



## Durham E-Theses

---

### *Mulla Sadra and the mind-body problem: A critical assessment of Sadra's approach to the dichotomy of soul and spirit*

Daftari, Abdulaziz

#### How to cite:

---

Daftari, Abdulaziz (2010) *Mulla Sadra and the mind-body problem: A critical assessment of Sadra's approach to the dichotomy of soul and spirit*, Durham theses, Durham University. Available at Durham E-Theses Online: <http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/506/>

#### Use policy

---

The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that:

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a [link](#) is made to the metadata record in Durham E-Theses
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the [full Durham E-Theses policy](#) for further details.

---

Academic Support Office, Durham University, University Office, Old Elvet, Durham DH1 3HP  
e-mail: [e-theses.admin@dur.ac.uk](mailto:e-theses.admin@dur.ac.uk) Tel: +44 0191 334 6107  
<http://etheses.dur.ac.uk>

**Mulla Sadra and the mind-body problem:  
A critical assessment of Sadra's approach to the  
dichotomy of soul and spirit**

**By:**

**Abdulaziz Daftari**

**A Thesis Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of  
Philosophy**

**2010**

**University of Durham  
United Kingdom**

## **Statement of Copyright**

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author. No quotation from it should be published without prior written consent from Abdulaziz Daftari and information derived from it should be acknowledged.

## **Declaration**

I, the author of this thesis, declare that none of the materials in this thesis have been submitted in support of an application for any other degree qualification in this or any other university.

## **Dedication**

I dedicate this thesis to my wife and children who have supported me throughout the years of my study, especially in the years that I was working on this thesis.

## **Acknowledgements**

My special thanks and gratitude go to my supervisor, Dr Colin Paul Turner (Durham University) who painstakingly guided me through all my work with his suggestions and critical comments.

Many thanks are due to the staff at Durham University library who always provided me with the best resources.

I would also like to express my gratitude to my family and friends back at home who never hesitated to provide assistance.

Finally, I wish to express my gratitude to my wife who has always been beside me showing great patience and sharing my concerns throughout these years.

## Abstract

The presence of some ambiguity about the two terms of soul and spirit, which up until now has not been considered, has been investigated in this research. This ambiguity has created problems in different fields of study such as philosophy, psychology and commentaries of religious texts. This is because the two words are usually used synonymously.

The main aim of this research is to investigate whether the human being has an independent spirit in addition to the body and the soul or not. In other words it is attempting to establish if man is a tripartite existence made of body, soul and spirit.

In order to attain this aim the ideas of various philosophers are discussed on different subjects regarding the soul with particular attention to the philosophical system introduced in the seventeenth century AD by the Muslim philosopher, Sadr al-din Shirazi. This consisted of two other philosophical systems in Islamic philosophy, peripatetic (*mashā*) and illuminative (*'ishrāq*) combined with mystical and religious teachings. His idea about the soul was set as the basis for the arguments regarding the soul and the ideas of other philosophers were compared to it.

This research explores the principles that form Sadra's beliefs about the soul. One of Sadra's principles, the fundamentality of existence, is explained. This principle aims to prove the reality of the external world and the soul as one of these realities. The topics of motion and time and the views of philosophers about these are cited. In addition, another Sadra's important principles, trans-substantial motion, is mentioned and explained and it is suggested that the difference between Sadra's and other philosophers' ideas about the soul lies in accepting or rejecting motion in substance. According to Sadra, the soul which is material at the beginning of its creation moves towards immateriality by trans-substantial motion.

Then philosophers' ideas about the soul are mentioned as well as their disagreements regarding different issues such as immateriality, motion, origination of the soul etc. In addition, the problem that Sadra's philosophical system faces in regard to the soul is discussed in particular since it is the main aim of this research.

