University of North Alabama

UNA Scholarly Repository

Sociology and Family Studies Master's Theses   College of Arts and Sciences

Spring 2017

Giving Up the Microphone: The White Racial Framing of Race

Kimberly Lane
University of North Alabama, kimberly.lane6644@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.una.edu/sfsmt

GIVING UP THE MICROPHONE: THE WHITE RACIAL FRAMING OF RACE

by

KIMBERLY LANE

M.S., University of North Alabama, 2017

A THESIS

submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

MASTER OF SCIENCE

Department of Sociology and Family Studies
College of Arts and Sciences

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH ALABAMA
Florence, Alabama

2017

1

ABSTRACT

Drawing from Joe Feagin's *white racial frame*, the study employs critical discourse and framing analysis to examine ways in which two national newsprints- the *New York Times* and *Washington Post*- reinforced the framing of race in coverage of Trayvon Martin and the Black Lives Matter movement. Results showed that the news coverage reflected an encompassing pro-white/anti-Black master-frame that presented Black Americans as: inadequate, lawless, criminal, sassy, hypersexual, threatening, and biologically different. The news stories also contributed to the media's conceptualization of race within a paradigm of a liberty-and-justice American myth narrative. Conversely, whites were presented favorably as "protectors" and "virtuous." Episodic coverage was dominant in reports of Trayvon Martin and Black Lives Matter that often rationalized hardships, even one's own death. In order to understand how the white racial frame in the media transitions over time, an exploratory comparison was then implemented with historical coverage from 1955-1969 of the Civil Rights Movement and its catalyst, the Emmett Till murder. This exploration revealed dominant racial frames used during the Civil Rights Movement that were surprisingly similar to those of the Black lives Matter movement. However, there were some differences in the racial rhetoric within the white racial frame that transformed from overt to covert, and thus presented race as *more* violent, *more* radical, and *more* inferior during the Civil Rights Movement than the Black Lives Matter movement today. The transformation of racial frames informs the *Symbolic Racism Theory* by revealing that racism or racial framing in the media has not absolved, nor has it lessened, but has merely been redesigned in ways that link racism indirectly to whites' policy preferences and white ideologies. And, while this new racist framing certainly perpetuates racism, it does so

2

without explicitly referencing race. Few differences in framing between the two news sources

call into question the interconnectedness of U.S. mass media as a "propaganda model," and

U.S. political commentary as a "two-party horse race" in making salient the racial frames that

ratify the general interest of the economic elite, in whom they are indebted. In addition, the

white racial frame served to silence racial activism by employing sub-frames of guilty/innocent,

post-racial, fear mongering, obedience, and criminalization of racial activism, with only meagre

opportunity and space for Black counter-frames from everyday Black citizens to decriminalize

race. The study calls into question the modern mythicizing of Civil Rights Movement as the

"model nonviolent movement," as well as the modern idolizing of its leader, Martin Luther

King, Jr. as problematic to the maintenance of the modern Black Lives Matter movement.

Emergent findings, implications for navigating racial frames around the confines of the media,

and future research are discussed.

Table of Contents

List of Figures

List of Tables

Acknowledgment

First, I would like to thank Dr. Yaschica Williams, my research chair, for embarking on this scholarly journey with me and for her keen advice, guidance, and class that was consistently modeled. I am grateful for her willingness to share her research expertise with me and to connect me with resources and outside networking opportunities which bolstered my research project. I would also like to personally extend my gratitude to Dr. Paulk, a true "encourager," for believing in me in spite of my doubts and fears and to Dr. Andrea Hunt for her deep investment into equality and activism that has inspired me greatly. Thank you all for answering my oftentimes redundant questions (I tried to divide them among you all in order to spread them out)! Your timely assistance with the tedious work of conceptualizing my project was impressive. I will forever be grateful for your empathy, patience, and support, as I have had to overcome numerous obstacles, some unforeseen, and less ideal circumstances throughout my graduate program. Thank you all for meeting with me and blowing me away with your unshakable faith in me to succeed beyond graduate school.

There are others I would like to say a special thanks to and that is Dr. Ansley Quiros for assisting in the final draft review and Derek Malone, the Librarian at UNA, for taking the time (more than once) to assist me in constructing a comprehensive online search, ordering a historical database trial, schooling me in the new online program *Zotero*, and following up with me. My acknowledgment would be incomplete without mentioning Dr. James Gadberry, my undergraduate instructor of social theories at Athens University and the first person I had ever heard to speak passionately and intellectually about race, for directing me to my perfect major fit- sociology. Thank you for following up with emails to encourage my research process. I

would also like to thank, from the bottom of my heart, my fellow Black Lives Matter friends for "calling me out" on my white privilege and then welcoming me in as a friend and ally (you know who you are).

A special thanks should now go to Wanda Edgil, (my "cuz," my second Mom, my best-friend, my sister-like, and my go- to -person) for always believing in me, offering me valuable advice, and encouraging me, through words and modeling, to return to school regardless of the challenges. To my Mom, Dad, and dear Maw Maw for stepping up and assisting me in navigating my various roles while completing my research project, graduate school, and life in general, thank you- I love my family! In saving the best for last, I thank my son, Ethan Lane, my motivator, for being patient, encouraging, and for always cheering me on!

Dedication

I dedicate this thesis to my son, Ethan, that you may always appreciate the diverse values that underlie your culture that is the best of both worlds. My prayer is that you develop and maintain pride in all your various qualities that make you who you are, with race being one of many positive qualities. Thank you for keeping me on my toes, for loving me in spite of, and for motivating me to become a better person. Your charisma, personality, and love takes my breath away! You are my "reason," and so will it always be. I love you to the moon!

Researcher Positionality and Reflexivity

This research considers the positionality, assumptions, and values of the researcher to be an integral part of the research process. Positionality describes the researcher's overall world-view that surrounds the research foci and how this view shapes the scope of the research, whereas reflexivity examines the values and assumptions that undergird the process. Sikes (2004) urges researchers to spend some time thinking about their position, their own biased and rigid assumptions, and the ways these can interconnect to influence their thinking and research. Therefore, in hopes of achieving transparency, I will lay out my critical self-examination in form of a *position statement* and *reflection*.

As a white cisgender female and first- generation college student from the south who researches race and who actively resists in myself, the very ideas, beliefs, and values of white hegemony that I have critiqued throughout the study, I must acknowledge that I am still a product of my environment. However, my positionality has not been static throughout my life. In reflection, I acknowledge that I have been a part of reproducing inequality, yet there has also been times in my life that I have found actions on part of the dominant group (of which I am a part of) to be unacceptable.

I conduct research from a conflict perspective through a lens of critical race theory, and thus, I maintain that one of the reasons conversations about race are often silenced is because the power structure benefits from keeping the masses far from critical thought. I recognize that I cannot speak for people of color, yet my roles as a mother of a biracial child, social and non-partisan political activist, and researcher better position me to achieve critical consciousness. I, too, have learned through constructive criticism in personal conversations with members of

10

Black Lives Matter that what I can do as a white ally is to "drop the microphone" and follow, not lead, in order to listen to and learn from Black Americans.

As a member of the white middle-class in the south, I am considered superior and a member of the 'default race' by which all other races are judged. I have struggled many times in my life, yet still I understand that it has not been made more complex by race. I am not considered a second-class citizen in the country in which I live. I realize that I did nothing to earn this status; it was given to me. I also understand that no matter my level of critical consciousness that I have achieved from life circumstances and/or my educational journey, I still benefit from white supremacy. And, all of my views, as well as the aspects of my identity can affect the research process. At the same time, I cannot deny every aspect of my identity, lest I risk impeding my unique contributions to the research process.

Finally, my passion for social justice is my religion, and what that means to me is that it is my moral obligation. This is difficult within a society that frowns upon critical consciousness, in so much that relatively few realize they do not possess critical awareness.

> The politicization- coming to critical consciousness- is a difficult, "trying" process, one that demands that we give up set ways of thinking and being, that we shift our paradigms, that we open ourselves to the unknown, the unfamiliar. Undergoing this process, we learn what it means to struggle and in this effort we experience the dignity and integrity of being that comes with revolutionary change. If we do not change our consciousness, we cannot change our actions or demand change from others (hooks, 1989, p. 25).

I. INTRODUCTION

Many of the racial barriers that existed prior to the Civil Rights Movement have been eradicated due to the great strides that Black Americans have made, coupled with those of sympathetic White Americans who supported the movement. Even so, many White Americans are oblivious to the substantial structural racism that remains. In fact, today, it is documented that more than 50% of whites identify "lack of motivation" by Blacks as the sole cause of any Black-white disparities in which 65% believe would disappear totally if Blacks would only "try harder" (Lipsitz, 2011, p. 250). However, Feagin (2013) argues that, "traditional approaches do not capture or explain the deep structural realities of this society's racial oppression in the past or present." (p.3)

Greatly influenced by W.E.B. DuBois, Feagin (2010) puts forth a new paradigm, one in which the nature of racism we see today in the U.S. relies only in part on ideals of individual bias and prejudice. Rather, this distinct area of academic inquiry delves more deeply into the embedded, yet muted, structural racism resulting from centuries of oppression of Black Americans and current racial apathy of white Americans. Here, past decades of literature have revealed a new form of racism that is institutionalized, intentionally positioning white supremacy in a historical context, whereby many doors of opportunity are shut for Black Americans.

The new focus on race scholarship also captures the ways in which deep-rooted racism not only affects Black Americans, but also affects white Americans in the form of "unearned benefits" (Bonilla-Silva, 2003; Feagin, 2010; McIntosh, 1988; Pager, 2003; Parker & Chambers, 2005; Rothenberg, 2008, 2012; Wildman, 1996; Wise, 2005). In this way, a comprehensive

exploration of racism, one in which greater attention is given to the "other side of racism" or else a "flip side" of racism, denies Black Americans equal opportunities and synchronously becomes special privileges for White Americans. As such, researchers have unearthed a modern phenomenon in which white Americans are placed as the unit of analysis in a more inclusive and interconnected way. Recent scholarly insight on studies of race redirects the race discussion to white Americans who are seen as beneficiaries of an oppressive status quo, and in so doing, holds them accountable (Bonilla-Silva, 2003; Delgado & Stefancic, 2001; DiTomaso, 2013; Dyer, 1997; Feagin, 2010; Jensen, 2005; Lipsitz, 2009; McIntosh, 1988, 1998; Neville, Worthington & Spanierman, 2001; Pence & Fields, 1999).

The current research draws upon a *white racial frame*, devised by Feagin (2013) as an inquiry into ways in which existing beliefs, ideas, and stereotypes about people of color unite to legitimize such forms of systemic racism, racial oppression, and discrimination. Furthermore, over centuries of operation, this dominant white frame has encompassed both a strong pro-white sub-frame and a strong anti-Black sub-frame that possibly de-legitimize voices of racial resistance. This frame as an "ideal type" (p. 14) is comprised of a large array of elements, including stereotypes which whites selectively draw, refurbish, and pass along from one generation to the next. According to Feagin (2013), a great array of ideas and emotions that whites communicate, often nonverbally, and few perhaps subconsciously, are deeply embedded by the symbolic interactive process of socialization. This framing thus becomes daily lived experiences for the Black community, as well as other people of color.

As a fairly new concept, scant research has explored the effects of the white racial frame in the U.S. mass media, and even less has evaluated the ways in which it changes in the media

over time. Nonetheless, attention by researchers concerning framing of race will be incomplete without conceptualizing this long-lasting and deeply institutionalized frame [white racial frame], whereby such frames are crafted, refurbished, and cemented successfully. The purpose of the project begins to fill the gap in framing race in the media by not only extending the new wave of race scholarship, but also by drawing from the white racial frame to make sense of the discrepancies between racial realities and perceptions of race. More specifically, the project informs the question of how print media reports of Trayvon Martin and the Black Lives Matter movement reinforced the framing of race. In Feagin's (2013) analysis, he contends that an array of evidence points to the reality that the old white racial frame, with its "numerous sub-frames," remains "deep and pervasive," (p. 90-91) despite slight contemporary refurbishing. Therefore, this research is among the first to analyze ways in which the white racial frame transforms or evolves in the mass media's framing of race over time. This is enacted by a thorough exploration of the different media frames used during two distinct racial movements-the Civil Rights Movement (CRM) of the 50's and 60's and the modern Black Lives Matter movement (BLM). Lastly, the research examines the persistently crafted "Black counter-frame" (i.e., counter-stories) and whether or not those frames are given a platform or remain marginalized in media reports of race.

Theoretical Perspectives

Several theories provide a framework for understanding the relationship between framing and race. The reigning race ideology in the U.S. today is that of *color-blindness*. Proponents of colorblindness or "race blindness" believe that ignoring race and treating people equally, in turn, leads to an overall equal or "post-racial" society. As such, many individuals

14

believe communication surrounding race leads to revitalizing racial tension (i.e., "race baiting");

however, critics of the color-blind philosophy argue that it serves to legitimize "white privilege"

(Bonilla-Silva, 2003; Wildman, 1996), "colorblind white dominance" (Haney-Lopez, 2006) and/

or "racial hierarchies" (Gallagher, 2003). For instance, survey data utilized by Bonillo -Silva

(2003) revealed that specific *micro-frames* are often drawn upon by whites to interpret racial

issues and narratives that position them in a color-blind contextual frame.

The reason for such boundless color-blind rhetoric, Gallagher (2003) contends, is that

white Americans, through their excessive relationship with the mass media, are bombarded by

depictions that racial barriers have been eradicated, and therefore, racial harmony now exists.

Color-blind practices are advanced by whites who believe that since segregation and

discrimination are now illegal, they do not exists, and rather have been replaced by

"meritocracy," the belief in equal opportunity for upward mobility. The media's depiction of

"identity politics," with grandstanding of and by Black neoconservatives, portray highly

visualized successful racial minorities which create an impression that little, if any,

socioeconomic differences among races exist. Defined by Gallagher (2003) as a "myth," this

representation allows for "laissez-faire racism" in which Black Americans, themselves, are

blamed for their own circumstances in life for not working as hard as whites or for not seizing

the opportunity that being American affords them.

One of the latest interdisciplinary developments in racial theorizing that is closely tied to

an overview of framing race, the critical race theory, argues that ideologies of assimilation and

color-blindness may actually perpetuate white racial dominance rather than dismantle it.

According to Delgado and Stefancic (2001), the critical race theory challenges the presumed

racial neutrality where there is little incentive to eradicate racism, as people who are on top of the racial hierarchy, in essence, benefit from those positioned on the bottom. The color-blindness ideology maintains that treating people equally inherently leads to equality for all, yet in order to treat individuals equally, according to the critical race theory, we must treat them differently based on contexts that are specific to that individual or group. Therefore, the study considers both the social and historical contexts to inform the ways in which race is framed in the media.

A concept that is central to the critical race theory is "counter-stories," whereby Black Americans counter or debunk stereotypical myths and overgeneralizations of their race that are not buttressed by any real data, but rather underpin attempts to perpetuate white supremacy. Counter- stories, as powerful tools, have been devised to challenge dominant white narratives relayed through history books, Sunday sermons, legal decisions, U.S. historical landscapes (i.e., historical monuments) and the mass media in order to assist dominant groups in understanding the world from the perspectives of subordinate groups (Fitzgerald, 2014).

Sears and McConahay (1973) coined the term, *symbolic racism* [*modern racism*], which postulates that the content of white racism has transformed into a coherent belief system that reflects more subtle and indirect forms of racism toward Black people in America. McConahay and Hough (1976) liken symbolic racism to an expression in terms of abstract ideological symbols and symbolic behaviors of the feelings that Blacks are violating deeply embedded values and making illegitimate demands for changes in the racial status quo. The unidimensional system is grounded on stereotypical inferences that are reflective of whites' "cherished values," including individualism (Henry & Sears, 2002; Kinder and Sears, 1981;

16

McConahay & Hough, 1976; Sears & Henry, 2003), white political views (Henry & Sears, 2002),

and actual governmental policies, such as opposition to "big government" (Dovidio & Gaertner,

2004; Rabinowitz, Sears, Sidanius & Krosnick, 2009). Aside from color-blindness, these new

race theories share the assumption that, although many "old fashioned" racist opinions about

racial issues have been seemingly liberated, the substantial disadvantages experienced by Black

Americans in most domains of life have not ended (Bobo & Fox, 2003; Henry & Sears, 2002).

Framing and Constructs

This study relies on Erving Goffman's (1974) work on the "frame analysis." The

Goffmanesque frame analysis, albeit imperfect, suggests that in order to navigate through life

and make sense of our environment, we must rely on shared frames. The underlying and

universal consideration of communication is the dual idea that as social animals, we do not

communicate in a social vacuum, but rather we receive and process ideas about reality during

interactions that are social. The term, "frame" denotes a "schemata of interpretation" that

enables humans, whether individually [micro-social] or collectively [macro-social] to sort

through large amounts of information rather quickly in order to render events as meaningful

and worthy of further consideration (Goffman, 1974, p. 21). However, Fisk and Taylor (1991),

from a socio-psychological outlook, described human beings as "cognitive misers," with natural

tendencies to think as little as possible, and hence, the narrowing process is not without

limitations.

The preceding theoretical framework is not meant to capture a comprehensive

understanding of racial attitudes, nonetheless, its interconnection is valuable for informing

processes of racial framing. Additionally, the new racial theories share the assumption that the

nature of racist expressions is not static but changes over time. The critical race theory takes into consideration the social and historical contexts of race, and thus, informs the way in which race is framed through Eurocentric world views. By reading and closely analyzing articles, researchers can identify and confront the broad, historical, and patterned Eurocentric context of U.S. media, noting the ways in which race is centered in all facets of the research design.

II. REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The White Racial Frame and Constructs

Joe Feagin (2013) coined the term, white racial frame, more elaborately to describe a worldview that includes racial beliefs [stereotypes and ideologies], racially-loaded terms, racialized images, verbal and visual connotations, racialized emotions, and interpretations of narratives as well as discriminative actions that both fuel and help to justify ongoing racial oppression. In order to assess the relationships of the white racial frame to Black Americans' lived experiences, it is noteworthy to explore the contributions of others to this relatively new way of studying racism. Framing and framing discourse are fairly new concepts in race scholarship; nevertheless, the white racial frame itself is not novel, but has evolved over time to provide only new language for what is, in fact, old views of whites as the highly virtuous racial group (Feagin, 2013, p. 95).

The first construct, *two-faced racism*, was coined by Picca & Feagin (2007) who drew from Erving Goffman's Dramaturgical Model of Social Interactions to explore journal-based reports that reflected a transition of white racism from traditional public to private "underground" spaces. Less obvious, however, is the way in which racist speech, including racist joking and racial hostility, abound in the public, front stage as well. At this juncture, the

18

expression of "language accents" and much of the "auditory elements" of the white racial frame are not only working simultaneously in the backstage, many take place bravely in the front stage, conveying an outgroup inferiority message in such as the mass media.

The second construct, stereotyping and controlling images, is discussed by Patricia Hill Collins (1990) in her reference to four controlling images designed to provide powerful ideological justifications for race, class, and gender oppression. Portraying Black women as stereotypical "mammies" project an image of Black house slaves as accepting their position of subordination in slavery; "matriarchs" portrays Black single mothers as "bad mothers" who fail to fulfill the white traditional family role; "welfare queens" portray Black mothers as being responsible for their own poverty because of their "laziness," as they and their Black, drug dealer 'baby daddies' somehow live extravagantly 'off the system,' while refusing to work; and lastly the "jezebel" which portrays Black women as having excessive sexual appetites.

According to Collins (1990), these images of Black womanhood take on special meaning such as to make oppression look normal and justified in everyday life. What's more, people, including children, are more likely to accept media stereotypes as reality if they lack real-world facts [counter-stories] that contradicts these stereotypes (Holtzman, 2000). Individuals who average two hours or more a day being entertained by the media, ascertain these stereotypes that serve as a substitute for African Americans' 'real-life experiences,' thereby keeping them second class citizens to whites who are overrepresented in the media.

Whites also design and manipulate what Lorde (1984) referred to as "master narratives," the third construct, as it relates to white racial framing in the current research project. The dominant white group creates a master narrative in which schemas always favor

them, while simultaneously expressing inferiority toward the subordinate group. For example, master narratives of colonial-like stories are conveyed to others, often repetitively, without given critical thought to the message that is aided and abetted. From effective pathways of media journalists, scripts that are agreed upon by whites are shared, whether consciously or subconsciously, and consequently become frames and master narratives. Together, they shape public understanding in ways that are invisible, and reframing is the goal in restructuring a society that is stacked against people of color. However, contemporary studies that emphasize the "other side of racism," the fourth construct, maintain that whites should be held accountable for dismantling their own house, that is, their own misconstrued racial ideologies.

The final construct, *whitewashing,* is supported by neo-conservatives who argue for and embrace the premise of a color-blind society (Brown, Carnoy, Currie, Duster & Oppenheimer, 2003). From this particular view, it is cultural and individual failures that foster racial inequalities. Stereotypes are crafted while whitewashing embeds superiority and inferiority between races. While the white racial frame is a broad framework, whitewashing denotes the action within the frame-deriving racial beliefs, racialized terms and images, racialized emotions, and interpreting discriminative actions. In sum, whitewashing is the 'common denominator' in all the previous constructs that holds whites accountable for their part in crafting unequal racial hierarchies. Whitewashing is ongoing and always at work within the white racial frame, producing and framing a two-faced racist system of control. In this system, stereotypes, framing, and narratives are produced and hard-pressed to mute Black Americans and their lived experiences by framing race.

White Racial Frame and Black Americans

White Americans have continuously and effectively applied the white racial frame as a shortcut in understanding Black Americans' lived experiences. Curiously, the reason for the current white apathy, according to Dr. Joy DeGruy Leary (2012), is *cognitive dissonance.* The intrinsic discomfort that is felt when one's behavior conflicts with his or her confessed values and the lengths of extremity that one will go to eliminate this feeling of dissonance must be considered within any comprehensive exploration of U.S. racial oppression. A strong white racial frame has abounded, successfully, and in so doing has eradicated significant recollections of a nation tainted by extreme racial oppression most of its existence. The following sections explore the ways in which whites have depended on framing race as a means to circumvent this uncomfortable feeling of dissonance attached to the U.S. racial legacy. What is more, an honest and open discussion of race has been silenced by aggressively applying the white racial frame to all aspects of society. The following sections focus on four aspects of racial framing, including: Slavery, Black women, Black men, and Black youth.

Slavery and the White Racial Frame

Research (i.e., Alexander, 2011 Blakey, 2001; Feagin, 2004, 2006; Leary, 2005) shows that nationwide ignorance concerning slavery, namely African slavery and its effects, is substantial. Although, whites distort the reality of slavery by deflecting to African- on- African slavery, it was Europeans who transformed slavery into a far more cruel invention never seen before by Africans. Within the preambles of white racial framing of slavery, white Americans who continue to benefit from the system they accept as normal, simultaneously, deal with the historical linkage by demanding that Blacks 'get over it.' Some, after all, believe that 'Slavery

21

was not that bad,' while others, assume that the slave legacy made Blacks dependent and eventually created a culture of 'laziness,' ironically, not for white Americans, but for Black Americans. The ideas of Black Americans as lazy, dependent, and dishonoring of the American values of hard work is essential in order to justify past brutalization of human beings and their children and current racial disparities. The white racial framing of slavery also obscures the fact that the U.S. wealth gap is highly racialized. Undeniably, O' Connell (2012) found that the 1860 slave concentration is correlated to the contemporary black-white wealth disparities in the U.S. The white racially framed discourse would have us believe that slavery's ancient effects are over and far removed; however, we are not that far removed physically in the current U.S. from the historical context of slavery.

Curiously, Bennett Jr. (1975, p. 62) (as cited by Alexander, 2011) noted a time in American History, prior to the establishment of the white and Black man (i.e., race), in which the Colonial population consisted largely of a great mass of white and Black bondsmen, who occupied roughly the same economic class and were treated with equal disdain by the planters and governments. They were unconcerned about color of skin, as they labored and relaxed together. As slavery progressed, the planter class, in order to eliminate future alliances between Black slaves and poor whites, special privileges were granted to poor whites which deeply divide the two. Once branded as physically and culturally inferior, institutions of hierarchical stages were designed by white supremacists in quest of establishing differences between Blacks and whites, in order to justify the inhumanities of chattel slavery that became a profitable U.S. economic system.

In addition, the U.S. Constitution was crafted "by 55 white men representing the upper 2% or so of the population in economic terms," to represent liberty-and-justice for all, yet made no mention of Native Americans, only mentioned African Americans to deem them as 3/5ths of a person, and overlooked women completely (Feagin, 2013). Upon establishing the white racial frame, much credit is distributed to elite whites for the explicit and profound development of its content and strength, as well as its continued framing by means of larger institutions. Thus, whitewashing the whole institution of slavery is beneficial, as it removes all white accountability, wherein talk of reparations is 'radical' and unfavorable to the manner of white supremacy.

