

## Durham Research Online

---

### Deposited in DRO:

02 October 2015

### Version of attached file:

Accepted Version

### Peer-review status of attached file:

Peer-reviewed

### Citation for published item:

McCreech, Nicky and Booth, Mark (2013) 'Challenges in predicting the effects of climate change on *Schistosoma mansoni* and *Schistosoma haematobium* transmission potential.', *Trends in parasitology*, 29 (11). pp. 548-555.

### Further information on publisher's website:

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pt.2013.08.007>

### Publisher's copyright statement:

© 2013 This manuscript version is made available under the CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 license  
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

### Additional information:

## Use policy

---

The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that:

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a [link](#) is made to the metadata record in DRO
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the [full DRO policy](#) for further details.

1 **Challenges in predicting the effects of climate change on *Schistosoma mansoni* and**  
2 ***Schistosoma haematobium* transmission potential**

3

4 Nicky McCreesh and Mark Booth

5 School of Medicine, Pharmacy and Health, Durham University Queen's Campus, University

6 Boulevard, Thornaby, Stockton on Tees, TS17 6BH, UK

7 Corresponding author: McCreesh, N. ([nicky.mccreesh@durham.ac.uk](mailto:nicky.mccreesh@durham.ac.uk))

8

9

10

11 **Keywords:** schistosomiasis, climate change, dynamical modelling, statistical modelling, snail  
12 ecology

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 **Abstract**

25

26 Climate change will inevitably influence both the distribution of *Schistosoma mansoni* and  
27 *Schistosoma haematobium* and the incidence of schistosomiasis in areas where it is  
28 currently endemic, and impact on the feasibility of schistosomiasis control and elimination  
29 goals. There are a number of limitations of current models of climate and schistosome  
30 transmission, and substantial gaps in empirical data that impair model development. In this  
31 article we consider how temperature, precipitation, heat-waves, drought, and flooding  
32 could impact on snail and schistosome population dynamics. We discuss how widely-used  
33 degree-day models of schistosome development may not be accurate at lower  
34 temperatures, and highlight the need for further research to improve our understanding of  
35 the relationship between air and water temperature and schistosome and snail  
36 development.

37

38

39

40

41

42

43 **Is climate change the elephant in the room for schistosomiasis control?**

44 The 2012 'London Declaration' on neglected tropical diseases (NTDs) (see Glossary) put  
45 schistosome parasites on the list of ten NTDs that can expect to be eliminated, eradicated,  
46 or controlled by 2020 (See  
47 [http://unitingtocombatntds.org/downloads/press/ntd\\_event\\_london\\_declaration\\_on\\_ntds.pdf](http://unitingtocombatntds.org/downloads/press/ntd_event_london_declaration_on_ntds.pdf)). In  
48 recognising that the ecology of schistosomes is more complex than some other parasites,  
49 the targets for this infection are more geared towards control rather than eradication.  
50 Nonetheless, the 2012 World Health Organization report 'Accelerating work to overcome  
51 the global impact of neglected tropical diseases – a roadmap for implementation' sets a goal  
52 of schistosomiasis elimination in many areas by 2020 [1].

53 Climate change can be considered to act in the short, medium, and long-term. Within the  
54 climate change community, predicting changes over the short and medium term are  
55 considered more challenging than long-term changes due to the impact of weather  
56 variability. Given that schistosomiasis is unlikely to be eliminated or eradicated by 2020 (the  
57 short term), there is a pressing need to consider if and how the future climate will impact on  
58 the transmission of the parasite in the medium to long-term. There is, in fact, just one  
59 empirical published study that suggests schistosome transmission potential is increasing as a  
60 result of climate change [2]. The observation that schistosome infections are being  
61 transmitted up to 1682 m above sea level in Uganda suggests that the environment has  
62 become suitable above a previously defined limit of 1400 m [3].

63 Only a handful of studies have attempted to predict the effect of climate change on the  
64 distribution or transmission intensity of schistosomiasis using dynamical modelling [4-9].  
65 These studies focused mainly on the effect of increasing mean temperature, with only one  
66 including changes in rainfall [6], and none considering the effects of extreme weather  
67 events. Here, we highlight the major gaps in current models of climate change and  
68 schistosomes and suggest areas of research that will help inform the next generation of  
69 mathematical models of schistosome transmission in relation to climate change. This  
70 Review focuses primarily on *Schistosoma mansoni* and *Schistosoma haematobium* (Box 1)  
71 because there are many differences between the issues involved in modelling the  
72 amphibious snail hosts of *Schistosoma japonicum* and the aquatic snail hosts of the two

73 more widespread human schistosome species (Box 2). Papers cited in this review were  
74 identified using the search strategy described in Box 3.

75

## 76 **Temperature**

77 The global average surface temperature is predicted to be 1.8-4.0°C higher in 2090-2099,  
78 relative to 1980-1999 [10]. In areas currently at risk for schistosomiasis, warming is  
79 predicted to be between 2°C and 5°C. The increases in the daily minimum night time  
80 temperatures are predicted to be greater than the increases in the daily maximum  
81 temperatures, leading to a decrease in diurnal temperature range over most land areas [11].

82 Temperature is an important determinant of the limits of snail distribution and population  
83 size, as egg production, hatching, and death rates; juvenile maturation and death rates; and  
84 adult death rates all affected by temperature [12]. The rate of cercarial maturation inside  
85 infected snails is also affected by temperature, increasing as temperature increases [13]. At  
86 low temperatures, cercarial development is slow or suspended, and the probability of  
87 cercariae maturing before the snails die is low [3, 14].

