1 Ichnological evidence for meiofaunal bilaterians from the Ediacaran–Cambrian

- 2 transition of Brazil
- 3
- 4 Luke Parry<sup>1,2,\*</sup>, Paulo C. Boggiani<sup>3</sup>, Daniel Condon<sup>4</sup>, Russell Garwood<sup>5,6</sup>, Juliana de
- 5 M. Leme<sup>3</sup>, Duncan McIlroy<sup>7</sup>, Martin D. Brasier<sup>8,†</sup>, Ricardo Trindade<sup>9</sup>, Ginaldo A. C.
- 6 Campanha<sup>3</sup>, Mírian L. A. F. Pacheco<sup>10</sup>, Cleber Q. C. Diniz<sup>3</sup>, and Alexander G. Liu<sup>2, 11</sup>
- 7
- 8
- 9 1: Palaeobiology, Royal Ontario Museum, 100 Queen's Park, Toronto, Ontario, M5S
  10 2C6, Canada
- 2: Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Toronto, 25
   Willcocks Street, Ontario, M5S 3B2, Canada
- 13 3: Instituto de Geociências, Universidade de São Paulo, Rua do Lago, 562, 05508-
- 14 080, São Paulo, Brazil.
- 4: NERC Isotope Geosciences Laboratory, British Geological Survey, Keyworth,
  Nottinghamshire, NG12 5GG, UK
- 17 5: School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Manchester,
  18 Manchester, M13 9PL, UK
- 19 6: Department of Earth Sciences, Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London
  20 SW7 5BD, UK.
- 21 7: Department of Earth Sciences, Memorial University of Newfoundland, Alexander
  22 Murray Building, 300 Prince Philip Drive, St. John's, NL, A1B 3X5, Canada.
- 23 8: Department of Earth Sciences, University of Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford,
  24 OX1 3AN, UK
- 25 9: Departamento de Geofisica, Instituto de Astronomia, Geofísica e Ciências
- 26 Atmosféricas, Universidade de São Paulo, Rua do Matão 1226, 05508-900, São
  27 Paulo, Brazil.
- 28 10: Department of Biology. Federal University of São Carlos. Rodovia João Leme
- 29 dos Santos Parque Reserva Fazenda Imperial, Km 104, 18052780, Sorocaba,
  30 Brazil.
- 31 11: Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, Downing Street,
  32 Cambridge, CB2 3EQ, UK
- 33

35

<sup>34</sup>  $^{\dagger}$  Deceased

36 The evolutionary events during the Ediacaran–Cambrian transition (~541 Ma) are unparalleled in Earth history. The fossil record suggests that most extant 37 38 animal phyla appeared in a geologically brief interval, with the oldest 39 unequivocal bilaterian body fossils found in early Cambrian. Molecular clocks 40 and biomarkers provide independent estimates for the timing of animal origins, 41 and both suggest a cryptic Neoproterozoic history for Metazoa that extends 42 considerably beyond the Cambrian fossil record. We report an assemblage of 43 ichnofossils from Ediacaran–Cambrian siltstones in Brazil, alongside U-Pb radioisotopic dates that constrain the age of the oldest specimens to 555–542 Ma. 44 45 X-ray microtomography reveals three-dimensionally preserved traces ranging 46 from 50-600µm in diameter, indicative of small-bodied, meiofaunal tracemakers. 47 Burrow morphologies suggest they were created by a nematoid-like organism 48 that utilised undulating locomotion to move through the sediment. This 49 assemblage demonstrates animal-sediment interactions in the latest Ediacaran 50 Period, and provides the oldest known fossil evidence for meiofaunal bilaterians. 51 Our discovery highlights meiofaunal ichnofossils as a hitherto unexplored 52 window for tracking animal evolution in deep time, and reveals that both 53 meiofaunal and macrofaunal bilaterians began to explore infaunal niches during 54 the late Ediacaran.

55

The lower Cambrian fossil record documents a major radiation of macroscopic animals (particularly bilaterian phyla), coupled with significant expansion of their behavioural interactions with substrates and other organisms<sup>1,2</sup>. However, a growing catalogue of evidence from body fossils, trace fossils, biomarkers and molecular clocks indicates a protracted Neoproterozoic history for the Metazoa, with the origin
of animals significantly pre-dating the base of the Cambrian<sup>3</sup>.

A range of biological phenomena typically associated with animals first appears during the late Ediacaran interval (~580–541 Ma) including: skeletogenesis<sup>4</sup>, reef-building<sup>5</sup> and macroscopic predation<sup>6</sup>. Body fossils of late Ediacaran macroorganisms include at least some early animals<sup>3</sup>, but crucially, most plausible claims for metazoans lie within the diploblasts rather than the Bilateria<sup>3</sup>. *Kimberella*, which is putatively a stem mollusc<sup>7</sup>, is a notable exception, but some authors suggest that it can only be reliably considered as a member of total group Bilateria<sup>3</sup>.

69 Our understanding of early animal evolution is complemented by ichnological investigations of latest Ediacaran to Ordovician strata<sup>1,2,8</sup>. Diverse ichnofossil 70 71 assemblages in the earliest Cambrian place an important constraint on the tempo of 72 bilaterian origins, since they indicate that some groups, including total group panarthropods and priapulid-like scalidophorans<sup>2,9</sup>, were globally distributed and 73 74 abundant by this point. The major bilaterian divergences (i.e. the protostome-75 deuterostome and ecdysozoan-lophotrochozoan divergences) must therefore pre-date 76 the Ediacaran-Cambrian boundary. To date, the Ediacaran trace fossil record has provided limited insight into these early divergences. Most Ediacaran ichnofossils are 77 78 either surface traces or simple under-mat burrows, created either on or immediately beneath matgrounds<sup>10</sup>. Such traces extend back to ~555 Ma<sup>11</sup>, including: inferred 79 80 grazing traces (*Kimberichnus*<sup>12</sup>) associated with the body fossil *Kimberella*, vertical adjustment structures in response to seafloor aggradation<sup>13</sup>, and in the latest 81 Ediacaran, shallow vertical burrows<sup>10</sup>, treptichnid-like burrows just below the 82 Ediacaran-Cambrian boundary<sup>14</sup>. Most Ediacaran ichnofossils are considered to have 83

been made by total group bilaterian<sup>15</sup> or cnidarian<sup>13,16</sup> eumetazoans. Notwithstanding
controversial claims for bioturbation and complex burrows at ~553 Ma<sup>17</sup>, widespread
substrate-penetrating burrows capable of significant sediment mixing do not appear
until close to the Precambrian-Cambrian boundary<sup>14</sup>.

Molecular clock analyses predict an earlier, pre-Ediacaran origin for the 88 Metazoa and Eumetazoa, and an early Ediacaran origin of Bilateria, Protostomia and 89 Deuterostomia<sup>18</sup>. Palaeontological support for these suggestions is limited to 90 purported body fossils of sponges<sup>19</sup>, and demosponge biomarkers<sup>20</sup>. A considerable 91 92 gap therefore remains between the fossil record of the late Ediacaran, and molecular 93 clock estimates for deep splits in the animal tree, e.g. between Metazoa and Eumetazoa<sup>3</sup>. Assuming that contemporary molecular clock analyses yield accurate, if 94 imprecise<sup>18</sup>, node ages for animal divergences, a small body size and concomitant 95 limited fossilisation potential<sup>21</sup> could reconcile these discordant records of animal 96 evolution (though see reference<sup>22</sup>). 97

The small body size of the ancestral bilaterian is supported by recent phylogenomic analyses of deep animal relationships, with acoel flatworms and xenoturbellids (Xenacoelomorpha) being a sister group to all remaining bilaterians (Nephrozoa)<sup>23</sup>, and small bodied spiralian taxa (the 'Platyzoa') recognised as a paraphyletic grade with respect to macroscopic trochozoans<sup>24</sup>. This suggests that early bilaterians and spiralians were small bodied, possibly meiofaunal, and moved using ciliary gliding.

