1   # Climate change may drive cave spiders to extinction

2

3   Stefano Mammola [1,2], Sara L. Goodacre [3] and Marco Isaia [1,2]*

4
5   1. Department of Life Sciences and Systems Biology, University of Torino, Torino, Italy

6   2. IUCN SSC Spider & Scorpion Specialist Group, Torino, Italy

7   3. School of Biology, University of Nottingham, Nottingham, UK

8

9   * Corresponding author: marco.isaia@unito.it (**Tel:** 011 6704544**; Fax:** 011 6704508)

10

13

14   **Running title:** Predicting cave spiders' extinction

15   --

16   **Authors contribution statement**

17   MI and SM conceived the study, collected and analyzed the data. SLG provided fundamental arguments for

18   the discussion. All authors contributed to the writing of the manuscript.

19

Abstract

Subterranean ecosystems present ideal opportunities to study mechanisms underlying responses to changes in climate because species within them are often adapted to a largely constant temperature. We have characterized the thermal conditions of caves in the Western Alps, and relate these hypogean climate data to the occurrence of *Troglohyphantes* spiders (Araneae, Linyphiidae). Our data indicate that present distributions reflect Pleistocene glaciation events and also point to specific responses as a consequence of changes in temperature. Constant temperatures recorded inside caves provide an approximation of the mean annual temperature outside, thus we extend the results to a regional scale. We used ecological niche modeling to predict habitat suitability both in the Pleistocene and under future global warming scenarios. These analyses point toward a future decline in habitat suitability for subterranean spiders and the potential extinction of the most restricted endemic species. When compared with other species that live in confined habitats such as islands and mountains, we expect cave species to be as much, if not more, vulnerable to climate change*.*

Introduction

The potential impact of global climate change on a broad range of organisms occurring in different ecosystems and showing a very diverse pattern of distributions is well documented (Walther et al. 2002, Parmesan and Yohe 2003, Parmesan 2006, Walther 2010, Chen et al. 2011, Dawson et al. 2011, Bellard et al. 2012). However, the effects on biological communities in hypogean ecosystems have not been well explored (but see Brandmayr et al. 2013, Wynne et al. 2014, Sánchez-Fernández et al. 2016).

From an ecological standpoint, hypogean ecosystems are considered extreme, lacking solar radiation, receiving poor energy inputs, and through being characterized by low abundance and diversity of organisms (Poulson and White 1969, Culver and Pipan 2009, Romero 2009). Most caves have almost constant temperature over the year, with an annual variability decreasing progressively with increasing distance from the entrance until a remarkable temperature steadiness is reached (Moore and Sullivan 1964, Smithson 1991), usually varying by only a few tenths of a degree over the year (Badino 2010).

According to direct field observations (Fejér and Moldovan 2013, Domìnguez-Villar et al. 2015) and theoretical models (Badino 2004, Covington and Perne 2015), anthropogenic global warming may significantly influence and modify the underground climate in different ways to that which happens outside. The most important difference refers to the thermal inertia of caves, which explains time lags of up to several decades in the warming of the system (Badino 2004). This increased flux of energy from the atmosphere to the subterranean environment is expected to be deposited primarily in the superficial sections of caves (Badino 2004) and in other superficial subterranean habitats (Mammola et al. 2016). Energy fluxes accumulating underground may have dramatic cascade effects on both physical and biological components of hypogean ecosystems. By affecting air density gradients, for instance, small changes in cave temperature modify air circulation, with potential fallouts on speleothem growth, seasonal ventilation rates, and processes of condensation and corrosion (Domìnguez-Villar et al. 2015).

Given the reduced physiological tolerance to temperature fluctuations in subterranean species (e.g. Bernabò et al. 2011, Mermillod-Blondin et al. 2013, Novak et al. 2014, Rizzo et al. 2015) as well as their low dispersal capacity (Sánchez-Fernández et al. 2016), ongoing human-driven climatic shifts are also expected to affect subterranean biocoenosis and ecosystems (Wynne et al. 2014). From a conservation perspective, the ecological and biogeographical peculiarity of the subterranean fauna enhances the risk of local extinction (Cardoso 2011a, b, 2012) and strengthens the importance of considering subterranean organisms as model species for ecological studies dealing with climatic changes (Chevaldonné and Lejeune 2003, Wynne et al.

63   2014, Mammola et al. 2015b).

64   We investigated the response of hypogean specialized spiders to increases in temperature in the Western

65   sector of the Alps. Among the range of subterranean taxa occurring in the Western Alps, we chose the cave-

66   dwelling spiders *Troglohyphantes* (Araneae, Linyphiidae) as model organisms. The reliability of this model

67   comes from empirical observations pointing out their preference for narrow, stable and cool microclimatic

68   conditions (Deeleman-Reinhold 1978, Isaia and Pantini 2010, Isaia et al. 2011, 2016, Mammola and Isaia

69   2016). Accordingly, *Troglohyphantes* spiders are characterized by moderate to high levels of

70   *troglobiomorphy* (*sensu* Juberthie and Decu 1994) and show restricted or point-like ranges of distribution

71   (e.g. Brignoli 1971, Deeleman-Reinhold 1978, Isaia and Pantini 2010, Isaia et al. 2011). On top of that,

72   populations of *Troglohyphantes* are usually extremely structured from a genetic point of view, lacking shared

73   haplotypes between caves and showing highly reduced dispersal ability (Mammola et al. 2015a).

74   We modelled presence/absence of *Troglohyphantes* spiders in relation to cave microclimate, past glacial

75   dynamics and other cave features in order to assess their sensitivity to potential subterranean climatic

76   variation induced by climate change.

77   Because constant temperatures recorded inside caves provide an approximation of the mean annual

78   temperature outside (Moore and Sullivan 1964, Smithson 1991, Badino 2004, 2010), in a second step we

79   extend the results to a bigger dataset. We used Ecological Niche Modeling (ENM) to extend to a wider scale

80   the response of our model organism to climatic changes, estimating the impact in terms of loss of habitat

81   suitability. In particular, we hypothesized i) a significant relationship between the occurrence of

82   *Troglohyphantes* spiders and different climatic conditions as a function of their adaptation to narrow and

83   specific ranges of temperature; and ii) that climate affected the distribution of our model species in the past

84   and will affect it in the future, through a decline in habitat suitability.

