Extra-curricular education for sustainable development
interventions in higher education

Thesis submitted in accordance with the requirements of the
University of Liverpool for the degree of Doctor in Philosophy

by

Bryan P. Lipscombe

December 2009
Abstract

Universities are seen to have a central role in the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD), partly through their teaching and research activities. However, the critique of Higher Education’s (HE) contribution to sustainable development thus far points to the limitations of a discipline driven, curriculum content and solely student focused response. Within this context, extra-curricular interventions, for example, running awareness campaigns, creating groups and organising events, appear to have potential to advance ESD in HE. However, there has been little investigation or published work in this area. Ideas of non formal and informal education; constructivist theories of learning; concepts of free choice, tacit and social learning, and the notions of whole systems thinking and sustainable education all point to roles for interventions in the extra-curricular sphere.

This thesis explores the use of extra-curricular interventions in HE through an empirical investigation in the UK. A 2006 postal survey of Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) records the extent and type of interventions in use and opinions about their utility. A case study, developed through action research, reports the use and impact of extra-curricular ESD-related interventions at one HEI over an academic year (2006-07). In this case study, regular contact with a group of staff and students over the year is used to map changes in their thoughts and actions relating to sustainable development, and to record the influences attributed to these changes.

Importantly, extra-curricular ESD-related interventions are found to be commonly used in UK HE, and to have a prominent position in ESD work despite their limited visibility in the literature. Their utility is confirmed as they are seen to provide experiences that contribute to student and staff learning, as well as institutional change. The evidence collected supports their roles as: disciplinary bridge; community bridge; socialisation scaffold, and social learning arena. They appear to have a useful developmental role in mobilising and motivating members of the campus community. As peripheral activities, however, extra-curricular interventions may be prone to erratic implementation through being under-resourced. They can extend
participation in ESD although will not reach everyone. They are best viewed as a complementary part of ESD and linked to a process of curricular and pedagogic renewal.

In addition to confirming the extent, utility and limitations of extra-curricular ESD practice, the research contributes a model to map understandings of sustainable development. This model points to a core environmental understanding to which extra layers and strands of thinking can be added. It also confirms the importance of non formal and informal influences in shaping people’s conceptions of sustainable development.
Thesis related outputs

**Published journal papers**


**Published conference proceedings and abstracts**


**Other outputs**


Acknowledgements

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisory ‘team’: Prof. Cynthia Burek, Dr. Chris Ribchester, Dr. Jac Potter and Dr. Martin Degg for their guidance and support from inception through to production of this thesis. It has been a long journey, but one more pleasurable in your company.

In the wider academic world, thanks are extended to Prof. John Blewitt, Dr. Steven Sterling and Prof. Steve Martin for commenting on my initial ideas for this research concerning its potential for an original contribution to knowledge. Thanks are extend to numerous journal referees and editors, conference participants and presenters who have read, listened to and commented on my work, or answered my questions on theirs.

I gratefully acknowledge the input of all participants in the research in helping create much of the ‘data’ upon which it is based. I extend my appreciation to those people from the 72 universities who took the time to complete and return a questionnaire on behalf of their institution. I am also grateful to the 27 people from Bright College University who participated in interviews and made regular reflections about their experiences. I also wish to formally thank Bright College’s Environmental Committee for welcoming me within their number and supporting my research and the extra-curricular programme investigated through it.

I am particularly thankful for the social support network provided by fellow research students, past and present, at the University of Chester: scholars all. Thanks Claire, Louisa, Emma, Johanna, Jo, Rebecca, Karen, Gina, Winnie, Debbie, Charles, Nick and Riikka. It was a pleasure to be a part of the Garden Lane Café luncheon club.