Meiofauna comprises all organisms between 32–1000μm in size, that inhabit
 pore-water-rich sediments in freshwater to deep-marine environments<sup>25</sup>. Modern
 meiofaunal communities include animals, foraminifera and some ciliates, and

108 contribute significantly to sediment bioturbation and bioirrigation<sup>26,27</sup>. The meiofauna 109 can be divided into permanent members (i.e. animals with adults of a small size 110 adapted and restricted to the meiofaunal, interstitial realm), and temporary meiofauna 111 (e.g. the larvae of macrobiota)<sup>25</sup>.

112 Despite its ecological and evolutionary importance, the deep-time record of 113 the meiofauna has received little discussion, principally due to the low preservation 114 potential of both meiofaunal body fossils and traces. Whilst meiofaunal burrows 115 (sometimes described as burrow mottling or cryptobioturbation) have occasionally been reported from Cambrian to Recent sediments<sup>26</sup>, they are rarely subjected to 116 117 detailed study. Body fossil discoveries also reveal organisms inhabiting meiofaunal 118 niches within early Cambrian communities, highlighting the potential for their preservation within particular taphonomic windows<sup>28,29</sup>. 119

120 Here we report a new assemblage of meiofaunal ichnofossils from siltstones of 121 the Ediacaran-Cambrian Tamengo and Guaicurus Formations, Corumbá Group, 122 central-western Brazil (Fig. 1). The age of the assemblage is constrained by U-Pb 123 (zircon) isotope dilution thermal ionisation mass spectrometry (ID-TIMS) dating of 124 inter-stratified ash beds. The dates indicate that the Tamengo Formation specimens 125 are late Ediacaran in age, and those in the Guaicurus Formation lie close to the 126 Ediacaran-Cambrian boundary. Our results constitute the oldest documented 127 meiofaunal burrows in the geological record, placing a constraint on the minimum age 128 of this key ecological innovation.

129

# 130 The Corumbá Group

131 The Corumbá Group, part of the Southern Paraguay Belt, is a ~600m thick

132 sedimentary unit comprising carbonate and siliciclastic facies deposited on a stable continental margin following a late Neoproterozoic rift event<sup>30,31</sup> (Fig. 1). The 133 134 lowermost units of the Corumbá Group are the terrigenous Cadieus and Cerradinho 135 Formations, which are likely contemporaneous with the Puga Formation of the Amazon Craton<sup>30</sup> (and thus possibly Marinoan-equivalent). Stromatolitic dolostones 136 137 and phosphorites of the Bocaina Formation lie above those siliciclastic units. The 138 lower Corumbá Group is unconformably overlain by the fossiliferous dark organic-139 rich marls and limestones of the Tamengo Formation, and laminated siltstones of the Guaicurus Formation<sup>31</sup> (Fig. 1). A breccia horizon marks the base of the Tamengo 140 141 Formation in several sections, and is concordantly overlain by interbedded mudstones 142 and grainstones deposited in a shallow platform setting. The laminated calcareous 143 siltstones of the Guaicurus Formation indicate deposition in a setting with low 144 hydrodynamic energy, probably below fair-weather wave-base. The sedimentary 145 succession has previously yielded macroscopic body fossils including the scyphozoan-like Corumbella werneri and Paraconularia<sup>4</sup>, along with Cloudina 146 lucianoi, in the upper Tamengo Formation, and possible vendotaenid algae 147 (*Eoholynia*) in the lowermost Guaicurus Formation<sup>31</sup> (Fig. 1). 148

149

150

#### 151 Results

152 U-Pb Geochronology

Three volcanic tuff horizons were sampled within the Corumbá Group (Fig. 1), and zircons from these tuffs were dated using U-Pb chemical abrasion (CA) ID-TIMS methods (see Methods for full methodology). An ash bed from the top of the Bocaina

156	Formation (from Porto Morrinhos; Fig. 1) yielded a weighted mean <sup>206</sup> Pb/ <sup>238</sup> U date of
157	$555.18 \pm 0.30/0.34/0.70$ Ma (MSWD=1.6, <i>n</i> =8 out of 8) (Supp. Info. Fig. 6, Table
158	3,4), which we consider to approximate the age of the sample. This date provides a
159	maximum age for the overlying Tamengo Formation. Two further ash beds (samples
160	1.08 and 1.04) were collected from the top of the Tamengo Formation. Zircons from
161	sample 1.04 yielded U-Pb CA-ID-TIMS dates that ranged from 541.2 to 548 Ma, with
162	a cluster of the five youngest concordant analyses defining a weighted mean
163	$^{206}$ Pb/ $^{238}$ U date of 541.85 ± 0.75/0.77/0.97 Ma (MSWD=3.3, <i>n</i> =5 out of 11) ((Supp.
164	Info. Fig. 6, Table 3,4) that we consider approximates the age of the sample. Zircons
165	from sample 1.08 yielded U-Pb CA-ID-TIMS dates that ranged from 537 to 552 Ma,
166	with a coherent cluster of four concordant analyses (Fig. 2) defining a weighted mean
167	$^{206}$ Pb/ $^{238}$ U date of 542.37 ± 0.28/0.32/0.68 Ma (MSWD=0.68, <i>n</i> =4 out of 8) (Supp.
168	Info. Fig. 6, Table 3,4). We consider the single significantly older data point to result
169	from the incorporation of xenocrystic zircon, perhaps during eruption. The three
170	younger <sup>206</sup> Pb/ <sup>238</sup> U dates from sample 1.08 are considered to reflect Pb-loss based
171	upon the observations that: (i) they are non-overlapping, (ii) the $^{207}$ Pb/ $^{206}$ Pb dates are
172	similar to those that define the $\sim$ 542 Ma population in both this sample and sample
173	1.04, and (iii) the derived dates from both upper Tamengo Formation samples are
174	consistent. Therefore $542.37 \pm 0.28/0.32/0.68$ Ma is taken to approximate the age of
175	sample 1.08. The data from samples 1.04 and 1.08 indicate an age of $\sim$ 542 Ma for the
176	top of the Tamengo Formation, constraining the age of the upper Corumbá Group as
177	late Ediacaran (uppermost Bocaina-Tamengo formations, 555-542 Ma) to earliest
178	Cambrian (lower Guaicurus Formation, <542 Ma). The current accepted age for the
179	base of the Cambrian is $541.00 \pm 0.29 \text{ Ma}^{32}$ (level Y uncertainty, excluding the

180 systematic  $^{238}$ U decay constant uncertainty).