85

Materials and methods

Study area

We studied caves in the administrative regions of Piemonte and Valle d'Aosta (Western Alps, Italy), a coherent biogeographic area of the Alps in which the distribution of *Troglohyphantes* spiders has been well documented (e.g. Isaia and Pantini 2010, Isaia et al. 2011, 2016). We used a regional scale for analyses instead of smaller or larger scales, as the former has been shown to be appropriate for species-level responses to global warming (Walther et al. 2002). The Western Alps contain more than 2,500 caves developed in carbonate and non-carbonate substrates (AGSP, 2016), plus a variety of artificial hypogean habitats such as bunkers and abandoned mines.

We selected 33 hypogean localities over a north-south range in the Western Alps (Fig. 1), from the Tanaro Valley (South; Province of Cuneo) to the Strona Valley (North; Province of Verbania). These included karst and tectonic caves as well as artificial subterranean sites, with an altitudinal range of 415–2,357 m a.s.l, a planimetric development range of 7– 3,440 m and an ascending/descending structure (i.e. drop) range from −143 to +184 m. We deliberately choose localities with an established, recently and well-documented spider fauna (see Isaia et al. 2011). A description of each site is provided in Supplementary Material Appendix 1.

Sampling design

Temperature (T) was monitored from 2012 to 2014 using Hygrochron^{TM} devices (accuracy: ±0.5 °C) placed inside the cave (T_{int}) and at cave entrances (T_{ext}). Measurements were taken every 3 hours and the devices were replaced after 12 months to allow download of data part way through the study.

The presence of *Troglohyphantes* at each site was verified during all surveys. The final presence/absence dataset was verified and integrated with available literature data (Isaia and Pantini 2010, Isaia et al. 2011, 2016), wherever possible.

Fine-scale modeling

Data from the Hygrochron^{TM} devices were used to generate values of mean annual temperature, daily and annual range at the cave entrance (T_{ext}) and at the deeper zone (T_{int}). Sites were sorted according to previous glacial history (ICE), as identified through an in-field geological survey by Motta (2014) or by using paleo-glacial reconstruction for sites not included in the Motta study (Ehlers et al. 2011)—see Supplementary

115 Material Appendix 1. The relationship between temperature variables was explored using linear regression

116 models—*lm* command in the "stats" R package (R Development Team 2015). Presence/absence of spiders

117 was modelled as a function of temperature and the glacial history (ICE) via generalized linear models (*glm*

118 command in the "stats" R package) assuming a Bernoulli error structure (0–1 discrete). Prior to model fitting,

119 we tested for multi-collinearity among covariates and excluded collinear variables (Zuur et al. 2010). We

120 tested for spatial autocorrelation among environmental variables and in species occurrence via Moran's I test

121 in the "ape" R package (Paradis et al. 2004), using the Gittleman and Kot (1990) method. After fitting the

122 initial model, we carried out model reduction by sequentially deleting terms—backward elimination—

123 according to AICc values (Hurvich and Tsai 1989). The process was repeated until a minimum adequate

124 model of fixed effects remained (Zuur et al. 2009).

125

126 **Wide scale modeling, past and future predictions**

127 Once the model had been fitted using the fine-scale dataset, we extended the detected trends to a wider

128 scale (regional) using ecological niche modeling. We modelled the current distribution of *Troglohyphantes* in

129 the study area, transferring the results into ancestral (Last Glacial Maximum; ~22,000 years ago; hereinafter

130 LGM) and future (2050 and 2070) climatic conditions in order to estimate variations in the distribution ranges

131 relative to past and future climate changes.

132

133 *Occurrence points*

134 Geo-referenced occurrence localities of *Troglohyphantes* spp. were taken from Isaia et al. (2011). This

135 dataset covers 361 caves and virtually all possible thermal ranges experienced by *Troglohyphantes* spiders

136 in the Western Alps. *T. lucifuga* and *T. lucifer*, which are not exclusively restricted to subterranean habitats

137 (Isaia and Pantini 2010, Isaia et al. 2016), were excluded from our analysis. Prior to model fitting, we

138 designated a sampling bias grid (Phillips et al. 2009, Syfert et al. 2013). Within each cell in the grid—which

139 had a width equal to the grain of the bioclimatic rasters—all the points apart from one were randomly

140 removed (see Newbold 2010). In this way, we minimised spatial autocorrelation, given that proximate

141 localities likely comprise similar environmental variables.

142

143 *Explanatory variables*

144 We represented present-day climate with 19 bioclimatic variables (1950–2000; Hijmans et al. 2005;

145 resolution: 30''; available at: www.worldclim.org; Table 1), and analogous data layers for past and future

146 climate. For both past and future climate, multiple GMCs were used to take into account variation and

147 uncertainty among simulations (Kageyama et al. 2001, Beaumont et al. 2008, Diniz-Filho et al. 2009). Paleo-

148 bioclimatic variables for the LGM were derived from simulations available from three General Circulation

149 Models (GCMs) from the Coupled Model Intercomparison Project Phase 5 (CMIP5; Taylor et al. 2012).

150 These were CCSM4, MIROC-ESM and MPI-ESM-P (resolution of 2.5'). Future data represent downscaled

151 and calibrated climate projections from three GCMs (CCSM4, BCC-CSM1-1, MIROC5) under two

152 Representative Concentration Pathway scenarios (rcp 2.6 and rcp 8.5 respectively) for both 2050 and 2070,

153 at a resolution of 30''. Ice cover during Pleistocene was derived from paleo-reconstruction, by converting the

154 shape of glacial masses provided by Ehlers et al. (2011) into a binary raster. This categorical variable was

155 further included in the models. Prior to model computing, we investigated multi-collinearity among covariates

156 via Pearson *r* correlation (Zuur et al. 2009, 2010), selecting a final set of uncorrelated bioclimatic variables

157 ($r < \pm 0.7$) (Table 1).

