Epidemic cholera in KwaZulu-Natal: The role of the natural and social environment

Maryam Darwesh Said

Submitted in fulfillment of part of the requirements for the degree of Philosophiae Doctor in the Faculty of Natural and Agricultural Sciences, University of Pretoria

DECLARATION

M D Said	Date
for a degree at another university.	
Doctor at the University of Pretoria has not been p	previously submitted by me
I declare that the thesis, which I hereby submit f	for the degree Philosophiae

SUMMARY

Title: Epidemic cholera in KwaZulu-Natal:

The role of the natural and social environment

 $\mathbf{B}\mathbf{y}$

Maryam Darwesh Said

Promoter: Prof. T.E. Cloete

Co-Promoter: Prof. S.N. Venter

Department: Microbiology and Plant Pathology

Degree: PhD - Water Resource Management

Cholera made an unforeseen appearance on the eastern coast of South Africa in the province of KwaZulu-Natal (KZN) in August 2000. Having started from the more urban centres of the coastal region of the province, cholera proceeded unabated to the interior of the province where no community was spared from the scourge. Despite prompt medical intervention, health education and media awareness campaigns, cholera continued to spread throughout KZN. By March 2004, the official statistics of cholera cases in KZN as per the Cholera Database records, stood at 158 895 cases (Dept-KZN Health, 2000). The death toll as reported in the Cholera Database was 575 persons that translated to a percentage case fatality rate of 0.36%; the lowest when compared to the previous epidemics recorded in South African (Kustner *et al.*, 1981; Küstner and du Plessis, G. 1991). An interesting feature of the epidemic was that 99% of the cases recorded by the central and provincial Departments of Health during the height of the epidemic were all from KZN.

The question then was, what factors played a role in the cholera epidemic of KZN? This study sought to understand the outbreak and the factors that possibly contributed to the spread of the 2000-2004 cholera epidemic in KZN. The drivers of disease associated with the communities affected by cholera were also explored by analysing the complex and

dynamic interaction of their biological, socio economic, and environmental nature over time and space. The nature of the study was such that it called for a multi faceted design to involve not just understanding the societal aspect of the disease but its demographic, ecological and spatial characteristics as well. Thus GIS was used as a research tool to facilitate the comparison of the disease trends and risk factors on a spatial level in order to determine the possible role(s) played by the different environmental and socioeconomic drivers.

The objective of the study was to investigate the possible role of the natural environment i.e. temperature, rainfall and humidity as the primary factors that influence cholera outbreaks in KZN; on the basis of its uniqueness in climatic conditions as compared to other areas of the Republic of South Africa (RSA). The other socio-economical and demographic factors were considered as factors that enhance the spread of the disease. As such, the exploration of the Cholera Database by use of spreadsheet, statistical correlations and spatial mapping using GIS technology mutually investigated the relationships between the different variables that came up as important factors in the spread of cholera.

Results indicated that 52% of the total cholera cases in KZN were reported from DC28 (Uthungulu), making it the focal point of the epidemic. In general, all the age groups were represented in the cholera database though the age groups 15-19 years and 0-4 years featured more prominently in the overall epidemic picture. On average the male to female case ratio was 1:1.5 respectively. The major cholera peak was experienced in 2001 and a minor peak in 2002. Both the peaks appeared during the summer months, which are also characterised by heavy rains.

The issues that were statistically proven to be associated with the spread of the disease were related to issues highlighting the inefficiencies in the provision of water and sanitation, which go hand in hand with poverty. Thus poverty was indirectly reflected in the data as an issue that compounded the cholera epidemic. There was no statistical correlation between the incidence of cholera and the climatic variables of rainfall, humidity and temperature. Notwithstanding, there was an overall seasonality revealed by the data, as seen with the cases peaking and waning between the summers and the winters

respectively. Furthermore, GIS mapping revealed a concurrence between the incidence of

cholera and the climatic variables of rainfall, humidity and maximum temperature.

At the spatial level, the characteristics of the epidemic as revealed by the GIS maps and

spatial modelling highlighted possible relationships between the incidence of cholera and

the various socio-economic and climatic variables (Chapter 6: 6.2.3; 6.2.3). The spatial

disease picture displayed a link between climatic seasons and the incidence of cholera.

Spatial modelling offered more insight that the statistically supported climatic and socio-

economic aspects were indeed important factors in guiding cholera outbreak predictions

in the future. The cholera model illustrated this as it selected for areas considered to be at

high risk for cholera (Map 34).

