

1 **Static stress drop as determined from geodetic strain rates and statistical** 2 **seismicity**

3

4 Alessandro Caporali¹⁾, Salvatore Barba²⁾, Michele M.C. Carafa²⁾, Roberto Devoti²⁾, Grazia
5 Pietrantonio²⁾, Federica Riguzzi²⁾

6 1) Dipartimento di Geoscienze, Università di Padova, Italy. 2) Istituto Nazionale di
7 Geofisica e Vulcanologia, Roma, Italy

8

9 **Abstract**

10 Two critical items in the energetic budget of a seismic province are the strain rate, which
11 is measured geodetically on the Earth's surface, and the yearly number of earthquakes
12 exceeding a given magnitude. Our study is based on one of the most complete and recent
13 seismic catalogues of Italian earthquakes and on the strain rate map implied by a multi-
14 year velocity solution for permanent GPS stations. For each of 36 homogeneous seismic
15 zones we use the appropriate Gutenberg Richter relation, which is based on the seismicity
16 catalogue, to estimate a seismic strain rate, which is the strain rate associated with the
17 mechanical work due to a co-seismic displacement. We show that, for each seismic zone,
18 the volume storing most of the elastic energy associated with the long-term deformation,
19 and hence the seismic strain rate, is inversely proportional to the static stress drop. The
20 GPS-derived strain rate for each seismic zone limits the corresponding seismic strain rate,
21 and an upper bound for the average stress drop is estimated. We show that the implied

22 regional static stress drop varies from 0.1 MPa to 5.7 MPa for catalogue earthquakes in
23 the moment magnitude range [4.5 - 7.3]. The stress drop results are independent of the
24 regional a and b parameters, and heat flow, but are very sensitive to the assumed
25 maximum magnitude of a seismic province. The data do not rule out the hypothesis that
26 the stress drop positively correlates with the time elapsed after the largest earthquake
27 recorded in each seismic zone.

28 **Introduction**

29 The static stress drop represents the overall reduction in the average shear stress in or
30 around an earthquake fault zone. The static stress drop $\Delta\sigma$ was introduced as a measure
31 of the final fault slip u as a fraction of the fault dimension R ($\Delta\sigma \propto u/R$) and was
32 estimated from geological observations (see, e.g., Kanamori and Anderson, 1975). Here,
33 we propose the use of long-term geodetic measurements to compute the upper limit of
34 the regional stress drop that can occur in a seismic area.

35 Following Brune (1970) and Madariaga (1976), who represented the radiated spectrum of
36 seismic waves in terms of the source parameters, the stress drop is often estimated by
37 measuring the corner frequency or source duration from seismic signals (see, e.g.,
38 Abercrombie, 1995). However, a finite rupture cannot be uniquely represented with an
39 equivalent point-source, and therefore, the relation between high-frequency ground
40 motion and static source characteristics is ambiguous (Beresnev and Atkinson, 1997),
41 especially for large ruptures. As a consequence, most published stress drop values exhibit
42 considerable scatter, even for the same earthquakes.

43 More recently, Kim and Dreger (2008) obtained a slip distribution by inverting the local
44 strong motion waveform combined with GPS and InSAR data. They deduced the static

45 stress change using the method of Ripperger and Mai (2004). The static stress change on
46 the fault plane is linked to the dynamics of the earthquake rupture and hence also to the
47 associated energy release and seismic radiation. Knowledge of the static stress change is
48 therefore required for dynamic rupture modeling of past (and future) earthquakes (Peyrat
49 et al., 2001).

50 In this paper, we use the long-term geodetic deformation and relate it to the statistical
51 seismicity to infer the upper limit of the regional stress drop expected in different seismic
52 zones of Italy.

53 Geodesy yields the present-day (in the sense of an average over the past few years) rate
54 at which elastic energy is stored at or near the surface. Statistical seismology has been
55 used to characterize how elastic energy is released in the form of earthquakes over the
56 last few centuries. We investigate how a cycle of energy loading compares with a cycle of
57 energy release and take into account several sources of uncertainty. The geodetic
58 information is limited by the reliability of the strain rate estimates, which are often based
59 on only a few stations and velocities that are known with various degrees of accuracy. The
60 seismological data are limited by the completeness of the catalogues and their temporal
61 extension relative to a seismic cycle. Given the complexity and spatial variability of the
62 stress regimes in Italy, such a comparative study must be regionalized.

63 **Geodesy and seismic hazard in Italy**

64 Over one hundred permanent GPS stations have been in operation for the past several
65 years in Italy and neighboring areas, and horizontal velocities are known with formal
66 uncertainties well below 1 mm yr^{-1} (Anzidei et al., 2001; Battaglia et al., 2004; Caporali et
67 al., 2003, 2009; D'Agostino et al., 2005, 2008; Grenerczy et al., 2005; Serpelloni et al.,

68 2005, 2006). Velocity profiles across areas of active deformation show detailed horizontal
69 gradients that positively correlate with the deformation style implied by both field data and
70 seismology. In areas with a dense population of GPS stations of known velocity, the
71 horizontal strain rate tensor has principal directions that, in most, if not all, cases,
72 successfully correlate with the horizontal projection of the PTN (Pressure, Tensional and
73 Null) axes inferred from fault plane solutions (Caporali et al., 2003, D'Agostino et al.,
74 2008, Caporali et al., 2009).

75 Although the surface kinematics derived from GPS data have been exploited in
76 considerable detail, much less knowledge exists on how the geodetic data can be
77 combined with data from statistical seismology. Early concepts pioneered by Westaway
78 (1992) and Ward (1999) were applied by Caporali et al. (2003) to five seismically and
79 tectonically homogeneous Italian macrozones. They concluded that, on average, 70 to
80 100% of the geodetic strain rate was released seismically. The correlation between the
81 tectonic moment rate (mainly based on space geodetic data) and the number of events
82 above a cut-off magnitude has been firstly analyzed within the Global Stress Rate Model
83 by Kreemer et al., 2003 and subsequently applied in Europe in the Aegean-anatolian area
84 (Kreemer et al., 2004).