Perceptions of Black Women

During the Liberty-and-Justice era, white slave holders were under pressure to defend slavery. The Black female body, the "the mule uh de world," was said to be specially designed to endure harsh labor. Indeed, African women were viewed as strong, robust, and able, even while sick, to serve their masters by night and by day (Jordon, 1968). Yet, African women who were less liabilities to slave holders, were paradoxically, framed in terms of innate flaws such as "lazy," "treacherous," and, "hypersexual." Black women, Black men, and Black children continue to be framed as "lazy" today in order to justify being, in many cases, worked to death (Blakely, 2001). Interestingly, Dill (1979) pointed out that Black females have historically held the highest participation rates in the labor force- higher than their White counterparts, even with children. As a matter of fact, a saying among enslaved Africans, "it's a poor dog that won't wag its own tail," alludes to the popular perceptions among Blacks that whites were lazy and did not value work as much as African-Americans themselves" (Collins, 1990, p. 50). It is no

wonder, then, that the independent, self-reliant, and strong characteristics of Black women throughout history need not identify with labor movements of middle-class White women, in that Black women were already what white women were striving to become.

Collins (1990) explained the claims that Black women were more suitable for having children than white women were because their "*manliness*" allowed them to "produce children as easily as animals" (p. 76). *Slave breeding* was a way for white slave owners to force Black slave women to participate in the perpetuation of the slave institution by rearing children who would become property of their slave masters, regardless of the presence of a father. After framing African-Americans as "unable to feel grief," the slaves' children, in some cases, would be sold away from parents, similar to the way a calf was sold away from a cow. The image of Black women as "hypersexual" also provides rationalization for slave breeding during slavery, as well as the continued harnessing of Black women's fertility" (Collins, 1990, p.76) today.

Collin's (1990) last controlling image discussed in *Black Feminist Thought*- the "*Jezebel*" whore or "Hot Mamma" is a sexually aggressive woman who is central in this nexus of elite white male images of Black womanhood. Efforts to control Black women's sexuality lie at the heart of Black women's oppression. Originating under slavery, this image provided justification for sexual assaults of Black female slaves by their white slave masters. The second function of the "*Jezebel*" which portrays Black women as having an excessive sexual appetite where "increased fertility should be the expected outcome" (Collins, 1990, p. 76). The white -framed gendered racism that most whites also directed at Black women routinely viewed them as having "*jungle bunny*" sexual desires and supernatural procreative abilities. Curiously, the

segregated south post- Civil War was marked by an obsession for maintaining purity of the white race.

Together, these images have created a major instrument of power as they interlock to make racism, sexism, and power appear natural as it perpetuates framing of Black females as deviant and unable to adopt the ideological standards of white families.

Perceptions of Black Men

Loewen's (1999) exploration into stereotyping of Black males is fueled by the disgust of "miscegenation" or intersex that is a threat to purity of the white race. The institution of sexism and racism defined not only Black women, but also Black men as 'oversexed.' This grew, at least in part, over the collective guilt of white men who regularly raped Black women during slavery. Stereotypes and racialized images and threats have framed Black men as being dangerous and 'lustful of white women,' which justified much of the public lynching in the Jim Crow Era. The white racial frame deemed racial integration as a threat, so much that lynchings involving Black males who were publicly mobbed, castrated, dismembered, shot, and burned became carnival-like shows for white family entertainment. Disturbingly, whites often "photographed the acts of horror and made postcards to buy and sale for popular consumption, as it was a time of celebration for whites and their families" (Fitzgerald, 2014, p.148-149).

Today, this white racial framing by the mass media and Hollywood contributes to the continued racial stereotyping of Black males in popular culture. Here, racial stereotyping serves as "mental shortcuts" for quickly understanding the character being introduced, and for Black males these stereotypes, during minstrel shows, repeatedly portrayed them as: "lazy, ignorant, and child-like." Minstrel shows were designed to appeal to white audiences and to convince

northern whites that "slavery was not really that bad" by making frequent references to the

"good ole days" (Fitzgerald, 2014, p. 349-350). Bolge's (1994) analysis of stereotyping African

Americans in Hollywood film (as cited by Fitzgerald, 2014, p. 354) found that they were

routinely limited to four primary characters which are "extensions of stock minstrel characters:"

the musical old "darky" whose only purpose in life was to play music; the Uncle Tom, similar to

the subordinate "Mammy," who did not stand a chance against racial oppression in that he was

a "good ole passive negro that caused no problems;" the "coon" or "uncle," with eyes popping

out of his head who was useless, lazy, and good for nothing at all; and the "buck" who was a

brutally violent, big, oversexed Black man with a desire for white women (p. 354). Though these

stereotypical characters are still viewed somewhat today, what is more available for our

viewing is the "*magical negro*" who has some supernatural talent or information necessary to

save whites, and thus save the day.

Patricia Hill Collins (1990) in *Black Feminist Thought* notes that the matrix of domination

shapes access to systems of social control and opportunity. Central to Heitzeg's (2013) analysis

is the role of the white racial frame in constructing whiteness as normal, while condemning

blackness. The case in point is that normalized whites are responsible for the majority of crime

committed in the U.S., including the following categories: violent, property, victimless, and

corporate crime (Alexander, 2011; Bureau of Justice Stats, 2012). Notwithstanding, white collar

crime, which receives at best meagre attention from government, public media and researchers

(Levi, 2006), is significantly committed by whites. While white perpetrators are usually defined

as 'mentally ill,' Black victims are routinely demonized upon death, and, in effect, put on trial

for their very own murders (Heitzeg, 2013).

There is a viable contrasting element within the white racial frame that ignores race completely when the crime is involving a white person[s] in comparison to crime involving a Black person[s]. Rather, crime committed by a Black person is referenced *Black crime*; *Black-on-Black crime*; or *urban violence.* Russell-Brown (1998) coined the concept, "*criminalblackman,*" to represent the stereotype of Black men as more prone to criminality which she refers to as the "criminal Black man myth." This fear of Black men shapes everyday fear-induced racism which, in turn, shapes systemic racism (e.g., school-to-prison pipeline, racial profiling, police brutality, racist criminal legislation). For example, Goffman (2016) argued that the scope of policing and imprisonment for young Black men who are constantly "on the run" in poor Black neighborhoods transforms these communities in ways that are deep and enduring, not only for those targeted, but also for their families, neighbors, and communities. And, this system of policing is very different from the policing in other parts of the U.S. The fear of race is deeply absorbed in our society, a haven for the construction, maintenance, and enforcement of racial framing, remains a serious problem.

Perceptions of Black Youth

The framed narratives involving Black youth do not tell their stories reliably, neither in the media, nor in the U.S. culture in general. Images of "failure" resonate and filter the media and the minds' of White America, as well as some who may be Black. Research reveals to us that Black teenage males are perceived to be older and stronger than they actually are, as well as less innocent than their same-sex white peers. In contrast, white teenage males are benefiting from the assumptions that they are childlike, innocent and in need of protection (Haslam, Rothschild & Ernst, 2000). Viewed as "problematic," Black teens are expected to be

27

more responsible for their actions, prompting a less essential conception of childhood, one in which Black youth, including children, are placed as high-risk targets for police profiling and brutality.

Operating from the context of a historical white frame, the Black race is assumed to be "*beast-like*", possessing extraordinary strength made possible through the Black body's God-ordained innate design "for slavery." According to Feagin (2013), the early biological racist framing of Blacks as *beast-like*, *cruel, deceitful* and *ungrateful* is aggressively rationalizing a person's right to be a slave trader or owner. Similar to Thomas Jefferson's white framed accusations of enslaved Blacks as *apes,* Long (1774) (as cited by Feagin, 2013) accented a "*bestial or fetid smell*" to proclaim that Black slaves were close to apes in intelligence and behavior. This, in turn, propagated stories of their "*amorous intercourse*" with apes (p. 54-55). It is only expected that the categorization of Blacks as *problematic*, *bestial,* and *deceitful* is, in part, reason for the disparities in treatment between Black and white teenage males today.

The framing of Black youth as well as Blacks in general as drug users and drug dealers is widespread. However, the overwhelmingly consensus of studies show that Blacks and whites use drugs at strikingly similar rates. When significant difference are shown, the differences repeatedly find *lower* rates of substance use, drug selling, and drug crime among African American youth than among European American youth (Alexander, 2011; Johnson, O'Malley, Bachman & Schulenberg, 2008). Yet, as cited by Alexander (2011), a report in 2000 observed that among youth who had never been sent to prison before, Black youth were *more than six times* as likely as whites to be sentenced to prison for identical crimes, although they only make up 16% of all U.S. youth. The criminal justice system appears to be a broader reflection of the

white racial frame that is designed to appear normal, even necessary, while it operates individually and institutionally in order to justify its enormous racial discrepancies.

Framing Race in the Media

Entman (1993) highlights "selection" and "salience" as two primary features in media framing. To frame, he postulates, is to "select some aspect of a perceived reality and make it more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/ or treatment recommendation" (p. 52). Alternatively, frames may "deflect attention away from other aspects" (p. 53) by a 'selective control.' In making the selected text more salient, *Agenda-setting*, associated with McCombs and Shaw (1972), proposed that through the media, we are not told what to think, but rather what to think about. Iyengar, Peters and Kinder (1982) draw from political science research to define *priming* which suggests that the media provides the contextual ramifications for social understanding and discussion about a political science issue. Shapiro (2011) denoted three key developments of interest regarding media's framing of race: demographic transformation since the 60s, technological innovations and evolving interests in identity, and institutions and the boundaries of politics. The media's infatuation with race spawns agenda-setting and thus framing condensed events often in reactant ways that are not uniform.

The notion that all persons have a trustworthy avenue in which to voice their opinions, views, and grievances, as well as inquire relevant information via the press, is highly inaccurate. Lippman, as far back as 1925, viewed the general public as a "phantom," who were on the average, uninformed and easily swayed by the media. Today, many advocates of framing ideologies suspect that the media has become a "propaganda tool" for the ruling class. Critical

political economics study the ownership of the mass media and the influence of this ownership

on its content. In this way, the content of U.S. mass media is thought to be reflective of the

interests of the elite while ignoring the interests of the poor. This is especially true, according to

Carpini (1998), for poor ethnic minorities who are severely underrepresented as journalists in

elite and corporate-owned media.

According to Budd, Craig and Steinmen (1999), mass media meets recommended or

endorsed biases at the most fundamental levels- consistent framing in favor of capitalism,

patriarchy, heterosexism, individualism, consumerism and White privilege- that help allocate

power in American society. The belief is echoed by Walter Karp, author of in *Liberty under*

Siege: American Politics, 1976-1988 in which he exerts that "the press does not act, it is acted

upon," and "stories often have the sanction of the highest official." Furthermore, Wilson,

Gutierrez and Chao (2013) note:

> Historically, and generally continuing in the 21st century, nonwhites and women have
> not been *gatekeepers* in American news media organizations. News coverage of people
> of color and women have been and remain a reflection of the attitudes held by the
> gatekeepers and those who influence them (p. 37).

The media's relation to the U.S. economy of capitalism is explained through a Marxist

perspective. This view would take into account the mass media is owned by the "ruling class"

who exploit workers and serve the hegemonic interests of the rulers, while instilling a "false

consciousness" that everyone is benefitting. This view situates the media in a conflicting

paradigm whereby news is relegated and propagandized by the hands of the increasingly fewer

and more powerful mega-media corporations which, in turn, leads to overwhelming concerns

about corruption in the media.

Iyengar (1991) found that media coverage of political relevance falls into two distinct categories: "thematic" and "episodic" coverage. Episodic news coverage covers social issues in terms of isolated events, whereas thematic coverage positions social issues within a larger collective context. Media scholars have noted that the public relies on the media to inform them about issues wherein they possess little knowledge, especially for "othered" issues that are "outside of a person's general knowledge" (Graber, 1984). Conceivably, the priming of news reports is correlated to the ways in which viewers determine "attribution of responsibility" (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000). Viewers who prescribe to news coverage that is heavily episodic (e.g., poverty, crime, terrorism), tend to attribute responsibility or blame to the individualistic motives and actions of those who are poor and minority. Contrariwise, viewers who observe thematic news coverage tend to ascribe "attribution of responsibility" to societal factors (e.g., economic inequality, systemic racism, governmental relations).

While this research focused on television news, juxtapositions to print news propose very little distinction. Research that explores framing effects on racial/ethnic inner cities is modest, yet extensive episodic news coverage of policing and economic disparities vital to inner cities, whether printed or televised, merits closer attention. This is because episodic coverage primes viewers to "blame the victims" for their own oppression. Moreover, this "blame game" works to disregard systemic racism in its entirety and obfuscates calls to unify cross-racial coalitions that would otherwise bring much needed attention to the larger racial realities. After understanding the ways in which news stories are negotiated into frames, together with the capitalistic nature of the media, there is much to explore concerning perceived race relations in the 21st century.

Framing Social Movements

To date, scholars have substantially applied framing and framing processes to the study of social movements (Benford 1997; Benford & Snow, 2000; Oliver & Johnson 2000; William & Benford, 2000). Snow and Benford (1998) proposed *frame alignment* and *realignment* to reference three core framing tasks: *diagnostic frame*; *prognostic framing*; and *motivational framing* that facilitate agreement and action, thus moving participants from the *"balcony to the barricades"* (Benford & Snow, 2000, p. 615). Diagnostic framing is to identify the problem or the source of blame; prognosis framing is to strategize; and lastly, motivational framing is to call for action. *Frame alignment* premises that a social movement's success is contingent upon how closely aligned the general framing of the movement is with that of the participants in the movement. Once the proper frames have been imposed through this process of frame alignment, real change in society through social movements is probable. However, Benford's (1997) criticizes the use of framing as a "cliché" (p. 415) that is sometimes applied too liberally and obscures the larger complexities of social movements. For instance, Oliver and Johnston (2000) stated:

> Framing alone will not suffice in constructing a complete understanding of the importance of a social movement, and in deed may trivialize the whole movement if it is seen only as such. We need to understand the concept of "Ideology" together with framing and the relationship that these two concepts represent as central components to movement and political formations. (p.1).

Social scientists agree that ideology is an underlying belief system shared by movement participants that fosters framing. And, just as the underlying and shared political implications spawn social movements, so too does the cultural context in which the movement is embedded (Jasper, 1997). The cultural material most relevant to the movement, the "*tool kit,*" is

32

comprised of beliefs, ideologies, practices, values, myths, and narratives (Swidler, 1986). In McAdam's (1996) extensive study of the Civil Rights Movement, he contended that our understanding of the Black church as a setting of movement mobilization would be incomplete without, first, a complete understanding of culture and various effects of "reference publics," including segregationists, the media, the public and the federal government. Such studies clearly indicate that in order to appreciate the complex and dynamic nature of a social movement, one must understand both the imbedded political and cultural context of the given movement.

In sum, the theoretical perspectives of framing race, the review of literature on the white racial framing of Black lives, as well as framing in the media and social movements, examined thus far, suggest that exposure to race in the media is likely to reinforce framing of race. The media is a powerful tool essential to the development and perpetuation of the elite white racial frame that privileges the white race and oppresses the Black race. It is important to recognize the mechanisms of white racial framing in the media and the ways in which it works in over-representing whites, in conjunction with under-representing Blacks.

III. METHODS

Motivated by research on the white racial frame and its relationship to systemic racism, this inductive project makes use of qualitative analysis in order to explore ways in which print news influences the framing of race in reports of Trayvon Martin and the Black Lives Matter movement. A comparative analysis will be conducted in order to examine the progression of the white racial frame in racially- focused media coverage of the 1955 Emmett Till murder case which inspired the Civil Rights Movement (CRM) to the more recent Trayvon Martin murder

and Black Lives Matter (BLM) movement. Lastly, the sub frames are evaluated in order to assess

whether the framing silenced efforts for racial activism in the news reports. For this purpose,

the following research questions were constructed:

RQ. 1: How do news reports of Trayvon Martin and the BLM movement

Influence or reinforce the framing of race?

RQ1a: Is the White Racial Frame dominant in news reports of Trayvon Martin and the

BLM movement?

RQ1b: What are the sub-frames in newspaper reports of Trayvon Martin and the BLM

movement?

RQ1c: Are there any differences in frames utilized by the *New York Times* and

Washington Post in reports of the Trayvon Martin Murder case and BLM regarding race?

RQ1d: Has the White Racial Frame transformed since the reporting of the Emmett Till

case and the emergence of the CRM?

RQ1e: Does the use of the white racial frame and its sub-frames suppress racial activism

in reports of the BLM movement?

It is hypothesized that the news discourse will heavily enunciate the pro-white and anti-

Black racial framing as well as sub-frames from the white racial frame, including stereotypes of

race as "threatening" which disregards thematic coverage of larger racial realities. Together,

these are expected to work in an interconnected mode to silence racial activism that could

otherwise lead to genuine racial harmony that is absent in America.

For this framing analysis, the online Pro Quest database was used to collect articles from

The New York Times and *Washington Post.* In order to inform research questions 1a and 1b,

data were collected from January 1, 2012 to August 1, 2016 for "Trayvon Martin" articles which were pertinent as Trayvon Martin was shot and killed on February 12, 2012. Data from "Black Lives Matter" articles were collected from January 1, 2012 to August 1, 2016 as well because it is well accepted that the acquittal of Trayvon Martin's shooter, George Zimmerman, inspired the movement. In order to investigate research question 1d- the transformation of the white racial frame from the era of Civil Rights to the current era of BLM- historical data was collected from August 27, 1955 to December 31, 1969 for both "Emmett Till" and "Civil Rights." These dates are constructive as Emmett Till was murdered on August 28, 1955. It is important to note that the time frame parameters for "Civil Rights" extend to the year 1969. These dates are beneficial to research question (1d) in which the commonly held myth is that the CRM ended after the Voting Rights Legislation of 1965 was enacted. This is problematic in that the 1955-1965 time frame ignores the larger systematic racism that continued. This misconception also silences the vital role that grassroots activism played in fighting systemic racism during the era such as in violent policing, and more importantly, calling attention to the dates could provide a patterned link between the racism of the CRM and the racism of the BLM movement today.

The units of analysis for the study were news stories from the *New York Times* and *Washington Post* that referenced "Trayvon Martin" and "Black Lives Matter." In the face of preparing for the news digital age, both publications remain prominent American newspapers and are powerful in setting the overall tone for national news coverage. Still, it is widely accepted that the *New York Times* reports tend to reflect a liberal bias, while the *Washington Post* is widely contested. Today, much of U.S. media is controlled by a few powerful corporations, and therefore mistrust of American mass media is at an all- time high. This,

together with the strength of these findings suggest that it is likely that a larger database would yield similar findings in most U.S. media print coverage. Distinguishing the differences in frames coded between *The New York Times* and the *Washington Post* provides insight for Research Question 1c.

The news sample for Emmett Till and Civil Rights Movement was drawn from ProQuest Historical Newspapers: *The New York Times* and *Washington Post*. The researcher used two key search terms- "Trayvon Martin" and "Black Lives Matter," which yielded a total of 138 cover stories and articles. Of the 138 articles, 44% (60) were from the *New York Times* and 57% (78) were from the *Washington Post*. The initial analysis in Pro Quest: *The New York Times* for "Trayvon Martin" yielded 285 articles, however, after limiting to front page cover stories, I was left with a smaller sample of 29 articles. Out of the sample of 29 articles, I used 26 in the analysis of Trayvon Martin since they were main stories; the additional two were opinion or editorials, and one was business-related.

Similarly, 32 articles were taken from the *Washington Post*. Commentaries, editorials, and interviews were excluded as they often times are opinion pieces on partisan ideas that may serve the function of appealing to those who already share the ideas at hand and to sway those who may not. News articles were selected because they are commonly agreed upon to be more objective, often with supposed facts, and with and with more influence. Of the 138 news articles, 58% (80) were in relation to the BLM movement, whereas, 42% (58) reference the death of Trayvon Martin. The researcher also implemented two searches for Emmett Till and Civil Rights using the following key terms: "Emmett Till," "Civil Rights" AND "Black" OR "Negro" OR "African American." Using these key terms, 147 articles were documented in order to

36

analyze the white racial frame's prevalence during this historical movement as well as its

transformation, thus creating a total of 285 articles. I used Zotero to collect, organize, and

manage articles for further exploration. Before examining frames, the articles were organized

chronologically.

Based on the literature review of existing research on the white racial frame, code

sheets were developed using Excel. The coder used interpretive coding rather than quantitative

coding in order to code the prevalence of the white racial frame, its sub-frames, and key terms

in the sample news reports. In lining with the framing research, coders were instructed to code

for *multi-frames*; 100% of the articles contained more than one frame. Data was also collected

and analyzed for any emerging themes that manifested themselves inductively during the

analysis. The framing devices utilized in this research to inform the research questions are

guided by Gamson and Modigliani's (1989) "media package." The media package identifies with

such as: metaphors, exemplars (i.e., historical examples in which lessons are drawn),

catchphrases, and depictions (p. 3).

Table 3.1 *Articles for Analysis*

	ProQuest Historical		ProQuest Online		
	Emmett Till	Civil Rights	Trayvon Martin	Black Lives Matter	
Search Terms	"Emmett Till"	"civil rights" AND "black" OR "Negro" OR "African American"	"Trayvon Martin"	"Black Lives Matter"	
Dates	8-27-1955-12-31-1969	8-27-1955-12-31-1969	1-1-2012-8-1-2016	1-1-2012-8-1-2016	
New York Times articles	32	36	26	34	
Washington Post articles	22	57	32	46	
Totals	54	93	58	80	285

IV. FINDINGS

The purpose of this chapter is to present the findings as they relate to the central research question: *How did the news reports of Trayvon Martin and the Black Lives Matter movement influence or reinforce the framing of race?* In order to accomplish this, the findings were categorized into eight general categories that described how race was presented in the reports. This information is presented in Table 4.1 and includes: anti-Black frames; pro-white frames; stereotype frames; episodic frames; thematic frames; Black counter-frames; American myth narratives; and biological differences frames. Next, a quantitative coding sheet was

38

constructed. Additionally, I drew qualitative examples from the sample and disclosed them under the appropriate general frames, noting key terms and phrases that informed sub-frames from the eight general frames (See Table 4.2). The articles were then divided accordingly and positioned in Table 4.3 which enabled the researcher to compare and contrast frames utilized by *The New York Times* and *Washington Post*.

Reports of Trayvon Martin and the Black Lives Matter Movement

My analysis showed that the three general frames assumed by Joe Feagin (2013) to be consistent with white racial framing were also found to be dominating in news reports of Trayvon Martin and BLM. Although the first two frames are commonly combined as one pro-white/ anti-Black frame by Feagin (2013) in his analysis of the white racial frame, the researcher has chosen to present them in the number order in which they manifested themselves in the framing analysis. (See Table 4.1).

Table 4:1 *General Frames in reports of Trayvon Martin and Black Lives Matter*

Frames	Number of Articles	Percentages (%)
Anti-Black	122	88.4
Pro-white	113	81.9
Stereotype	104	75.3
Episodic	83	60.1
Black counter-frame	68	49.2
Thematic	58	42.0
Biological difference	54	39.1
American myths	22	15.9

Table 4:2 *Sub-frames in reports of Trayvon Martin and Black Lives Matter*

Frames	Sub-frames
Anti-Black frame	Inadequate sub-frame
	No leadership sub-frame
	Lawlessness sub-frame
Pro-white frame	Whites as "virtuous" sub-frame
	Whites as "protectors" sub-frame
Stereotype frame	Criminal "Gangsta" thug sub-frame
	"Lazy" sub-frame
	"Sassy" and Hypersexual Black female sub-frame
	Threat of a Black militant uprising sub-frame
Episodic Frame	Blame sub-frame
Black counter-frame	Decriminalizing sub-frame
Thematic frame	Lack of opportunity sub-frame
	Systemic racism sub-frame
	White supremacy sub-frame
Biological differences frame	Older sub-frame
	Stronger sub-frame
	Emotional sub-frame
	Larger in number sub-frame
	Animalistic imagery sub-frame
American myth narrative frame	Liberty-and-justice sub-frame

Anti-Black frame. The most dominant frame (n=122, 88.4%) detected in my analysis of news reports concerning Trayvon Martin and BLM was the anti-Black frame. In articles, the anti-Black frame highlighted terms, catch phrases, adjectives, and descriptions that presented race as divergent: "clinging to false narratives;" a "new crop of activists who are ineffective in creating change;" "up to no good;" "sowing racial division;" and a "bad bunch of people grabbing any

excuse they can find to go and loot a store." The anti-Black framing disclosed sub-frames including: inadequate, no leadership and lawlessness sub-frames.