88 Given these sensitivities, it is apparent that we need to understand comprehensively how  
89 snail ecology and schistosome development will be affected by temperature changes  
90 associated with climate change (Figure 1). Existing models agree that temperature is a key  
91 factor in determining schistosome transmission potential [4, 7, 8], but they do not account  
92 for a number of important modifiers. In the following sections of the paper we highlight  
93 how the complex relationship between climate and both schistosome and snail natural  
94 history will need to be considered in future modelling exercises.

95

### 96 *Air temperature as a proxy for water temperature*

97 All temperature-sensitive stages of the life cycles of *S. mansoni* and *S. haematobium* occur  
98 within water, as do all life stages of their intermediate hosts. Data on water temperature is  
99 rarely routinely collected, however, and climate predictions do not estimate future  
100 freshwater temperatures. Air temperature has therefore been used as a proxy for water

101 temperature in most models (e.g., [4, 7]). The justification given is that the temperature of  
102 shallow water is similar to ambient air temperature. But is this justified? Comparisons  
103 between air temperature and water temperature in a variety of water bodies suggest that  
104 unadjusted air temperature is often not a reliable proxy, with surface water temperatures  
105 more than 2°C higher in many cases [15, 16].

106

107 *Does this matter?*

108 A warning on the potential impact of neglecting this issue in mathematical models comes  
109 from work on the malaria vector *Anopheles gambiae* in Kenya. Paaijmans *et al.* [17]  
110 demonstrated that using air temperature instead of water temperature resulted in an  
111 increase in mosquito numbers with increasing temperature being greatly overestimated. It  
112 is probable that the bias caused by modelling air temperature as a proxy for water  
113 temperature will be even greater in dynamical models of schistosome transmission because  
114 the majority of the stages of the life cycles of the schistosome parasites and intermediate  
115 host snails occur in water.

116

117 *Temperature gradients within water bodies*

118 The use of air temperature as a proxy for water temperature is further complicated by the  
119 fact that intermediate host snails are not confined to the shallows of deeper ponds and  
120 lakes. In some bodies of water, surface water temperatures are considerably higher than  
121 water temperatures at greater depths [18, 19]. Snails may exploit these temperature  
122 gradients to potentiate their own survival. Snails have been found in water at depths of 4.3  
123 m for *Biomphalaria smithi*, 12.2 m for *Biomphalaria choanomphala*, 4-5 m for *Biomphalaria*  
124 *glabrata*, and 4.5 m for *Biomphalaria pfeifferi* [20]. Snails are capable of surviving for  
125 extended periods at these depths; for example, *Bi. glabrata* [21] and *Bi. pfeifferi* [22] have  
126 been shown to survive for 24 and 31 days when submerged in boxes at depths of 10 m and  
127 15.25 m, respectively. For snails in deep bodies of water, spending time at depths of several  
128 meters could therefore be a way of avoiding above-optimum temperatures. Burying in mud  
129 at the bottom of the water could further decrease the maximum temperature to which

130 snails are exposed [23]. These behaviours will be particularly important during heat waves  
131 when the high temperatures found at the surface would greatly reduce snail survival. There  
132 is also some evidence that the reverse occurs, with snails in a South African pond spending  
133 less time in deeper water in winter when water temperatures are below optimal [18].  
134 Miracidia may follow the snails to shallower and deeper water, as they are negatively  
135 phototactic at high temperatures, but move towards light and warmer temperatures as  
136 overall temperatures decrease [24].

137

138 *Does this matter?*

139 If the potential for snails to move to greater depths is not considered, predictions of the  
140 effect of climate change on schistosomiasis distribution may overestimate the reductions in  
141 schistosomiasis risk in areas with large water bodies and where temperatures are above the  
142 optimum for snail development. To improve model predictions, further studies are needed  
143 on the ability of each snail species to live and reproduce at different depths, and the  
144 tendency of snails to increase the depth at which they live in response to high surface  
145 temperatures.

146

147 *Water temperature and schistosome development in snails*

148 Studies of vector-borne parasite transmission and temperature often use a 'growing degree-  
149 day' approach to parameterise models [25]. The approach can be applied both to the  
150 development of the intermediate host as well as the schistosome within the intermediate  
151 host. It is based on the idea that the organisms in question require a certain number of heat  
152 units to complete their development. These heat units are measured in growing degree-  
153 days and are calculated as the difference between the mean daily temperature and the  
154 development threshold temperature of the organism, which is the temperature below  
155 which the organism will not develop [26]. The number of growing degree-days are taken to  
156 be zero for a day if the mean daily temperature is below the development threshold  
157 temperature. For this calculation to be valid, after adjustment for time spent below the  
158 development threshold temperature, the decrease in development rate when the

159 temperature is below average must be exactly balanced by the increase in rate when the  
160 temperature is above average. This assumption is valid only if, above the development  
161 threshold temperature, there is a linear relationship between temperature and rate of  
162 development. Experimental work suggests the relationship is linear for *S. mansoni*  
163 development when temperatures do not fluctuate outside of 16-35°C [27]. Models that  
164 assume a linear relationship over a greater range will either over-estimate or under-  
165 estimate the rate of schistosome development.

166

167 *Does this matter?*

168 The experiments described above indicate that current growing degree-day models of  
169 schistosomiasis distribution and climate change [5, 26] could greatly underestimate the  
170 potential for schistosomiasis to spread to areas currently too cold for transmission. To  
171 improve the parameterisation of future models, similar experiments could be conducted  
172 with *S. haematobium*, and the use of nonlinear relationships between temperature and rate  
173 of development in growing degree-day models should be explored.