Finally, I express my eternal gratitude to my wife, Vicky, and family for their support and tolerance without which this work would never have been completed. Mum and dad, if this is hard bound, I have finished. Elizabeth and John, if you are reading this then perhaps you will now understand what your Dad was up to when you were little. I hope you approve.
Contents

Chapter One: Introduction 1-12
Introduction 1-2
Higher Education for Sustainable Development: from curriculum content to extra-curricular context 2-4
Research Questions 4-5
Approach 5
Researcher’s interest in the investigation 6-9
Structure of the argument 9-12

Chapter Two: Higher Education for Sustainable Development in perspective – problems and prospects 13-42
Introduction 13-15
About Sustainable Development 15-20
About Education and learning 20-25
Education 20-23
Learning 23-25
Concepts of learning pertinent to extra-curricular ESD 25-26
Education for Sustainable Development 26-30
The international dimension 26-28
Critique of ESD 28-29
The two sides of ESD 29-30
Sterling’s whole systems thinking and sustainable education 30-33
Higher Education for Sustainable Development 33-34
The critique of HE response to sustainable development 34-36
The potential for extra-curricular interventions 36-38
Existing research on extra-curricular education 39-40
Conclusions 40-42

Chapter Three: Methodology 43-62
Introduction 43
Situating the research 44-53
Philosophical position 44-46
Research approach 46-47
Research design 47-49
Methods for generating data 49-51
Analysis and data handling 51-53
Appropriateness of design and methods 53-58
Ethical considerations 58-61
Conclusion 62

Chapter Four: Survey into extra-curricular ESD interventions in the UK universities 63-81
Introduction 63
The survey process 64-65
Preparation 64
Format 64-65
Deployment 65
Response 66
Findings 67-75
1. The Use of Extra-curricular ESD related interventions
   - Extent of Interventions across UK HEIs
   - Type of Interventions
   - 67-70

2. Views about the use of extra-curricular interventions to advance ESD in HE
   - Utility of extra-curricular interventions
   - Strengths and weaknesses
   - Opportunities and Barriers
   - 70-74

3. Views about the institution’s work on ESD overall
   - The relative development of curricular and extra-curricular ESD work
   - 74-75

Discussion
Conclusions
76-79
79-81

Chapter Five: Extra-curricular ESD practice at Bright College University
Introduction
82
Context
83-90
- Bright College University
  - The development of institutional support for ESD at Bright College
- 83-84
84-90

Practice
Extra-curricular ESD-related interventions 2006-2007
- Awareness campaigns
- Events
- Volunteering opportunities
- Networking opportunities
- 91-97
91
92-97
97
97

Discussion
Character of extra-curricular interventions
The audience engaged by extra-curricular interventions
- 97-103
98-101
101-103

Conclusions
104-116

Chapter Six: Staff and student engagement with sustainable development at the start of the case study year
Introduction
107
PART ONE:
Characteristics of participants in the longitudinal survey
- Introduction
- Study participant mix
- Study participation profile
- Length of involvement in the Sustainable University Network
- Initial participant engagement with the Sustainable University Network
- 108-123
108
108-110
111
111-113
113-122

PART TWO:
The 'Baseline' position
- Introduction
- Understandings of Sustainable Development
  - Themes in participant understanding of sustainable development
  - Conceptions of sustainable development
- 123-156
123
124-137
124-127
128-137
| Experiences informing initial understanding of sustainable development | 137-143 |
| Thoughts and feelings about sustainable development | 143-148 |
| Behaviours in relation to sustainable development | 148-154 |
| Implications | 155-156 |
| Conclusions | 156-157 |

**Chapter Seven: Participant thoughts, feelings and actions in relation to sustainable development at the end of the study year** 158-191
- Introduction 158-159
- Changes in conception of sustainable development 159-164
- Changes in views on the prospects for sustainable development 164-169
- Changes in feelings about sustainable development 169-171
- Changes in behaviour in relation to sustainable development 172-177
- Influences prompting participant thoughts about sustainable development 177-181
- Engagement with the extra-curricular interventions 181-182
- Discussion 182-189
- Conclusion 189-191

**Chapter Eight: Conclusions** 192-206
- Introduction 192
- The research questions revisited 193-197
- Implications 197-201
  - For knowledge 197-198
  - For policy and practice 198-201
- The research process 202-206
  - Limits 204-205
  - Future lines of enquiry 205-206
- Closing remarks 206