158

159 *Algorithm choice and projections*

160 A wide suite of algorithms exists in the realm of bioclimatic envelope modeling (Peterson et al. 2011).

161 Considering the conceptual ground of the "no free lunch" theorem (Ho and Pepyne 2002), Qiao et al. (2015)

162 recently suggested that no single best algorithm should be chosen *a priori* for modeling the ecological

163 niche/species distribution of a certain organism. We thus began the analysis of this particular dataset with an

164 assessment of performance of potential competing algorithms (see also Elith et al. 2006). In particular, we

165 tested the performance of three well-acknowledged statistical techniques, belonging to the three existing

166 categories of algorithms for computing ENM/SDM: regression [Generalized linear models (GLM); McCullagh

167 and Nelder 1989], regression trees [Boosted Regression Trees (BRT); Friedman, 2001] and machine-

168 learning [Maximum entropy model (MaxEnt); Philips et al. 2006]. Details of the modeling procedure and

169 settings for each technique are provided in Supplementary Material Appendix 2.

170 As is widely recommended in the literature (e.g. Peterson et al. 2011, Saupe et al. 2012, Merow et al. 2013),

171 models were calibrated within the accessible area—often referred to as area M (Barve et al. 2011; details in

172 Supplementary Material Appendix 2). **M** is the geographic extent hypothesized to fall within the long-term

173 dispersal and colonization potential for a particular species over its evolutionary history. Considering the

174 reduced dispersal potential of *Troglohyphantes* spiders, in our case area **M** was approximated by masking

175 the bioclimatic layers with a rectangle delimiting the Western alpine chain.

176 We computed the models using the three modelling techniques in order to relate the occurrence points to the

177 set of non-collinear variables. For each technique, we ran twenty replicate of models via a loop in R, keeping

178 a random partition of 20% of the points for each run to assess the predictive ability of each algorithm.

179 Predictive abilities of the three models were obtained by calculating two different metrics (average of the

180 twenty runs): the area under the Receiver Operating Characteristics (ROC) curve (AUC; Fielding and Bell

181 1997) and the True Skill Statistics (TSS; Allouche et al. 2006), whereby an AUC < 0.60 and/or a TSS < 0.1

182 denotes a predictive ability no better than random. We employed two metrics because it is not recommended

183 to rely on a single measure of model fit for comparing different techniques (Elith and Graham 2009).

184 We finally retained the modeling technique showing the best performance. A final model was generated

185 using the same parameters and calibrated with the complete occurrence dataset.

186 Subsequently, we transferred the model into each LGM and future GCMs, and we calculated the median

187 value across all projection for each combination of GCM. We estimated environmental suitability for each

188 projection by rescaling raster cell values above the threshold of 0.4 (see discussion in Liu et al. 2005)

189 between 0 and 1. Areas below a threshold value of 0.4 were set to 0.

190

191

192

193 # Results

194 **Fine-scale modelling**

195 As expected, we observed a strong linear relationship between mean annual T_{int} and mean annual T_{ext}

196 (Estimated β±se: 0.901±0.041, p<0.001), with only 3 out of 33 caves showing T_{int} values 1 °C higher (Grotta

197 di Bergovei and Fessura di Verrogne) or lower (Grotta Testa di Napoleone) than T_{ext} values (Supplementary

198 material Appendix 2, Fig. A1).

199 No variables considered in the GLM analysis were found to be spatially autocorrelated (Moran's I test, all

200 p>0.05) apart from the mean annual T_{int} range (p<0.01) which therefore was not considered further. Moran's I

201 test results are reported in the Supplementary Material Appendix 2, Table A1. Daily range of T_{int} was highly

202 collinear with past ice cover (ICE) and thus excluded from the analysis (Supplementary material Appendix 2,

203 Fig. A2). All variables related to T_{ext} (mean and range) were highly collinear with T_{int} (Pearson r>±0.7), and

204 thus not included in the model (Supplementary material Appendix 2, Table A2). Backward elimination

205 revealed that variables related to cave features—type of cave, total development, drop—were not influential

206 in determining the presence/absence of *Troglohyphantes* and these were therefore not considered in further

207 analytical steps. Accordingly, the structure of the minimum adequate model included mean annual T_{int} and

208 the past glacial cover (ICE) as covariates. Outcomes of the GLM pointed to a significant decrease in the

209 probability of occurrence of *Troglohyphantes* with increasing mean annual T_{int} values (Estimated β±se: -

210 0.543±0.249, p=0.02). We also found a significant negative effect of glacial history, namely a lower

211 probability of occurrence of the model organisms in caves covered by the ice during past glaciations (ICE,

212 test relative to the level "uncovered"; Estimated β±se: -2.584±1.052, p=0.01; Fig. 2).

213

214 **Model on the regional dataset, past and future predictions**

215 MaxEnt performed better than other algorithms tested in terms of predictive ability (MaxEnt: mean AUC±sd =

216 0.873±0.09; mean TSS±sd = 0.51±0.08; GLM: AUC±sd = 0.676±0.378; mean TSS±sd = 0.32±0.221; BRT:

217 AUC±sd = 0.78±0.02; TSS±sd = 0.43±0.12). We therefore retained the former technique for further analysis

218 and projections. Uncorrelated variables introduced in the final model are reported in Table 1. The final model

219 included mean annual temperature (Bio01), mean diurnal range (Bio02), and ice cover (ICE)—response

220 plots are reported in Supplementary Material Appendix 2, Fig. A3. Suitable areas predicted by the model for

221 the current climate (Fig. 3) roughly overlay the known distribution of *Troglohyphantes* in the study area, with

222 higher suitability predicted in the low-medium mountain belt, ranging from the districts of Maritime to Graian

223 Alps. The most suitable and unfragmented habitat is found at the southern border of the Alps. Based on the

224 model projections, the average probability of occurrence is 0.68 across all known populations of

225 *Troglohyphantes*.

226 With regard to LGM projections (Fig. 3), the district of Maritime Alps (South-western Alps) and the

227 surrounding plains appear to contain the most suitable areas of habitat. Areas covered by ice were predicted

228 to be largely unsuitable, with areas bordering the glacial masses possibly acting as microrefugia (*sensu* Rull

229 2009).