181

#### 182 Trace fossils of the Guaicurus and Tamengo formations

183

Three dimensionally mineralised fossils were collected from approximately 30–40m
above the base of the Tamengo Formation at two levels in the Ladário section (Fig.
1), and from a single horizon and loose material ~7 metres above the base of the
Guaicurus Formation from the Laginha Mine section (Fig. 1). The latter horizon is
<542.0 Ma in age based on the U-Pb CA-ID-TIMS data presented above.</li>

Bi-lobed horizontal, iron oxide filled, ichnofossils occur in a single handspecimen, preserving part and counterpart, derived from float in the lower Guaicurus Formation (Fig. 2c–d). The burrows are straight to curving, approximately 2 mm in width, and exhibit dorsal and ventral median depressions, creating the bi-lobed appearance typical of *Didymaulichnus lyelli*<sup>33</sup>.

194 Small sub-horizontal structures occur in abundance in both the lower 195 Guaicurus (Fig. 2) and Tamengo Formation (Fig. 3). These consist of irregular multi-196 tiered networks connected by short sub-vertical shafts. In bedding plane view, the 197 fossils are dark in colour relative to the matrix, forming dense assemblages comprised 198 of sinuous structures with rare dichotomous branches (Fig. 2a-b). The fossils are 199 filled with oxidized iron-rich minerals with framboidal morphologies, and authigenic 200 microcrystalline calcite (Fig. 2e–h). Framboids suggest that the fossils were originally 201 pyritized, and subsequently oxidized to iron oxides and oxyhydroxides (Supp. Fig. 1). 202 The presence of calcite and framboids throughout the infill suggests that the 203 framboids and calcite formed at a similar time.

204	The density contrast between the fossils and the host-rock allows them to be
205	visualized through X-ray microtomography ( $\mu$ CT; Figs 3–5), revealing a dense
206	ichnofabric (Figs 3e-g, 4e-f, 5f). Although many of the burrows are restricted to
207	single horizons, some cut across up to ~7mm of stratigraphic thickness, indicating
208	interstratal burrowing (Fig. 4g). Burrow diameters range from 45-573µm (Fig. 5g;
209	mean =193.2 $\mu$ m, n = 393). The Shapiro-Wilks test indicates these data are not drawn
210	from a normal distribution (p<0.01), and univariate BIC analysis supports either a
211	two- or three-component model. The lower limits of this distribution are likely
212	dictated by the voxel size of the scans, and so it is possible that the smallest size
213	fractions are omitted.

214

## 215 Discussion

216

217 The Guaicurus Formation assemblage is dated at  $<541.85 \pm 0.77$  Ma, and is broadly contemporaneous with the Ediacaran–Cambrian boundary<sup>32</sup>. The Tamengo Formation 218 ichnofossils lie stratigraphically below our dated horizon of  $542.37 \pm 0.32$  Ma, and 219 are thus between 542 and 555 Ma in age (late Ediacaran). The presence of different 220 221 size classes within the Corumbá Group data indicates different populations, further supporting a biological, rather than abiological, mode of formation (see 222 223 supplementary information). As the structures are preserved as discrete, rounded 224 authigenically mineralised tubes they cannot be shrinkage features such as synaeresis 225 cracks.

A body fossil explanation for these structures is considered unlikely sinceauthigenically mineralized body fossils (e.g. algal filaments) would be expected to be

228 confined to discrete horizons in finely laminated sediments rather than crossing multiple horizons. Some Ediacaran body fossils, such as the simple conical 229 *Conotubus*, can grow through sedimentary laminae if felled<sup>34</sup>. In contrast, the 230 231 branching ichnofossils of the Guaicurus Formation are  $\sim 0.5$  mm wide and cross up to 232  $\sim$ 7 mm of stratigraphic thickness. The contemporaneous (Fig. 1) vendotaenid alga 233 Echolynia corumbensis is superficially similar in size and morphology to the ichnofossils described herein<sup>31</sup>. Two factors make algal origins for the fossils we 234 235 describe unlikely: mode of preservation, and morphology. First, in contrast to these 236 authigenically mineralised trace fossils, *Eoholynia* specimens in the Corumbá Group 237 are preserved as two-dimensional carbon films with some accessory oxides (possibly 238 after pyrite) (Supplementary Figure 5d-f). A comprehensive study of early Palaeozoic 239 non-biomineralized macroalgal taxa found that two dimensional compression (with 240 some accessory mineralisation) is the only taphonomic pathway through which macroalgae fossilize during this time interval<sup>35</sup>, consistent with the algal affinities of 241 242 Eoholynia and similar fossils. Although taphonomic mode should not be conflated 243 with affinity, the absence of three dimensionally pyritized algae from similar 244 localities of the same age renders an algal affinity for the proposed ichnofossils 245 unlikely. Secondly, Eoholynia have straight branches (rather than 246 undulating/sinusoidal) that taper after regular (dichotomous to polychotomous) 247 branching from a distinct main branch and have rounded terminal structures 248 interpreted as sporangia<sup>31</sup>. Polychotomous branching, tapering and rounded termini 249 are not present in the ichnofossils.

Iron oxides form a patina on the outer margin of some larger endichnial
burrows, possibly reflecting pyritization of a mucous burrow lining<sup>36</sup> (Fig. 2e).

252 Three-dimensional preservation as authigenic pyrite and calcite suggests that the 253 burrows were open prior to burial and compaction, and were not backfilled by the 254 trace-maker. Preservation in almost undistorted full relief is uncommon in mudstones 255 in the absence of burrow fill, except where significant early diagenesis and dewatering occurs before burial<sup>36</sup>. Similar sized burrows of modern nematodes 256 possess a polysaccharide-rich mucous burrow lining<sup>37</sup>, which would provide a locus 257 for the microbial reduction of sulphate from seawater within the burrows, causing 258 pyrite precipitation and consequently burrow preservation<sup>38</sup>: a mechanism we 259 260 consider to have been responsible for preservation of the Corumbá Group structures.

261 The poorly organized, vertically stacked, network-like galleries connected by 262 short oblique shafts are typical of the ichnogenus Multina. A combination of size range and irregularly sinuous gallery morphology allows attribution to M. minim $a^{39}$ . 263 264 The small burrow diameter, originally circular cross-sections, and lack of dorso-265 ventral differentiation characteristic of the Corumbá Group Multina are consistent 266 with a narrow-bodied vermiform trace maker. It is unclear how many infaunalization 267 events are represented by the assemblages reconstructed in three dimensions (e.g. Fig. 268 5e), but the presence of continuous oblique shafts between levels suggests that the 269 burrows remained open throughout the life of the tracemaker.

Animal burrowing is typically achieved either by: 1) peristalsis (e.g. in annelids like the Arenicolidae); 2) through the extension and retraction of an introvert (e.g. loriciferans, kinorynchs, sipunculans); or 3) by a combination of the two (e.g. priapulids)<sup>60</sup>. These mechanisms compact sediment laterally at the burrow margins<sup>40</sup>, but such compaction is absent in the Guaicurus traces (Fig. 2e–g). Compression burrowing is similar, and involves the tracemaker forcing its way through the 276 sediment, compacting it at the margins<sup>41</sup>. Trochozoan taxa such as annelids, molluscs 277 and nemerteans can be excluded as potential trace-makers because the minimum 278 diameter *M. minima* resolved in the Guaicurus Formation is ~45 $\mu$ m; significantly 279 smaller than recently hatched trochophore larvae, which are approximately 100 $\mu$ m in 280 diameter and pelagic, not endobenthic<sup>42</sup>. Annelids can be further excluded as potential 281 trace-makers since the smallest annelid eggs (50–70 $\mu$ m diameter<sup>42</sup>) exceed the 282 diameter of the smallest traces.

