



Strathprints Institutional Repository

Paterson, M. (2009) *Are Scottish primary schools becoming more enterprising?* Scottish Educational Review, 41 (1). pp. 36-50. ISSN 0141-9072

Strathprints is designed to allow users to access the research output of the University of Strathclyde. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. You may not engage in further distribution of the material for any profitmaking activities or any commercial gain. You may freely distribute both the url (<http://strathprints.strath.ac.uk/>) and the content of this paper for research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge.

Any correspondence concerning this service should be sent to Strathprints administrator: <mailto:strathprints@strath.ac.uk>

Are Scottish primary schools becoming more enterprising?

Moira Paterson

University of Strathclyde

Enterprise in education features in the political as well as the educational agenda and enterprise activities are now a compulsory part of Scottish Education for all pupils from P1 to S6. The profile of enterprise in education increased with the publication of *Determined to Succeed* and the responses to it (Scottish Executive 2002b, 2003, 2004a, 2006, 2007). This article examines definitions of enterprise and seeks to identify what it means to be enterprising. Existing practice is compared and contrasted and the widening perspective of the meaning of creating enterprising individuals is discussed. The publication of *A Curriculum for Excellence*, (Scottish Executive 2004b) highlights the need for all children to develop their capabilities as 'successful learners, confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors to society.' Enterprise in education is seen as one way to contribute to this. The research raises questions about how *Curriculum for Excellence* will enable the curriculum to become more enterprising.

INTRODUCTION

Enterprise in education has had a higher profile in Scotland over the past few years with the provision of enterprise activities for all pupils from P1-S6 formalised in the publication of *Determined to Succeed* (Scottish Executive 2002b). This considered how enterprising attitudes and skills could be developed through teaching and learning as well as enabling pupils to gain experience of the world of work.

Enterprise in education has different meanings for different people. It can be defined as encompassing a wide range of enterprising skills and attitudes. Some definitions focus on the world of work; however evidence put forward in this discussion will suggest that the development of personal, transferable or life skills has become increasingly important in schools. What place enterprise has in schools at this time will be explored and consideration will be given as to how that changed during the period of the research. Data collected in this small scale study and examples from real life situations will be used to describe and support the findings. There are a number of possible interpretations of enterprise in education in primary schools. Over the period of this study it would seem that there have been changes in the ways that enterprise in education is perceived and implemented. This article analyses the responses from a project that set out

to evaluate the educational and economic impact of enterprise in education in Scotland. It builds up a picture of the enterprise experience but does not aim to make any sweeping conclusions.

Determined to Succeed (Scottish Executive 2002b) defined enterprise in education as developing enterprising attitudes and skills through learning and teaching across the curriculum, and developing experience of the world of work:

Encouraging enterprising values – a ‘can do, will do’ attitude - in our schoolchildren is not just about producing the business people and entrepreneurs of tomorrow. It is the route to a more enterprising Scotland, where all our people understand the contribution they can make as citizens, both to society and the economy. And where individuals have the self confidence and belief in their ability to succeed in whatever they choose. (Scottish Executive 2003)

Determined to Succeed: Three Years On (Scottish Executive 2007) emphasised the importance of creating a culture of enterprise and stressed the importance of teachers delivering lessons in an enterprising way. The four key themes identified were; enterprising learning; entrepreneurial learning; work-based and related vocational learning; and appropriately focused career information, advice and guidance.

What does the term enterprise mean?

The debate around defining the term is ongoing and there is confusion about what this involves in primary schools. It is important to try to be clear about what is meant by the term enterprise in education.

Brownlow et al (2004) argue that while there would seem to be agreement at a general level over the meaning of enterprise in education that there is no agreement over specific definitions. In defining quality indicators in enterprise in education (HMIE 2004) it was argued that enterprise is a complex issue and that its meaning continues to develop. Ofsted (2004) evaluated enterprise learning in a number of schools using a definition based on the work of the Howard Davies Review (2002) which defined enterprise capability as:

the ability to handle uncertainty and respond positively to change, to create and implement new ideas and new ways of doing things, to make reasonable risk/reward assessments and act upon them in a variety of contexts, both personal and work. (Ofsted 2004: 6)