230 Future forecasts based on different emission scenarios indicate a general decline of suitability throughout the

231 distribution range (Fig. 4), with major effects at higher emissions. For 2050 we predict a general decrease in

232 suitable areas (threshold 0.4) of ~ 45% for the low emission (rcp 2.6) and of ~ 55% for the high emission

233 scenario (rcp 8.5) in respect to the present-day projection. Habitat loss is further intensified in the 2070 high-

234 emission scenario, with an overall reduction of ~ 70%. The predicted loss of suitable habitat appears to be

235   more intense at lower altitudes. In particular, for the high-emission scenario in 2070 approximately half of the

236   current localities are predicted to be unsuitable (Fig. 5).

237   Across all known populations, the average decrease in the probability of occurrence of *Troglohyphantes*

238   drops from 0.68 to 0.51 in the low emission scenario (both 2050 and 2070). For the high emission scenario,

239   the probability of occurrence drops to 0.40 for 2050 and 0.17 for 2070.

DISCUSSION

Caves as laboratories for the study of climate change

In contrast with fluctuating surface temperatures, temperature stability in the subterranean domain allows the detection of temperature changes over longer time periods. Indeed, this working hypothesis provides a stimulating starting point for the ecological modeling of hypogean ecosystems. In spite of that, correlative distribution modelling techniques have been rarely—and only recently—applied to these particular biological systems (e.g., Bryson et al. 2014, Naranjo et al. 2014, Fišer et al. 2015, Mammola et al. 2015a, Soto-Centeno et al. 2015, Christman et al. 2016, Copper-Bohannon et al. 2016, Ferreira et al. 2016, Sánchez-Fernández et al. 2016).

However, the link between the external climate and the subterranean habitat has been well documented in speleological literature (Moore and Sullivan 1964, Smithson 1991, Badino 2004, 2010, Covington and Perne 2015). The general explanation for this relationship is found in the physics of the infiltrating meteoric fluids. Over a geological timeframe, a given rock layer will be forced to the thermal equilibrium of the water flowing through it. As a consequence, the temperature of the rock surrounding the cave equilibrates to the mean temperature of the infiltrating waters, which, in turn, is equal to the mean temperature outside (Badino 2010). Depending on the thickness of the rock layer (i.e. the cave depth), the amplitude of the sinusoidal input signal (i.e. the external temperature range) can be shifted in time—i.e. there is a time lag between input and output maxima (Badino 2004), but this lag is likely to have a duration of decades. As an example, for the Postojna cave (Slovenia) Domìnguez-Villar et al. (2015) estimated a warming time lag of ~ 20 years, which is orders of magnitude less time than the glacial time frames that are the focus of the study. In practical terms, this implies that our future projections are mostly relevant for the superficial subterranean habitats—including the outermost sectors of caves—whereas they should be shifted in time of at least 20 years to obtain a more precise time scale for future habitat modifications in deep hypogean layers.

In an evolutionary sense, such a time lag is not large, but in an anthropogenic sense it might be significant. As a consequence, spiders that we see today may still be in the lag phase i.e. not yet fully adapted to the current temperature.

We note that, in general, correlative distribution models prioritize the use of extreme values—maxima and minima—instead of average values. Whilst extremes are often believed to reflect a realistic relationship with species-specific physiological constraints (Hijmans et al., 2005), in the case of caves with constant temperatures and reduced temperature excursions, average values are likely to be more appropriate. Our

270   use of average values thus likely increases the robustness of our results because GCMs models are better

271   at predicting average than extreme values (but see Zimmerman et al. 2009).

272

273   **Interpreting the effects of past climate change**

274   Two contrasting theories attempt to explain the origin and the distribution of the subterranean fauna (Culver

275   and Pipan 2009, 2010). The theory of the active colonization (Rouch and Danielopol 1987) or adaptive shift

276   hypothesis (Howarth, 1980) puts great emphasis on the process of active colonization of the hypogean

277   domain, with species being driven by the opportunity to occupy new, unexploited ecological niches. On the

278   other hand, the theory of relicts and refuges (Botosaneanu and Holsinger 1991) invokes long-term climatic

279   changes, such as glaciation cycles and other large-scale climate upheavals, as the main factors that

280   prompted the colonization of the subterranean habitat and causing the obliteration of surface-dwelling

281   populations (Holsinger 1988, Botosaneanu and Holsinger 1991).

282   Although this dichotomous vision exists, the case of our model species possibly supports the latter theory of

283   relict and refuges, given that the occurrence of *Troglohyphantes* appears to be significantly linked to the

284   glacial history. This pattern can be explained by taking into account the self-evident fact that, most likely,

285   natural populations do not survive in caves filled with ice (Culver and Pipan 2010). Remarkably, in our case

286   only two sister species (*T. lucifuga* and *T. lucifer*) were found to occur in caves that were covered by ice

287   during the Pleistocene. *T. lucifuga* is a common and widespread species in the North Western Alps showing

288   a low degree of troglobiomorphism, whereas the recently described *T. lucifer* represents its ecological

289   vicariant in the nearby alpine districts of Cottian and Southern Graian Alps (Isaia et al. 2016). Both species

290   occur in epigean as well as hypogean habitats (Isaia and Pantini 2010, Isaia et al. 2016), an occurrence that

291   could be explained by *T. lucifuga* and *T. lucifer* having colonized the area after the glaciers retreated.

292

293   **Global change in hypogean ecosystems**

294   Little attention has been given to the effects of global climate change on hypogean organisms and

295   ecosystems relative to their epigean counterparts. In this study, we show the extent to which cave-dwelling

296   biological communities are likely to be affected by changes in temperature. Specialized hypogean arthropods

297   are known to have a fine-tuned thermal tolerance to the constant and narrow temperature ranges of the

298   subterranean habitat (Delay 1978, Huevy and Kingsolver 1989, Rizzo et al. 2015). This extends even to a

299   greater reduction in thermal tolerance observed in species living in the buffered portion of caves compared

300 with those living in the vicinity of the cave entrance (Lencioni et al. 2010, Bernabò et al. 2011, Novak et al.

301 2014).