The first anti-Black sub-frame, inadequate, was found in reports that presented race, including Trayvon Martin's parents, the trial, Black youth in the courtroom, and BLM as inadequate. For example, one news article quoted prosecutors: "Unless there are good witnesses and clear-cut physical evidence, the self-defense homicide cases are often murky and hard to sort out…" Another article reported on a disconnect between Trayvon Martin's parents' testimonies. For instance, "When asked if the voice on the recorder was that of Trayvon, his mother responded with, 'There is no doubt,' whereas his father "quietly responded no." Another article reported on Sybrina Fulton's misspoken words in the following article:

> *Exhausted by the ordeal, Mr. Martin's mother, Sybrina Fulton, said she had misspoken on a news program earlier in the day when she used the word "accident" to describe the shooting. It was not the shooting that was the accident, she said; it was the encounter between Mr. Martin and Mr. Zimmerman. "The accident came when Zimmerman exited his vehicle and they met," she said.*

One article reported on insinuations made by commentators that U.S. courtrooms were spaces in which African American youth did not belong:

> Like much in the trial, her [Rachel Jeantel] testimony became a cultural touchstone outside the courtroom and a source of dispute inside it. She said that she was on a cellphone with Martin in the moments before he died and that he said a "creepy-ass cracker" was following him….Might she have neglected to "code switch," some commentators mused, referring to the difficulty of translating the vernacular of African American youth into a courtroom setting.

Concerning the inadequate sub-frame as it relates to race and the BLM movement's objectives, many articles described the movement as "scattered," lacking "traction," and ultimately "ineffective." For example, an article quoted Martin Luther King Jr.'s niece, Alveda King, who called the BLM's method "inappropriate." Another article quoted a Republican right

41

candidates who argued that, "The Black Lives Matter movement is fundamentally focused on the 'wrong issues' and the 'wrong things,' and rather 'young Black Americans need to 'avoid public strife." In a more aggressive article, a report of a tweet by a police officer read, "Oh joy... Stuck late again at work to babysit these fools!"

The second anti-Black sub-frame, no leadership**,** was found in reports that questioned the movement's leadership. For example,

There are internal fights and both productive and unproductive disagreements about who the movement's leaders are, whether leaders are needed, what the movement should do now and whether coordination itself is a good thing.

The third anti-Black sub-frame, the lawlessness sub-frame**,** included messages relating "law and-order" to BLM and race. For example, an article quoted David Clarke, a sheriff, who "declared that 'Blue lives matter' and argued that the BLM movement was contributing to 'a collapse of social order.'" Another article quoted a sheriff who "accused protesters of contributing to 'anarchy,'" as "violators who violate the code of conduct that 'we' rely on [as the crowd erupted in cheers]." In some articles, President Donald Trump was quoted referencing himself as the "law-and-order" candidate; however, one in particular reported that, "Hours after he branded himself the law-and-order candidate for president, Donald Trump weighed on another politically loaded term- one he proudly rejected: 'Black Lives Matter.'" Lastly, an article reported on regular citizens outside of the movement and their views of lawlessness and the BLM movement. For example, "'We are not going to tolerate lawlessness or destruction of property,' though they respected the freedom of speech in protests."

Pro-white frames. Not surprisingly, the second most dominant frame (n=113, 81.9%) discovered was the pro-white frame. Pro-white messages describing George Zimmerman and

the police abounded in form of catch phrases and adjectives which served to define whiteness

as virtuous and protecting: "a neighborhood watch volunteer," "a person to contact only

second to police," "undeserving of a severe charge," "appropriately using lethal force to defend

himself," "a decent guy," "a good human being," a "level-headed man who shot Mr. Martin out

of fear," and one who acted in "self-defense." While news reports describing race were often

anti-Black, describing Blacks as inadequate and lawless, they were at the same time pro-white,

describing whites as "virtuous" and as "protectors."

In the first Pro-white sub-frame, 'virtuous,' Zimmerman as well as police are presented

as 'all that is good.' For example, it was reported that, "His bosses and co-workers repeatedly

described Mr. Zimmerman, 28, who speaks English and Spanish, as helpful and reasonable."

Moreover, reports quoted Zimmerman's brother who described him as "sensitive" and "very

likable," and a witness for Zimmerman was quoted saying that he thought of Zimmerman

"almost as a son." In fact, it was reported that he had contributed to his legal expenses,

personal website, and wardrobe for the trial which was approximately $5,000.00. It was quoted

that the witness told the juror that he "taught his younger friend how to tie a Windsor knot." It

was reported that George Zimmerman's brother, Robert Zimmerman Jr., "fired off an angry

post on Twitter at Natalie Jackson, one of the Martin family's lawyers; nevertheless, it was said

to be 'justifiable anger.' The article also quoted Mr. O'Mara, Zimmerman's lawyer stating that,

"The Zimmerman family has been through a lot, and they have been frequently misrepresented

in the media, so we do not begrudge Robert for wanting to speak out and set the record

straight." It was reported that, "a wide- ranging investigation of George Zimmerman... found a

man not prone to violence or prejudice and who moved easily between racial and ethnic

groups." One article included a report from Reuters which argued that aside from the fact that some Americans consider him a cold-blooded murderer, George Zimmerman was raised Catholic, eschewing the limelight. And, he served as an altar boy from age 7 to 17 in which he conducted "home visits" with his mother to feed the less fortunate.

Even violent crime committed by white shooters uncovered a sub-frame of whites as virtuous by the "medicalization" of white crime in the news reports. For instance, an article concerning the white supremacists who shot five BLM members quoted prosecutor Mike Freeman in a statement: "The defendant's own statements, their videos, show that these are 'sick' people." Additionally, an article reported on the irony of the Dallas police deaths at the "tail end of a peaceful BLM march." President Obama hailed the Dallas Police Department as one of the jurisdictions that were improving relationships between police and communities, however, one that he would mourn 24 hours later after five officers were killed by a lone gunman. The article reported: "An officer-involved shooting in the city in 2012 threatened to similarly spill over into violence but didn't, thanks to the departments focus on transparency."

In the political news reports concerning BLM, ample pro-white messages of 'virtuous' and 'good' were detected. Two examples included 2016 democratic presidential candidate Martin O'Malley (D) who was recognized for quoting, "Not only do 'Black Lives Matter,' but 'All Lives Matter' and 'White Lives Matter' too," as well as Jeb Bush (R) who boasted of his interest in "restoring opportunity for *all* Americans."

In contrast, news reports indicated that after a Black protester got "sucker punched" at a Donald Trump rally, Trump appeared to relish and condone the violence. Specifically, an article noted a recording of Trump shouting "Isn't this exciting? I love it! I love it!" Furthermore,

44

in news reports of the White Student Union at the University of Illinois, the administrator of its

Facebook page that was designed to challenge BLM stated: "Black Lives Matter disrupts student

daily life and activity far too much and marginalizes white students… We are in the U.S. and not

Africa, and we do not desire to have an African flag on campus."

In the second Pro-White sub-frame, 'protector,' reports of Zimmerman and law officials

connected whiteness to that of "civilizers" and "protectors." For example, it was reported that,

"Mr. Zimmerman, a criminal justice major, often patrolled the neighborhood. He had placed 46

calls to 911 in 14 months for reports including open windows and suspicious persons," and

once he [George Zimmerman] reported "too many children playing in the streets of his

neighborhood at dusk that risked being injured."

Stereotype frame. The third most governing frame (n=104, 75.3%) in the analysis of news

reports about Trayvon Martin's murder case and BLM, the subsequent movement it incited,

was the stereotype frame, which was attributed to race membership. Terms and phrases

attributed to Black Americans included: "suspicious," "criminal," "thug," "drugs," "demanding,"

"disrupting," "riots," "promoting Black power," "militant uprising," and "terrorist groups." The

stereotype frame also provided four sub-frames that stereotyped Trayvon Martin as a 'Criminal

'Gangsta' Thug,' Black youth as 'lazy,' Black females as 'Sassy' and 'Hypersexual,' and BLM as

threatening of a 'Black militant uprising.'

In the first stereotype sub-frame, the criminal "Gangsta" thug, news stories framed

Trayvon Martin in a way that attacked his character and lessened the likelihood of

commiserating his death. For example, one article stated: "Allegations of traces of marijuana

found in his book bag, truancy, graffiti offense, claims of jewelry, a watch, and a screwdriver in

45

his bag were reported," though they were never confirmed. Another report recorded

Zimmerman's preconceived assumption of Trayvon as a "criminal" and therefore guilty. For

example, Zimmerman, "scared for his life and thinking that Mr. Martin was going to grab his

gun… slipped the weapon out of its holster and shot him."

Forged depictions of Martin enamored in a *"Gangsta culture,"* were radiating as well as

reported references to himself as a "Gangsta." It was reported that George Zimmerman

allegedly yelled, "Punks" and "fucking coons" who "always get away," as he gasped for breath

in his pursuit of Trayvon Martin. In conflicting news reports, nevertheless, Zimmerman reported

being "so afraid of Mr. Martin that he did not roll his window down."

The second stereotype sub-frame portrayed race as innately 'lazy,' with 'refusal to work'

rhetoric. For example, an article reported the following:

> To several Republican candidates…instead of calling for police reforms, young black
> Americans need to embrace the discipline of work and safety that comes with law-
> abiding life and avoid public strife. Black parents need to better monitor their children,
> their souls, their character. And police officers, a brave and public-service-minded lot,
> should plow ahead in the work of enforcing law and maintaining order.

The 'lazy' sub-frame is implicitly depicted in the following news report:

> Simmering racial tension boiled over, yet again, when several men shot five people who
> were protesting a recent police killing of an African American man. It was noted that
> some demonstrators stood each day of the rally while others dozed in sleeping bags or
> lawn chairs, camping out.

In addition, it was noted that well-known activist, DeRay McKesson, "quit his job" in order to

become a full-time activist.

The third stereotype sub-frame, the 'sassy and hypersexual Black female,' was observed

perceptibly in a news report describing Martin's female friend who was also a witness to his

murder as a "brash" and "sassy 19-year old Miami high-schooler." A report described Mattie

Aikens, 33, of Sanford who was the last protester to leave the courthouse after the verdict was

delivered:

> She had been standing outside since noon, holding a bag of Skittles and a can of Arizona
> "watermelon" drink, which Mr. Martin was carrying the night he was shot….He should
> have went to prison… He was just guilty, guilty, guilty, guilty.

News reports of the "distraught" daughter of Eric Gardner who was killed during a police

interaction, accosted President Obama after a meeting with "demands of her own." She was

quoted as she criticized policies that "compel police to use military equipment that turns

communities into 'war zones.'" Another concerned female activist's feelings were highlighted in

stereotypical reporting, as "She felt frustrated, dejected, and angry at what she perceived as a

lack of progress." Stereotyping of Black females as 'hypersexual,' was emitted through a report

in which the Cofounder of *300 Men March to Stomp out Violence* endorsed a Spike Lee movie

about "women who were lovers of gang members who withheld sex until their boyfriends' put

the guns down."

The final stereotype sub-frame, Black militant uprising threat, was detected in

melodramatic language that instilled the ultimate fear, that of a 'Black uprising.' For example,

reports announced that "Jurors received death threats" and "feared the consequences of

acquitting Mr. Zimmerman," while another report noted that the U.S. is sitting on what police

termed a "Powder Keg." Reports of BLM leaders quoted that they had "doubled-downed on

their mission" in which the report later warned of "more dangerous situations to come."

Similarly, law enforcement related the movement to common threatening semantic that

described "escalating national tension between police and BLM." More examples included

quotes from a sheriff who spoke of "riots" in which police and activists "clashed" and likened

BLM to "terrorists" who were contributing to a "collapse of social order." One report of four 'innocent' police officers who were shot by a lone gunman was attributed to his "connection with BLM," (even while this connection was denied.) An article reported on a controversial photo of sixteen Black female graduates from the United States Military Academy who "raised their clenched fists" and therefore were accused by arm forces and commenters of "allying themselves with the BLM movement and sowing racial division in a military that relies on assimilation." One commenter was John Burk, an Iraq veteran turned blogger from Georgia, who wrote a post that stated by raising their fists, the women were identified with BLM activists who he quoted were 'known for inflicting violent protest throughout various parts of the United States, calling for the deaths of police officers, and even going as far as to call for the deaths of white Americans.'"

Political articles were no less stereotypical in their depiction of the BLM movement as a threat of a Black militant uprising. For instance, Mike Huckabee (R) stated that, "Black Lives Matter is magnifying problems" and driving people to "violent uprisings." Another stereotypical report depicted a rally of protesters in which "People passed out candy, pizza, fried chicken and other food," as the demonstrators vowed "not to cower in fear of what one organizer called 'an act of terrorism.'"

Episodic Frames. Episodic frames (n=83, 60.1%) were found in over half of the articles analyzed. The Episodic frames uncovered terms, catch phrases, adjectives, and descriptions that presented race as a subtext. One collective way this manifested in the news reports was through the court's ruling to take the concept "race" out of "racial profiling" in its deliberations. In the articles about Trayvon Martin, episodic coverage of case studies and events comprised

texts and expressions such as: 'parent blaming,' "self-defense," "Stand-Your-Ground," "martial

arts," "school suspensions," "rap music," "traces of marijuana," "fighting," and a "few bad

apples." Likewise, catchphrases in articles about BLM included: "charges of trespassing,

unlawful assembly, disorderly conduct," "targeting police officers," and "outside agitation."

     With race as a subtext in news reports, Trayvon Martin's "martial arts" experience, his

frequent "school suspensions," and his drug usage or the claims of "traces of marijuana in his

bag" enabled lawyers to argue that, "Martin's drug use could have made him aggressive and

paranoid." The one sub-frame, blame, portrayed an "unfamiliar tall teenager in a 'hoodie'," and

this image was liberally applied in the news stories surrounding Trayvon Martin. This episodic

coverage served to blame him for his own death, as the image or "figure in a hoodie" was

ample motivation for George Zimmerman to fear for his life. It was alleged that Martin

"instigated a fight that led to his death," yet, not without reports of Zimmerman's testimony

that contained a "number of inconsistencies" with "injuries that were negligible." It was also

suggested in reports that "Zimmerman's heart was in the right place," and that something went

terribly wrong. Moreover, Zimmerman's mother noted that her son had been taken into

custody "solely to placate the masses."

     Although, former President Obama admitted to "a few bad apples" in policing, another

article quoted him admonishing protestors. For example, Obama was quoted stating that,

"Whenever those of us who are concerned about fairness in the criminal justice system attack

police officers, you are doing a disservice to the cause." In another article, it was reported that

as Mr. Obama grasped for solutions, he argued that officers were being asked to do too much

in disadvantaged communities and not thanked often enough. Nonetheless, he argued that

they must do "more to address implicit prejudice that can feed violent clashes." Obama was also quoted addressing BLM activists:

> Once you have highlighted an issue and brought it to people's attention and shined a spotlight, and elected officials or people who are in a position to start bringing about change are ready to sit down with you, then you can't just keep on yelling at them.

He went on by stating that, "America should engage in 'soul searching'… on how we can bolster and reinforce our African American boys." Finally, the mayor of New York lashed out at BLM protesters, shouting that "the police only want to help people regardless of race," accusing the movements of "ignoring Black-on-Black crime," "promoting racism," and "targeting police officers." He was also reported as he blamed rap music for the incident and the succeeding conflict.

Black Counter-frames. The Black counter-frame was detected in roughly half (n=68, 49.2%) of the articles about Trayvon Martin and BLM. The Black counter-frame highlighted terms, catch phrases, adjectives, and descriptions that also presented race as a continuous effort to explain experiences that uniquely affect them. Such terms and phrases employed by this counter frame include: "an unfair criminal justice system," "sloppy work by police," "criminalization of the victim," "unfair gun laws including Stand-Your-Ground and self-defense legislation," "underlying stereotypes," "generalizing," "collateral damage in the 'War on Drugs'," "license to kill," and overall "racial profiling" of Black men.

The Black counter-frame sub-frame, 'decriminalization of race,' arose from the analysis and echoed efforts to counter the criminalization of race. For example, in response to the "unflattering thug images in social media," his [Trayvon Martin's] mother stated that, "Attacks on his character as a 'Gangsta hoodie-wearing drug dealer' were unwarranted." Rather, it was

50

noted elsewhere that, "What's ignored is his unblemished personal life, with no criminal record." Another report noted that "Trayvon Martin did not have a gun. Trayvon Martin did not get out of his car to chase anybody. Trayvon Martin is not on trial."

Allegations of Trayvon Martin as a "Gangsta thug" led also to accusations of the association of Gangsta rap with Black culture. An article countered the myth of Gangsta rap music relative to race. For example, it was stated that, "Gangsta rap is meant to describe realities on the streets, not promote it…Whether Mr. Martin once wore gold teeth or used an obscene gesture in a photograph has nothing to do with his death." Challenges to counter the images of Trayvon Martin as a criminal were juxtaposed with articles and language that also countered the pro-white "choir boy" image of Zimmerman. For example:

> *One more ex-girlfriend of Zimmerman testified that he molested her. He was always charming and personable with everyone in the family and would always laugh and entertain everybody. But he was different behind closed doors. Zimmerman and his family had talked of race often and disparaged African Americans stating that they only liked Black people if they acted like White people.*

In news reports of Trayvon Martin, the articles containing Black leaders' counter - frames, included those of President Obama who recognized the "humiliation of being guilty until proven innocent" while comparing Trayvon Martin's murder to that of civil rights era, Emmett Till. Although there were articles from the President containing wording that debunked common narratives surrounding Trayvon Martin and BLM, they were underdeveloped. An article detailed BLM activists' concerns for the lack of quality in briefings by political candidates, as "extremely dismissive" when candidates sort of utter "Black Lives Matter" without taking advantage of their platform to deliberate on the groups' intents. As such, President Obama

noted, "African Americans look at this issue through a set of experiences and a history that doesn't go away and still weighs heavily on them." One article stated:

> *Concerns of the BLM movement are real. BLM are not saying that other lives do not matter, but rather, that there are specific concerns happening in the African American community that are not happening in other communities.*

A key BLM leader challenged the narratives that BLM is anti-police by assuring that, "This is not about picking sides, we can stand up for the rights of minorities and the good work of police, and those are not competing thoughts." It was found that there is, in standard, an over-all ignorance of the BLM movement, and therefore, the Black counter-frames were designed and implemented as an attempt to decriminalize race.

Thematic Frames. (n=58, 42.0 %) Thematic frames were found in just under half of the articles sampled. These articles contained messages in news reporting that were thematic in coverage and employed terminology and metaphors such as: "racial profiling," "systemic racism," "reinforcement of American hierarchies," "white supremacy," "underlying stereotypes, attitudes, and beliefs," "unemployment, failed education, and poverty," and a "sovereign citizen subculture."

In news articles of the BLM movement and Trayvon Martin, thematic coverage premised the BLM movement "on a rejection of what they see as a dominant mainstream culture that has marginalized the value of African Americans lives for decades" which raises the following questions:

> *What would be different in the last six years if America and its policies had functioned like Black lives really do matter? What is it that those who object to that phrase to day believe will happen if that sentiment is rendered real?*

The sub-frames that surfaced from the exploration of thematic framing were: "lack of opportunity," "systemic racism," and "white supremacy." These three sub-frames interconnected in ways that served as safeguards for the persisting racial hierarchy and status-quo. Here, articles that reflect the lack of opportunity sub-frame resonated from words of a Chicago priest who stated, "I pray we'll 'stand our ground' against unemployment, failed education, poverty, and the other evils that have created an atmosphere of violence and hopelessness." The article continued with a quote from a Chicago priest who fearlessly explained the lack of opportunity that breeds violence in America:

> *The government understood that these riots were about more than brutal policing. Black Americans were expressing their frustrations with racism and their lack of economic opportunity-over their sense that the Civil Rights Movement had, despite progress failed to fulfill its promises.*

> The second systemic racism sub-frame in the unfair criminal justice system was

captured in reports of Martin Luther King III who believed that this was about something far greater than the verdict. For example,

> *The verdict had led to an unusually introspective and widespread national conversation about race and the criminal justice system…People are not as frustrated about the verdict. It's about consistent, systemic kinds of things that don't get reported and happen every day in courtrooms across America.*

President Obama was quoted in an article highlighting the "underlying stereotypes and underlying attitudes, mistaken beliefs that serve as a basis for these too common incidents." Activists were quoted seeing the "structural violence and systemic racism that is oppressing and killing Black women, men and children" as "an emergency" and "the most important and urgent issue of our day." Furthermore, "since the days of slave patrols and urban labor uprisings," we "have employed police to violently reinforce American hierarchies."

The third sub-frame, white supremacy, shows reinforcement of the racial status-quo and racial hierarchies. For instance, it was reported that students at Georgetown University in the District of Columbia led demonstrations "to rechristen buildings that had been named for college presidents who sold slaves," and according to a law professor who is an expert in police misconduct at the University of California, historically, "jurors have given officers the benefit of the doubt" in cases involving police brutality. Another article described white supremacy that is closely aligned with *sovereign citizen views*. For example:

> *Scarsella, described by police as having a "very intense pro-constitution and sovereign citizen views," and who "believes it is un-American to trust the government," …shot five people at a Black Lives Matter demonstration in Minneapolis last week...The criminal complaint against him alleges he and the other three men left a digital trail of racist posts and plans for the shooting, including cellphone photos of them holding guns in front of a confederate flag and racist images…*

Messages were reported from members of a white student union on a campus which stated what they liked about the union is that, "They are fighting for the rights of the white man which are dwindling faster than a rabbit on meth!" A supporter continued by stating, "I have no desire to harm the non-white races"… "I simply think it would help everyone to separate"… "I don't want to be a mud race in this country, and I will fight to the death against that."

Biological frame. The biological framing of race (n=56, 40.5%) was detected in less than half of the articles and employed terms and phrases which included: "Mr. Martin;" "ambushed;" "dog attack;" "jockey riding a horse;" "skilled and aggressive fighter;" "slamming his head into the sidewalk;" "little emotion;" "a largely organic web;" "thousands of protesters," "yelps;" "howlings;" and "ignorant baboon." The biological framing that was detected in the Trayvon Martin and BLM articles established sub-frames that describe race as older, stronger, less emotional, larger in number, and with animalistic imagery.

In the first biological sub-frame, older, many of the articles analyzed developed a reoccurring theme in relation to Trayvon Martin's age by implying that he was older. References of Trayvon Martin to "Mr.," insinuated that Trayvon Martin, though he had recently turned seventeen, was an adult. An article also described "killing a young 'man' on the cusp of adulthood." And, then again, a witness who described the fight, described a "man" on top of another man. In court, Zimmerman articulated to Trayvon Martin's family, "I thought he was a little bit younger than I am." It was noted that the pictures of Martin displayed on social media made him appear much younger and innocent; however, the picture that was supposed to be a much more recent one of Martin was found to be a picture of a 30- year- old rapper. Trayvon's mother, at the New York rally, countered the biological framing of her son as 'older' by stating that, "Trayvon was a child, and I think sometimes it gets lost in the shuffle, because as I sat in the courtroom, it made me think that they were talking about another man."

In the second biological differences sub-frame, 'stronger,' race was framed in relation to strength. In reports that contained the stronger sub-frame, a witness for Zimmerman, referred to Trayvon who just turned 17, as a "man" also used interpretations of Trayvon as stronger in the following:

> *…The "man" was plummeting him, slamming his head repeatedly into the pavement so it felt like my head was going to explode, Mr. Zimmerman told the police in newly released tapes… I couldn't breathe, and he still kept trying to hit my head against the pavement.*

The third biological differences sub-frame, less- emotional, contained within Trayvon Martin news reports, framed race as inherently less emotional, including his parents as well as the BLM leaders and participants. An article injected a report that "Martin's parents showed little emotion during remarks." For instance, "The father, who Martin was visiting in Sanford on

the night of his death, watched stoically, his emotions measured best by the slowing or

accelerating speed of his jaw muscles as he grinded through packs of gum." Further, Reverend

Al Sharpton was reported saying that, "Last Saturday we cried… but this Saturday we march."

Contrariwise, a report of Zimmerman that highlighted his emotional state reported that he was

"distraught…stressed and tired after long weeks of not being able to go out in public… and

dealing with the reality that he caused the death of somebody… that weighs on you."

Larger in numbers was the fourth biological differences sub-frame. News about the

number of members or the size of the demonstrations reported, for example, "Police formed a

human barricade in which protestors kept coming, gathering on a swell outside a Shell gas

station," and "3,000 protesters shut down Mall of America, a 'largely organic web' of young

African American activists."

As a final biological differences sub-frame, animalistic imagery, was found to parallel a

rich predatory nature of race to that of its non-raced victims. Animal imagery was also used to

describe race as wild and "bestial." For example, the witness thought he was viewing a "dog

attack," and "The scene reminded the witness of a 'jockey riding a horse'." Animalistic imagery

was more overtly pronounced by Zimmerman who allegedly referred to President Obama as an

"ignorant baboon."

American Myth Narrative frame. The least governing, albeit significant, general frame was the

American Myth Narratives frame (n=22, 15.9%). In the analyzed reports about Trayvon Martin

and BLM, American myth narratives, unsurprisingly, surfaced to frame race in relation to

language unique to America. *Americanness* terminology and catchphrases surfaced including:

"the American Dream," "free speech," "great democracy," "racial harmony and justice," "police

heroism," and "justice for all...regardless of race, gender or background." In the American myth

narrative frame, one sub-frame emerged: the liberty-and-justice sub-frame.