The results give an altogether holistic portrayal of the cholera epidemic from all

perspectives and also supported to the hypothesis that cholera is a function of social and

environmental factors. The results from this study further confirm the negative health

effects of inadequacies in basic services delivery. The study made use of data resources

to understand the relationships between the incidence of cholera and the different

demographic, socio-economic and climatic variables implicated in the spread of cholera

epidemics (Chapter 3: 3.3.3). It also emphasizes the importance of using reliable data as a

management tool to model various scenarios in order to obtain information that could be

used in the prediction and management of diseases like cholera at the community level in

the future.

Keywords:

Epidemic Cholera

Disease trend

Socio-economic variables

Climate

Poverty

GIS mapping

Risk models

v

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge the contributions of the various persons and organizations towards the successful completion of this study.

- The GIS Unit, KwaZulu-Natal Department of Health in Pietermaritzburg, for permission to use the KwaZulu-Natal Cholera Dataset.
- Water Research Commission for funding the project.
- Water Research Fund for Southern Africa for partial funding of the project.
- Dr. M. van der Linde and Ms. R. Ehlers for all the statistical work.

On a personal level, I am mindful of that fact that I am indebted to so many special people who gave me the gift of their time, be it while offering their expertise, or social support. In particular, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the following people:

- My promoter, Prof T.E. Cloete for his guidance, support, encouragement throughout my study tenure. Many thanks for the final review of my thesis.
- My Co-Promoter, Dr. S.N. Venter for his academic guidance, support and the constructive ideas in the organisation and critical review of my thesis.
- Ingrid Booysen of the GIS Unit, University of Pretoria for all the GIS and cartographic work. Her personal guidance and friendship throughout the study was highly appreciated.
- I pay tribute to my late mother, Fatima Mohamed and my father, Darwesh Said, who have never faltered in their trust of my academic ability.
- I am grateful for the love, trust and friendship of my children, Fikile Mthwalo and Thambo Mthwalo.
- I am indebted to Mohamed K. Mussa for his guidance in offering constructive ideas in handling the data in the early stages of my studies.
- A special thank you to my friend and lab colleague, Jabulani Gumbo, for the endless constructive discussions, ideas and support.
- My heartfelt gratitude to Col. J.L. Simbakalia for a being my mentor and my friend.

I am truly blessed to have shared this experience with you.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declarati	on	ii
Summary	7	iii
Acknowl	edgements	vi
Table of	Contents	vii
List of Ta	ables	xi
List of Fi	gures	xii
List of M	aps	xiv
List of A	bbreviations	xvi
CHAPT	ER 1: Introduction	1
CHAPT	ER 2: Literature Review	4
2.1 Introd	luction: Cholera pandemics	4
2.2.1	Cholera in Africa	6
2.2 The h	sistory of cholera in South Africa	. 7
2.3 Chole	era – the affliction	. 10
2.3.1	The pathogen	11
2.3.2	Infections and symptoms	13
2.3.3	Global surveillance	13
2.3.4	Transmission and spread of the disease	14
2.3.5	Treatment	17
2.4 Vibri	o cholerae and the environment	18
2.4.1	Cholera epidemics and climate	21
2.5 Socio	p-economic factors associated with cholera	23
2.5.1	Access to basic services	24
2.6 Epide	emic control and prevention	25
CHAPT	ER 3: Research Approach and Methodology	27
3.1 Introd	luction	27
3.2 Ratio	nale	27