174 An additional complicating factor is that snails may move to greater depths to improve  
175 survival following exposure to and/or infection with schistosomes. This phenomenon was  
176 demonstrated over 20 years ago in an experiment, which observed that *Bi. glabrata*  
177 exposed to schistosome cercariae preferred water temperatures  $1.9\pm 0.5^{\circ}\text{C}$  cooler than non-  
178 exposed snails five weeks after exposure [28]. To our knowledge, it has not been  
179 investigated whether this behaviour is found in wild snails.

180

181 *Multiple species of intermediate host snail*

182 Snails of the genera *Biomphalaria* and *Bulinus* act as intermediate hosts for *S. mansoni* and  
183 *S. haematobium*, respectively (Box 2). Within each genus, there are several species of snail  
184 capable of acting as an intermediate host, and multiple species of snail hosts can be found  
185 at any one site [29]. Each species of snail has slightly different requirements for  
186 development, such as a preference in habitat for shallow or deep water [30]. Temperature

187 needs vary as well; *Biomphalaria alexandria* eggs require temperatures between 15°C and  
188 30°C to hatch, whereas *Bulinus truncatus* eggs will hatch at temperatures as low as 12.5°C  
189 and as high as 35°C [12]. Additionally, there is a range of susceptibility to schistosome  
190 infection among species [31].

191 A recent geographical risk model clearly demonstrates the need to consider multiple snail  
192 species in any modelling exercise [6]. The model was parameterised separately to each of  
193 five African species of *Biomphalaria*, and highlighted diverse potential ranges. *Bi.*  
194 *alexandrina* is limited to small areas of north and west Africa, whereas *Bi. pfeifferi* is found  
195 in much of sub-Saharan Africa. Models will therefore be unreliable if the diverse  
196 requirements of snail species are not taken into consideration and if, in the case of  
197 statistical models, the model is applied over an inappropriately large geographic area.  
198 Evidence of this phenomenon is found by examining a statistical model of environmental  
199 data and *S. haematobium* risk parameterised using data from one area of coastal Tanzania.  
200 The model performed well in other coastal areas of Tanzania, but not elsewhere in the  
201 country [32]. This was thought to be because the snails that inhabit the coastal area of  
202 Tanzania are distinct from those found elsewhere in the country. Each species will respond  
203 differently to a specific environmental factor, resulting in the poor fit of models that are not  
204 fitted separately for multiple snail species.

205 Further complications are added by the need to consider subspecies and geographical  
206 strains of snails, which can have slightly different characteristics and requirements [33], and  
207 by the fact that snail species cannot always be accurately identified using morphology. A  
208 study comparing the molecular and morphological classification of *Biomphalaria* specimens  
209 found a number of discrepancies [34]. Many of the data that are currently available for  
210 parameterising models come from snail species identified using morphological methods  
211 only, and the geographical source of the snails used is not always given [33].

212 *Does this matter?*

213 In the absence of experimental data on many snail species and sufficient field-based data on  
214 wild snail populations, current dynamical models of *S. mansoni* and *S. haematobium*  
215 transmission have been necessarily limited in terms of their scope for addressing the  
216 potential impact of climate change [4, 7, 8]. In some models, it has been necessary to fill

217 the gaps in empirical data by mixing up information from different snail species for each  
218 stage of the life cycle [4, 7, 8]. Models such as this allow some reflection of the relationship  
219 between temperature and transmission, but cannot estimate schistosomiasis transmission  
220 potential in any one location. They will also not be able to reliably predict any expansion in  
221 the geographic distribution of schistosomiasis due to climate change. Many areas could  
222 become suitable for the survival of one or more snail species, but geographic scale needs to  
223 be considered because snail populations are unlikely to become established unless the areas  
224 become suitable for species of snails already found nearby.

225 At present, many of the data needed to parameterise models to single snail species are not  
226 available. Experiments are needed to determine the effect of temperature on each stage of  
227 the life cycles of all important intermediate snail hosts, identified using both morphological  
228 and molecular methods and from a known location. A better knowledge of the current  
229 distribution of each species will also enable improved predictions to be made of areas  
230 where new snail colonies could become established.

231 There is considerable uncertainty in many of the estimates of the parameter values used in  
232 dynamical models, and the effects of this are not always made clear. A recent study  
233 investigated the sensitivity of *Oncomelania hupensis* range predictions in Sichuan province,  
234 People's Republic of China, to uncertainty in two key degree-day model parameters: (i) the  
235 lower temperature threshold for development and (ii) the total number of degree-days  
236 necessary for the completion of development [25]. The study found that estimates of snail  
237 densities, the seasonality of population dynamics, and range predictions were all highly  
238 sensitive to changes in the parameters, even to levels of parametric uncertainty that are  
239 common in disease models. This was particularly the case along the edges of the range of  
240 the snail population, and therefore studies attempting to predict the effect of climate  
241 change on the potential range of schistosomiasis will be particularly sensitive to this cause  
242 of inaccuracy. In many cases, experiments are needed to improve estimates of parameter  
243 values and reduce uncertainty.

244

245 **Precipitation**

246 The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) predict that climate change will  
247 cause overall increases in the amount of precipitation in high latitudes and overall decreases  
248 in most subtropical land regions [10]. The frequency of heavy precipitation events, and the  
249 proportion of total rainfall from heavy falls, will increase over most areas.

250 The relationship between precipitation and schistosome transmission is difficult to  
251 characterise. Large-scale statistical models can show no effect [6], but patterns of  
252 precipitation may be important on a smaller scale. Changes in the amount of precipitation in  
253 an area could be associated with increased or decreased range of infection, but other  
254 factors could be more important than the amount of precipitation itself, such as the length  
255 of the dry season [35]. In general, it seems probable that increased rainfall would increase  
256 schistosome transmission, but in some cases it could reduce it, for example by creating fast-  
257 flowing water that is unsuitable for cercaria [36] or snail survival [37].