283 Early spiralians may have been small bodied, with taxa such as gastrotrichs and gnathiferans recovered as a paraphyletic grade in phylogenomic analyses<sup>24</sup>. Many 284 285 spiralian meiofaunal groups move using ciliary gliding, which is unlikely to have 286 formed continuous open burrows or achieved the sediment movement responsible for interstratal burrowing. Mucociliary gliding by extant platyhelminths<sup>43</sup> creates traces 287 288 similar in gross morphology to horizontal Ediacaran trails, and so members of the 289 total groups of Bilateria, Xenacoelomorpha and Nephrozoa are candidate trace makers 290 for late Ediacaran surficial traces. Ciliary gliding has probably been independently 291 lost multiple times within Nephrozoa (e.g. Ecdysozoa, which lack external ciliation). 292 Ciliary gliding is retained in some macroscopic spiralians, including Nemertea, 293 Platyhelminthes and molluscan classes in which the foot is used in locomotion, such 294 as gastropods. Nevertheless, ciliary gliding was the likely locomotory mechanism for 295 the last common ancestor of both Bilateria and Nephrozoa. Ciliary gliding is unlikely 296 to produce open burrows in fine-grained sediments and in the meiofauna it is most 297 commonly utilised by organisms that live in interstitial spaces between sand grains.

Free-living nematodes use undulating motions to move through fine-grained soft sediments, the low viscosity of which limits them to small body size<sup>44</sup>. Organisms

without body appendages possessing only longitudinal muscles, such as nematodes<sup>45</sup>, 300 are restricted to sinusoidal locomotion since they lack the antagonistic circular 301 302 muscles necessary for peristalsis. Nematodes are common bioturbators of modern 303 muddy sediments, and can create open mucus-lined burrows of a size range 304 comparable to that of the Brazilian M. minima (Fig. 5g). Similar but slightly larger M. 305 *minima*, potentially attributable to marine nematodes, have been described from the Cambrian and Ordovician<sup>46,47</sup>, but do not preserve the tiered networks of *M. minima* 306 307 we report. Burrow morphologies produced by extant or extinct nematomorphs are 308 unknown.

309 The size and morphology of the meiobenthic Multina is consistent with a 310 nematoid-like tracemaker that lacked body appendages and did not move by 311 peristalsis or ciliary gliding. As the ancestral bilaterian and nephrozoan moved using 312 ciliary gliding, this burrowing style suggests a trace maker that phylogenetically 313 postdates the nephrozoan crown node. These burrows may potentially provide an age 314 constraint for total group Nematoida (i.e. nematodes plus nematomorphs). This is 315 consistent with Early Cambrian body fossils, which include representatives of most Ecdysozoan phyla, along with meiofaunal groups<sup>28</sup>. Total group nematoids are 316 317 therefore likely to have diverged from their closest living relatives by at least 520 Ma, regardless of their controversial position within Ecdysozoa<sup>48</sup>. An alternative 318 319 interpretation is that these trace fossils were produced by a stem group ecdysozoan 320 that phylogenetically predates the evolution of an introvert but had already evolved a 321 chitinous cuticle and thus was unable to use ciliary gliding. A similar body plan is 322 present in larval insects, which produce freshwater and terrestrial Cochlichnus burrows and move in a similar fashion to nematodes $^{10}$ . 323

#### 325 *The Proterozoic–Phanerozoic biological radiation and the origin of the meiofauna*

326

327 The Corumbá Group trace fossils place an important latest Ediacaran (541–555 Ma) 328 minimum constraint on the origin of meiofaunal animals and their interactions with 329 soft substrates. Meiofauna are ubiquitous in both modern marine and freshwater environments, and their origin in deep time has been often discussed<sup>21,22</sup> but little 330 331 explored from an evidential palaeontological perspective. Extant meioendobenthic 332 organisms are particularly important contributors to biogeochemical cycling, microbial ecology, and ecosystem productivity, especially in muddy sediments<sup>27,37</sup>. 333 334 Multiple studies discuss the trace fossil record of macrofaunal behaviour from the late 335 Ediacaran onwards, its postulated impacts upon sediment geochemistry and benthic ecology, and its role in ecosystem engineering and ecological escalation<sup>1,2,8</sup>. 336 337 Constraining the deep time origins of a meiofaunal mode of life may be equally 338 important for understanding the biological and chemical evolution of marine 339 sedimentary environments. It is unlikely that the meiofaunal burrowing described here 340 had a substantial impact on substrate mixing, due to its small depth of penetration 341 leaving sedimentary laminae largely undisturbed (Fig. 4e).

Our geochronological framework places temporal constraints on the first appearance of several biological and ecological innovations in the South American fossil record, and permits correlation of these events to other dated sections worldwide (Fig. 6). Biomineralizing macro-organisms (*Cloudina*), annulated tubular macrofossils (*Corumbella*) and meiofaunal burrowers all appear in the Corumbá sections after 555 Ma, but before 542 Ma. The temporal range for the macrofossils corresponds well to similar latest Ediacaran fossil assemblages, some of which record evidence for predation<sup>49</sup>, a decline in Ediacaran soft-bodied macro-organisms<sup>50</sup>, and the appearance of macroscopic burrows<sup>10,17</sup> in the interval immediately preceding the Ediacaran-Cambrian boundary. Taken together, these records bear witness to several major biological innovations amongst eumetazoans, indicating that this key interval may offer significant scope for unravelling the intricacies surrounding the early stages of bilaterian evolution.

355

## **356 FIGURE CAPTIONS**

357

358 Figure 1. Stratigraphic column and locality map of the Ediacaran–early Cambrian 359 Corumbá Group: composite section compiled from logs in the Corumbá – Ladário 360 region, Mato Grosso do Sul State, Brazil. Dates are derived from this study. White 361 stars indicate localities from which samples for geochronology were obtained. Black 362 stars indicate ichnofossil localities described in this study: Laginha Mine (Guaicurus Formation) S: 19° 07' 09.8", W: 057° 38' 40.4". Ladário (Tamengo Formation) S: 363 19° 0' 04.0" W: 57° 36' 00.7". Carbon isotope stratigraphy comes from the Laginha 364 365 Mine section<sup>51</sup>.

366

Figure 2. Hand specimens and SEM photomicrographs of *Multina minima* and *Didymaulichnus lyelli* traces from the Guaicurus Formation, Laginha Mine, Mato
Grosso do Sul State, Brazil. (a) Hand specimen of small *Multina minima*, OUMNH
ÁU.4c. (b) Bedding plane view of *Multina minima* (inset of (a)). (c–d) Bedding plane
view of bilobed *Didymaulichnus lyelli* (part and counterpart, OUMNH ÁU.2). (e–h)

372 SEM photomicrographs of bedding-normal polished thin sections of samples
373 containing *Multina minima*. Framboidal iron oxide (originally pyrite) burrows fills are
374 clearly observed. Burrows in (e-g) are viewed in cross section through the burrow
375 diameter. (h) A burrow in lateral view.

376

377

378 Figure 3. Photographs (a-d) and CT volume renders (e-g) of Multina minima 379 burrows from the Ediacaran Tamengo Formation, Ladário, Mato Grosso do Sul State, 380 Brazil. (a) Representative hand specimen of Tamengo Formation samples, specimen 381 GPIE 11048b. (b-d) Oxidized burrows with sub-horizontal trajectories, viewed in 382 plan view on a bedding surface, (b) GPIE-11048b, (c) GPIE-11004b, (d) GPIE-383 11005a. Note that these specimens have been heavily weathered. (e-g) Volume 384 renders of CT slice data through the burrows constructed using the programme 385 Drishti. The burrows show curved, sub-horizontal trajectories, and are mostly  $\leq 100$ 386 um in diameter.

