

Review

Author(s): John Lees

Review by: John Lees

Source: *The Modern Language Review*, Vol. 12, No. 2 (Apr., 1917), pp. 244-245

Published by: [Modern Humanities Research Association](http://www.mhra.ac.uk)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3714144>

Accessed: 11-03-2016 13:56 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Modern Humanities Research Association is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Modern Language Review*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

considered. First, there is an inherent, perhaps subtle, but very important difference between the iambic and the trochaic measures of the great poets. We see them passing, in the same poem, from the one to the other consciously and with telling effect. We hold that so-called iambic movement, even in its simplest form, as in the beat of a hammer on an anvil, is different both in itself and in its effect upon the ear, from so-called trochaic movement. And this difference is not adequately or correctly represented by saying that the one measure has *Auftakt*, while the other is without it. In the second place a system of German metre cannot disregard historical practice. When, for example, Schiller frankly speaks of the blank verse of his *Don Carlos* and *Wallenstein* as 'Die Iamben,' is it scientific or helpful to say, 'Oh, no, these are not iambs, but *fünftaktige Verse mit Auftakt*'? We cannot always find out how a poet scanned his lines, but when we do know, then that settles the question for most lovers of poetry.

JOHN LEES.

ABERDEEN.

Goethe's Poems. Selected and annotated, with a Study of the Development of Goethe's Art and View of Life in his Lyrical Poetry. By MARTIN SCHÜTZE. Boston: Ginn and Co. 1916. 8vo. lxxxii + 277 pp.

This selection of Goethe's poems is arranged in a capricious order under such groupings as 'The Twelve Greatest Songs,' 'Songs of Individual Import,' 'Gesellige Lieder,' 'Folksongs,' 'Narrative Poems' (beginning with ballads and ending with *Alexis und Dora*), 'Odes' (which include the *Elegie*), 'Man and the Universe' (including poems of all kinds and periods), 'Sprüche,' etc. To say nothing of the mixture of English and German titles, this scheme leads to chaos in the study of Goethe's development. The reason given by the editor is that 'the imaginative and spontaneous reader who is forced to travel by the chronological road is fatigued before he completes the first stage of his journey.' In that case he had better leave the serious study of Goethe alone. Most readers, we should fancy, will be more fatigued by the eighty pages of Schütze's Introduction. All through the book the author's language is frequently non-English, frequently unintelligible. Speaking of Goethe in the social milieu of Lili Schönemann, he says, 'He was often imposed upon and silenced.' Is the writer thinking of *imponieren*? He calls Mignon an 'exquisite waif' and the 'guiltless result of an offence against nature.' *Hermann und Dorothea* is a 'burgher idyl.' He speaks of 'Goethe's gift of assimilating and transforming into beauty the intimations and failures of others.' Does 'intimations' stand for *Eingebungen*? Contrasting the songs of the Strassburg and the Weimar periods he says of the latter, 'Less momentous in substance, though not in subjects, they push further the subjective pressure of their modes of statement.' Or again, 'Goethe has not

succeeded in informing with the spirit of the remainder of the poem the petty and annoying actuality of his relations,' etc.

The whole tendency of Schütze's edition is to heap up criticism, old and new, rather than to be explanatory or helpful. And the criticism, when new, is often pedantic and purblind. The remarks on Anacreontic Poetry (pp. xix—xx) are very misleading. The comments on *An den Mond*, both in the Introduction and the Notes, are simply exasperating. 'The last two stanzas, in spite of their verbal beauty, represent Goethe's farthest lyrical descent towards spiritual barrenness.' In the latter part of the poem there is 'a sudden, shocking change of focus.' Why 'shocking'? And really there is no change of focus at all; already in the second verse we find mention of the bliss of friendship:

Wie des Freundes Auge mild
Über mein Geschick.

We think it a mistake to try to build up Goethe's 'view of life' from the few poems given under the heading 'Man and the Universe.' It is bound to be incomplete and frequently strains the general sense of the poems. The page and a half devoted to Goethe's 'metres' is ridiculously inadequate. On the other hand the notes are generally far too long, as on p. 226, where the editor tells the whole story of Paris and the golden apple to explain a stanza (p. 61) which needs no explanation.

Teachers and students in this country would be grateful for an edition of Goethe's Poems. But it might, we think, contain all the lyrics. Use should be made of Goethe's own hints and statements about his lyrics and lyrical method. The Introduction should give a clear view of the development of the poet. Several very important elements in Goethe's lyrical growth, e.g., the Hans Sachs studies, the dithyrambic tendency, the influence of the Italian Journey, his attitude to the Folksong and to nature at different periods, the influence of his critical friends, his humour, etc. are hardly touched upon by Schütze at all.

JOHN LEES.

ABERDEEN.

Friedrich Hölderlin, Gesammelte Werke. Herausgegeben von WILHELM BÖHM. Zweite vermehrte Auflage. Drei Bände. Jena: E. Diederichs. 1909—1911. 8vo. cxix + 331 pp.; 402 pp.; and 436 pp.

Hölderlin, Sämtliche Werke. Historisch-kritische Ausgabe unter Mitarbeit von FRIEDRICH SEEBASS, besorgt durch NORBERT VON HELLINGRATH. v. Bd. *Übersetzungen und Briefe, 1800—1806.* Munich: Georg Müller. 1913. 8vo. xii + 368 pp.

Friedrich Hölderlins Sämtliche Werke und Briefe. Kritisch-historische