258 The relationship between changes in precipitation and snail numbers may be further  
259 complicated by changes in rates of evaporation. In general, evaporation is predicted to  
260 increase in areas where rainfall is predicted to increase and decrease in areas where rainfall  
261 is predicted to decrease [38]. Changes to established rainfall patterns will therefore not  
262 necessarily lead to corresponding changes in the size and permanence of water bodies.

263 In addition to affecting snail populations, changes in rainfall could affect the proportion of  
264 schistosome eggs that enter a water body. Because of this, Liang *et al.* [39] included  
265 seasonal variation in rainfall in their mathematical model of *S. japonicum* transmission in the  
266 People's Republic of China, with the amount of rainfall determining the proportion of  
267 schistosome eggs that entered the aquatic component of the model.

268

269 *Does this matter?*

270 The lack of a strong Africa-wide relationship in statistical models suggests that the  
271 relationship between rainfall and snail abundance changes by habitat. For instance, the  
272 amount and seasonality of rainfall could be more important for snails living in temporary  
273 water bodies than for snails living in permanent lakes. Both this and the geographical  
274 variation and uncertainty in predictions of future precipitation are likely to impede the

275 development of any large-scale models of precipitation change and schistosomiasis. The  
276 difficulties are further increased by the gaps in our knowledge of the different ecological  
277 requirement of snail host species.

278

## 279 **Seasonality**

280 Human schistosome intermediate host snail populations exhibit large seasonal fluctuations  
281 in many areas, but the direction of effect varies by region. Snails in highland regions can  
282 experience lower growth rates during the cold season [40], whereas snails in lower areas,  
283 for example along the coast, can benefit from cooler temperatures [41]. The diverse  
284 environments associated with the type of water body, such as streams and ponds, could  
285 also be influential [42].

286 In general, seasonality in snail numbers and schistosome transmission can be attributed  
287 largely to seasonal patterns of rainfall in tropical areas, and seasonal changes in  
288 temperature in sub-tropical and temperate areas [43]. The permanence of the water bodies  
289 responsible for transmission in an area also affects seasonality [44], however, seasonal  
290 fluctuations in rainfall have a larger effect on temporary versus permanent water bodies.

291

### 292 *Does this matter?*

293 It is probable that climate change will result in a longer period of high transmission in areas  
294 where transmission largely occurs in permanent water bodies and where transmission is  
295 currently lower in cooler seasons. In other areas, changes in temperature and patterns of  
296 rainfall will have more variable effects on the seasonality of schistosome transmission.  
297 Neglecting the issue of seasonality in dynamic models will lead to unreliable estimates of  
298 the relationship between environment and disease transmission.

299

## 300 **Extreme events**

### 301 *Heat waves*

302 The frequency, duration, and intensity of heat waves are predicted to increase over coming  
303 decades [38]. The effect of heat waves on schistosome transmission in an area will depend  
304 on typical maximum water temperatures in relation to the optimum temperatures for the  
305 snail hosts. In areas that are normally well above the optimum temperature, schistosomiasis  
306 incidence may be greatly reduced both while the heat wave is on-going and for some time  
307 afterwards. Sufficiently long or hot heat waves could even temporarily or permanently  
308 eliminate the intermediate host snails from an area, particularly if additional snail control  
309 measures are implemented while the snail population is vulnerable.

310 In colder areas, heat waves could potentially increase the transmission potential of  
311 schistosomes and the incidence of schistosomiasis, resulting in outbreaks occurring in areas  
312 that normally experience little transmission. In areas that are typically too cold for  
313 schistosomes to develop, but where suitable intermediate host snails are found,  
314 transmission may occur if miracidia are introduced into water bodies where the snails are  
315 found.

316

### 317 **Drought**

318 More intense and longer lasting droughts have occurred in many areas of the world since  
319 the 1970s, particularly in the tropics and subtropics. It is projected that the proportion of  
320 the world that is affected by droughts will continue to increase over coming decades [10].

321 *Biomphalaria* and *Bulinus* snails are aquatic and will only reproduce in water (Box 2). Some  
322 or all species are able to aestivate, which enables them to survive short-term drying up of  
323 water bodies [33]. This is a common occurrence for species that live in temporary ponds and  
324 streams, which can regularly dry up for several months at a time [33]. Droughts can both  
325 lengthen the time that temporary water bodies are empty and dry up permanent water  
326 bodies. The abilities of snail species to survive different lengths and severities of desiccation  
327 in natural conditions are not well understood. Survival rates will depend on many factors,  
328 including the species of snail, whether habitats dry up gradually or rapidly, soil moisture,  
329 and relative humidity [44]. Survival may be lower for snail populations with little history of  
330 previous desiccation [44].

331 Regardless of the snail species and environmental conditions, the extended drying up of  
332 water bodies will inevitably be harmful to the survival of any resident snail populations [45].  
333 Lack of rain over multiple years will be particularly detrimental if the snail populations are  
334 unable to fully recover their numbers between each dry season [46]. Droughts of a sufficient  
335 length and severity may even lead to the temporary or permanent elimination of the snail  
336 population from a site. This is particularly likely in areas that are currently marginal for snail  
337 survival [47].

338

### 339 **Flooding**

340 The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) predicts that rainfall events will  
341 become more intense over coming decades, leading to an increase in flooding in many parts  
342 of the world [11].

343 In general, the species of snail that act as intermediate hosts for human schistosomes are  
344 unable to tolerate water flows over approximately  $0.3 \text{ ms}^{-1}$  [48]. Intense rainfall and  
345 flooding could therefore greatly reduce the number of snails found at a transmission site  
346 [40].