3.3	Design a	nd development of the research framework	30
	3.3.1	Design and operations framework (A)	30
	3.3.1.1	Designate scope (A1)	30
	3.3.1.2	Determine information requirement (A2)	30
	3.3.2	Study Approach (B)	32
	3.3.2.1	Hypothesis (B1)	32
	3.3.2.2	Objectives (B2)	32
	3.3.3	Data Collection ©	34
	3.3.3.1	The KZN Cholera Database (C1)	34
	3.3.3.2	Choice of data and selection of parameters (C2)	37
	3.3.3.3	Data verification (C3)	39
	3.3.4	Creation of the Attribute database (D)	42
	3.3.4.1	Selection and categorisation of parameters (D1)	42
	3.3.4.2	Compilation of the Attribute database	55
	3.3.5	Data assessment (E)	56
	3.3.5.1	Data processing (E1)	56
	3.3.5.2	Ranking of areas with a high risk for cholera (E2)	63
3.4	Spatial M	Nodelling	64
	3.4.1	Lowlands Model	65
	3.4.2	Highlands Model	65
СН	APTER	4: The Research Area	67
4.1	Introduct	ion	67
۷	4.1.1 The	Province of KwaZulu-Natal	67
4.2	The dem	ography of KZN	68
4.3	The socio	o-economic profile of KwaZulu-Natal	70
4.4	History o	of cholera in KwaZulu-Natal	74
4.5	The chol	era epidemic of 2000-2004 in KwaZulu-Natal	76
СН	APTER	5: Data Interpretation	85
5.1	Introduc	ction	85
5.2	The Ge	neral Epidemic Picture	85
	5.2.1	Cholera within the demarcation of KwaZulu-Natal	85
	5.2.2	The annual trends of cholera in KwaZulu-Natal:2000-2003	86

5.2.3	Cholera and climate	90
5.2.4	Cholera and gender	92
5.2.5	Cholera and age	93
5.2.6	Cholera among the DCs of KwaZulu-Natal	101
CHAPTER	6: Statistical and Spatial Analyses	107
6.1 Variables	s statistically associated with cholera	107
6.2 The spati	ial approach	121
6.2.1	Spatial GIS mapping	122
6.2.2	Demographic variables and cholera	122
6.2.2.1	Population	122
6.2.2.2	Housing	123
6.2.3	Socio-economic variables and cholera	123
6.2.3.1	Water	129
6.2.3.2	Sanitation	132
6.2.3.3	Refuse	137
6.2.4	Climatic variables and cholera	137
6.2.4.1	Rainfall	140
6.2.4.2	2 Relative humidity	144
6.2.4.3	3 Maximum temperature	148
6.3 Spatial m	nodelling for high ranking high-risk cholera areas	152
6.3.1	The Spatial Model	159
CHAPTER	7: Conclusion	172
7.1 Concludi	ing remarks	172
7.1.1	Priorities in meeting basic needs	176
7.1.1.1	Managing risks	176
7.1.2	Issues at hand	177
7.1.2.1	Poverty	178
7.1.2.2	HIV/AIDS	178
7.1.2.3	Women	179
7.1.2.4	Travel and labour migrations	179
7.1.3	Predicting cholera	180
7.2 Towards	the future	181

7.2.1 Campaigns to eradicate poverty	181
7.2.2 Public awareness campaigns	182
7.2.3 Women as partners in progress	182
7.2.4 Introduction of simple and effective technologies	183
7.3 Final Conclusion	184
REFERENCES	185
ANNEXURE I: METHODOLOGY	206

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	Extract of a "line listing form" used to capture information on cholera patients.	40
Table 3.2	The definition of temperature ranges in South Africa as classified by South African Weather Service.	53
Table 3.3	The mean % CIR of cholera of the Magisterial Districts in KwaZulu-Natal.	62
Table 4.1	Comparing the socio-economic variables of Census 1996 and Census 2001 (KZN and in South Africa).	72
Table 4.2	Cholera cases reported in the past 20 years.	75
Table 5.1	Cholera case count per KZN District Councils.	93
Table 6.1	Derived values of the cholera situation in the DCs of KZN.	108
Table 6.2	Derived values of the cholera situation in the MDs of KZN.	109
Table 6.3a-k.	Partial Spearman's correlations of the socio-economic, demographic and climatic variables used in the study.	111-120
Table 6.4	An extract of the Partial Spearman's correlations of the variables that were positively associated with the %CIR of cholera.	121
Table 6.5	Top 15 places that reported high cholera case numbers during the major peak.	156
Table 6.6	Top 15 places that reported high cholera case numbers during the minor peak.	156
Table 6.7	Factors used in the creation of the spatial model to create risk maps.	162
Table 6.8	The different selection criteria used in the risk assessment model versus the datasets of the Nov-Dec-Jan (NDJ) months of the 4 years.	163