It was again found that there was a lack of understanding and no agreement as to how enterprise was defined. The follow up to this study (Ofsted 2005) recognised that some progress had been made in the development of what enterprise means but it still appears that this is an area that poses difficulties for those working in this field. TNS System Three (2005) found that pupils had difficulty in defining what was meant by enterprise in education. They suggested that rather than focus on the terminology it would be more effective to focus on what constitutes enterprise. Rodger and Hunter (2007) in their evaluation of *Determined to Succeed* also found difficulty in defining the terminology linked to enterprise in education. They did report that the majority of schools had experienced positive development in the way that DtS was incorporated but it would seem that the meaning of enterprise is still unclear. A comparative

analysis of enterprise education carried out in England, Wales, Northern Ireland and Ireland identified the on-going issue of definition as problematic and recommended that it should be clearly defined (Semple 2007). Although aspects of policy and practice were diverse in this report it was considered that there were enough similarities for useful comparisons to be made.

Background to Enterprise in Education

The current term enterprise in education is used to encompass enterprise education, career education and education for work (Semple & Brownlow 2004). Previous terms used have included Education Industry Liaison, Education for Life and Work and Education for Work and Enterprise. Twiddle & Watt (1995) looked at pupils learning about enterprise which would have a business focus, learning through enterprise which looked at skills and learning for enterprise which dealt with attitudes.

Semple *et al.* (2002) describe the term Education for Work, which was used in Scotland, as encompassing education/industry links, careers education and enterprise. They suggest that this derives from a background of education/industry links which were promoted in schools by government and industry schemes such as the Technical and Vocational Education Initiative (TVEI), Understanding Industry, Young Enterprise and Mini Enterprise. These focused on secondary schools and were often extra curricular. In primary schools initiatives such as *Enterprising Infants* (Twiddle & Watt 1995) and *Go for Enterprise* (Brownlow *et al.* 1998) were seen as promoting an understanding of business as well as developing positive skills and attitudes.

As well as education for work, enterprise in education is considered to be about citizenship and approaches to teaching and learning (HMIE 2004). LTS (2002) linked creativity, enterprise and citizenship. It is suggested that effective approaches to teaching and learning will contribute to pupils' experience of enterprise in education because it increases the relevance for pupils by setting activities in a real life context and relates to real life experiences. Enterprise in Scottish schools can have a business, community or environmental focus as well as being a way to develop skills. (Deuchar 2004; Deuchar 2007; Brownlow *et al.* 1998)

The development of the term enterprise can be traced back to Keith Joseph's Centre for Policy Studies in 1974 (Morris 1991, in Fagan 2006). He suggests that at this time it was understood in terms of commercial or industrial initiative. James Callaghan's Ruskin Speech (1976) initiated what came to be known as the Great Debate in education and it could be argued that enterprise in education has its roots here as this led to debate as to the purpose of education. Hayward (2004, in Deuchar 2007) argues that the idea of education for work can be traced back much further to the Samuelson Commission on Technical Instruction of 1882-84. Deuchar (2007) agrees that from the late 19th century vocational education was promoted to various degrees and at various times by sections of industry. The emphasis on enterprise in education was driven by political and economic goals as well as educational ones and it was suggested that in order for young people to be ready to face the future a new agenda for change in education was required (CBI Scotland 2000). The review group, *Determined to*

Succeed, was set up in 2002 in response to calls such as *A Smart, Successful Scotland* (Scottish Executive 2001, 2002a) which called for greater entrepreneurial dynamism in Scotland. *Determined to Succeed: Three Years On* (2007: 12) states explicitly that: 'Although *Determined to Succeed* is an economic policy, delivery is clearly within our education system.' Fagan's (2006) discussion of economics, enterprise and entrepreneurship supports this view. A recent OECD report (2008) argues that for too long there has been a concern that an emphasis on vocational studies will lead to a reintroduction of segregated provision. They suggest however that vocational studies should not just be about employability but should involve a variety of learning contexts including problem solving and collaborative learning. Deuchar (2007) suggests that the expansion of the enterprising agenda has not been confined to Scotland but has also been expanding in other countries such as Canada, South Africa, China and Australia where the focus has often been on business, individualism and the need for economic improvement. In the current economic climate the ideas of economic literacy, enterprising approaches and business awareness will become increasingly important, not just in Scotland but internationally.