347 While the majority of snails that are washed away by fast flowing water will not survive,  
348 some snails may end up in favourable habitats and could potentially establish new colonies,  
349 as observed in the People's Republic of China [49]. This could both reintroduce snails and  
350 schistosomes to areas from which they had previously been eliminated, and facilitate the  
351 spread of snails, including infected snails, to areas that are newly suitable for snail  
352 populations and/or schistosome development. Flooding may therefore play a large role in  
353 determining the actual range of schistosomiasis, as opposed to its potential range, over  
354 coming decades.

355

### 356 *Does this matter?*

357 The effect of extreme weather events on schistosome transmission may well be influential  
358 in the future, but capturing these events within dynamic models will be challenging due to

359 the difficulty in predicting their occurrence and severity over the decadal time scales over  
360 which models are expected to operate. The effects of an extreme event could have only  
361 short term effects or wipe out snail populations entirely for longer periods or even  
362 permanently. Floods could potentially also act as seeds to establish transmission in new  
363 areas. The solution to this issue will include stochastic models combined with more intense  
364 surveillance efforts following flooding.

365

### 366 **Concluding remarks**

367 As of yet, we do not have a firm idea of how climate change will affect the transmission of  
368 schistosomiasis, and the effects of changes in temperature, rainfall, and extreme events  
369 may be differ between areas (Figure 1). Carefully designed and parameterised models of  
370 climate and schistosomiasis can provide a useful guide to areas that will become newly  
371 suitable for schistosomiasis transmission in future years. They can also indicate which areas  
372 within the current range of schistosomiasis may be at risk of increased transmission.  
373 Dynamical models will benefit from being parameterised separately for each individual  
374 intermediate host snail species, and from including changes in patterns of rainfall and  
375 extreme events, in addition to changes in temperature. Geographical scale is important  
376 when developing statistical models, and they should ideally be fitted separately for different  
377 snail species and water body types. We consider that there are several crucial areas of  
378 research in the area of snail ecology, which would greatly improve future models. This  
379 includes measuring the effect of water temperature on each stage of the life cycle of each  
380 intermediate host snail species and estimating survival over time during aestivation of  
381 different snail species in a variety of conditions. Finally, there are a number of other  
382 questions that need to be considered when interpreting the results of models of climate  
383 change and schistosomiasis (Box 4), as changes other than climate change will also affect  
384 the future distribution and intensity of schistosomiasis.

385

386 **References**

387

388 1 World Health Organization (2012) Accelerating work to overcome the global impact of neglected  
389 tropical diseases: a roadmap for implementation.

390 2 Rubaihayo, J., *et al.* (2008) Schistosomiasis transmission at high altitude crater lakes in Western  
391 Uganda. *BMC Infectious Diseases* 8, 110

392 3 Kabatereine, N.B., *et al.* (2004) Epidemiology and geography of *Schistosoma mansoni* in Uganda:  
393 implications for planning control. *Trop Med Int Health* 9, 372-380

394 4 Martens, W.J.M., *et al.* (1995) Climate change and vector-borne diseases: A global modelling  
395 perspective. *Global Environmental Change* 5, 195-209

396 5 Zhou, X.N., *et al.* (2008) Potential impact of climate change on schistosomiasis transmission in  
397 China. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 78, 188-194

398 6 Stensgaard, A.-S., *et al.* (in press) Large-scale determinants of intestinal schistosomiasis and  
399 intermediate host snail distribution across Africa: Does climate matter? *Acta Tropica*

400 7 Martens, W.J.M., *et al.* (1997) Sensitivity of malaria, schistosomiasis and dengue to global  
401 warming. *Climatic Change* 35, 145-156

402 8 Mangal, T.D., *et al.* (2008) Predicting the Impact of Long-Term Temperature Changes on the  
403 Epidemiology and Control of Schistosomiasis: A Mechanistic Model. *PLoS ONE* 3, e1438

404 9 Mas-Coma, S., *et al.* (2009) Climate change effects on trematodiasis, with emphasis on zoonotic  
405 fascioliasis and schistosomiasis. *Veterinary Parasitology* 163, 264-280

406 10 IPCC (2007) Summary for Policymakers. In *Climate Change 2007: The Physical Science Basis.*  
407 *Contribution of Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on*  
408 *Climate Change* (Solomon, S., *et al.*, eds)

409 11 World Health Organization (2003) Climate Change and Human Health - Risks and Responses.

410 12 El-Hassan, A.A. (1974) Laboratory studies on the direct effect of temperature on *Bulinus truncatus*  
411 and *Biomphalaria alexandrina*, the snail intermediate hosts of schistosomes in Egypt. *Folia Parasitol*  
412 *(Praha)* 21, 181-187

413 13 Foster, R. (1964) The Effect of Temperature on the Development of *Schistosoma Mansoni*  
414 Sambon 1907 in the Intermediate Host. *J Trop Med Hyg* 67, 289-292

415 14 Pfluger, W. (1980) Experimental epidemiology of schistosomiasis. I. The prepatent period and  
416 cercarial production of *Schistosoma mansoni* in *Biomphalaria* snails at various constant  
417 temperatures. *Z Parasitenkd* 63, 159-169

418 15 Paaijmans, K.P., *et al.* (2008) Observations and model estimates of diurnal water temperature  
419 dynamics in mosquito breeding sites in western Kenya. *Hydrological Processes* 22, 4789-4801

420 16 Yin, X.G. and Nicholson, S.E. (1998) The water balance of Lake Victoria. *Hydrol. Sci. J.-J. Sci. Hydrol.*  
421 43, 789-811

422 17 Paaijmans, K., *et al.* (2010) Relevant microclimate for determining the development rate of  
423 malaria mosquitoes and possible implications of climate change. *Malaria Journal* 9, 196