85 Jenny et al. (2004) investigated the eastern Mediterranean area and determined seismic
86 hazard parameters from historical seismicity, tectonics and geodetic data. Slejko et al.
87 (2009) obtained 30-year earthquake probabilities by combining geodetic data with the
88 seismogenic areas of known depth, strike, dip, rake, geologic slip rate and expected
89 maximum magnitude derived from the Database of Italian Seismogenic Sources (DISS)
90 (Basili et al., 2008). D'Agostino et al. (2009) concentrated on a dense GPS network in the

91 extensional and seismically active area in central Italy and concluded that there is a deficit
92 in seismic activity relative to the geodetically measured deformation rate.

93 The working group for the seismic hazard map of Italy (Gruppo di lavoro MPS, 2004) and
94 the S1 project sponsored for the period of 2004-2006 by the Department of Civil
95 Protection of Italy and the Istituto Nazionale di Geofisica e Vulcanologia (INGV) (Meletti,
96 2007) reported 36 seismic zones (ZS9) that are homogeneous in deformation regime and
97 depth (Meletti et al., 2008). The CPTI04 catalogue (Gruppo di lavoro CPTI, 2004) explicitly
98 references the ZS9 and associates each event with a specific seismic zone. Details on
99 CPTI04 and the ZS9 are available at <http://emidius.mi.ingv.it/CPTI04/>.

100 **Velocity data**

101 The largest GPS time span covers an interval of 11 years (1998--2008), but most of the
102 data come from the recent RING network (<http://ring.gm.ingv.it>) that was developed in
103 Italy over the last five years by INGV and several other stations operated by other
104 institutions. The GPS data processing follows the procedure proposed in Devoti et al.
105 (2008).

106 The RINEX data was processed with Bernese software (Hugentobler et al., 2004) based on
107 double difference phase observables and using IGS/EUREF guidelines on absolute antenna
108 phase center modeling, orbits, earth rotation parameters and tides. The network is divided
109 into clusters that are processed in daily batches. A priori uncertainties of 10 m were
110 imposed to obtain the so-called loosely constrained solution. The daily loosely constrained
111 cluster solutions were then stacked into a combined daily loosely constrained solution of
112 the entire network by applying the classical least squares approach (Devoti et al., 2008).
113 The daily combined network solutions were then rigidly transformed into the ITRF2005

114 frame (Altamimi et al., 2007) to estimate translations and scale parameters and to apply
115 minimum constraints to a set of conventionally defined stations.

116 The velocity field was estimated from the ITRF2005 time series of the daily coordinates.
117 Annual signals and offsets at epochs of instrumental changes were removed, as in Devoti
118 et al. (2008) and Riguzzi et al. (2009). Because the time series of coordinates are affected
119 by white noise at high frequencies (up to about 2 cycles/yr) and colored noise (typically
120 flicker phase noise) at lower frequencies, we could not rely on the formal least squares
121 standard deviation to estimate the uncertainty in the velocities. This information is crucial
122 for inferring the uncertainties in the strain rates. The most convenient way to reliably
123 define the uncertainty in the velocity from the time series is to use the Allan variance
124 (Allan, 1966), which is the 1σ probability that two consecutive, equal length, non-
125 overlapping batches of time series data have the same slope. The Allan variance is taken
126 as a function of the length of the batch. This approach uses the full spectrum of the noise
127 in the time series and, as shown by Caporali (2003), yields estimates of the velocity
128 variance that coincide with the so-called maximum likelihood estimates (Mao et al., 1999)
129 when they exist (white noise + flicker phase, typically) and provide consistent variance
130 estimates for other combinations of white and colored noise. We re-scaled the formal
131 errors of the GPS rates using the mean scale factors estimated for each velocity
132 component, as in Devoti et al. (2008) and according to the approach developed in
133 Williams (2003). The GPS site positions and velocities given with respect to the Eurasian
134 fixed reference frame defined in Devoti et al. (2008) and their re-scaled uncertainties are
135 listed in Table AUX (auxiliary material) and reported in Figure 1.

136 Individual velocities cannot be interpreted as such, due to the noise and different
137 uncertainties. The minimum variance algorithm described below was used to obtain the

138 average strain rates for each area by using a weighted summation over the local velocity
139 data.

140 **The strain rate field**

141 The algorithm adopted here to estimate the strain rate is described in Caporali et al.
142 (2003). It is based on weighted least squares collocation and requires an isotropic
143 covariance function that is dependent on the distance between stations. Scattered
144 velocities (east and north components) and their variances are interpolated at a point P by
145 a weighted sum over all of the available data. The weight depends both on the uncertainty
146 of each contributing velocity through the weight matrix and on its distance from the point
147 P of computation through the covariance function .

148

149 The covariance function depends on one adjustable parameter: the scale distance d_0 ,
150 which describes the typical correlation length. We used one value of the scale length for
151 the entire data set. This approach has the advantage of providing a picture of the
152 deformation pattern at the same wavelength everywhere. Taking into account the average
153 distance between the GPS stations on the one hand and, on the other hand, the typical
154 size of the ZS9s, we found that $d_0=50$ km is a sound compromise. Table 1 contains an
155 account of the number of stations that fall within each seismic zone and the number of
156 stations that are located in a 50-km-radius circle centered on each ZS9. A minimum of
157 three unaligned stations is required to estimate the strain rate components. As shown in
158 Table 1, several of the seismic zones have insufficient coverage. In these cases, the strain
159 rate was interpolated from the velocities of stations that were farther than 50 km from the
160 ZS9. As described below, this approach resulted in small values for the strain rates

161 because the least squares collocation acts as a low pass filter and tends to smooth the
162 lateral changes in the velocity.

163 For each measured velocity, a weight factor was introduced based on the variance of the
164 sample relative to the variance of the population. The covariance function and the weight
165 matrix allowed us to map a specified point P (in our case, P is the center of each ZS9
166 seismic zone) and the variances of the two horizontal components of the velocity. These
167 variances are required to estimate the uncertainties of the strain rate. The least squares
168 collocation algorithm is a minimum variance algorithm and also allows the contributing
169 velocities to be properly weighted according to their estimated uncertainty.

170 The strain rate eigenvectors that were interpolated at the center of each ZS9 are shown in
171 Figure 2a. Figure 2b identifies the numerical labels for each of the 36 seismic zones. The
172 extensional deformation style of the Inner Apennines is described very well by the GPS
173 data. These data also show the compression in Friuli (NE Italy) and the transpression in
174 east Sicily. For comparison, we used the MEDNET catalogue of fault plane solutions since
175 1976 (Pondrelli et al., 2006). As Figure 2a suggests, good qualitative agreement exists
176 between the seismic and geodetic principal directions.