Shift towards teaching and learning approaches

Determined to Succeed (Scottish Executive 2002b) made it clear that enterprise in education had evolved from Education for Work and Enterprise but that enterprise was to have a much greater role and play a key part in Scottish schools. The responses to *Determined to Succeed* (Scottish Executive 2003, 2004a, 2006, 2007) stressed the importance of the development of enterprising skills and attitudes as well as the world of work. The idea of the development of a wider meaning for enterprise in education continued to shift with the publication of *HMIE Quality Indicators in Enterprise in Education* (2004) which looked at how enterprise in education could have an influence on the national priorities for Scottish education. Enterprise was seen as a way to contribute to raising the aspirations, motivation and attainment of pupils, promoting inclusion and positive attitudes. It was also seen as enhancing the quality of teaching and learning in real life contexts.

It would appear that the focus has shifted from one off business type enterprise projects to community type projects and in some schools to a more embedded approach where an enterprising approach to learning and teaching is used across curricular areas. Brownlow *et al.* (2004) reported that schools valued the skills and attitudes developed through enterprise in education. Some teachers were less happy about the business or commercial aspects but felt more comfortable when community or environmental type projects were involved. It is suggested that enterprise in education provides opportunities for learning in different ways across curricular areas and that enterprising approaches to teaching and learning make learning engaging, relevant and meaningful. Enterprise is seen as motivating pupils and giving them the confidence to succeed (Scottish Executive 2005a, 2005b).

THE RESEARCH

The research was part of a larger project commissioned by the Schools Enterprise Programme. This project set out to evaluate the educational and economic impact of enterprise in education in Scotland. This longitudinal, qualitative study took place over a three year period from 2001-2004. The national study involved 591 pupils in 26 primary schools in the first session and followed them through to secondary schools. Schools were a non representative sample, although they covered a range of socio-economic areas. They were selected by a combination of information from Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education (HMIE), Learning and Teaching Scotland (LTS), local and national publicity materials and the database of the Centre for Studies in Enterprise, Career Development and Work at Strathclyde University.

A case study approach was chosen to enable situations to be looked at in depth. The impact that involvement in enterprise activities had on pupils, teachers and schools was examined using data from a range of sources. Experiences from the schools in the study were built up and compared over the period of the research to put together a picture of what is happening in enterprise in education in this sample of Scottish primary schools. This paper focuses on the ideas, opinions and experiences of pupils, teachers and head teachers in the primary schools in the study in relation to enterprise in education. Practical examples are used to illustrate and exemplify the findings and suggestions will be made as to how some of the findings might relate to other situations and possible links will be examined to see if patterns emerge.

The five primary schools in this study were all associated schools for the local secondary and most of the pupils in this cohort moved on to this secondary school. The following research strategies were used to collect data to answer the research questions.

- What do we mean by the term enterprise in education?
- What do pupils gain from involvement in enterprise in education?
- How is enterprise in education developed and promoted?

Research Strategies

<p>Primary 7 pupils</p> <p>Questionnaires Semi structured group interviews Individual interviews</p>	<p>Secondary 1 pupils</p> <p>Questionnaires Semi structured group interviews</p>	<p>Secondary 2 pupils</p> <p>Questionnaires Semi structured group interviews</p>
<p>Primary 7 class teachers</p> <p>Questionnaires Semi structured interviews</p>	<p>Science and Technology teachers</p> <p>Questionnaires Semi structured interviews</p>	<p>Science and Technology teachers</p> <p>Questionnaires Semi structured interviews</p>
<p>Primary head teachers</p> <p>Questionnaires Semi structured interviews</p>	<p>Secondary head teacher</p> <p>Questionnaire Semi structured interview</p>	<p>Depute Head teacher responsible for S1/2</p> <p>Questionnaire Semi structured interview</p>
	<p>Parents of Secondary 1 pupils</p> <p>Questionnaires</p>	<p>Teachers and Head teachers from primary schools in phase 1</p> <p>Semi structured interviews</p>

TEACHERS' AND HEAD TEACHERS' PERCEPTIONS OF ENTERPRISE

Teachers and head teachers tended to have strong opinions about the purposes of enterprise education and suggested various interpretations of what enterprise in education means. Many of these related to social or life skills such as giving children a sense of pride and achievement. Pupils had opportunities to build up skills and to gain in confidence and self esteem. Benefits commonly mentioned as being developed effectively through enterprise were often to do with communication skills and team work.