It is concluded that Sadra's idea is more complete than the other ideas regarding the soul. The existence of the soul found a better justification in this idea. The problem of dualism of the soul and body with which other philosophers were faced has been resolved. Meanwhile the problem of this philosophical idea which sees the soul to be the same as the spirit was investigated and it was stated that this problem has caused many diversities of opinion between philosophers in subjects related to the soul. The propounded solution for all the cases was to accept the dichotomy of the soul and spirit. Religious texts have been classified, analysed and used to support this idea and by using different evidences it was confirmed that the soul and the spirit are two independent substances and that the human being is a tripartite existence.

# Table of Contents

<b>Statement of Copyright</b> .....	<b>II</b>
<b>Declaration</b> .....	<b>II</b>
<b>Dedication</b> .....	<b>III</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>IV</b>
<b>Abstract</b> .....	<b>V</b>
<b>Table of Contents</b> .....	<b>VI</b>
<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>1. Chapter One: A Brief Review of Mulla Sadra and his Philosophical System</b> .....	<b>20</b>
1.1. Introduction .....	20
1.2. His life .....	21
1.2.1. His Children .....	22
1.2.2. His Intellectual life .....	23
1.2.3. His students .....	27
1.2.4. The Main Influential Scholars and Sources .....	28
1.2.5. His belief in Quran and traditions .....	31
1.2.6. His power of intuition .....	32
1.3. His Personality and Situation .....	32
1.4. Foundations and Basic Principles of Sadra’s Philosophy .....	34
1.5. Mulla Sadra’s Works .....	36
1.5.1. Philosophical texts .....	37
1.5.2. Philosophical descriptions and comments .....	39
1.5.3. Philosophical treatises .....	39
1.5.4. Commentaries on Quran and the Traditions .....	42
1.5.5. Logic .....	43
1.5.6. Theological works .....	44
1.5.7. Mystical and Ethical Works .....	45
1.5.8. Literary Works .....	46
1.5.9. Other Works .....	46
1.5.10. Mulla Sadra’s Most Important Books in the Order that they Were Written .....	48
1.6. Conclusion .....	49
<b>2. Chapter Two: Fundamentality of Existence</b> .....	<b>50</b>
2.1. Introduction .....	50
2.2. An important point .....	52



2.3.	Existence ( <i>wujūd</i> ) .....	54
2.3.1.	The first meaning of existence: having external correspondence ( <i>miṣḍāq</i> ) .....	56
2.3.2.	The second meaning of existence .....	57
2.4.	Quiddity ( <i>māhīyya</i> ) .....	58
2.5.	The terms fundamental ( <i>aṣīl</i> ) and subjective ( <i>i'tibārī</i> ) .....	58
2.6.	The terms essential ( <i>bil-dhāt</i> ) and accidental ( <i>bil-'araḍ</i> ) .....	59
2.7.	An overview of the notion of the fundamentality of existence .....	62
2.8.	Arguments for fundamentality of existence .....	63
2.9.	Some ramifications of the fundamentality of existence .....	69
2.9.1.	The gradation of being ( <i>Tashkīk-i wujūd</i> ) .....	69
2.9.2.	Motion in Substance (trans-substantial motion) .....	70
2.9.3.	The question of the soul .....	71
2.9.4.	Other issues connected with the fundamentality of existence .....	71
2.10.	Conclusion .....	72
<b>3.</b>	<b>Chapter three: Motion .....</b>	<b>74</b>
3.1.	Introduction .....	74
3.2.	Constancy and change .....	75
3.2.1.	Philosophers who believed in absolute constancy .....	75
3.2.2.	Philosophers who Believed in Change .....	76
3.2.3.	Aristotle's Thoughts on Constancy and Change .....	77
3.2.4.	Change in Accident ( <i>'araḍ</i> ) and Change in Substance ( <i>jawhar</i> ) .....	78
3.2.5.	Thoughts on Constancy and Change in Islamic Philosophy .....	78
3.3.	Motion .....	80
3.3.1.	Introduction .....	80
3.3.2.	Time or Flowing Extension .....	80
3.3.3.	Stable and flowing extensions .....	82
3.3.4.	Issues Unrelated to Time and Issues Related to Time .....	85
3.3.4.1.	Issues Unrelated to Time .....	85
3.3.4.2.	Issues Related to Time .....	86
3.3.4.3.	The terms instant ( <i>'ān</i> ), instantaneous ( <i>'ānī</i> ) and temporal ( <i>zamānī</i> ) .....	88
3.4.	Kinds of Change.....	88
3.4.1.	Instantaneous change .....	89
3.4.2.	Gradual temporal change adapted to time (traversed movement)	90
3.4.3.	Temporal change not adapted to time (medial movement) .....	91
3.4.4.	Generation and annihilation .....	92
3.5.	Ideas of Muslim Philosophers on the Three Kinds of Movement .....	93
3.5.1.	Ibn Sina (Avicenna) .....	93
3.5.2.	Abul Hassan Bahmanyār .....	94
3.5.3.	Fakhr al-Din al-Razī .....	95
3.5.4.	Mir Dāmād .....	96
3.5.5.	Mulla Sadra .....	97
3.5.5.1.	Mulla Sadra's Thoughts on Generation and Annihilation ..	97
3.6.	To which Category does Motion Belong .....	98
3.7.	Prerequisites of motion ( <i>lawāzim-i ḥarika</i> ) .....	100
3.7.1.	Beginning ( <i>mabda'</i> ) .....	101

