View metadata, citation and similar papers at core.ac.uk

\_

# DESIGN OF A CHANNEL ERROR SIMULATOR USING VIRTUAL INSTRUMENT TECHNIQUES FOR THE INITIAL TESTING OF TCP/IP AND SCPS PROTOCOLS

Dr. Stephen Horan Ru-hai Wang

April 1, 1999

NMSU-ECE-99-002

# DESIGN OF A CHANNEL ERROR SIMULATOR USING VIRTUAL INSTRUMENT TECHNIQUES FOR THE INITIAL TESTING OF TCP/IP AND SCPS PROTOCOLS

Dr. Stephen Horan and Ru-hai Wang Lujan Space Tele-Engineering Program Klipsch School of Electrical and Computer Engineering New Mexico State University Box 30001, MSC 3-0 Las Cruces, NM 88003-8001

New Mexico State University Technical Report NMSU-ECE-99-002

April 1, 1999

# **Table of Contents**

Section			
Acrony	ym List	ii	
Ι	Background	1	
II	Design Goals	2	
III	Virtual Instrument Design	3	
III.1	Introduction	3	
III.2	Method of Error Generation	3	
III.3	Selection of VI Methodology	5	
III.4	VI Components	6	
III.4.1	User Interface	6	
III.4.2	VI Programming	8	
IV	Virtual Instrument Validation	12	
V	Sample Tests	14	
V.1	Test Configuration	14	
V.2	FTP Tests	14	
V.3	SCPS FP Tests	17	
VI	Summary and Conclusions	21	
VII	References	22	
Appen	dix - Test Data	23	

.

# **ACRONYM LIST**

AWGN	Additive White Gaussian Noise
BER	Bit Error Rate
CCSDS	Consultative Committee for Space Data Systems
Eb/No	Energy-per-bit-to-Noise-density Ratio
fp	File Protocol
ftp	File Transport Protocol
NMSU	New Mexico State University
PC	Personal Computer (Intel/Windows based configuration)
SCPS	Space Communications Protocol Specification
SGLS	Space-to-Ground Link Simulator
TCP/IP	Transmission Control Protocol/Internet Protocol
VI	Virtual Instrument
VME	Versa Module Eurocard

-ii-

#### **SECTION I - BACKGROUND**

There exists a need for designers and developers to have a method to conveniently test a variety of communications parameters for an overall system design. This is no different when testing network protocols as when testing modulation formats. In this report, we discuss a means of providing a networking test device specifically designed to be used for space communications. This test device is a PC-based Virtual Instrument (VI) programmed using the LabVIEW<sup>TM</sup> version 5 [1] software suite developed by National Instruments<sup>TM</sup>. This instrument was designed to be portable and usable by others without special, additional equipment. The programming was designed to replicate a VME-based hardware module developed earlier at New Mexico State University (NMSU) [2] and to provide expanded capabilities exceeding the baseline configuration existing in that module.

This report describes the design goals for the VI module in the next section and follows that with a description of the design of the VI instrument. This is followed with a description of the validation tests run on the VI. An application of the error-generating VI to networking protocols is then given.

#### **SECTION II - DESIGN GOALS**

The design of the Space-to-Ground Link Simulator (SGLS) for modeling satellite channel error scenarios was based on the following goals to replicate the statistical characteristics of a satellite channel:

a. Allow for simultaneous bi-directional data flow (forward and return channels);

b. Allow user-selectable error rates and statistical descriptions of the channel;

c. Allow time-variable error rates over several minutes as would be found in a satellite pass;

d. Allow different data rates on the forward and return links as would be found in satellite links,
e.g. 2400 baud forward, 57600 baud;

e. Provide for a simulated <sup>1</sup>/<sub>4</sub>-second delay as typically found in satellite channels.

The first design goal is documented in this report. As additional modules are developed and tested, they will be individually documented to provide an overall VI architecture for the channel error simulator.

By using a PC-based configuration and not a generic networking simulator package, we believe the VI configuration to allow for several advantages, including:

a. Allowing tests on actual data streams with operating system interactions included and not simulations of those data streams;

b. Providing portability so that can be placed in a lap-top PC with appropriate interface cables;

c. Can be configured to work with multiple networking and communications technologies (RS-232, RS-422, Ethernet, etc.).

The simulations would be conducted at baseband and not include any effects of modulation. This is done for two reasons: it allows for simulating network channels other than space channels, and we are really interested in testing the performance of the networking protocols while the modulation provides an added layer of complexity to the simulation environment without providing more accurate results when looking at protocol performance. If there are modulation losses in the system, the bit error rate and statistical descriptions can be adjusted to match the expected performance without modulating the data explicitly.

-2-

#### SECTION III - VIRTUAL INSTRUMENT DESIGN

#### **III.1 INTRODUCTION**

In this section, we develop the design of the Virtual Instrument forming the heart of the SGLS channel error simulator. This will include a description of the error generation methodology as well as the programming to accomplish the error generation functions. A full description of the software modules to perform the necessary functions is also given.

As documented in [2], an initial hardware approach was developed to realize a methodology for generating the channel error profile. This initial development was based on a custom VME module that used a local disk file containing the error vectors. The module would perform the Exclusive-Or of the data with an error vector derived from a statistical generator developed in [3]. The error vector was selected by the user when the controlling C program was started and the vector was loaded from a disk file inside the VME chassis to the custom VME module. The data input was over one RS-422 connector on the VME module and the resulting modified data was output over another RS-422 connector on the VME module.

There were several problems with this approach. The major problem was that the VME module was uni-directional (forward or return link but not both without wire-wrapping another module). Therefore real protocol testing was not readily available. Secondly, the time-variable error generation based on a single simulated satellite pass did not work properly due to the C control program continuing to fault before completion. Additionally, this program was not well documented thereby making changes difficult. Finally, there was a hardware failure in the VME module. At this point, another approach was sought. The Virtual Instrument method appeared to be appropriate for the solution to the needs of the module development.

# **III.2 METHOD OF ERROR GENERATION**

The error generation methodology used in the VI is the same as the one used in the hardware module. It is based upon the known relationship from digital logic that if one takes a digital data stream of logic 0s and 1s and then performs an Exclusive-Or (Ex-Or) operation on the data stream then every place where the data stream is Ex-Ored with a logic 0, the data is unchanged while every place where the data stream is Ex-Ored with a logic 1, the data symbol is complemented [4]. This can be used to model the channel error generation process: the channel can be modeled as an Ex-Or gate that randomly operates on the input data stream. This is illustrated in Figure 1 where a single bit error is generated in the output data stream.

 Input Data Stream: ... 0 0 0 1 1 0 0 1 ...

 Error Vector: ... 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 ...

 Output Data Stream: ... 0 0 0 1 1 1 0 1 ...

 bit error location 1

Figure 1 - Channel error generation process.

