**College of Engineering** 



Drexel E-Repository and Archive (iDEA) <u>http://idea.library.drexel.edu/</u>

Drexel University Libraries www.library.drexel.edu

The following item is made available as a courtesy to scholars by the author(s) and Drexel University Library and may contain materials and content, including computer code and tags, artwork, text, graphics, images, and illustrations (Material) which may be protected by copyright law. Unless otherwise noted, the Material is made available for non profit and educational purposes, such as research, teaching and private study. For these limited purposes, you may reproduce (print, download or make copies) the Material without prior permission. All copies must include any copyright notice originally included with the Material. **You must seek permission from the authors or copyright owners for all uses that are not allowed by fair use and other provisions of the U.S. Copyright Law.** The responsibility for making an independent legal assessment and securing any necessary permission rests with persons desiring to reproduce or use the Material.

Please direct questions to archives@drexel.edu



Available online at www.sciencedirect.com



WEAT

Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx

www.elsevier.com/locate/wear

### Ambient and 550 °C tribological behavior of select MAX phases against Ni-based superalloys

S. Gupta<sup>a</sup>, D. Filimonov<sup>a,\*</sup>, V. Zaitsev<sup>b</sup>, T. Palanisamy<sup>c</sup>, M.W. Barsoum<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Materials Science and Engineering, Drexel University, Philadelphia, PA 19104, United States

<sup>b</sup> Department of Materials Science and Engineering, State University of New York at Stony Brook, Stony Brook, NY 11794, United States

<sup>c</sup> Honeywell International Inc., Morristown, NJ 07962, United States

Received 15 June 2006; received in revised form 6 February 2007; accepted 12 March 2007

#### Abstract 10

3

In this paper, we report on the tribological behavior, at 25 and 550 °C of the following layered (MAX phase) ternary carbides: Ti<sub>2</sub>AlC, Cr<sub>2</sub>AlC, 11 Ta2AIC, Ti3SiC2, Ti2AIN, Ti4AIN3, Cr2GeC, Cr2GaC, Nb2SnC and Ti2SnC, tested against Ni-based superalloys, SA (Inconel-718 and Inconel-12 600). The tests were performed using a pin-on-disc method at 1 m/s and 3 N. At room temperature, the wear rates, WRs, were relatively high 13  $(\geq 10^{-4} \text{ mm}^3/\text{N-m})$  and no correlation was found between the WRs and the friction coefficients,  $\mu$ . Third body abrasion is believed to be responsible 14 for the high WRs at this temperature. At 550 °C, oxidized transfer films were identified on both contact surfaces. The tribofilms comprised mostly 15 of Ni, Cr, Fe and O and resulted in low (<10<sup>-6</sup> mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m) WRs and  $\mu$ 's<0.5. This result implies that the tribo-oxidation products of the Ni-based 16 SA tested herein (Inconel 718) are lubricious. 17

© 2007 Published by Elsevier B.V. 18

Keywords: MAX phases tribology; Tribofilm formation; Tribo-oxidation; Solid lubricants; Lubricious effect 19

#### 1. Introduction

20

By now it is reasonably well established that as a class the 2 50 + MAX phases known to date display unusual and sometimes 3 unique properties [1-3]. These phases are so-called because of 4 their chemistry:  $M_{n+1}AX_n$ , where n is 1, 2 or 3, M is an early tran-5 6 sition metal, A is an A-group (mostly IIIA and IVA) element, and X is either C and/or N. These compounds are layered, possess 7 hexagonal symmetry (space group P63/mmc) and consist of M 8 carbide or nitride layers interleaved with metallically bonded A-9 element layers. They are highly damage tolerant, thermal shock 10 resistant, readily machinable, and with Vickers hardness values 11 of 2-5 GPa, are anomalously soft for transition metal carbides 12 and nitrides. They are also excellent conductors of heat and 13 electricity [3–6]. 14

The MAX phases decompose incongruently in inert atmo-15 spheres into MX-based compounds and A-rich liquids. The 16 decomposition temperatures vary from over 2000 °C to under 17 1000 °C [3]. In air, at elevated temperatures, however, they are 18

Corresponding author. Fax: +1 2158956760. E-mail address: filin@radio.chem.msu.ru (D. Filimonov).

doi:10.1016/j.wear.2007.03.011 2

oxidized at lower temperatures [3,7,8]. Some, notably Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and Ti<sub>2</sub>AlC, have excellent oxidation resistances because they form protective oxide layers [3,7–9].

In the first report on the properties of Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>, it was noted that the material felt lubricious [2], which led Myhra et al. to study its tribological properties using a lateral force microscope with a  $Si_3N_4$  tip [10]. They showed that indeed the friction coefficients,  $\mu$ , of the basal planes were ultra-low (2 to  $5 \times 10^{-3}$ ). The  $\mu$ 's of non-basal planes, however, were much higher.

El-Raghy et al. [11] studied the tribology of coarse-grained, CG ( $\approx$ 25–50 µm) and fine-grained, FG ( $\approx$ 4 µm) polycrystalline Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> samples, using a pin-on-disc method and a diamond belt abrasion test. The tests were carried out using a 9.5-mm diameter 440C steel ball, a load of 5 N, with a sliding speed of 0.1 m/s. For both the microstructures,  $\mu$  rose linearly from 0.15 to 0.4 and then to a steady state value of 0.8. The initial transition region was longer for the CG than the FG samples. The average sliding wear rates were high,  $1.34 \times 10^{-3}$  and  $4.25 \times 10^{-3}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m for the FG and CG samples, respectively.

Sun et al. [12] studied Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> with 7 wt.% TiC against 3.5 mm steel pins, and showed that the  $\mu$ 's were not very sensi-39 tive to normal load, and displayed steady state values of 0.4–0.5. 40 The average WR was  $9.9 \times 10^{-5}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m, and increased with 41

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

<sup>0043-1648/\$ -</sup> see front matter © 2007 Published by Elsevier B.V.