387

388

**Figure 4.** CT slices and 3D reconstructions of a burrow assemblage in specimen OUMNH ÁU.3 from the early Cambrian/latest Ediacaran Guaicurus Formation. (**a**–**c**) Representative CT x-ray slices through the specimen in plan view, showing burrows in light grey against a dark grey rock matrix. (**d**) 3D render of the specimen produced using Blender, showing individual burrows in different colours. (**e**) The same CT data volume rendered in Drishti, with burrows in gold. (f) Drishti volume render normal to bedding, showing interstratal burrowing. 396

2	n	7
Э	Э	1

398	Figure 5. Specimen OUMNH ÁU.4/p1 from the Guaicurus Formation from which
399	burrow measurement data were obtained. (a) Hand specimen from the Laginha Mine
400	section, plan view. (b) Drishti volume render of 3D CT scan data, plan view. (c-d)
401	Individual CT slices in plan view, from which burrow measurements were obtained
402	via comparison of 3D volume-render to determine the maximum diameter of each
403	burrow. (e) The Drishti volume render in (b) in lateral view. (f) Individual burrow
404	morphologies extracted from the volume render in (b). (g) Histogram plotting burrow
405	width against frequency.
406	

407

Figure 6. Plot showing the temporal distribution of body and trace fossils from key Ediacaran and earliest Cambrian stratigraphic sections that are radio-isotopically constrained to a useful level of precision. Uncertainty in the temporal occurrence of a given fossil is constrained by dated ash layers that occur above or below the fossil type occurrence. The uncertainty in the placement of the first and last occurrence datum increases away from the dated levels. An asterisk (\*) indicates data from this study.

415

# 416 METHODS

417 U-Pb Geochronology

U-Pb dates were obtained by the chemical abrasion isotope dilution thermal ionisation
mass spectrometry (CA-ID-TIMS) method on selected single zircon grains (Table 1;

Supp. Info. Table 1), extracted from an aliquot of samples "Porto Morrinhos", "1.04" 420 421 and "1.08". Zircon grains were isolated from the rock samples using standard 422 magnetic and density separation techniques, and annealed in a muffle furnace at 423 900°C for 60 hours in quartz beakers. Zircon crystals from sample Porto Morrinhos 424 have aspect ratios varying from  $\sim 2$  to  $\sim 5$  and are typically 150 to 300  $\mu$ m in their 425 longest dimension, and often contained a medial melt inclusion typical of volcanic 426 zircon. Zircon form samples 1.04 were smaller with the long-dimension on the order 427 of 50 to 100  $\mu$ m with lower aspect ratios (~2) and doubly terminated. Zircon form 428 samples 1.08 had aspect ratios ranging from 2 to 4 and long-dimension on the order of 429 100 to 200  $\mu$ m w and were doubly terminated. No cathodoluminescence imaging was 430 undertaken due to the small size of the zircon, and that the presence of medial melt 431 inclusions and the general external morphologies were indicative of inherited cores 432 not being present. Zircon selected for analyses based on external morphology, were 433 transferred to 3 ml Teflon PFA beakers, washed in dilute HNO<sub>3</sub> and water, and loaded 434 into 300 µl Teflon PFA microcapsules. Fifteen microcapsules were placed in a large-435 capacity Parr vessel, and the crystals partially dissolved in 120 µl of 29 M HF for 12 436 hours at 180°C. The contents of each microcapsule were returned to 3 ml Teflon PFA 437 beakers, the HF removed and the residual grains immersed in 3.5 M HNO<sub>3</sub>, 438 ultrasonically cleaned for an hour, and fluxed on a hotplate at 80°C for an hour. The 439  $HNO_3$  was removed and the grains were rinsed twice in ultrapure  $H_2O$  before being 440 reloaded into the same 300 µl Teflon PFA microcapsules (rinsed and fluxed in 6 M 441 HCl during crystal sonication and washing) and spiked with the EARTHTIME mixed <sup>233</sup>U-<sup>235</sup>U-<sup>205</sup>Pb tracer solution (ET535). These chemically abraded grains were 442 dissolved in Parr vessels in 120 µl of 29 M HF with a trace of 3.5 M HNO<sub>3</sub> at 220°C 443

for 60 hours, dried to fluorides, and then re-dissolved in 6 M HCl at 180°C overnight. 444 445 U and Pb were separated from the zircon matrix using an HCl-based anion exchange 446 chromatographic procedure, eluted together and dried with 2  $\mu$ l of 0.05N H<sub>3</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>. Pb 447 and U were loaded on a single outgassed Re filament in 5 µl of a silica-gel/phosphoric acid mixture<sup>52</sup>, and U and Pb isotopic measurements made on a Thermo Triton multi-448 449 collector thermal ionisation mass spectrometer equipped with an ion-counting SEM 450 detector. Pb isotopes were measured by peak-jumping all isotopes on the SEM 451 detector for 100 to 150 cycles. Pb mass fractionation was externally corrected using a mass bias factor of 0.14  $\pm$  0.03%/u determined via measurements of  $^{202}$ Pb/ $^{205}$ Pb 452 453 (ET2535)-spiked samples analysed during the same experimental period. Transitory isobaric interferences due to high-molecular weight organics, particularly on <sup>204</sup>Pb, 454 455 disappeared within approximately 30 cycles or earlier, and ionisation efficiency averaged  $10^4$  cps/pg of each Pb isotope. Linearity (to  $\ge 1.4 \times 10^6$  cps) and the 456 457 associated deadtime correction of the SEM detector were monitored by repeated 458 analyses of NBS982, and have been constant since installation in 2006. Uranium was analysed as  $UO_2$ + ions in static Faraday mode on  $10^{12}$  ohm resistors for 150 to 200 459 cycles, and corrected for isobaric interference of <sup>233</sup>U<sup>18</sup>O<sup>16</sup>O on <sup>235</sup>U<sup>16</sup>O<sup>16</sup>O with an 460 <sup>18</sup>O/<sup>16</sup>O of 0.00206. Ionisation efficiency averaged 20 mV/ng of each U isotope. U 461 mass fractionation was corrected using the known <sup>233</sup>U/<sup>235</sup>U ratio of the ET2535 462 463 tracer solution.

We used the ET535 tracer solution<sup>53, 54</sup> and U decay constants recommended by Jaffey et al.<sup>55</sup>. A value of 137.818  $\pm$  0.045 was used for the <sup>238</sup>U/<sup>235</sup>U<sub>zircon</sub> based upon the work of <sup>56</sup>. <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>238</sup>U ratios and dates were corrected for initial <sup>230</sup>Th disequilibrium using a Th/U[magma] = 3  $\pm$ 1 resulting in an increase in the <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>238</sup>U dates of ~0.09 Myr. All common Pb in analyses was attributed to laboratory blank
and subtracted based on the measured laboratory Pb isotopic composition and
associated uncertainty. U blanks were estimated at 0.1 pg, based upon replicate total
procedural blanks.