177 **Relating present-day strain rate and historical seismicity**

178 The earthquake catalogue CPTI04 consists of 2550 events in the moment magnitude
179 range [3.9 – 7.4] in the time interval [217 BC – 2002 AC]. The interval of completeness for
180 magnitude 4.5 and higher starts however from 1600 AC. The homogeneous ZS9 seismic
181 zones represent the updated seismic zonation of the Italian territory. These seismic zones
182 embody the most recent data on seismogenic sources available from the DISS 2.0
183 (Valensise and Pantosti, 2001) and reference the CPTI04 catalogue (Figure 3). The ZS9s

184 are characterized by the following properties: the geographical location of each zone, the
185 typical depth of the events, the maximum magnitude and the b value (Table 1). By 'typical
186 depth', we mean the depth at which the largest number of events takes place. By
187 'maximum magnitude', we mean the maximum expected magnitude. Because the
188 catalogue was complete over a period of time that is certainly smaller than a seismic cycle,
189 the maximum observed magnitude may underestimate the maximum expected magnitude
190 (see, e.g., Pisarenko et al., 1996). Any countermeasures for this lack of information
191 require some arbitrariness. We increased the maximum observed magnitude given by
192 Meletti (2007) and Meletti et al. (2008) by 0.3, and these increased values are reported in
193 Table 1 as the 'maximum expected magnitude'. Assuming a b value b_s from the definition
194 of ZS9 zonation (Table 1), we estimated the a value a_s by fitting a straight line $a_s = \alpha$
195 $+ \log(-b_s * \ln(10))$ to the catalogue events in the magnitude interval [4.5-5.5]. The
196 magnitude dependence of the logarithm of the number of events that exceed a given
197 magnitude is linear in most, if not all, cases (Figure 4). The intercept α was estimated as a
198 free parameter. For each seismic zone, the geodetic shear strain rate is introduced
199 according to the following equation from Savage and Simpson (1997):

$$200 \quad \dot{\epsilon}_g = \max(\dot{\epsilon}_1, \dot{\epsilon}_2, |\dot{\epsilon}_1 + \dot{\epsilon}_2|) \quad (1)$$

201 The numerical estimates of the geodetic shear strain rate and the related uncertainty are
202 given in Table 1. Figure 5 shows that the computed strain rate (Eq. 1) can assume
203 relatively large or small values when three or more stations fall in a circle of radius $d_0=50$
204 km, i.e., the scale distance adopted for collocation. When no station is present within the
205 specified distance, the resulting strain rate goes to zero. Figure 5 suggests that the
206 number of stations, their geometry and the uncertainty in their velocities are sufficient to
207 provide a reliable estimate of the geodetic strain rate at the selected wavelength d_0 .

208 To relate the catalogue data to the strain rate released seismically, we used a modified
 209 form of the Kostrov equation (Kostrov and Das, 1988):

$$210 \quad \dot{\epsilon}_s = \frac{1}{2\mu V \Delta t} \sum M_0 \quad (2)$$

211 where μ is the shear modulus, Δt is the time span of the seismic event catalogue, M_0 is
 212 the seismic moment of each event, and V is the corresponding seismogenic volume. The
 213 summation is extended to the catalogue events that span the time Δt within each seismic
 214 zone. This formulation of the Kostrov equation has the disadvantage of being strongly
 215 dependent on the completeness of the catalogue over the time Δt . Moreover, no formula
 216 exists to compute the seismogenic volume V . The practice of defining V as the product of
 217 the area including the catalogue seismic events and the mean hypocentral depth implies
 218 that each seismic event, regardless of the seismic moment M_0 that is released, is assigned
 219 the same seismogenic volume: (total area)*(mean hypocentral depth)/ n , where n is the
 220 number of seismic events in that area over a time interval Δt . However, the total area is
 221 likely to be non-uniformly populated by events, and the events of larger magnitude (and
 222 hence of larger seismogenic volume) are given the same weight as smaller events,
 223 although the large magnitude events occur much less often in the selected time span.

224 A more convenient formulation of Eq. 2 requires using the Gutenberg Richter (GR) relation
 225 to approximate the seismic volume as the product of the slip area A times a thickness T .
 226 The volume $A*T$ then contains most of the deformation released by the seismic moment
 227 M_0 . Because $M_0 = \mu A u$, where u is the co-seismic displacement, we have:

$$228 \quad \dot{\epsilon}_s = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\int_{m_{min}}^{m_{max}} N(m) A(m) u(m) dm}{\int_{m_{min}}^{m_{max}} A(m) T(m) dm} \quad (3)$$

229 where N is the number of events per year in the magnitude range $[m, m+dm]$. The total
 230 magnitude range is defined by $[m_{min}, m_{max}]$, where $m_{min}=4.5$ is the magnitude above
 231 which $\log[N(m)]$ is approximately linear in m (Fig. 4), and m_{max} is the maximum
 232 magnitude of the specific seismic zone (see Fig. 3 and Table 1). We assume the following:

$$233 \log[N(m)] = a_s + b_s m; \log[u(m)] = a_{AD} + b_{AD} m; \log[A(m)] = a_{RA} + b_{RA} m \quad (4)$$

234 where a_s and b_s are the a and b parameters of the GR relation (Table 1). The empirical
 235 relations between the average displacement (AD) u (in meters) and the moment
 236 magnitude and between the rupture area (RA) A (km^2) and the magnitude are as given in
 237 Wells and Coppersmith (1994). We use the coefficients for "all" slip-types as follows:

$$238 a_{AD} = -4.80 \pm 0.57; b_{AD} = 0.69 \pm 0.08; a_{RA} = -3.49 \pm 0.16; b_{RA} = 0.91 \pm 0.03 \quad (5)$$

239 The work done to displace a slip area A(m) by an amount u(m) must equal the change in
 240 the potential energy within the seismogenic volume, which is the product of the stress
 241 drop $\Delta\sigma$ by the seismogenic volume A(m)*T(m). Therefore, we can estimate the thickness
 242 T(m) (for reverse and normal faulting) or width (for strike slips) of the seismogenic
 243 volume as follows:

$$244 \frac{\Delta\sigma A(m)T(m)}{\text{change in potential energy}} = \frac{\mu A(m)u(m)}{\text{mechanical work}} \xrightarrow{\text{yields}} T(m) = \frac{\mu}{\Delta\sigma} u(m) \quad (6)$$

245 Taking $\Delta\sigma=4$ MPa and $\mu=30$ GPa, it follows from Eq. 6 that, for example, $T=0.3$ km for
 246 $m=5$ and $T=8$ km for $m=7$.

