NASA Contractor Report 174762

 ~ 10

NASA-CR-174762 19850001859

 $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$

Effects of Cobalt, Boron, and Zirconium on the Microstrucutre of Udimet 738

Todd G. Nakanishi

 \sim

Purdue University West Lafayette, Indiana

September 1984

 \sim ω

Prepared for

NATIONAL AERONAUTICS AND SPACE ADMINISTRATION Lewis Research Center Under Contract NAG 3-59

LIBRARY COPY

每百万名 1984

LANGLEY RESEARCH CENTER LIBRARY, NASA HAMPTON, VIRGINIA

 $\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L$

×,

ENTER:

. . — ≱ = instrumente e statem in

 $\frac{1}{2}$, $\frac{1}{2}$, $\frac{1}{2}$, $\frac{1}{2}$

CREATED AT A

 \sim \sim

 $\sqrt{1+\sqrt{1+\lambda}}$

 $\epsilon_{\rm{eff}}$ $\Delta_{\rm c}$ $\mathcal{F}_{\mathcal{G}}$ \sim $\frac{d\mathbf{r}}{d\mathbf{r}}=\frac{1}{2}\left(\frac{\partial \mathbf{r}}{\partial \mathbf{r}}\right)$ $\sim 10^{-10}$ $\label{eq:2.1} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\sum_{i=1}^n\frac$ $\frac{1}{2}$

 \mathcal{A}^{\pm}

TABLE OF CONTENTS

 $\ddot{}$

 $\mathcal{L}^{\text{max}}_{\text{max}}$ and $\mathcal{L}^{\text{max}}_{\text{max}}$

 \mathbf{i}

 \bullet . $\frac{1}{2}$ \bullet \bullet $\Delta \sim 10^4$

I. INTRODUCTION

In the United States**,** s**u**perallog development began d**u**ring t**h**e 1930's prompted b_ t**h**e need _or heat resistant materials req**u**ired in aircraft engine t**u**rbos**up**erchargers**.** Since then **g**as t**u**rbine engine technologg has paced the development o_ new s**up**erallogs**.** In a gas t**u**rbine**,** the _irst stage turbine blades or b**u**ckets are cast parts which can see longit**u**dinal stresses o_ approximatelg 138 MPa and tem**p**eratures ranging From 650 to 980°C. Future demands on perFormance and efficiency will push these limits even higher each gear**.**

In order to ac**h**ieve these "s**u**per" pro**p**erties**,** mang alloging elements are ad**d**ed to t**h**e base element res**u**lting in **co**m**p**lex mi**c**rostructures. T**h**e ma**j**or a**l**loging elements o# Ni**-b**ase su**p**era**llo**gs in**clude; ch**romium (**C**r), **cob**alt (**C**o**)**, al**u**min**u**m **(**AI**)**, titani**u**m **(**Ti**),** tantal**u**m **(**Ta**)**, niobi**u**m **(**Nb**)**, t**ung**sten **(U)**, and molgbden**u**m (Mo**). C**arbon (**C)**, bor**o**n **(**B**)**, an**d z**ir**co**ni**u**m (Zr**)** are **co**nsidere**d** as tra**c**e or minor eleme**n**t a**dd**itions**.**

Cr**, Co**, **T**a. Nb, and W ar**e** im**po**rted #tom ?**o**rei**gn c**o**un**trie**s** and are cdns_dered to be critical or strate**g**i**c** elements. In recent gears, the **p**oliti**c**al **u**ncertaintg in **c**o**u**ntrie**s** prod**u**cing these strategic elements has prom**p**ted

studies o_ t**h**e roles o_ strate**g**ic elements in su**p**eralloys. Large amounts o. cobalt are used in su**p**eralloys**,** yet t**h**e role o_ cobalt is not well understood. Cobalt **h**as been found to have various roles in different alloys; however, t**h**e main role o_ cobalt a**p**parently is to modify t**h**e t**h**e matrix solubility for alloying elements thereby affecting mic**r**ostructu**r**es and m**e**c**h**anical properties.

To und**c,**.stan**d** t**h**e role o_ cobalt and its interactions wit**h** boron and zirconium _rom solidification to long time aged e_ects0 cast U-738 was chosen since it is a **h**ig**h** C**r** alloy and is being extensively used in gas turbines for oxidation and sul**ph**idation resistance. T**h**is study on U-738 will attempt to reveal the effects of Co, B, and Zr on:

- 1. Solidification behavior.
- 2. Precipitation of new phases.
- 3. Overall c**h**anges in mor**ph**ology o_ e**x**isting p**h**ases.
- 4. Str**u**ctural stability during e**xp**osure.
- 5. Mechanical **p**ro**p**erties.

Morphologie_ o**P** _**',** prim_rg and _econdarg carbide**s**, boride _'orm_Lion**,** eutectic **V**'**,** and the grain boundaries will be evaluat**e**d and t**h**en correlated to mechanical **p**ro**p**erty **da**ta**.** Str**u**ctural characterization by **s**canning e**l**ectron microscopy**,** energy **d**ispersive X-ray analysis (EDAX**),** and Xrag di_ractior**,** oF e**x**tracte**d** p**h**ases will be carried out.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Phases Found in Superallous

Nickel base superalloys consist of a variety of ele-There may be as many as ten to twelve major elements ments. and an equal number of trace elements. Nickel and cobalt are face centered cubic elements which prefer the austenite gamma matrix (b). Solid solutioning elements include iron, chromium, molybdenum, tungsten, and vanadium. Elements which may partition to form the coherent precipitate X' (Ni₃Al) include aluminum, titanium, columbium, and tantalum. Boron, carbon, zirconium, and hafnium are trace elements which form borides and carbides, and segregate to the grain boundaries. $\overset{(1)}{\circ}$ Generally all these elements combine to form five distinct phases, the matrix, gamma prime (X)', carbides, borides, and TCP (tetragonally close packed) phases.

Gamma prime is a unique precipitate that is inherently ductile and contributes to alloy strength by dislocation interaction, and antiphase boundary strengthening. The strength of 8' increases with temperature⁽¹⁾. Gamma prime nucleates homogeneously due to its compatible FCC structure lattice constant (O.1% mismatch). As a result it has and low surface energy and extraordinary long time stability⁽¹⁾.

Carbides may form in a various number of ways. Upon solidification type carbides form heterogeneously MC

 Δ

З

throughout an alloy and may be found intergranularly or transgranularly (often interdendritically)⁽¹⁾. Chemically these primary carbides contain titanium, tantalum, niobium, hafnium. They have a FCC structure and will decompose and during heat treatment to provide carbon for secondary carbide reactions. The secondary carbide reaction is usually the very important Cr rich $M_{23}C_6$ type carbide which forms in the range from 760 to 980⁰C. Molyhdenum and tungsten as well as nickel can be found in the $M_{23}C_6$. $M_{23}C_6$ carbides generally form in the grain boundaries, significantly improving rupture strength⁽¹⁾ by preventing grain boundary sliding. However rupture failure often initiates either by brittle fracture of these same carbides or through decohesion of the $M_{2,3}C_6 - \gamma$ interface.

 M_{6} C carbides, typically (Ni,Co)₃(Mo)₃ or (Ni,Co)₂(W)₄, form if the Mo plus W is greater or equal to 7 wt%. may. Often they will form in the matrix as either discrete particles or plates within a temperature range of 815 to 980°C.

Discrete MC, $M_{23}C_6$, and M_6C carbides have been shown to beneficial effects on mechanical properties by disperhave sion strengtheming and controlling grain growth. When they form plates, needles, or continuous films in grain boundaries, the mechanical properties can be impaired.

Borides may form upon solidification or as a result of heat treatment. The $\texttt{M}_{3}\texttt{B}_{2}$ boride is the most common type

found. Boride formation may occur when boron is in excess .012 wt%⁽¹⁾ in nickel-base alloys. However, borides may $\mathsf{d} \mathsf{f}$ be found in Ni-base alloys with less than 120 ppm of boron due to segregation. Boron generally segregates at the grain boundaries, and can be part of the $M_{23}C_6$ carbide.