472 In this manuscript the date uncertainties reporting is as X/Y/Z and reflect the 473 following sources: (X) analytical, (Y) analytical + tracer solution and (Z) analytical + 474 tracer solution + decay constants. The X uncertainty is the internal error based on 475 analytical uncertainties only, including counting statistics, subtraction of tracer 476 solution, and blank and initial common Pb subtraction. It is given at the  $2\sigma$  confidence interval. This error should be considered when comparing our dates with <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>238</sup>U 477 478 dates from other laboratories that used the same EARTHTIME tracer solution or a 479 tracer solution that was cross-calibrated using related gravimetric reference materials. 480 The Y uncertainty includes uncertainty in the tracer calibration and should be used 481 when comparing our dates with those derived from laboratories that did not use the 482 same EARTHTIME tracer solution or a tracer solution that was cross-calibrated using 483 relatable gravimetric reference material. The Z uncertainty includes the above in addition to uncertainty in the <sup>238</sup>U decay constant<sup>55</sup>. This uncertainty level should be 484 485 used when comparing our dates with those derived from other decay schemes (e.g. <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar, <sup>187</sup>Re-<sup>187</sup>Os). 486

487

488 *CT* 

Four individual hand specimens were scanned using Nikon XTH-225 μCT scanners at
the Natural History Museum (London), and the Life Sciences Building, University of
Bristol. X-rays were generated using a tungsten target. Scan parameters are provided

492 in the supplementary information.

Following µCT scanning, the data were imported into the programme Drishti<sup>90</sup> 493 494 We used this programme to both volume render the data following the methods in Hickman-Lewis et al.<sup>57</sup>, and to reslice the volumes to create a TIFF stack of images 495 496 approximately parallel to bedding. The data were also segmented using the SPIERS software suite<sup>58</sup> following the methods of Garwood et al.<sup>59</sup>, exported as STL meshes, 497 and then imported into the open source raytracer Blender<sup>60</sup>. In Blender, the mesh of 498 499 the surface was rendered partially transparent, and the mesh encompassing all 500 burrows was split into its component islands, allowing them to be coloured separately.

501

#### 502 Burrow Measurements

No statistical methods were used to predetermine sample size. Burrow measurements 503 were obtained using ImageJ<sup>61</sup>. Measurements of burrow diameter were taken from 504 505 individual slices from specimen OUMNH AU.3, in order to characterize the size 506 frequency distribution of the trace fossils (Fig. 5g). Burrows were measured from 507 approximately bedding-parallel  $\mu$ CT slices at maximum burrow width. This was 508 preferred over systematically measuring burrows from a sample of slices, as such a 509 method would not necessarily sample burrows at their maximum diameter, and 510 consequently would skew the size frequency distribution towards a smaller mean 511 diameter. The smallest burrows observed in  $\mu$ CT slices are approximately 2 pixels 512 (~40µm) in diameter, and are thus at the limit of scan resolution. A Shapiro-Wilks test and BIC analysis (using the R package mclust<sup>62</sup>) were used to determine population 513 structure in the measurement data<sup>63</sup>. 514

515

21

#### 516

## 517 DATA AVAILIBILITY

518

U-Pb isotopic data used in this study is available in the supplementary information.
CT data is stored on servers at the University of Bristol and will be made publically
available upon acceptance and publication of this manuscript. All specimens analysed
are held at the University of Sao Paulo and Oxford University Museum of Natural
History.

524

525

## 526 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

527 We acknowledge the support and guidance of our co-author Martin Brasier in the 528 early stages of this work, and particularly his invitation for LP to undertake fieldwork 529 in Brazil in 2012. Field costs for LP were supported by an undergraduate travel grant 530 from St. Anne's College, University of Oxford. Fieldwork costs for MDB were 531 supported by CNPq-Conselho Nacional Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico-532 Brazil (Proc. 451245/2012-1). This project was supported by a NERC Isotope 533 Geosciences Facilities Steering Committee grant (project IP-1560-0515). JML, PCB, 534 RT, GACC, CQCD and MLAFP were supported by grant numbers 2009/02312-4, 535 2010/02677-0, 2013/17835-8 and 2016-06114-6, São Paulo Research Foundation 536 (FAPESP), Brazil. AGL and LP are supported by the Natural Environment Research 537 Council [grant numbers NE/L011409/2 and NE/L501554/1 respectively]. RG is a 538 Scientific Associate at the Natural History Museum, London, and a member of the 539 Interdisciplinary Centre for Ancient Life (UMRI). DMc recognises the support of an

540 NSERC discovery grant. We are grateful to Mining Engineer Leonardo A. dos Santos
541 Reis (Votorantim Cimentos) for facilitating access to the Laginha Mine. We thank
542 Lidya Tarhan and Simon Darroch for constructive reviews.

543

544

## 545 AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

546 LP found and initially identified the *Multina* specimens in the Guaicurus Formation.

547 PCB, AGL, CQCD and JML found the *Multina* specimens in Tamengo Formation.

548 All authors collaborated in order to develop this research project. AGL and DC

secured funding for geochronological dating. LP, DC and RG conducted the analyses.

550 PCB, RT, JML, CQCD, MLAFP and GACC measured the stratigraphic section and

collected samples for dating. LP, DM, DC and AGL developed the manuscript, and

all the authors were involved in data interpretation and the final redrafting of the

553 manuscript.

554

# 555 COMPETING INTERESTS

556 The authors declare no competing financial interests.

557

#### 558 **References**

559

560

- McIlroy D, Logan GA. The Impact of Bioturbation on Infaunal Ecology and
   Evolution During the Proterozoic-Cambrian Transition. *Palaios* 14, 58-72
   (1999).
- Mángano MG, Buatois LA. Decoupling of body-plan diversification and
   ecological structuring during the Ediacaran–Cambrian transition: evolutionary
   and geobiological feedbacks. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 281, (2014).

569		
570	3.	Cunningham JA, Liu AG, Bengtson S, Donoghue PC. The origin of animals: Can
571		molecular clocks and the fossil record be reconciled? Bioessays <b>39</b> , 1-12
572		(2017).
573		
574	4.	Van Iten H, et al. Origin and early diversification of Phylum Cnidaria: key
575		macrofossils from the Ediacaran System of North and South America. In: The
576		<i>Cnidaria, past, present and future</i> (ed^(eds Goffredo S, Dubinsky Z) (2016).
577		······································
578	5.	Penny AM. Wood R. Curtis A. Bowyer F. Tostevin R. Hoffman KH. Farly
579		animals. Ediacaran metazoan reefs from the Nama Group. Namibia. Science
580		<b>344</b> 1504-1506 (2014)
581		<b>344</b> , 1304 1300 (2014).
582	6	Bengtson S. Zhao V. Predatorial Borings in Late Precambrian Mineralized
582	0.	Evokaletons, Science <b>257</b> , 367-369 (1992)
584		LX03Keletolis. Science 237, 507-505 (1552).
585	7	Vinther L Parry L Briggs DEG Van Boy P. Ancestral morphology of molluses
505	7.	rovealed by a new Ordevician stem aculiferan. Nature (2017)
500		revealed by a new Ordovician stern acumeran. <i>Nature</i> , (2017).
507	0	Tarban I.C. Drocar ML. Dianauchy NL. Jahnston DT. Drotracted douglanment of
200	0.	histurbation through the early Palaeszais Fra. Nature Conscience. (2015)
509		bioturbation through the early Palaeozoic Era. Nature Geoscience, (2015).
590	0	Vanniar I. Calandra I. Caillard C. Żulińska A. Brianulid warme, Dianaar
291	9.	Valinier J, Calanura I, Galilaru C, Zylliska A. Priapullu Wornis. Pioneer
592		711 714 (2010)
595		/11-/14 (2010).
594	10	Dustais I.A. Méngana MC. Johnslamy Organism substrate interactions in
595	10.	Bualois LA, Mangano MG. Ichnology: Organism-substrate interactions in
596		space and time. Cambridge University Press (2011).
597	4.4	James C. The Distance is and endiest Couchright three faceil records wetter
598	11.	Jensen S. The Proterozoic and earliest Camprian trace fossil record; patterns,
599		problems and perspectives. Integrated Comparitive Biology <b>43</b> , 219-228
600		(2003).
601	10	
602	12.	Genling JG, Runnegar BN, Droser ML. Scratch Traces of Large Ediacara
603		Bilaterian Animals. <i>Journal of Paleontology</i> <b>88</b> , 284-298 (2014).
604		
605	13.	Menon LR, McIlroy D, Brasier MD. Evidence for Cnidaria-like behavior in ca.
606		560 Ma Ediacaran Aspidella. Geology, (2013).
607		
608	14.	Jensen S, Saylor BZ, Gehling JG, Germs GJ. Complex trace fossils from the
609		terminal Proterozoic of Namibia. <i>Geology</i> <b>28</b> , 143-146 (2000).
610		
611	15.	Chen Z, et al. Trace fossil evidence for Ediacaran bilaterian animals with
612		complex behaviours. Precambrian Research 224, 690-701 (2013).
613		