247 With this model, the Kostrov strain rate (3) becomes :

$$248 \dot{\epsilon}_s = \frac{\Delta\sigma}{2\mu} \frac{10^{[a_s+a_{wc}+(b_s+b_{wc})m_{max}]} - 10^{[a_s+a_{wc}+(b_s+b_{wc})m_{min}]} }{10^{[a_{wc}+b_{wc}m_{max}]} - 10^{[a_{wc}+b_{wc}m_{min}]} } \frac{b_{wc}}{b_s+b_{wc}} \quad (7)$$

249 where $a_{WC}=a_{RA}+a_{AD}$ and $b_{WC}=b_{RA}+b_{AD}$ ('WC' stands for 'Wells and Coppersmith').

250 In general, the geodetic strain rate (1) is expected to be greater than or equal to the
251 seismic strain rate (3). Thus, the stress drop must satisfy the following inequality:

$$252 \quad \Delta\sigma \leq \Delta\sigma_g \equiv \frac{2\mu \dot{\epsilon}_g}{10^{2.5}} \frac{10^{[a_{WC}+b_{WC}m_{max}]} - 10^{[a_{WC}+b_{WC}m_{min}]}}{10^{[a_{WC}+(b_s+b_{WC})m_{max}]} - 10^{[a_{WC}+(b_s+b_{WC})m_{min}]}} \frac{b_s+b_{WC}}{b_{WC}} \quad (8)$$

253 $\Delta\sigma_g$ is the average stress drop that we expect in the case of the exact balance of the
254 geodetic and seismic strain rates across the catalogue time span and the magnitude
255 range, which, in our case, is [4.5 - 7.3] for each seismic zone.

256 In the right hand side of eq. 8 it should be noted that the ratio between the strain rate
257 and the yearly number of events of zero magnitude $N(0) = 10^{a_s}$, according to Table 1,
258 varies over a wide range of magnitudes. This is balanced by the variability of b_s and m_{max}
259 within each seismic zone, resulting in a slowly, laterally variable quantity.

260 The uncertainty in $\Delta\sigma_g$ can be obtained by linearly propagating the uncertainties in the
261 parameters m_{max} , ϵ_g , a_s , b_s , a_{RA} , b_{RA} , a_{AD} , and b_{AD} . For m_{max} , we assumed a 3%
262 uncertainty, which was derived propagating a 5% maximum error on the magnitude
263 sample onto the maximum. For ϵ_g and a_s we used the values in Table 1, and for b_s we
264 assumed a 10% uncertainty, a conservative estimate. For the last four parameters, we
265 used Eq. 5. We assumed that $m_{min}=4.5$. The resulting values are listed in Table 1.

266 Discussion

267 Figure 6 shows a plot of the estimates of the static stress drop from Eq. 8. Most of the
268 seismic zones have a stress drop below 2 MPa. Higher values were reached in Zone 906-
269 907, a left lateral shear zone in NE Italy that accommodates to the west the northwards

270 indentation of the Adria plate into Eurasia. It is worth noting that in our computation of
271 the maximum regional stress drop for zones 905 and 906, both with a maximum recorded
272 magnitude of 6.6, the maximum regional stress drop in zone 905 appears smaller than in
273 zone 906. This suggests that the assumed maximum magnitude does not necessarily bias
274 the regional stress drop. Other zones of high stress drop are Zones 913, 923, 924, 925,
275 929 and 935. These zones are in central and southern Italy and are known to be
276 seismically active. The epicenter of the Mw=6.3 Aquila earthquake of April 6, 2009 (hence,
277 not included in the catalogue) is in Zone 923. Zone 924 includes the Mattinata fault, an E-
278 W-trending feature that is ~50 km long. This fault cuts across the Gargano Promontory in
279 the foreland of the southern Apennines (Argnani et al., 2009) and is thought to have high
280 seismic potential (two Mw=5.7 events occurred in 2002 in rapid succession in that area).
281 Zone 935 in Sicily includes the Iblean Malta escarpment. According to Table 1, the largest
282 earthquakes in Italian history have occurred in Seismic Zones 929 and 935. Figure 7
283 shows that the static stress drop is uncorrelated with the b_s parameter. A negative
284 correlation between the stress drop and the a_s parameter, being controlled by only one
285 isolated point with a high stress drop, is unlikely.

286 The values obtained for the lateral variation of the static stress drop are in the range of
287 the estimates of the dynamic stress drop determined from spectral analysis of the seismic
288 source (Allmann and Shearer, 2009). Figure 8 shows the static stress drop and its
289 correlation with the seismic zones. Specific examples of seismic sequences in NE Italy and
290 western Slovenia (Bressan et al., 2006) exist; our value of 0.31 ± 3.47 MPa for ZS905
291 compares well with the 0.05-2.30 MPa range of the 1996 Claut swarm, the 0.5-7 MPa
292 range of the 1998 Kobarid sequence and the 1.4-7.8 MPa range of the 2002 M.te Sernio
293 sequence. In the Auxiliary material we provide additional plots similar to Figure 8, but with

294 the contours controlled only by the significantly non zero (i.e. non zero within one
295 standard deviation) values of the stress drop, under the same assumptions on the
296 maximum magnitude as in Figure 8 (i.e. $m_{\max} + 0.0$, $m_{\max} + 0.3$, $m_{\max} + 0.5$ respectively).

297 Two $M_w=5.7$ events that occurred further south in 2002 in Molise (ZS924) were analyzed
298 by Calderoni et al. (2009). Their estimated range of the dynamic stress drop (0.6 – 2.5
299 MPa) is in good agreement with our estimate of 3.20 ± 1.18 MPa given in Table 1.

300 Cocco and Rovelli (1989) reported stress drops on the order of several tens of MPa, and
301 they argued that thrust faults (e.g., in Friuli) have stress drops about three times larger
302 than normal faults. However, these large values may indicate the maximum stress drop .
303 Therefore, the inconsistency with the average values given in Table 1 is only apparent.