2

### **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

S. Gupta et al. / Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx

load. Fine-grained, and partially compacted tribo-layers con-42 taining Fe were observed on the plane, along with ploughing of 43 the steel pins. Zhang et al. [13] used an oscillating pin-on-disc method, with loads in the range of 1-10 N at a sliding speed of 45 13 mm/s, to study the tribological properties between self-mated 46 couples of Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and between Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and diamond. They 47 reported  $\mu$ 's of  $\sim$ 1 to 1.5 for the former, and  $\mu \sim 0.1$  for the lat-48 ter. The low  $\mu$ 's between Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and diamond were attributed 49 to the formation of a tribofilm. Zhai et al. [14] evaluated Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> 50 against low carbon steel using a block-on-disc method at a slid-51 ing speed of 20 m/s and loads corresponding to stresses between 52 0.1 and 0.8 MPa. They reported that the tribofilms formed were 53 composed of TiO<sub>2</sub>, SiO<sub>2</sub> and Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>. 54

<sup>55</sup> Souchet et al. [15] also studied the tribology of FG ( $\approx 4 \mu m$ ) <sup>56</sup> and CG ( $\approx 25-50 \mu m$ ) samples against steel and Si<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> balls <sup>57</sup> using a reciprocating type tribometer. Two successive wear <sup>58</sup> regimes were observed for the CG and FG samples against both <sup>59</sup> counterparts. During Regime I, both the WRs and  $\mu$  were low. <sup>60</sup> Regime I was followed by Regime II in which  $\mu$  increased to <sup>61</sup> 0.4–0.5 and wear became significant.

Sarkar et al. [16] studied the tribology of Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> against steel using a ball-on-disc method under fretting condition as the load was varied between 1 and 10 N. The  $\mu$ 's, they obtained, varied between 0.5 and 0.55, and the WRs were between 11 and  $37 \times 10^{-5}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m.

<sup>67</sup> Hongxiang et al. [17] tested Ti<sub>3</sub>AlC<sub>2</sub> using a block-on-disc <sup>68</sup> method against low carbon steel. At 60 m/s rotation speed and <sup>69</sup> loads corresponding to stresses of  $\approx 0.8$  MPa,  $\mu$  was  $\sim 0.1$  and <sup>70</sup> the specific WR was  $\sim 2.5 \times 10^{-6}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m. It was argued that <sup>71</sup> self-generating tribofilms, composed of Ti, O, Al and Fe were <sup>72</sup> responsible for this behavior.

A list of potential applications for solid lubricant systems 73 capable of working at intermediate temperatures (i.e. up to 74 600 °C) includes gas turbine seals, cylinder wall/piston rings for 75 low heat rejection diesels engines, various furnace components 76 among others [18]. Another important potential application with 77 specific requirements, concerning both  $\mu$ 's and WRs, as well 78 as good mechanical properties, is air foil bearings [18,19]. In 79 this application, solid lubricants are needed to prevent wear and 80 reduce friction during engine start-up and shut-down [19]. In 81 foil bearing applications, the higher the temperature at which 82 they run, the less need for cooling and the more efficient they 83 become. 84

The goal of this work is to understand the tribological behav-85 ior of predominantly single-phase MAX samples, and evaluate 86 them as potential triboactive materials, especially for high-87 temperature tribological applications in general, and as enabling 88 materials in foil bearing technology, in particular. In this work, 89 we report on the tribological behavior at 26 and 550 °C of the 90 following layered ternary carbides: Ti<sub>2</sub>AlC, Cr<sub>2</sub>AlC, Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC, 91 Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>, Ti<sub>2</sub>AlN, Ti<sub>4</sub>AlN<sub>3</sub>, Cr<sub>2</sub>GeC, Cr<sub>2</sub>GaC, Nb<sub>2</sub>SnC and 92 Ti<sub>2</sub>SnC, tested against Ni-based superalloys, which are widely 93 used as high-temperature engineering materials. 94

### 2. Experimental details

The  $Ti_2AIC$ ,  $Ti_2AIN$  and  $Cr_2AIC$  samples were obtained from 3-ONE-2, Voorhees, NJ. The processing parameters for synthesizing  $Ti_3SiC_2$ ,  $Ti_2SnC$ ,  $Nb_2SnC$ ,  $Ti_4AIN_3$ , and  $Cr_2GaC$  are summarized in Table 1. The processing details can be found elsewhere [4,20,21]. Table 2 lists the sources of materials and powders used.

95

To fabricate the Cr<sub>2</sub>GeC samples stoichiometric amounts of Cr, Ge and C powders were ball milled for 1 h. The powders were cold-pressed and annealed at 800 °C for 10 h. The annealed precursors were then uniaxially hot-pressed in a BN sprayed graphite die under a stress of 40 MPa at 1375 °C for 6 h. 102

The friction and wear tests were performed using a hightemperature pin-on-disc tribometer (CSM, Switzerland) capable of going up to  $600 \,^{\circ}$ C. All the testing was done at a linear velocity of 1 m/s and a load of 3 N. The sliding distance at room temperature varied from 300 to 800 m; at 550  $\,^{\circ}$ C it was at least 2 km.