Laves, σ , and mu are hard TCP phases which form upon heat treatment. TCP phases are platelike in nature and can nucleate at grain boundaries and in the matrix. The platelike morphology of these phases provides excellent nucleation sites for crack initiation and propagation leading to low temperature brittle failure. (1)

2. 2 Physical Metallurgy of U-738

A study by Betner et al . ⁽²⁾ described the phases found in the alloy IN-738. After the standard heat treatment two sizes of δ' were observed, one about 0.1 micron and the other about 1.5 to 2.5 microns. The finer X' was more rounded and the coarser more angular. Solutioning of the as cast »' in alloy 738 began at 980⁰C and was not complete until an hours exposure at 1204°C. 500 hours exposure at 820 $^{\circ}$ C showed a disappearance of the fine secondary \mathcal{V}' .

MC carbides were found dispersed interdendritically and in the grain boundaries and had a lattice-parameter of 4.36A. After 2000 hours at 820⁰C much of the MC carbides were still present along with a nearby-rod-like-phase.

 $\overline{5}$

M₂₃C₆ carbides were found primarily intergranularly and formed as a function of temperature at the expense of the MC phase. The solution temperature of $M_{23}C_6$ was found to be 1037°C. Many N_v ealculations were made to estimate σ formation tendenc**u** and it was concluded that allo**u** 738 is stable_ **ho**wever, a slight variation in com**p**osition could stronglg promote σ phase.

2.3 Effects of Cobalt

T**h**e role of cobalt in su**p**erallo**u**s **h**as been an area oe **g**reat interest in recent years. Several **p**a**p**ers have revealed the effect oF cobalt on _'**,** carbide Formation, allog stabilit**u**, and mechanical **p**ro**p**erties in nickel-base superallogs. (3-10> Cobalt has a varging role depending on t**h**e overall con**p**osition oe t**h**e alloy.

In a study by Engel, it was observed that removal of cobalt in Udimet² 700 resulted in an increased amount of $unsolutioned primary %'$ and a decrease in amount of fine secondary $\,$ Y'.⁽³⁾ Jarret and Tien also noted a decrease in (6) ${\sf true}$ ${\sf o}'$ due to less solutioning. ${\sf A}$ study of the allog Mar-M247 b**u** h!athal et al. revealed t**h**at u**p**on removal of cobalt, the γ' solvus temperature was raised by 30°C. ⁽⁴⁾ However, Mauer et al. found that in Waspaloy, the δ' solvus (9) was unaffected by the removal of cobalt

 ϵ

Cobalt has also been found to effect the weight percent %' in Ni-base alloys. Heslop claimed that cobalt of increased the amount of 8' found in Nimonic superalloys. He stated that the mechanism was a decreased matrix solubility for Al and Ti thereby increasing the 8' precipitation. (7) Studies by Mauer et al. and Nathal et al. reported a decrease in the wt% of δ' in when cobalt was reduced. $(9,4)$ This agrees with the results found by Heslop. Engel noted that the weight fraction of V' in U-700 was unaffected by removal of cobalt. ⁽³⁾ Nathal <u>et al</u>. also observed a reduction in ares fraction of eulectic δ' islands and an increase in secondary i' size upon removal of cobalt.⁽⁴⁾ Jarret and Tien claimed that the ¥' coarsened more readily in their cobalt free alloy due to no M₂₃C₆ pinning of the primary $8'$ (6)

Cobalt also significantly influences the formation of In his fundamental study, Heslop concluded that carbides. cobalt increased the solubility of the matrix for carbon, thus inhibiting the formation of grain boundary $\texttt{M}_{\texttt{O2}}\texttt{C}_{\texttt{A}}$ carbides. $\overset{(7)}{\texttt{M}}$ Mauer <u>et al</u>. found that removal of cobalt in Waspaloy resulted in increased precipitation of both MC and $\textsf{M}_{\texttt{p},\texttt{q}}\textsf{C}_{\texttt{p}}$ carbides. $^{(\texttt{9})}$ Engel noted that cobalt -removal -promoted $\texttt{M}_{23}\texttt{C}_{6}$ formalion; however, $\texttt{M}_{3}\texttt{B}_{2}$ precipitation increased as cobalt was added.⁽³⁾ Upon long time aging (LTA), Nathal et al. reported that additional $M_{23}C_{\tilde{G}}$ carbides and continuous carbide films formed in the grain boundaries upon remo-

val of cobalt. (4> **J**arret and Tien noted a slightlg different carbide alteration w**h**en cobalt was removed From Udimet 700. T**h**ey Found t**h**at removal of cobalt, especiall**y** down to 0 wt%**, p**ro**du**ced M23**C** 6 and M**C** carbides upon solidification. Thes**e** M_3**C** 6 carbide_ m**o**re likelg Form**e**d upon slo**w** cooling after solidification thereby appearing in the "as cast" microstr**u**ct**u**re. T**h**e**y** also eo**u**nd that upon a**g**ing, t**h**e 0 **w**t% cobalt allog dis**p**layed little additional grain bo**u**ndary **p**reci**p**itation of M23**C** 6 and attributed it to the relativ**e**lg stable "as <6) cast "3326. With regard to phase stability, Lund et al. performed a detailed study on the role of cobalt in σ _**o**rmation. T**he**y notod t**h**at cobalt in small amo**u**nts in**h**ibited = **p**hase Formation and at around 5 **w**t%**,** cobalt increased the _" precipitation, dis**p**lacing Cr From the matrix thereby making it available for formation of σ . Engel, darret, and Tien r6**p**orted t**h**at cobalt in e**x**cess oe approximately 8 w*.Z* promoted σ phase. (3,6)

Cobalt also has an impact on mec**h**anical **p**ro**p**erties o_ nickel-base s**up**erallogs. 14bile t**h**is may in **p**art be d**u**e to its solid solution effects, primarily it is due to its inel**u**ence on microstr**u**ct**u**re. Tensile **p**ro**p**erties are apparently least affected. Nathal <u>et al</u>. , Jarret and Tien, and Ma**u**er et al. all re**p**orted little **c**hange in tensile strength and d**u**ctility when cobalt was removed From their respective alloys.^{(5,6,9}

Creep/stress rupture properties were most influenced. Nathal et al. and Mauer et al. found that cobalt increased the stress rupture life of Mar-M247 and Waspaloy respectively by three fold.^(5,9) They also stated that removal of cobalt increased the creep rate up to six fold, yet the ductility in these tests were uninfluenced. Jarret and Tien investigated alloys with various heat treatments. (6) They found that in U-700, stress rupture life was significantly lowered when alloys with less than 8.0 wt% Co were given a disk heat treatment (partial V' solutioning). However, in the same alloys which were given a blading heat treatment (fully solutioned 8'), the stress rupture life was virtually unaffected.

2. 4 Effects of Boron and Zirconium

Boron and zirconium are added to nickel-base superalleys in small amounts and are therefore referred to as trace elements. In the late 1950's it was realized that trace amounts of these elements markedly improved hot working behavior and creep rupture properties of these alloys. (12) How B and Zr improve mechanical properties is not clearly understood yet they are considered "essential" elements. (1)

A study by Antony and Radavich extensively studied the microstructural results of Zr and B additions and their effect on stress rupture properties. $^{(11)}$ They found that $\,$ Zr $\,$

additions o_ .15 **u**t% increased t**h**e solidification range of their allog bg 16°C resulting in more microporositg which reduced 760⁰C stress rupture life drastically. However, the 928°C stress rupture life improved and was attributed to zirconiums effect on MC morphology. Zr was found to alter the e**x**isting script Ta**,** Ti MC carbides to a Ta ric**h** discrete MC p**h**ase**.** In addition, Zr suppressed t**h**e formation of a grain boundary film. This film formed at high B levels and lower Zr levels_

Zr **w**as _**o**u**nd** t**o p**r**o**m**o**t**e** lar**ge**r **and** m**o**re **nu**m**e**r**ou**s e**u**t**ec**tic _**"** isla**n**d_**,** arou**n**d which a Zr rich "stick" pha**se** could be seen**.** At t**h**e **h**i**ghes**t level**s** of Zr**,** the sti**ck ph**ase al**so** a**p**peared in t**h**e grain boundaries**.** Boron**,** contrarg t**o** t**h**e binarg Ni-B **ph**a**s**e dia**g**ram**,** actuallg dec**r**ea**s**ed the solidification **r**ange. Less microporosity formed and a large i**n**crease i**n** str**e**ss rupture life at both 760 a**n**d 928°**C o**ccurred.

