Self-assessment in General Practice
Vocational Training

Susan Peta Goldman
B Ed, Grad Dip Soc Sci

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

School of Human Life Sciences
University of Tasmania
December 2007
Candidate Declaration

I certify that the thesis entitled *Self-assessment in General Practice Vocational Training* submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, University of Tasmania contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University or any other institution, except by way of background information and duly acknowledged in the thesis. To the best of my knowledge and belief no material has been previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgement is made in the text of the thesis, nor does the thesis contain any material that infringes copyright.

Susan Peta Goldman

19 December 2007
Statement of Access

This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.
Publications and Presentations

The following published works and presentations arose from the self-assessment study in this dissertation:


Acknowledgements

A large team of individuals provided support and encouragement during the completion of this project. Professor Madeleine Ball provided supervision and ongoing support for my research. With her encouragement, the research and the dissertation came to fruition. Associate Professor Dominic Geraghty also deserves a thank you for his help during the last stages of the submission of the thesis. I would also like to acknowledge the efforts of Dr Rod Wellard. In addition to providing support for the research on behalf of the Royal Australian College of General Practitioners, Rod provided his own insights from an educational perspective. Amy Jasper, also from the Royal Australian College of General Practitioners, played an important part in providing ongoing support for the research.

I was fortunate also to have the help and assistance of Dr Chris Peterson. As well as statistical assistance and comments on drafts, Chris provided invaluable support and inspiration. Heather Gardner was another valuable support person who patiently proof read the dissertation.

There were 1500 trainees over three years, who contributed their valuable time in completing questionnaires and providing their views about general practice vocational training. Without the trainees’ preparedness to declare frankly their own strengths and weaknesses, there would not have been a self-assessment study. A thank you is also due also to Glynis Ramsay whose administrative assistance was outstanding. A dedicated crew of telephone callers, largely responsible for the high response rates for the three surveys, also deserve my thanks.

Finally, I thank Dr Stephen Goddard who has supported and encouraged me, not only on this journey, but also in life.
Contents

Candidate Declaration ................................................................................... iii

Statement of Access .................................................................................. iv

Publications and Presentations ................................................................... v

Acknowledgements ..................................................................................... vii

Abstract ...................................................................................................... xvi

Chapter 1: Introduction ............................................................................... 1

The Beginning of the Evaluation of General Practice Training ............... 1

Context ....................................................................................................... 2

Evaluation Approach of the Outcomes Evaluation Unit ....................... 3

Origin of the Self-assessment Study ....................................................... 4

Research Study Strategy and Questions ................................................. 5

Significance of the Self-assessment Study ............................................. 7

Thesis Overview ....................................................................................... 9

Chapter 2: General Practice Vocational Training. ................................. 11

Origins ...................................................................................................... 11

Influences on the Curriculum ................................................................. 17

The Development of Australian General Practice Competencies ........ 18

Summary of the Origins of General Practice Vocational Training ........ 22
Chapter 3: Perspectives of Learners

The Field of Self-assessment Studies and General Practice
Vocational Training ................................................................. 23

Self-assessment and Educational Evaluation .......................... 26

Attitudes to Training .............................................................. 26

Summary of Self-assessment and Educational Evaluation ......... 35

Validation Studies .................................................................. 37

Questions Around Validation Studies and Self-assessment ......... 38

Interpretations Around Difficulties of Validation Studies ......... 41

Summary of Validation Studies ................................................. 43

Interventions to Teach Self-assessment .................................... 44

Summary of Interventions to Teach Self-assessment ................ 45

Current Frameworks for Self-assessment ................................. 45

The Need for Self-assessment in Medical Education ............... 46

Benefits of Self-assessment ..................................................... 47

Assessment as a Collaborative Process .................................... 48

Measurement Rigour versus Educational Relevance ............... 49

Changing Methodologies ........................................................ 50

Summary of Current Frameworks for Self-assessment .............. 51

Towards a Model for Evaluating Training .............................. 51
Chapter 5: A Study of Aspects of General Practice Vocational Training. ................................................................. 84

Aims ......................................................................................................................................................... 84

Design Considerations ......................................................................................................................... 85

Research Strategy ................................................................................................................................. 88

Hypotheses ............................................................................................................................................. 91

Ethics ..................................................................................................................................................... 93

Method .................................................................................................................................................. 93

Procedure ............................................................................................................................................... 98

  Questionnaire Development ............................................................................................................... 100

  Sample ............................................................................................................................................... 103

  Recruitment ..................................................................................................................................... 103

  Questionnaire Data Analyses ............................................................................................................ 104

  Comparison of Questionnaire and Examination Data ................................................................. 107

  Summary of the Design of the Self-assessment Study .................................................................. 107

Chapter 6: Study Findings ......................................................................................................................... 109

  Characteristics of Respondents ........................................................................................................ 109

  Self-assessed Competence ............................................................................................................... 109

    Domain One: Communication Skills and the Patient-Doctor Relationship ................................ 112

    Longitudinal Results on Domain One ............................................................................................ 115
Domain Two: Applied Professional Knowledge and Skills ...........116

Longitudinal Results on Domain Two .................................121

Domain Three: Population Health and the Context of General Practice .................................................................122