To properly model a channel, the user needs a proper statistical description of the channel error generation mechanism. A typical channel error statistical description is Additive White Gaussian Noise (AWGN) where the errors are described by a Gaussian random process parameterized by the link Energy-per-bit-to-Noise-density ratio (Eb/No) [5]. Previous work at NMSU [3] generated a computer program whereby the user could specify an Eb/No value, the number of bit errors to be generated, and the type of statistics to be used and the program would produce a vector meeting this specification. The vector would be all 0s except for a 1 at the locations where the bit errors are to occur. The 1s would be distributed over the vector according to the statistics specified by the user. The program was designed to develop vectors for AWGN, radio frequency interference, and mixed noise-and-interference environments. Other statistical distributions could be generated by modifying the program to generate the desired statistical model. For all of the testing done here, the AWGN statistical model was used.

## **III.3 SELECTION OF VI METHODOLOGY**

The Virtual Instrument was designed using the LabVIEW<sup>™</sup> programing architecture. LabVIEW was chosen for the following reasons:

a. The programming language is available on PC, Macintosh, and UNIX platforms;

b. The programming language is object-oriented and allows for modular code development;

c. The programming language provides for convenient access to PC communications ports (RS-232 and Ethernet) for data flow through the modules.

LabVIEW is a graphical programming language that is data driven and not strictly sequence driven (it only operates on data as it becomes available). Additionally, LabVIEW manages all memory and I/O functions that normally the high-level language programmer would need to manage through programs and drivers.

The VI error generation module was designed to provide the following capabilities using the programming language primitives and built-in modules:

- a. Allow for data flow in two directions simultaneously;
- b. Allow user-selectable bit error rates for both data flow directions;
- c. Allow bit error rate vectors to be pre-computed and loaded prior to data flow;
- d. Use standard communications ports for data flow.

The general operation of the VI follows the following steps:

a. The user initializes the VI and sets ports for data input and output (baud rate and port number);

b. The VI reads each directional serial port to determine if data is present for processing;

c. The VI is to XOR the data with the error vector;

- d. The VI writes the data modified by the errors to the appropriate directional data port;
- e. The VI continuously loops as quickly as possible (no wait states: if no data available at the input port, loop back an poll again) to process the data with minim delay.

By investigating the capabilities of LabVIEW, it was evident that it would be able to support these operations.

-5-

#### **III.4 VI COMPONENTS**

The SGLS VI has two parts to it: the user interface and the programming language. In this section, we will describe the details of both components. Consulting the LabVIEW programming manuals may be necessary if the reader is not familiar with LabVIEW concepts.

#### **III.4.1 User Interface**

The user interface for the error generation VI provides the following features:

- a. Select the communications port for the forward and return data links. For this module, the RS-232 communications port in the computer is used. The user decides if COM1 or COM2 is to be used for the forward or return link. LabVIEW designates COM1 as port 0, COM2 as port 1, etc. on the PC platform.
- b. Select the baud rate for the forward and return links. Normally, standard RS-232 rates will be selected. Most PC communications ports support baud rates from 2400 bps through 115200 bps.
- c. Provide the user with real-time indications of data flow. This is done by showing the input queue size on each communications port upon each program iteration.
- d. Provide the user with a dialog box to select the desired bit error profile for the forward and return links. The current test configuration provides error files for Eb/No profiles in AWGN from 0.0 dB through 11 dB. The commonly-used files are listed in Table 1.

e. Provide the user with a run-time means to disable the software processing.

The user interface for the SGLS VI is illustrated in Figure 2. The input for the baud rate is done using the LabVIEW Text Tool on the panel. The forward and return data port can be selected by incrementing the selection slide using the Operating Tool. The software enable/disable is done using the toggle switch on the VI panel. This needs to set to the ON position prior to starting the VI operation. When the user has entered the data, set the enable switch to ON, then the LabVIEW execution is initiated by clicking the left-pointing arrow ( $\stackrel{\frown}{\longrightarrow}$ ) on the command bar using the mouse.

-6-

Table 1. Typical Statistical Error Files for Use with AWGN					
	I. 1000 bit e	rrors per file			
File Name	Target Eb/No (dB)	BER	File Size (K-Bytes)		
a825k.dat	8.25	0.0001315	929		
a850k.dat	8.50	0.00007865	1553		
a875k.dat	8.75	0.00005268	2318		
a900k.dat	9.00	0.00002170	5626		
a925k.dat	9.25	0.00001727	7069		
a950k.dat	9.50	0.00001246	9798		
a975k.dat	9.75	0.00000860	14193		
a1000k.dat	10.00	0.00000477	25599		
	II. 100 bit e	rrors per file			
File Name	Target Eb/No (dB)	BER	File Size (K-Bytes)		
a825c.dat	8.25	0.0001271	97		
a850c.dat	8.50	0.00008332	147		
a875c.dat	8.75	0.00005388	227		
a900c.dat	9.00	0.00002165	564		
a925c.dat	9.25	0.00001741	702		
a950c.dat	9.50	0.00001177	1037		
a975c.dat	9.75	0.00000869	1405		
a1000c.dat	10.00	0.00000474	2578		
a1025c.dat	10.25	0.00000289	4216		
a1050c.dat	10.50	0.00000298	4098		
a1075c.dat	10.75	0.00000094	12925		
a1100c.dat	11.00	0.00000095	12843		

-7-

Table 1 (cont.). Typical Statistical Error Files for Use with AWGN						
	III. 10 bit e	rrors per file				
File Name	Target Eb/No (dB)	BER	File Size (K-Bytes)			
a825d.dat	8.25	0.0001908	7			
a850d.dat	8.50	0.0001605	8			
a875d.dat	8.75	0.00004423	28			
a900d.dat	9.00	0.00002935	42			
a925d.dat	9.25	0.00001678	73			
a950d.dat	9.50	0.00001237	99			
a975d.dat	9.75	0.00000939	130			
a1000d.dat	10.00	0.00000432	283			
a1025d.dat	10.25	0.00000373	328			
a1050d.dat	10.50	0.00000214	570			
a1075d.dat	10.75	0.00000094	1304			
a1100d.dat	11.00	0.00000082	1485			
	IV. Zero Err	ors Per File				
infinite.dat	∞	0	1			

The program will then present the dialog box for the error file selection which is done using a standard Windows dialog box and can be selected with a mouse.