424 18 Shiff, C. (1966) The influence of temperature on the vertical movement of *Bulinus (Physopsis)*  
425 *globosus* in the laboratory and the field. *So. Afr. J. Sci* 62, 210-214

426 19 Hecky, R.E., *et al.* (1994) Deoxygenation of the Deep Water of Lake Victoria, East Africa.  
427 *Limnology and Oceanography* 39, 1476-1481

428 20 Jurberg, P., *et al.* (1987) Behavior of *Biomphalaria glabrata*, the intermediate host snail of  
429 *Schistosoma mansoni*, at different depths in water in laboratory conditions. *Memórias do Instituto*  
430 *Oswaldo Cruz* 82, 197-208

431 21 Deschiens, R. and Jadin, J. (1954) Viabilité des mollusques vecteurs des bilharzioses dans les eaux  
432 profondes. *Bulletin de la Société de pathologie exotique et de ses filiales* 47, 668-671

433 22 Gillet, J., *et al.* (1960) Resultats de prospections malacologiques en profondeur au lac Kivu et  
434 recherches sur la survie de *Biomphalaria* en eau profonde. *Ann. Soc. Belge de Med. Trop* 40, 643-649

435 23 Klumpp, R., *et al.* (1985) Observations on the growth and population dynamics of *Bulinus rohlfsi* in  
 436 an outdoor laboratory at Volta Lake, Ghana. *Ann Trop Med Parasitol* 79, 635-642  
 437 24 Shiff, C.J. (1974) Seasonal Factors Influencing the Location of *Bulinus (Physopsis) globosus* by  
 438 Miracidia of *Schistosoma haematobium* in Nature. *The Journal of parasitology* 60, 578-583  
 439 25 Moore, J.L., *et al.* (2012) Cautioning the use of degree-day models for climate change projections  
 440 in the presence of parametric uncertainty. *Ecological Applications*  
 441 26 Yang, G.J., *et al.* (2006) A growing degree-days based time-series analysis for prediction of  
 442 *Schistosoma japonicum* transmission in Jiangsu province, China. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 75, 549-555  
 443 27 Pfluger, W. (1981) Experimental epidemiology of schistosomiasis. II. Prepatency of *Schistosoma*  
 444 *mansoni* in *Biomphalaria glabrata* at diurnally fluctuating temperatures. *Zeitschrift fur*  
 445 *Parasitenkunde (Berlin, Germany)* 66, 221-229  
 446 28 Lefcort, H. and Bayne, C.J. (1991) Thermal preferences of resistant and susceptible strains of  
 447 *Biomphalaria glabrata* (Gastropoda) exposed to *Schistosoma mansoni* (Trematoda). *Parasitology*  
 448 103, 357-362  
 449 29 Kazibwe, F. (2003) The ecology of *Biomphalaria* species and their role in the transmission of  
 450 *Schistosoma mansoni* at Lake Albert in Western Uganda. Makerere University  
 451 30 Kazibwe, F., *et al.* (2006) Ecology of *Biomphalaria* (Gastropoda: Planorbidae) in Lake Albert,  
 452 Western Uganda: snail distributions, infection with schistosomes and temporal associations with  
 453 environmental dynamics. *Hydrobiologia* 568, 433-444  
 454 31 Kazibwe, F., *et al.* (2010) Transmission studies of intestinal schistosomiasis in Lake Albert, Uganda  
 455 and experimental compatibility of local *Biomphalaria* spp. *Parasitol Int* 59, 49-53  
 456 32 Brooker, S., *et al.* (2001) Predicting the distribution of urinary schistosomiasis in Tanzania using  
 457 satellite sensor data. *Tropical Medicine & International Health* 6, 998-1007  
 458 33 Brown, D. (1994) *Freshwater Snails Of Africa And Their Medical Importance*. Taylor & Francis  
 459 34 Plam, M., *et al.* (2008) Sympatric *Biomphalaria* species (Gastropoda: Planorbidae) in Lake Albert,  
 460 Uganda, show homoplasies in shell morphology. *Afr. Zool.* 43, 34-44  
 461 35 Bavia, M.E., *et al.* (1999) Geographic information systems and the environmental risk of  
 462 schistosomiasis in Bahia, Brazil. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 60, 566-572  
 463 36 Xue, Z., *et al.* (2011) Impact of temperature and precipitation on propagation of intestinal  
 464 schistosomiasis in an irrigated region in Ethiopia: suitability of satellite datasets. *Tropical Medicine &*  
 465 *International Health* 16, 1104-1111  
 466 37 Odongo-Aginya, E.I., *et al.* (2008) Effect of seasonal rainfall and other environmental changes, on  
 467 snail density and infection rates with *Schistosoma mansoni* fifteen years after the last snails' study in  
 468 Kigungu, Entebbe, Uganda. *East Afr Med J* 85, 556-563  
 469 38 Meehl, G.A., *et al.* (2007) Global Climate Projections. In *Climate Change 2007: The Physical*  
 470 *Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report of the*  
 471 *Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change* (Solomon, S., *et al.*, eds)  
 472 39 Liang, S., *et al.* (2002) A quantitative framework for a multi-group model of *Schistosomiasis*  
 473 *japonicum* transmission dynamics and control in Sichuan, China. *Acta Trop* 82, 263-277  
 474 40 Woolhouse, M.E.J. and Chandiwana, S.K. (1990) Population Biology of the Freshwater Snail  
 475 *Bulinus globosus* in the Zimbabwe Highveld. *Journal of Applied Ecology* 27, 41-59  
 476 41 O'Keeffe, J.H. (1985) Population Biology of the Freshwater Snail *Bulinus globosus* on the Kenya  
 477 Coast. I. Population Fluctuations in Relation to Climate. *Journal of Applied Ecology* 22, 73-84  
 478 42 Marti, H. (1986) Field Observations on the Population Dynamics of *Bulinus globosus*, the  
 479 Intermediate Host of *Schistosoma haematobium* in the Ifakara Area, Tanzania. *The Journal of*  
 480 *parasitology* 72, 119-124  
 481 43 Hairston, N.G. (1973) The dynamics of transmission. In *Epidemiology and control of schistosomiasis*  
 482 *(bilharziasis)* (Ansari, N., ed), pp. 250-336, Published on behalf of the World Health Organization by  
 483 University Park Press  
 484 44 Appleton, C.C. (1978) Review of literature on abiotic factors influencing the distribution and life  
 485 cycle of bilharzia intermediate host snails. *Malacological Review* 11, 1-25