Boron was also found to effect grain boundary precipitation. Wit**h** no B**,** fine MC **p**recipitates _ormed in t**h**e grain boun**d**aries **u**hereas at high B leve'ls t**h**e g**r**ain boundarg **c**ontained primarily the M₃ B₂ phase. Borides also formed in a script like fashion near the eutectic Y' islands when added at .012 **u**t%. However, theg changed to massive tgpe precipitates at .025 wt%. **A**ntong and Radavich also c**o**ncluded t**h**at t**h**e boride phase pre**c**ipitated directlg from the liRui**d ph**ase **d**uring the latter stages of solidification.

Decker and Freeman studied the **p**ossible mec**h**anisms t**h**at result in the beneficial effects of B and Zr. ⁽¹³⁾ They found that low B and lo**w** Zr content (approximately 0 **w**t%) resulted in rapid agglomeration of $M_{23}C_6$ and δ' in the grain boundaries, followed by depletion of δ' and intergranular cracking transverse to the applied stress. Microcracking initiated between $M_{23}c_6$ particles and the depleted zones. Additions o_ Zr**,** B**,** and Zr plus B in that order retarded this process thereby increasing rupture life. Their conclusion **w**as that Zr and B stabilized the grain boundary by inhibiting exc_s_ive **- -"** M23C 6 _ormation. Theg a**l**so concl**u**ded that B promoted the formation of carbides within the matrix.

A **su**mmar**y** o_ most o_ t**h**e wor**k** which **h**as been performed **w**it**h** regard to B and Zr in s**u**perallogs **w**as written bg Holt and Wallac**e.** (1_) The**g** state several examples o_ ho**w** these elements have been s**h**o**w**f**,** to increase rupt**u**re li_e 13 times, elongation 7 ti_es**,** high temperat**u**re strength, d**uc**tilitg, an**d** notch sensitivitg. Holt and Wallace presented many s**u**ggestions that B an**d** Zr a_e involved in interaction with interstitials and imp**u**rity elements**.** For e**x**ample, Zr is kno**w**n to interact **w**it**h** s**u**lph**u**r and carbon as a s**c**avenger _orming s**u**lphocarbi**d**es. This lo**w**ers the amounts o_ these elements remaining in solid sol**u**tion at the grain boundaries**.** Altho**u**gh there is no evidence t**h**at boron **c**ombines **w**it**h** s**u**lph**u**r, it has been s**u**ggested that boron alters s**u**lp**h**ide morpholog**y** _rom plate like to spheroidal and that its

solidus depressing effect may aid in the gettering of sul**phu**r an**d o**t**he**r **d**etrimental im**pu**rities. It **h**as a**lso** bee**n** J suggested that boron reduces secondary grain boundary precipitation b**y** shunting carbon to the matrix.

It is generall**y** agreed that B and Zr segregate to the grain boundaries due to their odd atomic size and low solubilities in δ and δ' . Boron is much smaller in atomic size than Ni and tends to locate interstitially while Zr is large in atomic size compared to Ni. In the grain boundaries they are believed to fill vacancies, reducing the formation of Y' denuded zones. In addition it has been suggested that they both be present during solidification to prevent oxygen and sulphur from forming continuous films in the grain boundaries.

A study b**y** Hu and Li revealed that B initially segregated to the grain boundary, the carbide-matrix interface, (14) and in the borocarbide M_3(C**,**B) 6. A?ter aging they discovered that the boron then segregated to the MC carbide periphery resulting in MC degeneration into more M₂₃ (C,B)₆.

Studies by Woodford and Bricknell have considered environmental damage to nickel-base superallo**y**s and how it is regulated. In a study by Woodford, oxygen was determined as the detrimc_utal species.⁽¹⁵⁾ Oxygen segregation can lead to grain boundary immobilization and unstable intergranular fracture. He found that B additions reduced this suscepti-

bility. In a later paper Woodford and Bricknell showed that B was effective in preventing preferential grain boundary precipitation of complex oxides during air exposure. (16)

Floreen and Davidson concluded that B and Zr improved creep proporties in a nickel-base superalloy.⁽¹⁷⁾ the. Although their primary effect appeared to be minimization of the harmful effects of oxygen, they also state that no single mechanism can explain all observed effects and their efficacy may vary with alloy composition and test conditions. They also noted no changes in microstructure, fracture appearance, or grain boundary sliding behavior due to B and Zr additions.

Zr at a level of 1 wt% in a Ni-Cr-Zr alloy, was found to be beneficial in preventing environmental attack. (18) The mechanism was described as a rapid and more extensive nucleation of Cr₂O₃ along the alloy-surface. A similar result occurred in a H₂, H₂S atmosphere.

In a study on Zr effects in alloy 713C, Radavich found zirconiums influence primarily to be changes in X' and MC carbides. (19) Alloy 713C with low Zr showed no eutectic islands and ragged primary V'. Increasing Zr resulted in more regular primary o' and large quantities of eutectic Alloy 713C with low Zr also displayed chinese islands. script MC carbides in the grain boundaries. Increasing the Zr in 713C created a more blocky, discrete, and higher

parameter MC. It was also noted that σ was found near eutectic islands and grain boundaries, although Zr showed little influence on its formation. Overall the grain boundary precipitates displayed a decrease in-quantity-with increased Zr levels.

III. EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURE

3.1 Materials

Twelve experimental heats o? Udimet 738 were prepared by the Special Metals Corporation (SMC), a division of Allegheng Ludlum Industries in New Hart?ord, New York. The heats varied co_positionallg by systematically replacing cobalt, boror**,**, and zirconium with nickel. The allog classification and corresponding weight percent (wt%) of the variable elements are given in Table I. The remaining elements o_ each allo**y** were held constant. The industrial standard composition for Udimet 738 is alloy 1A.

Each heat was investment cast in "cast to size" test bars with a test region diameter of .635 centimeters. These test bars provided samples ?or microstructural analysis as yell as mechanical testing.

3.2 Heat Treatment o? Cast U-738

Cast bars of U-738 were given the commercial standard heat treatment or 11_I°C ?or _ hours in vacuum**,** back cool with an inert gas (Ar or N) to room temperature.

Alloy No.	Cobalt	Boron	Zirconium
1A	8.5	.01	.04
1B	8.5	.03	.04
24	8.5	.01	. 10
2R	8.5	\cdot 03	.10
ЗA	8.5	. 01	. 20
33	8.5	. 03	. 20
4٨	0.0	.01	.04
43	O. O	.03	.04
5A	O. O	.01	.10
5R	O. O	.03	. 10
6A	O. O	.01	. 20
6B	O. O	50.	. 20
	Remaining composition of all allows (wty)		

TABLE I. Alloy Compositional Variation (wtX)

Ti Ta Nb W $A1$ Mo C_{Γ} C **Ni** 1.7 16.0 0.1 Bal. 3.4 3.4 1.7 0.9 2.6

The samples were aged at 843⁰C for 24 hours and air cooled to room temperature.

3.3 Structural Stability

Alloy stability was evaluated by exposing the as cast and the solution treated samples at 843°C up to 500 hours. The effects of the variations in cobalt, boron, and zirconium on the tendency for sigma formation would manifest themselves at this temperature.

3. 4 Mechanical Testing

Specific mechanical properties of all twelve alloys were obtained to evaluate ang e_ects that t**h**e compositional modifications pay in**du**ce. T**h**e two tests **ch**osen were unia**x**ial room tem**p**erature tensile**,** and unia**x**ial elevated tem**p**erature stress ru**p**ture. **C**ommercial specifications are given in Table II. The samples teste**d** were each heat treated to t**h**e in**dus** trg stan**d**ard.