# **III.4.2 VI Programming**

The SGLS LabVIEW program is divided into two sections: module initialization and the processing loop as illustrated in Figure 3. During the initialization phase, the user input is taken from the VI front panel and is passed to the serial port control elements. This includes setting the forward and return communications port numbers, and the communications baud rate. The serial port initialization assumes the following communications port parameters to be in place and changed by

-8-

ile <u>E</u> dit <u>Ope</u> r	rate Project Windows	Help			SG
। देखिः	16pt Application Font				1.
				मुद्धा सम्बद्धाः स्वयः स्वयः इतिहासः स्वयः	
	ansmitter/Receiver F	Port Configuration	Ennie	rd Queue	
Fo	orward Link Data Port	Return Link Data P	ort n		
		=0			
	weed Link Royal Date	Octum Link Roud F	Retur	n Queue	
		AREA THE AREA T	0		
40		4000			
- 	award Link Error File		Master		
				<ul> <li>Alternative algebra all sectors</li> <li>Alternative algebra all sectors</li> <li>Alternative algebra all sectors</li> <li>Alternative algebra all sectors</li> </ul>	
Yan di kara 🗠	and a standard and a star		Power On/Off		
	and the Free File				
۲ <u>۹</u>	BION LINK ENOTTINES		A 🚬		
e Stalle			Off		
				ver si brit	6-1 C

Figure 2 - User interface for channel error VI.

the user or the data sending device:

- a. 8 data bits, 1 stop bit and no parity bits on each byte transferred,
- b. No flow control is to be used to better simulate direct transmission through a radio channel, and
- c. A null modem cable will be used to connect to the serial port (a straight-through cable will not work properly).

Because no flow control is used on the RS-232 port, a 16-K byte buffer is used to buffer the input data and keep from losing bytes. After setting the communications ports, the user is presented with a standard dialog box requesting the file specification for the forward and return link error vector files. The file path and name can be input directly or a mouse can be used to click through the selection of the drive, path, and file name.

The processing is controlled using a While Loop structure with no timing breaks and with continuous operation as long as the front panel toggle switch is in the ON position. The processing loop proceeds as follows:



Figure 3 - Program for channel error VI.

- a. Each input communications port is queried to determine if at least one byte of data is available (the loop only processes integer byte multiples of data) for processing,
- b. For each port, if the port has no data to be processed, nothing is done for that port on the loop iteration.
- c. If the port has data to be processed, all of the available bytes are read into the VI and a variable type change is made from string type to unsigned integer type. This step does not perform any modification to the data but makes the data type compatible for further processing.
- d. For each communications port having data on this iteration, the data are sequentially processed in a Do Loop over all of the input bytes that were read in. Each byte of data is Ex-

Ored with the next byte of the error vector and the position index along the error vector is incremented as each byte is processed.

- e. As the index along the error vector is incremented, if it comes to the end of the error vector, then the index is reset to the start of the error vector.
- f. After all of the input bytes have been Ex-Ored with the error vector, the variable type is changed back from unsigned integer to string type and written to the indicated output port.
- g. The While Loop then starts the next iteration.

Processing will continue until the user either places the toggle switch on the VI front panel at the OFF position using the Operating Tool or when the user clicks on the LabVIEW stop button with the mouse.

#### SECTION IV - VIRTUAL INSTRUMENT VALIDATION

The basic SGLS instrument validation was performed by working with each component of the VI as a self-contained sub module and using the VI display interface options to place debug displays at each step of the way. With these debug options in place, the data flow was monitored for correct operation. Typical debug tests included

- a. Validation of the stepping through the error vector indices and proper roll over to the start of the vector when the end-of-vector count is reached;
- b. Monitoring the input queue size to verify that it did not exceed 16384 bytes at which point data can be lost;
- c. Verification of the Exclusive-Or operation by sending individual characters through the VI and monitoring the corrupted character results.

A typical throughput test of the VI compared the effective transfer rate to send a 76 KB file using a PC Hyperterminal data transfer test. In this test, the XMODEM protocol was used to transport the file through both the channel error simulator with the channel error rate set to zero errors (the processing continued but the error vector was all 0s) and via a direct null modem connection. The results of this test are shown in Table 2. Generally, the VI made the process run a bit slower but the queue was always bounded in length. From this we conclude that the VI presented no significant degradation to the transfer process.

	Table 2. VI XMODE	M Throughput Test	
Baud Rate	Straight Through	VI in the Loop	VI Max. Queue Size
9600	7880 bps	7150 bps	< 10 B
19200	15100 bps	13200 bps	< 10 B
38400	23200 bps	23100 bps	< 10 B
57600	29400 bps	30500 bps	< 10 B
115200	31100 bps	30700 bps	< 100 B

A second timing validation test was run using the actual computers and protocols that would be used in the protocol testing. In this test, various files were sent using the TCP/IP ftp service at different baud rates. The total time to transmit the files under the condition that the SGLS made no errors in transmitting the data (an error vector of all 0s is used so that the timing remains the same) is compared with the time to transmit the same files over a short, straight null modem cable. A plot of the results is shown in Figure 4. Here we can see that the curves for the file transfer times when using the SGLS and a null modem cable are virtually the same. There was a slight difference for 100 K-byte files but the differences in the mean times were less than the variations in the mean times. We conclude that the SGLS causes no significant transmission delay nor does it introduce any link errors of its own, e.g. dropping bytes.



Figure 4 - Comparison of file transfer time between using the SGLS and a null modem cable for ftp file transfer services.

#### **SECTION V - SAMPLE TESTS**

## V.1 TEST CONFIGURATION

The tests run with the SGLS were conducted using the configuration illustrated in Figure 5. The source and destination computers for the file transfer were two, identical Gateway PCs with 133 MHz processor speeds and 16 MB of memory running Red Hat Linux version 5.2. The computers were connected to the SGLS using commercially-obtained 6-foot null modem cables. Tests were run at channel Bit Error Rates (BER) of 0, 10<sup>-6</sup>, 10<sup>-5</sup>, and 10<sup>-4</sup> using the files listed in Table 3. Files to be transferred were random text files having lengths of 1 KB, 10 KB, 100 KB and 1000 KB. For each file transmission test, ten runs were performed and the average time to complete the transmission recorded. In some of the tests at the high BER values, a transmission could not be completed due to the protocol timing out. These are noted in the file results. Measured data for all of the tests is given in the report Appendix.

Table 3. Error Vector Files Use	ed in SGLS Transmission Tests
BER	Vector File
0	infinite.dat
10-6	a1075d.dat
10 <sup>-5</sup>	a975d.dat
10-4	a825c.dat

For each test run, the transmission rate in the forward and return direction was the same as was the BER on the forward and return rate.

## V.2 FTP TESTS

The first battery of tests performed was the transmission of files using the TCP/IP ftp service with



Figure 5 - Test configuration for TCP/IP and SCPS protocol testing.

the transmission error rates mentioned above. The results of these tests are summarized in Figure 6 where the transmission times for the various file sizes are displayed as a function of data rate and bit error rate. Each plot shows the transmission times for the 1 KB, 10 KB, 100 KB, and 1000 KB files with the 1-KB files taking the shortest time and the 1000-KB files taking the longest time. On each plot, the diamond marker on the y-axis represents the time to transmit the same file using the direct null-modem cable without the SGLS in the process. This is to give a reference indication of the best performance possible with these computers and operating system at the indicated data transmission rate. Interesting items noted during these tests include:

a. The file transfer process at a BER of 10<sup>-4</sup> was generally not possible. In these cases, after many minutes of no activity on the link, the file transfer was aborted and restarted. The only file lengths that could be delivered were the 1-KB files. However, in each of the cases where delivery was possible, no test completed all ten experimental runs. The completion



Figure 6 - File transmission time results using the ftp service as a function of BER and baud rate.

