of this visa, skilled women migrants, accompanying their husbands, could not qualify for the Zimbabwe Dispensation Permit as they were already regarded as legal residents under the Accompanying spouse dependent permit.

## 4.9 Conclusion

Chapter 4 outlined the migrant experiences of Zimbabwean women spouses with the 'Accompanying spouse dependent' visa. This chapter revealed that although the women faced several challenges in labour integration, there were not victims of the system, but were striving to attain their migrant rights to work as skilled spouses in South Africa. Chapter 4 has shown illustrated findings with data excerpts from interviews. Chapter 5 will give a detailed gender analysis of all the gender and migration policies of South Africa.

**CHAPTER FIVE**

**GENDER ANALYSIS OF SOUTH AFRICA MIGRATION AND LABOUR POLICIES REGARDING WOMEN'S INTERGRATION INTO THE FORMAL LABOUR MARKET**

### 5.1 Introduction

Migration today is vastly linked to work and the quest for decent employment either within countries or across international borders (International Labour Organisation, 2015). Approximately 50% of international migrants are economically active and thus presumably contribute immensely to the labour market. The diverse employment trends today coupled with the changing patterns of migration clearly suggest that migration is a labour market and decent work issue. For example, almost 50% of international migrants are women, either migrating independently for employment or reuniting with their families that have already migrated (International Labour Organisation, 2015; UN Women and International Organisation for Migration, 2016). Due to this increase in female migration, increased attention to gender dimensions of migration and specific gender analysis is urgently needed in migration and labour policies.

According to the gender and development approach, gender mainstreaming in migration policies has become a necessity for gender equality for women migrants. While there is increasing recognition that migration is gendered, attempts to mainstream women in policies regarding this area are few and more needs to be done to achieve tangible progress (IOM and OECD, 2015; UN Women and International Organisation for Migration, 2016). A lot of work has primarily focused on policy gaps addressing the vulnerability of women with particular attention on human trafficking for sexual exploitation (Jolly and Reeves, 2005; Women and migration network, 2017). Therefore, the role of gender in immigrant labour market participation remains poorly explored. In particular

among African migrants, where gendered structural barriers continue to affect the women`s access to jobs (Riano and Baghdadi, 2008).

Migration destination countries have a responsibility to create favorable social and economic environments for all including women migrants, to be free to enjoy their rights to decent livelihoods through employment opportunities. Steps need to be taken to create gender positive laws and immigration policies that create conducive settings that deliver equal labour market opportunities and easy access to resources for migrant women. Furthermore, research evidence, Chavan (2008) and Otobe (2014), has shown that employed women that have their own independent income have access to increased social-economic benefits for them and their families. Such benefits include women's empowerment and improved well-being, more decision-making in the household and community and improved health, nutrition and fertility. This chapter will analyse gender mainstreaming in migration and labour policies or lack thereof.

## 5.2 International human and women rights instruments that support gender mainstreaming in migration and labour policies

International and regional human rights instruments are fundamental for the establishment of migration and labour policies in host countries. These existing frameworks and protocols support the economic advancement of all women by lobbying countries on the endorsement and implementation of suitable laws that enforce gender rights and their financial standing. The important factors that encourage development of migration policies cited in international human rights principles mainly include ensuring of human rights and freedom of all citizens and preventing all forms of discrimination (Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM), 2005; International Labour Organisation, 2015). Gender aligned agreements and protocols can facilitate

women's access to economic development and resources. However, poor obligations to the application and meager critical understanding of gender as central to socio-economic development can lead to failure.

A lot of gender specific policies and programs created by civil society organisations and NGO's mainly focus on empowering, supporting and protecting women migrants than their inclusion in policy making (Jolly and Reeves, 2005; Women and migration network, 2017). As many women are migrating with various needs and priorities different from men, migration policies that are gender biased, gender neutral and gender blind can result in ineffective integration thereby widening gender inequalities (International Labour Organisation, 2016a). New gender-based migration and labour policies are needed to address the discriminations and the injustices that migrant women, particularly accompanying spouses, suffer in the various stages of migration and in labour integration. Migrant women spouses suffer additional barriers such as labour migration laws and policies that hinder them from decent work (International Labour Organisation, 2015). Provision of decent work to female migrants in host countries involves not only access to financial resources for survival but it builds confidence, human dignity and respected social standing for these women (Otobe, 2014). Taking into account the vast contribution that these women can bring through their skills in destination countries, gender sensitivity is required in migration and labour programmes and strategies (Bozrikova and Niyazova, 2011). Migration policies should highlight the different requirements and vulnerabilities that females face and dynamically aim to address them. (O'Neil et al., 2016).

Calls have been made globally, as highlighted below, for more gender mainstreaming in migration and labour policies but, in practice, less progress has been done. The recent 2016 UN Summit for Refugees and Migrants reiterated the sole purpose of addressing female migrants needs so as to

develop meaningful policies and programmes that cater for them (UN, 2016). UN Women and the International Organisation for Migration stated that migration should be equally empowering for women therefore gender sensitivity is much needed in migrant policies. The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development through its 17 Sustainable Development Goals, also called globally for countries to guarantee that women and girl migrants are not segregated and directly benefit from the economic and social advancement outlined in the 2030 Agenda. Furthermore, Sustainable Development Goal 10, Target 7 urges countries to encourage safe and well managed migration through the application of planned policies (UN, 2015).

The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), that is endorsed by most countries includes a number of provisions and concerns on all female migrants. CEDAW is a legally binding commitment that requires all member states to enforce, safeguard and achieve gender rights. It focuses on the elimination of all forms of discriminatory situations for all women in all sectors of life (Bozrikova and Niyazova, 2011). It is a critical tool to ensure that rights are upheld and gender responsive methods to migration and labour integration. CEDAW outlines all biased roles that are put forward regarding men and women (CEDAW, Article 5). CEDAW emphasizes the eradication of all forms of discrimination that women are exposed to everyday. The facts are outlined in the document as General Recommendations which were written in 2008 by the CEDAW commission and the UN Committee on Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Their Family Members. The UN Committee urges all member states participating to legalize all migration policies to work with their human rights commitments. Member states are encouraged to uphold safe migration taking into consideration women's rights during all migration stages (CEDAW general recommendation 26, 1979; European Union and UN Women, 2016; International Labour Organisation, 2015). CEDAW General Recommendations require member states to consider the following groups in their migration policies and laws:

unattached female migrant workers; female migrant workers who are dependents of their husbands including other family members who are also migrant workers and unregistered female migrant workers who can belong to any of the above-mentioned categories.

The CEDAW committee provides several recommendations to be adopted by destination countries while developing migration policies that cater for women:

- *"the need to promote the expansion of female migrant workers' access to employment by focusing on the promotion of safe migration*

- *to promote active participation of female migrant workers and relevant nongovernmental organisations in development, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of migration policy;*

- *inclusion into the provisions of the constitution, civil and labour legislations the same rights and measures for protection of female migrant workers as that provided for all workers of the country, including the right to establishment and freedom of association*

- *adopting strategies and programs aimed at providing women migrants the opportunity to integrate into a new community. These measures should protect their human rights and respect their cultural identity"* (CEDAW, 1979).

In September 2015 all UN Member States approved the SDGs that are to be attained by 2030. Southern African Development Community (SADC) countries united and adopted these goals. Most of the SDGs are directly connected to gender equality and migration issues. These are Goal number 5 that is on Gender equality and women and girls empowerment; Goal number 8 that states economic advancement and decent work for all; Goal number 10 that focuses on the reduction of inequalities among countries; Goal number 16 that emphasizes on creating peace in all settings that

encourages justice accessibility for all and Goal number 17 that encourages global partnerships with regard to achieving Sustainable Goals. Sustainable Development Goal 5 has the sole purpose to accomplish gender equality and empowerment for all women and girls (United Nations, 2016; Morna et al., 2016). Notable provisions and targets outlined in the Sustainable Development Goal 5 included but are not limited to:

- *"End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere.*

- *Ensure women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision-making in political, economic and public life.*

- *Undertake reforms to give women equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to ownership and control over land and other forms of property, financial services, inheritance and natural resources, in accordance with national laws*

- *Adopt and strengthen sound policies and enforceable legislation for the promotion of gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls at all levels.*

- *Seek to realise and protect human rights of all and to achieve gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls*

- *Aim for a world in which every woman and girl enjoys full gender equality and all legal, social and economic barriers to their empowerment have been removed*" (UN, 2016).

Sustainable Development Goal target 10.7 clearly illustrates that members should facilitate safe, orderly and regular migration through the implementation of accomplished migration policies (United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 2016). Effective implementation of these migration policies should be gender sensitive to capture the specific needs of female migrants.

The International Labour Organisation Multilateral Framework on Labour safeguards migrant worker rights and is important in developing national/regional gender-sensitive laws and programmes. The framework is a non-binding guiding document on managing labour migration to effectively meet the needs and rights of governments, employers and workers (Southern African Development Community, 2013). The framework requires running gender-sensitive policies, providing *"every able-bodied woman with opportunity for employment, to sign bilateral and multilateral agreements on specific issues related to gender themes*' (Southern African Development Community, 2013). International Labour instruments clearly outline that it is the States' prerogative to regulate employment access for all immigrants.

### 5.3 Regional human and women rights instruments that support gender mainstreaming in migration and labour policies

Several African women and human rights instruments have been drafted calling on member countries to be responsive to female migrant needs in and outside of their respective countries. These instruments call on African states to draft legal frameworks that cater African women necessities. These drafts include, and are not limited to, The Africa Common Position on Migration and Displacement drafted in 2006, which calls on African states to establish regular and transparent labour migration policies that results in benefits for both destination and sending states. The draft encourages African countries to *'implement labour migration policies and legislation that will incorporate good labour standards that benefit labour migrants and members of their families'* (Africa Union, 2006).

The African Women's Protocol on Women's Rights of 2005 seeks to *'promote the rights of African women by reinforcing the existing international human rights standards and adapting them to*

*address African context violations of women's rights'.* The protocol commits all state parties that have ratified it, to combat all forms of discrimination on women through their legislature. It promotes gender equity in both marriages and public governance. Furthermore, the protocol demands equal representation of women in politics, entrepreneurship programmes and access to credit and income (Mukasa et al., 2008). The 2008 SADC Protocol on Gender and Development and reviewed in 2015, is a sub-regional instrument that promotes gender equality. The protocol specifically calls on member states to '*eliminate all barriers that prevent women from participating meaningfully in all spheres of life'* (SADC Protocol on Gender and Development, 2008). Article 18 and19 of the SADC Protocol on Gender and Development, calls on state parties to ensure women have equal access to credit, capital and employment with benefits (SADC Protocol on Gender and Development, 2015).

SADC has cooperated with various influential organisations such as ILO and IOM, to create approaches that can successfully address labour migration in the sub-continent. Although adopted in 2005, the Facilitation of Movement of Persons protocol still awaits approval from other member countries. The protocol mainly enables migrants to move freely within the borders. However, the protocol does not facilitate the accessibility of employment. In 2013, the Employment Labour Sector of SADC adopted the Action Plan on Labour Migration, the Labour Migration Policy Framework 2014, and the protocol on Employment and Labour, that ensures that all migrant workers are safeguarded (African Centre for Migration and Society, 2015). The SADC Labour Migration Plan and the Labour Migration Policy Framework has requested member countries to create national labour migration policies by 2020. These National Labour Migration policies should be consistent with Southern African Development Committee, International Labour Organisation, African Union and United Nations instruments that promote and protect the migrant worker rights for themselves and their dependents.

Given this background, and that South Africa is the major destination of migrants in SADC due to its grandiose economic endowments, a gender analysis of its migration and labour policies is vital. Although the country has ratified and is signatory to various international human and women rights instruments, its constitution states that international law and treaties should be included in the representation of the nation`s Bill of rights and in other South African laws. However, a state is obliged to refrain from enacting legislation that contradicts any signed treaties (Article 18, Vienna Convention on the Law of treaties). All these international and African instruments seek to protect migrant and gender rights and call for destination countries to provide the necessary resources needed for their successful integration. Hence, the increase in gender related migration should be judiciously studied in order to harmonize international and domestic legal frameworks that regulate migration.

## 5.4 Gender concerns in South African migration-labour policies

Although there has been recent great interest in feminist migration scholarship, dearth in knowledge still exists regarding mainstreaming gender in migration (Näre and Akhtar, 2014). Gender is rarely integrated into the 'general' theorisation of social change (e.g. Lutz 2010; 2011). Perhaps this neglect by scholars has also led to governments paying little attention to gender needs when addressing migration. Yet, the economic advancement and labour integration of migrant women is successful if facilitated by the state's capacity to implement the various protocols and agreements cited above into measurable, development plans that eradicate barriers in structures to integration in the labour market. South Africa has experienced a growing gendered pattern of migration where women are migrating into the country both as independent women migrants and spouses (Chisale, 2015). Thus, successful integration of the migrants in all sectors specifically the labour is crucial to avoid gender disparities that result in several social ills. By virtue of their gender, race and migrant

status, women spouse migrants are faced with employment barriers limiting their potential and security in the host country, a clear indication of gender mainstreaming gaps in existing migration-labour policies.

Most of the respondents in this research study stated that if the migration-labour policies had considered giving them independent work visas, their gender needs; including opportunities for employment, access to financial services, increased decision making, access to health would have been met and their migration experiences would have been much better. It becomes a necessity for the women migrant spouses to access medical services and insurance once gender needs are successfully incorporated in the migration-labour policies, which is impossible on the current dependent visa they hold. This is seen below in a few excerpts:

*"I had high expectations to start work immediately with my statistics background. But the visa does not allow me to pursue my studies and work..."* (Ratidzai).

*"More improvement can be made to this dependent spouse visa, to allow us to live our lives...."* (Sandra)

*"I have a Bachelor in Law undergraduate degree which is relevant but employers tell me I cannot use it because I do not have a residence visa or work permit. They are also ready to employ a South African national with a lesser qualification than me..."* (Dudzai).

*"I have approached employers to present my skills and expertise and they asked me if I had a valid work permit. When I said I do not have one, I have an Accompanying Spouse dependent visa, they said we cannot help you..."* (Chido).

*"I cannot access credit loans to start a small business since I do not have a bank account. I am ready to start something that gives me money to apply for a work permit..."* (Tariro).

Exclusion of migrant women spouses from the socio-economic sphere makes it difficult for them to access the formal labour market leading to other forms of gender discrimination and violations that arise with the women lacking economic power (Mafukidze and Mbanda, 2008). Gender mainstreaming in the migrant and labour policies will successfully aid in the integration process. One of the most fundamental concerns today is that the issue of gender has not been satisfactorily incorporated in both South African migration-labour policy reform and the process of implementation (Crush and Williams, 2001).

Large numbers of women migrants find themselves excluded from legitimate employment when arriving as spouses to migrant's workers (International Labour Organisation, 2015). This continues regardless of the fact that women migrants' access to decent employment in the host country, is not only beneficial to the receiving country but can lift households out of poverty both for the immediate migrated family, and back home through remittances (UN Women, 2015). However, labour immigration policies tend to omit the labour needs for female spouses, even during family reunification programmes. In Europe, most member states have made significant strides but also lack successful gender mainstreaming in policies on migration and labour integration (Bach, 2009) with some even increasing restrictions on family immigration policies (Kraler and Kofman, 2006). Nevertheless, there is increasing global acknowledgement of the need to integrate gender sensitivity to address migration policies. For example, in Canada, progress has been made in viewing the migration and integration plans through a gender lens. Gender equality programmes have been instituted in an attempt to include migrant women in employment and even policy making (Bach, 2009). This is as a result of a meticulous Canadian immigration system which is solely based on

education and language attainment thereby producing increased highly qualified female migrants who can be incorporated in the formal labour market (Bach, 2009).

After apartheid South Africa, migration laws and policy programmes have not been successful in achieving the development potential of migration therefore did not address major factors as social-cohesion and labour incorporation (Carciotto and Mavura, 2016). Furthermore, South Africa's immigration and labour polices fail to adequately align themselves to global and nationwide tools that advocate and safeguard the equality of sexes (Chisale, 2015). More work needs to be done on gender mainstreaming in migration labour integration laws. Increasing restrictions imposed by migration and labour policies on migrant women, hinder access to the formal labour market. Women who migrate under family immigration or as marital spouses are not given independent visas that can allow them to work or study. This has an underlying assumption that the women spouses have no skills that can contribute to the knowledge of the economy in the receiving country. This chapter gives an in-depth gender analysis/critique on South Africa's migration and labour policies regarding migrant women's labour integration.

In order to understand South Africa's gender inclusion in migration-labour policies today it is necessary to gain an understanding of both its historical and current policy environment. The history of cross boarder migration in South Africa has been predominantly one of labour migration. Migration to South Africa has long been aligned to the mining sector making it male biased and consequently leading to a neglect of women in both migration policy and research studies (Barnes, 2002). Indeed, migration policies such as the Aliens Control Act of 1991 showed this male-centered approach because women were assumed to be 'left behind' which largely reflected typical migration patterns of the time.

### 5.4.1 Aliens Control Act, 1991

Despite having significant gender implications, the Aliens Control Act 1991 and the Green Paper on International Migration 1997 were completely silent about women inclusion in migration. The Act had a number of omissions and weaknesses. For example, the act had no provisions for special spousal or family category in temporary residence. Presumably due to the segregatory nature of the government at the time that focused on Africans immigrating as laborer's any rights of temporary residence pertaining to spouses and children of 'aliens' were vague. Article 26: 5 of the Act stated that: "*When a temporary residence permit is issued to an alien, an appropriate permit in terms of this section may also be issued to the spouse and to the dependent child of that alien*" (Aliens Control Act, 1991: Section 26). This clause was not clear regarding residence rights of spouses. By using the term *'may also be issued'*, the Act was thus not binding for any concerned parties in providing spousal permits and enabling rights to women migrants. Hence the Aliens Control Act unwittingly (or by design) discriminated female migrant spouses since its inception. Viewing with a gender lens, women spouses of migrants had no significant residence rights during this period. The 1995 amendments done to the 1991 Aliens Control Act, post the apartheid era, involved the addition of the term woman, altering the linguistic aspect of the policy document rather than substantially mainstreaming women in the process (Aliens Control Amendment Act, 1995: Section 13). Restricting spouses from bringing their families to reside with them in South Africa discriminated women significantly. Viewing from a gender lens, the 1995 alterations to the 1991 Act involved just changing the terms outlined in the previous act by putting the word 'women' in the text, without considerably addressing gender inequality in the policy. One can clearly state that not much has changed since the original 1991 Aliens Control Act, which had overt gender inequality. The policy has therefore implied gender inequality which has persisted in the South Africa's migration policies, disguised by gender neutral language put in the laws.

### 5.4.2      Green Paper on International Migration, 1997

The Green Paper on International Migration, 1997 stated *'that for both temporary and permanent immigration there should be 'rules of entry driven by labour market need', thereby admitting individuals who have desirable skills, expertise, resources and entrepreneurial will'* (Republic of South Africa 1997:19). There was continued male bias on how the labour need would be acquired. Dominance of the mining sector in labour demand during that period meant that the rights of males were inadvertently more enhanced. As South African women are routinely deprived of opportunities in acquiring such 'skills and expertise', they are automatically at a disadvantage in eligibility. The final category specified in the Green Paper was that of students, where especially in African countries there is a possibility in bias favoring males who have opportunities to migrate in pursuit of education prospects. The Green Paper did not also adequately address the issue of spouses and family residence beyond the acquisition of "border passes to eligible persons to ease the flow of legally-sanctioned temporary visitation of *bona fide* family members across our borders" (Republic of South Africa 1997: Article 26; Crush and Williams, 2001).

However, there are other positives noted in the Green Paper that favored the informal labour market trade. For example, the recommendation for the facilitation of cross boarder and informal-sector trading favored female migrants since the main key motive of women migration to South Africa is trade (Dodson, 1998). Skilled women migrants and spouses of migrant laborer's who sought legal residence status and formal employment were still disadvantaged and not mainstreamed in the labour migration policy framework. Although the Green Paper represented a considerable development from the Aliens Control Act, it can never be seen as gender neutral.

### 5.4.3        White Paper on International Migration, 1999

The White Paper on International Migration can be seen as not addressing gender matters at all. Any confirmatory action stated in the White Paper is articulated in terms of continental and global partialities rather than by gender. The White Paper states that *"Our obligations are to serve our people first; the people of the region and the member states of the Southern African Development Community (SADC) second; the people of Africa third; and the rest of the world last"* (Republic of South Africa 1999:9). The way it was going to be realized is not made clear.

White Paper on International Migration 1999 is likened to the Green Paper, in that the international migration system was driven primarily by narrowly defined economic criteria as stated in the policy document, Article 9: *'The people who can add value to our growth and development are those who invest, entrepreneurs and promote trade, those who bring new knowledge and experience to our society, and those who have the skills and expertise to do the things we cannot properly do at this stage'* (Republic of South Africa 1999: 9). A gender-lens look at this obvious inclusion of skills for admission would show that the likely migrant, either temporary/permanent, is possibly going to be a man than a woman. It is true when we consider the patriarchal bias that is present with women's access to finances, properties, and education in majority of Africa (Crush and Williams, 2001). Therefore, the selection of migrants and employing them migrant labor meant covert gender inequality, regardless of the gender neutrality which was portrayed in the policy. The suggestions to change the labor quota structure into an organisation of work permits allowed corporations to recruit foreign labor. These suggestions would favor men, as many women  are employed informally or in areas where jobs are individualized and less compliant to more organized recruitment.

Skilled women migrants' inclusion in the formal labour market was not addressed. There was defacto gender discrimination in the White Paper mainly in the implementation and application of migration policy. Skilled women who wished to migrate faced challenges in telling migrant officials that they are independent and breadwinners in their families. While the White Paper does not overtly show any form of gender inequality there is an implied supposition that the principal migrant is possibly a male "breadwinner," with dependent rights attached to his visa status. This has caused unfair discrimination against women and children and this inequality is rarely overt because it is intensely entrenched in societal structures, norms and values.

Gender neutral language is also of concern in the White Paper. Although the legislated document tried to use gender-neutral terms such as "spouse", "their" "his or her," it was portrayed more in a way that clearly shows gender sightlessness than consciousness. South African migration policy should be conceptualized and articulated, acknowledging both its own gender aligned expectations and its gender-distinguished possible consequences. Policies and regulations can be inscribed in gender-sensitive language which is instrumental, intended and having a meaningful basis.

Despite its short comings, positive developments for women migrants in informal trade and short-term migration are noted in the White Paper. A number of recommendations were stated and encouraged *including visits for the purpose of "tourism, business, trade, study or other activities not requiring work'* (Republic of South Africa 1999: Article 25). Making restrictions easier regarding temporal migration benefited women from the Southern African region greatly, because they migrated for informal trade, visiting and shopping (Dodson, 1998), rather than women migrant spouses who were reuniting with their working husbands. The White Paper reiterated *'the government's commitment to sustain the informal sector'* and notes that *'the public hearings have*

*provided the Task Team with an indication that foreign traders are beneficial to the informal sector'*
(Republic of South Africa 1999:24).

Women and families were acknowledged in the White Paper's Article 34 that emphasized family reunification: "*Family reunification should become an important element of migration policy. It must be noted that artificial colonial boundary lines and forced migration have disrupted many family units*" (Republic of South Africa 1999: 34). Foreign spouses of South African citizens would now have permanent residence rights. Furthermore, family relations "would also become the ground for a temporary residence permit for relatives" (Republic of South Africa 1999:34), with temporary residence permits granted to dependents of a permanent resident. However, from a gender analysis it is still a matter of concern that the condition of holders of such temporary residence permits would not be allowed to work. More females than males, in all likelihood, would enter the country under the 'family' category. Therefore, females who are skilled suffered disproportionately from the forced unemployment as a result. Gender discrimination, inequality and violation of women's rights are evident in the White Paper, because women migrant spouses are restricted in access to employment, resources and credit that would otherwise empower them.

The White Paper also addressed employers in South Africa when hiring skilled migrants in Section 8.5.1 stipulating that *'employers who employed foreigners would pay into a national training fund a ratio of the salary'* as prescribed by the regulation (Republic of South Africa 1999:8). This contribution/levy would go towards the training of South Africans. In this regulation, it meant that all employers who hired foreigners would do so at a higher cost than when they could hire equally trained South Africans. This levy controlled the integration of legal skilled migrants in employment by discouraging employers from employing foreigners because they would have to pay a ratio of the salary paid to the migrant into a national fund that contributes towards training of South

Page | 156

Africans. Hence, the White Paper's stance towards the employment of skilled foreigners, fails to unveil the skills present among migrant women which could benefit the economy. Gender mainstreaming these women in the White Paper regulations would have been useful.

### 5.4.4    Immigration Act, 2002

The most notably positive aspect of the 2002, Immigration Act was that it clearly stated that *"immigration should be a positive tool of social and economic development, without compromising both the rights and economic status of South African nationals or the basic human rights of all migrants'* (Republic of South Africa, 2003). The Act promised *'a new openness to immigration aiming to address South Africa's serious skills shortage'*.

The new immigration policy framework focused on *'national security, border control and economic criteria* (Republic of South Africa, 2002). The Immigration Act (2000) aims at *'setting in place a new system of immigration control which ensures that…the needs and aspirations of the age of globalization are respected* and *'the South African economy may have access at all times to the full measure of needed contributions by foreigners'* but also that *'the contribution of foreigners in the South African labour market does not adversely impact on existing labour standards and the rights and expectations of South African workers'* and *'a policy connection is maintained between foreigners working in South Africa and our nationals'* (Republic of South Africa, 2002). Unlike the other previous policies on migration, The Immigration Act, 2002 offered vital clear links between migration and labour to safeguard the rights of migrant workers in South Africa. The Act made categories regarding labour and skills highlighting who should qualify for what permit, as temporary or permanent resident and which labour migrants would be allowed to bring their families under what conditions (Crush and Dodson, 2006).