All testing was performed at the gas Turbine Division of General Motors Corporation, Indianapolis Indiana. Standard testing procedures were followed and the data sheets appear in **A**ppendix **B**. Tested samples provided _racture surfac**e**s _**o**r _ract**og**ra**p**hic e**x**ami**n**ati**o**n**.**

5 Sample Preparation And Examination

All sam**pl**es were pre**p**ared **b**g w**e**t **pol**i**sh**ing t**h**r**ough 6**00 **g**rit silicon carbid**e**. This was _**o**llow**e**d bg an electropolish in **2**0% s**u**l**phu**ri**c** acid in m**e**thanol and an immersi**o**n et**c**h in 15% hgdro**c**hl**o**ric a**c**i**d** in methanol pl**u**s a ?ew drops o? **h**gdrogel**,** pero**x**ide**.**

Optical and **sc**anning electron micros**co**pe (SEM) observation o? these pre**p**ared samples provided microstructural **ch**ara**c**terization **d**ata. D**u**rin**g** SEM o**b**servation**,** e**ne**r**gg** dis**p**ersive analgsis o_ X-rags (EDAX) provided **q**ualitative chemical analysis of phases in situ. These phases were then extracted for X-ray diffraction identification. Details of these techniques are located in Appendix A.

TABLE II. Mechanical Property Specifications

		Room Temperature Tensile Properties		
		$ \mathbb{S}^+_0$ (MPa) $ \mathbb{S}^+_1$ (MPa) %Elongation	XReduction of Area	
1896. 3	792.9	3.0	3.0	
		Stress Rupture Properties at 982°C and 151.8 MPa		
Life (Hrs) -30.		XElongation 5.0		

IV. RESULTS

The results of this study are grouped into three catagories; scanning electron microscopy, mechanical properties, and phase extraction identification. The first category discusses the microstructural characteristics as a function of compositional variations and heat treatment relative to the standard $alloy$ 1A. Mechanical property data is presented and related to compositional changes, microstructural differences and fractograghic observations. Finally, identification of extracted residues is presented.

4.1 Scanning Electron Microscopy

4.1.1 Standard Alloy Composition - 1A

The standard composition of U-738 contains 8.5 wt% Co, .01 wt% B and Figure 1 shows representative microstructure in the as cast, as cast plus solutioned, and "aged" conditions of the commercial standard composition of U-738. In the initial as cast condition, large script titanium rich MC carbides can be found throughout the sample. They occupy grain boundary and interdendritic locations. Two sizes of cooling or as cast o' were found which indicate areas of compositional variation. The as cast δ' generally appears starlike and coarse. Moderate sized kidney shaped islands of eutectic δ' were found along grain boundaries and

Figure 1. SEM Micrographs of Alloy 1A. (a) as cast 3000X (b) solution treated 2000X
(c) aged 24Hrs. 2000X

transgranularlu.

Eutectic areas are the last liquid to freeze and therecontain many odd sized elements resulting in areas of fore segregation. This provides excellent sites for nucleation of carbides, borides, zirconium rich phases, and deleterious TCP phases. The only precipitates in the as cast eutectic islands and grain boundaries of alloy 1A were script MC carbides.

In the as cast plus solution treated condition, the most visible change in microstructure was the formation of a duplex δ' structure. Because the solutioning temperature of 1121^oC is in the middle of the V' solutioning range, only a partial solutioning of δ' takes place. The result is a duplex structure of ultra fine secondary %' and coarse as cast \forall' . The solutioned treated as cast \forall' shows a more uniform cuboidal appearance than that in the as cast condition while the eutectic V' islands exhibit partial homogeni-The MC carbides remained unchanged. zation.

In the solution treated plus aged thermal condition, the precipitation of a Cr rich phase, most likely M₂₃C₆ carbides, can be seen along all grain boundaries while a heavier precipitation was noted in the eutectic areas. Veru breakdown of the primary MC carbides mincr occurred. Overall the as cast X' appeared more uniform and cuboidal.

4.1.2 Removal of Cobalt - Alloy 4A

Removal of all cobalt while maintaining levels of .01 **u**t% B a**nd .**04 **w**t% Zr **p**r**oduced** various mi**c**r**o**str**u**ctural alterations to alloy 1A. Fig**u**re 2 ill**u**strates t**h**e t**h**ree t**h**ermal **c**on**d**itions oe t**h**e **c**obalt _ree alloy.

T**h**e as cast MC carbides and **g**rain bo**u**ndaries **u**ere verg similar to t**h**ose o_ all**o**y 1**A.** An oc**c**asional lo**u** melting **ph**ase an**d** bori**d**e whi**ch u**ere not detecte**d** in alloy 1A, **u**ere _o**u**f,d **n**ear **eu**t**e**ctic _**"** ar**e**as**.**

T**h**e as **c**ast **plu**s sol**u**tion treated **co**n**d**ition **o**_ a**llo**g 4A showed no duplex δ' structure as was seen in alloy 1A. The e**u**t**ec**ti**c** islands also e**xh**ibite**d** less homo**g**eni**z**ation. O**c**casio**n**al grain bo**u**ndary **p**reci**p**itates co**u**ld be seen in addition to t**h**e MC carbides. Becaus**e** o_ t**h**e **C**o _ree nature o_ t**h**is alloy, it is highly probable that these are M₂₃C₆ carbides _o,.med u**p**on **co**oling d**u**e to c**h**ang**e** in **c**arbon sol**u**bilitg.

In t**h**e aged **c**on**d**ition, mu**ch h**eavier**,** almost **c**ontin**u**o**u**s g_ain boundal.g precipitates**,** most lik**e**lg M23**C**6_ can be seen. Thi_ appare**,,**t M23C 6 precipitation appears heaviest in the e**u**t**ec**tic areas. It is possible t**h**at some oe t**h**ese **p**re**c**i**p**it**a**t**e**s are borides. Breakdown oe M**C** carbides **w**as also more **p**revalent t**h**an in all**o**y 1A.

 $\label{eq:3.1} \Psi_{\rm{in}}=-\frac{1}{2}\left(1-\frac{1}{2}\right) \left(1-\frac{1}{2}\right)$

 \mathcal{N} , and \mathcal{N} , and \mathcal{N}

Figure 2. SEM Micrographs of Alloy 4A. (a) as cast 3000X (b) solution treated 1200X
(c) aged 24Hrs. 2700X

4.1.3 Addition of Boron - Alloy 1B

Increasing the level of boron in alloy 1A resulted in an allog **w**ith T**h**e as cast co_**,**dition s**h**o**w**ed precipitation o_ a Cr, Mo, W ric**h ph**ase in the eutectic areas. (see Figure 3). T**h**is phase a**p**peared blocky and discrete but also appeared **sc**ript like **o**n o**cc**asion an**d** is pr**ob**a**b**l**u** a **b**oride. T**he** e**u**te**c**ti**c** areas wer**e** m**uc**h larger and more n**u**mero**u**s t**h**an in th**e** base allog 1A. Some block**u** H**C c**arbides were _o**u**nd near the boride **p**reci**p**itates.

A?ter sol**u**tion treatment**,** more **p**re**c**i**p**itation o? the boride phase occurred in the eutectic areas. A duplex Y' str**u**ct**u**re r**e**s**u**lted **up**on sol**u**tion treatm**e**nt**,** similar to allo**u** 1A. Homogenization of the eutectic islands did not occur as **co**Cpletel**u** as in all**ou** 1A.

A?ter a**g**ing**,** a dis**c**rete **p**re**c**i**p**itation o_ grain bo**u**ndar**u** M_3**C** 6 phase occurred and minor M**C** breakdown was detected. The as cast X' showed an increased uniformity in shape and distrib**u**ti**o**n with thermal a**g**ing as seen in alloy 1A.

4.1.4 **R**emova**l** o? **Co**balt and **A**ddition o_ Boron -Allo**u** 49

Alloy 4B (0 wt% **C**o**,** .03 wt% B**,** .0**4** wt% Zr) in the as **c**ast conditiof**,** show**e**d a Cr rich bori**d**e **p**hase which was notabl**y** larger**,** m**o**re massive**,** and blo**c**ky than in all**oy** 1B (Fi**gu**re 4). MC **c**arbid**e**s occasionall**y** a**pp**eared m**o**re bl**ocky** than

 $\hat{\mathbf{S}}$

 $\mathcal{Y} = \{ \mathcal{Y} \}$. In the \mathcal{Y}

 (b) $\overline{10.0 \mu m}$

 (c) $\overline{10.0 \mu m}$

 α .

 .