486 45 Shiff, C. (1964) Studies on *Bulinus (Physopsis) globosus* in Rhodesia. III. Bionomics of a natural  
487 population existing in a temporary habitat. *Annals of Tropical Medicine and Parasitology* 58, 240-255  
488 46 De Kock, K.N. and Wolmarans, C.T. (1998) A re-evaluation of the occurrence of freshwater  
489 molluscs in the Kruger National Park. *Koedoe* 41, 1-8  
490 47 Appleton, C. and Naidoo, I. (2012) Why did schistosomiasis disappear from the southern part of  
491 the Eastern Cape? *South African Journal of Science* 108  
492 48 Appleton, C.C. and Stiles, G. (1976) Geology and geomorphology in relation to the distribution of  
493 snail intermediate hosts of bilharzia in South Africa. *Ann Trop Med Parasitol* 70, 189-198  
494 49 Wu, X.-H., *et al.* (2008) Effect of floods on the transmission of schistosomiasis in the Yangtze River  
495 valley, People's Republic of China. *Parasitology International* 57, 271-276  
496 50 Molyneux, D.H., *et al.* (2004) Disease eradication, elimination and control: the need for accurate  
497 and consistent usage. *Trends in Parasitology* 20, 347-351  
498 51 World Health Organization (1985) The control of schistosomiasis.  
499 52 Sturrock, R.F. (1993) The parasites and their life cycles. In *Human schistosomiasis* (Jordan, P., *et*  
500 *al.*, eds), pp. 1-32, CAB international  
501 53 Sturrock, B.M. (1966) The influence of infection with *Schistosoma mansoni* on the growth rate  
502 and reproduction of *Biomphalaria pfeifferi*. *Ann Trop Med Parasitol* 60, 187-197

503

504

505

506 **Figure 1. Potential effects of climate change on schistosomiasis and on intermediate host**  
507 **snail species.** The flow chart summarises projected climate changes such as increasing  
508 temperatures, changes in precipitation, and increasing frequencies and intensities of heat  
509 waves, droughts and flooding, on the ecology of intermediate host snails and schistosome  
510 transmission. The central column lists climate change events. The left and right hand  
511 columns relate each climate event to the natural history of schistosomiasis. The left hand  
512 column corresponds to increased transmission potential, and the right hand column to  
513 decreased transmission potential.

514

515 **Glossary**

516 **Aestivation:** A period of dormancy that allows snails to survive for extended periods out of  
517 water. Some species of *Biomphalaria* and *Bulinus* snails can live in temporary water bodies  
518 by aestivating during the dry season(s), although mortality during aestivation is high.

519 **Control:** “Reduction of disease incidence, prevalence, morbidity or mortality to a locally  
520 acceptable level as a result of deliberate efforts. Continued intervention measures are  
521 required to maintain the reduction [50].”

522 **Elimination:** “Reduction to zero of the incidence of infection or disease caused by a  
523 specified agent in a defined geographical area as a result of deliberate efforts. Continued  
524 measures to prevent re-establishment of transmission are required [50].”

525 **Empirical:** Data or knowledge acquired through observation or experimentation, as opposed  
526 to data or knowledge obtained through statistical or dynamical modelling.

527 **Eradication:** “Permanent reduction to zero of the worldwide incidence of infection caused  
528 by a specific agent as a result of deliberate efforts. Intervention measures are no longer  
529 needed [50].”

530 **London Declaration on Neglected Tropical Diseases:** A collaborative disease eradication  
531 programme launched in January 2012 in London, UK, that provides goals for the eradication  
532 or elimination of 10 neglected tropical diseases, including schistosomiasis, by 2020.

533 **Mathematical/dynamical modelling:** Dynamical models are simplified representations of  
534 complex systems, such as the schistosome lifecycle, that can be used to explore questions  
535 about the overall system that cannot be explored using empirical methods. They are  
536 parameterised with, or informed by, empirical data.

537 **Statistical modelling:** Statistical models look for correlations between explanatory variables,  
538 such as mean annual temperature, and outcome variables, such as the incidence of  
539 schistosomiasis. They can use data from a range of different locations, different time points,  
540 or both.

541

542 **Box 1. The lifecycles of human schistosomes**

543 The vast majority of human schistosomiasis is caused by infection with *S. mansoni*, *S.*  
544 *haematobium*, or *S. japonicum*. *S. mansoni* is found in South America and the Caribbean,  
545 Africa, and the Middle East; *S. haematobium* in Africa and the Middle East; and *S. japonicum*  
546 in the Far East. All of the species reproduce sexually in humans (and, in the case of *S.*  
547 *japonicum*, other mammals), and asexually in aquatic snails.