#### rates were

- i. At 9600 baud, 0 of 10 experiment runs were completed,
- ii. At 19200 baud, 8 of 10 experiment runs were completed,
- iii. At 57600 baud, 2 of 10 experiment runs were completed, and
- iv. At 115200 baud, 2 of 10 experiment runs were completed.
- b. The file transfer process at a BER of  $10^{-6}$  was nearly as good as the transfer process at a BER

of 0. However, as the BER was increased to 10<sup>-5</sup>, the transmission times rapidly increased as expected with TCP/IP confusing link errors for link congestion.

In all cases, TCP/IP was used as configured in the default Linux configuration and no attempt was made to vary parameters or otherwise tune the performance.

#### V.3 SCPS FP TESTS

The second group of tests performed was the transmission of files using the Consultative committee for Space Data Systems (CCSDS) Space Communications Protocol Specification (SCPS) File Protocol (fp) service [6] with the transmission error rates mentioned above. The SCPS-FP reference implementation we are using here is version 1.1.8 developed at MITRE [7] and is used with the default settings. The results of these tests are summarized in Figure 7 where the transmission times for the various file sizes are displayed as a function of data rate and bit error rate. As in the ftp results, each plot shows the transmission times for the 1 KB, 10 KB, 100 KB, and 1000 KB files with the 1-KB files taking the shortest time and the 1000-KB files taking the longest time. On each plot, the diamond marker on the y-axis represents the time to transmit the same file using the direct null-modem cable without the SGLS in the process. This is to give a reference indication of the best performance possible with these computers and operating system at the indicated data transmission rate.. Interesting items noted during these tests include:

- a. The file transfer process at a BER of 10<sup>-4</sup> was possible for the 1-KB. Again, for the longer files, the transmission was aborted after many minutes of no activity on the link. As in the TCP/IP experiments, in each of the cases where delivery was possible, no test completed all ten experimental runs. The completion rates were than TCP/IP and were as follows:
  - i. At 9600 baud, 0 of 10 experiment runs were completed,
  - ii. At 19200 baud, 8 of 10 experiment runs were completed,
  - iii. At 57600 baud, 6 of 10 experiment runs were completed, and

-17-



Figure 7 - File transmission time results using the fp service as a function of BER and baud rate.

iv. At 115200 baud, 5 of 10 experiment runs were completed.

As with the TCP/IP ftp service, the file transfer process at a BER of 10<sup>-6</sup> was nearly as good as the transfer process at a BER of 0. However, as the BER was increased to 10<sup>-5</sup>, the transmission times for SCPS fp did not show the same rapid increased as the TCP/IP ftp times did. This is expected due to the more appropriate way in which SCPS handles the

channel errors and does not treat them as congestion and therefore slow down the link. Not all of the SCPS fp experiments were able to complete ten trials at a BER of  $10^{-5}$ . This was a problem for the 100-KB and 1000-KB file lengths as follows:

- i. At 9600 baud, only 9 of the 10 experiments with the 100-KB files completed,
- ii. At 19200 baud, only 9 of 10 experiments completed with both the 100-KB and 1000-KB files, and
- iii. At 115200 baud, only 9 of 10 experiments completed with the 1000-KB files.

In all experiments, the SCPS fp protocol parameters were left at the default settings provided by MITRE and no attempt was made to optimize the settings.

We show a comparison of the TCP/IP ftp service and the SCPS fp service transmission delay times in Figure 8. As we can see, at the low BER configurations, both ftp and fp have essentially the same transmission times. As the BER increases, the effects of the congestion algorithm in the TCP/IP ftp service can be seen because the transmission time rapidly increases at a BER of 10<sup>-5</sup>. The SCPS fp protocol does a better job of maintaining a transmission time similar to the no-error case at this BER. The BER of 10<sup>-4</sup> cases do not represent a good comparison because both protocols had great difficulty in maintaining a connection at this BER and the number of completed file transfers is very small.



Figure 8 - Relative transmission times for ftp and fp as a function of file size and BER.

#### **SECTION VI - SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS**

A Virtual Instrument was constructed to realize a Space-to-Ground Link Simulator (SGLS) for performing baseband networking tests. In these initial tests the TCP/IP ftp and SCPS fp file transfer protocols were used with the SGLS simulator. Channel bit errors rates from 0 through 10<sup>-4</sup> were used. The source and destination host computers were modest PC-class computers running the Linux operating system. The general results were found to be

- a. Both protocols have transmission troubles at BER of 10<sup>-4</sup>. The SCPS fp did better at file delivery in the large error environment in that a larger percentage of the 1-KB files were able to be transmitted but both protocols had problems in transferring files larger than 1 KB this error rate.
- b. At low a BER of 10<sup>-6</sup> or better, both protocols ran at about the same speed (to within statistical variations).
- c. At a BER of 10<sup>-5</sup>, the TCP/IP ftp protocol showed a significant degradation in performance in that a significantly longer transmission time was required than in the no-error case and longer than that required for the SCPS fp protocol. The SCPS protocol did show some trends not being able to complete a transmission at this BER with longer files than the TCP/IP ftp service did. However, with only 10 trials, this many not be a significant difference.

Based on these limited experiments, we conclude that both protocols work equally well in a lowerror-rate environment. With bit error rates exceeding 10<sup>-6</sup>, the SCPS fp protocol appears superior because the transmission time does not grow rapidly as does the TCP/IP ftp transmission time as the errors corrupt the packets. In high-error-rate environments, packets need to be kept short, approximately 1KB at most, to ensure a reasonable chance of data delivery.

-21-

#### **SECTION VII - REFERENCES**

- [1] National Instruments<sup>™</sup>, LabVIEW<sup>™</sup>, version 5, Austin, Texas, January 1998.
- [2] Lynde, W. H. and Horan, S., "Space Protocol Test and Evaluation Project," NMSU-ECE-96-004, April 1996.
- [3] Moser, J. C. and Osborne, W. P., "Error Pattern Generation for Coded BPSK," NMSU-ECE-95-007, August 1995.
- [4]Sklar, B., Digital Communications Fundamentals and Applications, Prentice-Hall: Englewood Cliffs, NJ, 1988, p.276.
- [5] ibid., p. 156.
- [6] Consultative Committee for Space Data Systems, "Space Communications Protocol Specification (SCPS) - File Protocol (SCPS-FP)," CCSDS 717.0-R-3, September 1997.
- [7] Feighery, P., private communication.