**References** 207-221

**Appendices**
List of Tables

Table 4.1: Geographic comparison between total population of UK HEIs and respondent sample 66
Table 4.2: Comparison between total UK population of HEIs and respondent sample by date HEI attained university status 66
Table 4.3: Types of extra-curricular ESD-related interventions presented to respondents and their use as reported by respondents 68
Table 4.4: Strengths and weaknesses of extra-curricular ESD interventions 71
Table 4.5: Opportunities for and barriers to extra-curricular ESD interventions 73
Table 5.1: Academic schools and departments at Bright College University 84
Table 5.2: Awareness campaigns run during 2006 to 2007. 91
Table 5.3: ‘Perspectives on Sustainable Development’ extra-curricular event programme 2007 93
Table 6.1: Characteristics of study participant group 109
Table 6.2: Age and gender of study participants 110
Table 6.3: Record of participation over the study period 112
Table 6.4: Length of involvement at time of first interview 113
Table 6.5: Participants indicating a limitation in their understanding of sustainable development 124
Table 6.6: Sustainable development conception types attributed to each participant after first interview 132
Table 6.7: Recently published investigations into understandings of sustainable development in higher education communities 133-134
Table 6.8: Participant experiences informing initial understandings of sustainable development 139-140
Table 6.9: Participant views on the prospects for sustainable development at the time of the first interview 145
Table 6.10: Initial participant feelings about sustainable development 147
Table 6.11: Initial behaviours believed to be in support of sustainable development 151
Table 6.12: Initial behaviours believed contrary to sustainable development 154
Table: 7.1: Changes in conception of sustainable development 160-161
Table 7.2: Changes in views about the prospects for sustainable development 165-166
Table 7.3: Changes in feelings associated with sustainable development 169-171
Table 7.4: Changes in actions relating to sustainable development 173-175
Table 7.5: Influences prompting thoughts about sustainable development. 177-181
Table 7. 6: Engagement with the extra-curricular programme 182
Table 7.7: The influence of extra-curricular interventions on changes recorded over the study year
List of Boxes

Box 1.1: Chapter purposes 1
Box 1.2: Reflections on the path to this thesis 6-9

Box 2.1 Chapter purposes 13

Box 3.1: Chapter purposes 43

Box 4.1: Chapter purposes 63

Box 5.1: Chapter purposes 82
Box 5.2 Bright College University Environmental Policy 86

Box 6.1: Chapter purposes 107

Box 7.1: Chapter purposes 158

Box 8.1: Chapter purposes 192
Box 8.2: The researcher’s reflections on the research process 202-204
# List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Models of sustainable development</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>The modes and characteristics of Education</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Vare and Scott’s two sides of ESD</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>A systems view of education movements for change</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Research design showing the main components and methods employed and types of data generated</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Types of extra-curricular ESD related interventions in use</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Perceptions about work on ESD overall within UK HEIs</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Environmental Coordinating Group and topic clusters</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Disciplinary origin of student event participants</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Departmental origin of staff event participants</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>How participants found out about ‘perspectives’ event sessions</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Affiliations of study participants</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Circumstances leading to involvement in the Sustainable University Network</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Circumstances of involvement with Environmental Committee</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Motivations to join the Sustainable University Network</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Motivations to join the Environmental Committee</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Hopes when joining the Sustainable University Network</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Expectations when joining the Sustainable University Network</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Feelings when first heard about the Sustainable University Network</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>Fears when joining the Sustainable University Network</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10</td>
<td>Themes in participant understandings of sustainable development</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.11</td>
<td>Understandings of sustainable development in layers and strands</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.12</td>
<td>Themes in experiences informing understanding of sustainable development</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.13</td>
<td>Themes recorded in initial participant views about the prospects for sustainable development</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.14</td>
<td>Themes recorded when participants were initially questioned about their feelings with respect to sustainable development</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.15</td>
<td>Themes in initial participant behaviours believed to be in support of sustainable development</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.16</td>
<td>Themes in initial participant behaviours believed to be contrary to sustainable development</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 7.1: Changes in conception of sustainable development mapped using the layers and strands model