Molecular Breeding (2005) 15: 409–422 DOI: 10.1007/s11032-005-0386-8 © Springer 2005

The tomato Orion locus comprises a unique class of *Hcr9* genes^{\ddagger}

Maarten J.D. de Kock¹, Bas F. Brandwagt^{1,2}, Guusje Bonnema¹, Pierre J.G.M. de Wit² and Pim Lindhout^{1,*}

¹Graduate School Experimental Plant Sciences, Laboratory of Plant Breeding, Wageningen University, P.O. Box 386, 6700AJ Wageningen, The Netherlands; ²Graduate School Experimental Plant Sciences. Laboratory of Phytopathology, Wageningen University, P.O. Box 8025 6700EE Wageningen, The Netherlands; *Author for correspondence (e-mail: pim.lindhout@wur.nl; phone: +31-0-317-483454; fax: +31-0-317-483457)

Received 1 July 2004; accepted in revised form 11 January 2005

Key words: Cladosporium fulvum, Contig, Fingerprinting, Hcr9, Lycopersicon, Resistance

Abstract

Resistance against the tomato fungal pathogen *Cladosporium fulvum* is often conferred by *Hcr9* genes (<u>Homologues of the *C. fulvum* resistance gene *Cf-9*) that are located in the *Milky Way* cluster on the short arm of chromosome 1. These *Hcr9* genes mediate recognition of fungal avirulence gene products. In contrast, the resistance gene *Cf-Ecp2* mediates recognition of the virulence factor Ecp2 and is located in the *Orion* (*OR*) cluster on the short arm of chromosome 1. Here, we report the map- and homology-based cloning of the *OR Hcr9* cluster. A method was optimised to generate clone-specific fingerprint data that were subsequently used in the efficient calculation of genomic DNA contigs. Three *Hcr9s* were identified as candidate *Cf-Ecp2* genes. By PCR-based cloning using specific *OR* sequences, orthologous *Hcr9* genes were identified from different *Lycopersicon* species and haplotypes. The *OR Hcr9s* are very homologous. However, based on the relative low sequence homology to other *Hcr9s*, the *OR Hcr9s* are classified as a new subgroup.</u>

Abbreviations: Hcr9 – homologue of the Cladosporium fulvum resistance gene Cf-9; OR – Orion locus; R gene – resistance gene; Avr gene – avirulence gene; HR – hypersensitive response; Ecp – extracellular protein; PR protein – pathogenesis-related protein; MW – Milky Way locus; AU – Aurora locus; cM – centiMorgan; LRRs – leucine-rich repeats; NL – Northern lights locus; SC – Southern Cross locus; CAPS – Cleaved Amplified Polymorphic Sequence; ORF – open reading frame; FPC – fingerprinted contigs; RGA – resistance gene analogue; LoxC gene – LipoxygenaseC gene; utr – untranscribed region; UPGMA – unweighted pair group method with arithmetic mean

^{*}Data deposition: The sequence of the *Cf-Ecp2 Hcr9* gene cluster and the orthologous *Hcr9* sequences have been deposited in the GenBank database (accession No. AY639600..AY639604)

Introduction

The fungal pathogen *Cladosporium fulvum* causes tomato leaf mould. In wild related species of tomato (*Lycopersicon esculentum*), many accessions have been identified that are resistant to *C. fulvum*. Plant breeders have introgressed the C. fulvum resistance genes from these accessions (designated Cf-genes) into new cultivars, which provide effective protection of tomato against the fungus. The tomato – C. fulvum interaction has been extensively used as a model to study gene-forgene interactions (Joosten and De Wit 1999). According to this model, resistance against the pathogen depends on the presence of at least two components: a resistance (R) gene in the plant and a matching avirulence (Avr) gene in the pathogen. An interaction between the resistance gene product and the Avr factor will invoke defence responses (accompanied a hypersensitive response; HR) eventually leading to complete inhibition of fungal growth.

Colonisation of tomato leaves by C. fulvum remains restricted to the apoplast and, consequently, the exchange of molecular signals between fungus and the plant occurs extracellularly. Detailed analyses of apoplastic fluids resulted in the identification, molecular isolation and characterisation of race specific Avr factors (reviewed by Joosten and De Wit 1999; Luderer et al. 2002; Westerink et al., submitted). In addition to the race-specific Avr factors, many other fungal low molecular weight peptides have been purified from apoplastic fluids from infected tomato leaves. Several of these corresponding Ecps (Extracellular Proteins, including Ecp1, Ecp2, Ecp3, Ecp4 and Ecp5) have been isolated and, except for Ecp3, the encoding genes have been isolated (Van der Ackerveken et al. 1993; Laugé et al. 2000). During pathogenesis, all strains of C. fulvum produce and secrete these Ecps abundantly. Inoculation of an Ecp2-deficient replacement mutant on susceptible tomato plants showed a reduced virulence and induced accumulation of pathogenesis-related (PR) proteins (Laugé et al. 1997). Consequently, Ecp2 was proposed to play a role in virulence of C. fulvum by suppression of host defence responses.

Various breeding lines and accessions of L. *pimpinellifolium* have been identified that recognise Ecps after injection of these proteins or by Potato Virus X-based expression of the corresponding cDNA in infected plant tissue (Laugé et al. 1998, 2000). The ability to recognise Ecp2 and to induce an HR is based on the single dominant gene Cf-Ecp2 that confers resistance to C. *fulvum* strains producing the Ecp2 protein (Haanstra et al. 1999). As the Cf-Ecp2 gene

mediates recognition of the potential virulence factor Ecp2, it was hypothesised that *Cf-Ecp2* may confer durable resistance against *C. fulvum* (Laugé et al. 1998). Furthermore, Ecp2 is also specifically recognised by several *Nicotiana* species which are non-hosts to *C. fulvum* (Laugé et al. 2000; De Kock et al. 2004). This indicates that recognition of Ecp2 is widespread and can be found in both host and non-host plants.