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1	World maps of six cholera pandemics in the nineteenth century showing the main pathways followed.	5
Figure 3.1	The possible relationships between the cholera pathogen, transmission factors and the human host.	28
Figure 3.2	An illustration outlining the research framework.	29
Figure 3.3	An illustration of the tasks assigned to the design and operations framework.	31
Figure 3.4	An illustration of the tasks assigned towards the study approach.	33
Figure 3.5	An illustration of the tasks assigned to the data collection & verification exercise.	35
Figure 3.6:	An illustrative representation of how the Cholera Database was assembled.	36
Figure 3.7	An illustration of the assigned tasks that lead to the creation of the study database.	41
Figure 3.8	Schematic illustration of the tasks assigned to the overall assessment of the data.	54
Figure 3.9	The selection process for place-names to qualify for the monthly climatic variables-cholera correlations.	61
Figure 4.1	Orientation map of the study area KwaZulu, Natal, South Africa.	67
Figure 4.2	1996 Census KZN population statistics.	69
Figure 4.3	2001 Census KZN population statistics.	69
Figure 5.1.	Initial cases as reported in KZN during the month of August 2000.	86
Table 5.2a-d	Annual epidemic trends of cholera in KZN from August 2000 to February 2004.	87
Figure 5.3	The annual cholera case trends in KZN.	89
Figure 5.4	Variations in monthly rainfall (mm) patterns and the number of monthly cholera cases during the epidemic.	91
Figure 5.5	Variations in monthly humidity (%) and the number of monthly cholera cases during the epidemic.	91
Figure 5.6	Variations in monthly maximum temperatures (⁰ C) and the number of monthly cholera cases during the epidemic.	91
Figure 5.7	The distribution of cholera cases recorded among the different age groups within the DCs of KZN.	94
Figure 5.8	Cholera in the 0-4 year age group: August 2000- March 2004.	94

Figure 5.9	Cholera in the 5-9 year age group: August 2000- March 2004.	95
Figure 5.10	Cholera in the 10-14 year age group: August 2000- March 2004.	96
Figure 5.11	Cholera in the 15-19 year age group: August 2000- March 2004.	96
Figure 5.12	Cholera in the 20-29 year age group: August 2000- March 2004.	97
Figure 5.13	Cholera in the 30-39 year age group: August 2000- March 2004.	99
Figure 5.14	Cholera in the 40-59 year age group: August 2000- March 2004.	99
Figure 5.15	Cholera in the 60-74 year age group: August 2000- March 2004.	100
Figure 5.16	Cholera in the 75 and >100 year age group: August 2000-March 2004.	101
Figure 5.17	Cholera case distributions among the DCs in KZN: August'00 - December'04.	103
Figure 5.18	The % CIR of cholera among the DCs of KZN during the 2000-2004 epidemic.	104
Figure 5.19	Magisterial Districts that reporting the highest cholera cases during the epidemic period Aug00-Feb04.	105
Figure 6.1	A comparison of water supply and services for the top 15 places of the major peak and the minor peak respectively.	154
Figure 6.2	A comparison of sanitation options for the top 15 places of the major peak and the minor peak respectively.	155
Figure 6.3a-b	A comparison of the average rainfall of the 30 most affected places in relation to that of the entire KZN province.	157
Figure 6.4a-b	A comparison of the average humidity of the 30 most affected places in relation to that of the entire KZN province.	n 157
Figure 6.5a-b	A comparison of the average minimum temperatures of the 30 most affected places in relation to that of the entire KZN province.	158
Figure 6.6a-b	A comparison of the average maximum temperatures of the 30 most affected places in relation to that of the entire KZN province.	158
Figure 6.7	Flow diagram showing the climatic, demographic and socio-economic variables related to the Lowlands Model.	160
Figure 6.8	Flow diagram showing the climatic, demographic and socio-economic variables related to the Highlands Model.	161
Figure 7.1	The role of the natural and socio-economic environments in the cholera epidemic of KZN.	173