The cherished liberty-and-justice sub-frame was detected in reports, most often in

surrounding race and its position within America's master narrative of freedom. In some

reports concerning Trayvon Martin and BLM, the liberty-and-justice sub-frame treated race as a

coequal, indistinguishable and interchangeable to the justice that universally applies, whereas

other reports treated race as a challenge to be pursued with barriers to the coveted justice.

"Heroic police" together with the criminal justice department and court officials were perceived

as upholding the justice and freedom that is available to all, including Trayvon Martin, George

Zimmerman, and BLM members. For example:

> *Police officers are guardians of this great democracy... The freedom to protest, the*
> *freedom of speech, the freedom of expression-all freedoms we fight for, with our lives.*
> *It's what makes us who we are as Americans. And so we risk our lives for those rights.*

And after the acquittal, news reports of Zimmerman stated that, "Today, I'm proud to be an

American. God Bless America," and "I'm a free American." And later, Zimmerman boasted," I

can do what I want with my possessions." Reports presented race as a challenge and "violently

out-of-reach" to the liberty-and-justice of racial harmony in America. For example:

> Obama attempts to *get America thinking about some of what remains wrong with a*
> *country that enshrined the ideas of equality.....America was referred to as a country that*
> *enshrined the idea of equality in its founding documents ....but has yet to make that real.*

And finally, in the following report, the American myth narrative sub-frame, liberty-and-justice,

presented race in a way in which seeming barriers negate the universal application of liberty-

and-justice sub-frame:

Hopelessness is at an all-time high. When society tells people they are not valuable, people internalize this and they take it out on those closest to them, what Spike Lee called 'self-inflicted genocide.'

Frames utilized by the *New York Times* and *Washington Post*

In order to answer Research Question 1c, articles were separated in using an Excel code sheet according to two sources: *the New York Times* and *Washington Post*. As such, I was able to compare frames within the sample of news reports vis-à-vis Trayvon Martin's murder case and BLM by news source. (See Table 4.3)

Table 4:3 *General frames used in articles from the New York Times and Washington Post*

Frame	Source Type	
	New York Times	*Washington Post*
Anti-Black frame	53	69
Pro- white frame	50	63
Stereotype frame	48	56
Episodic frame	38	45
Black counter-frame	29	39
Thematic frame	23	35
Biological differences frame	26	28
American myth narrative	5	17
Totals	272	352

After reviewing the general frames compartmentalized by news source, few differences were found between general frames utilized in reports by *the New York Times* and those employed by *Washington Post.* Multiple explorations revealed that most articles included between 4-7 frames. A total of 624 frames were identified, of which 272 were present in *The New York Times,* and 352 were present in *Washington Post*. When differences emerged in the number of frames utilized by *The New York Times* and *Washington Post*, *Washington Post* held the highest count in every frame analyzed. This is not surprising, as the *Washington Post* had

the higher news story count of 56.6% (n=78), whereas *The New York Times'* news story count

was 43.5% (n= 60). In lieu of the ubiquitous liberal/conservative view, the frames utilized by

both the *New York Times* and *Washington Post* revealed coverage that was more episodic (n=

38, n=45) than thematic (n= 23, n=35) respectively. In all, the two news sources were similar,

complementary, and thus enriching to the scholarship of framing within the white racial frame.

The anti-Black frame was found in near equal distribution, that is, in 88.3% of *The New*

York Times articles (n= 53) and 88.4% of *Washington Post* articles (n= 69). The pro-white frame

was detected in 83.3% of *The New York Times* articles (n= 50) and 80.7% of *Washington Post*

articles (n= 63). The stereotype frame was present in 80.0% of *The New York Times* articles (n=

48) and 71.7% of *Washington Post* articles (n= 56). The episodic frame was present in 63.3% of

The New York Times articles (n= 38) and 57.6% of *Washington Post* articles (n= 45) whereas

thematic framing was found in 38.3% of articles from *The New York Times* (n= 23) and 44.8% of

articles from *Washington Post* (n=35). The Black counter-frame was identified in 48.3% of *The*

New York Times articles (n= 29) and in precisely half of articles from *Washington Post*. (n=39,

50%). The biological frame was present in 43.3% of *The New York Times* articles (n= 26) and

35.8% of *Washington Post* articles (n=28). Finally, the American myth narrative frame was

identified in 8.3% of *The New York Times* article (n= 5) and 21.7% of *Washington Post* articles

(n= 17).

Differences in Framing race between the Civil Rights Movement and Black Lives Matter

Research question 1d asks if the white racial frame transformed since the reporting of

the Emmett Till murder case and the emergence of the CRM. First, the resultant frames are

presented in Table 4.4 in the order in which they were revealed in my analysis.

Table 4:4 *Differences in frames of Civil Rights Movement and Black Lives Matter Movement*

Frames	Civil Rights Movement		Black Lives Matter Movement	
	Number of Articles	Percentages (%)	Number of Articles	Percentages (%)
Anti-Black frame	114	77.6	122	88.4
Pro-white frame	97	66.0	113	81.8
Stereotype frame	88	59.8	104	75.3
Episodic frame	86	58.5	83	60.1
Thematic frame	59	40.1	58	42.0
Black counter-frame	53	36.0	68	49.2
American Myth Narrative	52	35.3	22	15.9
Biological differences	37	25.1	54	39.1

The second analysis showed that the general white racial frames that dominated news reports of the BLM movement and its catalyst, the Trayvon Martin murder, also dominated news reports of the CRM and its catalyst, the Emmett Till murder. The analyses of frames in articles from Emmett Till and the CRM support the claim that the white racial frame with its pro-white/anti-Black master frame may have prevailed in our increasingly diverse society. What's more, this enduring and encompassing frame may have been aided and embedded by its succeeding frame, the stereotype frame. Dominantly, the anti-Black frame was found in 77.6% (n=114) of articles about Emmett Till and the CRM and 88.4% (n=122) of articles about Trayvon Martin and the BLM movement. Following closely is the pro-white frame which was detected in 66.0% (n=97) of articles with reports of Emmett Till and the CRM and 81.8% (n=113) of articles reporting on Trayvon Martin and the BLM movement. The stereotype frame was found in 59.9% (n=88) of articles about Emmett Till and the CRM and 75.3% (n=104) of articles about Trayvon Martin and the BLM movement.

Next, articles that reported on Emmett Till and the CRM contained coverage that was episodic in 58.5% (n=86) of news reports, and articles that reported on Trayvon Martin and BLM contained coverage that was episodic in 60.1% (n=83) of news reports. Thematic coverage was found in 40.1% (n=59) of news reports concerning Emmett Till and the CRM and 42.0% (n=58) in articles concerning Trayvon Martin and the BLM movement. The near equal amount of episodic and thematic coverage in both articles from the historical CRM and its often perceived modernized movement, the BLM movement, could be due to the high number of articles that were political. American myth narratives were present in 35.3% (n=52) of Emmett Till and the CRM reports and 15.9% (n=22) of the Trayvon Martin and BLM reports. Black counter-frames were detected in 36.0% (n=53) of articles about Emmett Till and the CRM, whereas, Black counter-frames were detected in 49.2% (n=68) of articles about Trayvon Martin and the BLM movement. Finally, while biological framing was present in 25.1% (n=37) of articles reporting on Emmett Till and the CRM, biological framing appeared in 39.1% (n=54) of articles that reported on Trayvon Martin and the BLM movement. A likely reason for the greater percentage of biological frames in the Trayvon Martin and BLM articles could be a result of a greater number of non-racist citizens today who the elite must convince, without any tangible evidence and with no references to race, that Trayvon Martin was guilty for his own murder. In fact, articles concerning Trayvon Martin and BLM contained the highest number of all general frames measured in exception to the Liberty-and-Justice frame that is less convincing to Americans today who see their democracy in great peril.

Not unlike articles from BLM, the white racial frame, its all-encompassing and opposing pro-white/anti-Black frame as well as the stereotypical frame governed reports from the CRM

and its antecedent, the murder of Emmett Till. However, differences were detected in the

texts, catchphrases, adjectives, and sub-frames that presented race as inferior, problematic,

and threatening to the normalization of white maleness that characterized the CRM. The

differences surfaced in the framing of leadership, as well as in the racial linguistic and the way

in which the racist discourse transformed from mostly overt to covert.

Surprisingly, articles that reported on race during the CRM presented the movement

with similarities to the way in which BLM articles presented race including: inadequate,

problematic, and violent. One article reported criticisms of the CRM for having "unruly tactics"

and "methods that were not proper," while others highlighted its "lack of goals and direction."

Despite Mike Huckabees (R) claims in the BLM news reports that the CRM's leaders would be

"appalled" by the BLM's alleged "violent" methods, most of the news articles of the CRM were

also critical of the movement for inciting violence.

The first difference was detected in the way in which articles criticized, and thereby

framed BLM for having 'no leadership,' while articles from the CRM portrayed its leaders,

including Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. as 'inadequate,' 'threatening' and 'violent.' For example,

the threatening and violent sub-frame was found in an article that noted the F.B.I director, J.

Edgar Hoover, who "denunciated Dr. King" as "the most notorious liar in the country," though

the article also acknowledged that King was "the leader the civil rights forces perhaps most

respect." After being accused of "great violence and danger, an article, using sarcasm, reported

on "two prominent leaders in the movement who were imprisoned… along with twenty-five

Freedom Riders in ... Dr. King's ...'nonviolent direct action.'" Members denounced Black racists

and former hero, the Rev. Martin Luther King, for his call to massive civil disobedience" which

was said to have led to… "Civil disorder."

Not only were the civil rights leaders depicted as being threatening and violent, the

movement as a whole, as well as its subsequent split-off groups, were depicted in threatening

rhetoric. Some similarities were found between depictions of the CRM and the BLM. For

example, both news sources from separate eras reporting on two different movements for

racial justice utilized the correspondent concept of "Powder keg" to describe the tension in the

atmosphere that both movements were said to have created.

A second notable difference detected in the stereotyping frame between reports of

Emmett Till's murder case and those of Trayvon Martin's murder case was found in the racial

depictions that ultimately blamed the victims for their own deaths or at the very least

vindicated those murders. While Trayvon Martin was covertly depicted as a 'Gangsta thug'

criminal who was suspiciously out of his place in a gated white neighborhood, one in which

'virtuous' George Zimmerman was patrolling, Emmett Till was stereotyped as an 'over-sexed'

menace to society and a chief threat to that of white women. Articles from the Emmett Till

murder case contained the, now, century-old racial framing of Black men as innately 'savage'

and 'hypersexual,' with bestial-like sexual appetites for white women that were deserving of

death. Emmett Till, age 14, stood as a warning symbol for those who would dare to step out of

their racially subordinate position, threatening to intermix and contaminate the purity of the

white race. The old racial framing of Emmett Till as a sexual predator, a post-slavery 'red-

herring,' served to justify a brutal mob-like lynching that was beneficial to the emergence of the

racial caste operating under the Jim Crow. This appeared in articles that inserted wording and

phraseology to describe an encounter in which Emmett Till allegedly [wolf-] whistled at a white woman. Contradictory reports stated that he addressed the woman as, "Baby," whereas other reports stated that he, "dirty- talked," "insulted a white woman," made "derogatory remarks," issued an "indecent proposal," and even "seized" her "forcefully."

In more recent articles about Trayvon Martin and BLM, the more modern and covert stereotype was utilized, that which depicts Black males as 'criminal Gangsta thugs' who are seen as 'suspicious.' While Emmett Till's murder was justified by many because of race, Trayvon Martin's murder was justified because he was seemingly prone to criminality, "up to no good," and 'out of place' in an all- white, middle-class suburban neighborhood. Furthermore, BLM articles injected subtle and racialized code words- "punk" and "thug" in the racial discourse which are highly recognized as a replacement for the less socially accepted word, 'nigger,' that centers all anti-Black caricature. For example, one article reported a prosecutor who quoted Zimmerman as saying, "Punks"…"adding expletives that Mr. Zimmerman used as he spoke to a police dispatcher on the phone"…"They always get away." On the other hand, the articles about the CRM did rely on aggressive and highly racialized words, including "Nigger," "Negro," and "Negroes."

The third difference found in news reporting between the CRM and the BLM movement was in its transition from more assertive "red neck" and overt depictions of race to more subtle and covert depictions that viewed the CRM as *more* radical, violent, and inferior than the BLM movement today. For example, articles stated that Civil Rights advocates were accused of "hell-hacking the south" and "resorting to a lynching of orderly procedure," whereas reports concerning BLM described "escalating national tension between police and BLM." Other articles

directly portrayed the CRM as "a threat," a "plot to gain power," a "desire for preferential treatment for Negroes," and a "move toward Communism." BLM was portrayed in articles as a "violation of societal rules," a "contribution toward 'anarchy'," and "putting the lives of citizens in jeopardy." Another example was found in an article that reported on Sheriff David A. Clarke Jr.'s speech as he addressed a crowd:

> *He accused protesters of contributing to anarchy and added, 'So many of the actions of the Occupy movement and Black Lives Matter transcend peaceful protest and violates the code of conduct we rely on,' [as the crowd erupted in cheers].*

In reports, split-off groups began to emerge from the CRM after the very brief mentioning of the assassination of Martin Luther King, Jr. in 1968. The emergence was said to be analogous to "changing roles in racial matters indicative of a new political climate," in which many "fear violence and militancy of the Negro." The leader of the Black Power movement, Stokely Carmichael, as well as H. Rap Brown, was referred to as "criminals" and "twin priests of violence," and their group was "compared to a John Birch society and Nazis." Other articles branded Stokely as an "anarchist" and "a national disciple of violence." Black power, was described as a group of "young firebrands," a "new breed of cats," with participants who "boo Martin Luther King…" Other descriptive discourse analogized the Black power movement to that of "a new Negro militancy," "a do-it-alone nationalism," and "Black anti-sentiments" that "compared to the KKK."

The time-frame of articles analyzed between 1955 and 1969 show that the threatening and violent leadership frame did not emerge merely as a result of more assertive "split-off" groups such as the Black Power movement, nor was it solely due to more "firebrand" leaders such as Stokely Carmichael that emerged later. The criticizing of Black leadership, including that

of Martin Luther King, Jr. by whites and the white establishment predates the split-off Black power movements and is evident throughout the time span sampled. Therefore, the way in which the general anti-Black frame was enforced by the media, from as early as 1955, portrayed the CRM as *more* threatening, violent, and radical than the BLM movement.

The CRM articles also portrayed Black Americans as *more* inferior than did the current BLM articles. In the articles analyzed from both eras, we see that the anti-Black frame did not wane, but rather, the terminology and catchphrases detected, again, appeared more subtle. Attacks directly due to color obsession transformed to attacks that indirectly emboldened a colorblind rhetoric that still targeted race, though more covertly. For instance, now, due to centuries of failed attempts to deem Blacks as biologically inferior to whites, together with the fact that it is now socially unacceptable to do so, instead of race being viewed as a barrier to whites "cherished values" and policy preferences, their actions do.

Overt racial frames were first detected in an article relating to Emmett Till that concentrated on Mississippi and its "unique" and "superior positions on race." The arguments stated that, "Negroes are dirty," and in regards to Mississippi's heavy Negro population, "If Negroes received equal status they would overwhelm us." Furthermore, articles from the CRM informed readers that, "Some whites maintained that they were not prejudiced, yet concurrently stated that, "Negroes are inferior." Another article from the CRM reported on a Dallas Sheriff Segregationists who "watched and was 'nauseated' at the line of more than 300 Negroes." Others more bluntly reported, "I don't care for niggers." Particular contrasts in articles that discussed polls taken by whites as well as their reported attitudes about the civil rights drive provided copious overt discussion surrounding race. For instance,

A 37-year-old utility worker of lower-middle income, who had stoutly proclaimed his belief in civil rights, sat without a shirt on the front steps of his brownstone apartment in Brooklyn drinking a beer. He thought a minute about housing integration and said: 'That's the one thing I wouldn't want. As soon as they move into a neighborhood, the place turns into a slum'.

In other articles, while demonstrating, civil rights demonstrators were targeted while under the assumption that they had broken a law (i.e., parading without permits or blocking traffic). It was reported that they were being followed by white supremacists who hurled racist obscenities. For example,

…at least 80 civil rights demonstrators were arrested… after they picketed without a parade permit from the city… Before they were arrested, a crowd of nearly 200 white segregationists carrying Confederate flags marched to within 50 yards of their picket line… White Alabamians led by a suddenly formed organization called 'Citizens for Better Government of Alabama,' jeered and denounced 'outside agitators' as they marched toward the civil rights group at the Capitol steps. The segregationists carried signs reading, 'Who needs Niggers?' and 'Impeach Nigger- Lover Johnson…' their speakers denounced the civil rights demonstrators over a loudspeaker as 'Communist' and 'white and colored beatniks'.

An article reported on civil rights demonstrators in Chicago as well as the white mobs, including the National States Rights Party, Nazis, and the Klansmen, who attacked them with anything they could get their hands on while demanding, "White power" and "Black blood," a centuries old, scientific racist framing of Blacks as biologically inferior due to an alleged "diseased mentality." The leader, Nazi Führer George Lincoln Rockwell, "delivered a racist harangue," calling on his audience to "get guns to fight in 'Coon County'-- an apparent reference to *Cook County…*" He continued by stating that, "for the first time we've got the niggers on the run- we're about ready to play cow," as the "taunting crowd jeered 'Nigger lovers'," "white power," and "free speech."

The fourth difference was identified in a transformation from a color-obsessed overt framing of race as affecting whites' cherished values of 'the southern way of life' and 'protection of the 14th Amendment' during the CRM to a more colorblind covert framing of race as defying whites' 'cherished values' of what it means to be American and pro-Constitution. For example, one article concerning the two men that were acquitted for Emmett Till's murder referred to "outside interests" who were "raising a furor over the case and trying to destroy the 'Southern way of life'." It was also noted that had these white men been charged with the death of Emmett Till, "Our forefathers would have rolled over in their graves." This is not to say that no reports during the CRM echoed color-blindness ideologies. There were demarcations of covert racism that appeared in articles during the civil rights era as well. For example, an article quoted a citizen who stated: "I'm not racist, but I'm proud of my heritage!" Even so, this notion was said "to serve as 'self-justification' for defending segregation that was 'God-ordained'."

In articles about the CRM, it was stated that "Negroes" defied whites' values of the 14th Amendment that provided equal protection for all citizens, yet also addressed what is called a "due process," which prevents citizens from being legally deprived of life, liberty, or *property*. For example, an article concerning the ban that was implemented by courts to stop the non-violent civil rights demonstration in Georgie stated:

> *The petition contended that "an atmosphere of tenseness and impending danger now looms over the city of Albany which threatens to erupt in mass violence and the deterioration of the public peace." Judge Elliott held that it appeared that activities of the Negroes "threaten mob violence" and tended to deny other citizens equal protection of the laws under the Fourteenth Amendment to the Constitution.*

In contrast, reports of Trayvon Martin and the BLM movement converted from overt racism into a coherent belief system that reflected more subtle forms of racism fixed on white's

values of overall "Americanness" and "pro-constitution" ideologies. Reports on George

Zimmerman auctioning the gun that was used to shoot Trayvon Martin was defended by his

strong identity with that of an American, whereas an article branded BLM "un-American." For

example, Zimmerman in referring to the gun as "an American icon" stated:

> *The firearm for sale is the firearm that was used to defend my life and end the brutal attack from Trayvon Martin on 02-26-2012…I have decided not to cower…I am a free American... I can do what I want with my possessions*.

Another example was highlighted in an article about a white man accused of shooting BLM

protesters who prescribed to a "sovereign citizen's subculture" which upholds anti-government

ideologies and "very intense pro-Constitution and sovereign citizen views." Conceivably, the

groups, including the shooter, were reported as having "negative experiences with and opinions

about African-Americans," however, their racial attitudes also indirectly connected to cherished

allegiance to the constitution that established a new white republic.

The final transformation detected in which racism became more subtle and colorblind in

the media news was in its strong association with racial policy preferences by whites, from that

of housing segregation in the CRM to that of gun laws during the BLM movement. During media

reporting of the CRM, the fight for voting rights, desegregated schools, and housing came with

strong white resistance. For example, in articles that depicted race as inferior, a 72-year old

citizen was quoted saying, "I would be the first to move out if a Negro family moved into this

neighborhood… Property devalues as soon as a Negro moves into an area." However, currently,

segregation has now become normalized and racial integration no longer threatens most

whites since many Black people are now confined to inner cities. The gun violence, both by so

called "Black-on-Black" crime and the disproportionate violence committed by police

contributes, in part, to yet another racial formation that is operating in the U.S. as the Criminal Justice System. Within this racial caste, framing race as "criminal" or "threatening" acts as an automaton in lieu of a *social imagination* that could otherwise take into account the patterned nature of racial castes in America and the wider context that links historic slave patrols to the police brutality we see today.

In the articles concerning the BLM movement, we see more color-blind and subtle opposition to gun control by many whites, including Zimmerman, Zimmerman's defense team, and the National Rifle Association (NRI). For example, one article stated that, "Mr. Zimmerman has said that he shot Mr. Martin, 17, in self-defense." Other articles that we have already reviewed, showed how Trayvon Martin's character was attacked in order to justify the need for "Stand-Your-Ground" laws and "self-defense" laws. For example, and article stated that, "a lawyer for Mr. Zimmerman released new material on Thursday that depicted Mr. Martin as troubled at school and enamored of a "Gangsta" culture. In one article that described scrutiny of the "Stand-Your-Ground" gun law reported that, "In Florida, it was pushed heavily by the National Rifle Association, but opposed vigorously by law enforcement."

For sake of summarizing the discovered ways in which the white racial frame transformed since the reporting of the Emmett Till case and the CRM, a list is constructed as follows:

1. Inadequate, violent, and threatening leadership to no leadership

2. Color-obsessed racist depictions that manifested in centuries- old stereotypical depictions of Emmett Till as "hypersexual" to those that were colorblind and covertly depicted Trayvon Martin as a modern criminal "Gangsta" thug

3. Aggressive framing that portrayed the CRM and its leadership as *more* violent, *more* radical and *more* inferior than that of the BLM

4. Overt racism that presented race as a barrier to whites' cherished values of "the southern way of life," as well as barriers to the protection under the 14th Amendment to the Constitution to a more covert presentation of race as a barrier to whites' ideologies of what it means to be American and pro-Constitution

5. Overt racism attached to whites' policy preferences of housing segregation to covert racism that attached race to whites' policy preferences of gun laws such as Stand-Your-Ground and self-defense

The White Racial Frame and Silencing of Racial Activism

Research Question (1e) asks whether the use of the White Racial Frame suppressed racial activism in reports of Trayvon Martin and BLM. The researcher revisited each news report to see if they contained barriers to mobilizing or to the continuance of demonstrations by BLM. An additional column was constructed for coding "silencing racial activism" in order to apply qualitative examples from articles that would explain how racial activism was silenced. Over half of the Trayvon Martin and BLM articles analyzed utilized the silencing racial activism frame (n=89, 64.4%). In an exploratory nature, the researcher was then able to discover terminology and language that employed silencing racial activism sub-frames which included: guilty/innocent, post-racial, fear-mongering, criminalization of racial activism, and the obedience.

The first sub-frames was derived from language that deemed race as guilty until proven innocent, whereas others interconnected to infer that racism is no more. These sub-frames,

together with fear-mongering phraseology and wording that criminalized protesting and dissenters, created a massif of barriers to racial activism. Opposing representations of character, deflections, descriptions of riotous arrests, and lectures by authority rendered racial activism inoperable and distasteful. Terms and catchphrases such as: "up to no good," "dwindling white man's rights," Communist [ism]," "militant," "anti-police," "lawlessness," "120 arrested," "let the law be the law," and "remain calm" obstructed attempts to mobilize as well as the initiative to continue in racial activism by inciting: blame, resentment, fear, and obedience to authority. The first silencing racial activism sub-frame, guilty/innocent, can be seen in the descriptions of Trayvon Martin as a guilty "aggressive and skilled fighter" with contrasting descriptions of George Zimmerman as innocent, "unathletic and soft." For example, the following article reveals a text conversation between Trayvon Martin and his girlfriend:

> *"Babe, why are you always fighting?"*
> *"I lost round one," [smiley face emoji inserted] "I won the second and third."*
> *"You need to stop fighting, for real."*
> *"When you gonna teach me how to fight?"*

In addition, a juror who was interviewed stated, "When George Zimmerman confronted him, he [Trayvon] could have walked away and gone home…He didn't have to do whatever he did and come back and be in a fight." The framing of Zimmerman, on the other hand, was that of unwaveringly innocence. For example, "All we did for two years was take 40 statements suggesting Zimmerman was non racist," and that "his history was not as a racist…"

The second silencing racial activism sub-frame, post-racial, was injected in articles that upheld the fallacy of a post-racial trial within a post-racial nation. Hence, racial activism is silenced by obfuscating the dire need for protesting racial discrepancies by again relying on colorblind rhetoric. For example, articles that insisted that, "This is not about race" included

72

those from the mayor of Sanford who apologized for the town's racial past and then insisted

that, "Today, it is no longer accepted." Another article reported that "To bring all this racial

stuff into it seems counterproductive," whereas, a citizen replied that, "It's a bunch of people

grabbing any excuse they can find to go and loot a store, nothing more …Lincoln freed slaves

what, like, 130 yrs. ago. How long does it take you to get your act together?"