A number of Cf resistance genes have been mapped at four different loci. Cf-2 and Cf-5 are closely linked and map on chromosome 6 (Dixon et al. 1996, 1998), Cf-4, Cf-4E and Cf-9 have been mapped on the short arm of chromosome 1 at the Milky Way (MW) locus (Van der Beek et al. 1992; Balint-Kurti et al. 1994; Takken et al. 1998), Cf-Ecp5 at the Aurora (AU) locus, 4 cM(centi-Morgan) proximal to the MW cluster (Haanstra et al. 2000) and Cf-Ecp2 and Cf-Ecp3 at the Orion (OR) locus, 12 cM proximal to the MW locus (Haanstra et al. 1999; Yuan et al. 2002), see also Figure 5. Several Cf genes, notably Cf-9 (Jones et al. 1994), Cf-2 (Dixon et al. 1996) Cf-4 (Thomas et al. 1997), Cf-4E (Takken et al. 1998), Cf-5 (Dixon et al. 1998) and 9DC (Van der Hoorn et al. 2001a; M. Kruijt et al. 2004) have been cloned and sequenced. The Cf-genes encode membraneanchored, extracytoplasmic glycoproteins with an extracellular domain mainly consisting of leucine-rich repeats (LRRs) which are predicted to mediate recognition of matching fungal elicitor proteins. The Cf genes cloned so far belong to two gene families, the Cf genes located in the MWlocus (Cf-4, Cf-4E, Cf-9 and 9DC) are very homologous and are referred to as Hcr9s (Homologues of the C. fulvum resistance gene Cf-9) and similarly, the genes Cf-2 and Cf-5 are referred to as Hcr2s. Depending on the genotype, the MWlocus can contain up to six Hcr9s (Parniske et al. 1997, 1999; Parniske and Jones 1999; M. Kruijt et al. 2004). The short arm of chromosome 1 harbours two additional clusters with Hcr9s, Northern Lights (NL) and Southern Cross (SC) (Parniske et al. 1999). The latter clusters do not contain Cf genes involved in resistance. RFLP analysis with a Cf-9 probe demonstrated that AUand OR loci containing the Cf-Ecp genes also comprise Hcr9s (Haanstra et al. 1999, 2000; Yuan et al. 2002). So far, 19 Hcr9s have been sequenced. Sequence variation within Cf proteins is generally present in the first 16 LRRs that most probably determine recognitional specificity (Thomas et al. 1997; Van der Hoorn et al. 2001b).

The resistance gene *Cf-Ecp*² has been accurately mapped on chromosome 1 at < 0.3 cM distance from the Cleaved Amplified Polymorphic Sequence (CAPS) marker CT116 (Haanstra et al. 1999). Bonnema et al. (1997) showed by using a cross between L. esculentum and L. peruvianum LA2157, that near the CT116 locus a genetic distance of 1 cM corresponds to a physical distance of maximally 52 kb. The tight linkage of Cf-Ecp2 with CT116 and the cosegregation with Hcr9s prompted us to use a combination of a homologybased- and map-based cloning approach to characterise the OR Hcr9 gene cluster and to identify candidate Cf-Ecp2 genes.

In the present study, the cloning and sequence analysis of the Hcr9s at the OR cluster is reported. Additionally, the presence of orthologous ORclusters was investigated. We isolated OR Hcr9sfrom other tomato haplotypes and discuss unique features of these Hcr9s and corresponding clusters.

Results

Library construction and screening

The *Cf-Ecp2* gene has previously been mapped within approximately 20 kb from the genetic marker CT116 (Haanstra et al. 1999). A five genome equivalent library was constructed in the pCLD04541 binary cosmid vector (Bent et al. 1994) with an average insert size of approximately 20 kb. Isolation of library clones containing *Hcr9*s and/or CT116 would enable us to isolate an overlapping series of clones (contig) covering the *OR* resistance cluster.

Due to a high background signal, hybridisation screening of pooled cosmid clones with Cf- and CT116 probes was not successful. Therefore, a PCR-based screening using Hcr9- and CT116 specific primer sets was performed. In total, 23 cosmids harbouring Hcr9 sequences and one cosmid containing the CT116 marker were identified. Detailed characterisation of these cosmids by restriction mapping, DNA hybridisation and sequence analysis of Hcr9-derived PCR amplification products indicated that coverage of clones varied over the genome (data not shown). Many cosmids showed similar sequences to known Hcr9 genes located in *NL*, *MW* or *SC* cluster. Two cosmids were identified that contained *Hcr9*s of unknown origin. Unfortunately, physical overlap of these clones with the clone containing CT116 was not present.

We used the binary cosmid vector since it allows a direct Agrobacterium-mediated transfer of cloned plant DNA into plant cells for complementation experiments. Although a contig covering the complete OR locus could not be constructed, we continued with the functional analysis. Cosmids carrying candidate Cf-Ecp2 genes were transformed into Agrobacterium tumefaciens strain GV3101. Restriction analysis of several transformed cosmids (including 3.8G and 4.8G, located in the OR contig) showed deletions of insert-DNA (results not shown). This artefact is probably caused by the recombination of duplicated homologous sequences on the insert and hampered a straightforward functional analysis of candidate Cf-Ecp2 genes.

A second genomic library was made in the λ -BlueStar vector (Novagen) which enables the screening of phages by DNA hybridisation and subsequent conversion of the isolated phages into high-copy plasmids (pBlueStar). A 16-genome equivalent library was constructed aiming to cover the complete *OR* cluster despite even in case of biased genome coverage. Hybridisation screening of this library resulted in 49 individual *Hcr9* clones and six CT116 clones, of which four clones contained both the CT116 CAPS marker and an *Hcr9* sequence confirming the tight linkage of CT116 with at least one *Hcr9*.

Contig construction and mapping

We expected that isolated library clones would align in different contigs corresponding to the different *Hcr9* clusters. Contig construction of the clones by (low-resolution) restriction mapping was very laborious and therefore a restriction-mediated PCR fingerprinting method was developed to obtain clone-specific, high-resolution fingerprints that facilitated a reliable contig establishment. Indeed, contiguous clones with similar fingerprintpatterns were clustered into a distance tree comprising distinct branches (Figure 1).

This restriction-mediated PCR fingerprinting method was initially optimised for the *Eco*RI/*Mse*I restriction enzyme combination. Additional



Figure 1. Ordering of library clones in contigs by PCR-fingerprinting and distance trees. (a) PCR fingerprint pattern of randomly ordered *Eco*RI/ *Mse*I-mediated pBlueStar library clones containing *Hcr*9s and/or CT116 (subset of clones). The fingerprint pattern of each clone was converted to a binary data set (presence or absence of a band), which, together with additional experimental data (not shown), enabled the calculation of a distance tree using UPGMA (Unweighted Pair Group Method with Arithmetic Mean) (b) Distance tree in which overlapping library clones were clustered. Arrows indicate five clades with contiguous clones. Clade 1 represents the *Northern Lights* cluster; clade 2 the *Milky Way* cluster, clade 3 is a cluster of unknown origin; clade 4 the *Orion* cluster; clade 5 the *Southern Cross* cluster. Clones, which could not be assigned to a contig, are indicated with an asterisk; (c) Fingerprint pattern of contiguous PCR fingerprinted library clones.

fingerprint data were obtained by using the five/ four-cutter restriction enzyme combination ApoI/ MseI which allowed the unambiguous location of clones into one contig. Some of the clones appeared in separate clades with unrelated fingerprints and could not be assigned to Hcr9 contigs. Additional hybridisation and PCR analysis showed that these clones did not contain Hcr9 sequences and were false-positives from the library screening. Positioning fingerprinted clones according to the position in this tree enabled us to visually confirm the order of clones in a contig (Figure 1). With this method we could efficiently construct five contigs.