3.7.2. Extremity ( <i>montahā</i> ) .....	101
3.7.3. Time ( <i>zamān</i> ) .....	102
3.7.4. Object of Motion ( <i>mawḍū' yā mutaharrik</i> ) .....	105
3.7.4.1. The first argument .....	105
3.7.4.2. The second argument .....	107
3.7.4.3. The third argument .....	107
3.7.4.4. The Body ( <i>jism</i> ) is the Object of Motion .....	110
3.7.5. Motion agent ( <i>fā'il</i> ) .....	111
3.7.5.1. The division of motion as compared with the mover ( <i>muḥarrik</i> ) .....	111
3.7.6. Distance .....	112
3.7.6.1. Instantaneous and flowing unit of distance.....	112
3.7.6.2. Unity of Distance, Motion and Time in the External World .	116
3.7.6.3. The Meaning of Motion in Substance .....	117
3.8. Conclusion .....	117
<b>4. Chapter Four: Trans-Substantial Motion .....</b>	<b>119</b>
4.1. Introduction .....	119
4.2. Trans-substantial motion .....	120
4.2.1. A perspective of trans-substantial motion .....	120
4.2.2. More details about the subject .....	125
4.3. Considering the object of motion ( <i>mawḍū'-i ḥarika</i> ) in more detail ...	126
4.3.1. The main problem which caused the denial of motion in substances .....	127
4.3.2. The object in the role of a substance which does not need a location ( <i>mahall-i mustaghni</i> ) .....	128
4.3.3. The object in the role of matter ( <i>mādda</i> ) or recipient ( <i>qābil</i> ) to accept motion .....	129
4.3.4. The object in the role of preserver of unity .....	133
4.3.5. Conclusion .....	136
4.3.6. Pointing out a difficulty regarding motion in substance by Ibn Sina and the response given by Mulla Sadra .....	136
4.4. Arguments on Trans-substantial Motion .....	140
4.4.1. The argument that substance is adapted to time.....	140
4.4.2. The argument that substance is the cause of accidents .....	140
4.4.3. The argument that there are not two fabrications ( <i>ja'1</i> ) .....	141
4.4.4. The argument that accidents personify the substance .....	142
4.4.5. The argument that generation and annihilation is false .....	142
4.4.6. The argument that proves specific forms have finality .....	143
4.4.7. The argument that the essential features of some substances can change over time .....	143
4.5. Conclusion: Generalization of motion to all nature ( <i>tabi'a</i> ) .....	144
4.6. The relation between the ever-changing ( <i>mutaghayyir</i> ) and the permanent ( <i>thabit</i> ) .....	146
4.6.1. Introduction .....	146
4.6.2. Stating the problem .....	146
4.6.2.1. The rule which says "the cause of that which is changing must also be changing" .....	147

