





Report of the joint workshop

"Smart Mitigation of GHG in livestock production"

29th and 30th November 2016,

in Potsdam, Germany

This document summarises the outcome of the joint workshop carried out by the three different EU funding networks, ERA-NET SusAn; ERA-GAS and ICT AGRI 2. The aim of the joint workshop was to discuss, identify and explore research priorities, -topics and tools for further additional activities in the three Era-Net Initiatives.

Publishable summary

FACCE ERA-GAS (ERA-NET Cofund for Monitoring & Mitigation of Greenhouse gases from Agri- and Silvi-culture), together with the ERA-NET SusAn, (Sustainable Animal Production Systems) and ERA-NET ICT-AGRI 2 (Information and Communication Technologies and Robotics for Sustainable Agriculture) organized a joint workshop on 29-30 November in Potsdam to identify promising approaches to reduce GHG emissions in livestock production. The joint workshop, the first of its kind involving three ERA-NETs, had close to 70 participants from 22 different countries. The three ERA-NETs have already identified a number of potential areas of synergy. This workshop explored one of those areas in detail: Comparison of animal production systems with respect to GHGs. Particular attention was paid to the following two sub-topics:

- Production technology and management (e.g. housing systems; optimal field and grazing management)
- Breeding, physiology, feed & nutrition

The outputs of the workshop will help to set the research priorities for future joint calls and other activities between the three ERA-NETs.

Summary of discussions

The workshop was opened by the chair of the CWG-SAP, Bernhard Polten, who gave a brief introduction to the complexity of the topic and the variety of views on livestock production. Reiner Brunsch, director of ATB, presented the research conducted at the Leibniz Institute for Agricultural Engineering and Bioeconomy, also with regard to research on GHGs. In the following keynote speeches, Jean Francois Soussana, scientific director (Environment), INRA, FR, and Harry Clark, director of NZAGRC, NZ, set the scene for the working groups by





introducing to the topic of GHGs and livestock from global to animal level. Finally, the three ERA-NETs involved in this workshop were briefly presented by Elke Saggau (SusAn), Raymond Kelly (ERA-GAS) and Niels Gøtke (ICT-AGRI 2). After the presentations, four breakout groups, each lead by a moderator, discussed the following four areas:

I. Production technology and management

a: Ruminants (including housing, manure- and range management) - Moderator: Gary Lanigan, TEAGASC, IR, co-moderator: Orlaith Ní Choncubhair, TEAGASC, IR
b: Monogastrics (including housing, manure- and grazing management) - Moderator: Jürgen Vangeyte, ILVO, BE_VLG, co-moderator: Kees Lokhorst, WUR, NL

II. Breeding, physiology, feed & nutrition

a: Ruminants - Moderator: Illan Halachmi, ARO, IL, co-moderator: Johannes Bender, BLE, DE

b: Monogastrics - Moderator: Vivi Hunnicke Nielsen, AU, DK, co-moderator: Boris Vashnev, FNR, DE

Three key questions were adressed in the breakout groups:

a. What are the challenges?

What are the most urgent challenges that need to be met in order to mitigate GHG emissions within the given area of livestock production systems (1a - 2b)?

b. <u>What are the Strategies?</u>

What are the most promising strategies within the given area of livestock production to meet the challenges? Can the expected effects of these strategies be quantified (estimated reduction of emissions by x pct = estimated impact)?

c. What are the burning research questions:

Which thematic research areas and what type of research and research questions will most likely contribute to meet the challenges?

The aim of the discussions was to identify possible research topics for further additional activities and/or potential (joint) calls in SusAn, ERA-GAS and ICT-AGRI. Additionally the Era-Nets intended to come up with a first list of priority topics areas that will be relevant for future development and alignment of research. The results were presented and discussed in the plenum at the end of day 1 and in the morning of day 2. Finally, the lists from the four groups were merged into one list (see <u>Annex 1</u>).