Positioning of contigs on the tomato genetic map

Based on the perfect sequence homology of *Hcr9*derived PCR products with published *Hcr9* sequences, three contigs were assigned to the *NL*, MW, or SC Hcr9 cluster. The fourth contig, spanning a 41 kb genomic DNA region, comprised the CT116 marker and therefore covers the ORlocus (Figure 2a). The fifth contig with two overlapping clones contained one Hcr9 of unknown origin. Physical overlap with one of the other contigs was absent. This contig may represent the AU locus of the Cf-Ecp2 haplotype.

The Cf-Ecp2 Orion locus

The *Cf-Ecp2 OR* cluster represented by pBlueStar clones 19, 49 and J was completely sequenced. In the initial physical alignment, clone 19 was overlapping with clone 49 by three shared *ApoI/ MseI* markers. Remarkably, the consensus DNA sequence of clone 19 and 49 could not be aligned. Analysis of both sequences showed that this was due to a perfect DNA repeat encompassing both clones. Therefore, additional selected cosmid



Figure 2. Physical map of the *Cf-Ecp2* locus. (a) A 41 kb contig spanning the *Orion Cf-Ecp2* resistance cluster was constructed with pBlueStar clones (solid lines) and pCLD04541 cosmid clones (dashed lines). The location of the CT116 CAPS marker is indicated by a diamond (\diamond). (b) A 29 kb segment was sequenced. The position and orientation of three intronless *Hcr9* ORFs is indicated by solid arrowed boxes. The position of the 26S proteasome regulatory subunit S12 exons are shown by connected boxes and triangle. The perfect tandem repeats are indicated by horizontal grey boxes.

clones were fingerprinted to assign them to Hcr9 contigs. After additional restriction mapping, DNA hybridisation and sequencing of Hcr9-derived PCR products, three binary cosmid clones were identified which fitted in the OR contig. As a result, clone 19 and 49 showed to be separated by a 1 kb gap. A part of clone 4.8G was PCR-amplified and sequenced to close this sequence gap. Finally, a complete 29 kb sequence was obtained for the complete *Cf-Ecp2 OR* cluster.

Four putative open reading frames (ORFs) present in the Cf-Ecp2 OR cluster are shown in Figure 2b. The CT116 CAPS marker is located in the first intron of a gene encoding the 26S proteasome regulatory subunit S12 (*E*-value 5e - 21) and does not cover the open reading frame. The 26S proteasome is a 2 MDa proteolytic complex that degrades ubiquitinylated protein conjugates (Voges et al. 1999; Smalle et al. 2004). The proteasome pathway degrades proteins that arise from synthetic errors, spontaneous denaturation, freeradical-induced damage, improper processing or diseases (Hershko and Ciechanover 1998). There is no evidence that this gene, of which the openreading frame is very conserved in the plant kingdom, is involved in the recognition of the C. fulvum Ecp2 elicitor.

The major part of the *OR* sequence contains three genes homologous to *Hcr9s*. These encode membrane-anchored receptor-like proteins with 27 extracellular LRRs and a short cytoplasmic tail (Figure 3). Following the nomenclature used by Parniske and Jones (1999), these genes were designated OR2A, OR2B and OR2C, after their genetic location *Orion*, their putative involvement in Ecp2 recognition and the alphabetic order of the gene in the *OR* cluster. The *OR* cluster contains a 2625 bp perfect tandem repeat including the promoter region and the first part of the coding region (432 bp) of *OR2A* and *OR2B*.

Typical for Hcr9 proteins, the majority of the amino acid variation between members of this family is present in the B-domain and the first 17 LRRs of the C-domain. The alignment of the three newly identified Hcr9s shows that the aminoacid variation is spread throughout the protein (Figure 3). The signal sequence has only $\pm 50\%$ amino-acid homology with Cf-9 but still resembles a putative signal peptide for extracellular targeting. The cysteine-rich B-domain of OR2A/OR2B has low sequence homology with Cf-9 but the cysteine residues are conserved. In OR2C, a stretch of 17 amino acids is absent, including one cysteine residue. In the majority of the first 17 LRRs, amino-acid substitutions occur at the putative solvent-exposed domains (xxLxLxx) of LRRs. The amino acid variation in the OR2 proteins continues in the C-terminal part, including LRRs 18-24, the loop-out and the acidic E-domain.

Orthologous OR loci

To study the complexity of *OR Hcr9* clusters, an *Hcr9*-specific fingerprint method was developed



Figure 3. Alignment of the Cf-9, OR2A, OR2B and OR2C proteins. Amino acid residues identical to Cf-9 are indicated with solid black background. Sequence gaps inserted to maintain the alignment are indicated by dashes. Domains are indicated above the sequence as follows: SP – signal peptide (A-domain); B – cysteine-rich domain, cysteine residues are indicated with an asterisk; LRR 1 to 27 (C-domain), various β -sheets are indicated (consensus xxLxLxx) each of which contains five solvent-exposed amino acid residues (x); D – domain without obvious features; E – acidic domain; TM – putative transmembrane domain; G – basic domain, representing the short, putative, cytoplasmic tail.



Figure 4. PCR-amplification strategy for the identification of *Orion* (*OR*) orthologous *Hcr9* genes and for the confirmation of physical linkage of *OR2C* orthologous genes with CT116. In the schematic representation of the *Cf-Ecp2 OR* cluster, the position and the orientation of the three *Hcr9s* are indicated by arrowed boxes, the CT116 CAPS marker is indicated by a diamond (\diamond). Triangles indicate annealing position and direction of primers. For further details see Experimental Procedures.