614 615 616	16.	Liu AG, McIlroy D, Brasier MD. First evidence for locomotion in the Ediacara biota from the 565Ma Mistaken Point Formation, Newfoundland. <i>Geology</i> <b>38</b> , 123-126 (2010).
617		
618	17.	Rogov V, et al. The oldest evidence of bioturbation on Earth. Geology 40,
619		395-398 (2012).
620		
621	18.	dos Reis M, Thawornwattana Y, Angelis K, Telford Maximilian J, Donoghue
622		Philip CJ, Yang Z. Uncertainty in the Timing of Origin of Animals and the Limits
623		of Precision in Molecular Timescales. <i>Current Biology</i> <b>25</b> , 2939-2950 (2015).
624		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
625	19.	Yin Z, Zhu M, Davidson EH, Bottjer DJ, Zhao F, Tafforeau P. Sponge grade
626		body fossil with cellular resolution dating 60 Myr before the Cambrian.
627		Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences <b>112</b> , E1453-E1460 (2015).
628	•	
629	20.	Love GD, Summons RE. The molecular record of Cryogenian sponges-a
630		response to Antcliffe (2013). Palaeontology, (2015).
631	24	
632	21.	Fortey RA, Briggs DEG, Wills MA. The Cambrian evolutionary "explosion"
633		recalibrated. <i>BioEssays</i> <b>19</b> , 429-434 (1997).
634	22	Dudd CE Janson C. A gritical resonancial of the fassil record of the hildtonian
635	22.	Budd GE, Jensen S. A critical reappraisal of the fossil record of the bilaterian
627		priyla. <i>Biological Reviews</i> <b>75</b> , 253-295 (2000).
638	23	Cannon IT Vellutini BC Smith I Ronquist E Jondelius II Heinol A
639	25.	Xenacoelomornha is the sister group to Nenhrozoa Nature <b>530</b> 89-93
640		(2016)
641		
642	24.	Laumer CE. et al. Spiralian phylogeny informs the evolution of microscopic
643		lineages. Current Biology 25, 2000-2006 (2015).
644		
645	25.	Giere O. Meiobenthology: the microscopic motile fauna of aquatic sediments.
646		Springer Science & Business Media (2008).
647		
648	26.	Löhr S, Kennedy M. Micro-trace fossils reveal pervasive reworking of Pliocene
649		sapropels by low-oxygen-adapted benthic meiofauna. Nature
650		communications <b>6</b> , (2015).
651		
652	27.	Cullen DJ. Bioturbation of superficial marine sediments by interstitial
653		meiobenthos. <i>Nature <b>242</b>,</i> 323-324 (1973).
654		
655	28.	Harvey THP, Butterfield NJ. Exceptionally preserved Cambrian loriciferans and
656		the early animal invasion of the meiobenthos. <i>Nature Ecology &amp; Evolution</i> 1,
657		0022 (2017).
658		

659 660 661	29.	Han J, Morris SC, Ou Q, Shu D, Huang H. Meiofaunal deuterostomes from the basal Cambrian of Shaanxi (China). <i>Nature</i> <b>542</b> , 228-231 (2017).
662 663 664 665 666	30.	de Alvarenga CJS, <i>et al.</i> The Amazonian Palaeocontinent. In: <i>Neoproterozoic-Cambrian tectonics, global change and evolution: a focus on southwestern Gondwana</i> (ed^(eds Gaucher C, Sial AN, Halverson GP, Frimmel HE). Elsevier (2009).
667 668 669 670 671	31.	Gaucher C, Boggiani PC, Sprechmann P, Sial AN, Fairchild TR. Integrated correlation of the Vendian to Cambrian Arroyo del Soldado and Corumba Groups (Uruguay and Brazil): palaeogeographic, palaeoclimatic and palaeobiologic implications. <i>Precambrian Research</i> <b>120</b> , 241-278 (2003).
672 673 674 675 676	32.	Bowring SA, Grotzinger JP, Condon DJ, Ramezani J, Newall MJ, Allen PA. Geochronologic constraints on the chronostratigraphic framework of the Neoproterozoic Huqf Supergroup, Sultanate of Oman. <i>American Journal of</i> <i>Science</i> <b>307</b> , 1097-1145 (2007).
677 678 679 680	33.	Fillion D, Pickerill RK. Ichnology of the Cambrian? to Lower Ordovician Bell Island and Wabana groups of eastern Newfoundland, Canada. <i>Palaeontographica Canadians</i> <b>7</b> , 119 (1990).
681 682 683 684	34.	Cai Y, Hua H, Xiao S, Schiffbauer JD, Li P. Biostratinomy of the late Ediacaran pyritized Gaojiashan Lagerstätte from southern Shaanxi, South China: importance of event deposits. <i>Palaios</i> <b>25</b> , 487-506 (2010).
685 686 687 688	35.	LoDuca S, Bykova N, Wu M, Xiao S, Zhao Y. Seaweed morphology and ecology during the great animal diversification events of the early Paleozoic: A tale of two floras. <i>Geobiology</i> .
689 690 691 692 693	36.	Virtasalo JJ, Löwemark L, Papunen H, Kotilainen AT, Whitehouse MJ. Pyritic and baritic burrows and microbial filaments in postglacial lacustrine clays in the northern Baltic Sea. <i>Journal of the Geological Society</i> <b>167</b> , 1185-1198 (2010).
694 695 696 697	37.	Schratzberger M, Ingels J. Meiofauna matters: The roles of meiofauna in benthic ecosystems. <i>Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology</i> , (2017).
698 699 700	38.	Schieber J. The role of an organic slime matrix in the formation of pyritized burrow trails and pyrite concretions. <i>Palaios</i> <b>17</b> , 104-109 (2002).
701 702 703	39.	Uchman A. Eocene flysch trace fossils from the Hecho Group of the Pyrenees, northern Spain. <i>Beringeria</i> <b>28</b> , 3-41 (2001).