Under temporary residence permits, the 'exceptional skills' work permit, was categorized under work permit which *'may be issued by the Department to an individual of exceptional skills or qualifications'* (Immigration Act 2002 section 19(4)). A gender analysis here can reveal that depending on how 'exceptional skills' are determined; this is likely to produce a defacto male bias, in that male migrants from African countries are likely the gender that holds such 'skills'. This is the only category of work permits that include residence rights to members of the holder's immediate family. Neither the Immigration Act nor the regulations stated whether such family members are themselves allowed to work, or in what capacity. Regulation 28(8) specifies that: *'the immediate family members… shall be those who are dependent on such permit holder, provided that the Department may issue an extended visitor's permit to other members of such immediate family'*. The attachment of family residence rights to this category show how skilled and labour migrants face either separation from their families or restrictions on their family members' residence and employment in South Africa. Having one's immigration status dependent on one's marital status can serve to discriminate and trap women, in unhappy or abusive relationships, making this provision potentially problematic if there is no repeal. The Immigration Act does not bring associated rights to women spouses of work permit holders. Spouses of work permit-holders should themselves be allowed to seek work whilst their employment is determined by labour market needs combined with the requirements for equal employment of foreigners and South African workers (Crush and Dodson, 2006). The Immigration Act of 2002 does not regard skilled women and skilled women labour migrants as bread winners. Furthermore, it failed to acknowledge that migrant laborer's can be accompanied by skilled spouses and dependents that need to be integrated in the formal labour market rather than be mere dependents of spouses that are skilled and employed.

### 5.4.5 Immigration Regulations, 2014

The Immigration Regulations of 2014 came into effect as an amendment to the 2002 Immigration Act. The amendment of the immigration regulations in 2014 saw the emergence of different categories of work permits such as general, quota, visitor's and exceptional skills. All these permits have their own significant administrative barriers. Several changes were made under the new regulations notably the word 'visa' replacing permit except in the case of permanent residence permit. Visitors permit is now referred to as visitor's visa, work permit as work visa. This change now reflects a clear distinction between short and long stay permanent permits. Furthermore, the amended Act (Republic of South Africa, 2014, Section 11(2) has provisions for spouses and children to immigrate into South Africa accompanying the main applicant, contrary to the previous Immigration Act of 2002. Spouses of applicants for work visas, critical skills visa are to be granted an 'Accompanying spouse dependent visa' also coined under the term visitor's visa, which allows them to join their husbands and reside with them in South Africa. This visa status prohibits them to work or study, in the event that they want to change to taking up their own employment or start school they are required to change their migration status. Under this policy document, women spouses that have their own skills have to independently apply for their own permits. Since traditional gender norms expect the husband to be the provider of the family, it is rare for the husband to be the spouse or dependent to his wife. Hence skilled migrant women are often forced to abandon their careers in their home countries and join their husbands in migration or stay separated from their husbands, or in extreme cases, absolve their marriages altogether. This is contrary to CEDAW which promotes access to employment for female migrants and the Africa Common Position on Migration and Displacement, 2006 that calls on states to implement policies and regulations on immigration and labour that benefit migrants and their families (AU, 2006).

In the Immigration Regulations, 2014, it is also stipulated that work and business visas will only be granted to suitably qualified migrants after showing need of employment for such foreigners instead of South African nationals. Work visas and business visas would be granted to foreigners that produce documentation with proof of the:

- purpose or necessity of the work;

- nature of the work;

- qualification and skills required for the work;

- duration of the work;

- place of work;

- duration of the visit;

- proof of remuneration or stipend that the foreigner will receive from the employer (Republic of South Africa, 2014, Section 11 (7a)).

The above stated immigration regulations regarding the employment of foreigners were made stricter such that, in the case of skilled women spouses, it was almost impossible to be formally integrated in the labour market as a dependent. The policy regulations do not enable an environment of successful employment especially for skilled women spouses that have the accompanying dependent visa status. Although migrant women can independently pursue their route for work permits or skills permits. The costs are prohibitive and not affordable for many as compounded by the subcontracting of a third party (VFS) which charges an almost equal fee to DHA for handling applications. Furthermore, the process is often plagued with several administrative challenges that often result in women being excluded from work for longer periods. This has resulted in most women spouses holding the Accompanying spouse dependent visa to be trapped and restricted.

### 5.4.6 Green Paper on International Migration 2016

The recent Green Paper drafted in 2016, proposes that international migration must be strategically managed in order to achieve national goals, economic growth and national security. The policy document states that *'risks have to be managed within the framework of the Constitution and the human rights of both citizens and other nationals must be respected and protected'* (Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs, 2016). Positive approaches that could benefit women have been proposed in the paper. The Green Paper has acknowledged that South Africa has no clear coherent integration policy therefore calls on an integration policy of migrants for foreigners that have long term stays. This call, once implemented, will be beneficial for women foreigners that need employment for sustenance. The Green Paper has further contended that international migration is beneficial when it is managed efficiently respectful of human rights. Although it is still not clear whether women's rights and welfare will be included, there is hope that women migrants' integration in labour will be made easier.

The Green Paper also calls on South Africa to attract skilled migrants since the economy is in demand of critical skills. It is stated that the immediate family of a visa-holder is now granted work and study visas without any delays (Republic of South Africa, 2016). The above measures will assist on a small scale, although there is an urgent need to make large changes in approaches, capacity and regulations in to address the serious skills gaps that are hindering development, training and job creation. The Green paper has proposed a long-term visa which is family oriented. Under the section on policy interventions it is stated that migrants with the needed skills, business interests and investments must be allowed access to a long-term visa that will allow access to permanent residence. This visa is termed a special visa that is fast tracked enabling the applicant and the immediate family to apply as one unit. The family members must be able to work and study

using the long-term visa without the need to apply for other appropriate visas as currently required. Although not clearly directed towards women migrants, this proposal will greatly empower skilled women spouse immigrants to be independent in their visa status and have greater chances of employment. Unlike other migration labour policy documents, the Green Paper, 2016 brings new hope for skilled women migrant spouses in South Africa that have been previously disadvantaged because of their visa status even though they possess valuable skills that South Africa can benefit from.

### 5.4.7 White Paper on International Migration 2017

The White Paper on International migration approved in 1999 has been the basis of immigration and legislation for the last 18 years. There has not been a comprehensive review of this policy and South Africa has faced several migration challenges since its implementation. By adopting the National Development Plan (NDP) as a policy framework for all public polices and strategies more focus has now been on skilled migration. Skilled migrants are now needed for the knowledge base needed in economic growth. (Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs, 2017). In view of the amplified importance of migration as well as concerns about migrant jobs and inequality, South Africa has become increasingly aware of the need for effective migration management and integration into labour markets. The 2017 White Paper on International Migration (Department of Home Affairs, 2017) marked a shift to a greater emphasis on the economic benefits gained from migration, as well as previous policies related to "critical skills".

The White Paper released in July 2017 proposes an adoption of a managed international migration approach that enables development and economic growth over the next two years. The White paper proposes that international migration should contribute to national goals such as skills acquisition.

The White Paper has several clear statements that favor skilled migration. Firstly, it states that South Africa has not been successful in attracting enough highly skilled foreigners. This has been mainly attributed to an international migration policy that is not linked to skills development and investment priorities. Therefore, the main objective of the White Paper is a simplified and predictable immigration administration that contributes to the economic growth of the country

The White Paper acknowledges that South Africa has not adopted a clear and coherent integration policy leading to immigrant's failure to fully adapt and integrate into the host country. It further states that the current policies are outdated and there are no clear strategies for retaining those immigrants that have necessary skills and resources. The White Paper recommends a global intelligence-based approach rather than the current mechanical application of migrant rules and policy. Therefore, the White paper encourages regulation and coordination across sectors of the government. In that effect, the following was proposed on the migration- integration policies of migrants:

- More attention needed in linking migrant provisions to existing legislation from other departments;
- More reviews needed in by-laws meant for managing the settlement and integration of migrants into communities thereby providing guidance to migrants; and
- Agreements to be reached with departments, provincial and local governments in terms of the legal framework. More engagement is needed with national organisations/institutions for example banks, to ensure those migrants with granted residence status have access to their services. (Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs, 2017).

Although there is no direct reference to women spouse immigrants and labour integration, the White Paper on International Migration 2017, proposes great improvement in the South Africa integration policy framework. Acknowledging the skills of immigrants will greatly improve labour integration and access to financial services for skilled women spouses.

The promises stated in the White Paper will shape the new South African immigration landscape and will align it to the regional integration of the country in the SADC and African Union. There is hope that there will be easier criteria for fellow Africans to easily obtain work visas upon entry. In addition, there is clarity in the proposed legislation for visa free travel within Africa during the coming years. The White Paper is a clear statement that favors skilled migration and regional integration. However, it is important to state that the real challenge will be to draft proper legislation, which reflects the liberal and open suggestions of the proposed White Paper.

### 5.5 Recommendations on addressing gender gaps in South Africa migration policies

From the analysis done in this chapter it is evident that gender gaps are evident in the South African migration policies. Contemporary international migration is better understood by incorporating its gender dimensions. The migration criteria for eligibility, duration, and restrictions in integration all have gender implications specific to economic, social and geographical context. More gendered research and research capacity building is needed in under researched areas of gender-migration and formal labour integration to provide the knowledge for context-specific and evidence-based migration policies. National capacity-building by both government and research institutes for gender research and policy analysis is also needed to enable the development of evidence-based migration policies. Such research could inform and enable policies to better take account of the contribution that gender makes in migration management.

Alignment of gender equality strategies with overall policy planning is important in ensuring that gender policies are incorporated in migration and do not remain at the periphery of government action. A gender sensitive and women rights-based approach is important to all migration policy discussions increasing efforts to mainstream gender in migration practices. Policymakers can merge employment policies to operate jointly with migration policies strengthening development efforts while respecting the human and labour rights that allow migrants to obtain employment opportunities, health services, education and other services in countries of origin as in countries of destination. Further steps are needed to strengthen the capacities and resources on all levels of government to engage in gender sensitive policymaking that works hand in hand with employment and decent work for all migrants.

There is also need to promote training programmes focused on gender equality and mainstreaming in policy so that new programmes can integrate the concepts of migration and gender equality. This is important in providing policymakers with tools and techniques that are essential in developing and implementing gender in migration policy. Training improves the knowledge and skills of migration policy makers to enable them to bring out some relevant policy changes that incorporate gender equality in migration. Gender-responsive training should also be done for potential migrants informing them about the migration process. Information can be disseminated teaching migrants the risks and their rights both at home and abroad. Women migrants can be taught the legal channels of migration, questions to ask recruiters, and where to receive sources of assistance at each stage in the migration process. Government and non-governmental organisations can be equipped to provide legal, socio-economic and counseling services in transit and destination countries while law enforcement can be trained to handle rights violations in a gender-sensitive way.

Raising awareness to the general public and policy makers is important in the inclusion of gender in migration policies. Both the public and policymakers should be informed of rights of migrant women, the potential exploitation and human rights violations they may encounter, and their valuable contribution to development. This will generate support to create laws and policies that safeguard their rights.

### 5.6 Conclusion

From the above gender analysis, more gender mainstreaming still needs to be done in migration and labour policies for successful formal labour integration. Migrant women spouses who are dependent visa holders have been facing barriers in acquiring decent work in South Africa because of the policies that are in place, an infringement of their human security, wellbeing and women's rights. The research findings in this study indicate that there is lack of inclusion of gender needs in migration and labour policies.

Great strides and improvements have been noted however, with more women migrants being educated in South Africa. Policymakers can assist towards the promotion of gender equality in the labour market. More focus can be drawn on women accessing better employment and new labour market opportunities that rise as the country grows thereby contributing to the development process. Gender-labour policies can focus more on access to better education and training programs and access to childcare. Other supportive institutions and legal measures can be placed to lighten the burden of domestic duties for women. South Africa can also increase consistency between international legal/policy frameworks on women's economic empowerment and its own policies and programmes. It can do this by reaffirming that women's rights are firmly rooted in the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action and CEDAW as key instruments for their full achievement.

South Africa can analyse its initiatives in improving women labour force participation whether they are complying with women's labour provisions within the ILO, BPfA, CEDAW standards and the SDGs. Monitoring and follow-ups will consider into account the gaps and lack of progress against these international frameworks. Gender inclusion in migration and labour regulations facilitates successful labour integration and improves women migrant's economic security. South Africa can therefore benefit from the untapped hidden skills that migrant women spouses have for positive economic advancement.

## CHAPTER SIX

## POSSIBLE INTERVENTIONS IN INTEGRATING SKILLED ACCOMPANYING WOMEN SPOUSES INTO THE FORMAL LABOUR MARKET

### 6.1 Introduction

Apart from national economy benefits, labour integration of skilled migrant workers is an important tool for addressing poverty and inequality among migrant communities. As developed countries continue to fight for skilled migrants, South Africa as the largest economy in Africa, has aptly followed suit in tapping the international skilled labour market. However, despite this progressive stance on paper, there are several loopholes which often makes it unattractive for skilled workers. In particular, with regards to employment rights of female spouses of skilled workers.

Chapter 6 outlines possible interventions that can be undertaken to improve migrant labour integration in the formal labour market for skilled migrant women spouses in South Africa. I particularly focus on women as their migration in South Africa mostly falls under what is often termed "chain-migration", 'trailer spouse' or kinship-based where family reunification is recognized as the primary purpose of the trans-boundary movement. I therefore deliberately leave other two broad visa categories in South Africa which are skills-based or ii) humanitarian-based where refugees and asylum seekers fall under. Unlike the latter two categories, the kinship nature of the family reunification category results in spouses immediately getting trapped under visas that classify them as dependents without working rights. The overall goal of this chapter seeks to provide possible interventions that can be adopted by South Africa to improve the labour integration of these women who hold the accompany spouse visa.

The bulk of these interventions were paraphrased based on the conceptual recommendations that were raised by the study respondents and together with comparisons from other nations that tap on the integration of migrants in the global skilled labour market. Access to employment for immigrants requires recognition of qualifications and enabling migrant workers` legislation for efficient integration of migrants in a manner that is beneficial to the economy of the host country. For example, the findings of the research study revealed that skilled migrant women spouses in South Africa need legislation and policy assistance in labour integration. The migrant women mainly raised concerns on the hindrances that the 'Accompanying spouse dependent visa' brings in acquiring formal employment regardless of their skills. The need for migration policies to include them as independent individuals rather as dependents was the main finding of this study. These are some of the responses the women in this study stated:

*"Can the visa be improved to enable us to work, and is it possible to look at what migrant rights are saying about employment…"* (Jackie)

*"More improvement can be made to this dependent spouse visa, to allow us to live our lives…."* (Sandra)

*"Why not give us a visa that permits us to legally stay in South Africa, working…"* (Marlene)

*"The visa should just allow us to work. We have the skills…"* (Patie)

Basing on some suggestions that the respondents highlighted, I have also cited case studies of other global economies tapping on the international labour market for comparative purposes. Several possible interventions can be adopted to facilitate migrant women integration in labour without

Page | 169

jeopardizing job opportunities of the local citizens. Even though national needs and integration capacities differ among countries due to various socioeconomic factors, there are several learning points which can be helpful and adopted by South Africa.

## 6.2 Establish an integration policy

Immigrant's access to the labour market is vital in the integration process in foreign countries. The economic involvement of labour migrants is to be maximized in agreement with the principles of a proper managed migration policy. Labour access concerns for migrants can be given utmost attention under the integration policy bracket in order to address gender disparities among migrant populations. Social integration is likely to assist labour market integration either way (Spencer et al., 2007).

An integration policy determines that early integration measures are directed towards immigrants regardless of their permit status (European Network of Migrant Women and the European Women's Lobby, 2012). In this policy, immigrants are provided with basic information about the host country, and the service system. Integration policy also include migrant rights, obligations and how they can access different integration programmes (European Network of Migrant Women and European Women's Lobby, 2012). An integration act will promote the participation and influence of immigrants in the host society whilst maintaining high levels of migration management (Briggs, 2013).

Germany has a national integration strategy that provides a framework for conducting immigrant integration programmes (Thym, 2016). Due to the high influx of foreigners and asylum seekers in 2015, Germany established an Integration Act passed in 2016. The Act makes provisions for labour market integration of foreigners with prospects of granting them residence permits (Thym, 2016).

These provisions include language, civic and cultural courses which help migrants integrate into their host communities. Canada is another example of a country that has had successful integration. The Canadian model of managed integration based on immigration selection, citizenship, settlement, and multiculturalism policies has been largely successful in integrating immigrants to that country (Rose and Preston, 2016).

It is also important to note that South African citizens seem prepared to accept and welcome foreigners if their economic impact is demonstrably positive. Hence, skills and investor-friendly integration policies would be readily accepted by nationals. Neocosmos (2006) makes the following suggestion with regard to this*: 'If temporary residential and social rights were to be granted to all who wish to settle and work in South Africa, then after a period of one or two years, extension or maybe permanent residence may well be provided exclusively on the idea of profitable employment. In this way migration could be regularized, the police and other state agents would have less power over migrants, and the state would give a lead on democratic anti-xenophobic practices. At constant time any criminals may well be additional simply controlled as they'd be traceable by the state. Furthermore, such a requirement is probably going to assemble widespread support as analysis has shown that South Africans tend to welcome foreigners who have an economic impact that is positive'* (Neocosmos, 2006).

Despite the heavy influx of immigrants, South Africa still has no explicit integration policy for foreigners. Integration policies that intersect with other major policy areas such as protection of migrant human rights, employment-labour market and citizenship are urgently required.  Several intervention points that can be used for successful integration were identified. For example, integration can be localised to municipal levels to have a grassroot approach in communities. Such an approach has been largely successful in Australia and New Zealand where local governments

Page | 171

identify migrant skill needs and conduct government-assisted immigration programs. In these programs immigrants are immediately labour integrated in communities where there are skill demands. Where communities recognize and accept the need for migrant workers, this can have spin-off benefits including management of xenophobic attitudes as communities will be aware of the need of the foreign workers.

Integration policies should be driven by facts rather than by misconceptions, therefore there has to be good data available, both on the migrant population and on the effectiveness of prior policies (Konhle-Seidl, 2018). Lack of solid statistics about the socio-demographic characteristics of new immigrants is one of the main hindrances that policymakers face in creating adequate policy responses to migration influxes in destination countries. A detailed picture of the target group will offer essential indicators to policymakers that needs to be addressed. More systematic monitoring of the current policies is needed to ensure successful up-scaling and translation into sustainable policy measures. Monitoring and Evaluation teams can be placed that record the essential data and the progress made so far. This enables policymakers to recognize gaps and build on addressing them.

Effective integration policies should cater for all immigrants regardless of their status and gender. As the skills of the husband are acknowledged, the same should be done for the wife in order to avoid gender imbalances in the family due to absolute dependency on a spouse. In the case of migrant workers in South Africa, it is widely acknowledged that in most cases it is the husbands who mostly come with working rights whilst women are reduced to be dependents like their children. Integration policies will therefore be essential in providing information about migrant's rights and the incorporation of women into the host society. This can be coupled with culture orientation and information sessions about labour laws in South Africa. With such interventions, a

smooth integration of migrants economically, socially and culturally in the host society can be realized in South Africa.

### 6.3 Gender mainstreaming in integration policies

Gender mainstreaming involves analysing the existing status quo with the purpose of identifying inequalities and developing policies which aim to redress these inequalities. Gendered structural barriers play a great role in migrant women's ability to obtain employment in the host country. Source and destination countries should consider gender needs in their migration policies. Migration, at first glance, seems to be a neutral process, but it is directly related to social and gender differences, since men and women migrate for different reasons and experiences. Immigration regulations, as highlighted in the previous chapters, hinder labour integration as many immigrant women enter countries of destination with a family or dependent visa under which they are not expected to find work or contribute to the economy of the host country (Riano and Bhagdadi, 2007). Studies done in Switzerland in 2007, revealed that the country addressed barriers posed by family-related migration for skilled immigrants and changed its labour-immigration policies to cater for them. Approximately 43% of Switzerland's immigrants migrate for reasons of marriage or family reunification, whereas only 26% of the immigrants enter for employment. Sweden has also made advanced changes in its labour integration policies to cater for new immigrants (OECD, 2014).

Female immigrants are rarely taken into consideration in policy formation and implementation therefore more attempts are needed to gender mainstream them for empowerment and equality (International Organisation for Migration (IOM) and Organisation for Economic Cooperation (OECD), 2014; UN Women and International Organisation for Migration, 2016). Immigration policies can incorporate the growing number of female immigrants through gender mainstreaming

which entails integrating gender issues in implementation of policies and programs. Gender mainstreaming is a means to achieve equality in migration policies. Different needs of migrant sub-groups such as migrant women spouses can be addressed notably their residence status and employment equity in the host country. This was cited by some of the respondents of this study as cited below:

*"Can the visa be improved to enable us to work and is it possible to look at what migrant rights are saying about employment…"* (Jackie).

*"Our requirements and needs as women foreigners can be put in these policies…"* (Precious)

*"May be a change or improvement in the visa will help…"* (Carla)

*"It would be better if foreign women were given attention and help in these policies…"* (Rudo)

*"Foreigners especially women should be put in these policies…"* (Dudzai)

Gender based approaches are instrumental in successful labour integration of women spouses. Women immigrants can be incorporated in the activities in organisations responsible for the regulation of migration process and protection of labour migrants. A gender-based approach in migration policies will facilitate understanding of migrant women spouses' experiences. Programmes or strategies can be created to address their needs in labour integration. This ensures that migration policies do not discriminate migrant women directly or indirectly. The programmes developed can have monitoring and evaluation projects that assess the trends and progress of labour

integration for women. Migrant women spouses face various barriers that hinder them from successful labour integration such as non-supportive visa regulations, work authorisation restrictions and ethnicity/gender inequalities. Once their needs are incorporated in policy, through planning, monitoring and evaluation, integration becomes easier. More responses from the women supported this:

*"I feel like women foreigners are not supported by the South African government…"* (Natsayi)

*"I feel challenges are different if you are a woman than a man. You are expected to rely on the husband always. We need assistance on this…"* (Rutendo)

*"Women should not be attached to the husband's permit, they should just give a separate one…"* (Sandra)

It would be essential to include advocacy tools that promote gender mainstreaming in key South Africa migration policies and programs as highlighted in Chapter 5. Furthermore, gender-impact assessments of migration-labour policies can be done to ensure that policies do not discriminate women migrant rights. Policies should ensure that migrant women are granted full human rights and are able to access services and resources meant for basic rights. Women migrants should receive the same standards, protection and access to all services as non-migrants. Women migrants should be protected regardless of their migratory status (Ghosh, 2009; United Nations Development Programme, 2009). Migrant policies should make sure that women must have access to employment, shelter, health services, regardless of their legal status (United Nations General Assembly, 2013). The rights of migrant women should be legally protected and they should have access to legal services. To establish effective implementation of gender mainstreaming in

migration policies preparation and planning is priority. Key elements are important to consider, firstly, it is important to set up a plan for the implementation of gender mainstreaming, with defined steps and milestones. This includes assigning tasks, responsibilities and communicating the plan to different stakeholders involved in the migration management. Secondly, sufficient resources need to be made available because effective gender mainstreaming requires budgeting and time. Resources for awareness-raising and capacity-building initiatives are to be acquired. The skills of experts mainly from gender and migration research institutions might also be needed. Thirdly, there is need to involve policy stakeholders throughout the policy cycle to address concerns, expectations, and views of the target groups such as skilled migrant women. It is recommended to affirm opportunities and structures for stakeholder involvement and consultations into the policy process. Fourth, there is need to set in place accountability mechanisms to ensure an adequate follow-up of the policy implementation. Monitoring and evaluation of the process ensures effectiveness coupled with transparency and accountability. Lastly, policy makers need to build knowledge concerning gender equality and good practices for gender mainstreaming to make the approach more effective. Data can be collected and information on indicators recorded. Progress can be reported so that effectiveness of gender mainstreaming is monitored and assessed to see if there is room for improvement in the future.

Relevant institutional mechanisms may be established to ensure that commitments and recommendations that were ratified are implemented. CEDAW Recommendations that promote gender equality among women need to be implemented. Furthermore, South Africa needs to ensure that UN 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development migration related goals and targets are included in its national policies and they are implemented. For example, Sustainable Development Goals 5, 8 and target 10.7 encourage gender equality, promotion of decent work for all, reduction in inequality within countries and promotion of orderly/safe migration all vital concerns that need to

be represented in migration policies. An adoption of global and national indicators of the SDG's is also vital to effectively monitor and measure the progress. This can be done by integrating a gender sensitive approach on the activities that are already being undertaken. Gender aspects can be introduced to the main actors involved in the implementation of the SDG programme.

It is important to grant an independent residence or work permit for the spouse of the principal legal status holder at an early opportunity regardless of income and ethnicity, to protect their rights and guarantee the facilitation of labour integration. This possible solution grants autonomy to dependent visa holders and gives them authorisation to work.

### 6.4 Evidence-based policy making in labour-integration policies

In evidence-based policy making, pilot projects have been identified as important tools to create 'evidence' of policy innovations (Sutcliffe and Court, 2005). As sufficient evidence to implement single measures can be scarce there is an important need to start testing possible interventions before they are introduced on a larger scale. It is advisable to engage researchers and conduct pilot studies where participants are randomly assigned to an intervention, before it is implemented on a larger scale. For more accuracy in assessing the effectiveness of a measure, there is a need to perform randomised experiments within certain policy areas.

Evidence-based policy making comprises a set of methods which informs and directs the policy process, rather than directly affecting the results or goals of the policy. It is a rational and systematic approach. The pursuit of evidence-based policy assumes that policy decisions can be better informed by supporting evidence that includes rational analysis. It is sufficient to state that policies based on systematic evidence produce better results. This approach incorporates evidence-based

practices. The evidence needed will include identifying new problems, such as labour integration of skilled immigrant women or the accumulation of evidence regarding the magnitude of a problem. Identifying problems informs relevant policy actors areas that need addressing. An important factor here is the credibility of evidence and the way evidence is communicated to the relevant policymakers. Policymakers should ensure that their understanding of the situation and the different options are detailed so that they make informed decisions about which policy to implement. The evidence gathered should be more credible. Monitoring structures can be placed afterwards to ensure effectiveness of the policy. Young and Quinn (2002) state that '*a thorough evaluation process is needed to determine the effectiveness of the policy implemented at the same time providing basis for future decision-making'*. During monitoring and evaluation, it is vital that the evidence is objective and relevant, and it is communicated successfully into the policy process. Evidence-based policy making was adopted in Canada where several recommendations were put forward at the Canadian Science Policy making conference in 2015. Proceedings from the conference stated research can influence policy making by establishing a framework for evidence to encourage integration of science into practice. There is a greater need to integrate evidence and bring it to policymakers in a meaningful way. This evidence should be accessible to policy makers disseminated in a way that is understood by scientists, politicians and the public (7th Canadian Science Policy Conference, 2015).