(De Kock 2004). In a mapping population segregating for Cf-Ecp2 resistance, certain Hcr9 markers cosegregated with Cf-Ecp2 resistance, while one Hcr9 marker was in repulsion phase with Cf-*Ecp2* resistance. Probably, this *Hcr9* marker corresponds to an orthologous gene in the OR locus of the susceptible parent MM-Cf0. The OR clusters in other haplotypes were subsequently investigated. The low sequence homology at primerannealing site of the OR Hcr9s compared to the consensus sequence of Hcr9s enabled us to design OR specific primers that were used to identify orthologous OR genes in other Lycopersicon accessions. By a PCR-based cloning strategy using primer sets specific for each of the three OR2s (Figure 4), orthologous OR Hcr9s from Cf0-, Cf-Ecp3 and Cf-Ecp5 haplotypes were identified. Following the above nomenclature, these genes were designated after their genetic location Orion, the Cf-haplotype (Cf0, Cf-Ecp3 and Cf-Ecp5) and the alphabetic order of the gene in the OR cluster. The prefix Ψ indicates a pseudogene. The organisation of all the 32 presently known *Hcr9*s is depicted in Figure 5.

The OR orthologue in Cf-0, designated $\Psi OR0A$, is homologous to OR2C (99.7% sequence homology) but has a 10 bp deletion resulting in a frame shift. The MM-Cf-Ecp3 and MM-Cf-Ecp5 orthologues of OR2C (designated Ψ OR3B and Ψ OR5A, respectively) showed 99.5% and 99.1% sequence homology to OR2C. Both genes encode a truncated Hcr9 caused by a point mutation resulting in a stop-codon (Cf-Ecp3 haplotype) or a nucleotide insertion (Cf-Ecp5 haplotype). By using primer sets specific for OR2A, no orthologous genes in other haplotypes were identified, while one orthologous gene in the Cf-Ecp3 OR cluster was identified by using a primer set specific for OR2B designated OR3A. The encoded protein showed 92% sequence homology to OR2B. The Cf-Ecp3 and Cf-Ecp5 haplotypes were not studied by RGA-fingerprint analysis. Therefore, the presence of additional *Hcr9*s at these loci cannot be excluded.

Physical linkage of OR3A and $\Psi OR3B$ to the CT116 marker was proven by the analysis of *Cf-Ecp3* genomic library clones harbouring the *Cf-Ecp3 OR* locus (Y. Yinan, personal communication). Finally, physical linkage of $\Psi OR0A$, $\Psi OR3B$ and $\Psi OR5A$ to CT116 was investigated by PCR analyses. The 4.2 kb DNA fragment that spans the distance between these *OR2C* orthologous genes and the CT116 locus could be PCR-amplified from all tested haplotypes. With these results we show the existence of orthologous gene clusters at the *OR* locus as was previously described for the *MW* cluster.

Discussion

Isolation and characterisation of binary cosmid library clones

In a genomic library of more than five genome equivalents, statistically more than 99% of the genome should be covered by cosmid library clones. In our study, the constructed binary cosmid library was incomplete at the OR locus. Therefore, it seemed not possible to isolate contiguous binary cosmid clones covering the complete OR cluster. Two additional reasons that prompted us to decide to construct a new genomic library in another vector were (*i*) the risk that *Cf-Ecp2* candidates that do not perfectly match to the degenerate *Hcr9* primers could have been



Figure 5. Map position, genetic distance (cM) and physical structure of the Northern Lights, Milky Way, Aurora, Orion and Southern Cross loci harbouring clusters of Hcr9s on the short arm of chromosome 1. (a) A genetic map of the various clusters showing the position of five Hcr9 loci relative to each other. (b) The physical organisation of each Hcr9 cluster is shown. (c) The Cf resistance genes present in the cluster are indicated. Arrowed boxes indicate the relative position and orientation of Hcr9s; white arrowed box: Hcr9 pseudogene; grey arrowed box: Hcr9 with unknown function; black arrowed box: Hcr9 resistance gene. Hcr9 clusters are derived from different haplotypes: NL0: L. esculentum Cf0; MW0: L. esculentum Cf0; MW4: L. hirsutum Cf4; MW9: L. pimpinellifolium Cf9; MW9_{DC}: L. pimpinellifolium 9DC (Kruijt et al. 2004). The organisation of the OR cluster was determined in this study: OR0: L. esculentum Cf0; OR2: L. pimpinellifolium Cf-Ecp2; OR3: L. pimpinellifolium Cf-Ecp3; OR5: L. pimpinellifolium Cf-Ecp5. SC0: L. esculentum Cf0. The organisation of the Aurora cluster is unknown. The CT116 CAPS marker at the Orion locus is indicated by a diamond (\diamond); RETRO denotes a retrotransposon insertion in the NL cluster.

missed in the PCR-selection of clones; (*ii*) DNAinstability of the selected cosmid inserts in *A. tumefaciens* hampered functional analysis of candidate *Cf-Ecp2* genes. Instability of insert-DNA in the binary cosmid vector pCLD04541 upon transfer to Agrobacterium has previously also been reported by Dixon et al. (1996). Although the vector pCLD04541 has frequently been used for the cloning of resistance genes, e.g. *Cf-2, Cf-4, Cf-5, Hero* (Dixon et al. 1996; Thomas et al. 1997; Dixon et al. 1998; Ernst et al. 2002), this vector was not suitable to clone *Cf-Ecp2*.

Isolation and contig construction of pBlueStar clones

To avoid the problems described above, a larger, 16-genome equivalent library in λ BlueStar was made and phages were screened by DNA hybridisation. After restriction-mediated PCR fingerprinting and contig calculation, selected clones were positioned into five different *Hcr9*-containing contigs representing the known *NL*, *MW* and *SC Hcr9* clusters and the *OR Hcr9* cluster. It is possible that the fifth contig belongs to the *AU* locus. The restriction-mediated PCR fingerprinting and subsequent calculation of contigs appeared to be a very efficient and reliable method for contig construction. Our method follows the same strategy of FPC (fingerprinted contigs) described by Soderlund et al. (1997), but a different type of fingerprint data is used and contig calculation is less complex. Selection of frequent or rare cutting restriction enzymes for fingerprinting is based on the required resolution and sizes of template DNA. After all, integration of two genomic libraries representing in total 21 genome equivalents was necessary for the contig construction and to sequence the *OR Hcr9* cluster.

