The Open
Jniversity

Open Research Online

The Open University's repository of research publications and other research outputs

The effect of fire on tree–grass coexistence in savannas: a simulation study

Journal Item

How to cite:

Lehsten, Veiko; Arneth, Almut; Spessa, Allan; Thonicke, Kirsten and Moustakas, Aristides (2015). The effect of fire on tree–grass coexistence in savannas: a simulation study. International Journal of Wildland Fire, 25(2) pp. 137–146.

For guidance on citations see [FAQs.](http://oro.open.ac.uk/help/helpfaq.html)

(c) Not Known

Version: Accepted Manuscript

Link(s) to article on publisher's website: <http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.1071/WF14205> <http://dx.doi.org/10.1071/WF14205>

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online's data [policy](http://oro.open.ac.uk/policies.html) on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.

oro.open.ac.uk

The effect of fire on tree -grass coexistence in savannas: a simulation study

ABSTRACT

The savanna biome has the highest amount of burned area globally. While the global distribution of

most biomes can be predicted successfully from climatic variables, savannas are an exception.

Attempts to dynamically model the distribution of savannas, including a realistically varying tree to

grass ratio are fraught with difficulties. In a simulation study using the dynamic vegetation model LPJ -

GUESS we investigate the effect of fire on the tree-grass ratios as well as the biome distribution on the

African continent. We performed simulations at three spatial scales: locally, at four sites inside Kruger

National Park (SA); regionally, along a precipitation gradient; and for the African continent.

We evaluated the model using results of a fire experiment and found that the model underestimates the

effect of fires on tree cover partially.

On regional scale, high frequencies were able to prevent trees from out-competing grasses in mesic

regions between ca. 700 to 900 mm MAP. Across the African continent incorporation of fire improved

notably the simulated distribution of the savanna biome. Our model results confirm the role of fire in

determining savanna distributions, a notion that has been challenged by competing theories of tree-

grass coexistence.

Abstract for TOC (50 words for a more general audience)

A dynamic vegetation model is used to assess the effect of fire on tree to grass ratios and the African

savanna biome distribution. High fire frequencies were found to maintain tree grass co-existence under

regionally, along a precipitation gradient; and for the African
del using results of a fire experiment and found that the mode
cover partially.
gh frequencies were able to prevent trees from out-competing
700 to 900 mm MAP mesic conditions (700 to 900 mm MAP) and the incorporation of fire substantially improved

continental simulations of biomes.

INTRODUCTION

ied to differ depending on life-history stages. Savannas can the brium' systems where frequent disturbance (i.e. fire or grazine at of tree dominance (Sankaran *et al.* 2004).
For Review of tree dominance (Sankaran *et al.* compete for water in the first soil layer where grasses outcompete trees. Trees are able to persist in the system because of exclusive access to deeper water (Sankaran *et al.* 2004; but see also February and Higgins 2010 who found instances where grasses also accessed deeper water). The second suite of hypotheses ('demographic bottleneck models') relies on recurring disturbance events to prevent trees from dominating over grasses. Grasses are considered to be favoured by fires since the fires occur in the dry season when the above ground biomass of the grasses is already desiccated leading to minor damage only. Contrary to the grasses, tree susceptibility to these disturbances is assumed to differ depending on life-history stages. Savannas can thus be viewed as transitional 'disequilibrium' systems where frequent disturbance (i.e. fire or grazing) prevents reaching the stable state of tree dominance (Sankaran *et al.* 2004). Apart from analyses relating vegetation and fire to each other, many studies investigated properties of savanna fires (see for example Hoffmann *et al.* 2003 for the effect of fires on above ground biomass and Govender *et al.* 2006 for the effect of fuel on fire intensity). Definitive testing of these explanatory models can only be conducted using large field manipulation experiments. But such multi-factorial experiments, comparing the effects of different mechanisms, are currently lacking, although experiments have been performed testing whether a single mechanism is acting (e.g. for a review of root partitioning between woody and herbaceous species see Schenk and Jackson 2002). Despite the attempts to explain the co-occurrence of trees and grasses in the past by single mechanisms, Murphy and Bowman (2012) concluded in a review that savannas are complex systems in which forest and grassland dominated vegetation can be viewed as fire mediated alternative stable states. They developed a conceptual model of savanna occurrence which included fire activity, water and nutrient availability and suggested that the ability of dynamic vegetation models to accurately reproduce vegetation pattern should be used to validate the underlying conceptual models. In this study, we aim at providing improved understanding of savanna vegetation dynamics focussing at the effects of wildfires. We use a dynamic vegetation model for the African continent to assess the potential effect of wildfires on the tree to grass ratio. We also investigate under which environmental

conditions (i.e. mean annual precipitation) wildfires are able to maintain tree grass coexistence. We