### 6.5 Engage non-governmental organisations in integration policy making

Non-government organisations (NGOs) both local and international have the capacity to inform national policy making in migration integration and citizenship. NGO's and the government can take up initiatives as partners and facilitate policy making favorable to migrant women. It is imperative that policy making structures relevant to migration are clearly outlined so that channels

Page | 178

where NGO's can exert influence are identified (Spencer, 2006). These organisations are important partners in promoting regular labour migration ensuring respect for the integrity and rights of labour migrants. This approach was taken by Ireland, where its government consulted and engaged with NGO's in migration policy making. Policy makers in Ireland identified specific channels where NGO's can be of assistance to them these included:

•       providing migrant information about their needs for the development of appropriate services,

•       building strong evidence base for policy making,

•       identifying problem areas within migrant communities and create policy solutions that are feasible.

•       identifying problems early before the government

•       service provision where certain services can be effectively provided by a non-governmental body (Spencer, 2006)

By using these channels, NGO's fulfilled a range of roles that were valuable in integration policy making.  South Africa can also adopt such initiatives in identifying the migrant needs of skilled women spouses and improve labour integration by creating policies that are tailor made for this specific population. NGO's can also influence government ministers and officials indirectly through various channels such as the media and other organisations that influence policy themselves such as statutory agencies, trade unions, employers and religious organisations (Spencer, 2006).

Non-government organisations offer important insights into problems that arise in migration settlement and integration. NGO's act as sources of knowledge and initiators of innovative approaches for migrant women and those who are vulnerable within this group for example asylum seekers, sex workers or victims of trafficking. They can therefore be used as valuable resources when planning active migrant labour/integration policies. To acquire and maintain the legal status in the host country, migrants need information, resources and support (Kontos, 2009). Non-profit/ non-government organisations can assist in delivering these services encouraging labour integration of migrants by assisting in the implementation of integration programs, policies and procedures. NGO's not only co-operate with governments on policy-related issues but facilitate grass root projects that can assist in labour integration. In Ireland for example, NGO's such as Amnesty International, Cross Care Migrant Project and Immigrant Council of Ireland provide immigrants with information about their rights and entitlements as foreigners. These organisations also collaborate with the government of Ireland in identifying problem areas in integration that can be addressed in migration policies (Quinn et al., 2007).

South African migrant NGOs can participate in planning and implementation of labour integration. They can create workshops that teach employers about immigration laws, gender equality, women migrant rights and empowerment in host countries. The Consortium for Refugees and Migrants and People against Suffering, Oppression and Poverty in South Africa are examples of NGOs that are promoting migrant rights. NGO's can also step in to fill the gaps in the provision of health care or medical benefits, capital for business initiatives that skilled women migrant spouses lack. At the same time, these organisations can also offer advice and career guidance towards adequate employment for the qualifications the women possess.

### 6.6 Involve more migrants in civic participation

Civic participation is a form of political participation outside the traditional politics. An active way in which immigrants can engage in society is being active in organisations, local politics and in immigrant politics that involve migrant organisations (Morales, 2011). Civic integration involves the political-legal dimension of integration where immigrants are included in the civic institutions of the receiving country. In this regard, citizens become an accepted part of society in civic terms. Civic integration, therefore means becoming a citizen of the receiving society, but not yet a full citizen with nationality and full political rights. Morales (2011) assessed that political integration of migrants in terms of their ability to use political actions allows them to seek to influence decision-making.

Civic participation is form of political participation taken in a broad sense (Gsir, 2014). Mobilising immigrants to be involved in political participation can assist in understanding the plight they face in host countries. Absence of citizenship or limitations to labour integration or political rights in the host country does not prevent migrants for participating civically. One of collective forms of civic action that contribute to civic integration is for migrants, especially women migrants to join or create an association. These organisations can be migrant organisations, hometown associations, consultative bodies or even bi-national associations. Women migrant involvement in such organisations can bring forth issues that need to be addressed.

The participation of migrants in civil and politics depends upon existing rights such as the right to belong to trade unions and the right to vote and the existence of institutions such as migrant associations. The rights of migrants in belonging or forming a trade union is rather limited in emerging countries but migrants enjoy those rights in some advanced countries. In several

established countries, labour unions, concerned about the enforcement of labour standards by deregulation and dropping membership, have adopted a more welcoming stance towards migrants in civic participation. These labour unions have support measures to ensure their equality with the nationals in employment. It is useful for migrants to have forums where they can have dialogue with both public and private sector representatives on policy issues that have a direct bearing on their life and well-being.

Migrant organisations are very diverse and can include cultural, ethnic, regional, social, professional organisations (Brettel, 2012). De Haas (2006) stated that a migrant organisation as *"any kind of organisation consisting mainly of migrants and their descendants, irrespective of the specific activities of such organisations."* Migrant associations are also called "ethnic" associations because they are oriented towards issues linked mainly to the country of residence (Portes et al., 2008). Among the various migrant organisations, scholars have recognized diaspora organisations, as (civic) hometown associations or even transnational organisations (Ramakrishnana and Viramontes, 2006). Hometown associations are *"organisations that allow immigrants from the same city or region to maintain ties with and materially support their places of origin"* (Orozco and Rouse, 2007). Hometown associations can also contribute to the integration of immigrants in the host countries as they are organized points of contact and coordination between immigrants, original and destination countries.

A good example of migrants involved in civic participation is Latin American migrants' involvement in American civic and political life (Fox and Bada, 2009). These migrants have made considerable progress in creating new migrant-led organisations, such as hometown associations, faith-based organisations, NGOs, indigenous right groups, community media and Latin workers' organisations. Latin Americans are joining existing US organisations, such as unions, community

associations, churches, civil rights organisations, business associations and media groups in the United States (Fox and Bada, 2009).

## 6.7 Improved access to basic information about living and working in South Africa

Information about migrant and their rights is not systematically provided in destination countries. Such important information includes how to apply for employment and opportunities provided, how to get NGO assistance or how to access interpretation or translation services, or other forms of support. In some cases, the information provided to migrants is outdated, inaccurate and incomplete (European Network of National Human Rights Institutions, 2017). In other countries, migrants do not fully understand the information they receive. Migrants are exposed to stressful circumstances that are often worsened by language-related issues and by possibly receiving information only on selected communication channels. It is may be possible that they might not be able to memorise and understand all the relevant information given to them when they migrate (European Network of National Human Rights Institutions, 2017). Access to information about their rights and options for legal assistance is particularly decisive for migrants' situation and it is considered throughout the European and international legal frameworks. Informing migrants on their rights impacts on their empowerment and autonomy in the destination country. Basic information provided for migrants should be in a concise, intelligible and easy to read form also in a language that the applicant understands. Where information is provided orally it has to have the support of a professional interpreter and in a visual form. Information provided for migrants should be adapted according to gender and take into account needs of minors or persons with specific needs and individual circumstances.

One complaint that was echoed among respondents in this study was the seemingly lack of coherent and systematic migration management in the case of available information on migrants' rights and institutional support for skilled women under the Accompanying Spouse dependent visa. The women respondent below stated:

*"Maybe if there were employment agencies that only help migrants, it would be better, and they would give us more information about migration and employment in South Africa…"* (Precious).

*"I would like to read more about what I deserve as a migrant. That information lacks in South Africa, the internet is broad…"* (Lana)

Studies in the United Kingdom that involve new labour migrants have emphasized the need for improved access to basic information on living and working in the country. This information included the process involved in opening bank accounts for immigrants, interpreting employment law for migrants, clarity on legal entitlements and access to basic needs such as health services, education and housing (Spencer et al., 2007). At the municipality level there is sufficient evidence shows that steps are being taken to provide such information (Spencer et al., 2007).

A United Kingdom Audit Commission done in 2007 highlighted that local information packs play a pivotal role in providing information for new arrivals and in educating employers and agencies. In West Lancashire and Cornwall for example, such information packs are distributed through employers, but libraries, service providers, community and faith-based organisations can also play an important role. Migrants who are better informed on arrival about their rights and responsibilities, employment access, housing and the necessary health systems are better equipped to deal with difficulties encountered in labour market integration, at an early stage (Spencer et al.,

2007). Respondents in this research study, all agreed that whilst they acknowledge the need to have their immigration status tied to their husbands, there was need for more institutional facilitation for them to gain legal rights to employment. This is cited below:

*"We do not know much about our rights as foreign women…"* (Ruvhe)

*"As South Africa, there should be institutions that assist foreign women in migration and employment…"* (Precious).

Another example, Tara a Psychology graduate, came here on Accompanying Spouse Dependent visa but with a burning desire to pursue her career in South Africa. However, because of the restrictive costs of the application of change of status which were compounded by the introduction of the VFS Visa facilitation centers, costs of visa application have doubled making it impossible for her to lodge another application on her husband`s meager salary. Furthermore, it was not clear if she could qualify for the Zimbabwe special dispensation permit (ZSP) that was later introduced. Even if she qualified, she stated that the ZSP was not a viable option for her as some of the conditions that came with it included going back to home country after three years. There is therefore need of institutional support including information dissemination to address the needs of this group of migrant workers.

Furthermore, institutionally driven social dialogue on migration related matters was cited by many respondents as a great need to improve integration in the labour market. The Green Paper on International Migration, 2016 proposed an increase in migration management in legislation which includes more policy and operational guidance in matters related to labour mobility, migrant integration, recruitment and placement is a good starting point. However, more can be done to

address the needs of spouses on accompanying spouse visas. Through dialogue, migration management can be a useful tool to also address the rights of female migrant.

In South Africa, non-government organisations can carry out development projects and sustainable support systems that encourage labour market integration of women spouse migrants. These NGO's can also provide information about migrant integration services upon arrival. By partnering with relevant authorities such as the Department of Home Affairs, information can also be disseminated at major ports of entry. Since the mandate of the Department of Home Affairs involves facilitating immigration through the country's borders, it can assist in organizing information dissemination centers, training workshops for both the locals and foreigners that facilitate integration. Migrant women spouses can particularly benefit from this prior employment whilst spending time at home. One woman respondent cited this:

> *"It would be helpful if information about South Africa's immigration can be given to us at specific areas. Cause the internet is broad…"* (Miri).

### 6.8 Provide basic education about migration to local nationals

South Africa government faces an educational challenge regarding migration, and it is unable to focus on only one group in the society. South Africa can manage migration better by providing citizens with sufficient knowledge about migrants, immigrants and refugees through various channels particularly through both print and social media. It is helpful to encourage Africanisation and internationalisation through the media and through public pronouncements of opinion-makers as suggested by Crush and Pendleton, (2004). This strategy can only be achieved by working with schools, educational colleges and tertiary institutions to include issues such as citizenship and

xenophobia in their curriculum. The government can work with these institutions to emphasize to the public the positive impact that immigration has on the South Africa's economy and society and can use examples from migrant integrated countries such as the United Kingdom, Sweden, Canada and Switzerland. The media must play a pivotal role in this educational process. The following suggestions can be included:

- The journalism curriculum can be examined to determine how journalists can be trained and skilled in creating a good environment for effective intercultural communication with migrants especially when it relates to discrimination against other black migrants

- Tertiary institutions have taught courses regarding journalism and communication may incorporate detailed information on migrants, refugees, asylum seekers in their learning modules

- Media editors in both print and online versions should have a clear editorial policy that encourages coverage on refugee and migrant issues

- Stakeholders, researchers and other experts on migrant matters should publish more catalogues of media sources that can be used by journalists as background in covering such issues

- Sensitive, outlawing and negative language should not be used in the media in reference to migrants and different categories of migrants should be acknowledged as suggested by Danso and Macdonald, (2000)

- Journalists and editors should be pay attention and be accurate about immigration statistics on their reports. Statistics must be sourced from credible official sites and there should be critical assessment of these sources and thorough referencing made

- The media on its own or working with other stakeholders can seek ways of disregarding harmful migrant stereotypes

- Journalists, trade unions and other professional media forums may create media networks against xenophobia. These stakeholders should assist in heading campaigns for migration-integration as adopted practice in South Africa.

- Migrant communities and NGOs may also provide detailed information packs and regular updated newsletters and fact sheets that contain timely and country-specific information to the media.

In terms of improving migrant education, government can also work with other countries in the SADC region to devise and implement public education programmes that emphasize migrant tolerance and highlight common interests.

### 6.9 Government initiatives

*Municipalities*

Even though migration policies are set nationally, social integration dynamics are often tackled at local level (Green, 2007). Such is the case with South Africa where, despite an elaborate skills shortage list, many migrant women remain unemployed due to constraints listed above. For critical sectors such as health, there has been a shortage of, for example, nurses in provinces such as KwaZulu-Natal. In other top destinations for migrant workers, local authorities have been empowered to identify their skills needs in order to facilitate targeted employment of migrants. In most cases, barriers are completely removed to ensure immediate employment. This is the case with countries such as New Zealand and Australia where local municipalities facilitate the integration of

migrant workers guided by the national policy, but still satisfying local needs whilst fostering the needs of migrant communities.

Elsewhere, upon the peak of migrant and refugee crisis in 2015, EU policy makers across government and private organisations have been working cooperatively to help newcomers integrate successfully in the host countries using municipalities. Such a proactive approach comes from the understanding of the ever-changing migration patterns, the concomitant needs of migrant workers and the subsequent opportunities that lie for local governments (Syrett and Lyons 2007).

Municipalities and civil organisations have been at the forefront of launching initiatives that assess the skills of migrants upon arrival in order to offer support in employment transition in the destination countries (Hooper et al., 2017). Municipal governments have no direct responsibility for immigrant selection/integration, but they play a great role in developing welcoming communities and spaces of employment since new immigrants live in local communities and interact with municipal services upon their arrival. It is upon the interest of municipal governments to ensure that immigrants can support themselves and contribute to the economy. Multiple stakeholders that include government agencies, embassies and local municipalities can all participate in addressing problems raised by migrant women spouses by promoting networks and forums to jointly set integration priorities.

Studies have shown that decentralization and flexibility in migration policy implementation is effective as was done by Denmark and Sweden (Jorgesen, 2012). Jorgesen (2012) highlighted that the Danish central government, designs the integration policy framework whist local municipalities are responsible for implementing and managing integration. In that way, cities can be able to establish their own integration plans and adapt policies that align to the parameters set at the national

level. Municipal governments play a crucial role in migrant settlement in Canada (Rose and Preston, 2016). In Ontario, municipal governments have the local knowledge of support services needed for immigrants and the employment opportunities available which allows them to inform provincial or national implementation of immigrant/integration strategies (Rose and Preston, 2016).

Municipalities can be responsible for implementing and monitoring the labour integration process. In Canada, municipalities establish committees that include employers, local service providers and migrants to coordinate, promote and offer support services that encourage labour integration (Rose and Preston, 2016). Local municipalities may adapt centrally designed integration policies to suit local needs during the implementation process. South African government can adopt such approaches and use municipalities to disseminate migration information through resource centers that will assist in helping integration. Migration resource centers/services can be established for foreigners to offer information, guidance and career counseling. This will inform migrant women spouses about the labour market in greater detail. Not only that, the information centers can assist the migrant women in career guidance and job searching for example employment agencies that facilitate individual assessments of women migrants' capabilities and counseling.

### 6.10 Engaging employers

Employers play a key role in recruiting and selection process of migrants as employees even though they are not directly involved in bilateral exchanges regarding labour migration between countries of origin and destination countries (Enchautegui, 2015). In countries that have no distinct integration policy such as the United States, the private sector plays an imperative role in assisting immigrant integration where the government sorely cannot cater for this need (Enchautegui, 2015). Immigrants may face prejudice from employers on the basis of their background, ethnicity and other

stereotypical characteristics (Green, 2007). In many countries that have been successful in labour integration, employers have made significant efforts to support, connect and integrate migrants in their workplaces. This trend has been noticeable in countries at the forefront of the recent European upsurge in refugee arrivals from 2013 and in countries which receive resettled refugees. Employer engagement builds on both corporate social responsibility and economic advantages from harnessing the skills brought by refugees (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

Confusion amongst employers about who is eligible and not permitted to work, and about the intricacies of clarifying permission to work documentation and permits is a barrier to employment for some new arrivals (Green, 2007). Potential employers often have little understanding of the formal qualifications that migrants obtained at an educational institution in another country therefore are unable to assign value to migrants' prior education (Castagnone et al, 2013). Employer uncertainty about the value of the qualifications and work experience that immigrants hold presents a significant barrier in labour market entry immigrants without experience in Sweden. Validation of competences and qualifications will help those entering the labour market to overcome this uncertainty. Successful labour integration must involve employers in order to build trust, target areas that have skills shortages. It is also important to involve employers in the integral part of the certification process (OECD, 2014). In other professions such as self-regulated and licensed occupations, foreign qualifications and experience are seldom fully acknowledged or accepted (Castagnone et al, 2013). The education/training obtained in the country of origin may be insufficient or different because the organisation of tasks at the workplace or the technologies used there might differ between the origin and destination countries. In this situation, adaptation to prevailing practices in the host country is required (Castagnone et al, 2013). Therefore, it becomes imperative to manage migration policies by engaging with these employers in immigration policies

from the beginning. Immigration policies can be catalysts for employer engagement. Those countries that have employment- and skill-based immigration such as Australia, Canada, and New Zealand, involve employers in the integration and engagement of immigrants, prior the immigrant's arrival in the host country (Enchautegui, 2015). In these countries, employer engagement in labour integration becomes part of a broad range of integration policies expressed at different levels of their governments (Enchautegui, 2015).

Nonetheless, several countries have joined forces with employers to conduct recruiting campaigns, identifying potential candidates and providing information about their migration plans (Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2012). Such job fairs are held regularly in some OECD member countries such as Romania, Italy, Spain, and certain countries of origin have also partnered with main destination countries in developing similar initiatives (Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2012). South Africa can adopt such initiatives to assist in bridging the gap between employers and foreign job seekers.

From the research findings, it has been discovered that employers dismiss skilled migrant women spouses seeking jobs because of their 'accompanying spouse dependent' visa permits. This was highlighted by the respondents below:

> *"Maybe a system can be created that teaches employers about our visas. Can the government help us on that …"* (Rufaro)

> *"The employers do not entertain this visa that the government gives us… In other words, we are not required to legally work here…"* (Kaira)

*"Employers only want a work permit or permanent resident permit. This visa that we hold is always turned away…"* (Marlene)

This phenomenon of rejection of immigrants by employers was highlighted by Green (2007), stating that employers usually have a negative attitude in recruiting immigrants because they are highly unlikely to go out of their way in developing the migrants' skills or ensuring they have the required documentation for employment. South Africa needs to bridge the gap between employers and skilled migrants for improved labour integration.

*Employer training workshops and online portals*

Employer engagement is vital in successful labour integration because employers also play an important role in training and hiring of immigrants (Hooper et al., 2017). Successful labour market integration of migrants can only be achieved through joint efforts of relevant actors that involves employers and their associations, civil society organisations, trade unions, and migrants themselves. Employers can provide opportunities to immigrants through on-the-job training, internships, apprenticeships and ultimately employment. Stakeholders such as chambers of commerce and employer associations can assist in navigating the legal framework. Trade unions and employers can create a welcoming environment for immigrants in the workplace ensuring that their rights (particularly women rights) and obligations as employees are clearly respected and articulated.

According to Pattni, (2007), employers can recruit, perform mock interviews, educate and inform immigrants about the potential employees they are looking for. Furthermore, employers can be taught about migration and asylum regulations, integration and non-discrimination of migrants' especially migrant subgroups such as women spouses and other family members. Through these education workshops, employers can be made aware of the difficulties and implications raised

regarding temporary visas, migrant work rights and labour integration. Employers can further assist immigrants by creating and engaging in community-based mentoring programs, providing advanced job training, fast tracked recognition of foreign work experience and educational qualifications.

In Hungary, The Migrants' Help Association, an NGO based in Budapest offers practical job skills training to migrants as part of the European Computer Driving Licence (ECDL) programme. The accredited lessons include basic computer courses including email platforms and more advanced courses in data management, programming and web design. In addition, Migrants' Help has provided language beginner classes for migrants in Hungarian, French, German and English. They also offer driving lessons and childcare classes (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018). Another example in Germany is the German integration aid based on the five pillars mainly linguistic training, vocational qualification, education, social advice, and the promotion of societal integration. Priority is given to linguistic training. The majority of state funds are directed to language training. Language training has been among the first services introduced for migrants. In Germany, language courses for "foreign workers" have been provided since 1974, initially with a focus on the literacy of "guest workers". These courses have been prioritized for certain groups of unemployed migrants included in the predecessor of the current social law code in 1987 (Liebig, 2007b). Language training in Sweden is a mandatory plan of the integration of migrants co-ordinated by the public employment service. The provision of Swedish language for immigrants (SFI), however, is the responsibility of local municipalities and they can vary from one municipality to the other (OECD, 2014).

It is also important to explain the advantages of investing in language training to migrants themselves as many migrants, asylum seekers and refugees need employment quickly to support their families at home (Konhle-Seidl, 2018). This may require migrants to be convinced more about the long-term advantages of job qualifications in host countries. Moreover, investing in language and vocational qualifications is more advantageous for asylum seekers who will have to return to their home country. Newly acquired professional skills and language are an additional asset for people returning to their home countries. For economically developed destination countries, migrant investment in the skills development of asylum seekers and refugees with temporary residence permits should be considered as a kind of development aid.

Therefore, smooth integration will be enabled if employers are taught about migrant rights and non-discrimination. The civil society can work with employers in job matching and training of all parties and academic institutions can research on what works and what does not. An example where this is done is in the United States where Upwardly Global charity supports employers in the recruitment process by connecting them to recent arrivals and refugees who hold at least a Bachelor's degree. Prior being matched to a job opening, candidates tend to participate in upskilling and counselling programs leading them to be registered at the recruitment database (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

 In Norway, a fast-track evaluation was developed to enable employers to quickly check the educational qualifications of applicants. Employers are requested to fill online forms, detailing candidates' educational background and within five working days feedback is provided by the Norwegian Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (NOKUT) on whether qualifications are accredited and equivalent to a Norwegian degree. This makes it easier for the employees to recruit (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and

Development, 2018). The European Commission has also launched a Skills Profile Tool as part of the New Skills Agenda for Europe. The online tool facilitates skills mapping of third-country nationals. The focus of the tool is to help skilled migrants to produce a profile of their skills and to assist an adviser to identify any recommendations of employers who might be interested. It is free of charge and can be used by any migrant or employer who supports refugee integration and seeks to gain a systematic overview of refugees' competences. The information collected can be used in furthering support and assessment, offers guidance, identifies up-skilling needs and supports job-searching and job-matching. The tool is multilingual facilitates communication between migrants and service providers (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018). In this way critical skills required by employers are highlighted. South Africa can adopt such programmes from the countries above and through these channels listed, various concerns and difficulties raised by skilled immigrant women in securing employment can be addressed successfully. Local employers can be able to secure employment opportunities for their immigrants and facilitate with their work visas.

*Refresher courses offered by employers*

The government through various stakeholders can offer refresher courses or training programmes aimed at improving the employable skills of the migrant women spouses together with locals. Higher literacy levels may significantly improve employment and earning outcomes by enhancing productivity and accelerating immigrants' labour market integration (Clark and Skuterud 2016). In Turkey, UNHCR in collaboration with government partners implemented various training programmes in support of the Development Plan and Industrial Strategy of the country to increase employability of migrants and refugees (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018). These institutions aimed at improving migrant's

transition to self-reliance and all the language and vocational training programmes are supported by financial incentives to encourage participation. Furthermore, a center for vocational training has been established in the municipality of Ankara from the UNHCR. This vocational training centre will be open to both refugees and Turkish nationals (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

In Australia, skilled migrants can be included in vocational education and training which might be one avenue through which they can gain further education that is relevant to the Australian context (Webb et al, 2013). Vocational education and training is promoted as central in achieving higher levels of skills for workers and to enable the participation of those not in the workforce, including women. Funding for courses can be tailored towards education and training to enhance migrants' employability (Webb et al, 2013; Townsend 2008), but skilled migrants are unlikely to fall within this target group even though they may struggle to find appropriate employment. Few studies in Australia have investigated the positive impacts of participation in vocational education and training and the ways such study can assist some migrant women to gain employment (Saffu 2010).

From this study, one respondent highlighted that employers stated that she needed to improve her skills:

> *"I want to be a lawyer in South Africa but they keep telling me that my Bachelor of Laws Honors Degree cannot practice here and I need to add another South African qualification to practice. I cannot pursue this because my Accompanying Spouse Dependent Visa does not allow me to study…"* (Dudzai).

Currently, SA government efforts focus mainly on indigenous South Africans despite having accepted foreign women in their communities. Courses involving both foreign and local women

will therefore enhance employment opportunities for all women whilst creating a platform for lateral exchange of skills among women from different cultural backgrounds and training. From the results of the current research, skilled women migrant spouses need assistance in improving their skills so that they match with the recruitment requirements of employers, as is the case with many local women. An incisive intervention can therefore assist employers to fill in vacancies and meet skills shortages in a manner that ensures the growth of the economy. Programmes can be created that harness the skills of women migrant spouses. Recognition of the skills that these women possess is beneficial for employers in labour recruitment. Apart from offering training opportunities, these government funded programmes can also provide networking events, seminars for both employers and unemployed women migrant spouses. This can strengthen and enable skilled migrant spouses to be successful in the formal labour market. An example is the Danish Centre for Gender, Equality and Ethnicity (KVINFO) which has a network of 2 500 mentors that focus on women from refugee families and other migrant groups (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018). Mentors are humanitarian migrants and they are matched with their mentees with similar educational or occupational profiles. The mentorship programme builds networking and has a clear focus on employment, with the sole aim of providing advice on career opportunities and employment openings. The mentors offer support in the application process that includes writing job applications and interview preparation (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

Furthermore, there is need to enhance cooperation between employers, employment agencies and migration authorities in the process of granting work permits. There has to be transparency if multiple agencies are involved in the process of granting these visas. Such cooperation will ensure that employer requirements are merged in immigrations regulations. In the United Kingdom, the

Page | 198

Bridges Programme is matching refugees with employers offering short courses and work opportunities. These refugees are selected based on prior previous work experience or training in the employer's sector. Placements are made and are unpaid and there is no obligation to offer a job afterwards. Many employers keep refugees as employees after matching. The involvement of the Bridges Programme ensures that the placement and possible continuation of work does not violate any immigration or UK labour laws (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

Employers also need legal certainty when hiring migrants so that they can invest in training. Germany offers a clear example where a new scheme was implemented in 2016 that allowed asylum seekers and those termed "tolerated" persons, (who are migrants whose asylum applications have been rejected but cannot be deported due to administrative and other obstacles), to take up an apprenticeship. The scheme guarantees that during the three-year vocational training, asylum seekers can remain in the country, even if their asylum application has been denied. Furthermore, they are supposed to find employment after finishing their training, they have a right to remain in Germany for an additional two years. This regulation created strong incentives to finish training and find subsequent employment. It also reduces the risk of employers feeling that their investment in training apprenticeships does not pay because those trained have to leave the country.