The Cf-Ecp2 Orion cluster

The contig is at one side flanked by the CT116 CAPS marker, but the physical end on the other site of the contig remains obscure and thereby the number of *Hcr9*s was not known. To confirm the number of *Hcr9*s in the *OR* cluster, an *Hcr9* resistance gene analogue (RGA) fingerprint method was developed (De Kock 2004). With this method *Hcr9* gene-specific markers are generated. All *Hcr9* markers which cosegregated with *Cf-Ecp2* resistance corresponded with the three *Hcr9*s of the *OR* contig. Therefore, we concluded that the *Cf-Ecp2 OR* cluster contains three *Hcr9*s.

The *Cf-Ecp2 OR* cluster harbours a large duplication of 2.6 kb, which is probably a result of a recent intergenic unequal crossing over. Interestingly, the first 576 bp of this duplicated region shows high sequence homology (92%) with the promoter region of *Hero*, an NBS-LRR resistance gene located on chromosome 4 conferring broad spectrum resistance against potato cyst nematodes (Ernst et al. 2002). For *Hero*, *OR2A* and *OR2B* the conserved 576 bp region is located approximately 1.5 kb upstream of the ATG start codon and may therefore act as cis-acting binding domain that regulates the transcriptional activity of the upstream gene.

The OR Hcr9 proteins show the characteristic domains of plasmamembrane-anchored glycoproteins of which the extracytoplasmic domain mainly consists of LRRs. The LRR domains of R proteins were suggested to be involved in the recognition of the corresponding elicitor or co-acting proteins (Jones and Jones 1996). Consistent with this theory, it was found that Hcr9 proteins with specificity for different Avr factors predominantly differ in amino acid residues located at putative solvent-exposed positions in the N-terminal LRRs (Parniske et al. 1997, Van der Hoorn et al. 2001b; Wulff et al. 2001). However, in contrast to the previously known Hcr9 proteins, the variation in the OR Hcr9 proteins continues in the C-terminal LRRs. Additionally, the loop-out and the acidic E-domain vary, whereas these domains are rather conserved in the NL, MW, SC Hcr9 proteins (Figure 6). The loop-out of the BRI1 receptor protein, a receptor-like kinase located on the cell surface that is involved in brassinosteroid signalling (Li and Chory 1997; Wang and He 2004), was proven to facilitate brassinosteroid binding. Therefore, the abundant variation in the loop-out domain and the other C-terminal domains of the OR Hcr9s may indicate that elicitor perception and signal transduction mediated by the OR Hcr9s is different compared to the other Hcr9s.

Orthologous Orion Hcr9 clusters

The OR Hcr9s are highly homologous. OR0A is present in the Cf-0 L. esculentum haplotype, whereas the other genes are from different L. pimpinellifolium introgressions. Apparently, these sequences are very conserved in two Lycopersicon species although only OR2C encodes a full-length protein. Polymorphic sites can distinguish the individual members and allow speculation about the origin and relation to other members of this gene family. Based on the shared polymorphic sites, the OR Hcr9s are subsequently most related to $\Psi NL0A$, $\Psi NL0B$, NL0D and NL0E. The Hcr9s in the OR cluster represent a distinct subgroup of Hcr9s when the sequences are aligned with NL, MW, SC Hcr9s and Hcr2s (Figure 7). In contrast, the intergenic regions are very unique for the ORlocus. The MW and SC clusters harbour several LipoxygenaseC (LoxC) exons that are thought to have coduplicated with Hcr9s (Parniske et al. 1997). These LoxC sequences are absent in the ORcluster as they are also absent in the NL cluster. Parniske and Jones (1999) suggested that the divergence of the NL Hcr9s was probably a consequence of its genetic isolation. This suggestion is now contradicted by our finding of the relative



Figure 6. Schematic presentation of amino acid similarity of the *Cf* resistance proteins Cf-4, Hcr9-4E and the Orion Hcr9 protein OR2A, OR2B and OR2C compared to the Cf-9 resistance protein; structural protein domains: SP – signal peptide; B – cystein-rich domain; C – domain containing 27 leucine-rich-repeats (LRRs), LO – Loop Out; D – domain without conspicuous features; E – acidic domain; TM – putative transmembrane domain; G – basic cytoplasmic domain. Grey scale indicates the level of amino acid similarity compared to the Cf-9 protein.



Figure 7. Phylogenetic relationships between Hcr9s and Hcr2s. The nucleotide sequences were aligned using the Clustal method (Higgins and Sharp 1989) and the neighbour-joining method was employed to construct a phylogenetic tree. Three different clades are constructed representing (*i*) the *NL*, *MW*, *SC Hcr9s*, (*ii*) the *OR Hcr9s* and (*iii*) the *Hcr2s*. The scale bar indicates the degree of nucleotide dissimilarity.

high homology of the OR Hcr9s to the NL Hcr9s, although the OR cluster is located between the MW and SC cluster.

Homology searches in databases using Cf gene and protein sequences showed that numerous sequences highly homologous to Cf genes (Evalue < 1e - 50 at nucleotide level) are present in Lycopersicon, Solanum and Capsicum species. Interestingly, sequences most homologues to the OR Hcr9s are not found in Lycopersicon species, but are present in Solanum tuberosum. This suggests the existence of common ancestral ORgenes before Lycopersicon and Solanum speciation and indicates that the unique features of the OR Hcr9 genes remained conserved during evolution.

Depending on the haplotype, the identified OR *Hcr9s* are candidate genes for *Cf-Ecp2* and *Cf-Ecp3* function. Complementation analysis with these candidate *Cf-Ecp2* and *Cf-Ecp3* genes has to reveal which genes are involved in the perception of the *C. fulvum* elicitor Ecp2 and Ecp3, respectively and trigger HR-based resistance.

Experimental procedures

pCLD04541 binary cosmid library construction and screening

Genomic DNA was isolated according to Van der Beek et al. (1992) from four-week-old leaves of the breeding line Ontario 7518 (Cf18) showing Cf-Ecp2-mediated resistance (Laugé et al. 1998). DNA was partially digested with Sau3A I to an average size of 40 kb. Partially filled-in insert DNA (1 µg) was ligated at 4 °C for 16 h in a total volume of 10 µl with 500 ng of XhoI digested and partially filled-in binary cosmid vector pCLD04541 (Dixon et al. 1996). Ligated DNA was packaged using commercial extracts with size-selection (GigapackIII XL, Stratagene) according to manufacturer's instructions and transfected to XL1-Blue MRA Escherichia coli (Stratagene). Recombinant bacteria were plated onto agar at a density of 1000-2000 bacteria per plate. After growth at 37 °C, the bacteria of each plate were pooled into 5 ml of LB medium. Subsequently, 4 ml was used for cosmid DNA isolation, while the remainder was kept as glycerol stock. The entire library consisted of 2.7×10^5

clones in 180 pools representing 5.6 haploid genome equivalents based on an average insert size of 20 kb. Cosmid pools were screened by PCR with primers of the CT116 CAPS marker (Bonnema et al. 1997) and with degenerate primers which amplify LRR 1 to 17 of *Hcr9*s (HCR9C1F: 5'-catgggatggmrttsattgtgac-3' and HCR9C1R: 5'catwgtgggattgtyccctcc-3'). Pools that yielded a PCR product were selected. To isolate single clones, 7.5×10^3 bacteria of selected pools were screened for hybridisation with the two PCR products. Plasmid DNA of selected bacteria was isolated for further analysis.