The second part of the workshop started with an excercise in which all participants were asked to select five topics of high research priority from the list provided by the breakout groups of part I. The data were compiled directly (see <u>Annex 2</u>).

Christine Bunthof, coordinator of PLATFORM of bioeconomy ERA-NET Actions, presented funding instruments and mechanisms for European initiatives to support research and innovation. The participants then split into ERA-NET specific working groups in order to brainstorm on collection and definition of funding instruments and mechanisms for further additional activities in SusAn, ERA-GAS and ICT-Agri.

The outcome of the ERA-NET related discussions was, that the ranked list of research topics in combination with the instruments presented are a useful basis for the planning of future activities within the ERA-NETs. A follow-up workshop would be welcomed, possibly in order to discuss selected research topics in more debth and again in combination with specific funding instruments and mechanisms.





Annex 1: List of topics identified during the workshop

- 1) Role of livestock production in EU? related to world food challenges)
- 2) Cascading to add value (bio economy)
- 3) Methanotrophic microorganisms
- 4) Developing, testing and validating : Measurement techniques (low cost, IOT based, big data analytics, ...) for creating awareness for farmers ; High throughput low-cost technologies
- 5) Practical uptake through large scale deployment, use in management systems, large scale monitoring for policy makers (adoption is integrated), adoption of PLF concepts. (license to produce is embedded)
- 6) What are sustainable business model? (technology, economically, socially?
- 7) Can we develop housing systems that are good for the environment and animal welfare – what AW requirements do we want? Re)design of production systems?
- 8) Housing systems: indoor climate, ventilation strategies, flooring systems, innovative materials Housing better EFs and mitigation
- 9) What potential is in manure treatments ? micro digesters, (local /central) or drying and upgrade of manure, Application of manure via injectors
- 10) Precision livestock feeding, (real time, individual, group feeding)/ Precision
 livestock farming including precision livestock feeding for optimal utilization of nutrients
- 11) Feed chain strategies: Feed chain impact of feed quality across whole chain
- 12) Better understanding knowledge of rumen microbiome, soil microbiome, manure microbiome/ Microbiome (improvement of nutrient utilization and health and reduced emission)
- 13) Thematic area: Strategies to improve inventories
 - How to best share experience
 - Methodologies
- 14) Optimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validation
- 15) Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration
- 16) Can we develop farm level MRV?
- 17) Pasture management? Improving pasture sustainability (use of sensing)





- 18) Inhibitors (soil/feed)
- 19) Quantifying fate of N
- 20) Characterising soil characteristics/ Drainage impacts on nutrient cycling
- 21) *New feedstuffs:* New European protein sources (European/locally produced)(legumes, grass based proteins, products from biorefineries of biomass, aquatic/marine resources, insects, annelids, former foodstuff)
- 22) *Breeding* (traditional, genomic selection, NBT) for animals adapted to new feedstuff ensuring low FCR (identification of new traits)
- 23) Breeding and management for improved *health and welfare (20% productivity loss du to diseases)*
- 24) Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens Developing efficient animal production systems:
 - Accurate measurements in livestock on individuals and on group levels, data interpretation, big data, machine learning, PLF, sensors, signal processing, caring the smallest production unit.
 - b) Feed efficiency and diet design towards lower GHG while elevating production, health, reproduction, sustainability and economics measures of performances.
 - c) Manipulating the rumen microbiome, including early life intervention, (e.g. Feeding strategy for chickens in the first days of life)
- 25) Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques, affordable and implementable by the livestock farmers.
- 26) How to raise awareness of farmers and society for the need to decrease GHG's ?. And how new technique should be better communicate with farmers, public and all stakeholders ?. Thematic area – farmer uptake and wider societal impacts

Long-term studies, per species (comparing systems within a species), addressing several synergetic aspects at once. ex combined breeding and feeding strategies. Holistic research approach, and modular 'tailor-made' to national/regional specificities, considering the diversity of livestock sector in Europe