Employers can also network with other employers on ways they can improve labour integration. This was done in Germany where the Association of German Chambers of Commerce and Industry created a network for its members who are interested and those experienced in hiring migrants, asylum-seekers and refugees. The network called "Businesses integrating refugees" gathers information and providing practical guidance on a number of topics related to migrant and refugee employment. This information includes how to employ, prepare staff and line managers, and how

they can support newcomers. The employer network offers step-by-step guidance on cultural diversity management and provides material on intercultural communication. In addition, the employer network provides brief information sheets that outline successful labour integration strategies used by other network members to make the workplace more inclusive. In 2017, it was estimated that around 1 500 German businesses were now part of this active employer network (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

## 6.11    Entrepreneurship support

Entrepreneurship can offer an alternative pathway to work opportunities for migrants (Lintner, 2015). By offering the skilled migrant women opportunities to generate income, they can be able to produce money to enable social integration and independence from spouses. Migrants and refugees have potential in entrepreneurship but face particular barriers to engaging in such activities relating to their legal status that might prevent them from working and accessing essential services (Lintner, 2015). Migrants face hindrances in starting a business in the host country. These hindrances include lack of professional networking, lack of familiarity concerning administrative and legal requirements required to start a business, difficulties in accessing start-up finance and formal bank accounts language/cultural barriers, lack of credit history or funding and legal restrictions pertaining to their residence stay.  However, despite these unsurmountable obstacles, in some countries solutions are being brought forward by governments, NGO's, public institutions, the private sector to support entrepreneurial activity for migrants and maximize the entrepreneurship potential of migrant communities so that they support countries of origin and destination (United Conference on Trade and Development, 2018). These solutions are being implemented across different levels from the supranational, national, local and municipal levels.

Such support makes meaningful contributions to the well-being of refugees and migrants, as well as having broader positive social and economic impacts. It is important to note that although entrepreneurship support is an important factor in advancing migrant integration, it should be viewed as supporting a more holistic intervention on migrants socioeconomic integration including access to services. As emphasized in the international guidance and policy, the IOM's Migration Governance Framework states that effective migration policies and practices rely on a "whole-of-government" approach, whereby all sectors of government collaborate to ensure a coherent and multidimensional response (United Conference on Trade and Development, 2018).

Lack of entrepreneurship support was highlighted by some of the women respondents in this study:

*"I cannot access credit loans to start a small business since I do not have a bank account. I am ready to start something that gives me money to apply for a work permit..."* (Tariro).

With these barriers in mind a wide variety of entrepreneurship programmes that can offer skilled migrant women mentorship, professional networking, information sessions on designing business plans or securing funding may be able to assist. Civil societies and private sectors can also offer programmes that meet these needs with/without the involvement of government funding. In Germany for example, the German Chamber of Trade and Industry, offers monthly start up classes for migrants and refugees. The classes offer courses on legal requirements to start up a business and they help connect participants with more established migrant entrepreneurs and representatives of the local business community (Desiderio, 2016). In Ethiopia, the Italian Agency for Cooperation and Development (AICS) has created projects for migrants that support businesses and micro businesses through credit micro financing (Italian Agency for Cooperation and Development, 2017).

## 6.12 Bringing together the key stakeholders and forming partnerships in migration integration

There have been many fundamental changes to migration emerging over the decades and this calls for more involvement of various key stakeholders for effective migration management. For labour integration to succeed key actors can be brought together to form partnerships. These partnerships can be between the government and civil society, private sector, NGO's, recruitment agencies, migrant organisations and the media (International Organisation for Migration, 2017). For example, the private sector can contribute positively in migration policies and quota systems since they have the best experience on labour market developments in the host country. The private sector can also highlight the valuable contributions of migrants to host societies. In this case, the private sector can market the skills of these migrant women spouses thereby facilitating employer engagement and possible job placements.

As highlighted above, the government can form partnerships with the civil society and non-government organisations since these key stakeholders experience the day to day realities of migrants. They can be able to source firsthand information about the realities of migrant experiences and offer an insight into the challenges they are facing in the host country and inform the government (International Organisation for Migration, 2017). The civil society can also offer networks for interacting with migrants.

Partnerships can be created with sending country governments where migrant information centers can be established. These centers can supply detailed information about migration realities and procedures in the host country so that they can have a considerable impact on the migratory decisions that immigrations have to make before migration (International Organisation for

Migration, 2017). Stronger interchange between countries of origin and destination is needed with inputs from workers and employers. An ILO review done recently showed the content of 144 bilateral migration data on low-skilled workers, in Africa, Europe, Asia and the Americas, indicated that there is need to ensure agreement with international norms on human-labour rights of migrant workers. The review stressed the importance of including stakeholders in consultative processes regarding the implementation and monitoring of bilateral agreements (Wickramasekara, 2015).

In the European Union other legal migration pathways are being considered where migrant pilot projects are implemented with several countries of origin and destination countries (Hooper, 2019). These pilot projects are a way to test legal migration pathways between countries. These projects offer training, exchange programs, work placements on a temporary basis with the costs covered by the destination country governments. These projects recruit individuals who are already qualified to work in their profession and provide language training and vocational training that is country specific to equip migrants to work abroad (Hooper, 2019). By focusing on recruiting in employment sectors that mutually benefit both countries, pilot projects offer opportunities for good ethical recruitment practices and responsible migration management. For example, nurses can be recruited from a country with a large unemployed nursing workforce to work in another country where they are in demand. By building skills development into the program and discovering the best way to encourage circulation of skills, these pilot projects maximise development benefits both in countries of origin and for the migrants themselves (Hooper, 2019).

In this research, the social imaginary concept has shown immensely how cognitive processes influence migratory decisions. Positive expectations of the life across borders greatly influence the migratory decision. Migratory experiences are fore grounded by imagining, strategizing and planning the life one expects at the destination country. Creating partnerships with sending country

governments can assist in informing migrants about the realities faced in the host country. Migrants can be better informed about the migration policies or their rights prior their decision to migrate.

It is also essential to engage individual migrants as key stakeholders in the migration process. This will assist the government in viewing the migration policies and processes from the perspective of migrants. Such initiatives can strengthen the protection of human rights in migration and facilitate more orderly migration processes. The media can assist in creating a balanced view of migration by increasingly both shaping policy and public opinion. In the absence of reliable statistics in the media, the reality of migration and the challenges migrants face is frequently distorted, and half-truths or stereotypes guide most the perceptions that nationals have of migrants. The lack of available and reliable information tends to reinforce the perception that current migration trends (globally or locally) are beyond the control of authorities and undermines the credibility of labour-migration policies. Moreover, globally, the political discourse on international migration is not perceived as being the reflection of a coherent and committed policy by the media to such an extent that further undermines its credibility. Media has the potential to steer public opinion away from simplistic and erroneous views. It shapes public views of migration. Even though media has a tendency to concentrate on worrying trends that reinforce prejudice against migrants, it also exposes issues that need to be addressed, such as discrimination, xenophobia and the poor living conditions they face. Media can assist in taking affirmative action aimed at promoting respect for diversity and cultural, religious and ethnic pluralism in a globalizing world where international mobility is increasing. Media can be an information conveyor belt between public opinion and the government. Through this way, better perceptions of migrants' skills can be easily identified.

In the United Kingdom, as a strategy in integration of migrants, all national, regional and local actors were engaged to be responsible for the different aspects of integration of new arrivals (Green,

2007). These actors included central government departments and agencies, local government regional agencies, non-governmental organisations, community, voluntary, and faith-based organisations. These stakeholders are instrumental in providing support and identifying the needs of new migrants that arrive in the United Kingdom (Green, 2007). In 2017, the European Commission and the European Union Social and Economic partners signed a "European Partnership for Integration", that drafted key principles and commitments to encourage support and strengthen opportunities for labour market integration (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018). Another example is the Portuguese High Commission for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue (ACIDI) that created National Immigrant Support Centres (CNAI) in 2004 which currently operates in Lisbon, Porto and Faro. Their work and meetings are supported by smaller, local offices throughout Portugal. National CNAI centers hosts a variety of stakeholders that provide migrant integration and reception services for immigrants (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018). The stakeholders include the Immigration and Borders Service, Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Health and the Labour Inspectorate. In addition, the CNAI offers legal advice to immigrants and employment support through a specialized agency. The organisation works closely with immigrant organisations which has allowed successful streamlining of integration services and increased cooperation between different stakeholders involved in the field of integration. In 2016, both Portugal national and local support services were adapted to better serve the needs of migrants (The United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2018).

The same strategy can be adopted by South Africa in identifying the needs of skilled migrant women. Unions, support agencies, small to medium enterprises (SME's), women organisations, information centers and other relevant state agencies can be brought together and work to ensure

successful integration. After these needs are identified, a mainstreaming strategy can be established for effective delivery of information, support services and advocacy. In Berlin, for example, municipalities have been engaging with small to medium enterprises in training and internship programmes for migrants and refugees. This partnership has created the ARRIVO project, which has seen approximately 90 out of 280 migrants securing job placements in 250 companies across Germany (Hooper et al., 2017). Through these drives, Germany has achieved one of the highest migrant employment rates (Born and Schwefer, 2016). Co-ordination between stakeholders strengthens labour market integration and South Africa can adopt such initiatives.

NGOs can also facilitate migrant women social networks for skilled women spouses searching for employment. These networks can offer support to other women migrants who are facing the same problem. This was raised by the women respondents below:

> *"We need some forum as Zimbabwean women where we can meet and discuss our careers, offer each other support and advice in what we can do as foreigners. Other nationalities can join in…"* (Natsayi)

> *"An official group or forum will be good for us. We have small gatherings but professional career guidance in South Africa will be beneficial…"* (Marlene)

> *"We have unofficial meetings as Zimbabweans but forums that are formal will be good. We have started the Women of Substance group that we feel can be a platform to discuss migrant problems once we have registered it as an NPO…"* (Jackie).

Social networks have been found to create positive psychological well-being, autonomy and purpose for life (Wang and Kanungo, 2004). Migrants respond strongly to the interlinkages of their

Page | 206

families with friends and kinship networks and they are consistently drawn to networks that are interconnected and embedded (Blumenstock et al, 2018). Migrant processes from decision making to settling in the host country are embedded in social networks. Social networks are not just a mechanism through which the migration process is patterned, but they have broader implications for migrants and non-migrants as well (Bilecen et al, 2018). Important information feedback mechanisms are generated within these networks in the form of resources and support. Through these feedback mechanisms, migration becomes 'a path dependent process' because inter-personal relations before and after migration facilitate it (van Meeteren and Pereira, 2016). The social network theory states that networks and linkages develop overtime within societies. They vary and are often a reflection of the identity of the society. The social network theory states that networks can generate long-lasting ties through social structures (Williams and Durrance, 2008). The types of social networks that migrants have influence their labour and socio-economic integration. Access to social networks within ethnic communities may assist immigrants to settle and may even help them get employment to fulfil their immediate needs, but they rarely help them find highly skilled employment (Nakhaie, 2007). Lack of ties with the host community and specifically to members of their occupational field cuts immigrants off from many job opportunities and other valuable information such as cultural norms and practices within their profession in the host country. In a study done in Quebec it was shown that weak ties are thought to be useful in providing new information but the weak ties to Quebecers created by immigrants are too weak to be useful in job search (Arcand et al., 2009).

Migrant women networks with the help of NGOs can facilitate work placements with employers across various sectors. These work placements can be sourced according to the qualifications and skills that migrant women spouses have. These networks can also help in curriculum vitae writing, application procedures and searches for various employment options. Migrants are able to build

Page | 207

networks easily when vocational education training providers, higher education institutes, professional accrediting bodies/associations and employers intervene actively to support paths to employment particularly for the partners of skilled migrants. This was highlighted by the respondents below:

*"Women groups with the help of NGO's can be a starting point for employers to locate skilled employees…"* (Joy)

*"People who employ can come to groups of women and ask about their qualifications…"* (Martha)

The women respondents also suggested that the government can provide services in the form of employment agencies that assess immigrant qualifications thoroughly and prepare their curriculum vitas, tailoring them to meet labour market requirements. These agencies can also assist in work placements and bridging the gap between the women spouse migrants and employers. The respondents also reiterated that adequate information channels are needed about employment access for migrant women in South Africa since it is a foreign country to them. This was highlighted below

"*It would be good if opportunities were created that help migrant women in accessing jobs. There are employment agencies but its better if some dealt with migrants…"* (Miri)

*"Maybe if there were employment agencies that only help migrants, it would be better, and they would give us more information about migration and employment in South Africa…"* (Precious).

In the United Kingdom, one of the quickest ways to find employment for immigrants is through employment or recruitment agencies (Parutis, 2011). These employment and recruitment agencies provide services for both employers and job seekers. Employment agencies have the responsibility to find workers and match them to available jobs in other organisations. Agencies place workers into specific jobs and the worker is paid by the organisation which employs them. Employment agencies charge the employers a fee (or hourly rate) for their services and offers easy gain of employees because, they are legally required to check documentation about the job seekers' right to work. Studies in the United Kingdom have shown that although employment agencies are one of the first points of contact by recent migrants, once migrants have been in London for a longer period, they abandon agencies because they offer low status jobs and are a good solution for the beginning of life abroad (Parutis, 2011).

## 6.13    Conclusion

In conclusion, Chapter 6 outlined the possible intervention strategies that South Africa can adopt to ease labour integration of migrants. Some of the interventions stated above have been proposed by the skilled women spouses in this study. Other interventions have been practiced in countries that have been labeled as 'successfully integrated'. The skilled migrant women on the Accompanying Spouse Dependent visas are consumers of many government goods and services yet they are marginalised from mainstream employment. It is imperative that concerted efforts are done to ensure employment of skilled migrant women to also contribute to the growth of the economy.

The next chapter finalizes this thesis by giving a summary of the findings, the contributions of the research and suggestions for further research that can be done.

# CHAPTER SEVEN

# CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

## 7.1 Overview of the study

The current study explored the experiences of labour integration for skilled Zimbabwean spouses in South Africa's formal labour market. The research focused on migration and gender exploring the gender biases in labour integration of skilled women migrants posed by the 'Accompanying Spouse's Dependent visa' of South Africa, which excludes spouses from employment. Although the excluded spouses can be male in the cases where the female is the principal applicant, I particularly focused on women as they are, by far, the most holders of this visa type. Discourse about gender-based imbalances in access to employment among skilled migrant women in South Africa is scant in current literature. This is despite the potent dire socioeconomic implications it presents to foreign communities integrating into their adopted societies in South Africa.

Indeed, gender aspects play a pivotal role for skilled migrant spouses in their decision to migrate to South Africa and their settlement therein. This study unveiled how South Africa's migration policies have covertly hindered the skilled women's labour integration through lack of gender mainstreaming. Despite the women having migrated to South Africa to join their husbands who had secured employment, they often get trapped in a web of unemployment. This has largely been attributed to the provisions, or lack thereof, of the 'Accompanying Spouse Dependent visa' which at best only recognise the role of women as being in the home, as if they were minors. This has been a challenging experience for employable skilled women migrants, some holding qualifications that can immensely contribute to the economy and societal development of South Africa.

The research study was focused on African labour integration, specifically in South Africa guided by insights on the matter in the SADC where the lack of labour integrating frameworks among countries of the same economic block was apparent. The setting of this study was in Pietermaritzburg, KwaZulu-Natal, the administrative capital of the province where a high influx of African migrants occurs, with Zimbabweans forming the largest contingency.

The introduction of this study gave insights into the research and highlighted important aspects that included research aims, objectives and the significance of the study. This was followed by the literature review in Chapter 2, which put the topic of gender and migration into perspective. The literature review drew its insights from relevant journals, books, published and unpublished thesis and it spanned from early to recent writings providing insight into how migration literature has evolved over time. The literature review also looked at how recent global developments in the 21st century is changing migration dynamics and policies thus providing insights into the current migratory trends. Although the literature review gave a lead into the better understanding of the study, there was clear evidence that there is scant literature concerning labour integration of skilled migrant women spouses. Literature on Zimbabwe migration in South Africa revolved mostly on the informal labour integration involving informal cross boarder trading and illegal migration. Little focused on formal labour integration of migrants in South Africa. These were however mostly not focused on a gender lens. The current study therefore filled in these gaps by doing extensive literature on formal labour integration, gender migration policies and their gender biases in South Africa. The research was supported by various theories, as no single theory could explain the various concepts that were raised. Chapter 2 further explained in detail the theories of social inclusion, gender geographies of power Mahler and Pessar (1996), and gender and development have been used to gain a better understanding of the women migrant experiences in transnational spaces.

The third chapter of this study describes the research methodology that was used. It gave a rationale for a qualitative approach together with the sampling protocol, the data collection methods and the demographics of the participants. The research respondents were all Zimbabwean women spouses who held the 'Accompanying Spouse Dependent' visa. There were forty participants in total. During my interviews with the women, self-reflectivity and gender power dynamics were experienced. As a researcher originating from Zimbabwe myself, sharing cultural and linguistic aspects with these respondents, certain subjectivity was used in structuring the study. This was explained clearly by Patton (2002) who stated that a researcher's personal experiences are important in understanding certain phenomenon. However, due care was taken to ensure that the findings of the study was based on the experiences of the respondents and not the current researcher. Gender power dynamics faced by the researcher in conducting interviews are also explained in detail in Chapter 3.

The study took a qualitative research methodology approach, which according to Denzin and Lincoln, (2013) is an in-depth understanding of phenomenon in a population and the context in which they live. A qualitative approach was best suited for this study because it aimed to research labour integration experiences of a specific population, skilled migrant women spouses. An interpretivist paradigm was used because it highlights the subjectivity of human beings both as study participants and as researchers. Interpretivism acknowledges that the background and emotions of the researcher are an integral part of processing the data (Reeves and Hedberg, 2003). Placing this research within this paradigm helped me to engage critically and meaningfully with the study.

The rest of the chapters excluding the conclusion chapter emanated from the data collected from this study. Data collected from the in-depth interviews was analysed into themes that were described

in Chapter 5, 6 and 7. Chapter 4 outlined the migratory experiences of the skilled Zimbabwean women in labour integration. It showed the gender dynamics that the women faced in the migratory process. Gender dynamics were evident from the decision to migrate, the gender biases of the migratory policies in South Africa, the challenges faced by the women in their marriages, social circles and power dynamics that arose from unemployment. Data excerpts were quoted in the text, where actual responses from the participants were highlighted. This was helpful because it offered a deeper understanding and strengthened the views that were highlighted in the research. The researcher used synonyms as names in the data excerpts.

During the in-depth interviews it emerged that the migration policies were not catering for the integration needs of these skilled women spouses. This led to a detailed critical analysis of the migration policies of South Africa from a gender lens in Chapter 5. Chapter 5 explored the history of migration policies before South Africa's independence to the present day, highlighting the gender gaps that were existing. Chapter 6 derived from the findings that the research participants highlighted in the study. The chapter highlighted possible interventions that can be adopted in addressing the challenges that were raised by the research respondents. Some of the possible interventions were raised by the women respondents themselves during the in-depth interviews.

 Reflection of the research process

Undertaking a PhD was one of the greatest decisions I ever had to make mainly because I knew it was going to be a lot of hard work. Once I had made the decision, I knew that I would be determined to complete it. My research involved several phases that I had to complete throughout the period notably, the proposal stage, data collection phase, analysis phase and the writing, editing and compilation phase. The first phase was the research proposal phase. The research proposal needed

to be short and detailed. A skill that I learnt with the help of my supervisor. I wrote my proposal and had to present it to the Development Cluster academic staff and post graduate students. My presentation was well received with minor comments/additions. I incorporated the comments and submitted it to the School review and the Higher degrees review committee for acceptance. My proposal was accepted and ethical clearance to conduct data collection was granted after a long wait.

Creating rapport with the participants was not a difficult task since I related to the women on the same gender, marital status and nationality. I would exploit my shared characteristics with the women by engaging in several church topics in Shona our indigenous language. This helped me merge well with the target group. On meeting my participants, I would explain to them clearly what the research was about, and they had to sign the informed consent form. On one hand, the participants viewed me as a 'sister' but on the other hand after introducing my study and the purpose for the research they would hesitate. Partly, because of power dynamics that were involved. Although I was a Zimbabwean woman, I was also conducting a PhD research and could not specifically identify with most of them since they were unemployed. I managed to handle this well by sharing my own experience as a skilled accompanying spouse who also struggled to secure formal employment after migration to South Africa. Using self-reflexivity was helpful in this research. After they heard about how I also experienced the same situation, they were responsive and wanted to participate with the hope it would also change their situation.

After data collection I started the process of analysis, identifying recurring themes from the participants' responses. This was a challenge on its own, as I was faced with a lot of data and paperwork that I had to read. I had to read through all the responses and identify notable themes. It was particularly difficult and emotional for me as a researcher, to go back and read these

experiences because I had experienced this life before.  I could relate to the constraints and difficulties that skilled migrant women were facing in South Africa. Writing chapters was challenging, it is a skill that I have learnt to sharpen. I had to learn to write academically beyond my Master's level. Apart from the challenges I faced during the research process, I had to juggle my PhD work with my family life and other activities and responsibilities. It was a challenging journey, but I strived and succeeded in the end.

Findings of the study

The current study unveiled several insights that have implications on the socioeconomic standing of female migrants who tail their spouses on an 'Accompanying Spouse Dependent Visa'. First, the findings of the study unveiled how gender dynamics are pivotal in migration patterns where experiences differ between men and women. Many women expressed regret at the decision to move in order to maintain the family unit but without guaranteed employment.  From the responses, it was mainly the husband's decision to migrate and the wife had to agree so that she can secure her marriage.

Second, the study shows disproportionate sensitivity in migration policies addressing the need for migrant women in South Africa. The need for mainstreaming of gender in migration policies was apparent. For example, the skilled women migrant all lament the restrictive provisions of the accompany spouses visa which does not allow them to work. Even though visa types may be amended to enable employability, many complained about prohibitive costs and lengthy periods required to convert dependent spouse visas. This is further compounded by the fact that the dependent visa category does not allow women to study leaving migrant women completely marginalised. As highlighted in Chapter 5, South Africa's immigration and labour polices fail to

adequately align themselves to the international, regional and national instruments that promote and protect gender equality and the wellbeing of all migrants (Chisale, 2015). There is a need for gender sensitivity in migration and labour policies of South Africa to increase the level of empowerment and social justice for these migrant women. Instead of depending on their husbands for sustenance, these women could be formally employed as migrants according to their skills.

Third, findings from the study have revealed that skilled women immigrants have insufficient access to the host society's resources and institutions, which can enable them to improve their social standing. This is mainly attributed to lack of coherent policy frameworks that facilitate integration in South Africa. This problem is however not unique to South Africa as there is no elaborate harmonised policies governing transboundary movement of skilled laborer's in the SADC region, women included. The fate of women is however usually more dire than men since, in most cases, women migrate for family reunification where challenges become unique and different from their spouses.

Fourth, the study revealed several gender inequalities that arise with migration at family level. Migration changes gender power relations and can lead to gender power, in households, being challenged. Migration impacts on household structures and the gender patterns within it. Many women respondents attested that they have seen behavioral changes bordering domestic abuse in their spouses due to the over-dependency they have on their spouses. Although this maybe attributed to the patriarchal nature of marital unions in this community, some women argued that abuse is rife as most spouses recognize the dependency and lack of institutional support that makes women powerless to make independent decisions like going back to home country, without money. Indeed, the theory of gender geographies of power used in this research revealed the unequal power relations involved in transnational marriages are fueled by unemployment, lack of financial

autonomy, which inevitably leads to lack of decision making in the household. These power relations have involved patriarchal dominance with husbands' misusing the immigration status to usurp the rights of their spouses. As highlighted in Chapter 4, this type of power and control is greatly facilitated by the current immigration laws and procedures that allow legal residents (mainly male) with work visas or permits to control the application and filling of their wives' immigration documents. The research respondents have echoed these sentiments highlighting an increase in domestic abuse, violence and heated arguments.

Fifth, this study has revealed that policy makers and practitioners need to understand how gender inequalities in migration have influenced progress on each Sustainable Development Goal and target. Migration policies should support measures that reduce gender discrimination whilst increasing women opportunities and decision-making power. This has been highlighted in the research where document analysis on migration policies and the women migrants' responses show lack of support from policy structures in formal labour integration. Migration polices now, are not upholding the gender equality rights and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) that South Africa is a signatory to. Sustainable development goal 10 Target 7, for example states that countries should 'facilitate orderly, safe, regular and responsible migration and mobility of people, through the implementation of planned and well managed migration policies' (UNDESA, 2016). SDG 5 on gender equality and women and girls 'empowerment, SDG 8 on growth and decent work and SDG 10 on reducing inequalities are particularly important to the wellbeing of female migrants ensuring they are not left behind in progress towards the 2030 Agenda (UNDESA, 2016).

Sixth, the research further revealed that women are not always victims of circumstances, but they can exercise agency to lift themselves out of subordinated situations. In this study there were several respondents that highlighted that they are striving to make ends meet, by engaging in informal

marketing jobs that generate incomes, with the aim of applying for study and work permits. This shows the resilience and determination that these women have in succeeding in the host country. This is supported by the Gender and Development theory used in the study, that states that women can be agents of their own development.

Lastly, gender identities are compromised as shown in the research where women respondents had their gender identity as 'income earners' lost since migrating to South Africa. Gender geographies of power explains how gender identities and roles can be compromised under transnational spaces. Women in this study have expressed how the sudden domestication has resulted in the loss of their professional identity. This has resulted in reinforcement of traditional gender roles in their marriages. Men are the breadwinners and income earners as the women are left home to do the cooking, cleaning and childcare since they are unemployed. In this transnational space, opinions and the role in decision making the women spouses played is no longer valued as it was back at home mainly because they did not contribute financially in the household anymore. This has resulted various mental challenges for these women migrants that has compromised their well-being.