λ -BlueStar library construction and screening

Genomic DNA from 4-week-old leaves of the breeding line Ontario 7518 (Cf18) showing Cf-Ecp2-mediated resistance (Laugé et al. 1998) was isolated according to the protocol described of Van der Beek et al. (1992). DNA was partially digested with Sau3A I to an average size of 40 kb and size-fractionated on a 10-40% sucrose gradient (Sambrook et al. 1989). Fractionated insert DNA with an average size of 20 kb was ligated at 4 °C for 16 h with 0.5 µg of BamHIdigested, dephosphorylated λ BlueStar arms (Novagen). Ligated DNA was packaged using commercial extracts with size-selecting features (GigapackIII XL, Stratagene) according to manufacturer's instructions. Phages were transfected to host strain ER1647 (Novagen). The entire library consisted of 1.1×10^6 phages representing 16 haploid genome equivalents based on an experimental average insert size of 15 kb. Phages were screened by hybridisation with the CT116 probe and a Cf-9 probe covering the entire gene. Selected phages were automatically subcloned into plasmid by Cre-mediated excision from λ BlueStar in host strain BM25.8 (Novagen). Plasmid DNA of selected bacteria was isolated for further analysis.

Restriction-mediated PCR fingerprinting and contig construction

To produce clone-specific markers, a restrictionmediated PCR fingerprinting method was optimised. Basically, the protocol consists of four steps: (1) digestion of plasmid DNA with two restriction enzymes; (2) ligation of matching adapters to sticky ends (3) pre-amplification and (4) labelled amplification which allows sizeseparation on sequencing type gels. For both plasmid- and cosmid-library clones, 50 ng DNA was digested with EcoRI or ApoI and MseI at 37 °C. Simultaneously, adapters compatible to the restriction site were ligated. The EcoRI-adapter, which is also compatible to the ApoI restriction site, originated from the AFLP-protocol (Vos et al. 1995), the adapter compatible to the MseI site was adapted from the Universal Genome-Walker kit (Clontech, Palo Alto, CA). PCR amplification was essentially performed according to the standard AFLP protocol (Vos et al. 1995) on 10 times diluted restriction-ligation mixture. E-1 EX (5'-ctcgtagactgcgtaccaatt-3') and the AP1 (5'- taatacactcactatagggc-3') were used as primer set. A second, nested PCR using an fluorescently labelled, internal primer AP2 (5'-IRD700actatagggcacgcgtgga-3') in combination with the E-1 EX-primer were performed on 25 times diluted amplification product of the first PCR. Samples were denatured and separated on a 5.5% polyacrylamide sequencing type gels using LI-COR Global IR² Systems. The presence or absence of polymorphic bands was scored by visual interpretation of outputs of the LI-COR system using the image interpretation software CRoss-CHECKER (Buntjer 2000; http://www.dpw.wau.nl/ pv/pub/CrossCheck/download.html). The resulting binary data set was subsequently used for clustering by UPGMA (Unweighted Pair Group Method with Arithmetic Mean) using the software package NTSYSpc2.0 (Applied Biostatistics Inc.). UPGMA is the simplest method of distance tree construction. The calculated phylogenetic tree should represent contiguous clones clustered in clades. To confirm the position of each clone in a clade, fingerprinted samples were re-loaded on a gel in the order as indicated in the phylogenetic tree. A combination of restriction mapping, PCR analysis and DNA hybridisation resulted in additional data used for accurate aligning of library clones into a single contig. The origin of Hcr9s located on a library clone was identified by HinfI, AvaII or TaqI digestion of the PCR amplified region of *Hcr9s* containing LRR 1 to 17 (primers: HCR9C1F/-R) and subsequently size-separation on 1.5% agarose gel.

Sequencing and sequence analysis

Selected library clones were sequenced by shotgun sequencing or by transposon-based sequencing using the GPS-LS linker scanning system (New England Biolabs). Greenomics (Wageningen, The Netherlands) performed sequencing of pBlueStar library clones. Evaluation of sequencing data and construction of sequence contigs was performed with Lasergene (DNASTAR Inc., Madison, WI, USA) software packages. PCR products selected to be sequenced were subcloned into pGEM-T Easy (Promega) or PCR-Script (Stratagene). Sequencing of these constructs and insequencing of the insert was done by BaseClear (Leiden, The Netherlands). DNA sequence similarity analysis was performed using BLASTN and BLASTX (Altschul et al. 1997). The presence of retrotransposon sequences or repeated sequences of other nature was analysed by The TIGR Plant Repeat Database (http://www.tigr.org/tdb/e2k1/plant.repeats/index.shtml). Promoter regions and polyA signal sites were analysed with the Gene-Builder prediction program (http://l25.itba. mi.cnr.it/~webgene/genebuilder). Protein structure predictions were performed using publicly available programs (http://www.expasy.ch/ tools), signal peptide motif was identified by SignalP V1.1 (http://www.cbs.dtu.dk/services/ SignalP).