 α

Figure 3. SEM Micrographs of Alloy 1B. (a) as cast 5000X (b) solution treated 3000X
(c) aged 24Hrs. 2200X

 (a) $rac{10.0 \mu m}{$

 Δ

 $10.0 \mu m$ (b)

 $10.0 \mu m$ (c)

script type; however, the majority of MC carbides remained script type and were located in grain boundaries or interdendritically as in 1B. The grain boundaries and eutectic 1B. Islands apprared similar to those in alloy 1B.

Upon solution treatment no duplex α structure The eutectic δ' islands showed some homogenizadeveloped. tion and the as cast o' became more uniform and cuboidal. These results are similar to those found in alloy 1B. Additional precipitation in the eutectic island periphery suggests more boride formation. Due to decreased carbon solubility resulting from the removal of Co, some of these precipitates may be M₂₃C₆ carbides.

After aging, the addition of B seemed to promote fewer discrete $M_{23}C_6$ precipitates in the grain boundaries. Minor MC carbide breakdown was noted and traces of an ultrafine background o' were observed amidst the as cast o'. The eutectic X' islands remained unchanged from the solution treated condition.

4.1.5 Addition of Zirconium - Alloy 3A

Zirconium was varied to three levels; . 04 wt%, . 10 wt%, Because the alloys with . 10 wt% level of zirand $.20$ $w\tau$ %. conium showed no substantial microstructural difference relative to the .20 wt% level, the .20 wt% zirconium alloy (3A) was used for evaluation (Figure 5). This allou

contained 8.5 wt% Co and **.**01 wt% B.

o The as cast structures o_ allog 3A sho**w**ed two main structural differences relative to the standard alloy 1A. First, the eulectic V' islands were larger and more numerous. Second, a zirconium rich stick phase precipitated near the eutectic δ' islands. The script MC carbides and **g**rain boundarg precipitation appear una?_ected **b**g t**h**e **h**i**g**her addition o? Zr. Overall the as cast _" appeared slightlg more u**rl**i?orm in this higher Zr level allog as compared to alloy 1A which had the lowest level of Zr.

The solutionin**g** heat treatment produced several structural effects. The eutectic Y' areas showed occasional boride type precipitates even though the level of boron was only .01 wt %. These eutectic δ' areas did not homogenize as completelg as t_**,**e low Zr allog IA. Occasionallg a low melting phase was observed in these same locations. The Zr rich stick phase remained unaltered in location, size, and shape. The as cast $3'$ in alloy 3A exhibited solutioning but to a lesser degree compared to allog 1A.

The aging treatment produced discrete grain boundary precipitatiol**,** o? M_3C 6 carbides. Some Zr sticks **w**ere also fcund in the grain boundary and the MC breakdown was very minor. The repaining structures apeared similar to those in the solutioned, condition.

4.1.6 Removal of Cobalt and Addition of Zr - Alloy 6A

Alloy 6A contains O wt% Co, . 20 wt% Zr, and . 01 wt% B. This cobalt free alloy showed minor variations in as cast phases compared to alloy 3A (Figure 6). Occasional boride type precipitates on the eutectic island periphery and more numerous ultra fine V' precipitating between the coarse as cast 8' appear in the as cast structure of alloy 6A. These structures do not appear in alloy 3A.

The solutioning heat treatment did not produce as distinct a duplex o' structure as seen in other cobalt free alloys. The eviectic V' areas displayed less homogenization than in alloy 3A.

The aging heat treatment resulted in slightly heavier $M_{23}C_{6}$ precipitation in the grain boundaries than in alloy 3A. Alloy 6A, having the highest level of Zr, appeared to have less continuous precipitation of M₂₃C₆ in the grain boundaries than alloys of lower Zr levels and O wt% Co. Fairly heavy breakdown of MC carbides was also noted in alloy 6A. The ultrafine 8' and partially homogenized eutectic X' remained unchanged relative to these same structures in the solutioned condition.

4.1.7 Additions of Boron and Zirconium - Alloy 3B The microstructures of alloy 3B are shown in Figure 7.

 $\mathbf{z} = \mathbf{z}$, and $\mathbf{z} = \mathbf{z}$

 $\mathbf{y}=-\mathbf{y}$

Figure 6. SEM Micrographs of Alloy 6A. (a) as cast 3000X (b) solution treated 5000X
(c) aged 24Hrs. 3000X

Figure 7. SEM Micrographs of Alloy 3B. (a) as cast 5000X (b) solution treated 2000X
(c) aged 24Hrs. 1800X

 Δ .

 \pm

 $\mathbf{1}$, $\mathbf{1}$

Allo**y** (3B**)** contains .03 _t% B**,** .20 wt% Zr**,** and 8.5 wt% Co. Co_pared to allo**y** 1A**,** the as cast MC carbides and the grain boundaries appear unaltered b**y** the high B and Zr content ?ound in a11o9 3B. However**,** more _requent bo**r**ides and larger, more numerous eutectic &' were found in alloy 3B than in the alloys with a low level of Zr (1B). Occasionally a Zr rich stick and a boride were observed together as in Figure 7. The borides were more block**y**, ?airlg discrete**,** and found in the eutectic %' areas.

After the solutioning heat treatment, the borides appeared**-** to coarsen resulting in some massive boride particles. The M_ phase appeared to be stable and the grain boundaries showed no signs of precipitation. The eutectic areas showed less signs of homogenization than those in allo**y**s with less Zr and less B. A less distinctive duple**x** _" structure w_s observed in allog 3B**;** there?ore, the solutioning of the as cast Y' was not as extensive as in alloys with less Zr.

Agter the aging heat treatment**,** discrete H23C 6 ca**r**bid**es** were observed in the grain boundaries along with minor M**C** breakdown. This observation was made in all allo**y**s which • contained Co. Fi_ _eco_dar 9 _', Zr rich sticks**,** and boride phases remained unchanged from the solution treated condition. Coarse as cast Y' appeared more cuboidal and the eutectic \mathbb{Y}^* islands showed no additional homogenization.

Figure 8. SEM Micrographs of Alloy 6B. (a) as cast 3000X (b) solution treated 3000X
(c) aged 24Hrs. 2000X

 Δ , \sim , \sim , μ

4.1.8 Alloy 6B - 0.0% Co Plus Additions of B and Zr

As cast alloy 6B with 0 wt% Co, .03 wt% B, and .20 wt% is shown in Figure 8. Borides, MC carbides, grain boun- Zr daries, and eutectic X' areas were similar to those observed the cobalt containing alloy 3B. The only difference in appeared to be a few additional Zr rich sticks.

After the solutioning treatment, no duplex %' structures were noted, and an ultrafine background X' appeared slightly more numerous than in alloys with lower boron and zirconium levels. The eutectic areas remained large and appeared unaffected by the heat treatment. Other structures were essentially unchanged from those in the as cast condition.

Aging produced two noticeable structural changes. First, a fairly discrete and infrequent precipitation of $M_{23}C_6$ in the grain boundaries and second a plate phase precipitate in the matrix were found. The plate phase was high in Cr and may be the TCP phase sigma $\langle \sigma \rangle$. These plates occurred infrequently and also appeared in the cobalt free alloys 5A and 5B.

4.1.9 Alloy Stability

Structural stability of all twelve alloys was determined by aging at 843⁰C. At this temperature, **σ** formation and/or heavy $\texttt{M}_{23}\texttt{C}_{6}$ precipitation occurs if the alloys are compositionally unstable. Both as cast alloys and solution treated alloys were aged for 100, 300, and 500 hours.

Overall, less plate formation was found in the as cast alloys even though normally as cast alloys show more segregation. Trends of instability were otherwise similar in both as cast and solution treated alloys. They were as fol $lous:$

- 1. High levels of boron (.03 wt%) apparently promoted plate phase formation in as little as 100 hours of aging.
- 2. Removal of cobalt accelerated plate phase formation. These plates were observed in some Co free alloys after 24 hours of aging and in all Co free alloys after 100 hours of aging.
- 3. Removal of cobalt destabilized the MC type carbides resulting in massive breakdown of MC into $\texttt{M}_{23}\texttt{C}_{6}$ type carbides. Massive breakdown was observed in Co free samples as early as after 100 hours of aging.