Data
- Test
Appendix

True size:         Vol         Dirate         Time (sec)         1.96         1.91 <th1.91< th="">         1.91         1.91<th>Protocol:</th><th><b>FTP</b> 1000</th><th></th><th>Baud:</th><th>9600</th><th>sdq</th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th></th1.91<>	Protocol:	<b>FTP</b> 1000		Baud:	9600	sdq							
0         1.955         0.00517         1.96         1.95         1.95         1.96         1.95         1.96         1.95         1.91 <th1.91< th="">         1.91         1.91         <th< th=""><th>FIIE SIZE: Error Rate</th><th></th><th>Bytes SDEV</th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th>Data</th><th>Time (sec)</th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th></th<></th1.91<>	FIIE SIZE: Error Rate		Bytes SDEV					Data	Time (sec)				
IE-06         1.96         0.008165         1.95         1.97         1.97         1.97         1.97         1.97         1.96         1.97         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91         1.91	0	1.955	0.00527	1.96	1.96	1.95	1.95	1.96	1.95	1.96	1.96	1.95	<u>,</u>
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	1E-06	1.96	0.008165	1.95	1.97	1.96	1.95	1.97	1.97	1.96	1.96	1.95	-0
File Size:         10000         Bytes           File Size:         10000         Bytes         Error Rate         Avg         SDEV         19.1         19.	1E-05 0.0001	2.245	0.897753	1.95	1.96	1.97	1.97	1.96	1.96	1.96	4 8	1.96	1.0
Contrate         Avg         Survey         Time (sec)         101         191	File Size:	10000	Bytes										
	Error Kate	<b>Avg</b> 19.1	3.6E-07	19.1	19.1	19.1	19.1	<b>Uata</b> 19.1	19.1 19.1	19.1	19.1	19.1	19.
1E-05         34.29         9.091932         22.2         41.8         40.3         40.3         28.9         30.9         52.2         29         31.5         25.           0.0001         Bytes         10000         Bytes         10000         Bytes         135         135         135         139         139         135         13           File Size:         10000         Bytes         5001         Bytes         135	1E-06	21.57	5.207271	19.1	19.1	19.1	31.5	19.1	19.1	19.1	19.1	31.4	19.
File Size:         100000         Bytes           Error Rate         Avg         SDEV         Data         Time (sec.)         135         1	1E-05 0.0001	34.29	9.091932	22.2	41.8	40.3	40.3	28.9	30.9	52.2	29	31.5	25.
Fror Rate         Avg         SDEV           0         136.2         1.932184         135         <	File Size:	100000	Bytes										
1E-06       179.6       59.70334       221       172       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       142       135       140       306       275       400       30       0.0001       0.0001       Bytes       0.0000       Bytes       142       142       143       0.000       0.0001       Bytes       1160       1090       1160       1090       1160       1090       1160       1090       1160       1090       1160       1450	Error Rate	<b>Avg</b> 136.2	<b>SDEV</b> 1 932184	135	139	135	135	Data 135	Time (sec) 135	139	139	135	7
1E-05         395.4         135.5214         334         329         439         321         529         714         306         275         400         30           0.0001         0.0001         Bytes         1000000         Bytes         1000000         Bytes         1090         1090         1090         116           File Size:         1000000         Bytes         1090         1090         1090         1090         116           0         1109         30.71373         1090         1150         1090         1090         1160         1090         116           1E-06         1394         61.13737         1320         1420         1420         1430         1400         1450         1450         1450           1E-05         2895         77.63876         3030         2920         2970         2760         2850         2940         2900         2910         2910	1E-06	179.6	59.70334	221	172	135	142	135	249	307	142	135	15
File Size:         1000000         Bytes           Error Rate         Avg         SDEV           0         1109         30.71373         1090         1150         1090         1160         1090         1160         11450<	1E-05 0.0001	395.4	135.5214	334	329	439	321	529	714	306	275	400	30
Error Rate Avg SDEV 0 1109 30.71373 1090 1150 1090 1090 1090 1090 1090 1160 1090 115 1E-06 1394 61.13737 1320 1260 1420 1430 1390 1400 1390 1460 1450 142 1E-05 2895 77.63876 3030 2920 2970 2760 2850 2830 2940 2900 2840 29 0.0001	File Size:	100000	Bytes										
1E-06 1394 6113737 1320 1260 1420 1430 1390 1400 1390 1460 1450 142 1E-05 2895 77.63876 3030 2920 2970 2760 2850 2830 2940 2900 2840 291 0.0001	Error Rate 0	<b>Avg</b> 1109	<b>SDEV</b> 30.71373	1090	1150	1090	1090	<b>Data</b> 1090	<b>Time (sec)</b> 1090	1090	1160	1090	115
1E-05 2895 77.63876 3030 2920 2970 2760 2850 2830 2940 2900 2840 29 0 0001	1E-06	1394	61.13737	1320	1260	1420	1430	1390	1400	1390	1460	1450	142
	1E-05 0 0001	2895	77.63876	3030	2920	2970	2760	2850	2830	2940	2900	2840	29.

2.203591 2.207133 2.201474	21.59861 21.62442 24.93713	131.5216 135.2204	1169.927 1184.493 1467.888
2.195723	21.61438	131.4463	1169.487
2.211258	21.61248	133.24	1199.386
2.211943	25.04917	153.0437	1393.653
2.199009	21.61473	131.474	1182.944
2.213342	21.64292	135.0012	1181.589
2.575144	24.9019	149.0181	1478.491
2.224149	21.60949	131.5141	1169.846
2.224419	21.63682	135.2237	1239.407
2.216883	38.17912	155.32	1509.603
<b>Time (sec)</b>	<b>Time (sec)</b>	<b>Time (sec)</b>	<b>Time (sec)</b>
2.20383	21.61923	131.4513	1170.696
2.226929	21.60441	131.6132	1182.116
2.212473	28.34153	306.6148	1321.493
<b>Data</b>	<b>Data</b>	<b>Data</b>	<b>Data</b>
2.223424	21.61442	131.7012	1169.918
2.206857	29.16012	133.7312	1186.538
2.211824	75.49184	287.6407	1541.752
2.212135	21.73915	131.6789	1169.003
2.200866	20.01195	131.6788	186.5591
2.21163	32.32873	155.777	1567.237
bps 2.207083 2.211627 6.383126	21.57742 21.64452 24.92662	131.5488 136.8612 166.9746	1169.115 1186.841 1453.818
9600 2.213607 2.212331 2.221749	21.58781 21.61407 28.4308	131.4791 135.1039 188.0867	1168.534 1187.539 1391.403
<b>Baud:</b> 2.209314 2.199526 2.199028	21.51071 21.63169 41.40141	131.5862 131.5167 152.6101	1170.734 1195.483 1317.65
<b>Bytes</b>	<b>Bytes</b>	<b>Bytes</b>	<b>Bytes</b>
<b>SDEV</b>	<b>SDEV</b>	SDEV	<b>SDEV</b>
0.009452	0.056124	0.090209	4.247712
0.008858	2.491341	1.862794	318.947
1.311604	15.58279	61.7261	86.39444
FP 1000 <b>Avg</b> 2.209187 2.211429 2.664527	10000 <b>Avg</b> 21.60859 22.21834 34.39882	100000 Avg 131.5401 133.919 190.5651	1000000 <b>Avg</b> 1171.02 1092.995 1444.299
<b>Protocol:</b> <b>File Size:</b> <b>Error Rate</b> 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	<b>File Size:</b> Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	<b>File Size:</b> <b>Error Rate</b> 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	<b>File Size:</b> <b>Error Rate</b> 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001