4.6.2.2.	Simple fabrication ( <i>ja'l-i basīt</i> ) and composite fabrication ( <i>ja'l-i ta'līfī</i> ) .....	148
4.6.2.3.	The rule "essential issue does not need to be made and accidental issue needs to be made" .....	152
4.6.2.4.	Explanation of the problem .....	152
4.6.2.5.	The solutions of the problem by philosophers before Mulla Sadra .....	153
4.6.2.6.	The solutions of Suhriwardī and his followers .....	153
4.6.2.7.	Mulla Sadra's main solution .....	156
4.6.2.8.	The divine agent and natural agent .....	159
4.6.2.9.	Division into stable and flowing .....	160
4.7.	Conclusion .....	165
<b>5.</b>	<b>Chapter five: considering issues of the soul and the spirit .....</b>	<b>167</b>
5.1.	Introduction .....	167
5.2.	The ideas of the classical Western philosophers regarding the soul ..	170
5.2.1.	Plato's idea about the soul .....	170
5.2.2.	Aristotle's idea about the soul .....	171
5.2.2.1.	The relation between the soul and the body according to Aristotle .....	172
5.2.3.	Plotinus' idea about the soul .....	174
5.3.	The soul-body relationship in contemporary philosophy and psychology .....	175
5.3.1.	Freud's idea .....	176
5.3.2.	Idea of Marxism .....	176
5.3.3.	Behaviours' idea .....	176
5.3.4.	Gestalt's idea .....	177
5.3.5.	Some epistemologists' idea .....	177
5.4.	Islamic philosophers' ideas about the soul .....	178
5.4.1.	Some Muslim philosophers' definitions of the soul .....	178
5.4.1.1.	Ibn Sina's definition .....	178
5.4.1.2.	Tabātabā'ī's definition .....	179
5.4.1.3.	Mulla Sadra's definition .....	179
5.4.2.	The general ideas about the soul .....	181
5.4.2.1.	Peripatetic and Ibn Sina's idea .....	181
5.4.2.2.	Supporters of the notion of metempsychosis ( <i>tanāsukhīyya</i> ) .....	181
5.4.2.3.	Mulla Sadra and many Gnostics' idea .....	181
5.4.3.	The Relation between the Soul and the Body .....	187
5.4.4.	Mulla Sadra's problem regarding the differentiation between the soul and the spirit .....	190
5.5.	The issues about which philosophers have differing opinions .....	192
5.5.1.	The soul's immateriality or materiality .....	192
5.5.1.1.	Some philosophers' ideas about the soul and its immateriality .....	193
5.5.1.1.1.	Plato's idea .....	193
5.5.1.1.2.	Islamic Peripatetic philosophers' idea like Ibn Sina and Bahmanyar.....	194