Annex 1: List of top ranked topics identified during the workshop

R Developing efficient animal production systems Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems R Long-term studies, per species Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems R Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems R Role of livestock production in EU Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems R The matic area: Strategies to improve inventories Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems R Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems R Developing, testing and validation Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems R Develop housing systems Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems M Can we develop housing systems Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems M Can we develop farm level MR Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constraint of the systems M Can we develop farm level MR Image: Constraint of the systems Image: Constrategies Image: Constrategies Image:	
Relation New feedstuffs Role of livestock production in EU Role of livestock feeding Precision livestock feeding Breeding for animals adapted to new feedstuff ensuring low FCR Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques Doptimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validation Developing, testing and validating Mean develop housing systems Rededing and management for improved health and welfare Rededing and management for improved health and welfare Rededing and management for improved health and systems Practical uptake through large scale deployment Methanotrophic spiced farm level MR Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency SOC sequestration Methanotrophic microorganisms Red Can we develop farm level MR Red Can we develop farm le	
New feedstuffs Role of livestock production in EU How to raise awareness Precision livestock feeding Thematic area: Strategies to improve inventories Breeding for animals adapted to new feedstuff ensuring low FCR Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques Developing, new, ambitious, mitigation techniques Developing, testing and validation Developing, testing and validation Breeding and management for improved health and welfare Breeding and management for improved health and welfare Developing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Practical uptake through large scale deployment Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Moditation of sensing as proxies for losses	
How to raise awarenessPrecision livestock feedingPrecision livestock feedingPrecision livestock feedingPrecision livestock feedingPrecision livestock feedingPrecision for animals adapted to new feedstuff ensuring low FCRPrecision of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validationPrecision of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validationPrecision animals adapted to new feedstuff ensuring low FCRPrecision of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validationPrecision of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validationPrecision and management for improved health and welfarePrecision and management for improved health and welfarePrecision Practical uptake through large scale deploymentPrecision Inhibitors (soil/feedPrecision Inhibitors (soil/feedPrecision Sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestrationPrecision Inhibitors (microorganismsPrecision Internet metric microorganismsPrecision Precision Precis	
How to raise awareness Precision livestock feeding Thematic area: Strategies to improve inventories Breeding for animals adapted to new feedstuff ensuring low FCR Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques Optimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validation Mathematic area: Strategies to improve inventories Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques Optimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validating Mathematic area: Strategies to improve the alth and welfare Breeding and management for improved health and welfare Pasture management? Can we develop housing systems Mathematic area: Strategies scale deployment Inhibitors (soil/feed Mathematic area sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Can we develop farm level MR Can we develop farm level MR Can we develop farm level MR Mathanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Optimistor of sensing as proxies for losses, afficiency, for add value Mathanotrophic microorganisms Mathanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Optimistor derivation and survival of pigle	
Q1 Precision livestock feeding Q1 Thematic area: Strategies to improve inventories Q2 Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques Q2 Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques Q4 Developing, testing and validation Q5 Breeding and management for improve health and welfare Q6 Pasture management? Q6 What are sustainable business model Q1 Unhibitors (soil/feed Q6 What are sustainable business model Q1 Can we develop farm level MR Q2 Can we develop farm level MR Q2 Can we develop farm level MR Q1 Can we develop farm level MR Q2 Can we develop farm level MR Q3 Methanotrophic microorganisms Q4 Quantifying fate of N Q5 Muthanotrophic microorganisms Q4 Quantifying fate of N </td <td></td>	
Thematic area: Strategies to improve inventories Breeding for animals adapted to new feedstuff ensuring low FCR Optimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validation Optimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validation Methods Optimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validation Methods	