302 However, from a global change perspective, such an adaptation turns out to be a strong limitation. Indeed,

303 while most invertebrates living close to the surface—troglophiles—have retained their ability to withstand

304 temperature variations, many specialized hypogean organisms—troglobionts—have lost such

305 thermoregulatory mechanisms (Novak et al. 2014).

306 Modelling at both local and regional spatial scales indicates that subterranean *Troglohyphantes* spiders are

307 restricted to particular climatic environments, occurring only in caves with annual mean temperatures below

308 10–11°C. This finding implies that in most mid-altitude areas of the W-Alps, where annual mean

309 temperatures are around 10–12°C, populations of *Troglohyphantes* are close to their physiological limit. Due

310 to predicted temperature rises (IPCC 2014), it is therefore expected that large areas of currently suitable

311 habitat will become progressively unsuitable, therefore falling outside the climatic niche of our model

312 species.

313 Our results, indeed, point to a likely dramatic decline in habitat suitability (Fig. 5) for most of the species

314 included in the analysis—*T. bornensis, T. iulianae, T. konradi, T. lanai, T. nigraerosae, T. pedemontanus*,

315 and *T. pluto*. On the other hand, a higher chance of survival is expected in *T. vignai* because it shows a

316 wider distribution and is also recorded at higher altitudes (above 2,000 m; Isaia et al. 2011, Mammola et al.

317 2015a). In addition to troglobiomorphic species being restricted to areas of temperature stability, caves are

318 often isolated from each other and species within them, including spiders, often exhibit reduced vagility (e.g.,

319 Hedin 1997, Snowman et al. 2010, Yao et al. 2016). In turn, this latter factor significantly increases the threat

320 of global extinction because the rate of recolonisation is low (Cardoso et al. 2011a, b). This is particularly

321 evident for *Troglohyphantes* spiders, for which we previously demonstrated a very low dispersal ability within

322 caves (Mammola and Isaia 2016) and extreme levels of population differentiation (Mammola et al. 2015a).

323 It is interesting to note that in the case of other troglobiomorphic species, the assessment of global warming

324 impacts on subterranean species based exclusively on correlative niche models is suggested to be

325 unreliable if thermal tolerance is wider than that reflected by current distributions (Sánchez-Fernández et al.

326 2016). Physiological mechanisms that might account for such an observation include the ability to synthesize

327 stress proteins (e.g. heat shock proteins; Bernabò et al. 2011). Whilst the data for these particular species

328 (Leiodidae beetles) are compelling, the finding seems unlikely to apply more generally to the glacial relict,

329 cold-adapted spiders in our study. These have a rather different evolutionary history to that of the beetles

330 and are not shown to be able to over-express similar, protective proteins. It is clear, however, that an intrinsic

degree of uncertainty remains associated with interpreting the results of any statistical model of this kind. Accordingly, as a follow up of this study, we aim to combine multiple lines of evidence (see Peterson 2009)—such as thermal tolerance experiments and population genetic studies—in order to explore our predicted patterns further (see Krehenwinkel et al. 2015 for an example on spiders). Testing the physiological response of subterranean model species to altered climatic condition could help to identify their specific upper thermal limits, and thus provide experimental evidence for our findings. In parallel, molecular analysis could establish contemporary population structure and dispersal modes, thereby increasing our understanding of the ability of subterranean species to escape and survive climate changes.

Conclusions

Together with other species living in confined habitats such as islands (e.g., Bellard et al. 2014, Yalor and Kumar 2016) and mountain summits (e.g., Beniston 2003, Xu et al. 2009, Yoccoz et al. 2010), we expect cave adapted species to be as vulnerable, if not more so, to climate change. However, the principal mechanisms underlying the response of cave-dwelling species to global climate change are as yet poorly described. Caves are excellent natural laboratories for the study of global changes in environment because of their remarkable ecological and thermal stability. Our findings emphasise the importance of considering subterranean organisms as model species for ecological studies dealing with climatic changes, and to extend such investigations to other subterranean systems worldwide.

Supplementary materials

362   **Appendix 1 -** Raw data of the fine-scale dataset, with details about sampling sites.

363   **Appendix 2 -** Details on modeling procedure. Additional figures and tables.

364

Literature cited

Allouche, O. et al. 2006. Assessing the accuracy of species distribution models: prevalence, kappa and the true skill statistic (TSS). – J. Appl. Ecol. 43: 1223–1232.

AGSP 2016. Catasto speleologico del Piemonte e della Valle D'Aosta. – Associazione Gruppi Speleologici Piemontesi, Italy, < http://sellarenato.interfree.it >.

Badino, G. 2004. Cave temperature and Global Climatic Change. – Int. J. Speleol. 33: 103–114.

Badino, G. 2010. Underground meteorology. What's the weather underground? – Acta Carsol. 39: 427– 448.

Barve, N. et al. 2011. The crucial role of the accessible area in ecological niche modeling and species distribution modeling. – Ecol. Model. 222: 1810–1819.

Beaumont, L. J. et al. 2008. Why is the choice of future climate scenarios for species distribution modelling important? – Ecol. Lett. 11: 1135–1146.

Bellard, C. et al. 2012. Impacts of climate change on the future of biodiversity. – Ecol. Lett. 15: 365–377.

Bellard, C. et al. 2014. Impact of sea level rise on the 10 insular biodiversity hotspots. – Global Ecol. Biogeogr. 23: 203–212.

Beniston, M. 2003. Climatic change in mountain regions: a review of possible impacts. –Springer. [page numbers]

Bernabò, P. et al. 2011. Cold stenothermal cave-dwelling beetles do have an HSP70 heat shock response. – J. Therm. Biol. 36: 206–208.

394 Botosaneanu, L. and Holsinger, J. 1991. Some aspects concerning colonization of the subterranean realm -

395   especially subterranean waters: a response to Rouch and Danielopol, 1987. – Stygologia 6: 11–39.

396

397 Brandmayr, P. et al. 2013. Hypogean carabid beetles as indicators of global warming? – Env. Res. Lett. 8:

398   1–11.