The MAX-based samples were shaped into cuboid chip hav-113 ing a square 6 mm  $\times$  6 mm working face  $\sim$ 2 mm thick. The 114 counter surfaces were 9.5 mm thick superalloy (SA) cylindri-115 cal (55 mm diameter) discs of Inconel718 or Inconel-600 (High 116 Temp Metals, Inc., Sylmar, CA), henceforth referred to as Inc718 117 and Inc600, respectively. The base composition of Inc718 is Ni 118 50–55% Cr 22–24% Fe 20–23% (wt.%), with small (<5 wt.%) 119 quantities of additions like Nb, C, Mo, Si, Mn, Si, etc. For sim-120 plicity herein we assume the chemistry of Inc718 to be close 121 to Ni:Cr:Fe  $\approx$  0.5:0.25:0.25. Similarly, the base composition of 122 Inc600 is Ni 70–75% Cr 15–17% Fe 6–10% (wt.%), with small 123 (<2 wt.%) quantities of additions like C, Si, Mn, Cu, etc. there-124 fore its chemistry is, approximately, Ni:Cr:Fe  $\approx 0.7:0.2:0.1$ ). 125

Table 1 Summary of MAX phase microstructures

	-			
Compo-sition	Process	Parameters	Grain size	Secondary phases
Ti <sub>2</sub> AlC	3-ONE-2		≈45 µm	Ti <sub>3</sub> AlC <sub>2</sub> (<3 vol.%) and TiAl <sub>3</sub> (<2 vol.%)
Ti <sub>2</sub> AlN			$\approx 20 \mu m$	Ti <sub>4</sub> AlN <sub>3</sub> (~5–9 vol.%); TiN and Al <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (<1 vol.%)
Cr <sub>2</sub> AlC			$\approx 20  \mu m$	$Cr_7C_3 \ (\approx 3 \text{ vol.}\%) \text{ and } Al_2O_3 \ (< 1 \text{ vol.}\%)$
Ti <sub>4</sub> AlN <sub>3</sub>	HIP	1275 °C for 24 h under 70 MPa	(20–30) µm	TiN (<1 vol.%) and Al <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (<1 vol.%)
Ti <sub>3</sub> SiC <sub>2</sub>	HIP	1450 °C for 40 h under 40 MPa	$\approx 4  \mu m$	SiC ( $\approx 2 \text{ vol.}\%$ ) and TiC ( $\approx 2 \text{ vol.}\%$ )
Ta <sub>2</sub> AlC	HIP	1600 °C for 8 h under 70 MPa	$\approx 20  \mu m$	Ta <sub>4</sub> AlC <sub>3</sub> (≈5 vol.%), TaAl <sub>2</sub> (≈2 vol.%) and Al <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (<1 vol.%)
Cr <sub>2</sub> GaC	HIP	1200 °C for 12 h under 70 MPa	≈30 µm	Cr <sub>7</sub> C <sub>3</sub> (<1 vol.%) and Ga (<1 vol.%)
Ti <sub>2</sub> SnC	HIP	1325 °C for 4 h under 70 MPa	(5–10) μm	Sn (5 vol.%) and TiC <sub>x</sub> (<1 vol.%)
Nb <sub>2</sub> SnC	HIP	1300 °C 4 h under 70 MPa	(5–10) μm	$NbC_x$ (<1 vol.%) and Sn (4 vol.%)
Cr <sub>2</sub> GeC	HP	See text	$\approx 20  \mu m$	Cr <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (<3 vol.%) and Ge (<1 vol.%)

#### S. Gupta et al. / Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx

Table 2
Characteristics of starting powder precursors

Powder precursors	Source	Particle size	Purity
Ti Cr Nb Sn	Alfa Aesar (Ward Hill, MA) Aldrich (Milwaukee, WI)	-325 mesh	99.5% 99% 99.80% 99.80%
Ga Ge TiN	Alfa Aesar (Ward Hill, MA) Advanced Technology Inc., NJ	3 mm pellets -200 mesh (2-3) μm	99.99% 99.99% 99.8%
AlN Graphite	Alfa Aesar (Ward Hill, MA)	dm $\approx$ 3 $\mu$ m -300 mesh	32 wt.% (N-min) 99%
SiC Ta <sub>2</sub> AlC Cr <sub>2</sub> AlC Ag	Atlantic Eng. Eqp. (Bergenfield, NJ) 3-ONE-2, Voorhese, NJ. 3-ONE-2, Voorhese, NJ Alfa Aesar (Ward Hill, MA)	-400 mesh -325 mesh -325 mesh -325 mesh	99.50% > 92% >95% 99.9%

All surfaces were polished to a 1  $\mu$ m diamond finish, washed with acetone and dried prior to testing. The measured  $\mu$ 's will be referred to in two ways:  $\mu_m$  to refer to the mean friction coefficient over the entire sliding distance, and  $\mu_s$  to refer to its steady state value during sliding.

The WRs of the MAX phase samples were determined by measuring their weights before and after testing in a scale with a resolution of  $10^{-4}$  g. The WRs were calculated by normalizing the volumetric wear by the total sliding distance and applied load. The wear of the SA discs was measured by laser profilometry [Solarius Development, Sunnyvale, CA].

<sup>137</sup> Profilometry of the MAX surfaces after testing were carried <sup>138</sup> out by an atomic force microscope AFM (Dimension-3000, Dig-<sup>139</sup> ital Instruments, Santa Barbara, CA) in a scanning mode over <sup>140</sup> a 100  $\mu$ m × 100  $\mu$ m contact area and a scan rate of 0.5 Hz. The <sup>141</sup> average root mean square roughness values, *R*<sub>RMS</sub> of the scanned <sup>142</sup> surfaces were calculated.