LIST OF MAPS

Map 1	Occurrence of cholera in KZN in 2000.	77
Map 2	Occurrence of cholera in KZN in 2001.	79
Map 3	Occurrence of cholera in KZN in 2002.	81
Map 4	Occurrence of cholera in KZN in 2003.	82
Map 5	District Councils, Magisterial Districts and Conservation Areas	
	in KZN.	85a
Map 6	The proportion of people per MD (as percentage) in relation to	
	total KZN population.	124
Map 7	Population density (people per square kilometre) per MD in KZN.	125
Map 8	Distribution of traditional dwellings (as percentage of MD) in KZN.	126
Map 9	Distribution of homeless persons (as percentage of MD) in KZN.	127
Map 10	Percentage of people with no income (as percentage of MD) in KZN.	128
Map 11	Percentage households in KZN with piped water in their dwellings.	130
Map 12	Percentage households in KZN using dam, river, stream or	
	spring water.	131
Map 13	Percentage households in KZN using water from boreholes,	
	rainwater tanks or well.	133
Map 14	Percentage households in KZN with pit latrines.	135
Map 15	Percentage households in KZN with bucket sanitation system.	136
Map 16	Percentage households in KZN with unspecified sanitation.	138
Map 17	Percentage households in KZN with no refuse removal services.	139
Map 18	Distribution of cholera cases and monthly rainfall during	
	December 2000 in KZN.	141
Map 19	Distribution of cholera cases and monthly rainfall during	
	January 2001 in KZN.	142
Map 20	Distribution of cholera cases and monthly rainfall during	
	February 2001in KZN.	143
Map 21	Distribution of cholera cases and humidity during	
	December 2000 in KZN.	145
Map 22	Distribution of cholera cases and humidity during	
	January 2001in KZN.	146

Map 23	Distribution of cholera cases and humidity during	
	February 2001 in KZN.	147
Map 24	Distribution of cholera cases and maximum temperature during	
	December 2000 in KZN.	149
Map 25	Distribution of cholera cases and maximum temperature	
	during January 2001 in KZN.	150
Map 26	Distribution of cholera cases and maximum temperature during	
	February 2001 in KZN.	151
Map 27	Location of perennial rivers in relation to the places most	
	affected by cholera in KZN.	153
Map 28	Distribution of Health Facilities in KZN.	102
Map 29	Showing Cholera Risk Areas by applying the Lowlands Model	
	during Peak 1 (NDJ 2000/01).	165
Map 30	Showing Cholera Risk Areas by applying the Highlands Model	
	during NDJ 2003/04.	166
Map 31	Showing Cholera Risk Areas by applying the Highlands Model	
	during NDJ 2001/02.	167
Map 32	Showing Cholera Risk Areas by applying the 4xNDJ Averages	
	and Peak 1's socio-economic factors.	168
Map 33	Showing Cholera Risk Areas by applying the 4xNDJ Averages	
	and Peak 2's socio-economic factors.	169
Map 34	Showing Cholera Risk Areas by applying the models on all	
	NDJ's over the 4 year period 2000-2004.	170

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS Acquired Immuno Deficiency Syndrome

CFR Case Fatality Rate

CIR Cumulative Infection Rate

DC District Council

DOH Department of Health

E East

EA Enumerator Area

GEAR Growth Employment and Redistribution

GIS Geographical Information System

HIV Human Immunodeficiency Virus

km kilometre

KZN KwaZulu-Natal

MD Magisterial District

n Number

N North

^oC Degree Celsius

ORS Oral Rehydration Salts

ORT Oral Rehydration Therapy

p probability

PHC Primary Health Care

r Correlation coefficient

R Rand

RSA Republic of South Africa

S South

sq Square

STATSSA Statistics South Africa

UN United Nations

WHO World Health Organisation

WRC Water Research Commission

The degree PhD

Maryam Darwesh Said

Maryam Darwesh Said obtained her BSc(Hons) in Zoology and Botany from the University of Nairobi in 1985. In 1994, she completed her MSc(Med) in Molecular Biology at the University of the Witwatersrand. Thereafter she joined the National University of Lesotho as a Lecturer in the Department of Biology. She commenced with her PhD studies at the University of Pretoria in 2002 in Water Resource Management.

In her thesis, **Epidemic cholera in KwaZulu-Natal:** The role of the natural and social environment, the promovendus investigated the possible role of the natural environment i.e. climatic factors that influence cholera outbreaks in KwaZulu-Natal; on the basis of its uniqueness in climatic conditions as compared to other area in South Africa. In addition, the socio-economic and demographic factors were also considered. The issues that were proven to be associated with the disease were related to issues highlighting inefficiencies in the provision of water and sanitation, which go hand in hand with poverty. GIS technology and spatial mapping and risk modelling was used to select areas considered to be at high risk for cholera due to the inadequacies in basic service delivery. The study illustrated how health, demographic, climatic and socio-economic data can be used as a reliable disease management tool that could be used in the prediction and management of diseases like cholera. The research findings from this thesis have been presented at conferences both locally and internationally.

Supervisor: Prof: T.E. Cloete (University of Pretoria) Co-supervisor: Prof: S.N. Venter (University of Pretoria)