Identification of orthologous Orion Hcr9s

Orthologous Hcr9 genes were PCR-amplified using OR Hcr9-specific primers sets with Pfu-*Turbo* proofreading DNA polymerase (Stratagene) at $T_{\rm m} = 50$ °C, 30 cycli, using genomic DNA of tomato haplotypes Cf0 (MoneyMaker), Cf-Ecp2 breeding line Ontario 7518 (Cf18), Cf-Ecp3 (L. esculentum G1.1153) and Cf-Ecp5 (L. esculentum G1.1161) and selected Cf-Ecp2, Cf-Ecp3 or Cf-Ecp5 genomic library clones as template and an extension time of 3.5 min at 72 °C. Tomato Cf-Ecp3 and Cf-Ecp5 genomic libraries were donated by Y.Yuan and F. Meijer-Dekens, respectively (Wageningen University, The Netherlands). Positions of the primer sets are depicted in Figure 5. The forward primers were located at the first 30 nucleotides of a specific Hcr9(OR2ABf1: 5'-atgggttacgtaaaacttgtttttttaatg-'3, OR2Cf: 5'-atgggctacgtagaccttgtatttttatg-3'), the reverse primer were located at the gene specific 3' untranscribed region (utr) (OR2A-utr: 5'-ctaatgcttttattacttagggaaatgcac-3', OR2B-utr: 5'-atagagattaagttgaatacctggagg-3', OR2C-utr: 5'-gaaaaatatcaagttgaatacctggag-3'). Partial Cf-Ecp3 OR sequences (Y. Yinan, unpublished data) were aligned to optimise primer sequences. PCR-amplification products were cloned into pGEM-T (Promega) and DNA sequencing was performed by BaseClear (Leiden, The Netherlands). Two independent clones per PCRproduct were completely sequenced to avoid base pair changes introduced during PCR. To verify the physical linkage of OR2C orthologous genes with the CT116 CAPS marker, a PCR analysis was performed using the forward primer ORCutr-f, located at the 3'utr region an OR2C orthologue (ORCutr-f: 5'-aacctccaggtattcaacttg-3') and reverse primer in the CT116 CAPS locus (CT116F2r 5'-ttaccttctcaatcggcctcg-3'). PCR-amplification was performed on 200 ng of genomic DNA or 20 ng of plasmid DNA in 25 µL reaction volume using Supertaq (HT Biotechnology) DNA polymerase at annealing temperatures of 48 °C and an extension time of five minutes at 72 °C. PCRamplification products were checked for size on a 0.8% agarose gel.

Acknowledgements

We are grateful to Yuan Yinan, Marjan Bovers and Fien Meijer-Dekers for supplying the Cf-Ecp tomato genomic libraries. We acknowledge Matthieu Joosten for critically reading the manuscript. This project is sponsored by the Dutch Technology Foundation (STW, grant No. WGC5107) and Dutch breeding companies.

References

- Altschul S.M., Madden T.L., Schäffer A.A., Zhang J., Zhang Z., Miller W. and Lipman D.J. 1997. Gapped BLAST and PSI-BLAST: a new generation of protein database search programs. Nucl. Acids Res. 25: 3389–3402.
- Bonnema G., Schipper D., Van Heusden S., Zabel P. and Lindhout P. 1997. Tomato chromosome 1: high resolution genetic and physical mapping of the short arm of and interspecific *Lycopersicon esculentum* × *Lycopersicon peruvianum* cross. Mol. Gen. Genet 253: 455–462.
- Balint-Kurti P.J., Dixon M.S., Jones D.A., Norcott K.A. and Jones J.D.G. 1994. RFLP linkage analysis of the Cf-4 and

Cf-9 genes for resistance to *Cladosporium fulvum* in tomato. Theor. Appl. Genet. 88: 691–700.

- Bent A.F., Kunkel B.N., Dahlbeck D., Brown K.L., Schmidt R., Giraudat J., Leung J. and Staskawicz B.J. 1994. RPS2 of *Arabidopsis thaliana*: a leucine-rich repeat class of plant disease resistance genes. Science 265: 1856–1860.
- Buntjer J.B. 2000. CROSSCHECKER: computer-assisted scoring of genetic AFLP data. In: Plant & Animal Genome VIII Conference. San Diego, CA, January 9–12 2000. http:// www.intl-pag.org/pag/8/abstracts/pag8664.html.
- De Kock M.J.D. 2004. A resustance gene analogue fingerprint method facilitating mapping, cloning and mRNA profiling of tomato *Cf*genes. Thesis, Wageningen University.
- De Kock M.J.D., Iskandar H.M., Brandwagt B.F., Laugé R., De Wit P.J.G.M. and Lindhout P. 2004. Recognition of *Cladosporium fulvum* Ecp2 elicitor by non-host *Nicotiana* spp. Is mediated by a single dominant gene that is not homologous to known *Cf* genes. Mol. Plant Pathol. 5: 397–408.
- Dixon M.S., Hatzixanthis K., Jones D.A., Harrison K. and Jones J.D. 1998. The tomato Cf-5 disease resistance gene and six homologs show pronounced allelic variation in leucinerich repeat copy number. Plant Cell 11: 1915–1925.
- Dixon M.S., Jones D.A., Keddie J.S., Thomas C.M., Harrison K. and Jones J.D.G. 1996. The tomato Cf-2 disease resistance locus comprises two functional genes encoding leucine-rich repeat proteins. Cell 84: 451–459.
- Ernst K., Kumar A., Kriseleit D., Kloos D.U., Phillips M.S. and Ganal M.W. 2002. The broad-spectrum potato cyst nematode resistance gene (*Hero*) from tomato is the only member of a large gene family of NBS-LRR genes with an unusual amino acid repeat in the LRR region. Plant J. 31: 127–136.
- Haanstra J.P.W., Laugé R., Meijer-Dekens F., Bonnema G., De Wit P.J.G.M. and Lindhout P. 1999. The *Cf-Ecp2* gene is linked to, but not part of the *Cf-4/}Cf-9* cluster on the short arm of chromosome 1 of tomato. Mol. Gen. Genet. 262: 839–845.
- Haanstra J.P.W., Meijer-Dekens F., Laugé R., Seetanah D.C., Joosten M.H.A.J., De Wit P.J.G.M. and Lindhout P. 2000. Mapping strategy for resistance genes against *Cladosporium fulvum* on the short arm of chromosome 1 of tomato: *Cf*-*Ecp5* near the *Hcr9* Milky Way cluster. Theor. Appl. Genet. 101: 661–668.
- Hershko A. and Ciechanover A. 1998. The ubiquitin system. Annu. Rev. Biochem. 67: 425–479.
- Higgins D.G. and Sharp P.M. 1989. Fast and sensitive multiple sequence alignments on a microcomputer. Comput. Appl. Biosci. 2: 151–153.
- Jones D.A. and Jones J.D.G. 1996. The role of leucine-rich repeat proteins in plant defences. Adv. Bot. Res. 24: 91–167.
- Jones D.A., Thomas C.M., Hammond-Kosack K.E., Balint-Kurti P.J. and Jones J.D.G. 1994. Isolation of the tomato *Cf-9* gene for resistance to *Cladosporium fulvum* by transposon tagging. Science 266: 789–793.
- Joosten M.H.A.J. and De Wit P.J.G.M. 1999. The tomato *Cladosporium fulvum* interaction: a versatile experimental system to study plant–pathogen interactions. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 37: 335–367.
- Kruijt M., Brandwagt B.F. and De Wit P.J.G.M. 2004. Rearrangements in the *Cf*-9 disease resistance gene cluster of wild tomato have resulted in three genes that mediate Avr9 responsiveness. Genetics 168: 1655–1663.