4. Removal of cobalt increased grain boundary pre-

cipitation of $M_{23}C_6$ type carbides resulting in continuous films. Continuous films were observed in one **C**o free allog after 24 hours of . agin**g** a**nd** i**n** all **C**o free allogs after 100 **h**o**u**rs of agin**g**.

5. **C**obalt c**o**ntaining allogs **d**isplaged more dis**c**rete and limited M₂₃C₆ formation in grain boundaries and in MC carbide breakdown. This observation was noted in all Co containing allogs at all stages o? aging.

In the as cast **C**o free allogs, massive precipitation of dis**c**rete interdendritic M23C 6 carbides was ?ound, indicating _ore segregation within the grains. This segregation was not observed a_ter the solutioning heat treatment. Figure 9 displays characteristic morphologies of plate formation, grain boundary $M_{23}c_6$, MC breakdown, and interdendritic $M_{23}c_6$ formation.

1. 2 Mechanical Testing

Room t**e**mperature tensile and stress r**u**pt**u**re tests were carried out on all twelve allogs having the standard commercial heat treatment. A summarg of the test results as a function of each'elemental variation is given in Table III.

(a) $\frac{10.0 \mu m}{s}$

(b) $\frac{1}{10.0 \mu m}$ (c) $\frac{1}{10.0 \mu m}$

 $\mathcal{S}=\{S_{1},\ldots,S_{n}\}$

Figure 9. SEM Micrographs of LTA Samples. (b) Alloy $4A$ A.C. + aged 300Hrs. (a) Alloy 1E sltn. treated ⁺ aged 500Hrs. 1500X 1500X (c) Alloy 4A A. C. ⁺ aged 500Hrs. 2000X

TABLE III. Mechanical Property Test Results

 \mathbf{I}

Figure 10 shows the uniaxial tensile properties with respect to cobalt. Generally, alloys with cobalt had a +5.3% average improvement in ultimate strength over alloys without cobalt.

Figure 10. Ultimate Tensile Strength vs. Wt% Cobalt

 $\ddot{}$

 $\mathcal{A}(\mathcal{A})$ and $\mathcal{A}(\mathcal{A})$

Figure 11 shows the effect of boron on uniaxial tensile properties. Four of the six alloys in which boron was varied showed less than 5% change in ultimate strength from alloys with the standard level of boron. The other two exhibited opposite behaviors with larger changes in Therefore it is difficult to correlate additions strength. of boron to any trend in uniaxial tensile strength.

Figure 11. Ultimate Tensile Strength vs. Wt% Boron

Zirconium additions and their impact $-$ 0 $\overline{0}$ ultimate strength are depicted in Figure 12. Overall there appeared to be a decrease in strength with increasing zirconium content. However, it difficult to define a $a₅$ with boron, trend.

Figure 12. Ultimate Tensile Strength vs. Wt% Zirconium

Stress rupture lives were also plotted with respect to com**p**ositional variation**,** and again**,** cobalt allogs displaged an overall improvement in rupture life by +22% (see Figure **13)**.

Figure 13. Stress Rupture Life vs. Wt% Cobalt

Boron additions seemed to decrease rupture life; hou ever, two of the six alloys had significantly improved lives (see Figure 14).

Figure 14. Stress Rupture Life vs. Wt% Boron

Zirconium additions also displayed an overall decrease rupture life (Figure 15). Alloys with the .20 wt% level in of zirconium consistently showed shorter rupture life as compared to the alloys with the .04 wt% level of zirconium.

Figure 15. Stress Rupture Life vs Wt% Zirconium

The percent of elongation was used to compare $ductil -$ Both tensile ductility and stress rupture ductility ity. were plotted together relative to compositional variation.

Figure 16 depicts the effect of cobalt on ductility. Tensile ductility improved with cobalt additions at low boron levels and was constant at high boron levels. Rupture ductility showed mixed results, but there was a trend of improved ductility with the addition of cobalt, especially at high boron levels.

Figure 16. Percent Elongation vs. Wt% Cobalt

The effect of boron on ductility is shown in Figure 17. At room temperature the results again were mixed. Generally reduction in ductility occured with increased boron and Zr elevated temperatures, ductility was virtually $levels.$ At constant when boron was increased and cobalt was present. Removal of cobalt and increased amounts of boron showed a general reduction in ductility.

Figure 17. Percent Elongation vs. Wt% Boron

When zirconium was the variable, tensile ductility showed no trend. Rupture ductility showed general improvement although again the results were not consistent (Figure 18 .

Figure 18 Percent Elongation vs. Wt% Zirconium

4.3 Fractography

Fractographic analysis failed to reveal any causes o f failure that could explain the inconsistencies in mechanical properties. Although all samples showed varying degrees of porosity, it was concluded that porosity was not a major factor in failure. Large quantities of brittle MC carbide fracture were observed in many samples. All fractures were transgranular.

4.4 Phase Extraction Identification

The structures present in Udimet 738 were identified by X-ray powder diffraction analysis of extracted phases. Table IV shows the phases present in the coarse and fine residues extracted from the standard heat treated alloys.

The boride phase appeared only in the coarse residue of those alloys alloys with a high level of boron. The boride phase was found in the fine residues of all high level boron alloys as well as in the residues of low boron level alloys that did not contain cobalt. The $M_{23}C_6$ phase appeared to be greater in amount in Co free alloys. The amount of MC phase appeared fairly consistent and no shifts in lattice parameter were noted regardless of alloy composition.

TABLE IV. X-ray Peak Identification

Coarse Residue	Fine Residue
MC 4.36 A	MC 4.36 A
$\mathbb{CP}_{\times}(\mathbb{M}_{5}\mathbb{B}_{3})$	$M_{23}C_6$ 10.70 A
	CrB_x (M_5B_3)

V. DISCUSSION OF RESULTS

5.1 Role Of Cobalt In U-738

Cobalt at levels of 8.5 wt% and O wt% displayed little direct interaction with boron and zirconium. For the most part, borides were script like in appearance in alloys containing cobalt and more gassive when cobalt was removed. No. csbalt borides were found.

Cobalt had a more profound effect on Y'. Alloys containing cobalt showed a duplex δ' structure after solutioning whereas alloys without Co did not. This indicated that the 8' solvus temperature has been raised by the removal of cobalt. This observation agrees with the results of studies by Engel⁽³⁾, Nathal <u>et al</u> ⁽⁴⁾,and Jarret and Tien.⁽⁶⁾ It was difficult to determine optically if the volume fraction of X' was altered by cobalt removal. The as cast X' morphology in all alloys appeared similar in size and shape. Eutectic V' islands in Co free alloys displayed less homogenization possibly indicating an increased solvus temperature.

Samples which had a duplex V' structure showed an. improvement in stress rupture properties. The increase in stress rupture results agrees with results reported previously. (5,6,9) Stress rupture improvement generally has been attributed to discrete grain boundary precipitation and X'

vol**u**me fraction**.** (5) While **c**o**b**alt **p**revented continuous _ilms in t**h**e grain bo**u**ndaries**,** it is not **c**ertain as to whet**h**er an increase in \mathcal{V}' volume fraction occurred.

Tensile properties have also been related to V" morp**h**olog**y** and dis**c**rete grain bo**u**ndary carbides. Beca**u**se t**h**e V" particle si**z**_ distribution and volume _raction **w**ere not meas**u**red**,** it is diffi**cu**lt to sa**y** whi**c**h _a**c**tor had t**h**e most sig*uificant influence on tensile properties, V' or discrete* **c**aTbides. In this st**u**dy**,** allo**y**s containin**g** Co showed an improv**e**ment in tensile properties**,** w**h**ereas p**u**blished literatur**e h**as reported little or**.** no tensile property improvement**.**

Cobalt stabilized t**h**e **M**C carbides b**y** preventing MC breakdown the;**.**eby inhibiting massive M_3C 6 _ormation in the **g**rain bo**u**ndaries. **M**ang studies agree wit**h** t**h**is re_ult.(3'6**'**_**'**9) In long time aged samples o_ 500 hours**,** cobalt apparently retarded σ formation. This does not agree with earlier reports bg Engel (3) and Lurid e_t**_**alt **;** (8) ho**w**ever**,** their st**u**di**e**s were on allo**y**s o_ di_eerent **c**om**p**osition t**h**an **U**-738.