-24-

File Size:         1000         Bytes         Time (sec)         0979         109         101         171	Protocol:	FТР		Baud:	19200	sdq							
Error Rate         Avg         SUBV         0.973	File Size:	1000	Bytes					I	· · i				
1E-05         1.97.9         0.97.9 </th <th>Error Rate</th> <th>Avg</th> <th>DDEV</th> <th>0 0 0</th> <th>0 070</th> <th>0 070</th> <th>0 070</th> <th>Data 0 070</th> <th>Time (sec)</th> <th>0 070</th> <th>0 070</th> <th>0 067</th> <th></th>	Error Rate	Avg	DDEV	0 0 0	0 070	0 070	0 070	Data 0 070	Time (sec)	0 070	0 070	0 067	
TE-06         US/N         US/N <t< td=""><td></td><td>0.010.0</td><td></td><td>0.0.0</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>0.0</td><td>0.00</td><td>0.010</td><td></td><td></td></t<>		0.010.0		0.0.0					0.0	0.00	0.010		
1E-05         1547         123082         0.979         3.9         0.971         0	1E-06	0.979	1.3E-08	0.979	0.9/9	0.979	0.979	0.979	0.9/9	0.9/9	0.9/9	0.9/9	
0 0001         23331         32.08192         22         93.9         0.979         39         389         44.9         0.979         20.9           File Size:         10000         Bytes         Error Rate         Avg         SDEV         9.55         9.56         9.55 <td>1E-05</td> <td>1.5647</td> <td>1.23082</td> <td>0.979</td> <td>3.9 3</td> <td>0.994</td> <td>0.979</td> <td>0.979</td> <td>0.979</td> <td>0.979</td> <td>0.979</td> <td>3.9</td> <td></td>	1E-05	1.5647	1.23082	0.979	3.9 3	0.994	0.979	0.979	0.979	0.979	0.979	3.9	
File Size:         10000         Bytes         Data         Time (sec)         9.54         9.55 <td>0.0001</td> <td>23.931</td> <td>32.08192</td> <td>22</td> <td>93.9</td> <td>0.979</td> <td>3.9</td> <td>3.89</td> <td>44.9</td> <td>0.979</td> <td>20.9</td> <td></td> <td></td>	0.0001	23.931	32.08192	22	93.9	0.979	3.9	3.89	44.9	0.979	20.9		
File Size:         10000         Bytes         Data         Time (sec)         9.55 <td></td>													
Error Rate         Avg         SDEV         Data         Time (sec)         9.55	File Size:	10000	Bytes										
0         9.548         0.006325         9.54         9.55         9.549         549         <	Error Rate	e Avg	SDEV					Data	Time (sec)				
1E-06         11.915         3.938912         9.55         9.55         16.1         14.2         53.7         19.9         14.7           0.0001         25.76         15.84173         14.7         16.2         29.55         16.1         14.2         53.7         19.9         14.7           0.0001         Eric         15.84173         14.7         16.2         29         55.2         16.1         14.2         53.7         19.9         14.7           0.0001         Bytes         16.1         16.1         14.2         53.7         19.9         14.7           0.0000         Bytes         16.1         16.1         14.2         53.7         19.9         14.7           0.0001         Bytes         2000         8417         71.8         71.9 <td>0</td> <td>9.548</td> <td>0.006325</td> <td>9.54</td> <td>9.54</td> <td>9.55</td> <td>9.54</td> <td>9.55</td> <td>9.56</td> <td>9.55</td> <td>9.55</td> <td>9.55</td> <td></td>	0	9.548	0.006325	9.54	9.54	9.55	9.54	9.55	9.56	9.55	9.55	9.55	
1E-05         25.76         15.84173         14.7         16.2         29         55.2         16.1         14.2         53.7         19.9         14.7           0.0001         Bytes         10.0000         Bytes         14.7         16.2         29         55.2         16.1         14.2         53.7         19.9         14.7           0.0001         Bytes         10000         Bytes         10000         Bytes         11.4         14.1         14.2         53.7         19.9         14.7           0         74.77         9.216417         71.8         71.9         71.8         71.9         71.9         71.9           1E-06         111.48         54.91255         207         74.9         99.1         71.8         71.9         71.9         71.9           1E-05         182.4         20.24955         166         16.4         178         172         187         236         181         185           0.0001         182.4         20.24955         166         164         178         172         187         236         181         185           0.0001         182.4         20.24955         166         164         172         187	1E-06	11.915	3.938912	9.55	9.55	9.55	16.2	9.55	9.55	16.2	9.55	19.9	
0.0001 File Size: 100000 Bytes Error Rate Avg SDEV 0 74.7 9.216417 71.8 71.9 71.9 71.9 71.9 71.9 71.9 71.9 71.9	1E-05	25.76	15.84173	14.7	16.2	29	55.2	16.1	14.2	53.7	19.9	14.7	
File Size:         100000         Bytes           Error Rate         Avg         SDEV           0         74.77         9.216417         71.8         71.9         71.8         71.9	0.0001												
File Size:         100000         Bytes         Data         Time (sec)         71.9 </td <td>i</td> <td></td> <td>·</td> <td></td>	i		·										
0         74.77         9.216417         71.8         71.9         <	File Size: Error Rate	100000	Bytes SDEV					Data	Time (sec)				
1E-06         11.48         54.91255         207         74.9         99.1         71.8         123         71.9         64.3         208         71.8           1E-05         182.4         20.24955         166         164         178         179         172         187         236         181         185           0.0001         182.4         20.24955         166         164         178         179         172         187         236         181         185           0.0001         Error Rate         20.24955         166         164         178         172         187         236         181         185           0.0001         Bytes         179         172         187         236         56         56         56         56         56         57         56         57         56         57         57         572         572         572         550         549         549         572         572         572         550         549         549         572         572         572         550         549         549         572         16.01007         572         550         549         549         572         16.01007         572<	0	74.77	9.216417	71.8	71.8	71.9	71.8	71.9	71.8	101	71.9	71.9	
1E-05         182.4         20.24955         166         164         178         179         172         187         236         181         185           0.0001         0.0001         1         0.0001         1 <td< td=""><td>1E-06</td><td>111.48</td><td>54.91255</td><td>207</td><td>74.9</td><td>99.1</td><td>71.8</td><td>123</td><td>71.9</td><td>64.3</td><td>208</td><td>71.8</td><td></td></td<>	1E-06	111.48	54.91255	207	74.9	99.1	71.8	123	71.9	64.3	208	71.8	
0.0001 File Size: 1000000 Bytes Error Rate Avg SDEV 0 562.9 16.01007 572 572 596 550 550 549 549 572 1E-06 728.3 85.65441 819 650 650 659 638 795 844 818 758 1E-05 1530 111.8034 1610 1580 1390 1710 1520 1640 1450 1470 1400	1E-05	182.4	20.24955	166	164	178	179	172	187	236	181	185	
File Size:         1000000         Bytes           Error Rate         Avg         SDEV         Data         Time (sec)           0         562:9         16.01007         572         596         550         549         549         572           16-06         728.3         85.65441         819         650         659         638         795         844         818         758           1E-05         1530         111.8034         1610         1580         1390         1710         1520         1640         1470         1470         1400	0.0001												
Error Rate         Avg         SDEV         Data         Time (sec)           0         562.9         16.01007         572         596         550         549         549         572           1E-06         728.3         85.65441         819         650         659         659         638         795         844         818         758           1E-05         1530         111.8034         1610         1580         1390         1710         1520         1640         1470         1470         1400	File Size:	100000	Bytes										
0         562.9         16.01007         572         596         550         549         549         579         572           1E-06         728.3         85.65441         819         650         659         638         795         844         818         758           1E-05         1530         111.8034         1610         1580         1390         1710         1520         1640         1470         1470         1470         1470         1470         1470         1470         1470         1470         1470         1470         1470         1400	Error Rate	e Avg	SDEV					Data	Time (sec)				
1E-06 728.3 85.65441 819 650 650 659 638 795 844 818 758 1E-05 1530 111.8034 1610 1580 1390 1710 1520 1640 1450 1470 1400	0	562.9	16.01007	572	572	596	550	550	549	549	549	572	
1E-05 1530 111.8034 1610 1580 1390 1710 1520 1640 1450 1470 1400	1E-06	728.3	85.65441	819	650	650	659	638	795	844	818	758	
	1E-05	1530	111.8034	1610	1580	1390	1710	1520	1640	1450	1470	1400	