ear and depends only on the amount of light reaching the grouperiments performed in this study we additionally include a res which scales root water uptake exponentially with an exponent of unity in the standard water upta Fire properties are calculated depending on the fuel quality (type, moisture), fuel quantity (calculated by LPJ-GUESS-SPITFIRE) and the climate (which is read in). Trees can either be damaged by the fire, resulting in a loss of biomass (esp. leafs), or they can be killed. If a tree is killed by a fire, all biomass which has not been burned (above and below ground) is transferred to the litter carbon pool. All individuals establish from seeds, re-sprouting is not implemented in the model. For each simulated grid cell a number of replicate patches are simulated (see below) and the results are averaged to account for stochastic effects of senescence and establishment or fire events. Re-establishment of trees can occur once per year and depends only on the amount of light reaching the ground. For the simulation experiments performed in this study we additionally include a modified water uptake routine for trees which scales root water uptake exponentially with an exponent of 0.6 compared to the exponent of unity in the standard water uptake routine of LPJ-GUESS (Sitch *et al.* 2003). This increases water uptake under dry conditions, since initial runs (data not shown) have shown that the standard water uptake routine as in Sitch *et al.* (2003), and Gerten *et al.* (2004) underestimated tree biomass in seasonally dry areas. Grasses retain the original linear water uptake scheme. All parameter settings of the plant functional types in the simulations are similar to Lehsten *et al.* (2009), except for the additional plant functional type 'shrub'. This PFT retains all plant specific parameters from the tropical broad leaved raingreen tree PFT (Sitch *et al.* 2003) but with changes in two allometric parameters: the linear factor in the height – diameter relationship (Sitch *et al.*, 2003) 150 was set to one eighth of the value used for trees and the maximum crown diameter was set to 10 $m²$ 151 (compared to 27 m² used for trees; Sitch *et al.*, 2003). These settings result in a PFT with considerably lower total height and stem diameter compared to the PFT tropical broadleaved raingreen tree, but retains all other characteristics such as phenology or root distribution from this PFT. This plant type has a considerably higher chance of being killed by a fire, caused by it lower height, though moist fuels or low fuel loads can lead to flame heights below the height of the shrub and hence allow the shrub to survive a low intensity fire. Additionally to the changes mentioned above, phenology has been adapted to assure that the leaves are shed in the beginning of the dry season and not at the end of the calendar year as in the original LPJ-GUESS version (for details see Lehsten *et al.* 2009).

Climate data

- *Patch scale simulations*
- We artificially prescribed fire frequency along a precipitation gradient from 100 to 1400 mm annually
- (MAP), spaced over approximately 1100 km (Fig. 1). This allows assessing the main effects of fire on

vegetation, without it being confounded by other factors. We prescribed a burning probability 189 corresponding to a fire return interval of 1, 2, 4, 8, 16 and ∞ years. While the average fire return interval of evergreen tropical forest was estimated to be around 500 years, the fire regime in African savannas may cover the full range from more than 1000 years (virtually no fire) to annual fire according to Scholes *et al.* (1996). For our simulation experiment, fire is simulated to occur on December 15, coinciding with the peak of the seasonal distribution of burned area in northern hemisphere sub-Saharan Africa (Fig. 2) identified from MODIS MCD45A1 data (Roy, *et al.* 2008; http://modis-fire.umd.edu/MCD45A1.asp).

Tree cover data from experimental plots

Ledu/MCD45A1.asp).

experimental plots

n the Kruger National Park (KNP), South Africa between Fe

nated in the savannas of north-eastern South Africa, and cove

getation in the park is mainly characterized by dense savann Data were collected in the Kruger National Park (KNP), South Africa between February and March 2010. The park is situated in the savannas of north-eastern South Africa, and covers an area of $200 \sim 19,633 \text{ km}^2$. The vegetation in the park is mainly characterized by dense savanna dominated by Acacia and Combretum species. Within the park there are long-term Experimental Burning Plots (EBPs) where fire is manipulated as a treatment since more than 50 years and thus KNP is an ideal environment for comparing fire effects on vegetation (Govender *et al.* 2006; Higgins *et al.* 2007). Each replicate plot consists of different experimental burning treatments as well as a control treatment (no fire) and each treatment is implemented in a 7-ha plot in a split-plot randomized design (see Fig. 2a in Moustakas 2015). The burning treatments include several experiments manipulating fire return interval (burning every 1, 2, 3, 4, and 6 year) as well as fire seasonality. We have used annual burning every August which is the dry season and the control treatment that excludes fire. We have decided against using the 3, 4, and 6 year burning treatments since we were not able to obtain tree cover estimates for the 4 year burning and our simulations did not contain burning every 3 or every 6 years. Tree cover data were collected in 2009 at the sites: Mopani (496 mm MAP), Satara (544 mm MAP), Skukuza (550 mm MAP) and Pretoriuskop (737mm MAP). The fractional tree cover was estimated using the Kendall-Moran algorithm (KM2P; Kendal and Moran 1963). The KM2P algorithm estimates tree cover based upon the distance to the second nearest neighbours of each tree. The KM2P was ranked amongst the best estimating methods of plant cover when sample size was around 25 focal