399

400 Brignoli, P. M. 1971. Note su ragni cavernicoli italiani (Araneae). – Fragm. Entomol. 7: 129–229.

401

402 Bryson, Jr R. W. et al. 2014. Caves as microrefugia: pleistocene phylogeography of the troglophilic North

403   American scorpion *Pseudouroctonus reddelli*. – BMC Evol. Biol. 14: 9.

404

405 Cardoso, P. 2012. Diversity and community assembly patterns of epigean vs. troglobiont spiders in the

406   Iberian Peninsula. – Int. J. Speleol. 41(1): 83–94.

407

408 Cardoso, P. et al. 2011a. Adapting the IUCN red listing criteria for invertebrates. – Biol. Conserv. 144: 2432–

409   2440.

410

411 Cardoso, P. et al. 2011b. The seven impediments in invertebrate conservation and how to overcome them. –

412   Biol. Conserv. 144: 2647–2655.

413

414 Chen, I. C. et al. 2011. Rapid range shifts of species associated with high levels of climate warming. –

415   Science 333(6045): 1024–1026.

416

417 Chevaldonné, P. and Lejeune, C. 2003. Regional warming-induced species shift in northwest Mediterranean

418   marine caves. – Ecol. Lett. 6: 371–379.

419

420 Christman, M. C. et al. 2016. Predicting the occurrence of cave-inhabiting fauna based on features of the

421   earth surface environment. – PloS ONE 11: e0160408.

422

423 Cooper-Bohannon, R. et al. 2016. Predicting bat distributions and diversity hotspots in southern Africa. –

Hystrix 27.

Covington, M. D. and Perne, M. 2015. Consider a cylindrical cave: a physicist's view of cave and karst science. - Acta Carsol. 44: 363–380.

Culver, D.C. and Pipan, T. 2009. The Biology of Caves and other Subterranean Habitats. – Oxford Univ. Press.

Culver, D.C. and Pipan, T. 2010. Climate, abiotic factors, and the evolution of subterranean life. Acta Carsol. - 39: 539–577.

Dawson, T. P. et al. 2011. Beyond predictions: biodiversity conservation in a changing climate. – Science 332: 53–58.

Deeleman-Reinhold, C. L. 1978. Revision of the cave-dwelling and related spiders of the genus *Troglohyphantes* Joseph (Linyphiidae), with special reference to the Jugoslav species. Opera Academia Scientiarum et Artium Slovenica.

Delay, B. 1978. Milieu souterrain et écophysiologique de la reproduction et du développement des Coléoptères Bathysciinae hypogés. – Mém. Biospéol. 5: 1–349.

Diniz-Filho, J. A. F. et al. 2009. Partitioning and mapping uncertainties in ensembles of forecasts of species turnover under climate change. – Ecography 32: 897–906.

Domìnguez-Villar, D. et al. 2015. Is global warming affecting cave temperatures? Experimental and model data from a paradigmatic case study. – Clim. Dynam. 45: 569–581.

Ehlers, J. et al. 2011. Quaternary glaciations - extent and chronology. A closer look. Vol. 15. – Elsvier. [chapter & page numbers?]

Elith, J. and Graham, C. H. 2009. Do they? How do they? WHY do they differ? On finding reasons for

455   differing performances of species distribution models. – Ecography 32: 66–77.

456

457 Elith, J. et al. 2006. Novel methods improve prediction of species' distributions from occurrence data. –

458   Ecography 29: 129–151.

459

460 Ferreira, M. I. et al. 2016. The genus *Zelurus* Hahn, 1826, in Brazilian caves: description of new species and

461   comments on the potential distribution of the genus in South America. – Zootaxa 4170: 250–270.

462

463 Fejér, A. and Moldovan, O. T. 2013 Population size and dispersal patterns for a *Drimeotus* (Coleoptera,

464   Leiodidae, Leptodirini) cave population. – Subterr. Biol. 11: 31–44.

465

466 Fielding, A. H. and Bell, J. F. 1997. A review of methods for the assessment of prediction errors in

467   conservation presence/absence models. – Environ. Cons. 24: 38–49.

468

469 Fišer, Ž. et al. 2015. Morphologically cryptic amphipod species are "ecological clones" at regional but not at

470   local scale: a case study of four *Niphargus* species. – PloS ONE 10(7): e0134384.

471

472 Friedman, J. H. 2001. Greedy function approximation: a gradient boosting machine. – Ann. Stat. 29: 1189–

473   1232.

474

475 Gittleman, J. L. and Kot, M. 1990. Adaptation: statistics and a null model for estimating phylogenetic effects.

476   – Syst. Zool. 39: 227–241.

477

478 Hedin, M. C. 1997. Molecular phylogenetics at the population/species interface in cave spiders of the

479   southern Appalachians (Araneae: Nesticidae: *Nesticus*). – Mol. Biol. Evol. 14: 309–324.

480

481 Hijmans, R. J. et al. 2005. Very high resolution interpolated climate surfaces for global land areas. – Int. J.

482   Climatol. 25: 1965–1978.

483

484 Ho, Y. C. and Pepyne, D. L. 2002. Simple explanation of the no-free-lunch theorem and its implications. – J.

485   Optim. Theory Appl. 115: 549–570.

486

487 Holsinger, J. R. 1988. Troglobites: the evolution of cave-dwelling organisms. – Am. Sci. 76: 147–153.

488

489 Howarth, F. G. 1980. The Zoogeography of specialized cave animals: a bioclimatic model. - Evolution 34:
490   394–406.

491

492 Huevy, R. B. and Kingsolver, J. G. 1989. Evolution of thermal sensitivity of ectotherm performance. – Trends
493   Ecol. Evol. 4: 131–135.

494

495 Hurvich, C. M. and Tsai C. L. 1989. Regression and time series model selection in small samples. –
496   Biometrika 76: 297–307.

497

498 IPCC 2014. Climate Change 2014: Synthesis Report. Contribution of Working Groups I, II and III to the Fifth
499   Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. – IPCC.

500

501 Isaia, M. and Pantini, P. 2010. New data on the spider genus *Troglohyphantes* (Araneae, Linyphiidae) in the
502   Italian Alps, with the description of a new species and a new synonymy. – Zootaxa 2690: 1–18.