It gave the pupils a chance to respond to other people and to be tolerant. It helped them to express their ideas and be able to accept that we can't all be winners all of the time. (class teacher)

Several teachers commented that pupils gained from being more involved in discussion and group work about enterprise topics. They were willing to share ideas and appreciated that ideas other people had might be more appropriate

than their own. Skills and confidence were seen as being able to be transferred to other curricular areas.

Really shone throughout the project and showed new skills in maths and language as well as gaining in confidence. (class teacher)

The view was expressed by some teachers that pupils seemed to enjoy enterprise projects because they are set in a context and pupils know that what they are doing is meaningful and relevant to them. Some teachers suggested that problem solving and thinking skills permeate the whole curriculum and that enterprise education encouraged pupils to persevere and to complete tasks. Some benefits were related to educational goals and some looked at work related goals for the future. In practical and oral tasks pupils gained experience in real life situations such as interviews, researching ideas and chairing meetings. Pupils learned to be aware of their strengths and to develop these in a variety of situations. One point made was that enterprise education was about learning for life, to be a good citizen as well as being a way for pupils to learn skills in an enjoyable way.

They find out their strengths, it helps them believe in themselves, helps them to have a vision. They can make things happen and have good life opportunities. (class teacher)

It gives them a sense of pride and achievement when they know people support them and where they feel their ideas are valued. (head teacher)

A lot of our children don't have much confidence in themselves, don't feel they're very good at anything and when they produce a piece of work that people actually want to buy it's wonderful for them. (class teacher)

Schools incorporated enterprise explicitly or implicitly into the curriculum. Schools that had less involvement with enterprise at the beginning of the study became more involved in explicit enterprise projects. Schools that were involved in explicit enterprise projects increased their involvement in these as well as promoting an enterprising ethos throughout the school. One school which had an enterprising ethos has developed a school policy indicating where enterprise fitted in both explicitly and implicitly to the curriculum and the school where the whole ethos revolved around enterprise has continued to provide varied opportunities for pupils. One comment from a primary head teacher illustrates this point.

The whole point about enterprise is that it is an opportunity to involve the children and the teacher in something that is very creative, that is totally cross curricular. (head teacher)

In this study the increase in awareness of enterprise emerged as a significant factor. At the beginning of the study one headteacher commented that a number of schools would be doing activities that could be classed as enterprise but that they might not be aware of or regard them as enterprise. In the first interviews teachers and head teachers were positive about the opportunities provided through enterprise but in some of the schools enterprising practice was at an early stage. In only one of the five schools had enterprise in education reached the stage of being a regular and recurring feature of school life, with discrete

projects tackled but with an enterprising ethos underpinning everything that was happening in the school. In one school, staff felt that enterprise was not really part of the curriculum, although on further discussion links were made to enterprising activities or approaches. It emerged from the study that teachers were becoming increasingly aware of the role of enterprise in education, not just as discrete activities but by developing an enterprising approach. One head teacher commented that enterprise was a way of thinking rather than a way of organising.

Tackling projects in an enterprising way will stand pupils in good stead for the future and will be something they remember.

Diversity exists among schools, teachers and pupils with regard to experience and knowledge of enterprise in education and in the five primary schools in this study enterprise education was organised in different ways. Early in the research involvement varied from one school where the plan was to start enterprise projects to one that had embedded enterprise into the curriculum as well as having specific projects at each stage. Other schools tackled discrete projects at specific stages with some incidental enterprise activities at other times. Others had discrete projects at each stage but fostered an enterprising atmosphere in all activities. It is difficult to measure whether undertaking specific enterprise projects enables pupils to be more enterprising than when enterprise is embedded into the curriculum. Primary schools generally work on thematic or topic based activities and this will increase with the implementation of CfE. Changes noted in several schools were that Environmental Studies projects were revamped and enterprise written into the programme or that existing topics were adapted to make them more enterprising. In fact in some schools pupils found it difficult to distinguish enterprise projects from other topics they had covered (Brownlow *et al.* 2004). This could be because enterprising approaches are used in other topics or because enterprise terminology was not used explicitly.