-25-

	1.076078 1.076448 1.039772	10.1338 10.93722 15.69533	65.94247 67.69154	583.2676 593.059
	1.076097 1.078912 1.141255	10.96885 10.06078 15.37285	65.9592 65.85621 76.73429	583.2021 593.1989 840.7823
	1.07292 1.075196 1.247487 411.1289	10.07651 10.06179 16.27043	64.99665 127.331 77.85322	583.4883 603.5983 746.0008
	1.081078 1.074239 1.077187 3.321233	10.16104 10.0616 14.70139	65.97155 66.83385 76.64107	583.2551 593.8116 869.0469
	<b>Time (sec)</b> 1.075164 1.078222 1.069454 10.44628	<b>Time (sec)</b> 10.95531 10.06884 11.62803	<b>Time (sec)</b> 65.98858 65.97624 75.49623	<b>Time (sec)</b> 583.248 601.855 674.9625
	Data 1.07361 1.075905 1.074564 5.33696	<b>Data</b> 10.13546 10.95869 16.9437	<b>Data</b> 66.00565 66.80174 83.59873	<b>Data</b> 590.5022 594.428 803.4728
	1.072557 1.078567 1.073711 51.15239	10.08482 12.65629 15.38809	66.07273 67.72933 76.32667	584.5511 593.0578 701.6177
sdq	1.140565 1.078519 3.321895 1.499607	10.1308 10.06172 14.70382	66.10184 67.64232 74.99642	583.2174 592.0493 752.5099
19200	1.062077 1.065829 1.061322 3.321405	10.96371 10.06102 11.63053	65.08601 65.97606 76.94615	583.855 592.4106 844.9705
Baud:	1.133237 1.076697 1.068604 3.312917	10.13568 10.93735 16.92631	66.06931 66.92158 75.54117	586.7316 601.3274 680.4842
Bytes	<b>SDEV</b> 0.027128 0.003859 0.706793 142.3591	<b>Bytes</b> <b>SDEV</b> 0.406548 0.837679 1.906756	<b>Bytes</b> SDEV 0.41397 19.14698 2.578465	<b>Bytes</b> <b>SDEV</b> 2.366544 4.486484 74.27622
<b>FP</b> 1000	Avg 1.086338 1.075853 1.317525 61.18996	10000 Avg 10.3746 10.58653 14.92605	100000 Avg 65.8194 72.87599 77.12599	1000000 Avg 584.5318 595.8796 768.2053
Protocol: File Size:	Error Kate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	<b>File Size:</b> Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	<b>File Size:</b> Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	File Size: Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001

-26-

Protocol: File Size: Frror Rate	<b>FTP</b> 1000 Аvg	Bytes SDFV	Baud:	57600	sdq		Data	Time (sec)				
0	0.32	0.002494	0.327	0.319	0.32	0.319	0.319	0.319	0.319	0.319	0.32	0.319
1E-06	0.3218	0.004237	0.332	0.32	0.32	0.327	0.32 2 2	0.32	0.32	0.32	0.32 3 3	0.319 3 3
0.0001	1.22.14 14.925	8.449926	0.332 8.95	20.9	200.0	0.004		0.004	170.0	170.0	0	5
File Size:	10000	Bytes					, I	i				
Error Rate	<b>Avg</b> 3.18	<b>SDEV</b> 4E-08	3.18	3.18	3.18	3.18	<b>Data</b> 3.18	<b>Time (sec)</b> 3.18	3.18	3.18	3.18	3.18
1E-06	3.497	0.9884	3.19	6.31	3.18	3.19	3.19	3.19	3.18	3.18	3.18	3.18
1E-05 0.0001	12.475	5.504613	5.77	12.9	13.2	13	9.99	6.49	13.5	12.3	26	11.6
File Size: Error Rate	100000 Avg	Bytes SDEV					Data	Time (sec)				
0	24.33	0.359166	23.9	24.2	24	24.3	23.9	24.8	24.8	24.3	24.3	24.8
1E-06	32.84	7.091811	30.1	40.8	41.2	32.6	24.3	25.8	29.6	41.4	24.2	38.4
1E-05 0.0001	63.69	10.79583	60.2	75.8	56	57.4	58.6	56.8	89.4	60.7	65.1	56.9
File Size:	100000	Bytes					·	i				
Error Rate	Avg	SDEV D 632456	183	183	183	183	Data 183	Time (sec) 183	185	183	183	183
1E-06	218.9	7.880355	207	217	218	218	216	218	214	221	238	222
1E-05	521.3	41.37108	472	485	521	508	479	607	501	546	546	548
0.0001												