304 In the classical treatment of the slider block problem (e.g., Turcotte and Schubert, 2002),
305 the stress drop is considered to be proportional to the lithostatic load, and the
306 proportionality constant is taken as the difference between the static (f_s) and the dynamic
307 (f_d) friction coefficients as follows:

308
$$\Delta\sigma = 2(f_s - f_d)\rho gh \quad (9)$$

309 where ρ is the crustal density, g is the acceleration due to gravity, and h is the thickness
310 of the slider. The lowest values of the static stress drop are independent of the typical
311 depth h (Fig. 7), and higher values require larger depths (i.e., larger lithostatic loads). The
312 fact that our upper limits for the stress drop are relatively small, at most, a few MPa,
313 implies that the dynamic friction coefficient is very close to the static friction coefficient.
314 This situation in turn suggests that very little or no shear stress is left on the faults, on
315 average, after an event. In Fig. 9, the map of the static stress drop is superimposed on
316 the contours of the heat flow (Della Vedova et al., 2001). In principle, the higher the heat

317 flow, the lower the friction. This expectation was verified in Seismic Zones 923 (with a
318 slight offset) and 924, but not in several other areas. This result leads us to conclude that
319 a correlation between the static stress drop and the heat flow is either non-existent or
320 very small in this plot. We cannot however exclude that better data for the Italian area, or
321 a similar analysis for other areas, make the correlation between heat flow and regional
322 stress drop more convincing.

323 Had we computed the seismic volume in the Kostrov formula (Eq. 6) as the product of the
324 area enclosing the epicenters times some average hypocentral depth, the resulting volume
325 would have been very large. This volume would also be dependent on the selection of
326 contributing events. This subjective element was emphasized by Caporali et al. (2003).
327 D'Agostino et al. (2009) showed that different assumptions for the seismic depth and/or
328 the tension factor used in the spline interpolation of the velocities (the tension factor plays
329 a role similar to that of our scaling distance d_0 in the collocation algorithm) could lead to
330 contradictory results for the energy balance of a seismic province. Our approach defines
331 the seismic volume as an integral across the magnitude spectrum and recognizes that
332 each magnitude involves a different deforming volume. The deformation scales with the
333 rupture area A and a characteristic thickness (or width, for strike slip faults) T
334 perpendicular to the rupture area. Therefore, the volume is:

335
$$V = \int_{m_{min}}^{m_{max}} A(m)T(m)dm \quad (10)$$

336 The value of V depends on the maximum magnitude assigned to the seismic province, but
337 defining the maximum magnitude is less of a subjective choice than the boundary
338 definition of the seismic province. However, our results indicate that two provinces with a

339 population of earthquakes of the same maximum magnitude can have different
340 seismogenic volumes V , depending on the lateral variations of the stress drop.

341 The static stress drop is usually introduced in terms of the slip u (m), a scale distance T
342 and a geometric factor C that depends on the form of the fault (e.g., Scholz 2002, ch.4) as
343 follows:

$$344 \quad \Delta\sigma = C\mu \frac{u}{T} \quad (11)$$

345 The ratio μ/T may be considered as a stiffness relating the stress drop to the slip u . T
346 represents the scaling distance for the fall-off of the deformation moving away from the
347 slip area. As a consequence, T is proportional to u , and the scaling factor can be estimated
348 from the data. The form factor C can be included in the definition of the stress drop.

349 Fletcher and McGarr (2006) have mapped the static stress drop and stiffness over the slip
350 surface of the Northridge ($m=6.7$), Landers ($m=7.3$) and Kobe ($m=6.9$) earthquakes,
351 using a technique (McGarr and Fletcher, 2002) which requires the knowledge of the
352 apparent stress and of the ratio between far field and near field energy. They report
353 average values of the static stress drop of 17, 11, and 4 MPa respectively, with large
354 variability across patches of the faults. These values are systematically larger than those
355 obtained by simple crack models, essentially because slip –and hence the distribution of
356 rupture of asperities- are laterally varying on the slip area. Our approach extends the
357 concept of stress drop to a seismic zone, rather than an individual fault or slip area, and
358 accounts for the variability of the amount of slip in each seismic zone by considering the
359 lateral changes in the maximum expected magnitude.

360
361

362
363 Figure 10 (top) shows the stress drop increasing with the time elapsed since the
364 occurrence of the earthquake of highest magnitude in each seismic zone according to the
365 CPTI04 catalogue. Although the statistical significance of this correlation plot is made
366 uncertain by the large scatter and error bars, the slope of 2 kPa yr^{-1} , when divided by a
367 Young modulus of 70 GPa , yields a strain rate of $30 \cdot 10^{-9} \text{ yr}^{-1}$, which is the average strain
368 rate in Italy as determined from GPS geodetic measurements. If this correlation could be
369 made more precise, there could be interesting implications for a better understanding of
370 recurrence times and seismic hazards. A more precise correlation will result both from
371 better data and, possibly, from a more homogeneous definition of certain seismic zones
372 (e.g., 923-Abruzzo and 927-Irpinia, see Table 1) which include a large number of active
373 faults. Alternatively, the correlation which is implied in this figure could well be an artifact
374 resulting from a misinterpretation of old, large events in the Catalogue.

375 Figure 10 (center) shows that the geodetically measured strain rate has a similar
376 correlation with the time elapsed since the largest earthquake as the static stress drop.
377 Figure 10 (bottom) finally shows that the mean time between earthquakes of zero
378 magnitude (that is $1/N(0)$, where $N(m)$ is the Gutenberg Richter law for each seismic
379 zone) has no appreciable correlation with the time since the last largest event.

380 The combination of geodetic and historical seismicity data provides constraints on the
381 static stress drop. Deconvolution of the source parameters from the spectra of measured
382 seismic waves provides estimates of the dynamic stress drop. Although the two stress
383 drops do not necessarily coincide, they are expected to be of the same order of
384 magnitude. A detailed analysis of the waveform spectra of earthquakes located in each of
385 the 36 seismic zones, wherever feasible, can, to some extent, validate our predictions.