Fear-inducing was the third silencing racial activism sub-frame concerning BLM news

reports. An article of a well-known voice in the movement, DeRay Mckesson, was reported to

have "been among hundreds arrested at weekend demonstrations across the country." The

sub-frame of fear mongering can be detected as the media highlighted instances of "dangerous

situations:"

> *… Smoke bombs and flash-bang grenades were used by officers who were targets of rocks and water bottles thrown by protesters… A very dangerous situation…involving the handling of nitroglycerin…the climate is simply too volatile.*

The following article reported on five BLM protesters shot in Minneapolis and served to silence

racial activism by inducing fear:

> *…and the minute I turned around I heard four shots….One whizzed right by me. I was going to get down but then I just ran…Brown said she heard about 15 shots and, when she turned around, four boys on the ground. She said she tended to one who had been shot in the leg... He just kept saying, "Don't leave me, don't leave me," she said.*

Finally, reports utilized fear-mongering as a way to silence the BLM participation by referencing

a study that linked Black American activists, with a preexisting susceptibility to depression and

anxiety, to depression and anxiety that is *dangerous*. For instance:

> *…a lot of African Americans are walking around depressed, coping from day to day, and not really living…One of McCarrel's last Facebook posts was a screenshot of a threatening email he had received: Were (sic) gonna keep making your life hell until you keep your N----- mouth closed, the email said… A few hours before he fatally shot*

himself, McCarrel posted a final message on Facebook: "My demons won today. I'm sorry."

The criminalization of protesting was the fourth sub-frame detected in articles about Trayvon Martin and BLM in which mass arrests of protesters took place. For example, one article reported that, "Although largely peaceful, the demonstrations have been disrupted by several other incidents," and "More than 50 protesters were arrested on Nov. 16 after they shut down a highway." Also, criminalization through "government monitoring" was injected in reports. For example:

> *And in what might be the surest sign yet that a real and functioning movement has been birthed, there are documents and reports detailing the many ways in which BLM activists and protest actions have been—and perhaps remain—the subject of government monitoring.*

It was written that after a Trump rally, Donald Trump referenced the 'good ole days,' as an African American woman protester was being pushed around by a crowd of white men…"You know, he said, "in the old days- which isn't very long ago- when we were less politically correct, that kind of stuff wouldn't have happened." Moreover, the criminalization of protesting was seen in news reports of the White Student Union who referenced the movement to that of "terrorism" on their Facebook page which was designed explicitly to challenge BLM. FOX 55 reported one specific message from the union that stated, "Feel free to send in pictures you take of any Black protestors on the quad so we know who the anti-whites are." Lastly, a news report that reflected the criminalization of BLM sub-frame reported on frustrated tourists who were observing the protests and who declared, "Oh, I don't know why they don't just run over them…" "Is it any wonder they're being gunned down in the street, when they behave like that?"

The final sub-frame in the silencing racial activism frame is obedience. Some articles illustrated the tendency of authoritative figures and those outside of the movement to lecture activists who challenge the racial status-quo. The lectures consisted of pleas for activists to behave and fall in line. For example, "…Remain calm, let the law be the law … Cases aren't going to handle emotions or feelings and opinions." Also, prior to the court's announcement of George Zimmerman's verdict, Mr. Crump, the Martin family's lawyer, asked the family's supporters to "keep the peace" and read a Twitter post by Dr. Bernice King, Dr. Martin Luther King Jr.'s daughter, that read, "Whatever the Zimmerman verdict is, in the words of my father, we must conduct ourselves on the higher plane of dignity and discipline."

In political articles, President Obama was reported stating that, "the solution will require a new level of political sophistication." He goes on to imply that, "Here we are more than a decade into the 21st century, and we are still relying on 1960's -era protest politics to air our grievances." The president continues by urging BLM protesters to "accept a series of partial solutions," and "take half a loaf" in order to advance their agenda. President Obama contends:

> The goal of protest isn't just to protest for the sake of protesting…The goal of protests is to then get the attention of decision-makers and sit down and say, 'There is what we would like to see' and have a 'negotiation' which over time can actually lead to improvements in the system.

And finally, an article mentioned a sign that read, "Make America Safe Again," wherewith Darryl Glenn, a Black Republican responded stating, "Someone with a nice tan needs to say too 'All Lives Matter'," as he lectured the crowd.

V. DISCUSSION

"The media's the most powerful entity on earth. They have the power to make the innocent

guilty and to make the guilty innocent, and that's power. Because they control the minds of the

masses."   (*Malcolm X*)

In lieu of traditional analyses of U.S. racial realities that relegate racism to that of a

"disease" within an otherwise healthy society (Feagin, 2013), the current analysis shows that

modern society, as well as individuals, draw from the white racial frame that portrays Black

Americans as: 'inadequate,' 'criminal,' 'threatening,' 'violent,' and 'inferior.' This is not a new

phenomenon, and fairly, the white racial frame was also discovered during the CRM and

aggressively presented race as even *more* 'inadequate,' 'inferior,' 'criminal,' 'violent,' and

'radical' than it is presented today during the BLM. What's more, the language within the white

racial frame transformed from overt racist framing that connected directly to race to covert

racist framing that indirectly connected to race. This transformation of racism is subtle and thus

harder to detect today, in that most of the new racism is color-blind in place of color-obsessed.

Racial attitudes in the analysis manifested subtly in whites' 'cherished values,' such as a strong

identity with *Americanness* and the Constitution as well as in whites' policy preferences

regarding guns laws. Meanwhile, portraying whites as 'virtuous,' 'protectors,' and 'all that is

good' is clearly observed in BLM news articles and remains unchanged since news articles of the

CRM. In the analysis, this 'protector' status was important to George Zimmerman who was

referred to by prosecutors as a 'wannabe cop' who had made forty-seven calls to 911 to report

mostly suspicious Black males. One such bizarre call to 911 consisted of Zimmerman reporting a "suspicious" Black male between the ages of 7-9 years old.

Consistent with Feagin (2013) who argued that the white racial frame strongly accents a positive orientation to whiteness and a strong negative orientation to blackness, the pro-white/anti-Black dichotomy was found to be the most dominating frame, with its lower level orientation to that of stereotyping. This is important because the white racial frame's pro-white/ anti-Black and stereotypical orientation has persisted for centuries and is speculated to continue unless there is extensive and holistic change. White views, values, and ideologies remain superior in the U.S. and are the default setting by which all others in society are judged.

Black counter-frames were dominant in BLM reports, but not in CRM reports. Though important, thematic coverage, as well as American myth narratives of 'liberty-and justice' and biological framing of race was not found to dominate reports of neither BLM nor the CRM. Moreover, I found that BLM members are given more opportunities to counter this racial framing than members of the CRM were, as leaders like Martin Luther King, Jr. were highly monitored by the government and silenced in the media.

At its most general level, the white racial frame views Blacks as culturally, economically, socially, and politically inferior to that of whites who are viewed as superior. The racial frames prevalent to systematic racism acknowledges an array of institutions that are responsible for its distribution throughout the globe. Nevertheless, "The mass media and politics have been most effective in spreading the frame's anti-Blackness that is 'deep and pervasive'" (Feagin, 2013, p. 91). The white racial frame, whether overt or covert is pertinent in that it influences the negative framing of race by media outlets, and thus by society which renders race as powerless.

In addition, negative stereotypical depictions of race are at the lowest abstract level of the white racial frame. Accordingly, Trayvon Martin was framed as a 'criminal Gangsta thug.' Therefore, this lends further support to both the white racial frame and Katheryn Russell-Brown's concept of the "*criminalblackman*" that stereotypically connects young Black men to crime in America and portrays them as a "symbolic pillager of all that is good." What is more, this criminalizing stereotype of Trayvon Martin contributes to the idea of "racial hoaxes," which leads to fabrications of crime where race is blamed, and/or false allegations of crime that are based on the person's race. In my analysis, the *criminalblackman* stereotype extends to the print media conglomerates- *New York Times* and *Washington Post* where race was an effective alibi in criminalizing the victim, Trayvon Martin, for his own murder and BLM for their own racial oppression.

It is remarkable and worth noting that no tangible evidence was found in reports that authorized the framing of Trayvon Martin as 'criminal,' as he had no criminal background and was not partaking in any criminal and/or violent behavior before the encounter. Likewise, I was unable to find any evidence that would explain the framing of BLM as "violent," as no one affiliated with BLM hurt anyone. Quite the contrary, I found white supremacists who were reported to have shot BLM participants. A powerful white racial frame had to be operating in both the *New York Times* and *Washington Post* as well as in the cognizance of individuals in order to criminalize an unarmed teenager, the target of stalking and murder, for his own death. Furthermore, the BLM movement that is recognized as a movement mostly by and for Black people, was criminalized for allegedly displaying the very violence that they fight against.

Collins (2000) found that *if* women were included in the media, they were portrayed as "lazy," "sexually promiscuous," "subservient," and/or "bitchy." Likewise, in my analysis of news articles, women were highly invisible, still, when referenced, Black women were depicted as 'sassy' and 'hypersexual.' Framing Black women as hypersexual is not a new phenomenon. Throughout history, it has served the purpose of rationalizing the oppression they have endured such as in the raping of Black female slaves by their white slave masters. Once labeled as "hypersexual," the slave masters, then, rationalized and blamed the rape on their "uncontrollable sexual desires." This worked out in favor of slave breeding, then, and the continued harnessing of Black women's fertility today (Collins, 2000).

The origin of the "sassy" image of Black women began in media representations during the Jim Crow era, as Black "mammies" would oftentimes be shown as playfully scolding their white families. This media representation is significant because it not only works to cloud viewers' minds of the brutality of slavery and the Jim Crow, but also the current gendered racism in the U.S., by forging the presumption that Black women were never truly oppressed. What's more, Black women receive a "double dose" of stereotyping in the media because of the intersectionality of both race and gender within a society of white supremacy. The interconnection of race and gender, makes racism, sexism, and subordination appear natural, while it perpetuates the images of Black females as deviant and unable to adopt the standards set forth by whites. For example, drawing from Kimberlè Crenshaw's (1989) theory of intersectionality, we notice that in the reporting of the Trayvon Martin trial, his "sassy" girlfriend's testimony was thrown out because it lacked consistency. Once she was labeled as "sassy," then it was permissible to dismiss her. My findings of Black female stereotypes clarify

Collin's (1990) "sexually promiscuous" and "bitchy" stereotype of Black women, but not the "subservient" stereotype, as the Black females in my findings were anything but subservient, but rather stood firmly for racial justice. Together, my findings of stereotypes of Black people are significant in that they create a major system of control through the media, as those who subscribe to the mass media, according to Holtzman (2000) are more likely to accept these stereotypes as reality if they lack real-world facts to counter them.

The research also extends theories of racial stereotyping, as it shows that not only does society accept these heavily portrayed media stereotypes about people whom they know little about, but also once accepted, society begins to relegate persons to these shared stereotypes where hate is once again socially acceptable. For example, it is seldom that a white person operating in the "front stage" of the white racial frame will attach allegations of guilt directly to race, nevertheless, the analysis discovered that it was quite common for whites to attach allegations of guilt to that of a criminal "thug." In the same way, Alexander (2011) argued that the term, "felon" replaced race during the Jim Crow Era, and in its current form, holds that same implications for those branded. As such, once defined as a felon, the old forms of discrimination in such as employment, housing, voting, education, government benefits, and jury service, suddenly becomes legal again. Next, we will turn our attention to the type of news coverage that is necessary for the white racial frame to operate in media conglomerates, and thus in the minds of those who prescribe to its content.

News Coverage

Although outside of the white racial framing of race, the current study lends further support to Iyengar's (1991) theory of episodic/ thematic political news coverage. The theory

contends that prescribers to heavily episodic news coverage in television tend to attribute

blame to the individual. I found this to be the case for newsprint as well, as Trayvon Martin and

Emmett Till were framed and thus blamed for their own deaths. There was also many articles

that contained thematic coverage, however, it is important to note that when societal issues

were recognized, it was usually done so by established politicians, Black and white, who

scurried over societal topics. The way the news is presented is important because we are

encouraged, even prohibited from using a "sociological imagination," that would otherwise

explore the larger racial realities of such as state sanctioned violence, police thuggery, and lack

of racial empathy that surrounded the death of Emmett Till and Trayvon Martin.

In the analysis, as most of the articles relied on episodic coverage to report on BLM, I

found the white racial frame to be in full force, heavily equating any and all violent activity,

irrespective of membership, to BLM. Hence, anti-Black reporting of the movement employed

sub-frames that relegated the BLM movement to a "threat of a Black militant uprising" and

"lawlessness," and its activists as "violent." In the news reports, BLM activists were said to be

"calling for the deaths of police officers and even the deaths of white people." However, rare

was the case in which activists were given an opportunity to counter these fear-mongering

claims that obfuscate, anger, and invoke fear, as this would not be 'newsworthy' in the eyes of

the corporate media.

Next, framing of biological differences was not considered dominant as it was

represented in less than half of the articles, yet was still crucial in understanding the early racial

framing of Black Americans and the way it still lingers today in the media. Feagin (2013) argues

that recent attempts to resurrect the centuries-old idea of "race" as biological are doing so with

neither a historical lens nor a critical awareness of the concept of race:

'Race' was not a product of critical scientific research, but was a category scheme for human beings intentionally adopted by white biological and medical scientists, other intellectuals, and political leaders in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries as part of a broad racist framing that was central to rationalizing the large-scale oppression of Africans and other people of color during the massive expansion of the Atlantic slavery system over several centuries. Their elite descendants extended this rationalizing racist framing of African-Americans and other people of color-for example, as "inferior" to "superior" whites- during the long Jim Crow era that followed on the slavery era and lasted until the 1960's (p. 119).

Framing race as having biological differences from whites can be seen in reports of

Trayvon Martin and BLM as race was portrayed as: older, stronger, emotional, larger in

number, and with animalistic imagery. These findings are relevant as it provides what Nelkin

and Lindee (1995) (as cited by Feagin, 2013) referred to as a "biological excuse" for further

oppression and the rationale needed to absolve any "moral responsibility" for societal

oppression.

The cherished American myth narrative sub-frame, liberty-and-justice, was not

considered dominant in number, nonetheless, its power, when articulated, was very beneficial

and crucial to understanding the individualistic ways in which race was framed in media reports

of Trayvon Martin and BLM. In addition, the liberty-and-justice sub- frame is crucial to

understanding the ideologies behind framing race in reports of Trayvon Martin and the BLM

movement. Feagin (2013) stated that the liberty-and-justice frame has great irony in that it was

crafted within a system of extreme slavery, as a counter for whites whose liberties were being

suppressed by the British. Furthermore, he noted that the liberty-and-justice frame is mostly

"reserved for rhetorical speeches and sermons" (p. 20). The findings extends this assumption,

as it shows that in the sample articles, that the American myth narrative sub-frame, "Liberty-

and-Justice," was delivered in speeches by white *and* Black elite politicians and court officials.

The criminal justice department officials drew, irresponsibly, from the white racial frame's

liberty-and-justice sub-frame in order to absolve any responsibility or efforts to challenge the

effects of racial discrimination within the department. In this way, rhetorically embracing the

myth of "justice for all," becomes a danger for Black lives who are viewed as threatening.

Research question (1c) asked if there were any differences in frames utilized by the *New*

York Times and *Washington Post* in reports of Trayvon Martin and BLM regarding race. The

analysis uncovered few differences between these two newspaper sources and challenged the

assumption that the *New York Times* is a more liberal -leaning news source than *Washington*

Post. Two different news sources that peculiarly articulated the same frames, the same framing

techniques, and the same type of news coverage to report on race during the Trayvon Martin

murder case and the ensuing BLM movement, is not insignificant. This could perhaps suggest

that these two news sources maybe working together for a common purpose other than

informing its audience.

The Propaganda Model

"We knew that we could not make it illegal to be either against the war or black, but by getting

the public to associate the hippies with marijuana and blacks with heroin and then criminalizing

both heavily, we could disrupt those communities. We could arrest their leaders, raid their

homes, break up their meetings, and vilify them night after night on the news on the evening

news. Did we know we were lying about the drugs? Of course we did."

(John Ehrlichman Chief Advisor of the Nixon Administration)

The analysis showed that the *New York Times* and *Washington Post* complemented each other, as they enacted the white racial frame to influence our understanding of race in ways that were similar. According to Iyengar (1991), episodic coverage of television news provides a distorted portrayal of "recurring issues as unrelated events" that "prevents the public from cumulating the evidence toward any logical ultimate consequence." Consistent with his analysis of television news dominated by episodic coverage , episodic coverage in newspapers was silent on U.S. racialized systems as 'patterned,' or 'reassembled.' Instead, the episodic reporting was heavily fixed on a 'blame frame.' The implications of Trayvon Martin's murder saturated news accounts in lieu of the persistent murdering of unarmed Black men by police.

The debate on the pro-establishment media suggests that through episodic news coverage, accountability from elected officials is deflected, and in fact, reiterates the status quo (Iyengar and Kinder, 1986). This was evident in deliberations from even more liberal elected officials in my analysis. In articles about Trayvon Martin and BLM that were highly racialized, President Obama managed to steer clear from any substantive discussion of race, as it was stated that his only in-depth deliberations on race relations lasted a total of fifteen minutes. In this way, whether reporters for television coverage or journalists for news print coverage, they are likely to respond to the interests of the highest and most powerful of society. Roughly a decade later, Budd, Craig, and Steinmen's (1999) analysis of media framing expounded on this to show that media endorsed biases in framing of the most pertinent regions including: framing in favor of capitalism, patriarchy, heterosexism, individualism, consumerism, and white privilege, among other deeply entrenched values that aid in allocating power in American society. This is a result of the mostly white heterosexual male national press who echo the

84

perceptions, values, and biases of its white consumers who are often uninformed about problems that are unique to Black lives. For example, those who drew from the white racial frame in article about BLM protests at the mall of America, criticized and criminalized the protestors for "shutting down the mall" with protests on their "busiest shopping day of the year." Here, blaming the demonstrators had an effect that was two-fold: providing a foolproof way of deflecting attention away from the reason they demonstrate and their goals and silencing the effects that derestricted capitalism continues to have on race. Interestingly, the episodic coverage of BLM failed to make clear in neither the *New York Times* nor the *Washington Post* that many Black people have *never* trusted U.S. police and their allegiance to 'serve and protect,' irrespective of race.

In their pioneering analysis, Herman and Chomsky (1988) proposed a "propaganda model," in which Chomsky (2012) later reiterated:

The media fulfils a societal purpose, but a very different one. That purpose inculcates and defends the economic, social, and political agenda of political groups that dominate domestic society. Some of the ways they do this is through: selection of topic, framing issues, filtering information, emphasis of tone, but crucially by the bounding of debate to make sure it doesn't go outside of certain limits in order to bound thinkable thought… a "propaganda model" that views the private media as corporations interested in profits at the detriment of quality news (0.37).

Black counter-frames that were dominant in the analysis were used as avenues through which political debates from mostly elite, some of which were Black, manifested as representative. Feagin (2013) stated that, "Americans of color often do absorb some of the white racial frame's negative racial stereotypes and images of people like themselves." They draw from societies framing of race as inferior, lacking in effort, abilities, and even intelligence which can have detrimental effects on them individually and collectively. In light of the

85

propaganda model, and its connection to the current analysis, not only are elite whites observed, but also elite Blacks were witnessed lecturing other Blacks in lower economic stratifications. Therefore, an 'innocent absorption' or a 'careful influence' of the white racial frame must be questioned and further investigated for intent, economically expediency, and in context with existing racial formations. The Black counter-frames in report of Trayvon Martin and BLM can be deceiving, as they appear to give Blacks and Black activists a false sense of representation and voice in societal matters. The counter-frames were navigated by elite politicians who noticeably confined the debate to one that did not prioritize familial or community interests.

The elite representation heavily accentuated the white racial frame, yet, also provided just enough 'impartial' and 'politically correct' presentations that appeared to maintain social order. To do otherwise would question the aforementioned inside motives or behind-the-scenes dealings in which we are to remain oblivious. Ehrlich (1995) noted the "competitive ethos" (p. 196) or the set of shared norms in news reporting whereby 'news' is defined and broadcasted according to the competitors definition, and thus accounts for the shallow and often inaccurate news reports. This leads to the 'assimilation of news,' with all programs taking on a corresponding shape. By providing similar one-sided perspectives, the *New York Times* and the *Washington Post* appeared to be complementing each other, and therefore framing of race was enriched, and overall public knowledge of race as it related to the Trayvon Martin case and BLM movement was controlled. And for these reasons, we continue to blame and frame race, while capitalistic powers in the media remain unchecked.

In turning attention to research question (1d), my analysis shows subtle, yet important ways that the white racial frame has transformed since the reporting of what has been called the most profound of social protests in the 20th century, the CRM and its catalyst, the Emmett Till murder. The study found transformations from inadequate and violent leadership frames during coverage of the CRM movement to no leadership during coverage of the BLM movement. Also, the CRM as a whole was portrayed as *more* violent and radical than the BLM movement. Another way that the white racial framing of race transformed since the reporting of the CRM was in the 'old,' aggressive white racial frame that depicted Emmett Till as hypersexual to the contemporary white racial frame that covertly depicts Trayvon Martin as a criminal thug. Furthermore, the overt, color-obsessed racist dialogue expressed as whites cherished "southern way of life" and support for the 14th Amendment transformed to colorblind dialogue that now covertly connects racism to whites' "cherished values" that are more generally pro- American and pro-Constitution. And lastly, racial rhetoric that once connected racism overtly to whites' policy preferences of segregated housing now connects racism covertly to whites' policy preferences that are pro-gun.

It was socially acceptable during the CRM to hate because of race, therefore Emmett Till was stereotyped because of his race by the "old" racist stereotype that depicted Black men, as 'oversexed' threats to white women. It is important to pause and take note that Emmett Till was a 14 -year old child, however, as illustrated by the biological differences sub-frame, 'older,' Black children were and still are often misperceived as being older, and thus, more mature and responsible for their actions. Joe Feagin (2013) stated that, "The white racial frame is comprised of a large array of elements, including stereotypes in which whites selectively draw, refurbish,

and pass from one generation to the next, deeply embedded by the symbolic interactive process of socialization" (p. 14). Though fear of Black male sexuality saturates society, what is even more steeping today, is fear of Black male criminality. The dominant stereotype has been refurbished, and Black men and teens, such as Trayvon Martin, are labeled as criminal thugs. When society began framing Black men as criminals, we began seeing a fluctuation in the prison industrial complex. It is more acceptable today to hate crime, and thus, Alexander (2011) contends that U.S. society has devised a post-slavery criminal system that operates as a racial caste in keeping mostly brown and Black men locked in a cycle where they are discriminated against in all the ways that the Jim Crow discriminated against race. The analysis found that the patriarchal nature of the white racial frame was drawn on that depicted 14 year-old Emmett Till as 'oversexed' and a threat to the store owner's young and "pretty brunette wife." The finding complements what Loewen (1999) believes to be the effect of framing Black sexuality, which is "fueled disgust with miscegenation." The ironic nature of the white racial frame's transformation is that white slave masters who lusted after Black female slaves now all of the sudden oppose Black men being with white women. There are various views as to why Black sexuality, and more so Black/ white sexuality is taboo, however, the conversation usually centers around sex, not love. In their minds, it is all about sex, like it was when they were raping their Black female slaves.

On the other hand, articles about Trayvon Martin drew upon the contemporary white racial frame, as Black men, have become more suspicious in the minds of the public and within the institution that is the criminal justice system. This finding is crucial in that young Black teens, as well as Black children who are viewed as older, more mature and more responsible for

88

their actions, are also viewed as suspicious. Curiously, this does not cut racial boundaries, in that white teens, as well as white children are often viewed as younger, with ages that are underestimated. This has manifested in the criminal justice system where we find disgruntled "gypsy" cops who are predetermining that Black men are guilty until proved innocent, and these preconceived notions have resulted in many lives being taken or locked away prematurely.

Furthermore, the criminal stereotype is important because throughout modern history, people have framed race or assigned identity based on race as a means of separating, limiting mobility, and maintaining control. Omni and Winant (1986) defined this as a racial formation perspective. Through this perspective, race becomes a political weapon of the dominant group, and hence has limiting effects on the racial group in society. In light of Omni and Winant's (1986) racial formation theory, the analysis extends its interpretation to offer a functional way that the media elite has refurbished the dominant racial stereotype from that of "hypersexual" to that of a "criminal" thug, as a possible "political weapon." In this point in time, to establish a racial formation that is the U.S. Prison Industrial Complex appears to be politically convenient, both for establishing a system of racial control and as a way in which racialized labor is once again co-opted for the benefit of white elites (Alexander, 2011). However, this specific racial formation could not have been successful for the elite in the U.S. society, without first establishing a way to define a large amount of the population as criminal.