548 Pairs of adult worms are found in humans in the veins of the bladder, ureters, and kidneys  
549 (*S. haematobium*) or the veins of the small intestine (all other species). The worms  
550 reproduce sexually, producing around 20-3500 eggs a day [51]. These eggs pass through the  
551 vein wall and tissues to the lumen of the gut or bladder, from where they are excreted in  
552 urine (*S. haematobium*) or faeces (all other species). Upon reaching fresh water, the eggs  
553 hatch releasing miracidia.

554 To progress to the next stage of their lifecycle miracidia must find and infect a suitable snail  
555 host before their food stores are exhausted [52]. Upon locating a snail, the miracidia  
556 penetrate it and start to develop into primary sporocysts. These primary sporocysts  
557 produce secondary sporocysts, which in turn produce cercariae which are shed from the  
558 snail.

559 Like miracidia, cercariae must find and infect a suitable host before their food reserves are  
560 depleted. Upon encountering a potential host, the cercariae penetrate its skin and  
561 transform into schistosomula. Over the course of several days, the schistosomula enter the  
562 venous system and are carried round the body. Schistosomula that are successful in  
563 reaching the liver start to feed and grow. Upon reaching sexual maturity they form pairs and  
564 travel together to their final locations in the perivesical venous plexus of the bladder,  
565 ureters, and kidneys (*S. haematobium*) or the mesenteric veins of the small intestine (all  
566 other species), where they start to produce eggs. In total, the time between infection and  
567 the first detectable excretion of eggs is around 35 days for *S. mansoni*, 70 days for *S.*  
568 *haematobium*, and 38 days for *S. japonicum* [52].

569 Water temperature has a substantial effect on the rate at which schistosomes progress  
570 through their lifecycles, cercaria and miracidium mortality and infection rates, and cercaria  
571 production rates [33].

572

573 **Box 2. The lifecycles of *Biomphalaria* and *Bulinus* snails**

574 Each of the three main human schistosome species reproduces asexually in a specific genus  
575 of snail: *S. mansoni* in *Biomphalaria* species, *S. haematobium* in *Bulinus* species, and *S.*  
576 *japonicum* in *Oncomelania hupensis*. Schistosomes are capable of infecting and developing  
577 in multiple species of *Biomphalaria* and *Bulinus* snails. The lifecycles and habitats of  
578 *Biomphalaria* and *Bulinus* snails are described here because this Review focuses on the  
579 transmission of *S. mansoni* and *S. haematobium*, and the lifecycle of amphibious  
580 *Oncomelania* snails differs in many respects.

581 *Biomphalaria* and *Bulinus* snails are aquatic and live in freshwater. Different species have  
582 varying habitat requirements ranging from large, permanent lakes, to slow moving areas of  
583 rivers and irrigation canals, to seasonal streams and ponds [33]. The snails are unable to  
584 tolerate water flows of over around  $0.3 \text{ ms}^{-1}$  [48]. Many species are able to aestivate to  
585 survive the temporary desiccation of their water bodies, although survival during aestivation  
586 tends to be low and varies greatly between species and populations [33].

587 The snails are hermaphroditic and can reproduce by self-fertilisation or outcrossing. They  
588 lay egg capsules containing multiple eggs on firm surfaces in water. These eggs hatch into  
589 juvenile snails, which develop into adult snails and produce eggs of their own. Egg  
590 production, development and hatching rates, juvenile development rates, and juvenile and  
591 adult snail mortality rates vary greatly with temperature [33].

592 Both juvenile and adult snails can be infected by miracidia and will go on to produce  
593 cercariae. The parasites are harmful to their snail hosts, increasing mortality substantially  
594 [13] and greatly reducing or preventing snail egg production [53].

595

596 **Box 3. Strategy of reviewing the literature**

597 Articles were identified by searching Medline through PubMed and Google Scholar using  
598 various combinations of search terms including “schistosom\*”, “*Biomphalaria*”, “*Bulinus*”,  
599 temperature”, “model\*”, “predict\*”, “precipitation”, “rain\*”, “flood\*”, “drought”, and  
600 “ecology”. Many older articles were found using reference lists in Brown (1992) [33].  
601 Additional articles were obtained by citation tracking. Articles were selected for inclusion in  
602 the review if they identified or illustrated key issues that should be considered when  
603 attempting to predict the effects of climate change on *S. mansoni* and *S. haematobium*  
604 transmission.

605

606

607 **Box 4. Outstanding questions**

608 There are many gaps in the experimental and observational data needed to support  
609 modelling efforts. Current models do not explore sufficiently the impact of climate change.

610 Many questions remain, including:

- 611 • Will intermediate host snail species and schistosomes adapt to climate change?
- 612 • How quickly will intermediate host snails spread to areas newly suitable for their  
613 survival?
- 614 • What effect will climate change have on the food sources, predators, and other  
615 parasites of intermediate host snails?
- 616 • What effect will current mass-treatment and other control strategies have on the  
617 long-term distribution and intensity of schistosomiasis?
- 618 • What will be the relative impact of climate change compared to other modifiers?

**Increased range in cool areas**

**Increased intensity in endemic areas**

**In general, increased transmission where rainfall increases**

**Outbreaks in low/zero transmission areas**

**Establishment of snail populations in new areas**

**Increasing average temperature**

**Changes in average annual precipitation**

**Increasing frequency, duration, and intensity of heat waves**

**Increasing frequency, duration, and intensity of droughts**

**Increasing frequency of high flow rate/flooding**

**Decreased range in hot areas**

**Decreased intensity in endemic areas**

**In general, decreased transmission where rainfall decreases**

**Reduction in incidence in hot areas**

**Temporary or permanent elimination of snails**

**Reduced transmission during and following drought**

**Temporary or permanent elimination of snails**

**Temporary or permanent elimination of snails**