_**.2 E_eect O_ Boron**

Many claims have been made as to the beneficial effects boron. Most studies report grain boundary effects of in**c**l**u**ding **c**arbo**n** s**hu**nting and com**p**le**x ox**ide retardation. In t**h**is st**u**dg o_ **U**-738**,** B additions did not alter t**h**e **g**rain

boundary morphology. In comparison of low B alloys to high B alloys, the $M_{23}C_K$ carbide precipitation and as cast Y' showed no change in quantity or shape. to high B allous. The most notable effects of higher boron additions appeared as the formation of a large boride phase and increased size and amount of eutectic Y' islands. The boride phase was most often found near these eutectic islands and rarely appeared in the grain boundaries. Most significantly, B additions did not result in an improvement in mechanical properties, but rather a decrease in stress rupture life was found. This does not coincide with findings by Holt and Wallace⁽¹²⁾, Decker and Freeman⁽¹³⁾, and Antony and Radavich; $^{(11)}$ however, their studies considered levels of boron primarily in the range of 0.0 wt% to .01 wt%, whereas this study compared B levels of . 01 to . 03 wt%. This suggests that addition of B beyond the . O1 wt% level may be ineffective in increasing mechanical properties of Udimet 738. Since the solid solubility limit of B in pure Ni is approximately . 015 wt%, higher levels of B may only result in the formation of larger borides which do not contribute to mechanical properties.

5.3 Effects Of Zirconium

Zirconium is a trace element which may control grain boundary precipitation and act as a getter of sulphur, thereby improving high temperature strength and ductility.

Zr has been reported to have a homogenizing effect on X' and to promote discrete and less numerous MC carbides. (19) Results of this study showed that samples of high Zr level had as cast o' which appeared more uniform in size and Solution treated alloys with high Zr levels also shape. showed a duplex o' structure that was not as distinct as that seen in alloys with low Zr levels. The ultrafine secondary o' appeared more dispersed in the matrix of high Zr level alloys. Zr additions showed no effect on MC morphology.

Zr additions also increased the size and quantity of eutectic X' islands which agrees with previous studies. $(11, 19)$ Zr appeared to be heavily segregated at eutectic X' islands as the majority of Zr rich stick phases were found in these areas. Grain boundary morphology appeared unaffected by Zr additions.

In this study, the effects of Zr on mechanical properties showed mixed results and it was difficult to observe any trends. Holt and Wallace reported that rupture life and ductility were independent of Zr content in alloy 738 and thus the beneficial effects of Zr may be alloy dependent. (12) In the study of Antony and Radavich, Zr had an adverse effect on mechanical properties which was attributed to microporosity. Their samples were taken from integrally cast wheels in which the microporosity was more dependent on changes in the solidification range. Samples in this study

ere cast to size test bars in **u**hic**h** solidification **u**as ver**u** rapid, thereby decreasing the effects of a large solidification range. Yet micro**p**orosity **u**as observed in t**h**e tested bars. How**e**ver, no correlation o **p**orosit**u** to mec**h**anical **p**ro**p**erties or Zr level could be made.

VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMENDATIONS

6.1 Conclusions

Variations of the minor elements B and Zr with the major alloying element cobalt resulted in changes in microstructure and although the complete role of cobalt is not fully understood in U-738, some of the effects of cobalt are as follows:

- 1. The presence of cobalt did not affect the as casi o' morphology.
- 2. Remaval of cobalt increased the δ' solvus temperature.
- 3. The amount of secondary V' was decreased after solution treatment in Co free alloys.
- 4. A decrease in stress rupture properties was associated with the loss of secondary \forall' .
- 5. Removal of coualt promoted $M_{23}C_6$ precipitation.
- 6. Cobalt stabilized primary MC carbides.
- 7. Cobalt inhibited formation of continuous grain boundary films.
- 8. Cobalt helped to prevent o formation.

Boron and zirconium had the following effects:

- 1. Boron additions beyond . O1 wt% precipitated large borides without a substantial change in mechanical properties.
- 2. Zirconium additions created subtle changes in Y'

but did n**o**t **e**_F**ec**t mec**h**anical properties**.**

- **3.** Hig**h** Zr l**e**vel**s p**rom**o**ted Zr ric**h** sti**ck ph**a**s**e precipitatio**n n**ear eutectic _**"** islands.
- 4**.** Doron and **z**ir**c**oni**u**m **h**ad little eFFect on matri**x c**ar**b**i**d**e**s o**r t**h**e m**o**r**pholog**g **o**_ **g**rain **bound**ary **c**arbi**d**es.
- 5**.** B**o**ron and **z**ir**c**o**n**i**u**m increased t**h**e solidifi**c**ati**o**n ran**ge o**_ t**h**e all**o**g w**h**ic**h** res**u**lted in lar**g**er an**d** more numerous eutectic _**"** islands.
- 6. L_it**h**in t**he** sco**pe** oF t**h**i**s** studg oF cast to size bars, t**h**ere was no **c**orr**e**lation betwe**e**n **p**orositg an**d** B **p**lu**s** Zr content, alt**h**ou**gh** porosity was observed in some Fra**c**ture surfaces**.**

_**.**2 R_c@mmendations

The result**s o**# t**h**is study s**ho**wed t**h**at additional r**e**s**e**ar**ch** needs to be done to **an**swer t**h**e di##eren**c**e in r**e**sults Foun**d** in t**h**i**s** study compare**d** to r**es**ults re**p**orted in ^r t**he** re_er**enced** literature. T**he** _**ol**l**ow**ing ar**e**a**s** _**o**r _**u**t**u**re _esearc**h** are recomm**e**n**d**ed**:**

> 1. Because of the great degree of difference in castabi**l**ity o_ ca**s**t to si**z**e t**es**t bars an**d**_lar**ge c**ast **c**omponents, it is recommend**ed** t**h**at act**u**al com**p**on**e**nts b**e c**ast wit**h** t**h**e com**p**ositional variati**o**ns **us**ed in t**h**is study and**'**eval**u**ate t**h**e eF#ects oF B and Zr on **p**or**o**sity Form**e**d durin**g** solidi**f**icati**o**n.

- 2. More mechanical propertg tests s**h**ould be per formed to insure statistical reliability.
- ° 3. Larger variations in composition**,** notablg B and Zr in U-738**,** should be investigated to determine t**h**e extreme amounts o_ B a**nd** Zr w**h**ic**h** w**ou**id be acce**p**table in t**h**is allog.

LIST OF REFERENCES

1. C. T. Sims, W. C. Hagel, The Superallous, John Wiley and **Sons** Inc., New York, 1972.

- 2. D.R. Betner, K.E. Muszar, E.S. Nichols, "Phase Stability of Two Investment Cast High Cr Ni-Base Alloys", Procedings of the First International Symposium on Structural Stability in Superalloys Seven Springs, Penn., pp. 278-311, 1968.
- 3. M.A. Engel, "Effects Of Co On The Microstructure Of U-700", M.S. in Metallurgical Engr. Thesis, Purdue Univ., 1981.
- 4. M.V. Nathal, R.D. Maier, L.J. Ebert, "The Influence Of Co On The Microstructure Of The Ni-Base Superalloy MAR-M247", Metallurgical Transactions, pp. 1775-1783, Oct. 1982.

5. M.V. Mathal, R.D. Maier, L.J. Ebert, "The Influence Of Co On The Tensile And Stress Rupture Properties Of The Ni-Base Superalloy MAR M247", Metallurgical Transactions, pp. $1767 -$ 1774, Oct. 1982.

- 6. R.N. Jarret, J.K. Tien, "Effects Of Co On Structure, Microchemistry, And Properties Of A Wrought Ni-Base Superalloy", Metallurgical Transactions, pp. 1021-1032, June 1982.
- 7. J. Heslop, "Wrought Ni-Cr Heat Resisting Alloys Containing Cobalt", Cobalt, Vol. 24, pp. 128, Sept. 1964.
- 8. C.H. Lund, M.J. Woulds, J. Hockin, "Cobalt And Sigma: Participant, Spectator, or Referee?", Procedings of the First International Symposium on the Structural Stability in Superalloys, Seven Springs, Penn., pp. 25-46, 1968.