Vegetation data

We compared simulated vegetation distribution with and without wildfires to the map of potential

vegetation by Ramankutty and Foley (1999) that was derived on the basis of the 1km global satellite

- based DISCover land cover dataset (Loveland and Belward 1997). In contrast to Ramankutty and
- Foley (1999) who differentiated between savannas and tropical deciduous forest, we combined these
- classes into a single class 'savanna' because both classes seem to have a similar relationship to

(Tab. 1). Comparison between our simulated and the mappe
kutty and Foley (1999) was performed using the Kappa statis
pose of comparing vegetation maps (Monserud and Leemans
zero and one. Values below 0.05 indicate no; $0.$ wildfires (i.e. do not differ in their typical fire frequency) which leads to a fine-scaled mixture of both biomes in the southern hemisphere of Africa (Ratnam *et al.* 2011). After re-gridding the potential vegetation map to a one degree scale, the distribution of savanna and tropical deciduous forest exert a more or less random rather than an environmentally determined pattern. We therefore differentiate only rainforest, savanna, open shrubland, dense shrubland, grassland and desert (Fig. 5). The simulated mixture of plant functional types per grid-cell was converted into biome types applying the classification scheme of Hickler *et al.*(2006), adopted to match the potential vegetation classes for the African continent (Tab. 1). Comparison between our simulated and the mapped potential vegetation of Ramankutty and Foley (1999) was performed using the Kappa statistic, developed especially for the purpose of comparing vegetation maps (Monserud and Leemans 1992). Kappa values range between zero and one. Values below 0.05 indicate no; 0.05 – 0.20 very poor; 0.2 –0.4 poor; 0.4 – 0.55 fair; 0.55 – 0.7 good; and 0.7 – 0.85 very good agreement (Monserud and Leemans 1992). We calculated the Kappa statistic for each vegetation class as well as a global Kappa statistic combining all vegetation types. **Results** *Effects of fire on tree to grass ratio* Prescribing fire along the precipitation gradient did not affect the dominance of trees at the wet, and grasses at the dry end (Fig. 3). However, in regions between MAP of around 600 to 900 mm, fire prevented trees and shrubs from out-competing grasses, but only when the prescribed fire return interval was around eight years, or less. In these 'mid-mesic' regions, trees and grasses co-dominated at variable ratios depending on fire return interval. When fire was excluded, grasses reached a maximum cover of 0.4; while at frequent fire return intervals (e.g. annual fires) the maximum grass

Experimental tree cover data versus simulated tree cover data

cover simulated by LPJ-GUESS-SPITFIRE was up to 0.7 (Fig. 3).

To confront model outputs with observed data we plotted the tree cover percentage under annual burning, biennial burning and no burning aside the field data derived from the experimental burning plots from the Kruger National Park (Fig. 4). Results show that tree cover for the burned plots is underestimated by the model, while at unburned plots the simulated tree cover is in the range indicated by the experimental data. They also show that fire is having an clear effect on tree cover starting at ca 540 mm MAP (Mopani, Satara and Skukuza) while at Pretoriuskop the tree cover values are in a relatively small range (though the highest value is found in the unburned plot and the lowest in the annually burned plot in Pretoriuskop).

Vegetation-fire interactions on continental scale

in Pretoriuskop).
 Follow Textuary Confinental scale
 Followide Scale Simulation resulted in a notable expect towards the northern and southern direction, emergence a along the continent's south-east coastal regions and Excluding fire in an African-continental scale simulation resulted in a notable expansion of the equatorial rainforest belt towards the northern and southern direction, emergence of tropical evergreen plant functional types along the continent's south-east coastal regions and across the island of Madagascar (Fig. 5), compared to simulations that had fire prescribed. While the expansion of tropical rainforest vegetation was at the expense of savannas, the extension and location of shrublands was unaffected by the presence of fire. The Kappa-statistic for the comparison of the potential vegetation of Ramankutty and Foley (1999) to our simulations (Table 2) improved notably for the 'fire present' case, both for the vegetation classes 'tropical evergreen forest' and 'deciduous forest / savanna', as well as for the overall total.

Discussion

The predominant factors controlling the co-existence of trees and grasses in savanna ecosystems have

been of longstanding interest to ecological research (for a reiview see: Sankaran *et al.* 2004; Murphy

- and Bowman 2012). A number of hypotheses, including resources acquisition and demographic
- bottleneck models, have been put forward to explain observed vegetation patterns in savannas but as
- yet, no conclusive multi-factorial model that applies to all savanna environments has emerged. Our
- simulation study aims to contribute to efforts to develop such a general model, by investigating the
- role of wildfires in savanna vegetation dynamics.