Teachers commented that giving ownership to pupils helped to increase their confidence and comments were made about the positive change in the behaviour of some pupils due to engagement with enterprise activities. Enterprise in education seemed to be increasingly seen as a practical way of teaching and learning that could encourage pupils to take responsibility for their own learning by enhancing ownership:

If you foster the right atmosphere the other bits come because the children want to do well. (class teacher)

A different view was expressed by one primary head teacher who considered that:

As well as developing an insight into the world of work, pupils' social skills will be developed.

Several teachers talked positively about the effect involvement in enterprise in education had on them as teachers. It seems that initially several teachers found it a challenge to take a step back and to allow pupils to take risks and to make their own decisions. Teachers also talked about how everyone could be included: 'in enterprise you're being inclusive because no one's left out'.

Staff in one school commented that enterprise projects were another way of promoting the kinds of activities already tackled but they had devised an enterprise policy to ensure that enterprise topics would now be tackled at all stages:

It was in my mind, there's been so much about *Determined to Succeed*, enterprise in schools, education for work, we were thinking about what we already do for enterprise. (head teacher)

One teacher commented that:

As enterprise increases throughout the school, more and more teachers are becoming involved and this helps to raise the profile.

Some teachers had concerns about pupils believing that the only worthwhile enterprise topics involved making money and were happier when the enterprise activity involved community or environmental type projects or when the focus was on the development of enterprising skills and attitudes.

The children would get tremendous satisfaction, not from having made £300 but from knowing they've given young children pleasure, enjoyment, something to look back and reflect on. (class teacher)

PUPILS' VIEWS

Contrary to the findings of TNS System Three (2005) and Rodger & Hunter (2007) it was found in this study that almost all of the pupils in the primary schools who had undertaken enterprise activities were aware of and able to discuss these. Several of them were able to use enterprise terminology appropriately:

...to be independent, making or organising a product or event.

...talented and an eye for a good deal in business.

Pupils were also able to show understanding of the terminology by explaining what it meant and by talking about the roles that they had taken on in enterprise projects e.g. manager, accountant or marketing manager. It would seem to indicate that using the terminology with pupils in a real life setting enables them to use it. Pupils seemed to mention business type enterprise if that was the kind of previous experience they had.

Pupils talked in detail about what enterprise meant and what they had gained from it. Comments from the pupils focused on enjoyment, interest and engagement with the ideas and activities. The specific impact of involvement in enterprise activities on pupils' attitudes and perceptions is difficult to separate from other activities. However pupils from the primary school which could be regarded as the most enterprising in the study were able to recall more examples of enterprise activities. Some studies have suggested that family and the media have more influence on pupils than school (Bricheno & Thornton 2007, Brownlow *et al.* 2004) and this was reinforced by comments made by pupils as to what influenced them. Langford & Aitken (2005) found that the two top sources of information for P7 pupils were TV and parents or carers.

It is worth considering whether it matters if pupils know the terminology of enterprise as long as they are being enterprising or showing enterprising traits. It is also debatable whether being able to talk about enterprising behaviour equates with demonstrating enterprising behaviour. It would seem to depend what emphasis is placed on explaining the terminology.

As with teachers and head teachers, working together was considered by many pupils to be an important aspect of enterprise in education.

Able to work with others and give ideas.

Team work gets the job done faster.

The majority of pupils' ideas were concerned with attitudes and values, some looked at business aspects and some dealt with the community. Very few of the definitions related directly to school life. Pupils described being enterprising as:

Ambitious, energetic.

Doing something for charity, doing stuff for schools in your community.

Need to be patient, need to have talents, one person can be good at one thing and others at something else.

Someone who might set up a business.

Being in charge of, looking after or being responsible for something.

When you get an idea and go ahead with it.

Pupils felt that they learned such things as taking responsibility and how to organise things. They talked about being able to take charge, to have good ideas and solutions and to put their skills into practice.

DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

The schools in this study had wide views of what it means to be enterprising, which ranged from tackling discrete enterprise projects to the embedding of an enterprising approach that permeated the whole curriculum. In some schools specific topics were tackled with incidental activities also taking place. It was found that during the time of this study the implementation of enterprise activities expanded.