The worn surfaces were also characterized by optical (Olym-143 pus PMG-3) and field emission scanning electron microscopy, 144 SEM (XL-30, FEI-Philips, Hillsboro, OR). The chemistries of 145 the tribofilms were evaluated with an energy dispersive spec-146 troscope, EDS (EDAX, Mahwah, NJ) attached to the SEM. 147 During this work on the contact surfaces metastable and/or 148 multi-component regions were formed. To call these regions 149 phases would be a gross oversimplification and in many cases 150 would be incorrect. So, the chemistries - determined by EDS 151 analysis - of the regions designated by letters in the various 152 SEM micrographs as well as in the tables, will be designated as 153 between two asterisks, viz. \*microconstituent\*. In most cases, 154 it was not possible to quantify carbon by EDS analysis and its 155 exact value is unknown and thus designated as x. 156

The volume fractions of the binary carbides, which are almost always present in the ternaries, were determined from image analysis of SEM backscattered, BS, micrographs. The grain size was calculated by a linear intercept of at least 10 grains. Since the MAX phase-grains tend to grow as hexagonal plates, what is reported is the average diameters of the plates.

The volume fractions of un-reacted A-group elements, such as Sn and Ga, present in some of the compositions, were determined using a differential scanning calorimeter, DSC [Perkin-Elmer, Boston MA]. The details can be found elsewhere [22].

X-ray diffraction, XRD, patterns were obtained on a Siemens D500 diffractometer (Bruker AXS, Madison, WI) using Cu K $\alpha$  radiation, step scan 0.02°, 1 s per step. When possible, Si powders were used as an internal standard.

### 3. Results

### 3.1. Synthesis and microstructure

A summary of the purities and grain sizes of the ternary carbides investigated herein (Table 1) clearly show that the least pure sample was 90 vol.% pure, with many much purer. The Cr<sub>2</sub>GeC sample, synthesized here for the first time, was  $\approx$ 95 vol.% pure; it contained  $\sim$ 4 vol.% Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> and  $\sim$ 1 vol.% Ge as impurity phases. Its average grain size was  $\approx$ 20 µm. 177

### 3.2. Room temperature results

At ambient temperature, for all the MAX samples tested, the initial  $\mu$ 's were low (<0.1–0.2), but rapidly increased to values >0.5 (Table 3). Typical variations of the  $\mu$ 's as a function of sliding distance are represented in Fig. 1a and b, showing the  $\mu$ 's 182 183 184 184 185 186

Table 3	
Summary of WR and $\mu$ of different tribocouples at 26 °C and 3 N load	

Specimen	Dynamic partner	WR of MAX (mm <sup>3</sup> /N-m)	$\mu_{\rm mean}$
Ti <sub>2</sub> AlC	Inc718	$\approx$ 5.5 × 10 <sup>-4</sup>	$0.5 \pm 0.1$
Ti <sub>2</sub> AlN	Inc718	$pprox 3  imes 10^{-2}$	$0.8\pm0.15$
Ti <sub>4</sub> AlN <sub>3</sub>	Inc718	$\approx 3 \times 10^{-2}$	$0.8\pm0.15$
Ti <sub>3</sub> SiC <sub>2</sub>	Inc718	$pprox 2.5  imes 10^{-2}$	$0.6\pm0.15$
Cr <sub>2</sub> AlC	Inc718	$\approx 1.2 \times 10^{-3}$	$0.6 \pm 0.1$
Ta <sub>2</sub> AlC	Inc718	$pprox 1.5  imes 10^{-2}$	$0.5 \pm 0.1$
Cr <sub>2</sub> GeC	Inc600	$\approx 1.2 \times 10^{-3}$	$0.5 \pm 0.1$
Cr <sub>2</sub> GaC	Inc600	$\approx 4 \times 10^{-2}$	$0.4 \pm 0.1$
Ti <sub>2</sub> SnC	Inc600	$\approx 8 \times 10^{-3}$	$0.63\pm0.1$
Nb <sub>2</sub> SnC	Inc600	$pprox 1.5  imes 10^{-2}$	$0.63\pm0.1$

Please cite this article in press as: S. Gupta et al., Ambient and 550 °C tribological behavior of select MAX phases against Ni-based superalloys, Wear (2007), doi:10.1016/j.wear.2007.03.011

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

180

4

### **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

S. Gupta et al. / Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx





Fig. 1. Change in  $\mu$  as a function of sliding distance at 26 °C, when Inc718 was tested against, (a) Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and (b) Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC. In both (a) and (b), insets show evolution of  $\mu$ 's during initial 10 m.

versus sliding distance for Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC tested against
 Inc718. Fig. 2a plots the absolute wear for Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC
 versus sliding distance. The almost linear dependencies reveal
 that the WRs are more or less constant with sliding distance.

At  $\geq 10^{-4}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m, the WRs of all the MAX phases were high, irrespective of the counter surface used (Table 3). No correlation was found between the WRs and the  $\mu$ 's (Fig. 2b). From the profilometry and the microscopy results, the WRs of the SA surfaces were low and difficult to quantify.

Fig. 2. (a) Typical plot of wear of  $Ti_3SiC_2$  and  $Ta_2AlC$  as a function of sliding distance against Inc718; (b),wear rate versus  $\mu$ 's after dry sliding against Inc718. A linear regression line was fitted (solid line) to the data points; the correlation coefficient, *R*, is shown.

Typical SEM micrographs of the Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC/Inc718 worn surfaces, shown in Fig. 3, showed to be covered with pulverized, partially oxidized, wear particles of an average composition,  $A = *[Ta_{0.7}Al_{0.3}]O_{0.1}\{C_x\}^*$ . At the same time, a smeared discontinuous transfer film – observed on the Inc718 surfaces (Fig. 3b) – had an average composition,  $B = *[Ta_{0.66}Al_{0.33}]O_{0.3}\{C_x\}^*$  [199 (Table 4). Sliding marks were also observed on the Inc718 surfaces (Fig. 3b).