Another difference in the way in which the white racial frame has transformed from the CRM to the BLM movement is by the way that race was framed as a threat to whites' "cherished values" of the time, which was still situated on keeping Black people "in their place."

Sears and McConahay's (1973) theory of symbolic racism postulates that much of the traditional white racism has transformed into a belief system that reflects more subtle forms of racism. After the Jim Crow era when traditional white racism became unacceptable, racism became more symbolic and covert, and it manifested in a racialized value system in which Blacks are perceived as dishonoring. The analysis deviated somewhat from what Henry and Sears (2002) defined as the main traditional value connected to symbolic racism, that of "individuality." Instead, it showed that the main ideologies during the Civil Rights era were specific to the "southern way of life" which was largely defined by white supremacy and strong support for the 14th amendment as it related to whites, although it was designed to provide the same rights to Black citizens. Today, white's main values connected to symbolic racism is more general and covertly connected to a strong allegiance to Americanness and the Constitution. However, white support for the 14th amendment served as justification for the striking down of many Jim Crow laws and also protected "states' rights" to ownership of property, which many whites still believed was Black people. The strong states' rights perspective began as a way for elite white to veto any Federal Government action that challenged white elite slave owner's interests to own slaves. The states' rights argument functioned much the same during the Jim Crow period, to veto any government actions against Jim Crow laws. Moreover, the continuous pattern of the long-standing and strong racialized support for states' rights and opposition to "Big Government" can still be seen today. The Federal Government has been vital in helping Black people get established outside of the legal boundaries of centuries of slavery, convict leasing, Jim Crow laws, mass incarceration, and the countless racial disparities today.

However, the transformation of racist framing during media framing of the BLM, show that the more general "Americanness" ideologies or what it means to be an American, as well as Pro-Constitution ideologies were the main cherished values of whites. What is noteworthy about this value is that "American" is synonymous to white American, according to Feagin (2013). For instance, in political framing of race, when Black people are mentioned, they are addressed not as Americans, but Black Americans. In addition, Pro-Constitution ideologies were centered on the 14th Amendment to the Constitution that ended up protecting a slave-like state.

The last difference identified in the white racial framing of race in media reports from the CRM to the BLM movement was a transformation in the way in which racism was affiliated with whites' policy preferences, from opposition to housing integration to opposition to gun control laws. The study of media reports during the CRM were closely tied to intense opposition to racial integration in specifically housing policies. Miscegenation or racial intermixing was characterized by a penetrating fear of what whites believed would affect the "purity" of the white race. Henry and Sears (2002) found in their survey research, that strong racial attitudes predicted whites' opposition to housing policies when the beneficiaries were Black. However, the transformation manifested in whites' opposition to housing policies during the CRM when housing mattered the most to the well-being of Black communities, to whites' opposition to gun control policies now that gun control is essential to Black families and communities. Symbolic racism theory posits that white racism has transformed into a coherent belief system that reflects more subtle and indirect form of racism toward Black people in America. The research advances the theory of symbolic racism to show its prevalence in the media. Media

91

framing of race during the CRM reflected a transformation of overt white racism connected to whites cherished values of the "southern way of life" and Amendments to the Constitution, specifically the 14th Amendment, to covert racism that indirectly connects race to whites' cherished values of a more general identity with "Americanness" and pro-Constitution ideologies during the BLM movement. Furthermore, my findings show that the transformation of media' framing of race was also seen in whites' overt opposition to housing integration in CRM articles to whites' covert opposition of gun control in BLM articles.

The consequences of symbolic racism affect all areas of Black lives. Contested meanings surrounding the Constitution, the southern way of life, and what it means to be American can be understood through the lens of symbolic racism. Not only do Blacks and whites hold different views of race-relations and racism, they also hold significantly different "collective memories" of the past, reflected in the support or opposition to American values. Notwithstanding, the power in society resides in the dominant white group, these collective memories are not equally valued, nor are they equally represented in the societies in which they operate. They are white racially framed and operate from a one-sided, white understanding of the world.

Although, the research question focuses on the differences in the way race was presented in the media during the CRM and BLM, it is also important to note the widespread similarities in the way that they were presented as a threat. An article noted that both movements have been opposed by half Americans, both have needed confrontations to attract national media attention, and both have been criticized for their combative tactics. The reason for such wide-ranging similarities, according to the framing analysis of race during both the

92

CRM and the BLM, requires recognizing the CRM as a highly mythicized "model nonviolent movement." The CRM as a movement with highly effective tactics and idolized leadership by Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. is misleading. Again, the contemporary framing of the CRM as a "model movement" remains a reference point by which the more modern BLM movement is judged, albeit inaccurately. Furthermore, this present day framing is problematic, as Black people during the CRM had to risk and sometimes welcome racially-inspired violence from whites as a vehicle for gaining national awareness that would lead to change within America's landscape of white supremacy.

The analysis of news reports drew from the contemporary white racial frame to deem the BLM movement with "no leadership" as problematic. However, a different perspective, one with a sociological imagination, could take into account the national demographics of the movement in assessing its leadership. Through a demographics framework, it could be argued that the BLM movement, indeed, has leadership however dispersed that it may be. In this milieu, leadership that is distributed throughout the U.S., not unlike the movement itself, is unlikely to be easily eliminated. The historical analysis discovered CRM, the "model movement," to be under heavy surveillance by the FBI, known as COINTELPRO. Though it is mostly absent from CRM discourse today, then FBI Director J. Edgar Hoover described a goal of the counterintelligence:

> *…to expose, disrupt, or otherwise neutralize the activities of Black nationalist, hate-type organizations and groupings, their leadership, spokesmen, membership, and supporters, and to counter their propensity for violence and civil disorder.*

One BLM article highlighted the FBI and government's "historically questionable surveillance" of domestic groups such as the CRM and the Black Panther Party, as well as the Rev. Martin

93

Luther King, Jr. himself. However, this is not only a historical phenomenon, as the article goes on to state that "many of us, as civil rights activists, have become targets of government surveillance for no reason beyond our advocacy or provision of social services for the underrepresented." Also, left out of the current whitewashed discussion of the CRM is Director Hoover who listed Angela Davis as the third woman and the 309th person to appear on the FBI's *Ten Most Wanted Fugitive List*. Though rarely briefed upon in the articles, the leaders of the CRM were often targets due to their power and intellect. We can see a different perspective of the "no leadership" frame in an interview of Van Jones in the 2016 documentary, *13ᵗʰ*, a galvanizing film that critiques the interlocking relationship between the criminal justice system, the 13ᵗʰ amendment, and race. Van Jones explains:

> *The brilliancy of the Black lives Matter movement is they don't have a distributed leadership model where you can't find their address. It's not a stoppable phenomenon by a bullet or anything else, and so there's hope there because of that (1.33:40).*

According to this "no leadership" frame that was injected in BLM reports by the *New York Times* and *Washington Post*, what was meant to be dismissive of the movement, appears to be a main difference in the two movements, a valuable lesson instilled by the Civil Rights era and cleverly heeded by the BLM.

The comparative exploration of two distinct movements for racial equality, the CRM and the BLM movement, is important because it illustrates that racism and racial framing has neither been eradicated nor has it diminished from U.S. media. The transformed white racial frame seems to have taken on subtle and less direct racial implications. It is no longer socially acceptable to be a racist or to discriminate based on color of skin; however, the transformation of the white racial frame from the Civil rights era to the modern BLM era requires a sociological

lens in order to understand the significance of the frame as well as its tendency to transform in the U.S. media over time and space.

In response to research question (1e), the findings show that the white racial frame suppresses racial activism in reports of the BLM through determining guilty/innocent anomalies, post-racial claims, fear inducing tactics, criminalizing racial activists, and a framework of obedience. Under the premise that racism has been eradicated, these covert methods were interconnected to silence the BLM activists. First, the preconceived notion in U.S society determined that upon his death that Trayvon Martin was 'guilty until proven innocent,' whereas Zimmerman was 'innocent until proven guilty.' The articles gave explanations for the assumption that Zimmerman acted in accordance with post-racial ideologies which concluded that supporting his prosecution was nothing more than 'playing the race card.' After all, it was noted in an article that Zimmerman's best friend was Black; he took a Black girl to the prom; and he mentored Black kids.

Articles with a heavy emphasis on the criminalizing of BLM activists allow for several Black activists to be justifiably bound and herded to jail at once. Moreover, much like the CRM, it was found that BLM was under heavy surveillance as reported previously. The study indicates that these serve as fear-mongering techniques that prohibit those who would have otherwise joined the BLM movement. And lastly, although it was neglected in CRM articles, Martin Luther King, Jr. once stated that being lectured to 'slow down' almost always meant never. The next section discusses framing disputes and contests that were uncovered as covert ways of deflecting from the purpose and goals of the BLM movement.

Frame Disputes and Contests

The frame disputes identified in the BLM articles referred to differences of opinions regarding the expression "Black Lives Matter." Rather than simply agreeing that Black lives do, in deed, matter, it was renounced by "All Lives Matter," imaginably by whites who function day-to-day in white social groups with little to no interaction with Blacks. Further, the expression was rebuffed by police who declared that, "Blue Lives Matter" and/or "White Lives Matter." These responses, albeit true, become contests that are flawed, as they deflect from the broader implications that Black lives, unlike white lives or blue lives, are devalued and have historically not been treated as if they matter.

In the context of social movements, frame disputes erupt within movements [intra-organizational disputes] or between representatives of two or more social movement organizations [inter-organizational disputes]. Frame disputes in the wider political arena such as those that often arise amid a social movement and their opponents are referred to as "framing contests." In this case, Benford and Snow (2000) posit that "reality" or compromise must be negotiated. Disturbingly, saying that "Black Lives Matter" is threatening and controversial in U.S. society of white hegemony. However, in an article, now former President Obama stressed that BLM is not saying that other lives do not matter, but rather they are expressing concern for things that are happening in the Black community that are not happening elsewhere.

When BLM activists and supporters affirm that BLM, it is synonymous to environmentalists who assert that "Our planet matters." When that is declared, it would be awkward to hear strong opposition that, "Mars matters too!" It would deflect attention away from the matter at hand, which in this case, would be our planet and the detrimental effects

that, for instance, climate change is having on it. In this way, the opposition, in fact, silences the voices that want nothing more than to be treated and valued as other citizens, not better than. When this conflicting paradigm is allowed to fester in society, racial resentment is the outcome, and the continued treatment of Black lives as 2nd class citizens, both in societal structures and individual minds.

The way in which the media frames race appears to be destructive to Black individuals, communities, and movements for racial equality. The study shows that through an aggressive white racial frame, BLM is framed heavily by the media who have the power to affect the overall perception of the movement. The study also reflects the transformation of past several decades to more colorblind language that has disconnected racism from race, and now connects it to stereotypes and whitewashed narratives and ideologies. Stereotyping and framing was found to be systematically aligned with and in context to the specific racial formations, racial ideologies, and/or racial policies that were operating in America at that time. For example, after the racial caste of slavery and later convict leasing, white elite had to design another way in which whites could profit from Black bodies, hence Black men were framed as dangerous and criminal in order to rationalize being herded to prison where they once again were agents of profit.

Finally, as extra findings, the study showed that politics have not concerned themselves with BLM as they did with the CRM, which could be a result of politics becoming more interconnected with capitalism and the resulting "propaganda model." Another emergent detail accentuated a modern mythicizing and idolizing of the CRM legacy and its leader, Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. To the extent that we now recognize it today, the CRM is esteemed as the

"model movement" and serves as a default basis of judgement for the modern BLM. This finding, too, is important because if BLM is to learn from the CRM strategies, they must know that it was framed as even *more* threatening and violent than BLM is today, yet, this actually functioned to give the CRM the media attention it needed for the change that transpired.

Several ideas are gleaned from the research. For instance, being labeled as threatening and violent should not stop BLM's pursuit for racial equality. If it is correct to say that history repeats itself, then we will see the violent frame be transformed in forthcoming generations. Additionally, BLM should be encouraged to continue organizing around the confines of the U.S. corporate-controlled mass media and the established politicians, who benefit from the position of those restricted to the lower ranks of the U.S. hierarchy. This includes some Civil Rights leaders who have become part of the establishment since the CRM. In relation to CRM, BLM is in a much better position to keep fighting in spite of the media framing and the lack of political support that in many ways aided the CRM, in that BLM is highly dispersed with no central leadership. In other words, the BLM is not a stoppable movement in comparison to the CRM that was leadership dependent. It appears that when Black Americans rally together, they have traditionally been an 'unstoppable' force, and the BLM movement looks to be as well.

What is left out of racial media framing is usually what is most central to race and racial movements. For example, the study of news articles of BLM did not include the central components of the movements that could have otherwise provided a sociological lens in which to see the purpose of the movement and why it is necessary in the post- CRM era. This was also evident in news articles from the CRM. Not unlike society in general, the central message of Martin Luther King's infamous "Letter from the Birmingham Jail," was left out. The letter

addressed, not the 'Ku Klux Klanner,' but the white moderate who was an alleged sympathizer

of the CRM and who was more concerned with shunning the tactics of the CRM, calling for

'order,' and lecturing the leaders to 'wait.' Just like today, silence meant complacency, and

therefore, King stated that, "Lukewarm acceptance is much more bewildering than outright

rejection." King went on to justify the movement to whites by stating, that, "We know through

painful experience that freedom is never voluntarily given by the oppressor; it must be

demanded by the oppressed." This silenced message, in fact, could be the reason that, though

King's framework was that of nonviolence, he was labeled as such. In the later years of the

CRM, King began directing his message to the establishment in which he brought to attention

the economic exploitation. He dreamed of a world in which men would no longer take from the

poor to provide luxuries for the elite. Noticeably, this messages is threatening to both the racial

status-quo and the class status-quo of the era, and therefore, the context in which framing

occurs is again shown to protect the racial ideologies that it operates under. King was killed

shortly after calling for a Poor People's Movement which targeted the establishment.

Furthermore, King's economic message that was mentioned vaguely in articles during this time

is also missing from discussions of his legacy today.

The study provides an extensive literature review of scholarship about misperceptions

of Black lives to show that white America's knowledge about their fellow Black counterparts, is

foreign. What's more, there is only meagre scholarship on framing race in the media and within

racial movements, during the past CRM, and more so, during the 21st century BLM movement.

This research is the first to explore newsprint's framing of race during two racial movements,

the CRM and the BLM movement and to implement a comparative exploration of the two

distinct racial movements. The comparative analysis allows us to assess ways in which frames, and more specifically, the white racial frame has transformed over time since the CRM. This research is helpful in that media frames affect perceptions which, in turn, effects behaviors, and so too does the kind of coverage that is used by the media. Framing race, especially within episodic coverage, can lead to the belief that the racial groups, rather than societal ills, are to blame for circumstances beyond their control. The findings extend the Theory of Symbolic Racism into the newsprint media to show that the theory was in full force during the BLM movement, though it was not completely absent during the CRM of the 50's and 60's.

The study is comprehensive, but like most studies, it has its limitations. For one, only two sources were utilized, that of the *New York Times* and *Washington Post,* and these two sources were neutral and clarifying of each other. However, future research could employ more diverse sources, including partisan sources in order to extend our understanding of racial frames in the mass media. Additionally, future research could go outside the confines of corporate media to investigate the prevalence of frames untampered by the media. And lastly, future research should focus on framing during the BLM movement, and investigate the ways in which the identified frames in the study evolve over time as the movement progresses, as it is likely to do. Framing is extensive and does not absolve, but rather it appears to be modernizing. The aim of the research was to add to the framing scholarship by drawing on the white racial frame, turning scholarly attention to the position of race in the BLM and to explore the ways in which frames evolve over time. By examining how race is being framed in the media and focusing intently on theorizing the subtle ways in which racial frames transform, we will have a sounder body surrounding framing theory that is better able to influence racial activism.

100

VI. CONCLUSION

Framing is built upon underlying beliefs, values, experiences and/or mental structures.

Framing as mental short cuts allows for individuals, whether conscious or not, to make sense of

the world around them, and as shown in the study, framing can be indirect. As such, framing

others that we are unfamiliar with obstructs contribution to a deep understanding of diverse

ideas by confounding communication and public dialogue. Indeed the framing of race that is in

the media leaves society unmoved and as a more serious ramification, racially resentful, and

furthermore, re-framing race, alone, may not suffice.

> *Framing theory offers a relatively shallow conception of the transmission of political ideas as marketing and resonating, while a recognition of the complexity and depth of ideology points to the social construction processes of thinking, reasoning, educating, and socializing (*Oliver & Johnson, 2000, para 1).

Linking these two concepts, framing and ideology, to compensate for [re]framing alone,

may be more helpful in understanding ways in which race is both framed, rather than merely

reframing one idea with its opposite. As such, exploring traditional ideologies and frames,

combined with understanding, teaching, and socializing new, accurate, and diverse ideologies

are crucial. Although the project does not center on intersectionality, the master's tools are

apparent: oppression, racial [re]framing and ideologies, whitewashing narratives and history,

racial resentment, blame, patriotism, lecturing, cognitive dissonance, and extraordinary denial

of racial oppression. And, to cite Lorde (1984), "The master's tools will never dismantle the

master's house." These tools were found to brush over the larger racial realities that are

constricted by frames have not been very effective in reframing the conversation of race. White

Americans have been responsible for a large part of America's legacy of violence; however,

instead of making amends, the study has shown that race remains foreign to the white population in U.S. society.

Recognizing the media's subtle ways of framing race is important. The study found that the media presented race as: inadequate, lawless, criminal, lazy, and threatening. By conceptualizing race as biological different from that of whites, Blacks were presented as older, stronger, more numerous, bestial, and militant. The threat of a Black militant uprising is the lingering fear at the heart of the U.S. racial status quo. However, through the media's accent of episodic news coverage, repetitive pro-white/anti-Black messages under the guise of liberty-and-justice, create blame sub-frames that serve to disregard thematic coverage, including lack of opportunity, systemic racism and white supremacy that underlie racial oppression. The study shows that racist framing is still just as prevalent as the traditional, blatant racism of the Jim Crow era, yet has transformed in ways that subtly portray Black demands as counter to whites' cherished American and pro-Constitution values and gun policy preferences, without explicit mention of race today. This transformation is a result of public spaces where it is no longer socially acceptable to be a 'racist,' nor is it 'politically correct.' Nonetheless, during times of economic instability, those who are unsophisticated contribute elusive fault, that is, an unwillingness to "try harder," to those more economically oppressed than they themselves. The white racial frame was shown to be "deep and pervasive," albeit socially malleable, as race is scapegoated, particularly in times of economic uncertainties and while operating to rationalize the particular racial formation or caste at the time. In the U.S., the media's framing of race is one of many ways to support a current elite business model over the welfare of its citizens, specifically its African American population. And, in a global context, the U.S., while

championing democracy for all, has organized coups to destroy democratic nations

unsupportive of America's elite business dealings, while supporting those who are 'friendly' to

it (Feagin, 2013).

As a nation, we have been socialized to believe whatever the media defines as

'newsworthy.' And, disturbingly, consumers of U.S. mass media are *cognitive misers*, who often

are without the time, interest, or ability to critically think about what is being misrepresented

and the dissonance it creates. Still, many progressives have turned in protest toward

independent websites that are not beholden to white hegemony, nor to the ideas of crony

capitalism. However, those who see this as a challenge to the "manufactured consent" of U.S.

media, are now ironically framing this representative news as "fake news." As a theoretical

explanation, frames are said to be built upon underlying beliefs, values or simplifications of

some reality, however, many of the racial frames were found to be antithesis to the reality

under investigation, and we must ask why. For example, BLM was framed as violent while they

were actually the victims of violence by those who framed them as such. Another example is

the framing of Trayvon Martin as a criminal "Gangsta" thug, when reality reveals a teenager

who was adorned in out-dated, pegged pants and a snuggly fit sweatshirt with a small hoodie,

returning from the store with skittles and tea while talking on his cellphone. And finally,

Zimmerman was framed as 'virtuous' and 'protecting,' even though reality was that

Zimmerman, armed with a gun, dismissed 911 operators' orders, to continue stalking Trayvon

Martin in whom he eventually shot to death. This shows that the white racial frame is not only

prevalent, but is very strong, multifaceted, and deeply embedded in U.S. society. It appears

more rationally to argue the extent to which Trayvon Martin considered George Zimmerman a threat and dangerous, as Trayvon more than likely feared for his life.

It appears that the "incomplete paradigm" of framing research has sidestepped the corruption aspect of the white racial frame in the media. A connection to corruption was evident in media portrayals of race, and this is problematic in that the media, and specifically national newspapers- the *New York Times* and *Washington Post*- are known to be responsible for controlling the dominant narratives. Moreover, the political elite are designing a cyber fraud bill aimed at 'fake news' which would prohibit independent digitalized news reporting that is not defined by corporate powers. This is an indication toward a Marxist perspective of the collusion between the "rulers" which would be considered owners of the mass media. This demonstrates the need for a great numbers of sophisticated young people of color to get involved as journalists in order to challenge the mass media narratives that support both the class and racial status quo.

A nation's media is central to its democracy, and hence the way in which the mass media contextualizes race is imperative. However, in America, media consumption by citizens are expected to contribute blame to individuals instead of broader sociopolitical realities. According to my analysis, the use of the white racial frame in the media appears to contribute to framing Black Americans and may contribute to our understanding of the immense discrepancies between racial realities and racial perceptions in society in which the master tools have not successfully eliminated. According to a Marxist perspective, the media acts as a tool of exploitation that prevents those exploited of all races, from uniting against the "ruling class." Rather than unity, as white America is becoming the minority, we are seeing an increase in fear

directed at people of color and an unfortunate decline in race relations. The study revealed

how the new racism manifests from blatant racial hostility to less identifiable blame that

silences racial activism, larger sociopolitical racial realities, and abilities to navigate Black

counter-frames. In sum, the white racial frame is a useful guide in exploring the large gap in

discrepancies between realities of race and racial movements and their perceptions.

Investigative journalism that challenges the effects of capitalism on media's tendencies

to frame its citizens of color should be supported, however limited this may be. As a more

practical alternative, those with sophistication could be vigilant in educating unaware

consumers of mass media that this national problem exists, and that there currently exists a

growing digital media alternative.

Black Americans have inherited this white racial frame that is full of discriminative

beliefs, interpretations, and actions that they themselves did not construct. The frame

encapsulates all the barriers that challenge and limit brown and Black lives, yet not without

resistance from Black Americans and other people of color to reframe the "natural" taken for

granted, dominant narratives, with counter-stories (Delgado, 1989). What's more, the critical

race theory has highlighted the importance of activism in progressing toward greater equality,

including white accountability (Bonilla-Silva, 2003; Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). Education using

a sociological lens of structural disparities and Black and white ideologies could strengthen

activism and perhaps benefit those who are stupefied and unable to appreciate the beauty and

resiliency of Black Americans' lived experiences. For these reasons, perhaps it is time to do

what Audre Lorde (2003) advised, that is to, "drop the microphone," critically analyze the mass

media's representation of race, and listen to those being framed with and through a sociological imagination.

"There will be neither rest nor tranquility in America until the colored citizen is granted her citizenship rights. The whirlwinds of revolt will continue to shake the foundation of our nation until the bright day of justice emerges."

Rev. Martin Luther King, Jr.

REFERENCES

Alexander, M. (2011). *The New Jim Crow: Mass Incarceration in the Age of Colorblindness*. New

York: The New Press.

Baum, D. (2016, April). Legalize it all: How to Win the War on Drugs. *Harper's Magazine.*

Retrieved from http://harpers.org/archive/2016/04/legalize-it-all/

Benford, R.D. (1997). An Insider's Critique of the Social Movement Framing Perspective.

Sociological Inquiry, vol. 67 (4): 409-430. Retrieved from http://www.unc.edu/~fbaum/

teaching/articles/Soc_Inquiry_1997_Benford.pdf.

Benford, R.D. & Snow, D.A. (2000). Framing Processes and Social Movements: An Overview and

Assessment. *Annual Review Sociological*, 26: 611-639.

Bennett Jr., L. (1975). *The Shaping of Black America: The Strategies and Triumphs of African

American, 1619 to the 1990s*. USA: Penguin Books.

Blakey, M. L. (2001). Bioarcheology of the African Diaspora in the Americas: Its Origins and

Scope. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 387-422.

Bobo, L.D. & Fox, C. (2003). Race, Racism, and Discrimination: Bridging Problems, Methods, and

Theory in Social Psychological Research. *Social Psychology Quarterly*, vol. 66 (4): 319-

332. Doi: 10.2307/1519832.

Bolge, D. (1994). *Toms, Coons, Mulattoes, Mammies, and Bucks: An Interpretative History of

Blacks in American Films*, 3rd Ed. New York: Continuum.

Bonilla-Silva, E. (2003). *Racism without Racists: Color-Blind Racism and the Persistence of Racial

Inequality in the United States.* Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

Brown, M. K., Carnoy, M., Currie, E., Duster, T., & Oppenheimer, D. B. (2003). *Whitewashing

Race: The Myth of a Color-blind Society. University of California Press.