There is debate about whether the term enterprise should be used as it has been suggested that pupils have no natural affinity with it (TNS System Three 2005). Deuchar (2007) contends that Scottish pupils as well as teachers need to be clear about the meaning of enterprise and of its links to citizenship. It can be argued that it is appropriate to use this terminology because pupils in this study were able to define and describe what it meant in their responses. In some primary schools teachers did use the terminology of enterprise. A number of teachers commented that in practical and oral tasks pupils were able to gain experience of real life situations and in one primary school the headteacher expressed the view that older pupils would be able to use the terminology of enterprise because it had been used to talk with them about their projects and they would be able to use business language to describe the jobs done.

Schools increased their commitment to enterprise in education; involvement in activities changed and developed during this study and the involvement of teachers increased as enterprise in education came to be seen as more diverse. It was found that several teachers became more comfortable with the whole idea of enterprise as the emphasis shifted from business type enterprise to have more of a focus on community and citizenship styles. One teacher commented that the skills behind tackling an enterprise project fitted in with the way she wanted to see her pupils work but felt that they could gain these from a community type project which she would feel more comfortable with. As this was the first time she had tackled an enterprise project she was guided by her stage partner but would now have the confidence to try other types of project as these fitted in better with her idea of what teaching was about, to support and help all pupils to develop fully. Teachers seemed comfortable with including a values approach to their enterprise practice and business type enterprise became less about making money and more about social entrepreneurship. (Deuchar, in Brownlow *et al.* 2004)

It appears that there is still a close association between enterprise in education and business in some people's minds and for some teachers enterprise in education is still associated with a business type project or topic. Pupils mentioned business type activities if these were the kinds of experiences they had been involved in. For several schools however enterprise in education has become part of the ethos of the school. Policy documentation from *Determined to Succeed* (2003) stressed the fact that enterprise in education was not just about business but about social and environmental aspects too. Concerns were expressed by some teachers about topics having a mainly money making business focus but there seems to be a definite shift in what is happening in primary schools from topics that had a mainly business focus, to those which look at environmental or community issues. Some teachers, especially in primary schools, seemed more at ease with the idea of social entrepreneurship where links are made to citizenship and to education for sustainability rather than the more traditional enterprise model of running a business.

Evidence from this study suggests that teachers are becomingly increasingly aware of the role of enterprise in education, not just as discrete activities but through the development of an enterprising approach. At the beginning of the study some teachers were unsure as to whether they were in fact involved in enterprise in education activities whereas by the end of the study, teachers were much more aware of issues related to enterprise in education in all its forms. Part of this could be due to the increased training opportunities for teachers, for the input into schools and local authorities by Enterprise Development Officers (EDOs) and to the fact that headteachers were responding to the advice and guidance given by such initiatives as *Determined to Succeed* (Scottish Executive 2002b).

Specific enterprise projects can be seen as one way to develop enterprising skills and attitudes. From the weight of evidence it would seem that the more opportunities a teacher gives for pupils to be enterprising in their approaches to all aspects of what they do, the better. It is difficult to identify one thing that

makes an impact on schools although teachers noted that enriching the curriculum and providing opportunities for pupils helped to make a good school. It can be argued therefore that it is important that pupils have a wide range of possible experiences and an enterprising approach would seem to be increasingly valued as an approach to teaching and learning. It can be asserted that in primary schools enterprise in education is used as a practical way of teaching and learning, to encourage pupils to take responsibility and give them an enhanced sense of ownership of what they are doing. There is also still debate over the best way to deliver enterprise in education in schools; an increase was found in the number and types of projects tackled in schools but there was also much more awareness of how an enterprising approach can permeate the whole curriculum. There is evidence of enthusiasm from those taking part, both teachers and pupils:

Enterprise can be seen as one way of motivating and involving the pupils in their learning and enriching the curriculum. Anything that's going to make that teaching more effective should be used. (head teacher)

CONCLUDING REMARKS

The findings illuminate the position of what is happening in a number of Scottish primary schools in relation to enterprise in education. There would seem to be some common issues. It emerged from this research that there is a range of interpretations of enterprise in education. Over the period of this study there have been changes in the ways that enterprise in education is perceived and implemented and the implementation of enterprise activities has expanded. Evidence from the data collected suggests that by the end of the study there was a much higher focus and awareness of what is meant by enterprise in all its forms and a much higher commitment to it.