### 7.2 Contributions of the research study

i)      The current study brings the spotlight on the labour integration challenges faced by migrant women on an Accompanying Spouse Dependent visa. Even though the women had acquired a legal visa, it had several restrictions that prevented them from full integration.

ii)     The research study sheds light on migratory experiences of Zimbabweans living in South Africa. It provides insights into the challenges that they face even if they possess legal documents.

iii)    The study also highlighted possible practical interventions that can improve labour integration for women migrants in South Africa drawing inspiration from top global destinations for migrant workers.

iv)    The study contributed to the gender-migration scholarly discourse. It has contributed to academic knowledge on the relationship between gender and migration filling in the gaps in studies of Zimbabwean women migrants in South Africa. The research has added knowledge on integration issues in South Africa and to that of international migration in general and intra Africa migration.

v)    The study has given insight into the current labour migration policy framework of SADC and South Africa, highlighting the gaps that need to be addressed to achieve gender equality and general well-being for female migrants. It has highlighted the lack of the integration policies in South Africa for migrants. Although the study focused on skilled women migrants, it has brought forth valuable arguments that can be addressed for all types of migrants through well planned migration management.

### 7.3 Suggestions for further research

The current study leaves gaps, which may be subject for further research. First, my study only focused on Zimbabwean nationals living in Pietermaritzburg. This means that my study largely reflects experiences of Zimbabweans, which in some cases may not be uniform across other nationals. For example, Zimbabwe geographic location is relatively closer compared to West African or Arabic countries where issues of failure among women to consider relocating to home countries may become magnified. In addition, traditional and cultural differences that influence family dynamics may differ among nationalities making it hard to generalise the findings of my study among different migrant groups in South Africa. It may therefore be of interest to extend this

Page | 219

study to other African and non-African immigrants to better unveil the impact of the Accompanying Spouse dependent visa in South Africa. Such a comprehensive approach is more likely to be more adequate in lobbying for policy change.

Second, choosing Pietermaritzburg, a relatively smaller town compared to economic hubs of South Africa such as Johannesburg, means that my study could not fully account for town-based experiences. Other studies have argued that labour integration opportunities are unique to towns depending on demand for labour based on economic opportunities. It is therefore plausible that some of the experiences of my respondents are largely based on the limited opportunities typical of smaller towns where economic activities are low. However, the level of employment opportunities may also not be directly a factor since the Accompanying Spouse Dependent visa does not allow the holder to assume any jobs. However, where job opportunities are available, respondents in my study indicated that they are willing to invest their meagre savings in the application of the exorbitant alternative visa, which would allow them to work as income would be guaranteed. This could be the case in larger towns with higher economic activity. Future studies may therefore endeavor to investigate if the economic activity of a city may also influence the conversion of the visas to working ones.

Third, my study was largely qualitative. Although the design was robust, future studies may incorporate quantitative designs with large population sizes to substantiate the sentiments of my respondents with numeric values. For example, I could not determine levels of household income and expenditure among respondents, which can be an important indicator of the prohibitive costs of changing the visa conditions. Such findings may help in lobbying for change of visa fees depending on household income or outright change of conditions on the accompanying spouse visa.

A longitudinal research that tracks my research respondents in future may also be done in the event of South Africa policy changes in order to ascertain how these would have affected them.

Fourth, migration policies were evolving and changing positively when this research was done. With the introduction of the South African Green Paper on International Migration 2016 and the White paper on International Migration 2017, positive approaches were proposed regarding integration as described in detail in Chapter 5. The introduction of these policies did not however affect the outcome of the study because they had not been implemented yet. It would be beneficial if a follow up research study can be later conducted to assess if any major positive developments were made after the release of the White Paper on International Migration in July 2017 which promised significant changes over the next two years in improving visa regulations and labour integration for all migrants.

Last, my research study solely focused on gender-migration in labour policies or lack thereof. A broad in-depth study of gender inclusion of women migrants in other policy fields might be important to give a detailed scope of the challenges of integration on skilled women migrants. There might be need for further research on gender inclusion of migrants in health, education, social care and welfare policies to assess challenges migrant women are facing in South Africa not only in labour integration.

### 7.4 Recommendations

The findings of my study show gender-based differential impacts of immigration policies. It is apparent that women on an accompanying spouse visa are disenfranchised of their economic autonomy and ultimately their dignity and social standing. Policy makers need to therefore consider the gender-based impacts of immigration policies using tools such as the gendered geographies of

power framework and gender mainstreaming to include the needs of skilled women spouses in policy. Concerning the Accompanying Spouse Dependent Visa, policy makers may consider introducing the following:

i)      Family based applications of work visas where a point system as for example what is used in Australia. This enables women to be included in the migration decisions but also enable them to work upon entry into the country as their qualifications would have been considered in the initial application. This will also ensure make the South African government benefit from their skills.

ii)     The costs of visa application may also be reviewed based on household income. Several respondents in my study conceded that the cost of application in changing the type of their visa was prohibitive. This was even made worse by the inclusion of a third party, VFS Global, for processing applications which has seen the cost of application doubling.

Other aspects, which need attention, include the harmonization of educational qualification requirements among regional blocks such as SADC. Respondents in my study indicated that accreditation to professional bodies was an obstacle to obtaining working visas. This was the case with many professionals in fields such as law and medicine.

From this research study it has been evident that gender and migration go hand in hand. Migration studies can be able to describe the phenomenon thoroughly if they apply a gender lens.

**REFERENCES**

Ackermann, L. and Velelo, N., 2015. The position of women in the South African labour force: an overview. *Pula: Botswana Journal of African Studies*, *27*(1), pp.153-168.

Adepoju, A. 2004. Trends in International Migration in and from Africa. Massey, D, S and Taylor J, E (eds). International Migration Prospects and Policies in a global market. Oxford: Oxford University PressAdida, C.L., Lo, A. and Platas, M., 2017. Engendering empathy, begetting backlash: American attitudes toward Syrian refugees. Immigration Policy lab. Working Paper Series Number (17) 01.

Africa Migration Policy Series, Number 9. Southern African Migration Project. Capetown and Kingston.

African Centre for Migration and Society. 2015. MiWORC Policy Update Number1 Adoption of the SADC Labour Migration Policy Framework. African Centre for Migration and Society. University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

African Development Bank. 2005. Kingdom of Lesotho: Multi-sector gender profile, Agriculture and Rural Development, North East and South Region (ONAR) [Accessed 5 January 2018].

African Union. 2006. African Common position on migration and development. Executive Council, Ninth Ordinary Session, Banjul. The Gambia, 25–29 June.

African Union. 2015. Improving the Status of women in African Labour Markets as contribution to the theme of the African Union for 2015: "Year of Women's Empowerment and Development towards Africa's Agenda 2063". First Session of the Specialised Technical Committee on Social Development, Labour and Employment (STC-SDLE-1). Addis Ababa. Ethiopia.

Ahmad, F., Riaz, S., Barata, P. and Stewart, D.E., 2004. Patriarchal beliefs and perceptions of abuse among South Asian immigrant women. *Violence against women*, *10*(3), pp.262-282.

Aitchison, C., 1999. New cultural geographies: The spatiality of leisure, gender and sexuality. *Leisure studies*, *18*(1), pp.19-39.

Alaniz, M.L., 2002. Migration, acculturation, displacement: migratory workers and "substance abuse". *Substance use & misuse*, *37*(8-10), pp.1253-1257.

Alba, R. and Nee, V., 2009. *Remaking the American mainstream: Assimilation and contemporary immigration*. Harvard University Press. Cambridge.

Albarrán C, R, Nyamathi, A. 2011, HIV and Mexican migrant workers in the United States: a review applying the vulnerable populations conceptual model. *Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care* 22(3): pp 173–185.

Aliens Control Act. 1991, www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b5100. [Accessed 08 February 2017].

Aliens Control Amendment Act, Number 1537. 1995, www.legalish.co.za. [Accessed 08 February 2017].

Allard, D., 2016. Translocal meaning making: Examining the information practices of migrants from the Philippines to Winnipeg. In *Proceedings of the 79th ASIS&T Annual Meeting: Creating Knowledge, Enhancing Lives through Information & Technology* (p. 143). American Society for Information Science. [Accessed 19 June 2017].

Amisi, B and Ballard, R. 2005, *In the Absence of Citizenship: Congolese refugee struggle and organisation in South Africa.* A case study for the UKZN project entitled: Globalisation, Marginalisation and New Social Movements in post-Apartheid South Africa. School of Development Studies and Centre for Civil Society. University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Amuedo-Dorantes, C. and Mundra, K., 2004. Social networks and their impact on the employment and earnings of Mexican immigrants. *Paper provided by EconWPA in its series Labor and Demography.* www.akela.mendelu.cz [Accessed 27 September 2018].

Anand, R., Kothari, S and Kumar, N. 2016. *South Africa: Labour Market Dynamics and Inequality*. IMF Working Paper. African Department.

Anderson, B. 2010. Migration, immigration controls and the fashioning of precarious workers. *Work Employment and Society* 24 (2): pp 300-317.

Anderson, B. 2015. Gender and Migration: An introduction and a conversation. http://bordercriminologies.law.ox.ac.uk/gender-migration-an-introduction-and-a-connversation. [ Accessed 08 August 2016].

Anglewicz, P., VanLandingham, M., Manda-Taylor, L., Kohler, H. 2016. Migration and HIV Infection in Malawi: A Population-Based Longitudinal Study. AIDS 30(13): pp 2099–2105.

Arkosu, A. 2016. Feminisation of Labour. The Wiley Blackwell Encyclopedia of Gender and Sexuality Studies. . [Accessed 4 March 2019].

Arango, J. 2000. Explaining migration: A critical view. *International Social Science Journal* 52(165): pp 283-296. Arango, J., 2018. Explaining migration: a critical view. *International Social Science Journal*, 68: pp 227-228.

Arcand, S., Lenoir-Achdjian, A and Helly, D. 2009. "Insertion professionnelle d'immigrants récents et réseaux sociaux: le cas de Maghrébins à Montréal et Sherbrooke", Cahiers canadiens de sociologie 34 (2): pp 373-402.

Arnold, D and Bongiovi, J.R., 2012. Precarious, informalizing, and flexible work: Transforming concepts and understandings. *American Behavioral Scientist*, *57*(3): pp 289-308.

Acharya, D, R., Bell, J, S., Simkhada, P., Teijlingen, E, R and Regmi, P, R. 2010. Women's autonomy in household decision-making: a demographic study in Nepal. *Reproductive Health* 7 (1), p.15.

Atteraya, M, S., Gnawali S and Song, I, H. 2015. Factors associated with intimate partner violence against married women in Nepal. *Journal for Interpersonal Violence 30(7)*: pp 1226–46.

Audit Commission. 2007. Crossing Borders: Responding to the Local Challenges of Migrant Workers. Audit Commission. London.

Auster, C.J. 1996. The Sociology of Work: Concepts and Cases. Pine Forge Press.

Bach, A. 2009. Immigration, integration and asylum policies from a gender perspective. Migrants in Europe as development actors: between hope and vulnerability. European Social Watch Report.

Bakewell, O and Bonfiglio, A. 2013. *Moving beyond conflict: Re-framing mobility in Africa Great Lakes region*. Working paper for the African Great Lakes Mobility Project. International Migration Institute, Oxford Department of International Development University of Oxford. Oxford.

Balgamwalla, S. 2014. Bride and prejudice: How U.S Immigration Law discriminates against spousal visa holders. *Berkeley Journal of Gender, Law and Justice* 29(1).

Ban, R and Rao, V. 2008. "Tokenism or Agency? The Impact of Women's Reservations on Village Democracies in South India." *Economic Development and Cultural Change* 56 (3): 501–30.

Banerjee, R and Phan, M, B. 2015. Do tied movers get tied down? The occupational displacement of dependent applicant immigrants in Canada. *International Migration and integration* 16: pp 333-353.

Bansak, K., Hainmueller, J and Hangartner, D. 2016. How economic, humanitarian, and religious concerns shape European attitudes toward asylum seekers. *Science* 354 (6309) pp.217-222.

Barchiesi, F. 2011. *Precarious liberation: Workers, the state and contested social citizenship in post- apartheid South Africa*. New York: Suny Press.

Barker, F. 2007. *The South African Labour Market: Theory and Practice*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Barnes, T. 2002. Virgin territory? Travel and migration by African women in twentieth century. Southern Africa. In: J. Allman et al., (eds). Women in African colonial histories. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press. pp 164-190.

Battaglia, M. 2011. Non-probability sampling. Encyclopedia of Survey Research Methods. SAGE Publications.

Bealey, F. 1999. The Blackwell Dictionary of Political Science: A user's Guide to its Terms. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers. Bealey, F. and Johnson, A.G., 1999. *The Blackwell Dictionary of Political Science: User*. Blackwell.

Benton, M. 2013. The changing face of International migration: Flows are increasingly fluid, diverse and unconventional. *Migration Information Source*. Issue 1.

Behning and Pascual, A.S. (eds.). 2001. *Gender Mainstreaming in the European Employment Strategy*. Brussels: European Trade Union Institute.

Beveridge, F., Nott, S. and Stephen, K. 2000. Mainstreaming and the engendering of policymaking: A Means to an end? *Journal of European Public Policy* 7 (3): 385–405.

Benhabib, S. 2004. *The Rights of Others: Aliens, Residents, and Citizens*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Berg, B.L. 2004. *Qualitative Research for the Social Sciences*. Pearson Press, Boston USA.

Bhadra, C. 2007. *International Labor Migration of Nepalese Women: The Impact of Their Remittances on Poverty Reduction.* Asia-Pacific Research and Training Network on Trade Working Paper Series, No 44.

Bhutta, R and Haider, J. 2013. Effects of economic dependency on decision making power of women in rural areas of Tehsil Dera Ghazi Khan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences* 3: pp 203-224.

Bilecen, B., Gamper, M and Lubbers, M, J.2018. The missing link: Social network analysis in migration and transnationalism. *Social Networks* 53: pp 1-3.

Biljohn, C., Pasha, A and von Fintel, D. 2018. Bargaining to work: the effect of female autonomy on female labour supply. Stellenbosch Economic Working Papers WP04/2018. Department of Economics. University of Stellenbosch.

Bimha, P. 2017. Legalising the illegal: an assessment of the Dispensation of Zimbabweans Project (DZP) and Zimbabwe Special Dispensation Permit (ZSP) regularization projects. open.uct.ac.za/bitstream/item/28572/thesis_hum_2017_bimha_primrose_zvikomborero_joylyn. pdf?sequence=1. [Accessed 15 April 2019].

Bloch, A, 2006. Emigration from Zimbabwe: Migrant Perspectives. S*ocial Policy & Administration* 40(1), pp 67-87

Blumenstock, J., Chi, G., Tan, X. 2018. Migration and the value of social networks. [Accessed 8 March 2019].

Böcker, A. and Tineke, S. 2011. Language and knowledge tests for permanent residence rights: help or hindrance for integration? *European Journal of Migration and Law* 13: 157–184.

Bordo, S., 1990. Feminism, postmodernism, and gender-skepticism. In L. Nicholson (Ed.), *Feminism/Postmodernism* (pp. 133–157). New York: Routledge.

Born, R and Schwefer M. 2016. Institutional dimensions of successful labour market integration of refugees. www.cesifo-group.de/DocDL/dice-report-2016. [Accessed 27 March 2017].

Bosswick, W. and Heckmann, F. 2006. Integration of migrants: Contribution of local and regional authorities. European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions. Cities for Local Integration Policy. www.eurofound.europa.eu/pubdocs/2006/22/en/1/ef0622en.pdf. [Accessed 13 June, 2016].

Bowen, G. A., 2009. Document analysis as a qualitative research method. Qualitative *Research Journal* 9(2): pp 27-40.

Boyd, M. 1989. Family and Personal Networks in International Migration: Recent Developments and New Agendas. *International Migration Review* 23(3): pp 638–670.

Boyd, M. 1995. "Migration Regulations and Sex Selective Outcomes in Developed Countries." In International Migration Policies and the Status of Female Migrants. United Nations Department for Economic and Social Information and Policy Analysis, Population Division. New York: United Nations.

Boyd, B, M and Grieco, E. 2003. Women and Migration: Incorporating Gender into International Migration Theory. *Population Studies* 56(3): pp 291-309.

Boyd. M. 2012. Migration in an interconnected and gendered world. 2012. The Center for Migration Studies Special Issue 22(1): pp12-20.

Boyle P, Cooke TJ, Halfacree K, Smith D. 2001. A cross national comparison of the impact of family migration on women's employment status. *Demography* (38): pp 201–213.

Bozrikova, T and Niyazova. 2011. Major approaches and principles of mainstreaming gender into migration policy. Documenting the experience of gender mainstreaming into migration policy and legislation in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Russia and Tajikistan. Central Asia Regional Migration Programme.

Bragun, M. 2008. The Golden Cage: How immigration law turns foreign women into involuntary housewives. 31 *SEAULR 937* :pp 937.

Braun, V and Clarke, V., 2006. Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 3(2): pp 77-101

Brettell, C.B., 2005.Voluntary organisations, Social Capital, and the Social Incorporation of Asian Indian Immigrants in the Dallas-Fort Worth Metroplex. *Anthropological Quarterly 78(4)*: pp 853-882.

Briggs, T., 2013. Labour market experiences of West African immigrants with Finnish Qualifications in Helsinki Finland. Degree Programme in Social Services Bachelor of Social Services (UAS). Diaconia University of Applied Sciences.

Bryman, A. 2008. *Social Research Methods*. Third Edition. New York: Oxford University Press.

Bryman, A. and Bell, E. 2007. *Business Research Methods*. 2nd edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bui, H. N. 2003. Help-seeking behavior among abused immigrant women: A case of Vietnamese American women. *Violence against Women 2*: pp 207-239. Bui, H.N., 2003. Help-seeking behavior among abused immigrant women: A case of Vietnamese American women. *Violence against women*, *9*(2), pp.207-239.

Bursell, M. 2012. Ethnic Discrimination Name Change and Labour Market Inequality. Mixed approaches to ethnic exclusion in Sweden. Stockholm: Acta Universitatis. Stockholmiensis.

Caiazza, A.B., 2002. *"Does Women's Representation in Elected Office Lead to Women-Friendly Policy?"* Research-in-Brief Series 1910, Institute for Women's Policy Research, Washington, DC.

Caidi, N and Allard, D., 2005. Social inclusion of newcomers to Canada. An information problem? *Library and Information Science Research 27(3),* pp. 302-324.

Calhoun, E. F., 1993. Action Research: Three approaches. Educational Leadership 51(2): pp 62-65

Cameron, L., Dowling, M and Worswick, C .2001. Education and Labour Market Participation of Women in Asia: Evidence from Five Countries. *Economic Development and Cultural Change, 49(3)*, pp. 459-477.

Canadian Science Policy Conference. *How to Ensure a Stronger Voice for Evidence in Government Policy Making!* Symposium: Evidence-Based Decision Making. Ottawa. Canada. http://sciencepolicy.ca/sites/default/files/ebdm_symposium_report.pdf [Accessed 12 March 2019].

Cantrell, DC. 1993. Alternative paradigms in environmental education research: The interpretive perspective. Alternative paradigms in environmental education research. (eds) R Mzarek. Lethbridge: NAAEE: pp 81-106.

Carciotto, S and Mavura, M. 2016. The Evolution of Migration Policy in Post-Apartheid South Africa. Emerging Themes and new Challenges. The Scalabrini Institute for Human Mobility in Africa (SIHMA) and The South African Catholic Bishops Conference Parliamentary Liaison office. Capetown.

Carlson, B., Magnusson, K., and Rönnqvist, S. 2012. 'Somalier på arbetsmarknaden – har Sverige något att lära?' Report. Stockholm: Elanders Sverige AB.

Carr, M., Chen, M.A. and Tate, J. 2000. Globalization and home-based workers. *Feminist Economics, 6*(3): pp 123-142.

Casale, D. and Posel, D. 2002. The feminisation of the labour force in South Africa: An analysis of recent data and trends. *South African Journal of Economics*, 70(1),156-184.

Cassels S, Manhart L, Jenness SM, Morris M. 2003. Short-term mobility and increased partnership concurrency among men in Zimbabwe. *PLoS One* 8(6): e66342.

Castagnone, E., Sakho, P., Nazio, T., Schoumaker, B and Rakotonarivo, N. 2013. *African migrants at work. Patterns of labour market integration in Europe, transnational economic participation and economic re-integration of migrants in origin countries. The case of Senegal.* MAFE Working Paper 29. Paris: MAFE.

Castells, M and Portes, A. 1989. World underneath: The origins, dynamics, and effects of the informal economy, in Portes, A., Castells, M and Benton, L. A. (eds.). The informal economy: Studies in advanced and less developed countries. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Castles, S., De Haas, H., and Miller, M, J., 2014. *The Age of Migration: International Population Movements in the Modern World*. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan Higher Education.

Castles S. and Davidson, A., 2000. *Citizenship and Migration: Globalization and the Politics of Belonging*. New York: Routledge.

Castles, S. and Miller, M. J., 2003. *The Age of Migration, International Population Movements in the Modern World*. Third Edition, Palgrave: Macmillan

Cazes, S., and S. Verick. 2013. *The Labour Markets of Emerging Economies: Has Growth Translated into More and Better Jobs?* Geneva and Basingstoke, International Labour Organisation and Palgrave Macmillan. United Kingdom.

CEDAW.1979. UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women. UN Document A/34/36.

Charlesworth, H. 2005. Not Waving, but drowning: gender mainstreaming and human rights in the united nations. *Harvard Human Rights Journal* 18: pp 1-18.

Charmes, J., (2012) The Informal Economy Worldwide: Trends and Characteristics, Margin: The Journal of Applied Economic Research, 6(2), pp. 103–1.

Charrad, M., 1990. State and Gender in the Maghrib. *Middle East Research Project* 20(2), pp.19 – 25.

Charsley, K., Bolognani, M., Spencer,S., Ersanilli, E., Jayaweera, H., 2016. *Marriage Migration and Integration*. Report. Bristol, UK; University of Bristol.

Chang, D.O. 2009. Informalising labour in Asia's global factory. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*. 39(2), pp. 161-179.

Chavan, P. 2008. Gender Inequality in Banking Services. Economic and political weekly 43, pp. 18-21.

Chen, M., Vanek, J., and Heintz, J., 2006. Informality, gender and poverty: a global picture. *Economic and Political Weekly, 41*(21), pp. 2131–2139.

Chen, M. 2008. Women and Employment in Africa. A Framework for Action. Background Document commissioned by the Danish Foreign Ministry for the Second Conference of the Africa Commission in November 2008. Harvard University.

Chisale, S.S., 2015. The Gender Implications of the Immigration Regulations of South Africa on "career wives": An African Feminist Perspective. Institute of Open distance learning and the Department of Development Studies. UNISA.

Chow, J, C and Lou, C, W. 2015.Community-based approaches to social exclusion among rural-to-urban migrants in China. *China Journal of Social Work* (8):1: pp 33-46.

Clark W, A, V and Huang Y, Q. 2006. Balancing move and work: women's labour market exits and.entries after family migration. *Population, Space and Place* (12): pp 31– 44.

Clarke, Andrew, and Mikal Skuterud. 2013. "Why do immigrant workers in Australia perform better than those in Canada? Is it the immigrants or their labour markets?" *Canadian Journal of Economics 46*(4): pp1431–1462.

Cohen, R. 1987. *The New Helots: Migrants in the international division of labour*. Oxford: Oxford University Press and Oxford Publishing Services.

Constable, N., 2009. The commodification of intimacy: marriage, sex, and reproductive labour. *Annual Review of Anthropology* (38): pp 49–64.

CoRMSA. 2009. *Protecting Refugees, Asylum Seekers and Immigrants in South Africa*. Johannesburg. Consortium for Refugees and Migrants in South Africa, 2009. *Protecting refugees, asylum seekers and immigrants in South Africa*. CoRMSA.

Crush, J., 2001. The dark side of democracy: migration, xenophobia and human rights in South Africa. *International Migration* 38(6), pp.103-133.

Crush, J., 2010. Migration, Remittances and Gender Responsive Local Development: The Case of Lesotho. SAMP, UNDP. INSTRAW. Johannesburg.

Crush, J., 2011. *"Complex Movements, Confused Responses: Labour Migration in South Africa"*. Southern African Migration Project Migration Policy Series, 25. Capetown.

Crush, J., and Dodson, B., 2006. *South African Immigration Law: A gender analysis*. Migration Policy Brief Number 16. Southern African Migration Project. Capetown.

Crush, J., and Jeeves, A., (eds). 1997. *White Farms, Black Labour: The State and Agrarian Change in Southern Africa*, 1910-1950. Pietermartizburg: University of Natal Press.

Crush, J., and Mcdonald D. 2002. Transnationalism and the New African Immigration to South Africa. Canadian Association of African Studies. Toronto.

Crush, J., and Pendleton, W. 2004. Regionalising Xenophobia? Citizen attitudes to immigration and refugee policy in Southern Africa. South Africa Migration Project.Canada.

Crush, J., and Williams, V. 2001. Gender concerns in the South African Migration Policy. Migration Policy Brief Number 4. South African Migration Project. Capetown.

Crush, J., Chikanda, A., and Tawodzera, G., 2012. The Third Wave: Mixed Migration from Zimbabwe to South Africa. Southern African Migration Programme. Migration Policy Series 59. Mueller. Capetown.

Crush, J., Chikanda, A., Tawodzera, G., and Tevera, D., 2017. Living with xenophobia: Zimbabwean informal enterprise in South Africa. Southern African Migration Programme. *Migration Policy Series* 77. The Printing Press. Capetown.

Crush, J., Jeeves, A., and Yudelman, D., 1991. South Africa's Labour Empire: A History of Black Migrancy to the Gold Mines. Wilmot James, Our Precious Metal: African Labour in South Africa's Gold Industry. Cape Town: David Philip.

Crush, J., Williams, V., and Peberdy, S., 2005. Migration in Southern Africa. Policy Analysis and Research Programme. Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM).

Czaika, M and De Haas, H. 2013.The Globalisation of Migration: Has the World become more migratory? Oxford University: International Migration Institute. Czaika, M. and De Haas, H., 2013. *The Globalisation of Migration: Has the world really become more migratory?*. International Migration Institute, University of Oxford.