9. G.E. Mauer, L.A. Jackman, J.A. Domingue, "Role Of Cobalt In Waspaloy", Superallous 1980, Procedings of the Forth International Symposium on Superalloys, Champion, Penn., pp. 43-52, 1980.

- 10. E.P. Whelan, "Co-Free Ni-Base Wrought Superalloys", Superallous 1980, pp. 53-62, 1980.
- 11. K.C. Antony, J.F. Radavich, "Solute Effects of B and Zr on Microporosity", Technical paper, Cabot Corp., Kokomo, Ind.
- 12. R.T. Holt, W. Wallace, "Impurties And Trace Elements In Ni-Base Superalloys", International Metals Review, pp. 1-23, March 1976.
- 13. R.F. Decker, J.W. Freeman, "The Mechanism Of Beneficial Effects Of B And Zr On Creep Properties Of A Complex Heat Resistant Alloy", Iransactions of the Metallurgical Society of AIME, vol. 218, pp 277-285, April 1960.
- 14. B. Hu, H. Li, "Neutron Activated Microradiography Determination Of Boron Distribution Of A Cast Ni-Base Superalloy", Superallous 1980, pp. 423-429, 1980.
- 15. D.A. Woodford, "Environmental Damage Of A Cast Ni-Base Superalloy", Metallurgical Transactions, pp. 299-308, Feb. 1981.
- 16. D.A. Woodford, R.H. Bricknell, "Grain Boundary Penetration Of Oxygen In Nickel And The Effect Of B Additions", Metallurgical Transactions, pp. 1467-1475, August 1981.
- 17. S. Floreen, J.M. Davidson, "The Effects Of B and Zr On The Creep And Fatigue Crack Growth Behavior Of A Ni-Base Superalloy", Metallurgical Transactions, pp. 895-901, May 1983.
- 18. K.N. Strafford, B.A. Nagaraj, "Degredation Of Zr Containing Ni-Base Alloys In A Hydrogen/Hydrogen-Sulfide Environment", Dxidation of Metals, y_{01} , 14, no. 2, pp. 109-117, 1980.
- 19. J.F. Radavich, "Effects Of Zr Variations On The Microstructural Stability Of Alloy 713C", Procedings of the First International Symposium on the Structural Stability of Superalloys, Seven Springs, Penn., pp. 199-226, 1968.

20. Y. Koizumi, M. Yamazaki, H. Harada, "M₅B₃ Type Boride In
Nickel-Base Superalloys", <u>Transactions</u> of National
Research Institute For Metals, yol. 19, no. 6, pp. 60-
61, 1977.

A**PPEN**DIX A

Sample **Preparation** And Examination

Sam**p**le **P**re**p**aration

Sam**p**les **us**e**d** i**n** this stu**d**y were taken From cast to **s**i**z**e test bars that had e**x**perienced all levels oF heat treatment and long time aging (LTA)**.** Aging **p**eriods were 100**,** 300**,** and 500 hour_ at 843°C. Both the _olutio**n** treated and as cast sa**m**ples were ex**p**osed to LTA. The cast to si**z**e bars were severed in the test region**,** then ground Flat longitudinallg. Eac**h** sample was then wet grou**n**d through 600 grit silicon carbide Followed bg an electropolish in **2**0% sulfuric acid in methanol electrolyte solution. A stainless steel beaker served as the cath**o**de and the sam**p**le itself as t**h**e anode. The polishing **p**arameters were **2**0 volts**,** 3 to 5 amps For a**pp**roximat**e**lg 8 seconds. T**h**is was Followed immediatelg bg an immersion etch in a 15% hgdrochloric acid in methanol **p**lus a Few **d**rops oF 30% **h**gdrogen pero**x**ide solution **F**or 5 to 10 seconds.

T**h**e el**e**ctro**p**olis**h se**rv**e**d to **p**ut the carbide**s**, boride**s0** T**C**P, and other inert **p**hases in relieF**.** MC carbide**s** that are rich in titani**u**m s**h**o**u**ld a**pp**ear black in the **s**canning electron microscope due to the relativelg low atomic weight oF titani**u**m**.** Other inert phase**s s**ho**u**ld ap**p**ear either **g**rag or bright. **T**he i_mersion etch removes the _" phase, res**u**lting

in three different levels of microstructure. The etched Y' should appear dark, since it is at the lowest level, the Y matri**x** should ap**p**ear gray (intermediate level), and t**h**e carbides and inert **ph**ases at t**h**e to**p** level are as **p**reviously decribed. The etching of the Y' and grain boundaries acts to en**h**ance t**h**e contrast oe eac**h** sam**p**le.

MicTostructural and Chemical Analgsis

Microstructures of each sample were characterized with a d.E.O.L, dSM 35**C**F scanning electron microscop**e** (SEM). T**h**e various morphologies and locations **o**f the phases present _ere recor**d**ed electon micrographicallg. An energy disper**s**ive X-rag af**,**alyzer (EDAX), attached to the SEM was used to ai**d** in p**h**ase composition analysis. Spot probing allowed eor J a general qualitative analysis of phases <u>in situ</u>..

Phase Extractions and Identification

Isolation of phases other than the matrix and Y' were required f**o**r positive i**den**tifi**c**ati**on**. A standard electrolytic extraction technique was employed for the removal of the inert boride, carbide, and T**C**P phases. Extraction samples were supplied from the remaining half of the severed cast to size test bars used in the SEM study. A 10% hydrochloric acid in methanol electrolyte, tantalum cathode, and extraction sample as anode wer**e** operated on the basis **o**f .07

amps per square centimeter of anode. Extraction time lasted approximatelg i hour. The residue was periodicallg washed from the extraction sample in clean methanol and was allowed to settle a minimum of 12 hours before separation and filtering. The extracted residues were agitated until fullg suspended. Settling was permitted for three minutes at which time all the methanol was decanted off and placed in a separate container. Additional clean methanol was added to the remaining settled residue and the agitation-separation process repeated. The decanted methanol held a suspended fine residue while the remaining residue **w**as defined as coarse. Each residue was then filtered from the methanol using Millipore .6 micron filter papers. The filter papers were then mounted on glass slides in preparation for X-rag identification.

The extracted and mounted residues were subjected to powder diffraction analysis to identify the fine and coarse residues in each alloy. A general Electric X-rag diffractometer was used to generate the diffraction patterns with nickel ?ilte**T**.ed copper K radation. The parameters used were 40 KV, 20 ma for primarg X-rag excitation. Scanning range **w**as from 25 to 61 ° 28.

APPENDIX B

MATERIALS RESEARCH LABORATORY

DETROIT DIESEL ALLISON DIVISION OF GENERAL MOTORS

PORM

 \overline{a}

DIAL

DIAL

FAILED IN THREADS

λ

 \mathcal{L}

 \bar{z}

FAILED IN THREADS

FORM 2273

 $\ddot{}$

68

 \sim

69

w 2273

 $70\,$

à,

FORM 2273

 71

FORM 2273

 72

INDEX NO. $\frac{1}{\sqrt{10}}$

INDEX NO. $16/1$

73

*For sale by the National Technical Information Service, Springfield, Virginla 22161

k

 $\mathbf{E}^{(n)}$ and $\mathbf{E}^{(n)}$ and $\mathbf{E}^{(n)}$ \mathcal{L}_{max} and \mathcal{L}_{max}

 $\label{eq:2.1} \mathcal{L}=\mathcal{L}(\mathcal{L}^{(1)})\otimes\mathcal{L}^{(2)}(\mathcal{L}^{(2)})$

 $\sum_{i=1}^n \frac{1}{n_i} \sum_{j=1}^n \frac{1}{n_j} \sum_{j=1}^n \frac{1}{n_j} \sum_{j=1}^n \frac{1}{n_j}$

 $\sigma_{\rm{max}}$ and $\sigma_{\rm{max}}$

National Aeronautics and Space Administration

Washington, D.C. 20546

Official Business Penalty for Private Use, \$300 SPECIAL FOURTH CLASS MAIL **BOOK**

Postage and Fees Paid **National Aeronautics and** Space Administration
NASA-451

 \mathbf{r}

÷

NASA

POSTMASTER:

If Undeliverable (Section 158
Postal Manual) Do Not Return