386 **Conclusions**

387 A static stress drop which is defined for a seismic province of known geodetic strain rate,
388 which covers a time interval of some centuries and which covers events distributed over a
389 range of magnitudes can prove a viable mean of integrating geodetic and historical
390 seismic data. The Italian area, with a detailed map of geodetic strain rates and long term
391 record of historical seismicity, is an ideal testing ground, but other areas such as Southern
392 California or the Anatolian Fault in Turkey, for example, can serve as well. We provide an
393 expression (eq. 8) where the geodetic strain rate, the a and b parameters of the regional
394 Gutenberg Richter law and the value of m_{\max} (maximum magnitude) are area dependent
395 parameters which constrain the maximum value of the stress drop released by the seismic
396 zone. The assumption that the geodetically measured strain rate is greater than or equal
397 to the strain rate released seismically (in the magnitude range of 4.5 to 7.3) leads to
398 upper limits of a static stress drop for each seismic zone. Lateral variations of the stress
399 drop results are in the range of 0.1 to 5.7 MPa in 36 seismic zones in Italy. Our data give
400 some indication of a correlation between the stress drop and the time elapsed since the
401 last largest earthquake in each seismic zone. This hypothesis should be investigated
402 further in Italy and other seismic areas and, if confirmed, could have far reaching
403 implications in several aspects of earthquake mechanics and seismic hazards.

404 **Acknowledgment**

405 The authors gratefully acknowledge the constructive review of the Associate Editor, of
406 Raul Madariaga and of an anonymous Reviewer. This research is supported by a contract
407 with the Dipartimento Protezione Civile and Istituto Nazionale di Geofisica e Vulcanologia
408 under Project S1.

410 **References**

- 411 Abercrombie, R., 1995. Earthquake source scaling relationships from -1 to 5 ML using
412 seismograms recorded at 2.5 km depth. *J. Geophys. Res.*, 100, 24,015– 24,036.
- 413 Allan, D.W., 1966. Statistics of atomic frequency standards. *Proc. IEEE*, 54, 221-230.
- 414 Allmann, B.P., Shearer, P.M., 2009. Global variations of stress drop from moderate to large
415 earthquakes. *J. Geophys. Res.*, 114, B01310, doi:10.1029/2008JB005821.
- 416 Altamimi, Z., Collilieux, X., Legrand, J., Garayt, B., Boucher, C., 2007. ITRF2005: A new
417 release of the International Terrestrial Reference Frame based on time series of station
418 positions and Earth Orientation Parameters. *J. Geophys. Res.*, 112, B09401,
419 doi:10.1029/2007JB004949.
- 420 Anzidei, M., Baldi, P., Casula, G., Galvani, A., Mantovani, E., Pesci, A., Riguzzi F.,
421 Serpelloni, E. 2001. Insights into present-day crustal motion in the central Mediterranean
422 area from GPS surveys. *Geophysical Journal International* 146, 98–110.
- 423 Argnani, A., Rovere, M., Bonazzi, C., 2009. Tectonics of the Mattinata fault, offshore south
424 Gargano (southern Adriatic Sea, Italy): Implications for active deformation and
425 seismotectonics in the foreland of the Southern Apennines. *Geological Society of America*
426 *Bulletin* 121 no. 9-10, 1421-1440, doi: 10.1130/B26326.1
- 427 Basili, R., Valensise, G., Vannoli, P., Burrato, P., Fracassi, U., Mariano, S., Tiberti, M.M.,
428 2008. The database of individual seismogenic sources (DISS) version 3: summarizing 20
429 years of research on Italy's earthquake geology. *Tectonophysics* 453, 20-43, doi:
430 10.1016/j.tecto.2007.04.014
- 431 Battaglia, M., Murray, M.H., Serpelloni, E., Burgmann, R., 2004. The Adriatic region: an
432 independent microplate within the Africa Eurasia collision zone. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 1,
433 L09605, doi: 10.1029/2004GL019723.
- 434 Beresnev, I.A., and G. M. Atkinson, 1997. Modeling finite-fault radiation from the ω^n
435 spectrum. *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America*, 87(1), 67-84.
- 436 Bressan, G., Kravanja, S., Franceschina, G., 2006. Source parameters and stress release of
437 seismic sequences occurred in the Friuli – Venezia Giulia region (Northeastern Italy) and in
438 Western Slovenia. *Phys Earth Planet. Int.*, <http://hdl.handle.net/2122/2513>.
- 439 Brune, J. N., 1970. Tectonic stress and the spectra of seismic shear waves from
440 earthquakes. *J. Geophys. Res.* 75, 4997-5009.

441 Calderoni, G., Rovelli, A., Milana, G., Valensise, G.L., 2009. Do strike slip faults of Molise,
442 Central Southern Italy, really release a high stress? Available through [http://www.earth-](http://www.earth-prints.org/bitstream/2122/5328/1)
443 [prints.org/bitstream/2122/5328/1](http://www.earth-prints.org/bitstream/2122/5328/1).

444 Caporali, A., 2003. Average strain rate in the Italian crust inferred from a permanent GPS
445 network I. Statistical analysis of time series of permanent GPS stations. *Geophysical*
446 *Journal International*, 155, 241-253.

447 Caporali, A., Martin, A., Massironi, M., 2003. Average strain rate in the Italian crust
448 inferred from a permanent GPS network – II Strain rate versus seismicity and structural
449 geology. *Geophysical Journal International* 155, 254-268.

450 Caporali, A., Aichhorn, C., Becker, M., Fejes, I., Gerhatova, L., Gitau, D., Grenerczy, G.,
451 Hefty, J., Krauss, S., Medac, D., Milev, G., Mojzes, M., Mulic, M., Nardo, A., Pesec, P., Rus,
452 T., Simek, J., Sledzinski, J., Solaric, S., Sangl, G., Vespe, F., Virag, G., Vodopivec, F.,
453 Zablotzki, F., 2009. Surface kinematics in the Alpine-Carpathian-Dinaric and Balkan region
454 inferred from a new multi-network GPS combination solution. *Tectonophysics* 474, 295–
455 321, doi: 10.1016/j.tecto.2009.04.035

456 Cocco, M., Rovelli, A., 1989. Evidence for the variation of stress drop between normal and
457 thrust faulting earthquakes in Italy. *J. of Geophys. Res.* 94 B7, 9399-9416,
458 doi:10.1029/JB094iB07p09399

459 Cole, J., Hacker, B., Ratschbacher, L., Dolan, J., Seward, G., Frost, E., Frank, W., 2007.
460 Localized ductile shear below the seismogenic zone: structural analysis of an exhumed
461 strike-slip fault, Austrian Alps, *J. of Geophys. Res.* 112, B12304,
462 doi:10.1029/2007JB004975.