704 705 706	40.	Powilleit M, Kitlar J, Graf G. Particle and fluid bioturbation caused by the priapulid worm Halicryptus spinulosus (v. Seibold). <i>Sarsia</i> <b>79</b> , 109-117 (1994).
708 707 708	41.	Bromley RG. <i>Trace Fossils: Biology, Taxonomy and Applications</i> . Routledge (2012).
709 710 711 712	42.	Anderson DT. Embryology and Phylogeny in Annelids and Arthropods: International Series of Monographs in Pure and Applied Biology Zoology. Elsevier (2013).
713 714 715 716 717	43.	Collins AG, Lipps JH, Valentine JW. Modern mucociliary creeping trails and the bodyplans of Neoproterozoic trace-makers. <i>Paleobiology</i> <b>26</b> , 47-55 (2000).
718 719	44.	Seilacher A. Trace fossil analysis. Springer (2007).
720 721 722 723 724	45.	Beron C, Vidal-Gadea A, Cohn J, Parikh A, Hwang G, Pierce-Shimomura J. The burrowing behavior of the nematode Caenorhabditis elegans: a new assay for the study of neuromuscular disorders. <i>Genes, Brain and Behavior</i> <b>14</b> , 357-368 (2015).
725 726 727	46.	Baliński A, Sun Y, Dzik J. Traces of marine nematodes from 470 million years old Early Ordovician rocks in China. <i>Nematology</i> <b>15</b> , 567-574 (2013).
728 729 730	47.	McIlroy D, Brasier MD. Ichnological evidence for the Cambrian Explosion in the Ediacaran to Cambrian succession of Tanafjord, Finnmark, northern Norway. <i>Geological Society London Special Publications</i> <b>448</b> , 351-369 (2016).
732 733 734 735	48.	Borner J, Rehm P, Schill RO, Ebersberger I, Burmester T. A transcriptome approach to ecdysozoan phylogeny. <i>Molecular phylogenetics and evolution</i> <b>80</b> , 79-87 (2014).
736 737 738	49.	Hua H, Pratt BR, Zhang L-Y. Borings in Cloudina Shells: Complex Predator-Prey Dynamics in the Terminal Neoproterozoic. <i>PALAIOS</i> <b>18</b> , 454-459 (2003).
739 740 741 742	50.	Darroch SAF, <i>et al.</i> Biotic replacement and mass extinction of the Ediacara biota. <i>Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences</i> <b>282</b> , (2015).
743 744 745 746	51.	Boggiani PC, <i>et al.</i> Chemostratigraphy of the Tamengo Formation (Corumba Group, Brazil): A contribution to the calibration of the Ediacaran carbon- isotope curve. <i>Precambrian Research</i> <b>182</b> , 382-401 (2010).
740 747 748	52.	Gerstenberger H, Haase G. A highly effective emitter substance for mass spectrometric Pb isotope ratio determinations. <i>Chemical Geology</i> <b>136</b> , 309

749		(1997).
750		
751	53.	Condon DJ, Schoene B, McLean NM, Bowring SA, Parrish RR. Metrology and
752		traceability of U–Pb isotope dilution geochronology (EARTHTIME Tracer
753		Calibration Part I). Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 164, 464-480 (2015).
754		
755	54.	McLean N, Condon DJ, Schoene B, Bowring SA. Evaluating Uncertainties in
756		the Calibration of Isotopic Reference Materials and Multi-Element Isotopic
757		Tracers (EARTHTIME Tracer Calibration Part II). Geochimica et Cosmochimica
758		Acta, (2015).
759		
760	55.	Jaffey AH, Flynn KF, Glendenin LE, Bentley WC, Essling AM. Precision
761		measurement of half-lives and specific of <sup>235</sup> U and <sup>238</sup> U. <i>Physics Reviews</i> C4,
762		1889-1906 (1971).
763		
764	56.	Hiess J, Condon DJ, McLean N, Noble SR. <sup>238</sup> U/ <sup>235</sup> U Systematics in Terrestrial
765		Uranium-Bearing Minerals. Science <b>335</b> , 1610-1614 (2012).
766		
767	57.	Hickman-Lewis K, Garwood RJ, Withers PJ, Wacey D. X-ray microtomography
768		as a tool for investigating the petrological context of Precambrian cellular
769		remains. Geological Society, London, Special Publications 448, SP448. 411
770		(2016).
771		
772	58.	Sutton MD, Garwood RJ, Siveter DJ, Siveter DJ. SPIERS and VAXML; A
773		software toolkit for tomographic visualisation and a format for virtual
774		specimen interchange. Palaeontologia Electronica <b>15</b> , 1-14 (2012).
775		
776	59.	Garwood R, et al. Tomographic reconstruction of neopterous Carboniferous
777		insect nymphs. <i>PLOS one</i> <b>7</b> , e45779 (2012).
778		
779	60.	Garwood R, Dunlop J. The walking dead: Blender as a tool for paleontologists
780		with a case study on extinct arachnids. Journal of Paleontology 88, 735-746
781		(2014).
782		
783	61.	Schindelin J, Rueden CT, Hiner MC, Eliceiri KW. The ImageJ ecosystem: An
784		open platform for biomedical image analysis. <i>Molecular reproduction and</i>
785		development <b>82</b> , 518-529 (2015).
786		
787	62.	Fraley C, Raftery AE. MCLUST: Software for model-based cluster analysis.
788		Journal of classification <b>16</b> , 297-306 (1999).
789		
790	63.	Darroch SA, Laflamme M, Clapham ME. Population structure of the oldest
791		known macroscopic communities from Mistaken Point, Newfoundland.
792		Paleobiology <b>39</b> , 591-608 (2013).
793		

794 795 796 797	64.	Grotzinger JP, Bowring SA, Saylor BZ, Kaufman AJ. Biostratigraphic and geochronologic constraints on early animal evolution. <i>SCIENCE-NEW YORK THEN WASHINGTON-</i> , 598-598 (1995).
798 799 800	65.	Grazhdankin D. Patterns of distribution in the Ediacaran biotas: facies versus biogeography and evolution. <i>Paleobiology</i> <b>30</b> , 203-221 (2004).
801 802 803 804	66.	Martin MW, Grazhdankin DV, Bowring SA, Evans DAD, Fedonkin M, Kirschvink J. Age of Neoproterozoic bilatarian body and trace fossils, White Sea, Russia: Implications for metazoan evolution. <i>Science</i> <b>288</b> , 841-845 (2000).
805 806 807	67.	Condon DJ, Zhu M-Y, Bowring SA, Wang W, Yang A, Jin Y. U-Pb Ages from the Neoproterozoic Doushantuo Formation, China. <i>Science</i> <b>308</b> , 95-98 (2005).
808 809 810 811	68.	Yang C, Li XH, Zhu M, Condon D. SIMS U–Pb zircon geochronological constraints on upper Ediacaran stratigraphic correlations, South China. <i>Geological Magazine</i> , 1-15 (2016).
812 813 814	69.	Pu JP, <i>et al.</i> Dodging snowballs: Geochronology of the Gaskiers glaciation and the first appearance of the Ediacaran biota. <i>Geology</i> <b>44</b> , 955-958 (2016).
815 816 817 818 819	70.	Noble S, Condon D, Carney J, Wilby P, Pharaoh T, Ford T. Age and global context of the Ediacaran fossils of Charnwood Forest, Leicestershire, UK. <i>Geol Soc Am Bull</i> <b>127</b> , 250-265 (2015).
820		
821		
822		