RC Breeding for animals adapted to new feedstuff ensuring low FCR VE Developing new, ambitious, mitigation techniques VE Optimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validation VE Developing, testing and validating O What potential is in manure treatments RC Breeding and management for improved health and welfare Pasture management? Pasture management? N Can we develop housing systems M Practical uptake through large scale deployment PS Inhibitors (soil/feed Matta are sustainable business model Matta are sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Matta are sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency and value Matta are sustainable business model M Can we develop farm level MR M Can we develop farm level MR M Methanotrophic microorganisms	
SQDeveloping new, ambitious, mitigation techniquesP1Optimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validationP2Developing, testing and validatingP3Breeding and management for improved health and welfareP4Pasture management?P4Can we develop housing systemsP5Practical uptake through large scale deploymentP3Inhibitors (soil/feedP4Can we develop farm level MRP4Cascading to add valueP5Methanotrophic microorganismsP4Can we develop farm level MRP5Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
TOptimisation of whole farm/sector "sustainability" and validationDeveloping, testing and validatingWhat potential is in manure treatmentsBreeding and management for improved health and welfarePasture management?Can we develop housing systemsCan we develop housing systemsPractical uptake through large scale deploymentInhibitors (soil/feedValidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestrationYalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency for we develop farm level MRCan we develop farm level MRMathematication	
HereDeveloping, testing and validatingDeveloping, testing and validatingWhat potential is in manure treatmentsBreeding and management for improved health and welfarePasture management?Pasture management?Can we develop housing systemsDeveloping, testing and walidatingPasture management?Pasture management?	
on What potential is in manure treatments Breeding and management for improved health and welfare Pasture management? Can we develop housing systems Can we develop housing systems Practical uptake through large scale deployment Inhibitors (soil/feed What are sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Can we develop farm level MR Cascading to add value Methanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Breeding and management for improved health and welfare Pasture management? Can we develop housing systems Housing systems Practical uptake through large scale deployment Inhibitors (soil/feed What are sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Can we develop farm level MR Can we develop farm level MR Methanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Pasture management? Can we develop housing systems Housing systems Practical uptake through large scale deployment Inhibitors (soil/feed Inhibitors (soil/feed What are sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Can we develop farm level MR Can we develop farm level MR Cascading to add value Methanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Pasture management? Can we develop housing systems Housing systems Practical uptake through large scale deployment Inhibitors (soil/feed Inhibitors (soil/feed What are sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Can we develop farm level MR Can we develop farm level MR Cascading to add value Methanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Can we develop housing systems Housing systems Practical uptake through large scale deployment Inhibitors (soil/feed Mattare sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency and value Can we develop farm level MR Can we develop farm level MR Methanotrophic microorganisms Methanotrophic microorganisms Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Practical uptake through large scale deploymentInhibitors (soil/feedWhat are sustainable business modelValidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestrationCan we develop farm level MRCascading to add valueMothanotrophic microorganismsFeed chain strategiesQuantifying fate of NImproved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Inhibitors (soil/feed What are sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Can we develop farm level MR Cacacading to add value Methanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
What are sustainable business model Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses Yalidation of sensing as proxies for losses <t< td=""><td></td></t<>	
What are sustainable business model Validation of sensing as proxies for losses, efficiency, SOC sequestration Can we develop farm level MR Cascading to add value Methanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Can we develop farm level MR Can we develop farm level MR Cascading to add value Methanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Can we develop farm level MR Can we develop farm level MR Cascading to add value Methanotrophic microorganisms Feed chain strategies Quantifying fate of N Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Cascading to add value m Methanotrophic microorganisms 1 Feed chain strategies 1 Quantifying fate of N 2 Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Methanotrophic microorganisms 다 Feed chain strategies 다 Quantifying fate of N 다 Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
Feed chain strategies 안 <t< td=""><td></td></t<>	
인 Quantifying fate of N 전 Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
치 Improved reprodution and survival of piglets and chickens	
R Characterising soil characteristics/ Drainag	
0 5 10 15 20 25	0 3