463 D’Agostino, N., Cheloni, D., Mantenuto, S., Selvaggi, G., Michelini, A., Zuliani, D., 2005.
464 Strain accumulation in the southern Alps (NE Italy) and deformation at the northeastern
465 boundary of Adria observed by CGPS. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 32, L19306,
466 doi:10.1029/2005GL024266.

467 D’Agostino, N., Avallone, A., Cheloni, D., D’Anastasio, S., Mantenuto, S., Selvaggi, G., 2008.
468 Active tectonics Adriatic region from GPS and earthquake slip vectors, *J. Geophys. Res.*,
469 113, B12413, doi:10.1029/2008JB005860.

470 D’Agostino, N., Mantenuto, S., D’Anastasio, E., Avallone, A., Barchi, M., Collettini, C.,
471 Radicioni, F., Stoppini, A., Fastellini, G., 2009. Contemporary crustal extension in the
472 Umbria Marche Apennines from regional CGPS networks and comparison between
473 geodetic and seismic deformation. *Tectonophysics*, 476, 3-12,
474 doi:10.1016/j.tecto.2008.09.033.

475 Della Vedova B, Bellani S, Pellis G, Squarci P (2001) Deep temperatures and surface heat
476 flow distribution. In: Vai GB, Martini IP (eds) *Anatomy of an orogen: the Apennines and*
477 *adjacent Mediterranean basins*. Kluwer, Dordrecht, pp 65-76.

478 Devoti, R., Riguzzi, F., Cuffaro, M., Doglioni, C., 2008. New GPS constraints on the
479 kinematics of the Apennines subduction. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 273, 163–174.

480

481 Fletcher, J.B., and McGarr, A., 2006. Distribution of stress drop, stiffness and fracture
482 energy over earthquake rupture zones. *J. Geophys. Res.*, 111, B03312,
483 doi:10.1029/2004JB003396.

484 Grenerczy, Gy., Sella, G., Stein, S., Kenyeres, A., 2005. Tectonic implications of the GPS
485 velocity field in the northern Adriatic region, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 32, L16311,
486 doi:10.1029/2005GL022947.

487 Gruppo di lavoro CPTI04, 2004. Catalogo parametrico dei Terremoti Italiani, versione
488 2004 (CPTI04), INGV, Bologna ed. by P. Gasperini, R. Camassi, C. Mirto and M. Stucchi,
489 (<http://emidius.mi.ingv.it/CPTI04/>)

490 Gruppo di Lavoro MPS, 2004. Redazione della mappa di pericolosità sismica prevista
491 dall'Ordinanza PCM del 20 marzo 2003. Rapporto Conclusivo per il Dipartimento della
492 Protezione Civile, INGV, Milano-Roma, aprile 2004, 65 pp. + 5 appendici. Available at
493 <http://zonesismiche.mi.ingv.it/elaborazioni/docs/>.

494 Hugentobler, U., Dach, R., Fridez, P. (eds.) 2004. Bernese GPS software, Version 5.0.
495 Bern: Astronomical Institute, University of Berne.

496 Jenny, S., Goes, S., Giardini, D., Kahle, H.G., 2004. Earthquake recurrence parameters
497 from seismic and geodetic strain rates in the Eastern Mediterranean. *Geophysical Journal
498 International* 157, 1331-1347, doi: 10.1111/j.1365-246X.2004.02261.x.

499 Kanamori, H., and D. L. Anderson (1975). Theoretical basis of some empirical relations in
500 seismology. *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America*, 65(5), 1073-1095.

501 Kim, A., Dreger, D.S., 2008. Rupture process of the 2004 Parkfield earthquake from near-
502 fault seismic waveform and geodetic records. *J. Geophys. Res.*, 113, B07308.

503 Kostrov, B.V., Das, S., 1988. *Principles of Earthquake Source Mechanics*, Cambridge
504 University Press, Cambridge, UK, 286 pp.

505 Kreemer, C. , W.E. Holt, and Haines, A.J. 2003. An integrated global model of present-day
506 plate motions and plate boundary deformation, *Geophys. J. Int.*, 154, 8-34.

507 Kreemer, C. , N. Chamot-Rooke, and Le Pichon, X., 2004. Constraints on the evolution and
508 vertical coherency of deformation in the Northern Aegean from a comparison of geodetic,
509 geologic, and seismologic data, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 225, 329-346. Madariaga, R., 1976.
510 Dynamics of an expanding circular fault. *Bull. Seismol. Soc. Am.*, 66, 639-666.

511 Mao, A., Harrison, C.G.A., Dixon, T.H., 1999. Noise in GPS coordinate time-series. *J.*
512 *Geophys. Res.*, 104B2, 2797-2816.

513

514 Mc Garr, A. and Fletcher, J.B., 2002. Mapping apparent stress and energy radiation over
515 fault zones of major earthquakes. *Bull. Seismol. Soc. Am.*, 92, 1633-1646.

516 Meletti, C., 2007. Project S1 - Continuation of assistance to DPC for improving and using
517 the seismic hazard map compiled according to the Prime Minister "Ordinanza" 3274/2003
518 and planning future initiatives. Final Report. Available at <http://esse1.mi.ingv.it/index.html>.

519 Meletti, C., Galadini, F., Valensise, G., Stucchi, M., Basili, R., Barba, S., Vannucci, G.,
520 Boschi, E., 2008. A seismic source model for the seismic hazard assessment of the Italian
521 territory. *Tectonophysics*, 450, 85-108.

522 Peyrat, S., Olsen, K., Madariaga, R., 2001. Dynamic modeling of the 1992 Landers
523 earthquake. *J. Geophys. Res.*, 106, 26,467– 26,482.

524 Pisarenko, V. F., Lyubushin, A. A., Lysenko, V. B., Golubeva, T. V., 1996, Statistical
525 estimation of seismic hazard parameters: Maximum possible magnitude and related
526 parameters, *Bull. Seismol. Soc. Am.*, 86(3), 691-700.

527 Pondrelli, S., Salimbeni, S., Ekström, G., Morelli, A., Gasperini, P., Vannucci, G., 2006, The
528 Italian CMT dataset from 1977 to the present, *Phys. Earth Planet. Int.*,
529 doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2006.07.008,159/3-4, pp. 286-303.
530 <http://www.bo.ingv.it/RCMT/Italydataset.html>.