Czaika, M., and De Haas, H., 2014. The globalisation of migration: has the world become more migratory. *International Migration Review* 48 (2),pp.283-323.

Czaika, M., and De Haas, H., 2014. The Effect of Visa Policy on International Migration Dynamics (Working Paper). Oxford: University of Oxford: International Migration Institute.

Daly, M.E. 2005. Gender mainstreaming in theory and practice. Social Politics: *International Studies in Gender, State and Society* 12(3): 433-450. Daly, M., 2005. Gender mainstreaming in theory and practice. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society*, *12*(3), pp.433-450.

Dancygier, R., 2010. *Immigration and conflict in Europe*. Cambridge University Press.

Danso, R., and Macdonald, D., 2000. Writing Xenophobia: Immigration and the press in post-apartheid South Africa, Canada: South Africa Migration Project.

Darke, P., Shanks, G., and Broadbent, M. 1998. Successfully completing case study research: Combining rigour, relevance and pragmatism. *Information Systems Journal* 8, pp.273-289.

De Haas, H. 2005. International Migration, Remittances and Development: Myths and Facts. *Third World Quarterly 26(8)*, pp.1269- 1284.

De Haas, H., 2006. "Engaging diasporas: How governments and development agencies can support diaspora involvement in development of origin countries". International Migration Institute. University of Oxford.

De Haas, H., 2010.The Internal Dynamics of Migration Processes: A Theoretical Inquiry. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 36(10), pp.1587–1617.

De Jong G.F., 2000. Expectations, gender and norms in migration decision-making. *Population Studies* (54), pp.307-319.

De Olivieira, O and Roberts. 1994. The many roles of the informal sector in development: evidence from urban labour market research, 1940-1989, in Rakowski, C. A. (ed). *Contrapunto: The informal sector debate in Latin America.* Albany : State University of New York Press.

De Soto, H., 2000. *The Mystery of Capital: Why Capitalism Triumphs in the West and Fails Everywhere Else.* Basic Books: New York.

Denzin, N, K and Lincoln, Y, S., 2013. *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*. 4th Edition. SAGE Publications.

Denzin, NK. & Lincoln, Y. 2003. Collecting and interpreting collective materials. 2nd edition. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.

Department of Home Affairs. 2014. Final immigration regulations. Government gazette. Number 37679.

Department of Home Affairs. 2014. Government gazette 37679. {https://www.greengazette.co.za/documents/regulation-gazette-37679-of-22-may-2014-vol-587-no-10199_20140522-GGR-37679.pdf} . [Accessed 09 June 2016].

Department of Home Affairs. 2016. Green Paper on International Migration. Government gazette 40088.{http://www.dha.gov.za/GreenPaperonInternationalMigration_GAZETTE_NO_7382_1.pdf} [Accessed 02 September 2016].

Department of Home Affairs. 2017. "White Paper on International Migration for South Africa", Government Gazette, Department of Home Affairs, Government of South Africa, Pretoria.

Department of Basic Education (Republic of South Africa). 2009. Education Statistics in South Africa 2009. Department of Basic Education. Pretoria.

Desiderio, M, V. 2016. Integrating Refugees in Host Country Labour Markets: Challenges and Policy Options. Washington, DC: Migration Policy Institute. {https://www.migrationpolicy.org/sites/default/files/publications/TCM-Asylum-Desiderio-FINAL.pdf} . [Accessed 07 April 2018].

Docquier, F., and Rapoport, H., 2007. Skilled Migration: The Perspective of Developing Countries. IZA Discussion Paper 2873.

Dodson, B., 1998. Women on the move: Gender and Cross boarder migration to South Africa. Migration Policy Series Number 9. The South African Migration Project (SAMP).

Dodson, B., and Crush, J., 2004. 'A report on gender discrimination in South Africa's 2002 Immigration Act: masculinizing the migrant'. *Feminist Review 77*, pp.96-119.

Donato, K, M and Gabaccia, D., 2016. The Global Feminisation of Migration: Past, Present and Future. Migration Information Source. .  [Accessed 7 August 2017].

Donnelly, J., 2015. Xenophobia in America. www.voicesofyouth.org .[Accessed 11 November 2018].

Dumont, J.C., Spielvogel, G. and Widmaier, S., 2010. International Migrants in Developed, Emerging and Developing Countries: An Extended Profile. OECD Social, Employment and Migration Working Paper 113.

Dutton, M., Orloff, L., and Hass, G, A., 2000. Characteristics of help-seeking behaviours, resources, and services needs of battered immigrant Latinas: legal and policy implications. *Georgetown Journal on Poverty Law and Policy* 7(2). pp.245-305.

Employment Services Act. 2014. Government Gazette, Act No. 4: Volume 586.

Enchautegui, M, E. 2015. Engaging Employers in Immigrant Integration. Research report, Immigrants and Immigration. Urban Institute. Enchautegui, M.E., 2015. Engaging Employers in Immigrant Integration. *Washington DC: Urban Institute*.

Enos, R, D. 2014. "Causal effect of intergroup contact on exclusionary attitudes." *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 111(10),3699–3704.

Erel, U. 2012. Gender and transnationalism. *European Journal of Women's Studies* 19(4): pp 409-412.

Erez, E., Alderman,M and Gregory, C., 2009. Intersections of immigration and domestic violence. Voices of battered immigrant women. *Feminist Criminology* 4 (32): pp 32-56.

European Network of Migrant Women and European Women's Lobby. 2012. Equal rights. Equal Voices. Migrant women's integration in the labour market in six European cities: A comparative approach. http://www.epim.info [ Accessed 05 July 2018].

European Network of National Human Rights Institutions. 2017. . [Accessed 14 March 2019].

European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. 2017. Together in the EU, Promoting the participation of migrants and their descendants. Publications office of the European Union. Luxemburg.

European Union Commission and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2015. Indicators of Immigrant Integration 2015, Settling In. http://www.oecd.org/publications/indicators-of-immigrant-integration-2015-settling-in-9789264234024-en.htm. [Accessed 8 March 2019].

European Union and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2016. How are refugees faring on the labour market in Europe? A first evaluation based on 2014 EU Labour Force Survey ad hoc module. Working Paper 1/2016.

European Union and United Nations Women. 2016. "Promoting and Protecting Women Migrant Workers' Labour and Human Rights: Engaging with International, National Human Rights Mechanisms to Enhance Accountability". Addressing large movements of Refugees and migrants.

United Nations summit on Refugees and Migrants http://refugeesmigrants.un.org/ [Accessed 15 November 2016].

Fall, P.D., 2007. La dynamique migratoire ouest africaine entre ruptures et continuitiés, *Comprendre les dynamiques des migrations sur le continent-* paper presented to conference: 'Understanding Migration Dynamics in the Continent', *Centre for Migration Studies and International Migration Institute-Accra*. Accra, Ghana 18-21 September 2007.

Fernández-Macías, E and Paniagua de la Iglesia, T. 2018. Labour integration of migrants and descendants. European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions. Eurofund.

Fineman, M, L, A. 1995. Masking dependency: The political role of family rhetoric. *Virginia Law Review 81(8)*: pp 2181-2251. Fineman, M.L., 1995. Masking dependency: The political role of family rhetoric. *Va. L. Rev.*, *81*, p.2181.

Fine, J. and Bird, W. (eds.). 2003. *Shades of Prejudice: An investigation into the South African Media's Coverage of racial violence and xenophobia*. Media Monitoring Project, CSVR. CSVR Report http://www. csvr. org.  za/wits/papers/papprej.

Fion de Vletter. 1987. Foreign labour on the South African gold mines: new insights on an old problem *International Labour Review* 12:  pp 199-218. De Vletter, F., 1987. Foreign labour on the South African gold mines: New insights on an old problem. *Int'l Lab. Rev.*, *126*, p.199.

Flahaux, M and De Haas, H., 2016. African migration trends, patterns and drivers. *Comparative migration studies 4(1),*Fleury, A., 2016. Understanding women and migration: A literature review.

Global Knowledge Partnership on Migration and Development. KNOMAD Working Paper 8. atina.org.rs. [Accessed 21 October 2018].

Fluri, J.L., 2009. Geopolitics of gender and violence 'from below'. Political Geography, 28(4), pp.259-265.

Fluri, J., 2015. Feminist Political Geography" In *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to Political Geography*, J. Agnew, V. Mamadouh, A. Secor, and J. Sharp (eds.). Wiley-Blackwell.

Fox, J.A. and Bada, X., 2009. *Migrant Civic Engagement.* Center for Global International and Regional Studies. Center for Global, International and Regional Studies, UC Santa Cruz.

Frye, M. 1996. The necessity of differences: constructing a positive category of women. *SIGNS: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 21(3): 991-1010. Frye, M., 1996.

Frye, M., 2000. *Categories and Dichotomies*, *Encyclopedia of Feminist Theories*. ed., Loraine Code, NY: Routledge.

Galiev, A. and Masoodi, S., 2012, August. Language Barriers to Integration: A Canadian Perspective. In *FIAR: Forum for Inter-American Research* 5 (2).

Garcia,B., Anker,R., Pinnelli, A. 2003. Women in the Labour Market in Changing Economies: Demographic Issues. Oxford University Press. NewYork. García, B., Anker, R. and Pinnelli, A. eds., 2003. *Women in the labour market in changing economies: demographic issues*. OUP Oxford.

Garip, F. 2008. Social Capital and Migration: How Do Similar Resources Lead to Divergent Outcomes? *Demography* 45(3), pp.591–617.

Gest, J. 2015. To become 'French' abandon who you are. The Great Debate. Reuters. . [Accessed 7 March 2019].

Ghosh, J. 2009. *"Migration and Gender Empowerment: Recent Trends and Emerging Issues."* Human Development Research Paper 04. United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Report Office. New York.

Glasser, B.G. and Strauss, A. L. 1967.The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research, Chicago: Aldine. Glaser, B.G. and Strauss, A.L., 1967. The discovery ofgrounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research. *Chicago: Aldire*.

Glick, S, N. 1999. *Transmigrants and Nation states: Something Old and Something New in the US Immigrant Experience*. The Handbook of International Migration. The Russell Sage Foundation. New York. pp.94-119.

Global Commission on International Migration. 2005. Migration in an interconnected world: New directions for action. GCIM Report. www.gcim.org . [Accessed 30 March 2017].

Goldkhul, G. 2012. Pragmatism versus interpretivism in qualitative information systems research. *European Journal of Information Systems 21(2)*: pp135-146.

Goodman, S.W. and Wright, M. 2015. Does mandatory integration matter? Effects of civic requirements on immigrant socio-economic and political outcomes. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 41: 1885–1908.

Gonzales, M. C., Jain-Chandra, S., Kochhar, M. K., and Newiak, M. M. 2015. *Fair Play: More Equal Laws Boost Female Labour Force Participation*. International Monetary Fund Discussion Papers No. SDN 15/02.

Grasmuck, S., Pessar, P. R. 1991. *Between Two Islands: Dominican International Mi- gration*. Berkeley: Univ. Calif. Press. Grasmuck, S. and Pessar, P.R., 1991. *Between two islands: Dominican international migration*. Univ of California Press.

Green, A.E., 2007. Local Action on labour market integration of new arrivals: Issues and dilemmas for policy. *Local Economy 22(4)*, pp.349-361

Greyling, T., 2016. The expected well-being of urban refugees and asylum-seekers in Johannesburg. *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences. 19(2):* pp.232-248

Grimson, J. and Rougheen, C., 2009. Diversity in engineering: tinkering, tailoring, transforming?, eds. Hyldgaaard Christensen, Bernard Delahousse and Martin Meganck in Engineering in Context, Denmark, Academica,pp.197-220

Gsir, S. 2014. Civic Participation and Integration: A country of origin perspective, INTERACT RR 2014/03, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, San Domenico di Fiesole (FI): European University Institute. Gsir, S., 2014. Civic Participation and Integration: A country of origin perspective.

Guruge, S. and Butt, H. 2015. A scoping review of mental health issues and concerns among immigrant and refugee youth in Canada: Looking back, moving forward. *Canadian Journal of Public Health* 106(2): e72-8.

Hagan, J.M., Rodriguez, N., and Castro, B., 2011. Social effects of mass deportations by the United States government, 2000–2010. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 34(8)*, pp.1374-1391.

Hai, Y. *Racism and xenophobia in China*. Fudan University. Department of Sociology. [Accessed 11 November 2018].

Hainmueller, J, and Hopkins, D. 2015. "The Hidden American Immigration Consensus: A Conjoint Analysis of Attitudes toward Immigrants." *American Journal of Political Science* 59(3),pp.529–548.

Halfacree, K and Boyle, P., 1999. *Introduction: Gender and Migration in Developed Countrie*. Boyle, P., and Halfacree, K. (eds). Migration and Gender in Developed World. London. Routledge. New York.

Hammond, L., Awad, M., Dagane, A. I., Hansen, P., Horst, C., Menkhaus, K., and Obare, L. (2011). Cash and compassion: The role of the Somali diaspora in relief, development and peace-building. Nairobi: United Nations Development Programme (UNDP).

Han, M. S. 1986. Social interaction and life satisfaction among the elderly. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, St. Louis University, St. Louis.

Haqopian, J., 2015.The Hidden Truth: The Rising "Global Racism" and Xenophobia. Center for research on Globalisation. www.globalresearch.ca [Accessed 11 November 2018].

Harrell, M.C., and Bradley, M, A. 2009. Data collection methods. Semi structured interviews and focus groups. RAND National Defense Research Institute. RAND Corporation. California.

Harrell, M.C. and Bradley, M.A., 2009. *Data collection methods. Semi-structured interviews and focus groups*. Rand National Defense Research Inst santa monica ca.

Hart, D., 1991. *The informal economy in South African Literature, in Rogerson, C. and Preston-Whyte, E. (eds.). South Africa's informal economy*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Heinmueller, J., Hangartner, D., and Pietrantuono, G., 2015. Naturalization fosters the long-term political integration of immigrants. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA.

Helbling, M. 2013. Validating integration and citizenship policy indices *Comparative European Politics* 11: 555–576. Helbling, M., 2013. Validating integration and citizenship policy indices. *Comparative European Politics*, *11*(5), pp.555-576.

Helbling, M., Reeskens, T., Stark, C., Stolle, D. and Wright, M., 2015. Enabling immigrants to participate: redirecting our attention to the role of integration regimes. In *The Political Immigrant: A Comparative Perspective*, edited by Antoine Bilodeau. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Hellgren, Z., 2015. Immigrant integration as a two-way process: Translating theory into practice. Interdisciplinary Research Group on Immigration. GRITIM-UPF Working Paper series, Number 23.

Ho, E., Cheung, E., Bedford, C., and Leung, P., 2000. *Settlement assistance needs of recent migrants*. University of Waikato, Hamilton: Migration Research Group, Department of Geography and Population Studies Centre and New Zealand Immigration Service.

Hoissan, I., Mathbor, G, M and Semenza, R. 2013. Feminisation and Labour Vulnerability in Global Manufacturing Industries: Does Gendered discourse matter. *Asian Social Work and Policy*

*Review 7*: pp 197–212. Hossain, M.I., Mathbor, G.M. and Semenza, R., 2013. Feminization and labor vulnerability in global manufacturing industries: Does gendered discourse matter?. *Asian Social Work and Policy Review*, *7*(3), pp.197-212.

Hollander, A.C., Bruce, D. Burström, B. and Ekblad, S. 2011. Gender related mental health differences between refugees and non-refugee immigrants. A cross-sectional register-based study. *BMC Public Health, 11(1),* pp.180.

Hollander, A.C., Bruce, D. Burström, B. and Ekblad, S. 2013. The association between immigrant subgroup and poor mental health: a population-based register study. *The Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease* 1(8), pp.645-52.

Hollander, A.C. 2013. Social inequalities in mental health and mortality among refugees and other immigrants to Sweden--epidemiological studies of register data. *Global Health Action* 6(1), pp.21059.

Holloway, I., and Wheeler, S., 2002. *Qualitative Research in Nursing*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Hondagneu-Sotelo, P., 1994. *Gendered Transitions: Mexican Experiences of Immigration*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Hooper, K., 2019. *Exploring new legal migration pathways. Lessons from pilot projects*. Translantic Council on Migration. Migration Policy Institute Europe: Brussels.

Hooper, K., Desiderio, M and Salant, B. 2017. *Improving the labour market integration of migrants and refugees: Empowering cities through better use of EU instruments*. Migration Policy

Institute Europe: Brussels. Hooper, K., Desiderio, M.V. and Salant, B., 2017. *Migration Policy Institute Europe (MPI): Brussels, Belgium.*

Hovell M., Wahlgren D, R and Gehrman, C. 2009. *The behavioral ecological model: integrating public health and behavioral science.* In: DiClemente RJ, ed. Emerging Theories in Health Promotion Practice and Research: Strategies for Improving Public Health. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass. Hovell, M.F., Wahlgren, D.R. and Gehrman. pp.347-385.

Htun, M, and Weldon, S, L. 2008. *"When and Why Do Governments Promote Sex Equality? Violence against Women, Reproductive Rights, and Work-Family Issues in Cross-National Perspective."* Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Political Association. Boston, MA, August 27.

Huddlestone, T and Sanchez-Montijano, E., 2015. *Integration Policies: Who Benefits?* Policy Brief. "Integration Policies: Who benefits? The development and use of indicators in integration debates" www.mipex.eu [Accessed 30 May 2016].

Huff, R., 2014. Transnationalism. Encyclopedia Britannica. https://www.britannica.com/topic/transnationalism . [ Accessed 09 November 2018].

Hungwe, C. and Gelderblom, D. 2014. Understanding the social exclusion of Zimbabwean migrants in Johannesburg, South Africa. *Journal of Community Positive Practices 14*: pp 75-91.

Hunt, A. and Samman. E. 2016. *Women's Economic Empowerment: Navigating Enablers and Constraints.* UN High Level Panel on Women" s Economic Empowerment background paper. London: Overseas Development Institute.

Hussey, J., and Hussey, R., 1997. Business research: A practical guide for undergraduate and postgraduate students. London: Macmillan.

Hunt, A., and Sarwar, B, M., 2017. Women's economic empowerment at international level, Directorate general for internal policies. Policy Department C: Citizens rights and constitutional affairs. Women's rights and Gender equality. In-Depth Analysis. European Union.

Idemudia, E, S., Williams, J, K and Wyatt, G, E. 2013. Migration Challenges among Zimbabwean Refugees Before, during and Post Arrival in South Africa. *Journal of Injury and Violence Research 5(1)*: pp 17–27.

International Labor Organisation. 2010. Labor and Social Trends in Nepal 2010, ILO Country Office for Nepal and National Planning Commission, Government of Nepal.

International Labour Organisation. 2012. Global Employment Trends for Women. ILO, Geneva.

International Labour Organisation .2013. Women and Men in the Informal Economy: A Statistical Picture (2nd Edition) International Labour Office. Geneva.

International Labour Organisation. 2015. Global Estimates on Migrant Workers: Results and methodology. ILO, Geneva.

International Labour Organisation. 2015. Promoting decent work for migrant workers.  Thirteenth international coordination meeting on international migration. Population Division Department of Economic and Social Affairs United Nations Secretariat New York, 12-13 February 2015.

International Labour Organisation. 2016a. Gender equality in labour migration laws, policy and management: GEM toolkit. International Labour Organisation. Bangkok.

International Labour Organisation. 2016b. Towards a Framework for fair and effective integration of Migrants into the Labour Market. OECD, ILO, World Bank. International Monetary Fund. . [Accessed 6 March 2019].

International Labour Organisation. 2018. World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends for women 2018- Global Snapshot. International Labour Office. Geneva.

International Monetary Fund .2016. Jaumotte, F., K. Koloskova, and S. Saxena (eds). Impact of Migration on Income Levels in Advanced Economies, IMF Spillover Note, Issue 8. International Monetary Fund. Washington.

International Organisation for Migration. 2012. Crushed Hopes: Underemployment and deskilling among skilled migrant women. IOM. Geneva.

International Organisation for Migration. 2014. Harnessing Knowledge on the migration of highly skilled women. Organisation for Economic Cooperation (OECD). International Organisation for Migration. Geneva.

International Organisation for Migration. 2016. 2015 Global migration trends factsheet. Global Migration Data Analysis Center (GMDAC). IOM, Berlin.

International Organisation for Migration. 2016. Migration Flows from Iraq to Europe: Reasons behind Migration. IOM Iraq Mission. Baghdad.

International Organisation for Migration. 2017. Migration initiatives 2018 Funding requirements. Leading the migration governance agenda. International Organisation for Migration. Geneva.

Ip, M., and Friesen, W. 2001. The new Chinese community in New Zealand: Local outcomes of transnationalism. *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal, 10(2)*, pp.213–240.

Ireland, P. 2004. *Becoming Europe: Immigration, Integration, and the Welfare State*. University of Pittsburgh Press. Pittsburgh. Ireland, P.R., 2004. *Becoming Europe: immigration, integration, and the welfare state*. University of Pittsburgh Pre.

Isike, C and Isike, E. 2012. A Socio-cultural analysis of African immigration to South Africa. *Alternation 19(1)*: pp 93-116. Isike, C. and Isike, E., 2012. A socio-cultural analysis of African immigration to South Africa. *Alternation*, *19*(1), pp.93-116.

Italian Agency for Cooperation and Development. 2017. About migration 7 researches of 5 Ethiopian Universities on the root causes of migration. Emergency Initiative in support of vulnerable people, refugees, IDPs and migrants addressing the root causes of irregular migration. www.aics.gov.it [ Accessed 13 July 2018].

Jamil, H., Kanno, S,S., AboShasha, R., Alsaqa, M,M., Fakhouri, M and Arnetz B,B. 2012. Promoters and barriers to work: A comparative study of refugees versus immigrants in the United States. *The New Iraqi Journal of Medicine* 8(2):19-28

Jarvis, P. 1999. The Practitioner-Researcher. Developing Theory from practice. Jossey-Bass. California. Jarvis, P., 1999. *The Practitioner-Researcher. Developing Theory from Practice.*

*Jossey-Bass Higher and Adult Education Series*. Jossey-Bass Publishers, 350 Sansome St., San Francisco, CA 94104.

Jaggar, A. (1983). *Feminist Politics and Human Nature* . Totowa: Rowman & Allanheld. Jaggar, A.M., 1983. *Feminist politics and human nature*. Rowman & Littlefield.

Jinnah. 2013. New households, new rules? Examining the impact of migration on Somali family life in Johannesburg. Q Science Proceedings. p.7.

Johnson, C.M., Rostila, M., Svensson, A.C. and Engström, K. 2017. The role of social capital in explaining mental health inequalities between immigrants and Swedish-born: a population-based cross-sectional study. *BMC Public Health* 17: 117.

Jolly, S., Reeves, H and Piper, N., 2005. Gender and Migration: Overview report. Bridge. Institute of Development Studies. www.bridge.ids.ac.uk. [Accessed 20 June 2017].

Jorgensen, M, B., 2012. The diverging logics of integration policy making at national and city level. *International Migration Review,* 46 (1), pp.244-278.

Junge, M and Retana de la Peza, M. 2013. Accompanying spouses in a welfare state. DEA and Spousecare. Copenhagen Talent Bridge.

Kabeer, N, Simeen M, and Sakiba T. 2011. *"Does paid work provide a pathway to women's empowerment? Empirical findings from Bangladesh."* IDS Working Paper No 375. Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex, Brighton. Bangladesh.

Kabeer, N. 2012. Women's economic empowerment and inclusive growth: labour markets and enterprise development. SIG Working Paper. Department for International Development (DFID) and International Development Research Center (IDRC). *International Development Research Centre*, *44*(10), pp.1-70.

Kalitanyi, V and Visser, V. 2010. African immigrants in South Africa: job takers or job creators. *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences* 13(4): pp.376-390.

Kandiyoti, D. 1988. Bargaining with patriarchy. *Gender and Society* 2: 274-290.

Karaoud, A. 2018. War, Culture, and Agency Among Sahrawi Women Refugees: A Photo-Essay, in Marcia Texler Segal , Vasilikie Demos eds. *Gender and the Media: Women's Places (Advances in Gender Research, Volume 26)* Emerald Publishing Limited.

Karasapan, Omer. 2017. "Refugees, migrants, and the politics of fear." https://www.brookings.edu/blog/future-development/2017/04/12/refugees-migrants-and-the-politics-of-fear/[Accessed 7 March 2019].

Kasper, H., 2005. *I am the Household Head now! Gender Aspects of Out-migration for Labour in Nepal*. Nepal Institute of Development Studies.

Kim, B.S.., Leong, F.T.L., Inman, A.G., Ebreo, A., Yang, L., Kinoshita, L and Fu, M eds. 2007. Acculturation and enculturation. Handbook of Asian American Psychology Second Edition. Thousand Oaks, Sage. California. Kim, B.S., 2007. Acculturation and enculturation. *Handbook of Asian American psychology*, *2*, pp.141-158.

Kim, J, Y and Sung K, T., 2000. Conjugal violence in Korean American families: A residue of the cultural tradition. *Journal of Family Violence* 15(4): pp.331–345.

Kim, I. J., Lau, A. S., and Chang, D. F. 2007. Family violence among Asian Americans. In F. Leong, A. G. Inman, A. Ebreo, L. Yang, L. M. Kinoshita, & M. Fu (Eds.), Handbook of Asian American psychology. Thousand Oaks, Sage. California.

Leong, F.T., Ebreo, A.E., Kinoshita, L.E., Inman, A.G., Yang, L.H.E. and Fu, M.E., 2007. *Handbook of Asian American psychology*. Sage Publications, Inc.

Kissinger P., Kovacs, S., Anderson-Smits, C., Schmidt, N., Salinas, O., Hembling, J., Beaulieu, A., Longfellow, L., Liddon, N., Rice, J., Shedlin, M. 2012. Patterns and predictors of HIV/STI risk among Latino migrant men in a new receiving community. *AIDS Behaviour*. 16(1): pp 199–213.

Kissinger, P.J. and Shedlin, M., 2012. HIV/STI Risk among Latino Migrant Men in New Receiving Communities. In *HIV Prevention with Latinos: Theory, Research, and Practice*. Oxford University Press.

Klugman, J. and Tyson, L., 2016. *Leave No One Behind: A call to action for gender equality and women's economic empowerment*. Report of the UN Secretary-General's High-Level Panel on Women's Economic Empowerment.