Budd, M., Craig, S., & Steinman C. (1999). *Consuming Environments: Television and Commercial Culture.* New Brunswick, NJ. Rutgers University Press.

Bureau of Justice Statistics. (2012). *Sourcebook of Criminal Justice Statistics*. Washington, D.C. U.S. Government Printing Office.

Collins, P.H. (1990). *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment*. Cambridge, MA: Unwin Hyman, Inc.

Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 139-167.

Delgado, R. (1989). Storytelling for Oppositionists and Others: A Plea for Narrative. *Michigan Law Review, 87,* 2411-2441.

Delgado, R. & Stefancic, J. (2001). *Critical Race Theory: An Introduction*. New York University Press.

Delli Carpini, M.X. (1999). In Search of the Information Citizen: What Americans Know about Politics and why it Matters. *The Communication Review (4)* 129-164. Retrieved from http://doi.org/10.1080/10714420009359466.

Dill, B.T. (1979). The Dialects of Black Womanhood. Chicago: *Chicago Journals.*

DiTomaso, N. (2013). The American Non-Dilemma: Racial Inequality without Racism. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

Dovidio, J.F. & Gaertner, S.L. (2004). Aversive Racism. *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology, vol. 36.*

108

Dyer, R. (1997). *White*. London England: Routledge.

Ehrlich, M.C. (1995). The Competitive Ethos in Television News work. Critical Studies in Mass

Communication, 12, 196.

Entman, R.M. (1993). Framing Toward Clarification of a Fractured Paradigm. *Journal of*

Communications, 43 (4): 51-58.

Feagin, J. R. (2004). Documenting the Costs of Slavery, Segregation, and Contemporary Racism:

Why Reparations are in Order for African Americans. *Harvard Blackletter LJ*, *20*, 49.

Feagin, J.R. (2006). *Systemic Racism: A Theory of Oppression*. New York: Routledge.

Feagin, J.R. (2010). *Racist America: Roots, Current Realities, and Future Reparations*. New York:

Taylor & Francis [CAM]

Feagin, J.R. (2013). *The White Racial Frame: Centuries of Racial Framing and Counter-Framing*,

2nd Ed. New York: Taylor & Francis.

Fitzgerald, K.J. (2014). *Recognizing Race and Ethnicity: Power, Privilege, and Inequality*. Boulder,

Colorado: Westview Press.

Gallagher, C.A. (2003). Color-blind Privilege: The Social and Political Functions of Erasing the

Color-line in Post -Race America. *Race, Gender and Class, vol. 10* (4): 22-37.

Gamson, W.A. & Modigliani, A. (1989). Media Discourse and Public Opinion on Nuclear Power:

A Constructionist Approach. *American Journal of Sociology, 95* (1): 1-37.

Goffman, A. (2009). On the Run: Wanted Men in a Philadelphia Ghetto. In an Alice Goffman

Presentation Conference (2016) at Athens State University. *American Sociological*

Review, *74*(3): 339-357.

Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience*. Boston:

Northeastern Press.

Graber, D. (1984). *Processing the News: How People Tame the Information Tide*. Longman, New

York.

Haney-Lopez, I.F. (2006). Color-blind to the Reality of Race in America*. Chronical of Higher Edu-*

Cation, November 3. Retrieved March 13, 2016 from

http://laverne.edu/diversity/files/2013/08/LOPEZ-Honorary-Whites.pdf

Haslam, N., Rothschild, L. & Ernst, D. (2000). Essentialists Beliefs about Social Categories. *British*

Journal of Social Psychology, *39*:113-127. doi: 10.1348/014466600164363.

Henry, P.J. & Sears, D.O. (2002). The Symbolic Racism 2000 Scale. *Political Psychology*, 23:

253-283.

Heitzeg, N.A. (2013). Of the Verdict, "Whiteness," and Abolition. *Critical Mass Progress*.

Retrieved from http://criticalmassprogress.com/2013/07/17/ci-7-the-verdict-whiteness-

and-abolition/.

Hermon, E.S. & Chomsky, N. *Manufacturing Consent*. New York. Pantheon Books.

Holtzman, L. (2000). *Media Messages: What Film, Television, and Popular Music teach us about*

Race, Class, Gender, and Sexual Orientation. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe Publishers.

Hooks, B. (1989). *Talking Back: Thinking Feminist, Thinking Black.* Boston, MA: South End Press.

Hoover, E.J. (1968). FBI Domestic Intelligence Activities: COUNTELPRO Revisited- Spying and

Disruption. Retrieved on March 13, 2016 from

www.whatreallyhappened.com/RANCHO/POLITICS/COINTELPRO-FBI.docs.html*.*

Iyengar, S. (1991). *Is Anyone Responsible?* University of Chicago Press.

Iyengar, S. & Kinder, D.R. (1987). *News that Matters: Television and American Opinion*.

University of Chicago Press: Chicago.

Iyengar, S., Peters, M. & Kinder, D.R. (1982). Experimental Demonstrations of the 'Not-So-

Minimal' Consequences of Television News Programs. In J.T. Jost, J. Sidanius, J.

(Eds.), Political Psychology: Key Readings (pp. 139-149). New York, NY, US:

Psychology Press.

Jasper, J.M. (1997). *The Art of Moral Protest*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Jensen, R. (2005). *The Heart of Whiteness: Confronting Race, Racism, and White Privilege*. San

Francisco: City Lights.

Johnson, L.D., O'Malley, P.M., Bachman, J.G. & Schulenberg, J.E. (2008). Monitoring the Future:

National Results on Adolescent Drug Use. Overview of Key Findings, 2009. NIH

Publication No. 10-7583. *National Institution of Health.*

Jordan, W. D. (1968). *White over Black: American Attitudes t̶oward the Negro, 1550-1812*. UNC

Press Books.

Karp, W. (July, 1989). All the Congressmen's Men: How Capitol Hill Controls the Press.

Harper's Magazine. Retrieved from harpers.org/archive/1989/07/all-the-

congressmensmen-men/

Kinder, D.R. & Sears, D.O. (1981). Prejudice and Politics: Symbolic Racism versus Racial Threats

To the Good Life. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, vol. 4* (3): 414-431.

Retrieved from www.collingwoodresearch.com/uploads/8/3/0/8360930/kinder-

Sears_1981_pdf.

Leary, J. D. (2016, January). [House of Spiritual Awakening]. *Post Traumatic Slave Syndrome:*

America's Legacy of Enduring Injury and Healing. [Youtube]. Retrieved on March 13

From http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vmKlq_d8TMA.

Levi, M. (2006). The Media Construction of Financial White-Collar Crimes. *The British Journal of*

Criminology, vol. 46 (6) pp. 1037-1057. Retrieved from

http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bjc/az1079.

Lippman, W. (1925). *The Phantom Public: A Sequel to "Public Opinion."* The MACMILLAN

Company. Harcourt, New York. Retrieved from

htttp://my.ilstu.edu/~jkshapi/Lippmann%20Phantom.pdf.

Lipsitz, G. (2009). *The Possessive Investment in Whiteness: How White People Profit from*

Identity Politics. Temple University Press.

Lipsitz, G. (2011). *How Racism Takes Place*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2011.

Loewen, J.W. (1999). *Lies Across America: What our Historic Sites Get Wrong*. New York: The

New Press.

Long, E. (1774). *The History of Jamaica: Or General Survey of the Ancient and Modern State of*

that Island, with Reflections or its Situation, Settlements, Inhabitants, Climate, Products,

Commerce, Laws, & Government. 6th ed. Lowndes, London.

Lorde, A. (1984). The Master's Tools Will Never Dismantle the Master's House**.** *Sister outsider:*

Essays and speeches. Ed. Berkeley, CA: Crossing Press, pp. 110-114, 2007. Retrieved

From http://collectiveliberation.org/wp-

content/uploads/2013/01/Lorde_The_Masters_Tools.pdf.

McAdam, D. (1996). The Framing Function of Movement Tactics: Strategic Dramaturgy in the

American Civil Rights Movement. In D. McAdam, J. McCarthy & M, Zald (Eds.)

Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements: Political Opportunities, Mobili

zing Structures, & Cultural Framings. Cambridge. Doi: 10.1017/CB097805/1803987.017.

McCombs, M.E. & Shaw, D.L. (1972). The Agenda-Setting Function of Mass Media. *Public Opinion Quarterly, 36* (2): 176.

McConahay, J.B. & Hough Jr., J.C. (1976). Symbolic Racism. *Journal of Social Issues*, 32 (2): 23-45.

McIntosh, P. (1988). White Privilege and Male Privilege: A Personal Account of Coming to see Correspondences through Work in Women's Studies. Wellesley: Center for Research on Women. Working Paper 189. Print.

Munson, Z. (1999). *Ideological Production of the Christian Right: The Case of the Christian Coalitions*. Unpublished Manuscript. Dpt. of Sociology, Harvard University.

Nelkin, D. & Lindee, M.S. (1995). *The DNA Mystic: The Genes as a Cultural Icon*. New York: W.H. Freeman and Company, 1995, p. 129.

Neville, H.A., Worthington, R.L. & Spanierman, L.B. (2001). *Race, Power, and Multicultural Counseling Psychology: Understanding White Privilege and Color-blind Racial Attitudes*. Sage Publications, Inc.

Norton, M.T. & Sommers, R.S. (2011). Whites See Racism as a Zero-Sum Game that they are Losing. *Perspectives on Psychological Science, 6* (215). Doi: 10.1177/17456916/140 6922. Retrieved on March 13 from ase.tufts.edu/psychology/sommersslab/documents/ raceInterNortonSummers2011.pdf.

O'Connell, H.A. (2012). The Impact of Slavery on Racial Inequality in Poverty in the Contemporary U.S. South. *Social Forces, 90 (3), 713-734.*

Oliver, P. & Johnston, H. (2000). What a Good Idea! Ideologies and Frames in Social Movement

Research. *An International Quarterly, vol. 5* (1): 37-54.

Oliver, P. & Johnston, H. (2000). What a Good Idea! Ideologies and Frames in Social Movement

Research. [Abstract]. *An International Quarterly, vol. 5 (1)*: 37-54

Omni, M. & Winant, H. (1986). *Racial Formation in the United States*. New York and London:

Routledge.

Pager, D. (2003). The Mark of a Criminal Record. *American Journal of Sociology*, 108, p. 937-

975.

Parker, R. & Chambers, P.S. (2005). *The Anti-Racist Cookbook: A Recipe Guide for Conversations*

about Race that Goes beyond Covered Dishes and "Kum-bah-ya." Roselle, NJ: Crandall,

Dostie & Douglass Books, Inc.

Pence, D. & Fields, A. (1999). Teaching about Race and Ethnicity: Trying to Uncover White

Privilege for a White Audience. *Teaching Sociology*, vol. 27 (2) p. 150-158.

Picca, L. H., & Feagin, J. R. (2007). *Two-faced Racism: Whites in the Backstage and Frontstage*.

Routledge/Taylor & Francis Group.

Rabinowitz, Sears, Sidanius, & Krosnick (2009). Why do White Americans Oppose Race-Targeted

Policies? Clarifying the Impact of Symbolic Racism. *Political Psychology*, vol. 30 (5) Doi:

10.1111/j.1467-9221.00726.x

Rothenberg, P.S. (2008, 2011, 2012). *White Privilege: Essential Readings on the Other Side of*

Racism, 3rd Ed. and 4th Ed. New York: Worth Publishers.

Russell-Brown, K. (1998). *The Color of Crime: Racial Hoaxes, White Fear, Black Protectionism,*

Police Harassment and Other Macroaggressions. New York University Press.

ISBN 0-8147-7471-7.

Sears, D.O. & Henry, P.J. (2003). The Origins of Symbolic Racism. *Journal of Personality Social Psychology, Vol. 85* (2): 259-295. Doi: 10.1037/0022-3514.85.2.259.

Sears, D.O. & McConahay, J.B. (1973). *The Politics of Violence: The New Urban Blacks and the Watts Riot*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin.

Semetko, H.A. & Valkenburg, P.M. (2000). Framing European Politics: A Content Analysis of Press and Television News. *Journal of Communication, 50* (2): 93-109.

Shapiro, R. (2011). *The Oxford Handbook of American Public Opinion and the Media*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Sikes, P. (2004). Methodology, Procedures and Ethical Concerns. In C. Opre (Ed). Doing Educational Research (pp. 15-33). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc.

Snow, D.A. & Benford, R.D. (1988). Ideology, Frame Resonance, & Participation Mobilization. In Bert Klandermans, Hanspeter Kriesi, & Sidney Tarrow (Eds.) *From Structure to Action: Social Movement Participation across Cultures*. Greenwich, Conn: Jai Press.

Swidler, A. (1986). Culture in Action: Symbols and Strategies. *American Sociological Review, 51*: 273-286.

[The Film Archives]. (2012, May 31). *The Propaganda Model and the Mainstream Media: Debate and the Liberal Bia- Noam Chomsky*. [The Film Archives]. Retrieved from http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=V4adRQX9Fi0.

Wildman, S. (1996). *Privilege Revealed: How Indivisible Preference Undermines America*, 6th Ed. New York: New York University Press.

William, R.H. & Benford, R.D. (2000). Two Faces of Collective Frames: A Theoretical Consider-ation. *Current Perspective Sociological Theory, 20*: 127-151.

Wilson, C.C., Gutierrez, F., & Chao, L.M. (2013). *Racism, Sexism, & the Media: Multicultural*

    Issues into the New Communications Age. (4th Ed.) Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publication,

    Inc.

Wise, T. (2005). *White like Me: Reflections on Race from a Privileged Son*. Brooklyn:Soft Skull

    Press.

Appendix A

Articles for Analysis

New York Times		
Trayvon Martin		
Date	Title	Author(s)
March 21, 2012	"A Florida Law Gets Scrutiny After a Killing"	Alvarez, Lizette
March 24, 2012	"A Personal Note As Obama Speaks On Death Of Boy"	Calmes, Jackie and Cooper, Helene
March 27, 2012	"Gunman's Account of Beating by Teenager Is Detailed"	Campbell, Robertson and Alvarez, Lizette
April 2, 2012	"A Deadly Encounter"	Park, Haeyoun
April 12, 2012	"Prosecutor Files Charge Of 2nd-Degree Murder In Shooting of Martin"	Alvarez, Lizette and Cooper, Michael
April 12, 2012	"Severe Charge, With a Minimum Term of 25 Years"	Schwartz, John
April 13, 2012	"Day in Court and New Lawyer for Defendant in Martin Case"	Kovaleski, Serge F. and Alvarez, Lizette
April 21, 2012	"Defendant Says 'I Am Sorry' to Martin's Parents as $150,000 Bail Is Set"	Kovaleski, Serge F. and Preston, Jennifer
May 17, 2012	"In Martin Case, Police Missteps Add to Challenges to Find Truth"	Kovaleski, Serge F.
May 18, 2012	"New details are released in shooting of teenager"	Kovaleski, Serge F. and Robertson, Campbell
May 19, 2012	"Martin spoke of 'crazy and creepy' man following him, friend says"	Kovaleski, Serge F.
June 22, 2012	"Documents Tell Zimmerman's Side in Martin Case"	Alvarez, Lizette and Williams, Timothy
July 13, 2012	"More Records Released In Trayvon Martin Case"	Alvarez, Lizette
July 17, 2012	"Woman Tells of Encounters With Killer in Martin Case"	Alvarez, Lizette
October 20, 2012	"Judge rules Martin files can be used by defense"	Alvarez, Lizette
November 7, 2012	"Social Media, Growing in Legal Circles, Find a Role in Florida Murder Case"	Alvarez, Lizette
April 6, 2013	"Settlement Is Reached With Family In Slaying"	Alvarez, Lizette
May 24, 2013	"Defense in Trayvon Martin Case Raises Questions About the Victim's Character"	Alvarez, Lizette
May 29, 2013	"Judge in Trayvon Martin Case Puts Limits on Defense"	Alvarez, Lizette
June 11, 2013	"Jury Selection in the Trayvon Martin Case Gets Off to a Slow Start"	Buckley, Cara

June 20, 2013	"Jury Selection Reaches Final Stages in Trayvon Martin Murder Case"	Buckley, Cara
June 25, 2013	"Clash of Styles in Court Opens Trial in Young Man's Death"	Alvarez, Lizette
July 14, 2013	"Zimmerman Is Acquitted In Trayvon Martin Killing"	Alvarez, Lizette and Buckley, Cara
July 15, 2013	"With Criminal Case Closed, Justice Department Will Restart Hate Crime Inquiry"	Lipton, Eric
July 21, 2013	"Demonstrations Commemorate Teenager Killed in Florida"	Channing, Joseph and Somaiya, Ravi
February 25, 2014	"U.S. Won't File Charges in Trayvon Martin Killing"	Alvarez, Lizette

Washington Post		
Trayvon Martin		
Date	Title	Author(s)
May 17, 2012	"Trayvon Martin Autopsy Report Indicates Struggle"	Horwitz, Sari and McCrummen, Stephanie
June 23, 2013	"On eve of Trayvon Martin shooting trial, present of Sanford, Fla., is shadowed by past"	Zak, Dan
June 26, 2013	"Zimmerman's neighbors describe 'yelps,' 'howling' on night Trayvon Martin was shot"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel
June 28, 2013	"Neighbors offer conflicting testimony in Zimmerman trial"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel
July 2, 2013	"Race is a subtext, not the focus at Zimmerman trial"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel
July 4, 2013	"5 Myths About the Killing of Trayvon Martin"	Capehart, Jonathan
July 8, 2013	"Defense: It's Zimmerman screaming on 911 call"	Roig-Franzia
July 10, 2013	"Zimmerman opts not to testify in defense"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel
July 11, 2013	"Prosecution portrays Zimmerman as 'wannabe cop'"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel
July 12, 2013	"Zimmerman jury must sort out through pieces"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel
July 13, 2013	"Jury acquits George Zimmerman in death of Trayvon Martin"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel
July 14, 2013	"Anger flows at acquittal of George Zimmerman in death of Trayvon Martin"	Leonnig, Carol D. and Johnson, Jenna
July 15, 2013	"Holder says he shares concerns about Trayvon Martin case"	Branigin, William and Horwitz, Sari
July 16, 2013	"After Zimmerman acquittal: Echoes of the past"	Haygood, Wil

Date	Title	Author(s)
July 16, 2013	"Attorney General Holder speaks against 'Stand your Ground' Laws"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel and Horwitz, Sari
July 17, 2013	"Zimmerman juror offers sole window into verdict"	Zak, Dan
July 17, 2013	"After Zimmerman verdict, what's next?"	Milloy, Courtland
July 19, 2013	"Al Sharpton manages several sides in Trayvon Martin story"	Farhi, Paul
July 19, 2013	"Obama asks Americans to 'do some soul-searching' following Trayvon Martin shooting"	Rucker, Philip and Eilperin, Juliet
July 20, 2013	"Across the country, protesters call for 'justice' for Trayvon Martin"	Somashekhar, Sandhya; Lydersen, Kari and Dazio, Stefanie
July 20, 2013	"Obama on Martin: The first black president speaks out first as a black American"	Maraniss, David
July 22, 2013	"Washington Post-ABC News Poll: Race shapes Zimmerman verdict reaction"	Cohen, Jon and Balz, Dan
July 24, 2013	"President Obama's bold remarks about race"	Milloy, Courtland
July 27, 2013	"Racial divide linger after Zimmerman trial"	Fears, Darryl
July 30, 2013	"Where will Trayvon Martin's hoodie go?"	Roig-Franzia, Manuel
August 18, 2013	"Vote for Trayvon Martin by amending 'stand your ground' laws"	Crump, Benjamin L.
August 18, 2013	"I left my job over a hoodie image"	Howard, Brenda
November 19, 2013	"Holder: Justice Dept. will soon announce decision on Zimmerman civil rights charges"	Horwitz, Sari
October 1, 2014	"Civil rights charges unlikely in Trayvon Martin case"	Horwitz, Sari
February 24, 2015	"George Zimmerman won't face civil rights charges in Trayvon Martin's death"	Berman, Mark and Horwitz, Sari
May 12, 2016	"George Zimmerman's many, many controversies since the Trayvon Martin case"	Andrews, Travis M.
May 12, 2016	"George Zimmerman to auction off gun he used to kill Trayvon Martin"	Andrews, Travis M.

New York Times		
Black Lives Matter		
Date	Title	Author(s)
December 21, 2014	"Chanting 'Black Lives Matter,' Protesters Shut Down Part of Mall of America"	

July 19, 2015	"At Town Hall, Confronting Candidates on Race"	Fandos, Nicholas
July 26, 2015	Candidates Caught in Middle as Words Ring Hollow to Activists"	Martin, Jonathan and Haberman, Maggie
August 20, 2015	"Clinton and Black Activists, Raw and Unscripted"	Haberman, Maggie
August 22, 2015	"In Questions Over Shaun King's Race, Activists See Challenge to Black Lives Matter Movement"	Rogers, Katie
August 23, 2015	"Sanders Courts Black Voters in South Carolina After Criticism on Racial Issues"	Horowitz, Jason
October 23, 2015	"Obama, Pushing Criminal Justice Reform, Defends 'Black Lives Matter'"	Harris, Gardiner
November 25, 2015	"Activists Vow Not to Cower After Five are Shot"	Eligon, John and Southall, Ashley
November 26, 2015	"4 Arrested in Shooting at Black Lives Matter Protest Are Identified"	Furber, Matt and Philipps, Dave
November 30, 2015	"The First Trial for 6 Officers in Baltimore Is Set to Start"	Stolberg, Sheryl Gay
December 1, 2015	"Four Charged in Shooting of Protesters in Minneapolis"	Furber, Matt and Perez-Pena, Richard
December 23, 2015	"Judge Bars Black Lives Matter Organizers From Mall Protest"	Victor, Daniel
December 24, 2015	"'Black Lives' Protesters Gather; Mall Is Shut in Response"	Capecchi, Christina
January 23, 2016	"A Debate Over Black Lives Matter"	Oppenheimer, Mark
February 4, 2016	"Activist Joins Campaign for Mayor in Baltimore"	Eligon, John
February 20, 2016	"Beyoncé Faces Police Boycott of Her Concert in Miami"	Rogers, Katie
April 9, 2016	"Bill Clinton Says He Regrets Showdown With Black Lives Matter Protesters"	Chozick, Amy
April 11, 2016	"Prison Rate Was Rising Years Before 1994 Law"	Eckholm, Erik
April 12, 2016	"National Briefing"	
April 24, 2016	"Obama Urges Activists to Do More Than 'Yelling'"	Shear, Michael D. and Stack, Liam
May 7, 2016	One Photo, 16 Clenched Fists and a Glimpse of a Riven West Point"	Philipps, Dave
June 28, 2016	"Black and White Americans Believe Race Relations Are Deteriorating, Polls Finds"	Thee-Brenan, Megan
July 10, 2016	"Strides of Black Lives Matter Halt in an Instant"	Barbaro, Michael and Alcindor, Yamiche
July 11, 2016	"Activists Condemns His Arrest as Unlawful"	Alcindor, Yamiche
July 11, 2016	"Giuliani, Amid Calls for Harmony, Lashes Out at Black Lives Matter"	Twohey, Megan

July 11, 2016	"Obama Urges Mutual Respect From Protesters and Police in Race Debate"	Landler, Mark and Fandos, Nicholas
July 15, 2016	"Obama Warns of Growing Mistrust Between Minorities and the Police"	Davis, Julie Hirschfeld
July 15, 2016	"Voices From the Protests"	
June 16, 2016	"Black Lives Matter Here, Too, Say Canadians Angered by Police Shootings"	Levin, Dan
July 19, 2016	"G.O.P. Is Off to Fiery Start at Convention"	Martin, Jonathan and Healy, Patrick
July 20. 2016	"Convention Speeches Unsettle Blacks in G.O.P."	Healy, Patrick, Alcindor, Yamiche and Peters, Jeremy W.
July 22, 2016	"A Day of Protests Over Police Shootings Across the U.S."	Shepherd, Katie and Hauser, Christine
July 22, 2016	"Obama Confronts Growing Expectations"	Davis, Julie Hirschfeld
July 29, 2016	"Police Protests a City Hall's 'Black Lives Matter' Sign"	Seeley, Katharine Q. and Bidgood, Jess

Washington Post		
Black Lives Matter		
Date	Title	Author(s)
May 19, 2015	"Black lives matter- including black women's, activists remind nation"	Davis, Marcia
July 22, 2015	"Why Hillary Clinton and her rivals are struggling to grasp Black Lives Matter"	Lowery, Wesley and Weigel, David
August 19, 2015	"How Black Lives Matter moved from a hashtag to a real political force"	Ross, Janell
September 3, 2015	"With 4 officers fatally shot in past 2 weeks, some blame Black Lives Matter protests"	Lydersen, Kari
September 18, 2015	"Black Lives Matter movement finds influencing 2016 contest a challenge"	Lowery, Wesley
September 27, 2015	"Elizabeth Warren draws parallels between Black Lives Matter and civil rights movement"	Lowery, Wesley
October 2, 2015	"Black Lives Matter has a lot in common with Civil Rights movement"	Sebastian, Simone
October 22, 2015	"Black Lives Matter should take on 'black-on-black crime'"	McWhorter, John
October 23, 2015	"President Obama defended 'Black Lives Matter.' But Why did he have to?"	Ross, Janell