A synthesis of tree cover for 854 savanna locations in Africa identified a strong effect of MAP on the

vegetation structure atop the climatic effects, although Sank
sistent response to herbivory. Regarding the role of soil and
tasets examining tree-grass interactions across precipitation is
and plant nutrient ratios did not tree to grass ratio (Sankaran *et al.* 2005). Soil physical properties that determine the water storage capacity are an additional key factor closely related to rainfall and that needs to be considered for a more process-based interpretation of a relationship between canopy structure and MAP (Sankaran *et al.* 2005). This data can be interpreted in terms of envelope functions that set an upper limit (*sensu* Sankaran *et al.*, 2005) or in terms of a sigmoidal function through the bulk of the data (Bucini and Hanan 2007). For both analyses it was argued that disturbance may play an important additional role to determine savanna vegetation structure atop the climatic effects, although Sankaran *et al.* (2005) could not detect a consistent response to herbivory. Regarding the role of soil and nutrients, in a meta-analysis of several datasets examining tree-grass interactions across precipitation gradients in savannas it was found that soil and plant nutrient ratios did not change along with precipitation (Dohn *et al.* 2013). Further, soil properties were not notably influential in determining tree-grass interactions at the Kruger National Park sites where our field data were collected in the absence of fire (Moustakas *et al.* 2013). Based on extensive empirical data, Sankaran *et al.* (2004) predicted that a sigmoidal increasing woody cover with increasing MAP in the absence of fire or other disturbances should be transformed into a more linear (i.e. gradual) increase of woody cover with MAP if disturbances like fire are taken into account as per the 'demographic bottleneck model'. Driving LPJ-GUESS-SPITFIRE with typically observed fire frequencies of between 3 to 8 years (Tansey *et al.* 2008), our simulations resulted in a fractional tree cover along the precipitation gradient that more closely resembles a linear relationship between tree cover and MAP, lending further support to the 'demographic bottleneck model'. The main assumption of the 'demographic bottleneck model' is that different species groups and age classes of trees differ in their susceptibility to disturbances such as fire. Fire mortality of mature trees in savannas and tropical forests is generally determined by bark thickness, which in turn is related to stem diameter and species groups (Hoffmann *et al.* 2012). The long history of fires in tropical savannas has led to a variety of adaptations to fire (Bond and Keeley 2005) resulting in high resistance against cambial damage of typical savanna trees, while evergreen trees are known to have a very low resistance against cambial damage, resulting in a strong disadvantage in fire prone sites. However,

with high precipitation, fire intensity is very low due to the vestablished trees is compensated by rapid post-fire tree re-grast, at very dry sites, establishment of trees is prevented by s
turbance. At these sites, the e top-kill still results in a high mortality regardless of the tree type. This determines the land use practice of frequent burns of at least every 2-3 years in national parks and tree plantations to minimize the risk of intensive fire by preventing fuel accumulation (Saarnak 2001). Rainforest trees have comparatively thinner bark compared with savannah trees. Seedlings, having low stem height are most susceptible to fire damage since their crowns are located within the flame height. Older, tall tropical broad-leaved raingreen trees have low direct or post-fire mortality, which depends mainly on the amount of crown scorching. These fire effects are especially pronounced in the mid-mesic range. At sites with high precipitation, fire intensity is very low due to the wet conditions, and any effect of fires on established trees is compensated by rapid post-fire tree re-growth in our simulations. By contrast, at very dry sites, establishment of trees is prevented by soil water shortage, rather than by fire disturbance. At these sites, the effect of fire disturbance is already comparably low due to low grass productivity and thereby low fuel loads. Recently, several empirical-based studies have demonstrated that tree cover-fire feedbacks are critical for maintaining forest and savannah boundaries (Sankaran *et al.* 2004; Lehmann *et al.* 2011; Hoffmann *et al.* 2012; Murphy and Bowman 2012). In essence, the interaction between tree growth rates and fire frequency limits forest development. Hence, canopy closure will be favoured by any factor that increases growth (e.g. elevated availability of water or in some cases also nutrients), or decreases fire frequency. In an analysis by Scheiter and Higgins (2009) the combination of a simplified DVM with a dynamic fire model that relied solely on fuel load, fuel moisture and wind speed yielded a much larger area influenced by fires compared to studies based on remote sensing data. While the knowledge and understanding of the drivers of fire is improving (Archibald *et al.* 2009, 2010) these drivers are complex and far from well understood. Saarnak (2001) estimates the number of natural ignitions to be currently below one percent. Several studies have linked fire occurrence and climatic variables (e.g. Lehsten *et al.* 2010; Lehmann *et al.* 2011) demonstrating that the human decision process leading to the fire application is driven at least partially by climatically determined factors. Regions differ in their culture of how to apply fires. To cover these variances, a complex model of human application of fires would be required which would introduce a considerable amount of additional uncertainty.