Koenane, M, L, J and Maphunye, K, J. 2015. Afrophobia, moral and political disguises: Sepa leholo ke la moeti. *The Journal of Transdiscliplinary Research in Southern Africa* 11(4): pp 83-98.

Kofman, E and Raghuram, P., 2009. Skilled female labour migration. Focus Migration. Policy Brief 13.

Kofman, E. 2004. Gendered global migrations: diversity and stratification. *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 6(4): pp 643-665.

Koh, S. D., Sakauye, R. M., and Koh, T. H. 1986. Mental health and stresses in Asian American elderly (P/AAMHRC Report 86-b). Pacific/Asian American Mental Health Research Report, Chicago.

Kok, P. 2008. *Migration in South and Southern Africa: Dynamics and Determinants. Integrated Regional and Rural Development Research Progr*amme. Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC). Capetown: HSRC Press.

Kok, P., Oucho, J. and Gelderblom, D., 2006. *Migration in South and Southern Africa: dynamics and determinants*. HSRC Press.

Kok, P. Gelderblom, D. Oucho, J.O and Van Zyl, J. (eds). 2003. *Post-Apartheid Patterns of Internal Migration in South Africa.Cape Town*: HSRC Press.

Konhle-Seidl, R. 2018. *Integration of Refugees in Austria, Germany and Sweden: Comparative Analysis*. Directorate General for Internal Policies. Policy Department A. Economic and Scientific Policy. European Parliament. European Union.

Kontos M. (ed). 2009. Integration of female immigrants in labour market and society. EU Project: Integration of female immigrants in labour market and society. Policy Assessment and policy recommendations (FeMiPol). Institute of Social Research at the Goethe University, Frankfurt.

Koopmans, R. 2010. Trade-offs between equality and difference: immigrant integration, multiculturalism and the welfare state in cross-national perspective. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 36 (1): pp 1–26.

Kothari, C.R. 2004. Research Methodology, Methods and Techniques. 2nd Edition. New Age International Publisher Limited. Kothari, C.R., 2004. *Research methodology: Methods and techniques*. New Age International.

Kofman, E. and Kraler, A., 2006. Civic stratification, gender and family migration policies in Europe.IMISCOE Policy Brief no.15. www.politikwissenschaft.univie.ac.at. [Accessed 06 December 2016].

Kuo, W.H., 1984. Prevalence of depression among Asian-Americans. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease (172)*, pp.449-457.

Kwena ZA, Camlin CS, Shisanya CA, Mwanzo I, Bukusi EA. 2013. Short-term mobility and the risk of HIV infection among married couples in the fishing communities along Lake Victoria, Kenya. *PloS One* 8(1). e54523.

Landau, W. 2012. Migration and employment in South Africa. Statistical and econometric analyses of internal and international migrants in Statistics South Africa's labour market data. Migration for Work Research Consortium. University of Witwatersrand, South Africa. African Centre for Migration and Society.

La Barbera M. 2012. Intersectional-gender and the locationality of women "in transit". In: Bonifacio G. (eds) *Feminism and Migration. International Perspectives on Migration,* volume 1.

Springer, Dordrecht. La Barbera, M., 2012. Intersectional-Gender and the Locationality of women "in transit". In *Feminism and Migration*(pp. 17-31). Springer, Dordrecht.

Lawrence, N.W. 2013. *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches.* Allyn and Bacon Publishers. Neuman, W.L., 1997. Social research methods: qualitative and quantitative approaches. Allyn & Bacon. *Needham Heights, USA*.

Leach, F., 1996. Women in the informal sector. *Development in Practice, 6*(1): pp. 25-36.

Lee, E. S. 1966. A Theory of Migration. *Demography 3*: pp.47-57. Lee, E.S., 1966. A theory of migration. *Demography*, *3*(1), pp.47-57.

Lee, Y and Hadeed, L. 2009. Intimate partner violence among Asian immigrant communities. Health/ Mental health consequences, help-seeking behaviors and service utilization. Trauma*, Violence and Abuse 10(2)*: pp 143-173. Lee, Y.S. and Hadeed, L., 2009. Intimate partner violence among Asian immigrant communities: Health/mental health consequences, help-seeking behaviors, and service utilization. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, *10*(2), pp.143-170.

Levitt, P., Yurdakul, G., Bodemann, M., (eds). 2007. *The changing contours of immigrant religious life. In Citizenship and Immigrant Incorporation: Comparative Perspectives on North America and Western Europe*. Palgrave Macmillan. New York.

Liebig, T. 2007a. The Labour Market integration of immigrants in Australia. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. OECD Social, Employment and Migration Working Papers. Directorate for Employment, Labour and Social Affairs. Employment Labour and Social Affairs Committee.

Liebig, T. 2007b. The Labour Market integration of immigrants in Germany. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. OECD Social, Employment and Migration Working Papers. Directorate for Employment, Labour and Social Affairs. Employment Labour and Social Affairs Committee.

Lima, A. 2010. Transnationalism: A new mode of immigrant integration. The Mauricio Gaston Institute for Latino Community Development and Public Policy.

Lintner, C., 2015. Migrant entrepreneurship: New potential discovered. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *191*, pp.1601-1606.

Lisenkova, K and Sanchez-Martinez, M. 2016. The long-term Macroeconomic effects of lower migration to the UK. National Institute of Economic and Social Research. Discussion Paper Number 460.

Lowe, A. and Prout, S.R., 2011. Economic justice in domestic violence litigation. *MICH. BJ*, *90*, pp.32-33.

Lutz, H., 2010. Gender in the migratory process. *Journal of ethnic and migration studies*, *36*(10), pp.1647-1663.

Lutz, H., 2011. *The new maids. Transnational women and the care economy*. London: Zed Books.

MacKinnon, C. 2000. Points against postmodernism. *Chicago-Kent Law Review* 75 (3),pp.687–712.

Mafukidze, J and Mbanda, V. 2008. Low income African migrant women and social exclusion in South Africa. Agenda: Empowering women for Gender Equity. Volume 22 Issue 78. Mafukidze, J. and Mbanda, V., 2008. Low-income African migrant women and social exclusion in South Africa. *Agenda*, *22*(78), pp.172-185.

Mahler, S, J and Pessar, P, R. 2006. Gender matters: Ethnographers bring gender from the periphery toward the core of migration studies. *International Migration Review* (40): pp 27–63. Mahler, S.J. and Pessar, P.R., 2006. Gender matters: Ethnographers bring gender from the periphery toward the core of migration studies. *International migration review*, *40*(1), pp.27-63.

Mahler, S, J. and Pessar, P. 2001. Gendered geographies of power: analyzing gender across transnational spaces. *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* (7): pp 441-459. Mahler, S.J. and Pessar, P.R., 2001. Gendered geographies of power: Analyzing gender across transnational spaces.

Markova, E. and Black, R., 2007. *East European immigration and community cohesion* (pp. 1-80). York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Marshall, M.N. 1996. Sampling for Qualitative Research. *Family Practice* 13 (6): pp 522-525.

Martinez-Donate, A.P., Hovell, M.F., Rangel, M.G., Zhang, X., Sipan, C.L., Magis-Rodriguez, C. and Gonzalez-Fagoaga, J.E., 2015. Migrants in transit: the importance of monitoring HIV risk among migrant flows at the Mexico–US border. *American journal of public health*, *105*(3), pp.497-509.

Massey, D. 1993. *Power Geometry and a Progressive Sense of Place*. In J. Bird, B. Curtis, T. Putnam, G. Robertson and L. Tickner (eds.). Mapping the futures. Routledge. London. Massey, D., 2009. Concepts of space and power in theory and in political practice. *Documents d'anàlisi geogràfica*, (55), pp.15-26.

Massey, D.S., Fischer, M.J. and Capoferro, C., 2006. International migration and gender in Latin America: A comparative analysis. *International migration*, *44*(5), pp.63-91.

Mason, M., 2010, August. Sample size and saturation in PhD studies using qualitative interviews. In *Forum qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: qualitative social research* (Vol. 11, No. 3).

Mazey, S., 2000. Introduction: integrating gender—intellectual and 'real world' mainstreaming. *Journal of European Public Policy* 7 (3), pp.333–45

Mbiyozo, A.N., 2018. Gender and migration in South Africa: Talking to women migrants. *ISS Southern Africa Report*, *2018*(16), pp.1-36.

McDonald, D.A (ed). 2000. Towards a better understanding of Cross-Border migration in Southern Africa. On Borders: Perspectives of International Migration in Southern Africa. St Martin's press. New York.

Mekonen, Y., 2010. A '2015'agenda for Africa: Development from a human perspective. *IDS Bulletin*, *41*(1), pp.45-47.

Miedema, B., Tastsoglou, E. and Miedema, B., 2000. " But Where Are You From, Originally?" Immigrant Women and Integration in the Maritimes. *ATLANTIS-HALIFAX CANADA-*, *24*(2), pp.82-91.

Mincer J., 1978. Family migration decisions. *Journal of Political Economy (86)*,pp .749–778.

Moody, C., 2006. Migration and Economic Growth: 21st Century Perspective. New Zealand Treasury Working Paper. www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/research-policy [Accessed 04 November 2017].

Morales, L., 2011. "Conceptualizing and Measuring Migrants' Political Inclusion", in Morales, Laura and Giugni, Marco eds. Social capital, political participation and migration in Europe. Making Multicultural Democracy work?  Palgrave Mac Millan. New York.

Morini, C., 2007. The feminization of labour in cognitive capitalism. *Feminist review*, *87*(1), pp.40-59.

Niraula, B.B. and Morgan, S.P., 1996. Marriage formation, post-marital contact with natal kin and autonomy of women: evidence from two Nepali settings. *Population Studies*, *50*(1), pp.35-50.

Morna C, L., Dube, S and Makamure, L. 2016. SADC Gender Protocol 2016 Barometer. Action and Results for Sustainable Development. Southern Africa Gender Protocol Alliance. http://genderlinks.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/Baro...-2016-Begin-pg43-FINALrev.pdf. [Accessed 18 November 2016].

Morse, J,M. 1994. Designing funded qualitative research. Denzin, N,K and Lincoln Yeds. Handbook of qualitative research 2nd Edition. Carlifornia: Thousand Oaks.

Moser, C.O., 1978. Informal sector or petty commodity production: dualism or dependence in urban development?. *World development*, *6*(9-10), pp.1041-1064.

Mudimbe, V.Y., 1988. *The Invention of Africa: Gnosis, Philosophy, and the Order of Knowledge*. Indiana University Press. Blooming and Indianapolis.

Mukasa, R, S., Gawaya, R and Banze, A. 2008. The African Women's Protocol: Harnessing a potential force for positive change. Oxfam GB. Mega Digital, Capetown. Mukasa, R.S., 2008. *The African Women's Protocol: harnessing a potential force for positive change*. Jacana Media.

Murunga, G. 2015., Why are we so shocked? It is Pretoria's official policy to treat Africans as aliens. African Review. www.africareview.com . [Accessed 29 September 2016].

Mutambanengwe, A. 2012. Post migration experiences of Zimbabweans in Pietermaritzburg, South Africa. Unpublished Master's Thesis, University of Kwa-Zulu Natal, Pietermaritzburg. Mutambanengwe, F.A., 2012. *Post Migration Experiences of Zimbabweans in Pietermaritzburg, South Africa* (Doctoral dissertation, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Pietermaritburg).

Muthuki, J., 2010. *Renegotiation of gender identities in transnational spaces: The experiences of foreign students of African origin at the University of KwaZulu-Natal in Durban South Africa*. Lambert Academic Publishing.

Muzumbukilwa, W. 2007. *The Impact of Government Migration Policies on Foreigners Known as" Amakwerekwere" in South Africa* (Doctoral dissertation, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Durban).

Muzvidziwa, V.N., 2012. Cross-border Traders: Emerging, Multiple and Shifting Identities. *Alternation* 19(1), pp.217-238.

Myers, M. D. 2009. *Qualitative Research in Business & Management.* Sage, London. Myers, M.D., 2013. *Qualitative research in business and management*. Sage.
Page | 264

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2015. The Integration of Immigrants into American Society. Panel on the Integration of Immigrants into American Society, M.C. Waters and M.G. Pineau (eds). Committee on Population, Division of Behavioural and Social Sciences and Education. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. doi: 10.17226/21746.

Näre, L., and Akhtar, P., 2014. Gendered mobilities and social change. An introduction to the Special Issue on Gender, Mobility, Women's Studies International Forum. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2014.10.007. [Accessed 6 March 2019].

Nakhaie, M.R., 2007. Ethnoracial origins, social capital, and earnings. *Journal of International Migration and Integration/Revue de l'integration et de la migration internationale*, *8*(3), pp.307-325.

Nawyn, S.J., 2010. Gender and migration: Integrating feminist theory into migration studies. *Sociology Compass*, *4*(9), pp.749-765.

Neocosmos, M. 2006. From 'Foreign Natives' to 'Native Foreigners', Dakar: Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa (CODESRIA). Neocosmos, M., 2006. From 'Foreigner Natives' to 'Native Foreigners': Explaining Xenophobia in Post-Apartheid South Africa. Citizenship and Nationalism Identity and Politics.

Ndubuisi, C, A. 2017. *African solutions to African problems: assessing the African Union's application of endogenous conflict resolution approaches* (Doctoral dissertation). Doctor of Philosophy. University of KwaZulu Natal. School of Social Sciences. International Relations.

Ngwenya, N., 2010. African expatriate communities in Africa: their size, lifestyles and relationships with their sending state. *Africa Insight 40(1),* pp.5 – 18.

Nijhawan, L.P., Janodia, M.D., Muddukrishna, B.S., Bhat, K.M., Bairy, K.L., Udupa, N. and Musmade, P.B., 2013. Informed consent: Issues and challenges. *Journal of advanced pharmaceutical technology & research*, *4*(3), p.134.

Nørredam, M., 2015. Migration and health: exploring the role of migrant status through register-based studies. *Danish medical journal*, *62*(4), pp.B5068-B5068.

Nor'Aznin, A.B. and Norehan, A., 2007. Labor Force Participation Of Women In Malaysia. In *International Economic Conference on Trade and Industry (IECTI)* (pp. 1-17).

Nshimbi, C.C. and Fioramonti, L., 2014. The will to integrate: South Africa's responses to regional migration from the SADC region. *African Development Review*, *26*(S1), pp.52-63.

Ntuli, M., 2009. Exploring the status of African Women in the South African Labour Market 1995-2004. Thesis or Dissertation, Doctor of Philosophy. University of Cape Town. School of Economics, Faculty of Commerce.

Nyamnjoh, F.B., 2006. *Insiders and outsiders: Citizenship and xenophobia in contemporary Southern Africa*. Zed Books.

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2014. Finding the way: A discussion of the Swedish Migrant Integration System. Directorate for Employment, Labour and Social Affairs. OECD.

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2015. OECD Employment Outlook 2015. Statistical annex. http://www.keepeek.com/Digital-AssetManagement/oecd/employment/oecd-employment-outlook-2015. [Accessed 7 January 2018].

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development- Development assistance committee (OECD-DAC). 2016. Tracking the money for women's economic empowerment: Still a drop in the ocean. Paris: OECD.

OECD/European Union. 2015. Indicators of immigrant integration 2015: Settling in, Paris: OECD Publishing. http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264234024-en. [Accessed 7 October 2016].

OECD/ILO. 2018. How Immigrants Contribute to South Africa's Economy, OECD Publishing, Paris. OECD/ILO. 2018. How Immigrants Contribute to South Africa's Economy, OECD Publishing, Paris  [Accessed 15 April 2019].

Oishi, N. 2005.*Women in Motion: Globalisation, State Policies and Labour Migration in Asia.* Stanford University Press. California.

Ojong, V, B. 2002. *A study of independent migrant women in Kwa- Zulu Natal South Africa (Their lives and experiences).* Department of Anthropology and Development Studies. University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Ojong, V, B. 2012. Pragmatic and symbolic negotiation of home for African migrants in South Africa. *Alternation 19(1)*: pp 262-279.

Oleksy, E, H., Hearn, J and Golaǹska, D. 2011. *The Limits of Gendered Citizenship Contexts and Complexities*. New York: Routledge.

O'Neil, T., Fleury, A and Foresti, M. 2016. Women on the move. Migration, gender equality and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Overseas Development Institute. London.

Onwuegbuzie, A, J., Leech, N, L., Collins K, M ,T. 2010. Innovative Data Collection Strategies in Qualitative Research. *The Qualitative Report 15 (3)*: pp 696-726.

Organista K, C. 2007. Towards a structural-environmental model of risk for HIV and problem drinking in Latino labor migrants: the case of day laborers. Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Diversity in Social Work 16 (1–2): pp 95–125.

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2011. Women's economic empowerment. Issues paper Paris: OECD-DAC GENDERNET.

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2012. Harnessing the skills of migrants and diasporas to foster development policy options. Directorate General of global affairs, development and partnerships. French Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2014. Finding the way: A discussion of the Swedish Migrant Integration System. International migration division. Directorate for Employment, Labour and Social Affairs. www.oecd.org/migration [Accessed 15 November 2017].

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2016.Working Together. Skills and Labour Market Integration of Immigrants and their Children in Sweden: OECD Publishing

Orozco, M. and Rouse, R., 2007. Migrant Hometown Associations and opportunities for development: A global perspective. Migration Policy Institute.

Orloff, L.E., Jang, D. and Klein, C.F., 1995. With no place to turn: Improving legal advocacy for battered immigrant women. *Family Law Quarterly*, pp.313-329.

Ortiz-Ospina, E., Tzvetkova, S and Roser M. 2018. Female Labour Supply. http://www.ourworldindata.org/female-labor-supply#informal-work-unpaid-care-work . [Accessed 16 January 2018].

Osirim, M.J., 1992. The state of women in the Third World: The informal sector and development in Africa and the Caribbean. *Social Development Issues*, *14*(2-3), pp.74-87.

Otobe, N., 2014. Resource guide on gender issues in employment and labour market policies: working towards women's economic empowerment and gender equality. International Labour Office, Employment and Labour Market Policies Branch, Employment Policy Department. ILO. Geneva.

Otu, M.N., The Role Played by Transnational Mobility in the Renegotiation of African Scholarship at the University of KwaZulu-Natal. *Mobilities and Transnationalised Lives*, p.46.

Owen, G.T., 2014. Qualitative methods in higher education policy analysis: Using interviews and document analysis. *The Qualitative Report*, *19*(26), pp.1-19.

Ozler, S., 2000. Export orientation and female share of employment: Evidence from Turkey. *World Development*, *28*(7), pp.1239-1248.

Palloni, A., Massey, D, S and Cellabos, M., 2001. Social Capital and International Migration: A Test Using Information on Family Networks. *American Journal of Sociology* 106(5), pp.1262–1298

Pampati, S., Alattar, Z., Cordoba, E., Tariq, M. and de Leon, C.M., 2018. Mental health outcomes among Arab refugees, immigrants, and US born Arab Americans in Southeast Michigan: a cross-sectional study. *BMC psychiatry*, *18*(1), p.379.

Paris, S.B., 2018. Should assimilation be a requirement for citizenship? Open Society. https://www.economist.com/open-future/2018/04/30/should-assimilation-be-a-requirement-for-citizenship . [Accessed 7 March 2019].

Parutis, V., 2014. "Economic migrants" or "middling transnationals"? East European migrants' experiences of work in the UK. *International Migration*, *52*(1), pp.36-55.

Pasetti, F., 2014. Country Report: Integration Policies in Spain. INTERACT Research Report 2014:30.

Patton, M, Q. 1980. *Qualitative Evaluation Methods*. Sage Publications. Beverly Hills. Patton, M., Q. 1980 Qualitative Evaluation Methods. *Beverly Hills: Sage*.

Patton, M, Q. 1990. *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*. 2nd edition. Sage Publication. Newbury Park, CA. Patton, M.Q., 1990. *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. SAGE Publications.

Patton, M, Q. 2002. *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods*. 3rd edition. Sage Publications. Thousand Oaks, CA. Patton, M.Q., 2002. Qualitative research and evaluation methods. Thousand Oaks. *Cal.: Sage Publications*.

Pécoud, A., de Guchteneire, P. and Guchteneire, P.F. eds., 2007. *Migration without borders: Essays on the free movement of people*. Berghahn Books.

Pedraza. S., 1991. Women and Migration: The Social Consequences of Gender. *Annual Review of Sociology (17)*,pp.303- 325.

Peninx, R and Garcés-Mascareñas, B. 2014. The concept of integration as an analytical and as a policy concept. Integration of Migrants into What? Integration processes and policies in Europe. IMISCOE/Amsterdam University. Amsterdam.

Pessar, P.R. and Mahler, S.J., 2003. Transnational migration: Bringing gender in. *International migration review*, *37*(3), pp.812-846.

Phan, M.B., Banerjee, R., Deacon, L. and Taraky, H., 2015. Family dynamics and the integration of professional immigrants in Canada. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, *41*(13), pp.2061-2080.

Pharr, J.R., Moonie, S. and Bungum, T.J., 2011. The impact of unemployment on mental and physical health, access to health care and health risk behaviors. *ISRN Public Health*, *2012*.

Pierce, S and Gelatt, J. 2018. Evolution of the H1-B: Latest trends in a program on the brink of reform. Migration Policy Institute.  [Accessed 1 March 2019]

Pierce, S., Bolter, J and Selee, A., 2018. *US Immigration Policy under Trump. Deep Changes and Lasting Impacts.* Transatlantic Council on Migration. Migration Policy Institute. Washington DC.

Piper, N., 2008. Feminisation of migration and the social dimensions of development: the Asian case. *Third World Quarterly,* 29(7),pp.1287-1303.

Piper, N. 2009. Gender and Labor Migration in Asia. Report on Gender and Labor Migration in Asia. International Organisation for Migration.

Porter, F. and Sweetman, C. eds., 2005. *Mainstreaming gender in development: A critical review*. Oxfam.

Portes, A., 2006. Institutions and development: A conceptual reanalysis. *Population and development review*, *32*(2), pp.233-262.

Portes, A., Escobar, C and Arana, R. 2008. Bridging the gap: transnational and ethnic organisations in the political incorporation of immigrants in the United States. *Ethnic and Racial Studies 31(6)*,pp.1056-1090.

Portes, A. and Sassen-Koob, S., 1987. Making it underground: Comparative material on the informal sector in Western market economies. *American journal of Sociology*, *93*(1), pp.30-61.

Posel, D. 2003. Have migration patterns in post-apartheid South Africa changed? University of Natal.

Quinn, E., Stanley, J., Joyce, C. and O'Connell, P.J., 2007. Handbook on Immigration and Asylum in Ireland. *Economic and Social Research Institute: Dublin*.

Raghuram, P. and Kofman, E., 2002. State, labour markets and immigration: overseas doctors in the UK. *Environment and Planning A*, *34*, pp.2071-2089.

Ramakrishnan, S.K. and Viramontes, C., 2006. *Civic inequalitites: Immigrant volunteerism and community organisations in California*. Public Policy Instit. of CA.

Rathgebeger M. E. (1989). WID, WAD and GAD – Trends in Research and Practice. International Development Research Centre. Ottawa.

Ravasi, C., Salamin, X and Davoine, E. 2013. The challenge of dual career expatriate management in a specific host national environment: An exploratory study of expatriate and spouse adjustment in Switzerland based MNCs. Swiss National Center of Competence in Research LIVES-Overcoming vulnerability: life course perspectives. Swiss National Research Foundation.

Rawal, N., 2008. Social inclusion and exclusion: A review. *Dhaulagiri Journal of Sociology and Anthropology*, *2*, pp.161-180.Rawal, D.S. and Agrawal, K., 2016. Barriers to women's land and property access and ownership in Nepal. *Kathmandu: International Organisation for Migration*.

Razzu, G. ed., 2014. *Gender Inequality in the Labour Market in the UK*. OUP Oxford.

Rees, T., 1998. *Mainstreaming Equality in the European Union*. London: Routledge.

Reeves, H and Baden, S. 2000. Gender and Development: Concepts and definitions. Department for International Development (DFID). Institute of Development Studies. Reeves, H. and Baden, S., 2000. *Gender and development: Concepts and definitions* (Vol. 55). Brighton: Institute of Development Studies.

Reeves, H. and Baden, S., 2000. Gender and development: Concepts and definitions—Report no. 55. *Bridge development-gender. Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex. Accessed*, *15*, p.13.
Page | 273

Reeves, T.C. and Hedberg, J.G., 2003. *Interactive learning systems evaluation*. Educational Technology.

Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs. 1997. Green Paper on International Migration. Pretoria. Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa. 2002. Basic Conditions of Employment Act No. 75 of 1997.

Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs. 2002. Immigration Act: Number 13 of 2002. Government gazette 443 (23478). Government Printer. Cape Town.

Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs. 2003. Immigration Act 2002 (Act No. 13 of 2002), Draft Immigration Regulations. Government gazette 453(24587). Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. 2011. Protection from Harassment Act 17 of 2011. http://www.justice.gov.za/legislation/acts/2011-017.pdf . [Accessed 22 January 2019].

Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs. 2014. Government Gazette 22 May, Immigration Act 2002, Immigration Regulations. www.dha.gov.za. [Accessed 1 December 2016].

Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs. 2016. Green Paper on International Migration. Government gazette 738 (40088). Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa, Department of Home Affairs. 2017. White Paper on International Migration. Government gazette 750 (41009). Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. 1997. Green Paper on International Migration. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. 1998. *Employment Equity Act, Act No. 55 of1998.* www.labour.gov.za/DOL/downloads/legislation/acts/employmentequity/eegazette2015.pdf. [Accessed 22 January 2019].

Republic of South Africa. 1999. White Paper on International Migration. Government Gazette 406 (19920), Notice 529 of 1999. Pretoria. Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa. 1999. White Paper on International Migration. Government Gazette 406 (19920), Notice 529 of 1999. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Republic of South Africa. 2000. Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act (No. 4 of 2000).

Republic of South Africa. 2014. Immigration Act 2002 (Act No. 13 of 2002). Government gazette 37716. Notice 459. Government Printer. Pretoria.

Reubenstein, J, S and Bacon, R, S. 1990. *The Cultural Landscape: An Introduction to Human Geography*. Prentice Hall of India, Pvt, Ltd. New Delhi.

Riaño, Y. and Baghdadi, N., 2007. Understanding the labour market participation of skilled immigrant women in Switzerland: The interplay of class, ethnicity, and gender. *Journal of International Migration and Integration/Revue de l'integration et de la migration internationale*, *8*(2), p.163.