Table 4					
Average chemistries of areas labeled	in Fig	s. 3, 5 and	6 as determin	ned by EDS	analysis

-			
Region	Surface examined	Wear partner	*Average composition*
A (Fig. 3a)	Ta <sub>2</sub> AlC	Inc718	$[Ta_{0.7\pm0.04}Al_{0.3\pm0.03}] O_{0.1\pm0.04} \{C_x\}$
B (Fig. 3b)	Inc718	Ta <sub>2</sub> AlC	$[Ta_{0.66\pm0.04}Al_{0.33\pm0.02}] O_{0.3\pm0.02} \{C_x\}$
C (Figs. 5 and 6a)	Ta <sub>2</sub> AlC Inc718	Inc718 Ta <sub>2</sub> AlC	$[Ta_{0.09\pm0.07}Al_{0.01\pm0.01}Ni_{0.5\pm0.15}Cr_{0.2\pm0.1}Fe_{0.2\pm0.1}]O_{0.7\pm0.14}$
D (Fig. 6b)	Inc718	Ti <sub>3</sub> SiC <sub>2</sub>	$[Ni_{0.25\pm0.03}Cr_{0.1\pm0.01}Fe_{0.1\pm0.01}Ti_{0.35\pm0.05}Si_{0.2\pm0.03}]O_{1.2\pm0.05}$
E (Fig. 6c)	Inc718	Cr <sub>2</sub> AlC	$[Ni_{0.5\pm0.01}Cr_{0.25\pm0.03}Fe_{0.25\pm0.03}]O_{1\pm0.05}$
F (Fig. 6d)	Inc718	Ti <sub>2</sub> AlC	$[Ni_{0.55\pm0.05}Cr_{0.23\pm0.03}Fe_{0.22\pm0.03}]O_{0.9\pm0.2}$

S. Gupta et al. / Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx



Fig. 3. BSE SEM micrographs of tribosurfaces after dry sliding of Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC against Inc718 at 26 °C: (a) Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC surface and (b) Inc718 surface. Compositions of  $\mu$ Cs designated by letters are listed in Table 4.

### 201 3.3. High-temperature results

<sup>202</sup> When tested against the SAs at 550 °C, the  $\mu_s$ 's for all the <sup>203</sup> MAX phases were <0.5 (Table 5). Typical examples are shown <sup>204</sup> in Fig. 4a and b, where the dependencies of  $\mu$  on sliding distance <sup>205</sup> for Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC, respectively, are plotted. Interestingly, <sup>206</sup> initially when the values of  $\mu$  are high (~0.6) the tribocou-<sup>207</sup> ples were accompanied by a loud metallic noise; once the  $\mu$ 's

Table 5 Summary of  $\mu$  and WRs of different tribocouples at 550 °C

Static partner	Dynamic partner	WR <sub>s</sub> (mm <sup>3</sup> /N-m)	WR <sub>d</sub> (mm <sup>3</sup> /N-m)	$\mu_{\mathrm{S}}$
Ta <sub>2</sub> AlC	Inc718	$\leq 1 \times 10^{-6}$	$\sim 10^{-5}$	≈0.4
Ti <sub>3</sub> SiC <sub>2</sub>		$\leq 1 \times 10^{-6}$		$\approx 0.4$
Cr <sub>2</sub> AlC		$\leq 1 \times 10^{-6}$	$\sim 10^{-5}$	$\approx 0.3$
Ti <sub>2</sub> AlC		$\leq 1 \times 10^{-6}$		$\approx 0.4$
Cr <sub>2</sub> GaC	Inc600	$\approx 5 \times 10^{-4}$		$\approx 0.5$
Cr2GeC	Inc600	$pprox 6  imes 10^{-6}$		$\approx 0.35$
Ti <sub>2</sub> AlN	Inc718	$pprox 3  imes 10^{-5}$		$\approx 0.4$
Ti <sub>4</sub> AlN <sub>3</sub>	Inc600	$\approx 1 \times 10^{-3}$		$\approx 0.6$

*Note*:  $WR_s$  – specific wear rate of the static tribo-partner.  $WR_d$  – specific wear rate of the dynamic tribo-partner.



Fig. 4. Change in  $\mu$  as a function of sliding distance when, (a) Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> and (b) Ta<sub>2</sub>AIC were tested against Inc718 at 550 °C.

decreased to their steady state values of  $\sim$ 0.4, the tribo-noises were significantly reduced.

Most of the MAX phases tested against the SAs at 550 °C showed negligible ( $\leq 10^{-5}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m) WRs after 2 km of sliding (Table 5). The high WRs observed for the Cr<sub>2</sub>GaC sample are most probably related to the presence of Ga excess at the grain boundaries.

Based on this preliminary work, it was concluded that the tribocouples of  $Ta_2AlC$ ,  $Ti_3SiC_2$ ,  $Cr_2AlC$  and  $Ti_2AlC$  with Inc718 were the most promising. Accordingly extensive EDS and profilometric studies were carried out to characterize their tribosurfaces after testing.

After sliding against Inc718 at 550 °C for 2 km, the Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC <sup>220</sup> surfaces (Fig. 5a) were covered with oxidized tribofilms of average composition,  $C = *[Ni_{0.45}Fe_{0.22}Cr_{0.23}Ta_{0.1}]O_{0.7}*$ . Even at <sup>222</sup> higher magnifications, the tribofilms formed appeared dense and <sup>223</sup> smooth; no evidence of phase separation was observed (Fig. 5b). <sup>224</sup> Weak C peaks were present in some of the EDS spectra, but, here again, it was impossible to quantify them and C is thus not included in the chemistries listed. <sup>227</sup>

The Inc718 surfaces were slightly gouged and covered with<br/>sporadic and discontinuous tribofilms (Fig. 6a). Under the opti-<br/>cal microscope, OM, these areas were colored metallic gray<br/>(inset in Fig. 6a). EDS of the tribofilms identified them to be an<br/>oxide with an average composition  $\approx C$  (Table 4). Analogously,228<br/>229

208

6

### **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

S. Gupta et al. / Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx



Fig. 5. SEM micrographs showing tribofilms formed on Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC surface after dry sliding for 2 km against Inc718 at 550 °C, (a) SE image and (b) higher magnification BSE image of the region marked with a rectangle in (a).

no phase separation in these oxide layers was observed (inset inFig. 6a).