Longitudinal Results on Domain Three ..............................125

Domain Four: Professional and Ethical Role ..........................126

Longitudinal Results on Domain Four ...............................129

Domain Five: Organizational and Legal Dimensions ............129

Care of Particular Patient Groups .......................................133

Longitudinal Results on the Care of Particular Patient Groups .................................................................139

Care of Patient Presentations ............................................141

Longitudinal Results on Patient Presentations ....................145

Satisfaction ........................................................................145

Longitudinal Findings on Satisfaction .................................149

Satisfaction and Self-assessed Competence .........................149

The Relationship Between Self-assessments and Examination Results .................................................................154

Self-assessed Competence ..............................................154

Satisfaction ......................................................................156

Findings in Relation to Study Hypotheses ...........................156
Chapter 7: Discussion of the Self-assessment Study

Reflections

Study Research Questions and Contribution

Methodology

Limitations

Perspectives of Learners and Self-assessed Competence

Findings

Stage of Training

Gender

Locality

Workload

Longitudinal Results

Perspectives of Learners and Satisfaction Findings

Perspectives of Educators and Study Findings

Conclusion

References

Appendix A

Appendix B

Appendix C

Appendix D
List of Tables

Table 1: Characteristics of current and former trainees .................... 110
Table 2: Further characteristics of current and former trainees ........ 111
Table 3: Stage of training by Domain one ........................................ 114
Table 4: Workload by Domain one .................................................. 115
Table 5: Longitudinal findings for Domain one ............................... 116
Table 6: Stage of training by Domain two ........................................ 118
Table 7: Stage of training by referrals ............................................. 119
Table 8: Workload by Domain two .................................................. 119
Table 9: Workload by further items in Domain two .......................... 120
Table 10: Longitudinal findings for Domain two ............................. 121
Table 11: Stage of training by Domain three ................................... 123
Table 12: Stage of training by public health items ........................... 124
Table 13: Longitudinal findings for Domain three ........................... 125
Table 14: Stage of training by Domain four ..................................... 127
Table 15: Workload by Domain four ................................................ 128
Table 16: Longitudinal findings for Domain four ............................ 129
Table 17: Stage of training by Domain five ..................................... 131
Table 18: Workload by Domain five ................................................ 132
Table 19: Stage of training by particular patient groups ..........134
Table 20: Stage of training by women to indigenous people ........135
Table 21: Stage of training by people with mental illness to chronic conditions.........................................................136
Table 22: Workload by particular patient groups.........................138
Table 23: Workload by women....................................................139
Table 24: Workload by men to people with chronic conditions ......140
Table 25: Workload by people with disabilities..............................141
Table 26: Longitudinal findings for particular patient groups........142
Table 27: Predictors of self-assessed competence for year one.......151
Table 28: Predictors of self-assessed competence for year two ......153
Table 29: Predictors of self-assessed competence for year three .....154
Abstract

Objectives: This dissertation explores the utility of self-assessment for trainee general practitioners in Australia and examines the implications of self-assessment for skills acquisition by reflecting upon educational theory and research.

Aims: The study at the core of this dissertation aims to evaluate general practice vocational training from the perspective of learners using self-assessment. Using a model developed from the self-assessment literature, the study examines the extent to which trainees view themselves as competent in key curriculum areas. Research questions consider whether participation in general practice training results in a measurable increase in self-assessed competence in the key areas of general practice training, and to what extent trainees are satisfied with the program. Also considered is the relationship between the two concepts of satisfaction and self-assessed competence, and the correlation between examination results and self-assessments.

Method: Qualitative analysis of empirical research on self-assessment studies in medical education and selected theories of adult and experiential learning produced a model with which to evaluate aspects of general practice vocational training from the perspective of the learner. A national sample of trainees of the Royal Australian College of General Practitioners participated in a three-year longitudinal panel study from 1999 to 2001.
**Results:** Six hundred and twenty-two trainees completed the survey in year one, 549 trainees in year two and 472 trainees in year three. The sample mirrored that of the population of general practice trainees. A sample of 161 trainees participated in all three surveys and their results on competence and satisfaction were compared over time. The model tested provided information about the significance and role of self-assessment to evaluate aspects of general practice vocational training from the perspective of the learner. It established that participation in general practice vocational training resulted in an increase of self-assessed competence in areas of the curriculum, and that trainees were generally satisfied with their training experiences. The variables of stage of training, gender, locality and workload provided insights into the utility of trainee self-assessments, particularly in relation to their strengths and weaknesses. The results suggest that as they progress, the longitudinal cohort of trainees viewed themselves as improving an average of nine percent in their self-assessed competence rating in the five domains of general practice, seven percent for the care of particular patient groups and 11 percent for the management of particular patient presentations. This pattern of consistent differences, in the same individuals over time, supported the idea that a process is at work whereby trainees’ confidence improved as they progress through training.
**Implications:** The baseline data emerging from this study provide findings that might usefully contribute to the debates surrounding future training needs and self-assessment, and the enhancement of the conditions around the delivery of general practice vocational training. This is particularly pertinent to the environment of general practice vocational training, in which there are multiple training providers, and to the development of continuing medical education.