Ritchie, J. and Spencer, L., 2002. Qualitative data analysis for applied policy research. *The qualitative researcher's companion*, *573*(2002), pp.305-29.

Robinson, I and Kappeli, A. 2018. *Policies, Outcomes and Populism: The integration of migrants in Sweden.* Center for Global Development. https://www.cgdev.org/blog/policies-outcomes-and-populism-integration-migrants-sweden . [Accessed 27 February 2019.

Rogerson, C, M., 1999. Building Skills: Cross boarder migrants and the South African construction industry. Migration Policy Series (No11). Southern African Migration Project (SAMP). Queens University, Kingston. Ontario.

Rogerson, C.M., 2000. Emerging from apartheid's shadow: South Africa's informal economy. *Journal of International Affairs*, pp.673-695.

Rogler, L.H., Gurak, D.T., and Cooney, R.S., 1987. The migration experience and mental health: formulations relevant to Hispanics and other immigrants. In Health and Behavior: Research Agenda for Hispanics eds. Gaviria, M and Arana, J, D. Univ. Ill. Press. Chicago.

Rose, J and Preston V. 2016. Canadian municipalities and services for immigrants: A Toronto case study. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research* 26: pp.29-39.

Rudiger, A and Spencer, S. 2003. Social Integration of Migrants and Ethnic Minorities Policies to combat discrimination. In conference on the Economic and Social Aspects of Migration organized by the  European Commission and OECD. Brussels.

Ruiz, M.R., 1998. Personal agency in feminist theory: Evicting the illusive dweller. *The Behavior Analyst*, *21*(2), pp.179-192.

Runner, M., Novick, S. and Yoshihama, M., 2009. Intimate partner violence in immigrant and refugee communities: Challenges, promising practices and recommendations. https://www.futureswithoutviolence.org/userfiles/file/ImmigrantWomen/IPV_Report_March_2009.pdf. [Accessed 07 May 2019].

Sachikonye, L.M., 2011. *Zimbabwe's Lost Decade: Politics, Development & Society*. African Books Collective. Harare

Salt, J., 1997. "International movements of the highly skilled'', International Migration Unit Occasional Papers 3. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. Paris. Begum.

Sadaquat, M. and Sheikh, Q.T.A.A., 2011. Employment situation of women in Pakistan. *International Journal of Social Economics*, *38*(2), pp.98-113.

Salih, R., 2000. Towards an understanding of gender and transnationalism: Moroccan migrant women's movements across the Mediterranean. *Anthropological Journal on European Cultures*, *9*(2), pp.75-91.

Samman, E. and Santos, M.E., 2009. Agency and Empowerment: A review of concepts, indicators and empirical evidence. Oxford Poverty and Human Development initiative.

Sander, C and Maimbo, S, M. 2003. Migrant Labour Remittances in Africa: Reducing Obstacles to Developmental Contributions. In Africa Region Working Paper Series. World Bank. Washington DC.

Sandoval, C., 2000. *Methodology of the Oppressed*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Sanusi, S.L., 2012. Increasing Women's Access to Finance: Challenges and Opportunities. *Paper presented by Mr Sanusi Lamido Sanusi, Governor of the Central Bank of Nigeria, at the Second African Women's Economic Summit, Lagos, 13 July 2012*. www.cbn.gov.ng. [Accessed 20 September 2017].

Schoumaker, B., Flahaux, M L., Schans, D., Beauchemin, C., Mazzucato, V. and Sakho, P., 2015. Changing patterns of African Migration: A Comparative Analysis. In Beauchemin, C (Ed.), Migration between Africa and Europe: Trends, Factors and Effects. New-York: Springer-Verlag & INED Population Studies series

Segatti, A., Adeagbo, O. and Ogunyemi, S., 2012. Nigerians in South Africa: Facts and Figures. *Migration Issue Brief*, *8*. African Center Migration and Society. University of Witwatersrand. Johannesburg.

Serumaga-Zake, P.A.E. and Kotze, D., 2004. Determinants of labour force participation of married women in South Africa. *Studies in Economics and Econometrics*, *28*(3), pp.99-111.

Sethuraman, S.V., 1998. Gender, informality and poverty: a global review. *Gender Bias in Female Informal Employment and Incomes in Developing Countries*. Geneva World Bank

Setel, P., 1999. *A plague of paradoxes: AIDS, culture, and demography in northern Tanzania*. University of Chicago Press. Chicago

Shaffer, M., Ferrato, G. and Jinnah, Z., 2018. Routes, locations, and social imaginary: a comparative study of the on-going production of geographies in Somali forced migration. *African geographical review*, *37*(2), pp.159-171.

Razavi, S. and Miller, C., 1995. *From WID to GAD: Conceptual shifts in the women and development discourse* (Vol. 1, No. 3). Geneva: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Sharpe, P. ed., 2002. *Women, Gender and Labour Migration: Historical and Cultural Perspectives*. Routledge.

Shauman K, A. and Noonan M, C. 2007. Family migration and labour force outcomes: sex differences in occupational context. *Social Forces* 85: pp.1735–1764.

Shumba, A. and Mawere, D., 2012. The causes and impact of the brain drain in institutions of higher learning in Zimbabwe. *International Migration*, *50*(4), pp.107-123.

Sidorchuk, A., Engström, K., Johnson, C.M., Leeoza, N.K. and Möller, J., 2017. Employment status and psychological distress in a population-based cross-sectional study in Sweden: the impact of migration. *BMJ Open*; 7(4),pe014698.

Simon, M.K., 2011. *Dissertation and scholarly research: Recipes for success*. Dissertation Success, LLC.www.dissertaionrecipes.com [Accessed 21 October 2017].

Skovdal, M., and Cornish, F., 2015. Qualitative Research for Development, Rugby. Practical Action Publishing. United Kingdom.

Skinner, C. 2016. Informal Food Retail In Africa: A Review of Evidence. Consuming Urban Poverty. Consuming Urban Poverty project (formally named Governing Food System to Alleviate Poverty in Secondary Cities in Africa), African Centre for Cities, Environmental and Geographical Science Building Upper Campus, University of Cape Town, Rondebosch. South Africa.

Smith-Tyler, J., 2007. Informed consent, confidentiality, and subject rights in clinical trials. *Proceedings of the American Thoracic Society*, *4*(2), pp.189-193.

Sniderman, P.M., Hagendoorn, L. and Prior, M., 2004. Predisposing factors and situational triggers: Exclusionary reactions to immigrant minorities. *American political science review*, *98*(1), pp.35-49.

Swartz, L. 2002. Fertility transition in South Africa and its implications on the four major population groups Country Paper. Population Bulletin of the United Nations: Completing the Fertility Transition 48/49: 487-500.

Solomon, H. and Kosaka, H., 2014. Xenophobia in South Africa: Reflections, narratives and recommendations. *South African peace and security studies*, *2*(2), pp.5-29.

Southern Africa Development Committee protocol on gender and development. 2015. http://genderlinks.org.za. [Accessed 26 November 2016].

Southern African Development Community. 2013. SADC Labour Migration Policy Draft. www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public. [Accessed 15 November 2016].

Spencer, S. 2006. Migration and Integration: The impact of NGO's on future policy development in Ireland. The Centre on Migration, Policy and Society. University of Oxford. United Kingdom.

Spencer, S., Ruhs, M., Anderson, B. and Rogaly, B., 2007. Migrants' lives beyond the workplace. *The experiences of central and east Europeans in the UK. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation*.

Standing, G., 1999. Global feminization through flexible labor: A theme revisited. *World development*, *27*(3), pp.583-602.

Statistics South Africa. 2018. Gender Series Volume IV: Economic Empowerment, 2001-2017. . [Accessed 18 December 2018].

Statistics South Africa. 2018. Quarterly Labour Force Survey. http://www.statssa.gov.za. [Accessed 28 December 2018].

Strum, P. and Tarantolo, D., 2002, September. Women immigrants in the United States. In *Proceedings of a Conference Sponsored by the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars and the Migration Policy Institute," September* (Vol. 9).

Saffu, S.A., 2010. Adult education and community capacity building: The case of African-Australian women in the Northern Territory. *Australasian Review of African Studies, The*, *31*(1), p.15.

Sutcliffe, S and Court, J. 2005. *Evidence-based Policymaking: What is it? How does it work? What relevance for developing countries?* Overseas Development Institute. United Kingdom. No. Folleto 1427.

Tastsoglou, E. and Preston, V., 2005. Gender, immigration and labour market integration: Where we are and what we still need to know. *Atlantis: Critical Studies in Gender, Culture & Social Justice*, *30*(1), pp.46-59.

Taylor, K.S., Lambert, T.W. and Goldacre, M.J., 2009. Career progression and destinations, comparing men and women in the NHS: postal questionnaire surveys. *BMJ*, *338*, p.b1735.

Terborg-Penn, R. 1996. Slavery and Women in Africa and the Diaspora in Terborg-Penn, R. and Rushing, A.B. *Women in Africa and the African Diaspora: A Reader* (2nd ed). Howard University Press. Washington DC.

Tevera, D and Crush, J., 2003. The new brain drain from Zimbabwe. Southern African Migration Project. Migration Policy Series 29. Capetown.

Tevera, D and Zinyama, L., 2002. Zimbabweans Who Move: Perspectives on International Migration in Zimbabwe. Southern African Migration Project. Migration Policy Series No. 25. Cape Town.

Thela, L., Tomita, A., Maharaj, V., Mhlongo, M. and Burns, J.K., 2017. Counting the cost of Afrophobia: Post-migration adaptation and mental health challenges of African refugees in South Africa. *Transcultural psychiatry*, *54*(5-6), pp.715-732.

Thompson, L., O'Dwyer, M and Chan, A. 2016. Hidden Assets: Partner Migration, skilled women and the Australian workforce. AMES Australia Research and Policy Unit and the Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet-Office for Women.

Thym, D., 2016. Integration kraft Gesetzes?: Grenzen und Inhalte des" Integrationsgesetzes" des Bundes. *Zeitschrift für Ausländerrecht und Ausländerpolitik: ZAR*, *36*(8), pp.241-251.

Timmerman, C., Martinello, M, Rea A and Wets J. 2015. *New dynamics in Female Migration and Integration. Routledge Research in Gender and Society*. New York and London: Taylor & Francis Group.

Tjaden, P and Thoennes, N., 2000. 'Extent, Nature and Consequences of Intimate partner violence: Findings from the National Violence against Women Survey'. National institute of Justice and Centres for Disease Control and Prevention.

Toma, S. and Vause, S., 2014. Gender differences in the role of migrant networks: Comparing Congolese and Senegalese migration flows. *International Migration Review*, *48*(4), pp.972-997.

Townsend, R., 2008. Adult education, social inclusion and cultural diversity in regional communities. *Australian Journal of Adult Learning*, *48*(1), pp.71-92.

Tsikata, D., 2009. Gender, land and labour relations and livelihoods in sub-Saharan Africa in the era of economic liberalization: Towards a research agenda. *Feminist Africa*, *12*(2), pp.11-30.

United Nations General Assembly. 2013. Violence against Women Migrant Workers. Report of the Secretary-General. UN General Assembly.

United Nations Conference on Trade and Development. 2016. African Continental Free Trade Area: Advancing Pan-African Integration Some Considerations. UNCTAD Geneva.

United Nations Conference on Trade and Development. 2018. Policy Guide on entrepreneurship for migrants and refugees. International Organisation for Migration. The United Nations Refugee Agency and United Nations. New York and Geneva.

UN Sustainable Development Goals, 17 Goals to transform our world. . [Accessed 18 November 2016].

UN Women. 2015. Progress of the World's Women 2015- 2016. Transforming economies, realising rights. http://progress.unwomen.org/. [Accessed 13 December 2016].

UN Women .2016. Women and Sustainable Development Goals. UN Women. New York.

UN Women and International Organisation for Migration. 2016. UN Women and the International Organisation for Migration call on world leaders to make migration policies that work for women. Joint statement by Mlambo-Ngcuka, P and Swing, W.

UNAIDS. 2008. HIV and International Labour Migration: UNAIDS Policy Brief. Geneva.

United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs.1997. Gender Mainstreaming. Report of the Economic and Social Council. Coordination of the policies and activities of the specialized agencies and other bodies of the United Nations system.

United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs. 2016. Sustainable Development Goals. Sustainable Development Knowledge Platform www.sustainabledevelopment.un.org. [Accessed 10 July 2017].

United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division. 2016. International Migration Report 2015: Highlights (ST/ESA/SER.A/375).

United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division. 2017. International Migration Report 2017: Highlights (ST/ESA/SER.A/404).

United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division, International migrantstock:2017revision.www.un.org/en/development/desa/population/migration/data/index.sht ml.

United Nations Development Programme. 2009. Human Development Report 2009: Overcoming Barriers: Human Mobility and Development. New York.

United Nations Economic Commission for Africa; UN. ECA Multinational Programming and Operational Centre (UNECA/MULPOC) for Eastern and Southern Africa (1996, July 24 - 26: Lusaka, Zambia) .1997. Labour market integration in Southern Africa.

UN.ECA Intergovernmental Committee of Experts Meeting (ICE) (4th: 1997, March 24 - 28: Pretoria, Republic of South Africa). Addis Ababa. UNECA. http://hdl.handle.net/10855/4721. [Accessed 14 October 2016].

United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO). 2012. Social Inclusion, Social Transformations, Social innovation. What role for UNESCO in 2014-2012? Consultations of the Director-General with Member States. UNESCO.

United Nations Global Commission on International Migration Report (GCIM). 2005. www.gcim.org/en/finalreport. [Accessed 9 March 2016].

United Nations Refugee Agency. 2013. A New Beginning: Refugee Integration in Europe. . [Accessed 5 March 2019].

United Nations Refugee Agency and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2018. Engaging with employers in the hiring of refugees. A 10-point multi-stakeholder action plan for employers, refugees, governments and civil society. UNHCR/OECD.

United Nations Summit for Refugees and Migrants. 2016. Addressing large movements of Refugees and migrants. http://refugeesmigrants.un.org/ [Accessed 29 September 2016].

United Nations. 2000. Gender mainstreaming an Overview. Office of the special advisor on Gender Issues and Advancement of women. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. New York.

United Nations. 2000. Gender mainstreaming an Overview. Office of the special advisor on Gender Issues and Advancement of women. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. New York.

UN General Assembly .2015. Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. New York: United Nations. A/RES/70/1. www.sustainabledevelopment.un.org. [Accessed 13 February 2017].

Uzodike, U, O., Idoniboye-Obu, S, A and Wheto, A. 2012. "Forced to flee": Conflicts and Mobilities in Africa's Great Lakes Region. *Alternation 19 (1)*, pp.173-198.

Van Meeteren, M and Pereira, S. 2016. *New Roles for Social Networks in Migration? Assistance in Brazilian Migration to Portugal and the Netherlands*. In: Bakewell O., Engbersen G., Fonseca M.L., Horst C. (eds) Beyond Networks. Migration, Diasporas and Citizenship. Palgrave Macmillan, London. van Meeteren, M. and Pereira, S., 2016. New roles for social networks in migration? Assistance in Brazilian migration to Portugal and the Netherlands. In *Beyond Networks* (pp. 47-68). Palgrave Macmillan, London.

Vanek, J., Chen, M., Carré, F., Heintz, J. and Hussmanns, R. 2014. Statistics on the Informal Economy: Definitions, Regional Estimates and Challenges. *WIEGO Working Paper* (Statistics) No 2. pp.47-59.

Verick, S. 2014. Female Labour force participation in developing countries. *IZA World of Labour. Evidence-based Policymaking 87*. Verick, S., 2014. Female labor force participation in developing countries. IZA World of Labor, 87, 1–10.

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties. 1970. 1155 United Nations Treaty Series.331.

Voigt, Graf, C. 2004. Towards a geography of transnational spaces: Indian transnational communities in Australia: *Global Networks* 4: 25–49. Voigt-Graf, C., 2004. Towards a geography of transnational spaces: Indian transnational communities in Australia. *Global networks*, *4*(1), pp.25-49.

Waiganjo, A.G., 2017. *Gender complexities in the context of xenophobia-afrophobia in the transnational space: the experiences of Somali women in Mayfair and Pretoria West in Gauteng province, South Africa* (Doctoral dissertation).

Walby, S., 2005. Gender mainstreaming: Productive tensions in theory and practice. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society*, *12*(3), pp.321-343.

Wang, X. and Kanungo, R.N., 2004. Nationality, social network and psychological well-being: Expatriates in China. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, *15*(4-5), pp.775-793.

Webb, S., 2015. The feminisation of migration and the migrants VET policy neglects: the case of skilled women secondary migrants in Australia. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, *67*(1), pp.26-46.

Webb, S., Beale, D and Faine, M., 2013. *Skilled migrant women in regional Australia: promoting social inclusion through vocational education and training.* Centre for the Economics of Education and Training and Faculty of Education, Monash University. National Vocational Education and Training Research Program. Research Report. Commonwealth of Australia.

Wickramasekara, P., 2015. Bilateral agreements and memoranda of understanding on migration of low skilled workers: a review. *Available at SSRN 2636289*.

Wiles, R., Heath, S., Crow, G. and Charles, V., 2005. Informed consent in social science research: a literature review. *NCRM Methods Review Papers NCRM*, *1*.

Williams, K. and Durrance, J.C., 2008. Social networks and social capital: Rethinking theory in community informatics. *The Journal of Community Informatics*, *4*(3), pp.1-20.. [Accessed 8 March 2019].

Winters, P., De Janvry, A. and Sadoulet, E., 2001. Family and community networks in Mexico-US migration. *Journal of human resources*, pp.159-184.

Wisker, G. 2007. *The Postgraduate Research Handbook*. 2nd Edition. Palgrave, U.K. Wisker, G., 2007. *The postgraduate research handbook: Succeed with your MA, MPhil, EdD and PhD*. Macmillan International Higher Education.

Withers, S.D. and Clark, W.A., 2006. Housing costs and the geography of family migration outcomes. *Population, Space and Place*, *12*(4), pp.273-289.

Women and migration network. 2017. Women in migration. .  [Accessed 16 March 2018].

Woodward, A., 2003. European Gender Mainstreaming: Promises and Pitfalls of Transformative Policy 1. *Review of Policy Research*, *20*(1), pp.65-88.

World Bank (2012) Zimbabwe – FinScope MSME survey 2012. Washington DC: World Bank Group.

World Bank, 2011. *World development report 2012: Gender equality and development*. World Bank Publications.World Bank Group, 2016. *World Development Indicators 2016*. World Bank Group. = indicators. [Accessed 15 January 2019].

Wright, M. and Bloemraad, I., 2012. Is there a trade-off between multiculturalism and socio-political integration? Policy regimes and immigrant incorporation in comparative perspective. *Perspectives on Politics*, *10*(1), pp.77-95.

Yeoh, B.S. and Willis, K., 2005. Singaporeans in China: transnational women elites and the negotiation of gendered identities. *Geoforum*, *36*(2), pp.211-222.

Young, E. and Quinn, L., 2002. Writing Effective Public Policy Papers: A Guide to Policy Advisers in Central and Eastern Europe. *Open Society Institute,* Budapest.

Yu, E. 1987. Korean American women: Demographic profiles and family roles. In E. Yu & E. Phillips (Eds.), Korean women in transition: At home and abroad. California State University, Center for Korean American and Korean Studies. Los Angeles

Phillips, E.H., 1987. *Korean women in transition: At home and abroad* (No. 5). Center for Korean-American and Korean Studies, California State University.

Yu, E.Y., 1987. Korean American women: Demographic profiles and family roles. *Korean women in transition: At home and abroad*, pp.183-197.Zinyama, L., 2002. International migration and Zimbabwe: an overview. *Zimbabweans Who Move: Perspectives on International Migration in Zimbabwe. Migration Policy Series*, *25*, pp.7-41.

**APPENDIX I Research Interview Guide**

## THE 'ACCOMPANYING SPOUSE DEPENDENT VISA STATUS': CHALLENGES AND CONSTRAINTS FACED BY ZIMBABWEAN IMMIGRANT WOMEN IN INTEGRATION INTO SOUTH AFRICA'S FORMAL LABOUR MARKET

*Please note that you can withdraw participation anytime and an informed consent document accompanies this interview*

**Interview number** _____

**Date**: _____ Start (time):_____ End (time):_____

*Instructions for the interviewee: Please read and answer the questions provided*

1. What occupation were you in before you came to South Africa?

   _____

2. What were the major reasons that made you migrate to South Africa?

   _____

3. What were your expectations before you came to South Africa?

   _____

4. What are the ways in which your expectations have been met or not met?

   _____

5. How has been your experience of family life since you came to South Africa as compared to when you were back home?

   _____

6. What level of skills and expertise do you possess?

   _____

7. How are your skills and expertise relevant for the South Africa employment sector?

   _____

8. What has been your experience in job searching in South Africa?

9. How has having skills and expertise impacted on your abilities to secure employment?

10. What have you done to improve your chances of securing employment?

11. What constraints have you faced in your employment search? How do you think these constraints would be different if you were a male migrant?

12. What hindrances have you faced when approaching employers?  How do you think these hindrances would be different if you were a male migrant?

13. How do you think your needs as a skilled migrant woman have been considered in your current visa status?

14. What do you think is not included in migration policies regarding your gender needs as a skilled migrant woman?

15. How different would the migration experience be if your gender needs were included in migration policies?

16. How would your migration experience be different if your gender needs were included in labour policies?

_____

17. How do you think labour laws can improve your welfare as a skilled migrant woman?

_____

18. What services would you like the government to provide you in your job search?

_____

19. How would you like migration policies to assist you in securing employment?

_____

20. How would you like labour policies and employers to assist you in securing employment?

_____

***THANK YOU***

**APPENDIX II Informed Consent Letter**

Dear Participant,

My name is…Rujeko Samanthia Chimukuche (216041777). I am a PhD Gender Studies candidate studying at the University of KwaZulu-Natal, Pietermaritzburg Campus. The title of my research is: The 'Accompanying Spouse Dependent visa Status': Challenges and constraints faced by Zimbabwean immigrant women in integration into South Africa's formal labour market. The aim of the study is to highlight the experiences of integration of skilled migrant women spouses in South Africa's formal labour market. The research intends to highlight how the accompanying dependent visa status blankets all women spouses as not skilled and therefore not employable. In so doing, the study will show the gender gaps in the migration and labour policies of South Africa. I am interested in interviewing you so as to share your experiences and observations on the subject matter.

Please note that:

• The information that you provide will be used for scholarly research only.

• Your participation is entirely voluntary. You have a choice to participate, not to participate or stop participating in the research. You will not be penalized for taking such an action.

• Your views in this interview will be presented anonymously. Neither your name nor identity will be disclosed in any form in the study.

• The interview will take about (20-30 minutes). May I also have your permission to record the interview so as to capture your words accurately

• The record as well as other items associated with the interview will be held in a password-protected file accessible only to myself and my supervisors. After a period of 5 years, in line with the rules of the university, it will be disposed by shredding and burning.

• If you agree to participate please sign the declaration attached to this statement (a separate sheet will be provided for signatures)

I can be contacted at: School of Social Sciences, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Pietermaritzburg Campus, Scottsville, Pietermaritzburg.

Email: rujekoc@yahoo.com /216041777@stu.ukzn.ac.za

Cell: 0710294318

My supervisor is Dr Muthuki who is located at the School of Social Sciences, Pietermaritzburg Campus University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Contact details: email: Muthuki@ukzn.ac.za

Phone number: 0332606462

The Humanities and Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee contact details are as follows: Ms Phumelele Ximba, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Research Office, Email: ximbap@ukzn.ac.za,Phone number +27312603587.

Thank you for your contribution to this research.

DECLARATION

I……………………………………………………………………… (full names of participant) hereby confirm that I understand the contents of this document and the nature of the research project, and I consent to participating in the research project.

# APPENDIX III Research Ethics Letter

UNIVERSITY OF ™
KWAZULU-NATAL

INYUVESI
YAKWAZULU-NATALI

27 October 2016

Ms RS Chimukuche 216041777
School of Social Sciences
Pietermaritzburg Campus

Dear Ms Chimukuche

Protocol reference number: HSS/1780/016D
Project title: The 'Accompanying Spouse Dependant Visa Status': Challenges and constraints faced by
Zimbabwean immigrant women in integration into South Africa's formal labour market.

**Expedited Approval**

In response to your application dated 20 October 2016, the Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics
Committee has considered the abovementioned application and the protocol have been granted FULL
APPROVAL.

Any alteration/s to the approved research protocol i.e. Questionnaire/Interview Schedule, Informed Consent
Form, Title of the Project, Location of the Study, Research Approach and Methods must be reviewed and
approved through the amendment/modification prior to its implementation. In case you have further queries,
please quote the above reference number. Please note: Research data should be securely stored in the
discipline/department for a period of 5 years.

The ethical clearance certificate is only valid for a period of 3 years from the date of issue. Thereafter
Recertification must be applied for on an annual basis.

I take this opportunity of wishing you everything of the best with your study.

Yours faithfully

.............................................
Dr Shenuka Singh (Chair)

/px

cc Supervisor: Dr Janet Muthuki
cc Academic Leader Research: Prof Maheshvari Naidu
cc School Administrator: Ms Nancy Mudau & Ms Lukong Shulika

---

Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee
Dr Shenuka Singh (Chair)
Westville Campus, Govan Mbeki Building
Postal Address: Private Bag X54001, Durban 4000
Telephone: +27 (0) 31 260 3587/8350/4557 Facsimile: +27 (0) 31 260 4609 Email: ximbap@ukzn.ac.za / snymanm@ukzn.ac.za / mohunp@ukzn.ac.za
Website: www.ukzn.ac.za

**APPENDIX IV Gate keepers letter**

APOSTOLIC FAITH MISSION of SOUTH AFRICA

DIVINE LIFE CENTRE SHONA ASSEMBLY PIETERMARITZBURG

AFM SHONA ASSEMBLY PIETERMARITZBURG

122 CHURCH STREET

PIETERMARITZBURG

3201

25 July 2016

Dear Rujeko Samanthia Chimukuche (216041777)

We grant you permission to conduct research at our church on the following topic: *The 'Accompanying Spouse Dependent Visa Status': Challenges and constraints in integration of Zimbabwean immigrant women in South Africa's formal labour market.*

It is however at the respondent's discretion. We look forward to working with you.

Yours sincerely

Mabikahama Mukudzei

(Secretary)

Contact: 0837359978

*Ishe ndinzwe nokufara*