503

504 Isaia, M. et al. 2011. Subterranean arachnids of the Western Italian Alps (Arachnida: Araneae, Opiliones,
505   Palpigradi, Pseudoscorpiones). – Mon. Mus. Reg. Sc. Nat.

506

507 Isaia, M. et al. 2016. Advances in the systematics of the spider genus *Troglohyphantes* (Araneae,
508   Linyphiidae) - Syst. Biodivers.[page numbers]

509

510 Juberthie, C. and Decou, V. 1994. Structure et diversité du domaine souterrain; particularités des habitats et
511   adaptations des espèces. – Encycl. Biospeol. 1: 5–22.

512

513 Kageyama, M. et al. 2001. The Last Glacial Maximum climate over Europe and western Siberia: a PMIP
514   comparison between models and data. – Clim. Dynam. 17: 23–43.

515

516 Krehenwinkel, H. et al. 2015. Eco-Genomic analysis of the poleward range expansion of the wasp spider
517   Argiope bruennichi shows rapid adaptation and genomic admixture. – Glob. Change Biol. 21: 4320–
518   4332.

519

520 Lencioni, V. et al. 2010. Cold resistance in two species of cave-dwelling beetles (Coleoptera: Cholevidae). –
521   J. Therm. Biol. 35: 354–359.

522

523 Liu, C. et al. 2005. Selecting thresholds of occurrence in the prediction of species distributions. – Ecography
524   28: 385–393.

525

526 Mammola, S. and Isaia, M. 2016. The ecological niche of a specialized subterranean spider. – Invertebr.
527   Biol. 135: 20–30.

528

529 Mammola, S. et al. 2015a. Alpine endemic spiders shed light on the origin and evolution of subterranean
530   species. – PeerJ 3: e1384.

531

532 Mammola, S. et al. 2015b. Seasonal dynamics and micro-climatic preference of two Alpine endemic
533   hypogean beetles. – Int. J. Speleol. 44: 239–249.

534

535 Mammola, S. et al. 2016. Ecology and sampling techniques of an understudied subterranean habitat: the
536   Milieu Souterrain Superficiel (MSS). – The Science of Nature 103(11-12): 88.

537

538 McCullagh, P. and Nelder, J. A. 1989. Generalized Linear Models (2nd ed.). – Chapman and Hall.

539

540 Mermillod-Blondin, F. et al. 2013. Thermal tolerance breadths among groundwater crustaceans living in a

541   thermally constant environment. – J. Exp. Biol. 216: 1683–1694.

542

543 Merow, C. et al. 2013. A practical guide to MaxEnt for modeling species' distributions: what it does, and why
544   inputs and settings matter. – Ecography 36: 1058–1069.

545

546 Moore, G. W. and Sullivan, G. N. 1964. Out of phase seasonal temperature fluctuations in Cathedral Cave,
547   Kentucky. – Geol. Soc. Am. 76: 313.

548

549 Motta, M. 2014. The definition of the extension of quaternary glaciers within alpine valleys, and his
550   application to study of troglobites. – EDIS 1: 439–444.

551

552 Naranjo, M. et al. 2014. ¿Dónde buscar troglobiontes? Ensayo de una cartografía predictiva con MaxEnt en
553   Gran Canaria (islas Canarias). – Arxius de Miscellània Zoològica 12: 83–92.

554

555 Newbold, T. 2010. Applicatons and limitatons of museum data for conservaton and ecology, with particular
556   attention to species distribution models. – Prog. Phys. Geog. 34: 3–22.

557

558 Novak, T. et al. 2014. Cold tolerance in terrestrial invertebrates inhabiting subterranean habitats. – Int. J.
559   Speleol. 43: 265–272.

560

561 Paradis, E. et al. 2004. APE: analyses of phylogenetics and evolution in R language. – Bioinformatics 20:
562   289–290.

563

564 Parmesa, C. and Yohe, G. 2003. A globally coherent fingerprint of climate change impacts across natural
565   systems. – Nature 421: 37–42.

566

567 Parmesan, C. 2006. Ecological and evolutionary responses to recent climate change. – Annu. Rev. Ecol.
568   Evol. Syst.: 637–669.

569

570 Peterson, A. T. 2009. Phylogeography is not enough: the need for multiple lines of evidence. – Front.
571 Biogeogr. 1: 19–25.

572

573 Peterson, A. T. et al. (2011) Ecological niches and geographical distributions: a modeling perspective. –
574 Princeton Univ. Press.

575

576 Phillips, S. J. et al. 2006. Maximum entropy modeling of species geographic distributions. – Ecol. Model.
577 190: 231–259.

578

579 Phillips, S. J. 2009. Sample selection bias and presence-only distribution models: implications for
580 background and pseudo-absence data. – Ecol. Appl. 19: 181–197.

581

582 Phillips, S. J. 2011. A brief tutorial on Maxent. – AT&T Research, Princeton.

583

584 Poulson, T. L. and White, W. B. 1969. The cave environment. – Science 165: 971–981.

585

586 Qiao, H. et al. 2015. No silver bullets in correlative ecological niche modelling: insights from testing among
587 many potential algorithms for niche estimation. – Methods Ecol. Evol. 6: 1126–1136.

588

589 R Development Core Team 2015. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. – R Foundation
590 for Statistical Computing, Austria, < http://www.R-project.org/ >.

591

592 Rizzo, V. et al. 2015. Lack of evolutionary adjustment to ambient temperature in highly specialized cave
593 beetles. – BMC Evol. Biol. 15: 10.

594

595 Romero, A. 2009. Cave biology. – Cambridge Univ. Press.

596

597 Rouch, R. and Danielpol, D. 1987. L'origine de la faune aquatique souterraine, entre le paradigme du refuge
598 et le modèle de la colonisation active. – Stygologia 3: 345–372.

599

600   Rull, V. 2009. Microrefugia. – J. Biogeogr. 36: 481–484.

601

602   Sánchez-Fernández, D. et al. 2016. Thermal niche estimators and the capability of poor dispersal species to
603   cope with climate change. – Sc. Rep. 6: 23381.

604

605   Saupe, E. E. et al. 2012. Variation in niche and distribution model performance: the need for a priori
606   assessment of key causal factors. – Ecol. Model. 237: 11–22.