Similar observations were made on the Inc718 surfaces after
 2 km of sliding against Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 6b), Ti<sub>2</sub>AlC (Fig. 6c) and
 Cr<sub>2</sub>AlC (Fig. 6d). In all cases, the Inc718 surfaces were slightly
 gouged and covered by patchy tribofilms. These tribofilms were

also significantly oxidized, and their main constituents reflected

### Table 6 Effect of interfacial film chemistries on $\mu$

the SA chemistry (Table 4). Laser profilometry of the worn 240 Inc718 surfaces after testing against Cr<sub>2</sub>AlC (Fig. 7a) and 241 Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC (Fig. 7b) detected tribofilms and gouges of the order of a 242 few micrometers, corroborating the microscopy results. Because 243 of the stochastic nature of the gouging and tribofilms, it was diffi-244 cult to quantify the wear of the Inc718 substrates. Nevertheless, 245 a semi-quantitative estimation was carried out (see Appendix 246 A) based on the profilometric data. The WRs estimated for the 247 SA surfaces examined were all of the order of  $\sim 10^{-5}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m 248 (Table 5). 249

The post-sliding roughness of the MAX surfaces – analyzed250with an AFM – was found to be extremely smooth (Fig. 8). The251 $R_{RMS}$  of Ta2AlC (Fig. 8), Cr2AlC, Ti3SiC2 and Ti2AlC (not252shown) surfaces were determined to be about 350 nm, 325 nm,253540 nm and 272 nm, respectively.254

The X-ray diffraction patterns of the surfaces of Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC samples after 2 km sliding against Inc718 did not reveal any new details compared to the bulk material.

258

### 4. Discussion

Before discussing the room temperature results, it is instructive to discuss the high-temperature ones. When the MAX surfaces are in contact with Ni-based SAs at 550 °C, tribofilms form on both contact surfaces (Figs. 5a and 6). These tribofilms are X-ray amorphous or nanocrystalline. According to EDS analysis (Table 4), they are mainly comprised of partially oxidized SA constituents, viz.: 265

$$Ni_{0.5}Cr_{0.25}Fe_{0.25} + O_2 \rightarrow *Ni_{0.5}Cr_{0.25}Fe_{0.25}O_{1-\gamma}*$$
(1) 266

with  $\gamma \le 0.5$ . These tribooxides apparently smear onto and coat the MAX-surfaces (e.g. region C in Fig. 5). In some cases, small amounts of elements from the MAX phases are found in the SA tribosurfaces (e.g. phases C and D in Table 4). As summarized in Table 5, these tribooxides result in relatively low  $\mu$ 's (<0.4) and quite low WRs ( $\le 10^{-6}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m).

That these oxides are lubricious is not too surprising. In the 11 literature, it is known that Ni-based binary alloys, e.g. Ni-2Ta, 1274 Ni-20W, Ni-20Cu, display  $\mu$ 's  $\sim 0.6$  when sliding against Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> 275

Solid lubricant	Temperature (°C)	$\mu_{ m s}$	Reference
$[Ni_{0.45}Fe_{0.22}Cr_{0.23}Ta_{0.1}]O_{0.7}$	550	0.3–0.5	Present work
$[Ni_{0.25}Fe_{0.1}Cr_{0.1}Ti_{0.35}Si_{0.2}C_x]O_{1.2}$			
[Ni <sub>0.5</sub> Fe <sub>0.25</sub> Cr <sub>0.25</sub> ]O <sub>1</sub>			
$[Ni_{0.55}Fe_{0.22}Cr_{0.23}]O_{0.9}$			
ZnO	600	0.7	[25]
NiO	500-800	0.4–0.6	
FeO	300-800	0.6	
CoO	300-600	0.4–0.6	
NiO-FeO	600	0.6	
NiO-TiO <sub>2</sub>	400-800	0.3-0.5	
Ti <sub>5</sub> O <sub>9</sub>	400	0.8	[26]
Ti <sub>9</sub> O <sub>17</sub> , γ-Ti <sub>3</sub> O <sub>5</sub> , Ti <sub>9</sub> O <sub>17</sub> , NiTiO <sub>3</sub>	800	0.2–0.8	
$SiC_xO_y$	400	0.7	
$SiN_xO_y$	800	0.6–0.8	

S. Gupta et al. / Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx



Fig. 6. SEM micrograph of tribofilms formed on Inc718 surfaces after 2 km dry sliding at 550 °C against, (a) Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC (BSE). Inset shows an optical micrograph of the tribofilm (light blue), (b) Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> (SE). Inset shows the SEM micrograph (BSE) at higher magnification, (c) Cr<sub>2</sub>AlC (BSE). Inset shows the BSE SEM micrograph at higher magnification, (d) Ti<sub>2</sub>AlC (SE). Inset shows the BSE SEM micrograph of the tribofilm.

at 26 °C. As the temperature is increased,  $\mu$  drops to 0.3–0.4 276 because of the formation of lubricious oxides, like NiO [24,25]. 277 It is also established that several transition metal oxides, e.g. 278 ZnO, FeO, etc. can be used as solid lubricants at elevated tem-279 peratures (Table 6) [25]. It is thus reasonable to assume that in 280 this work Ni-based lubricious tribooxides are generated, and that 281 these oxides transfer onto the MAX phase surfaces, leading to 282 the low WRs and  $\mu$ 's. 283