5.5.1.1.3.	The summary of Mulla Sadra's idea .....	194
5.5.1.1.4.	Tabātabā'ī's idea .....	195
5.5.1.2.	Arguments about the immateriality of the soul .....	196
5.5.1.3.	The reasons to prove the materiality of the soul (i.e. the soul is moving) .....	199
5.5.2.	Origination or pre-eternity of the soul .....	202
5.5.2.1.	The idea of the people who exaggerate things ( <i>ghulāt</i> ) ....	202
5.5.2.2.	Believers in metempsychosis's idea ( <i>Tanāsukhiyya</i> ) .....	202
5.5.2.3.	Nazzām al-dīn Herawī's idea .....	203
5.5.2.4.	Plato's idea .....	203
5.5.2.5.	Some of the philosophers and theologians' idea .....	203
5.5.2.6.	The majority of philosophers and theologians before Mulla Sadra, like Ibn Sina .....	203
5.5.2.7.	Mulla Sadra's idea .....	204
5.5.3.	Unity or multiplicity of the soul .....	208
5.5.3.1.	Plato's notion .....	208
5.5.3.2.	The idea of Muslim Peripatetics such as Ibn Sina and his followers .....	208
5.5.3.3.	Mulla Sadra and some of his followers .....	208
5.5.4.	Multiplicity of the soul and the problem of inner conflict .....	209
5.5.4.1.	The soul and the problem of multiplicity of faculties .....	211
5.5.4.2.	A suggestion to solve the problem of internal conflict .....	212
5.5.5.	Evidences to support the differentiation .....	212
5.5.5.1.	Mulla Sadra recounted a tale of Gnostics .....	213
5.5.5.2.	Second evidence of gnostics' writings .....	215
5.5.6.	Metempsychosis of the soul .....	216
5.5.7.	Active and passive intellect ( <i>'aql-i fa'āl wa monfa'il</i> ) .....	217
<b>6.</b>	<b>Chapter six: The traditional evidences about the soul and the spirit</b> .....	<b>222</b>
6.1.	Introduction .....	222
6.1.1.	The intended meaning of the soul and the spirit .....	222
6.2.	Consideration of the Quranic verses on the soul and the spirit .....	224
6.2.1.	Considering the verses about the spirit .....	224
6.2.2.	Reality of the spirit .....	225
6.2.3.	The realm of Divine Command .....	226
6.2.4.	The meaning of the spirit that was breathed into man .....	227
6.2.5.	Considering the verses about the soul .....	230
6.2.6.	Reality of the soul .....	232
6.2.7.	Are the soul and the spirit the same .....	233
6.2.8.	The first evidence: The meaning of Adam's proportionment ( <i>taswīya</i> ) .....	234
6.2.9.	The second evidence: Human being is an existence with two spirits .....	239
6.2.10.	The third evidence: the subject of the angels' prostration before Adam .....	244
6.2.11.	A supplementary to the third evidence: A discussion on human lifetime and primary humans .....	247

6.2.12.	The fourth evidence: The attribution of divine rewards and punishments only to the soul .....	249
6.2.13.	Two supplements for the fourth evidence .....	250
6.2.14.	The fifth evidence: The human spirit is an independent substance .....	253
6.2.15.	Conclusion .....	255
6.3.	Considering the Traditions about the soul and the spirit .....	256
6.3.1.	Introduction .....	256
6.3.2.	Traditions which clearly say that every human is made of three parts: body, soul and spirit .....	257
6.3.3.	The Traditions which hold that man has several spirits .....	264
6.3.4.	The traditions which hold that man has an inner guidance .....	270
6.3.5.	The traditions which state that the human being has an inward guidance .....	270
6.3.6.	Traditions which explain the intellect and its functions .....	271
6.3.7.	Traditions concerning sincerity in action .....	274
6.3.8.	The conclusion of these three groups of traditions .....	276
6.4.	Whether the different kinds of spirit mentioned previously are separate substances or not .....	276
6.4.1.	The Holy Spirit ( <i>rūḥ al-qudus</i> ) .....	277
6.4.2.	The spirit of faith ( <i>rūḥ al-'īmān</i> ) .....	278
6.4.3.	The spirit of life ( <i>rūḥ al-ḥayāt</i> ), the spirit of power ( <i>rūḥ al-qowwa</i> ) and the spirit of lust ( <i>rūḥ al-shahwa</i> ) .....	280
6.5.	The divine trust ( <i>'amānat-i 'ilāhī</i> ) .....	281
6.6.	Conclusion .....	281
	<b>General Conclusion .....</b>	<b>283</b>
	<b>Questions for future research .....</b>	<b>290</b>
	<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>292</b>