Hence we decided to prescribe remotely-sensed fire as an input to the LPJ-GUESS-SPITFIRE model

in this study, which allowed us to focus on the influence of fire on recent vegetation without

potentially confounding effects of simulated fire activity uncertainties.

cover around 7 ha) induced by local conditions such as soils and grazing will not be covered at DVM-scales. Based on the model results with annual fire frequency, Skukuza and Satara would be classified as grasslands, having a woody leaf area index of below 0.5. Vegetation at the third experimental site would be classified as savanna, since tropical broadleaf raingreen trees dominate in the simulations.

When comparing the experimental data and the simulation results, local-scale heterogeneity (all plots

Our simulations in which annual burning led to tree cover being too low compared to experimental

data indicates that the post-fire survival rates of young trees is too low in the model where one year

old trees are not above the flame escape height and hence are killed with a high probability. At higher

precipitation levels, fires are less intense due to higher fuel moistures, thereby allowing more trees to survive due to less intense fires (which result in lower flame height). The experimental results suggest

a possible improvement to the model, while for the purpose of classifying biomes at continental scale

this seems not to be important because an annual fire frequency is rarely detected at a spatial

resolution of one degree.

Example 5 savanna, since tropical broadleaf raingreen trees dominate i
hich annual burning led to tree cover being too low compared
post-fire survival rates of young trees is too low in the mod-
re the flame escape heigh Though our simulation results were strongly improved by the incorporation of fire in the model, our results (notably at the patch scale) are contradicting the result of Staver *et al.* (2011) who show that fire only influences tree cover above a precipitation level of 1000mm MAP while in our simulation significant effects are starting at 400mm MAP. When plotting continental scale tree cover and MAP in burned and unburned conditions many other factors might be influencing the fire regime, for example grazing, differences in seasonality or soil conditions. This has potentially led to the large variability in the tree cover of the analysis of (Staver *et al.* 2011). Since the experimental data shows a significant effect even at the lowest MAP level of 550 mm this shows that more research is needed to identify how fires and vegetation are linked to other factors (e.g. grazing and soils). Another continental scale analysis (Lehmann *et al.* 2011) showed that savannas are present up to precipitations well above the precipitation level which prevents grasses from persisting even at high fire frequencies. The reason

381 for the underestimation of the effect of fires at high precipitations in our simulation is that we

d here, effects similar to fire may also be caused by herbivor
tion harvesting. In the Eastern Cape region (South Africa), Ti
ly that a combination of fire and grazing is required to keep t
nes suffered a severe damage of 382 use a daily average burning probability and even slight differences in the timing of the 383 seasons can lead to fires occurring at wet days which will have only limited effects on the 384 vegetation. While climate data is currently available for a century, only slightly more than a 385 decade of remotely sensed burned area has been recorded (at sufficiently high resolution). 386 Since it is necessary to use the full time series of climate data to meaningfully run LPJ-387 GUESS-SPITFIRE we decided to transform the burned area data into a probability of burning 388 only related to the day of the year to be able to prescribe fire over the whole simulation. Although not included here, effects similar to fire may also be caused by herbivory which also acts as size-selective population harvesting. In the Eastern Cape region (South Africa), Trollope (1974) showed experimentally that a combination of fire and grazing is required to keep the landscape open, since the burned bushes suffered a severe damage of the stems, but coppiced from the base of the system. Only light grazing by goats prevented a fast shrub encroachment in the area. Staver *et al.* (2012) also showed that grazing and fire and herbivory can form a single trait off axis. Acacia saplings showed a continuum of adaptations responding to herbivory and fire and the species occurrence depended upon both. Our study aimed to show that the simulation of biome distributions are markedly improved by incorporating wildfire which was achieved even without the incorporation of herbivory. The incorporation of additional processes such as re-sprouting and herbivory might improve the models ability to predict vegetation, especially if applied at a fine scale. Yet, it also requires the parameterisation of the additional processes and in the case of the incorporation of herbivory a reliable spatio-temporal dataset of grazing pressure including both wild animals as well as livestock. Such a dataset is, to the knowledge of the authors, currently not available for simulations at continental scale. Additional anecdotal evidence that fire is crucial to maintain an open landscape even in the presence of large densities of herbivores comes from most national parks in African savannas where artificially maintained burning regimes are necessary to prevent shrub encroachment and to support grass growth for livestock herbivory (Saarnak 2001). Browsing densities can be considered relatively high in these parks since the visibility of game for tourists is the economic basis of most parks, thus herbivory alone seems not sufficient to maintain the *status quo.*

atellite derived vegetation data.