531 Riguzzi, F., Pietrantonio, G., Devoti, R., Atzori, S., Anzidei, M., 2009. Volcanic unrest of the
532 Colli Albani (central Italy) detected by GPS monitoring test. *Phys. Earth. Planet. Int.*, 177,
533 79–87.

534 Ripperger, J., Mai, P. M., 2004. Fast computation of static stress changes on 2D faults
535 from final slip distributions. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 31, L18610, doi:10.1029/2004GL020594.

536 Savage, J.C, Simpson, R.W., 1996. Surface strain accumulation and the seismic moment
537 tensor. *Bull. Seism. Soc. Am.* 87, 1345-1353.

538 Scholz, C.H., 2002. *The Mechanics of Earthquakes and Faulting*. 2. Edition, Cambridge
539 University Press, 471 pp.

540 Serpelloni E., Anzidei, M., Baldi., P., Casula, G., Galvani, A., 2005. Crustal velocity and
541 strain-rate fields in Italy and surrounding regions: new results from the analysis of
542 permanent and non-permanent GPS networks. *Geophysical Journal International* 161, 861-
543 880.

- 544 Serpelloni E., Casula, G., Galvani, A., Anzidei, M., and Baldi., P., 2006. Data analysis of
545 permanent GPS networks in Italy and surrounding regions: application of a distributed
546 processing approach. *Annales of Geophysics* 49, 897-927.
- 547 Slejko, D., Caporali, A., Stirling, M., Barba S., 2009. Occurrence probability of moderate to
548 large earthquakes. *J. of Seism.*, ISSN: 1383-4649, doi: 10.1007/S10950-009-9175-X
- 549 Turcotte, D.L. and Schubert, G., 2002. *Geodynamics*. 2nd edition, Cambridge University
550 Press, Cambridge, 456 pp.
- 551 Valensise, G.L. and Pantosti, D., 2001. Database of potential sources for earthquakes
552 larger than M 5.5 in Italy. *Ann. Geofis. Suppl.* 44(4), 797-964.
- 553 Ward, S.N., 1999. On the consistency of earthquake moment release and space geodetic
554 strain rate: Europe. *Geophys. J. Int.* 135, 1011-1018.
- 555 Wells, D.L., Coppersmith, K.J., (1994). New empirical relationships among Magnitude,
556 Rupture Length, Rupture Width, Rupture Area and Surface Displacement, *BSSA* 84, 974 –
557 1002.
- 558 Westaway, R., 1992. Seismic moment summation for historical earthquakes in Italy:
559 Tectonic implications. *J. Geophys. Res.*, 97, 15437-15464.
- 560 Williams, S.D.P., 2003. The effect of coloured noise on the uncertainties of rates estimated
561 from geodetic time series. *J. of Geod.*, 76, 483–494.
- 562

563
564

565 **Table and Figure Captions**

566 Table 1: The first nine columns list the properties of the ZS9 as defined by Meletti et al.
567 (2008). The symbol m_{\max} indicates the maximum observed magnitude + 0.3. The geodetic
568 shear strain rate and its uncertainty were computed from the eigenvalues of the geodetic
569 strain rate tensor according to Savage and Simpson (1997). The static stress drop is
570 defined in Eq. 12. We indicate the area of each seismic zone, the number of GPS stations
571 falling within each seismic zone and the number of GPS stations within $d_0=50$ km of the
572 geographic center of each seismic zone.

573 Table AUX (Auxiliary material): The velocities of the INGV multi-year solution relative to
574 the rigidly rotating Eurasian plate. Error ellipses are 1σ .

575 Figure 1: The velocities of the INGV multi-year solution relative to the rigidly rotating
576 Eurasian plate (see Table AUX for the numerical values). Error ellipses are 1σ .

577 Figure 2: (a) Strain rates interpolated at the center of each of the 36 ZS9 seismic zones
578 (polygons in yellow are labeled 901 to 936 in the index map). For comparison, we plot
579 the CMT's for the fault plane solutions of events of $m>5.5$ since 1976. Yellow cones
580 represent 1σ uncertainty in azimuth and absolute value for the largest eigenvector of the
581 strain rate tensor. (b) Identification of the 36 seismic zones (yellow polygons).

582 Figure 3: The seismic events in the CPTI04 catalogue (open circles) and their
583 geographical relation to the geometry of the ZS9 (yellow polygons).

584 Figure 4: Plots of the logarithm of the yearly number of events exceeding a given
585 magnitude for each ZS9 according to the CPTI04 catalogue..

586 Figure 5: The geodetic strain rate at the center of each ZS9 seismic zone vs. the number
587 of stations within a distance $d_0=50$ km from the geographical center of each zone. The
588 low correlation is an indication of the stability of the algorithm. When no station is within
589 the assigned distance, the algorithm tends to generate strain rates close to zero.

590 Figure 6: Estimates of the static stress drop defined by Eq. 8 as a function of the seismic
591 zone. The color codes refer to the dominant deformation regime (Meletti et al., 2008). The
592 assumed maximum magnitude is, for each seismic zone, the maximum recorded
593 magnitude + 0.3.

594 Figure 7: Graphical representation of data in Table 1. The static stress drop shows a weak
595 negative correlation with the a parameter (sub plot a) and is uncorrelated with the b
596 parameters of each seismic zone (sub plot b). The stress drop is independent of depth at
597 low values (sub plot c). Higher values appear at larger depths or lithostatic loads. The
598 stress drop has a positive correlation with the maximum magnitude with a large scatter

599 (sub plot d). The resulting correlation law is $m_{\max}=0.2 \Delta\sigma + 6.4$, $\Delta\sigma$ being the maximum
600 stress drop in MPa.

601 Figure 8: Geographical interpolation of the lateral variations of the static stress drop under
602 three assumptions: (top) the quantity m_{\max} in eq.8 is the maximum magnitude recorded in
603 each zone in the CPTI04 catalogue; (center) the maximum value in the catalogue is
604 increased by 0.3 in all zones; (bottom) the maximum value in the catalogue is increased
605 by 0.5 in all zones.

606 Figure 9: Static stress drop and heat flow (contours in mW/m^2).

607 Figure 10: The stress drop (top), geodetic shear strain rate (center) and recurrence time
608 of zero magnitude events (bottom) vs. time elapsed since the largest earthquake in each
609 seismic zone. The dashed line in the top plot represents the regression line. The error bars
610 of the strain rate in the center plot tend to be smaller than the size of the plot symbol.