Enterprise in education seems to have become more of a core and less of a marginal activity in the curriculum, although there is a variation in what happens from school to school. In primary schools there are more opportunities for cross curricular approaches and the introduction of *Curriculum for Excellence* (CfE) will further increase these opportunities. Attitudes would seem to have changed over the period of this research and the development of transferable or life skills would also seem to have become increasingly important in Scottish schools. It could be argued that the curriculum should be integrated through an enterprising approach rather than enterprise being integrated into the curriculum. The capabilities of CfE (Scottish Executive 2004b) may enable teachers to have the confidence to develop a more enterprising curriculum although the specific impact of involvement in enterprise activities on pupils' attitudes and perceptions is difficult to separate from other activities. The feeling about enterprise in education throughout this study was generally positive as it was seen as a challenging way to make the curriculum more real and relevant to the pupils. However, previous initiatives have been introduced but not sustained. If enterprise in education is to continue to be a major focus then it has to become an embedded part of the school curriculum. The capacities of CfE are designed to provide opportunities for schools to have a more flexible approach towards the

curriculum and this may enable enterprise education to become more embedded.

The way forward?

Enterprise in education is linked to wider policy initiatives. CfE (Scottish Executive 2004b) is based around values, purposes and principles and aims to streamline the curriculum. The four purposes look at the development of confident individuals, successful learners, responsible citizens and effective contributors to society. CfE aims to give teachers the freedom to make choices, to be more enterprising in their approaches and to encourage pupils to take more responsibility for their own learning. It is possible to argue that using an enterprising approach to teaching and learning helps to develop these capacities. One Scottish view of an enterprising approach looks at the five principles of: giving pupils' responsibility, making learning real, taking roles, providing relevance and encouraging reflection (Jackson & Duncan 2007). *Curriculum for Excellence* Social Studies draft experiences and outcomes for People in Society, Economy and Business (Scottish Executive 2007) explicitly mention aspects of enterprise such as ethical trading and running a business enterprise as well as looking at developing roles and responsibilities. *How Good is Our School? The Journey to Excellence* (HMIE 2006, 2007) links ten dimensions of excellence to CfE and to enterprising approaches to learning and teaching and these links need to be researched further. Further links also need to be explored between enterprising approaches and the principles of *Curriculum for Excellence* of challenge and enjoyment, breadth, progression, depth, personalisation and choice, coherence and relevance (Scottish executive 2004b).

Although this study looks at the picture of enterprise education in Scotland, one recommendation from the analysis of enterprise education in the five countries is the possibility of cross country studies on the impact of enterprise education and this may be an area for future research (Semple, 2007).

While the focus of this research is on enterprise in education it can be argued that an enterprising approach to teaching and learning is about good practice and therefore is not a new initiative. It can be contended that an enterprising approach to learning will be more effective and engaging for the pupils when teachers use different teaching styles to promote active learning, critical thinking skills, decision making, collaborative group work, experiential learning and problem solving (Smith & Brownlow 2005; Jackson & Duncan 2007). What constitutes an enterprising approach to teaching and learning and how this translates into classroom practice is an area for further research at a time when CfE is in the process of being implemented in Scottish schools.

REFERENCES

- Bricheno, P. & Thornton, M. (2007) Role model, hero or champion? Children's views concerning role models, *Educational research*, 49(4), 383-396.
- Brownlow, L., Connor, M., Deuchar, R., Forster, M., & Weir, D. (2004) *Schools Enterprise Programme Research Project: The Educational and Economic Benefits of Enterprise Education*, SEP.