Terences remain between the simulated and mapped potentia

rublands and grasslands. These vegetation classes occur at a

a thin band along the Mediterranean, the southern and northe

the All simulations performed in this study include differences in phenology between trees and grasses. Some models suggest that these differences alone can maintain co-existence of trees and grasses ('phenological niche separation model' *verso* Sala et al., 1997). However, since the simulations without wildfires resulted in a poor agreement between simulated and observed biome distribution for the savanna biome, we have no indication that this is the case. A strong sensitivity of African biome distribution in response to fire (similarly to our study) was also demonstrated by Bond *et al.* (2005) applying the Sheffield Dynamic Vegetation Model without fire and comparing it to satellite derived vegetation data. Still, considerable differences remain between the simulated and mapped potential vegetation in case of open and dense shrublands and grasslands. These vegetation classes occur at a very narrow range of low MAP, limited to a thin band along the Mediterranean, the southern and northern edge of the Sahara desert, next to the Kalahari Desert, and at the horn of Africa. For these biomes, successful representation by vegetation models has to rely not only on the correct representation of growth processes but equally so on the availability of high resolution rainfall data and soil physical parameters to match the exact geographic location. Our simulations were based on adjusted NCEP reanalysis data (Kalnay *et al.*, 1996; for details see Weber *et al.*, 2009). Although this climate input data had a spatial resolution of one degree, it was generated in parts from coarser resolution raw data that requires spatial interpolation for the reanalysis. Visual inspection of the vegetation maps shown in Figure 4 indicates the presence of simulated shrublands and grasslands in regions close (but not identical) to those identified by Ramankutty and Foley (1999). This spatial mismatch may, at least in parts, result from imprecision in the precipitation input. The Kappa statistic only provides a measure of how many cells of similar vegetation type are exactly at the same position in different maps. Similar cells in close proximity are identified as mismatch, which leads to the low values for the simulated grasslands and shrublands. **Conclusion**

Through incorporation of fire into a dynamic vegetation model the simulation of the distribution of biomes on the African continent was markedly improved. Our work supports data-based predictions that the tree to grass ratio in tropical savannas depends strongly on the fire frequency (following the

- 'demographic bottleneck model') especially in the mid-mesic climate space. Though there is abundant
- evidence that a multitude of disturbances including grazing and climatic variability influences
- vegetation structure, we have shown that the sole application of typical fire frequencies to drive
- vegetation simulations was sufficient to generate realistic vegetation pattern at a continental scale.
- Further improvement of simulation results will require higher resolved climate and soil data,
- especially for the precise simulation of locations of grassland and shrubland biomes, as well as
- accounting for landscape management, for example, grazing and agriculture.
- **Acknowledgements**
- No. 197132). We.
Review Only Clay This study was supported by the European Commission within the sixth Framework Program under
- the project CarboAfrica (contract nr: 037132). We would like to thank Ulrich Weber for providing
- parts of the climate data.

448 **References**

- 449 Archibald S, Nickless A, Govender N, Scholes RJ, Lehsten V (2010) Climate and the inter-annual
450 variability of fire in southern Africa: A meta-analysis using long-term field data and satellite-450 variability of fire in southern Africa: A meta-analysis using long-term field data and satellite-
451 versions that are a data. Glob Ecol Biogeogr 19, 794–809. doi:10.1111/j.1466-451 derived burnt area data. *Glob Ecol Biogeogr* **19**, 794–809. doi:10.1111/j.1466- 8238.2010.00568.x.
- 453 Archibald S, Roy DP, van WILGEN BW, Scholes RJ (2009) What limits fire? An examination of 454 divers of burnt area in Southern Africa. *Glob Chang Biol* 15(3), 613–630, doi:10.1111/i.136 454 drivers of burnt area in Southern Africa. *Glob Chang Biol* **15**(3), 613–630. doi:10.1111/j.1365- 2486.2008.01754.x.
- **Formally 11** II to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmenta
ML, Canziani OF, Palutikof JP, van der Linden PJ, Hanson C
ML, Canziani OF, Palutikof JP, van der Linden PJ, Hanson C
s, Cambridge UK, 433-467.
Sitch 456 Boko M., Niang I, Nyong A, Vogel C, Githeko A, Medany M, Osman-Elasha B, Tabo R, Yanda P 2007: Africa. Climate Change 2007: Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability. Contribution of Working Group II to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Clima 458 Working Group II to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate
459 Change, Parry ML, Canziani OF, Palutikof JP, van der Linden PJ, Hanson CE, Eds., Cambridge 459 Change, Parry ML, Canziani OF, Palutikof JP, van der Linden PJ, Hanson CE, Eds., Cambridge 460 University Press, Cambridge UK, 433-467.
- 461 Bonan GB, Levis S, Sitch S, Vertenstein M, Oleson KW (2003) A dynamic global vegetation model
462 for use with climate models: concents and description of simulated vegetation dynamics. Glob 462 for use with climate models: concepts and description of simulated vegetation dynamics. *Glob* 463 *Chang Biol* **9**(11), 1543–1566.
- 464 Bond WJ (2008) What Limits Trees in C-4 Grasslands and Savannas? *Annu Rev Ecol Evol Syst* **39**, 465 641–659. doi:10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.110707.173411.
- 466 Bond WJ, Keeley JE (2005) Fire as a global "herbivore": the ecology and evolution of flammable 467 ecosystems. *Trends Ecol Evol* **20**(7), 387–394.
- 468 Bond WJ, Woodward FI, Midgley GF (2005) The global distribution of ecosystems in a world without 469 fire New Phytol 165(2) 525–537 469 fire. *New Phytol* **165**(2), 525–537.
- 470 Bucini G, Hanan NP (2007) A continental-scale analysis of tree cover in African savannas. *Glob Ecol* 471 *Biogeogr* **16**(5), 593–605.
- 472 Byram GM (1959) Combustion of forest fuels. (Ed KP Davis) pp.61–89. (McGraw-Hill Book Company: New York)
- 474 Dohn J, Dembéle F, Karembé M, Moustakas A, Amévor KA, Hanan NP (2013) Tree effects on grass 475 growth in savannas: competition, facilitation and the stress-gradient hypothesis. *J Ecol* **101**, 202– 209. doi:10.1111/1365-2745.12010.
- 477 FAO (1991) The Digitized Soil Map of the World (Release 1.0).
- 478 February EC, Higgins SI (2010) The distribution of tree and grass roots in savannas in relation to soil
479 introgen and water. South African J Bot 76, 517–523, doi:10.1016/i.saib.2010.04.001. 479 nitrogen and water. *South African J Bot* **76**, 517–523. doi:10.1016/j.sajb.2010.04.001.
- 480 Gerten D, Schaphoff S, Haberlandt W, Lucht W, Sitch S (2004) Terrestrial vegetation and water 481 balance hydrological evaluation of a dynamic global vegetation model *J Hydrol* 286 249 481 balance - hydrological evaluation of a dynamic global vegetation model. *J Hydrol* **286**, 249–270.
- 482 Govender N, Trollope WSW, Van Wilgen BW (2006) The effect of fire season, fire frequency, rainfall and management on fire intensity in savanna vegetation in South Africa. *J Appl Ecol* 43(4), 748– 483 and management on fire intensity in savanna vegetation in South Africa. *J Appl Ecol* **43**(4), 748– 484 758. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2664.2006.01184.x.