The results of Hongxiang et al. [17] – who studied Ti<sub>3</sub>AlC<sub>2</sub> 284 by a block-on-disc method against low carbon steel at 0.8 MPa, 285 but at very high rotation speeds (60 m/s), observed a  $\mu \sim 0.1$ 286 and specific WRs  $\sim 2.5 \times 10^{-6}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m – are also consistent 287 with our interpretation. In that work the excellent tribologi-288 cal properties were ascribed to the formation of self-generating 289 tribofilms, composed of Ti, Al, Fe and O. In their case, the tri-290 booxides formed at room temperature, presumably as a result of 291 the increased contact temperatures at the high rotation speeds 292 used. 293

In light of these conclusions, what is occurring at room 294 temperature becomes clear. At room temperatures, triboox-295 ides either do not form or they form, but are too brittle or 296 thin to impart any lubricity. What seems to occur instead 297 is the formation of massive wear particles, which are pre-298 sumably quite abrasive, resulting in the high WRs observed 299 (Table 3). Interestingly these third body particles are slightly 300 oxidized (Table 4). Consistent with this notion is the fact 301 that high-temperature lubricious oxides, like NiO and ZnO, 302 are brittle at room temperature [25]. How this problem was 303

solved by the addition of Ag is discussed in a forthcoming paper,

It is appropriate to note here the tribological study of  $Ti_3SiC_2$ 306 against steel by Souchet et al. [15], who showed that as long as a 307 tribofilm comprised of Ti, C and O was maintained between the 308 pin and disk, the tribological properties were excellent. Disrup-309 tion of that film resulted in high  $\mu$ 's and WRs. Also noteworthy 310 was that when the same tribocouple was tested in vacuum at 311 room temperature, the initial low WRs and low  $\mu$  stage was 312 absent. Both observations support our arguments about the key 313 role oxygen plays in enhancing the tribological properties of the 314 MAX/SA tribocouples. 315



Fig. 7. Laser profilometry on Inc718 surfaces after dry sliding for 2 km at 550 °C against, (a) Cr<sub>2</sub>AlC and (b) Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC.

305

S. Gupta et al. / Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx



Fig. 8. AFM analysis in scanning mode on  $100 \,\mu$ m  $\times 100 \,\mu$ m Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC surface after testing against Inc718 for 2 km sliding at 550 °C, (a) isometric view, (b) top view and (c) side view of the profile of the region marked by arrows in top view.

### 316 5. Conclusions

At room temperature, when tested against SAs, the tribological behavior of the MAX phases were characterized by  $\mu$ 's>0.4 and high WRs ( $\geq 10^{-4}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m). Third body abrasion is believed to be responsible for this behavior.

In contradistinction, at 550 °C the MAX/Inc718 tribocouples 321 form lubricious tribooxide films, comprised mainly of oxides 322 of the superalloy elements, viz. Ni, Fe and Cr. The formation 323 of this lubricious tribofilms at the contact areas is believed to 324 be responsible for the ultra-low wear rates of the MAX phases 325  $(<10^{-6} \text{ mm}^3/\text{N-m})$  and the slightly higher WR's of the Inc718 326 surfaces (~10<sup>-5</sup> mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m) as well as the relatively low  $\mu$ 's 327 (<0.4). 328

### 329 Uncited reference

330 [23]

### 331 Acknowledgement

This work was supported by ONR (N00421-03-C-0085).

### 333 Appendix A. Estimation of WR of SA counterparts

<sup>334</sup> If one assume the average gouge is of uniform depth through-<sup>335</sup> out the tested wear track, i.e.  $\sim 0.5 \,\mu\text{m}$  for the Inc718 counterpart <sup>336</sup> after the 2 km sliding against Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC at 550 °C (Fig. 7b), then <sup>337</sup> the volume of worn material is 0.018 mm<sup>3</sup> on a 36 mm<sup>2</sup> area in <sup>338</sup> the track. For the given volume of worn material WR could be <sup>339</sup> estimated by the formula (A.1):

WR = 
$$\frac{V_{\rm w}}{(F_{\rm n}l_{\rm s}(L/2\pi r_{\rm mean}))}$$
 (A.1)

where  $V_{\rm w}$ : volume of worn material,  $F_{\rm n}$ : normal load,  $l_{\rm s}$ : linear tab size, *L*: sliding distance and  $r_{\rm mean}$ : mean track radius. The normal load is 3 N, using  $r_{\text{mean}}$  (mean radius of track) ~10 mm, 6 mm sample length, and using the formula (A.1), the WR of the Inc718 could be estimated as ~10<sup>-5</sup> mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m. 343

The similar value of  $\sim 10^{-5}$  mm<sup>3</sup>/N-m was obtained by analogous calculations of the WR of the Inc718 counterpart tested against Cr<sub>2</sub>AlC at 550 °C (Fig. 7a),  $r_{mean} \sim 12$  mm.