- Brownlow, L., Twiddle, B. & Watt, D. (1998) *Go for Enterprise*, Glasgow: Scottish Centre for Enterprise Education.
- Callaghan, J. (1976) *Towards a National Debate, The Prime Minister's Ruskin Speech*. Online at <http://www.open2net/schoolday/standards.html> (accessed 28/10/05).
- CBI Scotland (2000) *Rethinking Scotland's Skills Agenda*, CBI Brief.
- Deuchar, R. (2004) Changing paradigms-the potential of enterprise education for promoting and enhancing education for active and responsible citizenship: illustrations from a Scottish perspective, *Oxford Review of Education*, 30(3), 222-239.
- Deuchar, R. (2007) *Citizenship, enterprise and learning; harmonising competing educational agendas*, Stoke on Trent: Trentham Books.
- Fagan, C. (2006) Three Es for teachers: economics, enterprise and entrepreneurship, *Teacher Development*, 10(3), 275-291.
- HMIE (2004) *Quality Indicators in Enterprise in Education*, Edinburgh: HMIE.
- HMIE (2006) *How Good is Our School? The Journey to Excellence Part 1 and Part 2*, Livingston: HMIE.
- HMIE (2007) *How Good is Our School? The Journey to Excellence Part 3*, Livingston: HMIE.
- Howard Davies (2002) *A Review of Enterprise and the Economy in Education*. Norwich: HMSO.
- Jackson, A. & Duncan, J. (2007) *Enterprising Ideas for Primary Schools within a Curriculum for Excellence*. Glasgow: Centre for Studies in Enterprise, Career Development and Work, University of Strathclyde.
- Langford, L. & Aitken, C. (2005) *Benchmarking Research of Young People's Perceptions of Enterprise*, Scottish Executive Social Research/Synovate. Online at <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2005/04/13141331/13326> (accessed 15/04/08).
- Learning and Teaching Scotland (2002) *Education for Citizenship in Scotland: a paper for Discussion and Development*, Dundee: LTS.
- OECD (2007) *Reviews of National Policies for Education: Quality and Equity of Schooling in Scotland*, Paris: OECD Publishing.
- Ofsted (2004) *Learning to be Enterprising*, Ofsted.
- Ofsted (2005) *Developing Enterprising Young People*, Ofsted.
- Osler, D. (2003) Preach, but also lead by example, *TES Scotland Plus*, 13/06/03, p5.
- Rodger, J. & Hunter, A. (2007) *National Evaluation of Determined to Succeed-Phase 2: Early Impact Across Scotland*, Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department. Online at <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2007/1905615/0> (accessed 9/10/07).
- Scottish Executive (2001) *A Smart Successful Scotland: Ambitions for the Enterprise Networks*. Online at <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library3/JPTfinal.pdf> (accessed 09/08/04).
- Scottish Executive (2002a) *Measuring Scotland's Progress towards a Smart Successful Scotland*. Online at <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library3/JPTfinal.pdf> (accessed 09/08/04).
- Scottish Executive (2002b) *Determined to Succeed: A Review of Enterprise in Education*, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive.
- Scottish Executive (2003) *Determined to Succeed: Enterprise in Education –Scottish Executive Response*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive.
- Scottish Executive (2004a) *Determined to Succeed: One Year On*, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive.
- Scottish Executive (2004b) *A Curriculum for Excellence*. Online at <http://www.curriculumforexcellencescotland.gov.uk/index.asp> (accessed 08/01/07).
- Scottish Executive (2007) *Curriculum for Excellence Draft experiences and outcomes; Social Studies*. Online at <http://www.ltscotland.org.uk/curriculumforexcellence/outcomes/socialstudies/index.asp> (accessed 07/09/08).
- Scottish Executive (2005a) *Excellence through Enterprise, National Guidance: Enterprise in Education*, Glasgow: Learning and Teaching Scotland.

- Scottish Executive (2005b) *Focusing on enterprise in education: a paper for professional reflection*, Glasgow: Learning and Teaching Scotland.
- Scottish Executive (2006) *Determined to Succeed: Three Years On*. Online at <http://www.ltscotland.org.uk/enterpriseineducation/images/dts> (accessed 11/01/08)
- Scottish Executive (2007) *Evaluation of the Whole School Approach to Enterprise in Education*. Online at http://www.scotland.gov.uk/social_research (accessed 11/01/08).
- Semple, S. & Brownlow, L. (2004) *The role of parents and families in Enterprise in Education*, Glasgow: Centre for Studies in Enterprise, Career Development and Work, University of Strathclyde.
- Semple, S., Paris, M., McCartney, P. & Twiddle, B. (2002) *Learning Gains from Education for Work*, Interchange 74, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive.
- Semple, S. (2007) *Enterprise Education in Schools in the Five Countries*. Glasgow: Centre for Studies in Enterprise, Career Development and Work, University of Strathclyde.
- Smith, M. & Brownlow, L. (2005) *The Enterprising School*. Glasgow: Centre for Studies in Enterprise, Career Development and Work, University of Strathclyde.
- TNS System Three (2005a) *Enterprise in Education, SME Survey*. Online at http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/lifelong/eess_03.asp (accessed 18/10/07)
- Twiddle, B. & Watt, D. (1995) *Enterprising Infants*. Glasgow: SEP.