- 524 Murphy BP, Bowman DMJS (2012) What controls the distribution of tropical forest and savanna?
525 Ecol Lett 15(7), 748–58, doi:10.1111/i.1461-0248.2012.01771.x. 525 *Ecol Lett* **15**(7), 748–58. doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2012.01771.x.
- 526 Patt AG, Ogallo L, Hellmuth M (2007) Sustainability Learning from 10 years of climate outlook
527 forums in Africa. Science (80-) 318(5847), 49–50. doi:10.1126/science.1147909. 527 forums in Africa. *Science (80-)* **318**(5847), 49–50. doi:10.1126/science.1147909.
- 528 Peterson DL, Ryan KC (1986) Modeling postfire conifer mortality for long-range planning. *Environ* 529 *Manage* **10**, 797–808. doi:10.1007/BF01867732.
- 530 Ramankutty N, Foley JA (1999) Estimating historical changes in land cover: North American
531 croplands from 1850 to 1992. Glob Ecol Biogeogr 8(5), 381–396. 531 croplands from 1850 to 1992. *Glob Ecol Biogeogr* **8**(5), 381–396.
- 532 Ratnam J, Bond WJ, Fensham RJ, Hoffmann WA., Archibald S, Lehmann CER, Anderson MT,
533 Higgins SI, Sankaran M (2011) When is a "forest" a savanna, and why does it matter? Gloi 533 Higgins SI, Sankaran M (2011) When is a "forest" a savanna, and why does it matter? *Glob Ecol* 534 *Biogeogr* **20**(5), 653–660. doi:10.1111/j.1466-8238.2010.00634.x.
- 535 Rothermel RC (1972) A Mathematical Model for Predicting Fire Spread in Wildland Fuels.
- 536 Roy DP, Boschetti L, Justice CO, Ju J (2008) The Collection 5 MODIS Burned Area Product Global 537 Evaluation by Comparison with the MODIS Active Fire Product. *Remote Sens Environ* 112. 537 Evaluation by Comparison with the MODIS Active Fire Product. *Remote Sens Environ* **112**, 538 3690–3707.
- 539 Saarnak CF (2001) A shift from natural to human-driven fire regime: implications for trace-gas 540 emissions. *The Holocene* **11**(3), 373–375. doi:10.1191/095968301669139230.
- 541 Sala OE, Lauenroth WK, Golluscio RA (1997) Plant functional types in temperate semi-arid regions.
542 (Editors: Smith TM, Shugart HH, Woodward FI) pp.217–233. (University Press: Cambridge) 542 (Editors: Smith TM, Shugart HH, Woodward FI) pp.217–233. (University Press: Cambridge)

and *i* (1,6 of 1) WHERE 10006634. The section of AFF (1,6 of 53–660, doi:10.1111/j.1466-8238.2010.00634.x.