#### References

- M.W. Barsoum, M. Radovic, in: R.W.C.K.H.J. Buschow, M.C. Flemings, E.J. Kramer, S. Mahajan, P. Veyssiere (Eds.), Encyclopedia of Materials Science and Technology, Elsevier, Amsterdam, 2004.
- [2] M.W. Barsoum, T. El-Raghy, Synthesis and characterization of a remarkable ceramic: T<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 79 (1996) 1953–1956.
- [3] M.W. Barsoum, The  $M_{N+1}AX_N$  phases: a new class of solids; thermodynamically stable nanolaminates, Prog. Solid State Chem. 28 (2000) 201–281.
- [4] M. Radovic, M.W. Barsoum, T. El-Raghy, S.M. Wiederhorn, W.E. Luecke, Effect of temperature, strain rate and grain size on the mechanical response of Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> in tension, Acta Mater. 50 (2002) 1297–1306.
- [5] T. El-Raghy, M.W. Barsoum, A. Zavaliangos, S.R. Kalidindi, Processing and mechanical properties of Ti3SiC2. II. Effect of grain size and deformation temperature, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 82 (1999) 2855–2860.
- [6] T. Zhen, M.W. Barsoum, S.R. Kalidindi, M. Radovic, Z.M. Sun, T. El-Raghy, Compresive creep of fine and coarse-grained Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> in air in the 1100–1300 °C temperature range, Acta Mater. 53 (2005) 4963–4973.
- [7] S. Gupta, M.W. Barsoum, Synthesis and oxidation of V<sub>2</sub>AlC and (Ti<sub>0.5</sub>,V<sub>0.5</sub>)<sub>2</sub>AlC in air, J. Electrochem. Soc. 151 (2004) D24–D29.
- [8] M.W. Barsoum, N. Tzenov, A. Procopio, T. El-Raghy, M. Ali, Oxidation of Ti<sub>n+1</sub>AlX<sub>n</sub> (n = 1–3 and X = C, N). II. Experimental results, J. Electrochem. Soc. 148 (2001) C551–C562.
- [9] X.H. Wang, Y.C. Zhou, Oxidation behavior of Ti<sub>3</sub>AlC<sub>2</sub> powders in flowing air, J. Mater. Chem. 12 (9) (2002) 2781–2785.
- [10] S. Myhra, J.W.B. Summers, E.H. Kisi, Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub> a layered ceramic exhibiting ultra – low friction, Mater. Lett. Mater. Lett. 39 (1999) 6–11.
- [11] T. El-Raghy, P. Blau, M.W. Barsoum, Effect of grain size on friction and wear behavior of Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>, Wear 238 (2) (2000) 125–130.
- [12] Z.M. Sun, Y.C. Zhou, S. Li, Tribological behavior of Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>-based material, J. Mater. Sci. Technol. 18 (2002) 142–145.
- [13] Y. Zhang, G.P. Ding, Y.C. Zhou, B.C. Cai, Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>—a self-lubricating ceramic, Mater. Lett. 55 (2002) 285–289.

Please cite this article in press as: S. Gupta et al., Ambient and 550 °C tribological behavior of select MAX phases against Ni-based superalloys, Wear (2007), doi:10.1016/j.wear.2007.03.011

8

349

350

351

352

353

354

355

356

357

358

359

360

361

362

363

364

365

366

367

368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

379

380

381

#### S. Gupta et al. / Wear xxx (2007) xxx-xxx

- 382 [14] H.Z. Zhai, Z.Y. Huang, Y. Zhou, Z.L. Zhang, Y. Wang, M. Al, Oxidation 383 layer in sliding friction surface of high-purity Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>, J. Mater. Sci. 39 (21) (2004) 6635-6637. 384
- [15] A. Souchet, J. Fontaine, M. Belin, T. Le Mogne, J.-L. Loubet, M.W. 385 Barsoum, Tribological duality of Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>, Tribol. Lett. 18 (2005) 341-386 387 352.
- [16] D. Sarkar, B. Basu, S.J. Cho, M.C. Chu, S.S. Huang, S.W. Park, Tribological 388 properties of Ti<sub>3</sub>SiC<sub>2</sub>, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 88 (11) (2005) 3245-3248. 389
- [17] Z. Hongxiang, H. Zhenying, A. Zingxing, Z. Yang, Z. Zhilli, L. Shibo, 390 Tribophysical properties of polycrystalline bulk Ti<sub>3</sub>AlC<sub>2</sub>, J. Am. Ceram. 391 Soc. 88 (11) (2005) 3270-3274. 392
- [18] C. Dellacorte, H.E. Sliney, Tribological Properties of PM212: A High-393 394 Temperature, Self-Lubricating, Powder Metallurgy Composite, NASA TM 395 102355, 1990.
- [19] C. Dellacorte, A. Zaldana, K. Radil, A systems approach to the solid lubri-396 cation of foil air bearings for oil-free turbomachinery, J. Tribol. 126 (2004) 397 201-207.

- [20] T. El-Raghy, S. Chakraborty, M.W. Barsoum, Synthesis and characterization of Hf<sub>2</sub>PbC, Zr<sub>2</sub>PbC and M<sub>2</sub>SnC (M = Ti, Hf, Nb or Zr), J. Eur. Ceram. 399 Soc. 20 (2000) 2619.
- [21] Z.M. Sun, S. Gupta, H. Ye, M.W. Barsoum, Spontaneous growth of freestanding Ga nanoribbons from Cr2GaC surfaces, J. Mater. Res. 20 (2005) 2618-2621.
- [22] A.T. Procopio, M.W. Barsoum, T. El-Raghy, Synthesis of Ti<sub>4</sub>AlN<sub>3</sub> and phase equilibria in the Ti-Al-N system, Metall. Mater. Trans. A 31A (2000) 333-337.
- [23] S. Gupta, D. Filimonov, M.W. Barsoum, Isothermal oxidation of Ta<sub>2</sub>AlC in air, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 89 (2006) 2974-2976.
- [24] M.B. Peterson, S.J. Calabrese, S. LI, X. Jiang, Friction of alloys at high temperature, J. Mater. Sci. Technol. 10 (1994) 313-320.
- [25] A. Erdemir, Modern Tribology Handbook, CRC Press LLC, 2003, Chapter 411 22. 412
- [26] A. Skopp, M. Woydt, Ceramic and ceramic composite materials with 413 improved friction and wear properties, Tribol. Trans. 38 (1995) 233-242. 414

Please cite this article in press as: S. Gupta et al., Ambient and 550 °C tribological behavior of select MAX phases against Ni-based superalloys, Wear (2007), doi:10.1016/j.wear.2007.03.011

398

400

401