607

608   Smithson, A. 1991. Inter-relatonships between cave and outside air temperatures. – Theor. Appl. Climatol.
609   44: 65–73.

610

611   Snowman, C. V. et al. 2010. Caves as islands: mitochondrial phylogeography of the cave-obligate spider
612   species *Nesticus barri* (araneae: Nesticidae). – J. Arachnol. 38: 49–56.

613

614   Soto-Centeno, J. A. et al. 2015. The importance of late Quaternary climate change and karst on distributions
615   of Caribbean mormoopid bats. – Am. Mus. Novit. 3847: 1–32.

616

617   Syfert, M. M. et al. 2013. The effects of sampling bias and model complexity on the predictive performance
618   of MaxEnt Species Distribution Models. – PLoS ONE 8: e55158.

619

620   Taylor, S. and Kumar, L. 2016. Global climate change impacts on pacific islands terrestrial biodiversity: a
621   review. – Trop. Conserv. Sci. 9: 203–223.

622

623   Taylor, K. E. et al. 2012. An overview of CMIP5 and the experiment design. – B. Am. Meteorol. Soc. 93:
624   485–49.

625

626   Walther, G. R. 2010. Community and ecosystem responses to recent climate change. – Phil. Trans. R. Soc.
627   Lond., B, Biol. Sci. 365: 2019–2024.

628

629   Walther, G. R. et al. 2002. Ecological responses to recent climate change. – Nature 416: 389–395.

630

631   Wynne, J.J. et al. 2014. Disturbance relicts in a rapidly changing world: The Rapa Nui (Easter Island) factor.
632   – Bioscience 64: 711–718.

633

634   Xu, J. et al. 2009. The melting Himalayas: cascading effects of climate change on water, biodiversity, and
635   livelihoods. – Conserv. Biol. 23: 520–530.

636

637   Yao, Z. et al. 2016. High endemism at cave entrances: a case study of spiders of the genus *Uthina*. – Sc.
638   Rep., 6: 35757.

639

640   Yoccoz, N. G. et al. 2010. Impact of climatic change on alpine ecosystems: inference and prediction. – J.
641   Alp. Res.: 98–104.

642

643   Zimmermann, N. E. et al. 2009. Climatic extremes improve predictions of spatial patterns of tree species. –
644   Proc. Natl. Acad. Sc. USA 106: 19723–19728.

645

646   Zuur, A. F. et al. 2010. A protocol for data exploration to avoid common statistical problem. – Methods Ecol.
647   Evol. 1: 3–14.

648

649   Zuur, A. F. et al. 2009. Mixed effect models and extensions in ecology with R. – Springer.

650

651

652

653

654

655

656

657

658

659

660

661

662

Tables and Figures

Table 1. List of the variables selected to construct the regional scale model. The uncorrelated variables (Pearson r <±0.7) used in the model are highlighted. Percent contribution and permutation importance (*sensu* Phillips 2011) of each variable for building the final MaxEnt model is reported.

Variable	Description	Unit	Percent contribution	Permutation importance
Bio01	**Annual Mean Temperature**	**°C**	**29.6 %**	**27.4**
Bio02	**Mean Diurnal Range**	**°C**	**32.7 %**	**32.5**
Bio03	Isothermality (Bio02/Bio07) (*100)	°C	-	
Bio04	Temperature Seasonality (standard deviation*100)	°C	-	
Bio05	Max Temperature of Warmest Month	°C	-	
Bio06	Min Temperature of Coldest Month	°C	-	
Bio07	Temperature Annual Range (Bio05–Bio06)	°C		
Bio08	Mean Temperature of Wettest Quarter	°C	-	
Bio09	**Mean Temperature of Driest Quarter**	**°C**	**Discarded (<5%)**	**Discarded**
Bio10	Mean Temperature of Warmest	°C	-	

Variable	Description	Unit	Percent contribution	Permutation importance
	Quarter			
Bio11	Mean Temperature of Coldest Quarter	°C	-	
Bio12	Annual Precipitation	mm	-	
Bio13	Precipitation of Wettest Month	mm	-	
Bio14	Precipitation of Driest Month	mm	-	
Bio15	Precipitation Seasonality (Coefficient of Variation)	mm	-	
Bio16	Precipitation of Wettest Quarter	mm	-	
Bio17	Precipitation of Driest Quarter	mm	-	
Bio18	**Precipitation of Warmest Quarter**	**mm**	**Discarded (<5%)**	**Discarded**
Bio19	Precipitation of Coldest Quarter	mm	-	
Alt	Altitude a.s.l	m	-	
Ice	**Ice cover during Last Glacial Maximum**	**Categorical**	**37.7 %**	**40.1**

667

668

Figure legends

Figure 1. Hypogean localities selected in the present work. Ice cover during Last Glacial Maximum is reported in the top-right inset map. A code in brackets referring to the Italian speleological cadaster is provided for each locality—more details in Supplementary Material Appendix 1.

Figure 2. Predicted values (filled lines) and 95% confidence intervals (dashed lines) of the effect of mean annual cave temperature (T_{int}) on the probability of presence of *Troglohyphantes* spiders according to glacial history, derived from GLM analysis.

677

Figure 3. Projected environmental suitability of Western Alps for troglobiomorphic species of

Troglohyphantes spiders according to current and Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) climatic conditions. LGM

projection represents the average of three General Circulation Models (GCMs). Only suitable areas over the

threshold of 0.4 are shown.

682

Figure 4. Projected future environmental suitability of the Western Alps for troglobiomorphic species of

Troglohyphantes spiders in 2050 and 2070 according to the two Representative Concentration Pathways

(rcp) considered in the work. Each map represents the average of the projection into three General

Circulation Models (GCMs). Only suitable areas over the threshold of 0.4 are shown.

687

Figure 5. Current and projected future environmental suitability (high emissions scenario for 2070) of the

Western Alps for *Troglohyphantes* spiders. Orange dots represent current localities of *Troglohyphantes.*

Localities of *T. lucifuga* and *T. lucifer* are not shown in the map. Only suitable areas over the threshold of 0.4

are shown.

692