-27-

-

			•	
	0.349859 0.357986 0.339448	3.521164 4.020038 4.05944	23.1406 23.73905 26.82114	210.0718 214.1674 259.6098
	0.352276 0.335513 0.337185	3.533345 3.487488 4.049792	23.13855 23.34989 26.19634	210.0813 213.1328 253.9675
	0.347472 0.337492 0.343825	3.531006 3.497673 5.124497	23.12905 25.33112 26.41572	210.5128 213.6697 236.9375
	0.350083 0.346556 0.331981	3.53568 3.493521 4.634713	23.13027 23.50712 26.57158	210.104 212.9287 297.999
	<b>Time (sec)</b> 0.350049 0.334286 0.33897 0.326775	<b>Time (sec)</b> 3.517435 3.497487 4.017762	<b>Time (sec)</b> 23.15946 23.60884 39.98096	<b>Zime (sec)</b> 210.7 213.5687 239.4611
	Data 0.357654 0.335415 0.335415 0.411812 1.182364	<b>Data</b> 3.478406 5.098627 4.947471	<b>Data</b> 23.1635 23.32538 27.55222	<b>Data</b> 210.8763 213.2223 261.4706
	0.338786 0.33748 0.340896 22.72204	3.505242 3.529125 4.049383	23.15149 23.17604 32.32969	210.6861 212.7073 236.7853
sdq	0.350061 0.346605 0.830978 0.812013	3.517891 3.479608 4.544508	23 14989 23 45629 27 23349	210.9374 214.7074 269.3509
57600	0.347382 0.370065 0.33846 3.67153	3.49987 3.47979 4.479625	23.21508 23.20963 26.86594	210.9331 213.0246 280.2263
Baud:	0.327429 0.338718 0.320649 0.779639	3.505196 3.501769 4.064699	23.14606 23.85423 36.99914	210.3185 212.9783 246.4816
	<b>SDEV</b> <b>SDEV</b> 0.008356 0.011743 0.155687 8.804056	<b>Bytes</b> <b>SDEV</b> 0.017732 0.515661 0.411899	<b>Bytes</b> SDEV 0.024756 0.62797 5.008396	<b>Bytes</b> <b>SDEV</b> 0.355727 0.625557 20.06435
<b>FP</b>	<b>Avg</b> 0.347105 0.344012 0.39342 4.915727	10000 <b>Avg</b> 3.514524 3.708513 4.397189	100000 <b>Avg</b> 23.1524 23.65576 29.69662	1000000 <b>Avg</b> 210.5221 213.4107 258.229
Protocol: silo sizo:	Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	File Size: Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	File Size: Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	File Size: Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001

-28-

Protocol: File Size: Error Rate	<b>FTP</b> 1000 <b>Аvg</b>	Bytes SDEV	Baud:	115200	sdq		Data	Time (sec)				
0 1E-06	0.1693 0.1682	0.020726 0.010799	0.227 0.179	0.167 0.172	0.16 0.172	0.16 0.192	0.16 0.167	0.172 0.16	0.16 0.16	0.16 0.16	0.16 0.16	0.167 0.16
1E-05	0.1685	0.002415	0.167	0.167	0.167	0.172	0.167	0.167	0.167	0.172	0.167	0.172
0.0001	2.086	1.575434	3.2	0.972								
File Size:	10000	Bytes										
Error Kate	<b>Avg</b> 1.624	<b>5UEV</b> 0.028363	1.7	1.62	1.61	1.61	<b>Uata</b> 1.61	<b>1.61</b> (sec)	1.61	1.61	1.64	1.62
1E-06	1.808	0.612097	3.55	1.62	1.61	1.61	1.62	1.61	1.61	1.61	1.62	1.62
1 <b>E-</b> 05 0.0001	6.696	3.172143	5.55	5.52	3.55	4.86	2.77	7.41	8.38	14.1	7.41	7.41
File Size: Error Rate	100000 <b>Avg</b>	Bytes SDEV					Data	Time (sec)				
0	14.21	2.128876	12.4	16.2	16.2	11.7	12.1	12.4	16.3	16.2	16.2	12.4
1E-06	14.08	2.062792	11.9	12.4	12.6	15.7	16.2	12	16.1	16.2	15.9	11.8
1E-05 0.0001	33.98	4.115769	31.9	28	32	41.7	32	32.9	37.7	38.9	31.9	32.8
File Size: Error Rate	1000000 <b>Avg</b>	Bytes SDEV					Data	Time (sec)				
0	95.29	2.568376	93	93	93	93.1	98.3	98.1	93.1	98.2	98.2	94.9
1E-06	114.2	6.89283	108	114	112	116	114	132	111	113	107	115
1E-05	312.2	13.20606	298	319	322	325	302	325	301	308	329	293
0.0001												

-29-

\_

	6 0.135068 2 0.134522 5 0.143718	6 1.952364 3 1.934224 8 2.461435	7 11.86189 8 12.61986 7 16.94782	1 102.4579 7 103.9187 8
	0.13255 0.13240 0.14562	2.61335 1.97354 2.04033	11.8693 12.8516 13.0554	102.478 103.878 136.857
	0.13251 0.134969 0.143805	1.954039 1.947377 2.203544	11.86189 11.6572 15.05213	102.2808 103.7265 232.2197
	0.135388 0.132741 0.004241	1.94529 1.931654 2.22867	11.85473 12.08326 15.35958	102.6114 103.4741 154.5618
Time (sec)	0.135253 0.135285 0.131259	<b>Time (sec)</b> 2.614983 2.224114 4.183749	<b>Time (sec)</b> 11.86739 12.30949 13.20558	<b>Time (sec)</b> 102.4579 104.5343 126.291
Data	0.142687 0.13542 0.151231 0.001853	<b>Data</b> 1.952436 1.935303 2.462904	<b>Data</b> 11.83937 11.84507 13.22759	<b>Data</b> 102.2847 104.4248 161.4882
	0.135446 0.132372 0.385873 0.776173	2.612743 1.930759 4.148035	11.83496 12.08078 13.69604	102.4322 103.7205 129.8817
sdq	0.134914 0.1324 0.143676 0.133612	1.95499 1.939353 3.987491	11.84482 11.60822 26.19897	101.7535 104.1622 162.6331
115200	0.139817 0.133686 0.143128 139.8109	1.942537 1.944738 2.21839	11.84416 11.84994 16.53157	102.6744 105.7727 147.0604
Baud:	0.11279 0.117842 0.143615 24.06358	1.955256 1.942378 2.723725	11.83901 12.70967 13.94259	102.6343 104.3762 167.7461
Bytes SDEV	0.007957 0.005182 0.092693 60.61326	Bytes SDEV 0.320144 0.090019 0.87752	Bytes SDEV 0.012792 0.444609 3.936166	<b>Bytes</b> <b>SDEV</b> 0.265355 0.65248 31.64371
<b>FP</b> 1000 <b>Avg</b>	0.133643 0.132164 0.153617 32.95722	10000 <b>Avg</b> 2.149799 1.970344 2.865828	100000 Avg 11.85176 12.16152 15.72173	1000000 <b>Avg</b> 102.4065 104.1989 157.6377
Protocol: File Size: Error Rate	0 1E-06 0.0001	<b>File Size:</b> Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	File Size: Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001	File Size: Error Rate 0 1E-06 1E-05 0.0001

-30-