October 26, 2015	"FBI director tells police chiefs they can learn from Black Lives Matter hashtag"	Lowery, Wesley
November 17, 2105	"How Black Lives Matter became a campus force"	Somashekhar, Sandhya
November 20, 2015	"New questions about how much 'Black Lives Matter' really matters on the trail"	Williams, Vanessa
November 20, 2015	'White Student Union' challenges Black Lives Matter at University of Illinois"	Moyer, Justin Wm.
November 24, 2015	"Five Black Lives Matter protesters shot in Minneapolis; police arrest one suspect"	Baumhardt, Alex; Bever, Lindsey and Miller, Michael E.
November 24, 2015	"Five Black Lives Matter protesters shot in Minneapolis; police searching for white suspects"	Miller, Michael E. and Bever, Lindsey
November 27, 2015	"Violence toward Black Lives Matter activists erases any doubt: We live in a time of racial strife"	Ross, Janell
December 1, 2015	"Minnesota man accused of shooting Black Lives Matter protesters reportedly subscribed to 'sovereign citizen' subculture"	Kaplan, Sarah
December 11, 2015	"Black Lives Matter group is pressured to expand the scope of its outrage"	Fletcher, Michael A.
December 22, 2015	"Mall of America sues to stop planned Wednesday protest by Black Lives Matter"	Moyer, Justin Wm.
January 6, 2016	"Do Black Lives Matter to evangelicals?"	Inazu, John
February 3, 2016	"Black Lives Matter activist launches last-minute bid to become mayor of Baltimore"	Lowery, Wesley
February 15, 2016	"Ohio activist's suicide spotlights depression among Black Lives Matter leaders"	Lowery, Wesley and Stankiewicz, Kevin
March 11, 2016	"Analysis: Why Black Lives Matter activists are siding with Apple in its fight with the FBI"	Peterson, Andrea
March 18, 2016	"I yelled 'black lives matter!' at a Trump rally. This is what happened next"	Thomas, Sierra K.
March 21, 2016	"Winning Google Doodle invoking Black Lives Matter was designed by high school sophomore"	Cavna, Michael
March 31, 2016	"Video shows activists turning Hollywood Walk of Fame into Black Lives Matter memorial"	Holley, Peter

April 7, 2016	"Bill Clinton gets heated with Black Lives Matter protesters over his crime bill"	Bump, Philip
April 8, 2016	"Bill Clinton 'almost' apologizes for arguing with Black Lives Matter protesters"	Williams, Vanessa
April 10, 2016	"After Black Lives Matter dust-up, Bill and Hillary Clinton shore up support with black voters"	Philip, Abby
July 8, 2016	"Texas Republicans blame Black Lives Matter for shooting of Dallas police"	Weigel, David
July 8, 2016	"The irony at the heart of the Dallas police deaths after a Black Lives Matter march"	Bump, Philip
July 10, 2016	"Black Lives Matter activist DeRay McKesson released after arrest by Baton Rouge police"	Lowery, Wesley
July 10, 2016	"Police arrest Black Lives Matter activist DeRay McKesson, 200 other protesters"	Nirappil, Fenit; Lowery, Wesley and Branigin, William
July 10, 2016	"Black Lives Matter activist DeRay McKesson arrested by Baton Rouge police"	Lowery, Wesley
July 10, 2016	"In an era of Black Lives Matter protests, history offers a powerful lesson"	Guo, Jeff
July 12, 2016	"Detective demoted after calling Black Lives Matter protesters 'terrorists' on Facebook"	Larimer, Sarah
July 12, 2016	"Black Lives Matter is a global cause"	Tharoor, Ishaan
July 12, 2016	"Three words Republicans wrestle with: 'Black Lives Matter'"	Weigel, David
July 12, 2016	"Off-duty cops quit security for WNBA game after players wear Black Lives Matter shirts"	Bieler, Des
July 13, 2016	"No, 'Black Lives Matter' is not 'inherently racist'"	Capehart, Jonathan
July 22, 2016	"How Obama failed Black Lives Matter"	Smith, Mychal Denzel
July 22, 2016	"Black Lives Matter: What's Next?"	Lowery, Wesley and Kaplan, Sarah
July 23, 2016	"WNBA withdraws penalties for players' 'Black Lives Matter' protests"	Eilerson, Nick
July 25, 2016	"This attorney wore a 'Black Lives Matter' pin to court0 and went to jail for it"	Wootson Jr., Cleave R.
August 13, 2016	"'Black Lives Matter' activists, Jeb Bush meet face-to-face"	O'Keefe, Ed.

November 25, 2016	"Officer reassigned after calling Black Lives Matter protesters 'fools' in tweet"	Larimer, Sarah

Table 4: Historical Articles for Analysis

New York Times (1923- current file)		
Emmett Till		
Date	Title	Author(s)
September 6, 1955	"REPORT ON SLAYING DUE: Mississippi Jury Rules Today in Killing of Negro Youth"	
September 10, 1955	"MURDER TRIAL DATE SET: Special Prosecutor is Named in Mississippi Case"	
September 18, 1955	"TRIAL TOMORROW IN BOY'S MURDER: Counsel for 2 Mississippians Accused of Killing Negro to Raise Venue Issue"	Popham, John N.
September 22, 1955	"SLAIN BOY'S UNCLE ON STAND AT TRIAL: He Identifies in Mississippi Court 2 Accused Slayers as Youth's Kidnappers"	Popham, John N.
September 24, 1955	"Mississippi Jury Acquits 2 Accused in Youth's Killing"	Popham, John N.
September 24, 1955	"Boy's Mother 'Not Surprised'"	
September 25, 1955	"MISSISSIPPI SEEKS KIDNAPPING COUNT: Two Men Cleared of Murder of Murder of Negro Boy are Jailed for Grand Jury Action"	Popham, John N.
September 26, 1955	"RACE NEUROSIS' DECRIED: Preacher Sees It in Murder Acquittal in Mississippi"	
October 1, 1955	"MISSISSIPPI MEN RELEASED ON BAIL"	
October 12, 1955	"BOYCOTT IS URGED IN YOUTH'S KILLING: Rally of 20,000 Here Cheers Call for Action Against Mississippi Goods"	
October 22, 1955	"SURVEY FINDS U.S. HURT BY TILL CASE: American Jewish Group Cites Reaction Abroad—Urges Strict Civil Rights Code"	
October 25, 1955	"U.S. BARS TILL ACTION: Chicago Delegates Fail in Plea for Intervention in Killing"	
October 30, 1955	"TILL CASE LINKED TO NEGRO'S PLIGHT: Persistence of Segregation in Both South and North Decried by Rabbi Klein"	

October 31, 1955	"A.V.C. HONORS NEGRO: Cites Mississippi Surgeon for Role in Till Case Inquiry"	
November 4, 1955	"U.S. WON'T ARREST CAROLINE PASTOR"	
November 10, 1955	"Grand Jury in Till Case Fails to Indict Two White Men Accused in Kidnapping"	
November 21, 1955	"U.S. AIDE DEPLORES DELAY IN TILL CASE"	
November 23, 1955	"GAINS AND LOSSES IN FREEDOM CITED: Year-End Review Tells of 3 'Serious Setbacks' in 1955 but Notes Advances"	
January 16, 1956	"RABBI CHAMPIONS NEGROES OF SOUTH: Klein, in Presbyterian Pulpit, Proposes Relief for Those Suffering From Injustice"	
March 13, 1956	"Mississippi"	Hill, Gladwin
April 16, 1956	"FAULKNER CHALLENGED: Dubois, an N.A.A.C.P. Founder, Would Debate Integration"	
June 14, 1956	"MOVIE PLANNED ABOUT TILL CASE: Bischoff and Diamond Film of Murder of Negro Boy to Tackled Racial Problem"	Pryor, Thomas M.
September 23, 1956	"A Southern Negro's View of the South: He Indicts the Southern way as a defiance of freedom and calls for a national effort to bring about human equality"	Johnson, Charles S.
October 11, 1956	"GERALD CHATHAM DIES: Prosecutor in Emmett Till Murder Trial Was 50"	
December 16, 1956	"PRESIDENT DRAWS SOVIET PARTY FIRE: Pravda Calls Statement on Human Rights in Hungary 'Crude Interference'"	
April 26, 1959	"Mob Toll Put at 4, 733"	
July 22, 1962	"NEGROES DEFY BAN, MARCH IN GEORGIA: Police in Albany Arrest 160 for Protesting Despite a Federal Court Order"	Sitton, Claude
June 25, 1964	"F.B.I. Augments Mississippi Force: But Kennedy Tells N.A.A.C.P. That He Cannot Order Any Federal Police Action"	Handler, M.S.
June 28, 1964	"MISSISSIPPI: A PROFILE OF THE NATION'S MOST SEGREGATED STATE	Herberts, John
January 24, 1965	"A Double Standard For Murder?"	Carter, Hodding

May 8, 1965	"TRIAL OF WILINS FOLLOWS PATTERN: Defendants Went Free in 3 Previous Rights Killings"	Zion, Sidney E.
June 30, 1968	"'When Emmett Till Was Slain"	Brown Jr., Claude

Washington Post		
Emmett Till		
Date	Title	Author(s)
September 1, 1955	"Missing Negro Boy Found Shot to Death in River"	
September 18, 1955	"Article 1- No Title"	Kilgallen, James L.
September 22, 1955	"Uncle Tells of Boy's Abduction at Night"	
September 23, 1955	"Woman Says Negro 'Seized' Her in Store"	
September 24, 1955	"2 Acquitted of 'Whistle' Slaying in Mississippi: Half-Brothers Face Kidnap Charge in Adjoining County in Boy's Abduction"	
October 4, 1955	"Mississippian Says Few Negroes Seek Vote"	
October 10, 1955	"Mother of Slain Boy Coming Here"	
October 17, 1955	"6100 Pack Uline's in Till Protest"	
October 25, 1955	"Group Asks U.S. to Act in Till Case"	
November 13, 1955	"Panel to Discuss Till Kidnapping Case"	
November 13, 1955	"Lehman Backs 5-Point Civil Rights Program"	
December 25, 1955	"Church Group Assails 'Terror' in Mississippi"	
January 4, 1956	"Democrats Face Hassle in Senate"	Pearson, Drew
January 6, 1956	"Newspaper Honors 11; 3 Slain Negroes Named"	
January 14, 1956	"Milam Shot Everett Till, Says Magazine Writer"	United Press
January 21, 1956	"Howard Again Challenges FBI in Killing of Negroes"	
January 24, 1956	"Gains Are Noted In Civil Liberties"	Marder, Murrey
February 8, 1956	"Brownell Gets Rights Questions"	Pearson, Drew
February 10, 1956	"No Case on Till, Justice Dept. Says"	United Press
March 1, 1956	"Brownell to Enter Racial Conflict"	Pearson, Drew
June 26, 1956	"Mississippi Defended On Till Slaying Case"	Brown, Gordon
August 1, 1965	"Mississippi Town Racial Oasis"	Von Hoffman, Nicholas

New York Times (1923-current)		
Civil Rights Movement		

Date	Title	Author(s)
September 2, 1956	"STATE G.O.P. MAPS NEGRO VOTE DRIVE: Special Task Force Set Up to Accent Eisenhower's Civil Rights Record"	Dales, Douglas
December 4, 1958	"Civil Rights Commission to Shun Segregated Montgomery Hotels: Fails to Get Accommodations To Include Negro Member- Will Stay at Air Base"	Associated Press
December 27, 1959	"HOUSING PROGRESS SEEN BY N.A.A.C.P.: State Anti-Bias Laws Cited as Cutting Discrimination Against Negroes"	Ennis, Thomas W.
January 3, 1960	"EISENHOWER WARY ON PLAN TO WIDEN CIVIL RIGHTS LAW: Unlikely to Press Congress for U.S. Vote Registrars to Protect Negroes"	Lewis, Anthony
January 12, 1960	"COURT RESTORES VOTE TO NEGROES IN LOUSIANA CASE: Decision by Federal Judge Hailed as First Victory Under Civil Rights Act"	Lewis, Anthony
February 19, 1960	"NEW REFEREE BILL FOR NEGRO VOTING GOES TO CONGRESS: Justice Department Offers Changes to Assure the Effectiveness of Plan"	Lewis, Anthony
July 16, 1960	"NOMINEES APPEAL FOR NEGRO VOTES: Kennedy, Questioned, Asks for Faith- Johnson Vows to Back Civil Rights"	Loftus, Joseph A.
May 26, 1961	"DR. KING REFUSES TO END BUS TEST: Rejects Pleas of Southern Liberals Who See Harm to Negroes' Struggles"	Sitton, Claude
October 13, 1961	"A.F.L.-C.I.O. CHIEFS SCORE RANDOLPH: Say Civil Rights Views Split Labor and Negro Groups"	Levey, Stanley
February 13, 1963	"CIVIL RIGHTS FIGHT SHIFTING TO NORTH: Report to President Cites Menial Status of Negro and Curbs on Housing"	Hunter, Marjorie
May 19, 1963	"Kennedy, In South Hails Negro Drive For Civil Rights: It is in 'Highest Traditions' of U.S. Freedom, He Asserts at Vanderbilt Celebration"	Wicker, Tom
June 20, 1963	"KENNEDY ASKS BROAD RIGHTS BILL AS 'REASONABLE' COURSE IN CRISIS; CALLS FOR RESTRAINT BY NEGROES"	Wicker, Tom
June 23, 1963	"NEGROES INFORM KENNEDY OF PLAN FOR NEW PROTESTS:	Hunter, Marjorie

	Demonstrations Needed to Assure Civil Rights Law, Leaders Say at Parley"	
July 7, 1963	"Meredith, in Tears, Scores 'Bigotry' Among Negroes: Retorts to Reprimand by an N.A.A.C.P. Aide- Wilkins Also Critical"	United Press International
July 31, 1963	"WAGNER EXTENDS CIVIL RIGHTS TALKS ON JOB PRACTICES: CORE Chief Calls Opening City Hall Session 'Good'- Panel of 10 to Confer"	Kihss, Peter
August 11, 1963	"Church to Enlist Catholics Here For Capital Civil Rights Rally: Vicar General's Letter to Be Read in ALL 402 Parishes Urging Participation"	
August 15, 1963	"CITY URGES UNIONS TO FAVOR NEGROES: Civil Rights Body Suggests This Will Correct Hiring Bias in Buildings Trades"	Bigart, Homer
August 29, 1963	"200,000 MARCH FOR CIVIL RIGHTS IN ORDERLY WASHINGTON RALLY; PRESIDENT SEES GAIN FOR NEGRO: 10 Leaders of Protest Urge Laws to End Racial Inequality"	Kensworthy, E.W.
November 12, 1963	"More Salaried Positions Are Opening to Negroes: Business and Industry Here Reassess Policies in Face of Civil Rights Drive"	Stetson, Damon
April 2, 1964	"Civil Rights Forces Assail Denial of Vote to Negroes"	Kensworthy, E.W.
July 14, 1964	"SCRANTON BEATEN ON RIGHTS MOVE AS REPUBLICAN CONVENTION OPENS; EXTREMISTS SCORED BY KEYNOTER"	Wicker, Tom
July 15, 1964	"PLATFORM VOTED: Negro Bloc Questions Arizonan's Fitness- Rockefeller Booed"	Wicker, Tom
August 15, 1964	"MURPHY APPOINTS A NEGRO TO HEAD HARLEM PRECINCT: Capt. Sealy First of Race in Post-Civil Rights Groups Had Asked for Change"	Arnold, Martin
September 21, 1964	"Poll Shows Whites in City Resent Civil Rights Drive: Majority Queried in Times Survey Say Negro Movement Has Gone Too Far, but Few Intend to Change Votes"	Powledge, Fred
November 30, 1964	Role of F.B.I. Distrusted By Negro in Rights Cases"	Kihss, Peter
July 14, 1965	"JOHNSON PLEDGES TO LEAD A DRIVE FOR NEGRO GAINS:	Pomfret, John D.

	Concedes 'Mistakes I Made in My Past' on Civil Rights-	
August 2, 1965	"Two Churches Bar Civil Rights Groups In Americus Drive"	
August 7, 1965	"Americus Names Negroes To Jobs as Polling Clerks"	Roberts, Gene
August 11, 1965	"VOTING OFFICIALS SIGN 1,144 NEGROES FIRST DAY OF DRIVE: Applicants Form Long Lines Before Federal Aides in Three Southern States"	Roberts, Gene
October 29, 1965	"Civil Rights March in Georgia Turned Back by Negro Parents"	Rugaber, Walter
July 11, 1966	"LINDSAY TO NAME 4 CIVILIANS TODAY FOR POLICE BOARD: 2 Members Will Be Farrell and Black, Long Active in Civil Rights Causes"	Perlmutter, Emanuel
July 12, 1966	"NEW POLICE BOARD HAS TWO NEGROES AND PUERTO RICAN: Mayor and Leary Select 7, Among Them 2 Active in Civil Rights Affairs"	Weinraur, Bernard
September 19, 1966	"Civil Rights: A Turning Point"	Roberts, Gene
September 21, 1966	"RIGHTS BACKERS FEAR A BACKLASH: Liberal Bipartisan Forces Are Thinning as Voters Score Negro Violence"	Herbers, John
March 3, 1967	"JOHSON AFFIRMS HIS COMMITMENT TO HELPING NEGRO: Hails Rights Gains in a Visit to Howard U.- He Spends Busy Day in Public Eye"	Reed, Roy
March 20, 1967	"WEALTHY NEGROES FORM NEW GROUP FOR LEGAL RIGHTS: Plan to Raise Million a Year From 1,000 in U.S. to Aid Fight on Discrimination"	Lissner, Will
August 25, 1967	"SUIT BIDS U.S. RUN POLICE IN NEWARK: 18 Negroes File Case Under 1871 Civil Rights Laws"	Johnson, Thomas A.
April 8, 1968	"Mrs. King to March In Husband's Place In Memphis Today"	Caldwell, Earl
July 8, 1968	"JEWS TROUBLED OVER NEGRO TIES: Long Civil Rights Support Strained by Antagonisms"	Spiegel, Irving

Washington Post		
Civil Rights Movement		
Date	Title	Author(s)
September 18, 1955	"Citizens Cite 'Grievances' As Rights Inquiry Opens"	Marder, Murrey

March 5, 1956	"Civil Rights Leader Asks For Action: 2000 Delegates Told by Wilkins To Demand Laws From Congress"	Sampson, Paul
April 10, 1956	"Congress Gets GOP Civil Rights Plan: Brownell Asks Division to Fight Race Ban Cases"	Marder, Murrey
April 11, 1956	"Democrats Map Strategy to Win Passage of Own Civil Rights Bills"	Marder, Murrey
April 26, 1956	"House Judiciary Group Approves Administration's Civil Rights Bill"	Marder, Murrey
April 28, 1956	"Rights Bill, School Aid Face Fight: Outlook in House Fair but Senate Chances Appear To Be Dimming"	Albright, Robert C.
July 13, 1956	"83 House Members Sign Manifesto on Civil Rights"	International News Service
July 17, 1956	"House Opens Its Debate on Civil Rights: Talk Mild at Start As Outvoted South Prepares Stratagems"	Marder, Murrey
August 12, 1956	"Armistice Reached on Civil Rights: Democrats End Plank Hearings After Factions Drop Invective"	Albright, Robert C.
June 6, 1957	"Civil rights Bill Clears 1st Hurdle In House: Measure Is Given Right-of-Way as 290-117 Vote Holds Debate to 4 Days"	Albright, Robert C.
June 22, 1957	"Senate Roles Shift In Rights Bill Vote"	Albright, Robert C.
July 3, 1957	"Russell Says Present Civil Rights Bill Would Bring 'Bayonet Rule' in South"	Lyons, Richard L.
September 10, 1957	"Civil Rights Measure Signed by President"	Folliard, Edward T.
October 28, 1958	"Nixon Denies Ducking Civil Rights Question"	Robert, Chalmers M.
November 1, 1958	"Ike Points Up Slit in Democrats: Announces Drop In Unemployment At Campaign Finale"	Stern, Laurence
January 21, 1959	"Johnson Bill Includes New Rights Setup: Conciliation Efforts Would Be Stressed Instead of Force"	Lyons, Richard L.
January 7, 1960	"Rayburn Invites Action On Civil Rights Bill"	
February 16, 1960	"Civil Rights Push Opens In Senate: Southerners Assail Use of Minor Bill To Start Debate"	Albright, Robert C.
February 16, 1960	"Civil Rights Forces Win Senate Test: Russell's Attempt To Delay Action Is Rejected, 61-28"	Albright, Robert C.

February 19, 1960	"Committee Clears Civil Rights Bill: Rules Deadlock Is Ended. 7 to 4; Floor Action Set"	Albright, Robert C.
March 11, 1960	"Civil Rights Board Moves to Expand Its Study of Justice"	Carper, Elsie
March 14, 1960	"Civil Rights Plea Made By Rogers: Section on Defying Courts on Schools Imperative, He Says"	Chadwick, John
April 9, 1960	"Senate Passes Rights Bill, 71-18: Final Action By House Is Awaited"	Albright, Robert C.
April 22, 1960	"Civil Rights Bill Passed By House: 288-to-95 Vote Sends Measure To Eisenhower"	Lyons, Richard L.
August 10, 1960	"Kennedy Advisers on Civil rights Urge More Active Presidential Aid"	Clayton, James E.
July 17, 1961	"Quiet Progress Seen In Civil Rights Case"	Clayton, James E.
September 8, 1961	"Virginia Civil Rights Leaders Told To Produce Desegregation Records"	Stern, Laurence
November 17, 1961	"Continuing Brutality by Police Found: But Civil Rights Report Sees Decline In Violence Since '47"	Clayton, James E.
December 29, 1961	"Civil rights 1961 Report Hails Gains: Attorney General Lauds Local Steps, Asks No New Laws"	Kilpatrick, Carroll
March 26, 1962	"Kennedy's Civil Rights Aid Lauded: Council Acclaims Attitude, But Sees Neglected Fields"	Carper, Elsie
July 18, 1963	"President Backs 'Assembly' Here For Civil Rights"	Roberts, Chalmers M.
August 29, 1963	"200,000 Jam Mall in Mammoth Rally In Solemn, Orderly Plea for Equality: Largest Demonstration On Civil Rights Urges Passage of Legislation"	Baker, Robert E.
October 20, 1963	"Politicians Taking A Wary Attitude Toward the Civil Rights Question"	Roberts, Chalmers M.
October 22, 1963	"Reverses Frustrate Rights Drive Leaders"	Baker, Robert E.
June 24, 1964	"Burned Car Clue in Hunt For 3 Men: Kin of Vanished Civil Rights Aides Win Federal Help"	Chapman, William
July 5, 1964	"Civil Rights Law Response Good Throughout U.S.: Ellender Urges Compliance in Louisiana Talk"	Lyons, Richard L.
July 20, 1964	"Goldwater Rights Views Given Minority Rating"	Harris, Louis
January 19, 1965	"Mob Action Ruled Out in Civil Rights Protests"	Mintz, Morton
March 19, 1965	"Wallace Asks Federal Protection For Sunday's Civil Rights March"	Chapman, William

March 30, 1965	"Gov. Wallace Agrees to Meet Today With 20 Selma Civil Rights Delegates"	Clopton, Willard
June 2, 1965	"Court Stand on Legal Rights: Action Expected To Add to Row on Coping With Crime"	Mintz, Morton
August 10, 1966	"House Votes Civil Rights Bill, 259-157: Amendment On Housing Is Included"	Lyons, Richard L.
August 22, 1966	"Chicago White Mobs Pelt Rights Marchers"	Spencer, Frank
March 25, 1967	"SNCC Quits Civil Rights Conference"	Baker, Robert E.
August 17, 1967	"House Approves Major Rights Bill"	Lyons, Richard L.
October 2, 1967	"High Court Faces Some Thorny Issues: Crime in Street, Police Power Head List in New Session"	MacKenzie, John P.
October 26, 1967	"Rights Bill Approved by Senate Unit"	White, Jean M.
November 23, 1967	"Rights Report Gives Ghetto No. 1 Priority"	White, Jean M.
January 25, 1968	"LBJ Asks Congress to Vote Five-point Rights Program"	Kilpatrick, Carroll
April 12, 1968	"McCarthy Offers Civil Rights Program: Sweeping Measures Proposed For Income, Health, Housing"	Just, Ward
May 12, 1968	"Rights Unit Warns Parties on Bias"	White, Jean M.
June 27, 1968	"Abe Fortas: Intense Campion Of Civil Rights"	MacKenzie, John P.
August 19, 1968	"Agnew: His history on Civil Rights"	Homan, Richard
January 14, 1969	"Record Reviewed"	Edstrom, Eve