A Mathematical Model for Predicting Fire Spread in Wildle

Justice CO, Ju J (2008) The Collection 5 MODIS Burned 543 Sankaran M, Hanan NP, Scholes RJ, Ratnam J, Augustine DJ, Cade BS, Gignoux J, Higgins SI, Le
544 Roux X, Ludwig F, Ardo J, Banvikwa F, Bronn A, Bucini G, Cavlor KK, Coughenour MB. 544 Roux X, Ludwig F, Ardo J, Banyikwa F, Bronn A, Bucini G, Caylor KK, Coughenour MB,
545 Diouf A, Ekaya W, Feral CJ, February EC, Frost PGH, Hiernaux P, Hrabar H, Metzger KL, 545 Diouf A, Ekaya W, Feral CJ, February EC, Frost PGH, Hiernaux P, Hrabar H, Metzger KL,
546 Prins HHT. Ringrose S. Sea W. Tews J. Worden J. Zambatis N (2005) Determinants of woo 546 Prins HHT, Ringrose S, Sea W, Tews J, Worden J, Zambatis N (2005) Determinants of woody 547 cover in African savannas. *Nature* **438**(7069), 846–849. doi:10.1038/nature04070.

- 548 Sankaran M, Ratnam J, Hanan NP (2004) Tree-grass coexistence in savannas revisited insights from
549 an examination of assumptions and mechanisms invoked in existing models. *Ecol Lett* 7(6), 480– 549 an examination of assumptions and mechanisms invoked in existing models. *Ecol Lett* **7**(6), 480– 550 490. doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2004.00596.x.
- 551 Scheiter S, Higgins SI (2009) Impacts of climate change on the vegetation of Africa: An adaptive dynamic vegetation modelling approach. *Glob Chang Biol* 15, 2224–2246. doi:10.1111/j.136 552 dynamic vegetation modelling approach. *Glob Chang Biol* **15**, 2224–2246. doi:10.1111/j.1365- 2486.2008.01838.x.
- 554 Schenk HJ, Jackson RB (2002) Rooting depths, lateral root spreads and below-ground/above-ground
555 allometries of plants in water-limited ecosystems. *J Ecol* 90(3), 480–494. 555 allometries of plants in water-limited ecosystems. *J Ecol* **90**(3), 480–494.
- 556 Scholes RJ, Archer SR (1997) Tree-grass interactions in savannas. *Annu Rev Ecol Syst* **28**, 517–544.
- 557 Scholes RJ, Kendall J, Justice CO (1996) The quantity of biomass burned in southern Africa. *J*
558 Geophys Res 101(D19), 23667–23676. 558 *Geophys Res* **101**(D19), 23667–23676.
- 559 Schreck CJ, Semazzi FHM (2004) Variability of the recent climate of eastern Africa. *Int J Climatol* 560 **24**, 681–701.

595 Table 1. Classification scheme for the simulated maps of plant functional types, adopted from Hickler

596 *et al.* (2006), all values are maximum annual LAI values.

M.		
ı v	× I ۰. v	

- 599 Table 2. Kappa statistic of agreement between the simulated biomes to the biomes mapped by
- 600 Ramankutty and Foley (1999).

Figure 1. Continental and latitudinal mean annual precipitation.

Left panel: mean annual precipitation, derived from adjusted NCEP and locations of the simulated latitudinal gradient. Right panel: mean annual precipitation over the simulated latitudinal gradient. 96x55mm (300 x 300 DPI)

www.publish.csiro.au/journals/wf

F M A M J J J A S O N D
 For A M J J J A S O N D
 **Form of a start of the African contrementely sensed data. The criter bars indicate one standar

POZZ6mm (300 x 300 DPI)

POZZ6mm (300 x 300 DPI)** Figure 2. Average monthly burned area over the years 2000-2007 of the African continent derived from the MODIS MCD45 remotely sensed data. The error bars indicate one standard deviation. 70x26mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Figure 3. Stand scale analysis: Cover ratio of grasses (panel a) and trees (panel b) along the 20° meridian from 5° to 15° north. The precipitation decreases along the gradient linearly from 1400 to 100 mm mean annual precipitation (see Fig. 1). Simulation results with varying fire return interval. The cover is shown as absolute ratio ranging from 0 to 1. 131x188mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Figure 4. Simulated experimental and tree cover The circles are the experimental data collected at Kruger National Park (4 plots per site and fire frequency) and the lines with error bars show the simulated results. The error bars indicate one standard deviation. Different colours indicate different fire frequencies. 279x361mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Upper right panel: Annual ratio of burned area at a one degree spatial resolution as detected by MODIS MCD 45. Remaining panels: biome classification: Upper left: biome distribution according to Ramankutty and Foley (2006). The lower panels displays the biome distribution as simulated with LPJ-GUESS SPITFIRE, lower left panel with fire and lower right panel without fire. 185x173mm (300 x 300 DPI)