- Laugé R., Goodwin P.H., De Wit P.J.G.M. and Joosten M.H.A.J. 2000. Specific HR-associated recognition of secreted proteins from *Cladosporium fulvum* occurs in both host and non-host plants. Plant J. 23: 735–745.
- Laugé R., Joosten M.H.A.J., Haanstra J.P.W., Goodwin P.H., Lindhout P. and De Wit P.J.G.M. 1998. Successful search for a resistance gene in tomato targeted against a virulence factor of a fungal pathogen. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 95: 9014–9018.
- Laugé R., Joosten M.H.A.J., Van der Ackerveken G.F.J.M., Van der Broek H.W.J. and De Wit P.J.G.M. 1997. The in planta-produced extracellular proteins Ecp1 and Ecp2 of *Cladosporium fulvum* are virulence factors. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 10: 725–734.
- Li J. and Chory 1997. A putative leucine-rich repeat receptor kinase involved in brassinosteroid signal transduction. Cell 90: 929–938.
- Luderer R., Takken F.L., De Wit P.J.G.M. and Joosten M.H.A.J. 2002. *Cladosporium fulvum* overcomes *Cf-2*-mediated resistance by producing truncated Avr2 elicitor molecules. Mol. Microbiol. 45: 875–884.
- Parniske M., Hammond-Kosack K.E., Golstein C., Thomas C.M., Jones D.A., Harrison K., Wulff B.B.H. and Jones J.D.G. 1997. Novel disease resistance specificities result from sequence exchange between tandemly repeated genes at the *Cf*-4/9 locus of tomato. Cell 91: 821–832.
- Parniske M. and Jones J.D.G. 1999. Recombination between diverged cluster of the tomato *Cf-9* plant disease resistance gene family. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 86: 5850–5855.
- Parniske M., Wulff B.B.H., Bonnema G., Thomas C.M., Jones D.A. and Jones J.D.G. 1999. Homologues of the *Cf-9* disease resistance gene (*Hcr9s*) are present at multiple loci on the short arm of tomato chromosome 1. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 12: 93–102.
- Sambrook J., Fritsch E.F. and Maniatis T.T. 1989. Molecular Cloning: A Laboratory Manual, 2nd ed. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press, Cold Spring Harbor, NY.
- Smalle J. and Vierstra R.D. 2004. The ubiquitin 26S proteasome proteolitic pathway. Annu. Rev. Plant Biol. 55: 555–590.
- Soderlund C., Longden I. and Mott R. 1997. FPC: a system for building contigs from restriction fingerprinted clones. CAB-IOS 13: 523–535.
- Takken F.L.W., Schipper D., Nijkamp H.J.J. and Hille J. 1998. Identification and *Ds*-tagged isolation of a new gene at the *Cf-4* locus of tomato involved in disease resistance to *Cladosporium fulvum* race 5. Plant J. 14: 401–411.
- Thomas C.M., Jones D.A., Parniske M., Harrison K., Balint-Kurti P.J., Hatzixanthis K. and Jones J.D.G. 1997. Characterization of the tomato Cf-4 gene for resistance to Cladosporium fulvum

identifies sequences that determine recognitional specificity in *Cf-4* and *Cf-9*. Plant Cell 9: 2209–2224.

- Van den Ackerveken G.F.J.M., Van Kan J.A.L., Joosten M.H.A.J., Muisers J.M., Verbakel H.M. and De Wit P.J.G.M. 1993. Characterization of two putative pathogenicity genes of the fungal tomato pathogen *Cladosporium fulvum*. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 6: 210–215.
- Van der Beek J.G., Verkerk R., Zabel P. and Lindhout P. 1992. Mapping strategy for resistance genes in tomato based on RFLPs between cultivars: *Cf-9* (resistance to *Cladosporium fulvum*) on chromosome 1. Theor. Appl. Genet. 84: 106–112.
- Van der Hoorn R.A.L., Kruijt M., Roth R., Brandwagt B.F., Joosten M.H.A.J. and De Wit P.J.G.M. 2001a. Intragenic recombination generated two distinct *Cf* genes that mediate Avr9 recognition in the natural population of *Lycopersicon pimpinellifolium*. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 98: 10493– 10498.
- Van der Hoorn R.A.L., Roth R. and De Wit P.J.G.M. 2001b. Identification of distinct specificity determinants in resistance protein Cf-4 allows construction of a Cf-9 mutant that confers recognition of avirulence protein Avr4. Plant Cell 13: 273–285.
- Voges D., Zwickl P. and Baumeister W. 1999. The 26S proteasome: a molecular machine designed for controlled proteolysis. Annu. Rev. Biochem. 68: 1015–1068.
- Vos P., Hogers R., Bleeker M., Reijans M., Van de Lee T., Hornes M., Frijters A., Pot J., Peleman J., Kuiper M. and Zabeau M. 1995. AFLP: a new technique for DNA fingerprinting. Nucl. Acids Res. 23: 4407–4414.
- Wang Z.-Y. and He J.-X. 2004. Brassinosteroid signal transduction – choices of signals and receptors. Trends Plant Sci. 9: 91–96.
- Westerink N., Brandwagt B.F., De Wit P.J.G.M. and Joosten M.H.A.J. 2002. *Cladosporium fulvum* evades *Hcr9–4E*-mediated resistance by abolishing *Avr4E* expression or by modifying the Avr4E elicitor protein. Submitted.
- Wulff B.B.H., Thomas C.M., Smoker M., Grant M. and Jones J.D.G. 2001. Domain swamming and gene shuffling identify sequences required for induction of an Avr-dependent hypersensitive response by the tomato Cf-4 and Cf-9 proteins. Plant Cell 13: 255–272.
- Yuan Y., Haanstra J., Lindhout P. and Bonnema G. 2002. The *Cladosporium fulvum* resistance gene *Cf-Ecp3* is part of the *OR* cluster on the short arm of tomato chromosome 1. Mol. Breed. 10: 45–50.