

**ADDRESSING THE PSYCHO-SPIRITUAL BEREAVEMENT NEEDS
OF HIV AND AIDS ORPHANS AND OTHER VULNERABLE ADOLESCENTS:
A NARRATIVE PASTORAL CARE APPROACH**

by

AMANDA RICHTER

Submitted for fulfilment of the requirements for the degree:

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

with specialisation

PASTORAL FAMILY THERAPY

in the

FACULTY OF THEOLOGY
DEPARTMENT OF PRACTICAL THEOLOGY

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Promoter
PROF J C MÜLLER

September 2010

DECLARATION

I, the undersigned, hereby declare that the work contained in this thesis entitled:

**ADDRESSING THE PSYCHO-SPIRITUAL BEREAVEMENT NEEDS
OF HIV AND AIDS ORPHANS AND OTHER VULNERABLE ADOLESCENTS:
A NARRATIVE PASTORAL CARE APPROACH**

is my own original work. All sources consulted have been properly acknowledged by means of academic references. This work has not previously in its entirety or in part been submitted to any other university for a degree.

Amanda Richter

September 2010

**DEDICATION
OPGEDRA AAN
*DITEBOGO***

☺ **To my brave co-researchers:**

Annie, Dee, Dimakatso, Palesa, Zinhle, Michael, Moses, Shaun, Victor, Wiseman

Always honour the memory of the people you loved and lost. Remember the lessons they have taught you – to love as they have done, to work hard and to look after each other. I will never forget you guys! With love.

Go banyakisišimmogo ba ka:

Annie, Dee, Dimakatso, Palesa, Zinhle, Michael, Moses, Shaun, Victor, Wiseman

Ka mehla hlomphang kgopotšo ya batho bao le bego le ba rata gomme ba le tlogetšego. Gopolang dithuto tše ba le rutilego tšona – go rata go swana le ka fao ba bego ba dira ka gona, go šoma gaboina le go hlokamelana. Nka se tsoge ke le lebetše bagwera! Ka lerato.

☺ **To my parents – Johan and Julie Richter.**

Dankie vir al julle opofferings en die menige geleenthede wat aan my gegun is!

ABSTRACT

This study looks at the bereavement of adolescents left orphaned by and vulnerable to the HIV and Aids crisis that is crippling the continent of Africa. Their bereavement and the psycho-spiritual issues relating to this bereavement are examined by means of postfoundationalism as an approach to practical theology along with the narrative approach to research and therapy. This is done by integrating these approaches with the art of storytelling within the unique African context.

By listening to the stories of ten adolescents under the care of PEN, a Non Governmental Organisation (NGO), this research gives them the opportunity to express their own unique stories of bereavement. Stories that would otherwise have been silenced by the wave of bereavement in the wake of countless deaths worldwide due to the HIV and Aids infection. It looks holistically at the multiple losses these adolescents have suffered and consequently how this has affected them not only physically, but also especially emotionally and spiritually.

In light of the above, this research attempts to show how these adolescents are in the process of – by means of storytelling – reformulating the story of their lives and the lives of those they care about in the true spirit of *Ubuntu* to find hope anew in the proverbial pot of gold at the end of the rainbow.

KEY CONCEPTS

Please note that at times the stated abbreviations for some of the following key concepts are used in the thesis.

- ☺ Narrative approach
- ☺ Social-constructionism
- ☺ Postfoundational Practical Theology (PFPT)
- ☺ Transversal rationality
- ☺ African storytelling
- ☺ HIV and Aids orphans and other vulnerable adolescents (OVAs)
- ☺ Tree of Life (TOL) camps
- ☺ Psycho-spiritual needs of bereaved adolescents
- ☺ *Ubuntu*
- ☺ Pastoral care

OPSOMMING

Hierdie studie fokus op die verlies wat tieners ervaar wat wees gelaat is deur die MIV en Vigs pandemie wat besig is om die vasteland van Afrika te verlam. Hulle rousmart en die gepaardgaande psigies-spirituele aangeleenthede word ondersoek deur middel van die postfondamentele benadering tot praktiese teologie in samehang met die narratiewe benadering tot navorsing en terapie. Dit word gedoen deur die integrasie van hierdie benaderings met die vertelkuns binne die unieke Afrika konteks.

Deur te luister na die stories van tien tieners onder die sorg van PEN, ‘n Nie-Regeringsorganisasie (NRO), gun hierdie navorsing hulle die geleentheid om hul eie unieke stories van smart te vertel. Stories wat andersins verlore sou gegaan het in die golf van verlies wat volg op die ontelbare getal sterftes wêreldwyd as gevolg van MIV en Vigs besetting. Daar word holisties gekyk na die veelvoudige verliese wat hierdie tieners beleef het en gevolglik hoe dit hulle nie net fisies nie, maar ook emosioneel en geestelik beïnvloed.

Asook hoe hulle in staat is om – deur die gebruikmaking van stories – hul lewensstorie te hervertel asook die lewens van diegene naby aan hulle, in die ware gees van *Ubuntu*, om nuwe hoop in die spreekwoordelike pot goud aan die einde van die reënboog te vind.

SLEUTELBEGRIPPE

Let asseblief daarop dat daar by tye van die onderstaande afkortings vir sommige van die sleutelbegrippe gebruik gemaak word in die tesis.

- ⌚ Narratiewe benadering
- ⌚ Sosiaal-konstruktionisme
- ⌚ Postfondamentele.Praktiese Teologie (PFPT)
- ⌚ Transversale rasionaliteit
- ⌚ Afrika vertelkuns
- ⌚ MIV en Vigs weeskinders en ander kwesbare tieners (AKT's)
- ⌚ Boom van Lewe (BVL) kampe
- ⌚ Psigies-spirituele behoeftes van bedroefde tieners
- ⌚ *Ubuntu*
- ⌚ Pastorale sorg

KAKARETŠO

Dinyakišišo tše di lebelela go hlokoфalelw ga bana ba mahlalagading bao ba tlogetšwego e le ditšiwana le go ba kotsing ya mathata a HIV le Aids yeo e golofatšago khonthinente ya Afrika. Go hlokoфalelw le ditaba tša bona tša monagano le tša semoya tše di amanago le go hlokoфalelw mo di hlahlobja ka go šomiša post-foundationalism bjalo ka mokgwa wa Tiragatšo ya Thutabodumedi gammogo le mokgwakanegelo wa dinyakišišo le kalafo. Se se dirwa ka go kopanya mekgwa ye ka bokgabo bja go anega kanegelo ka tikologong ya Seafrika ye e swanago e nnoši.

Ka go theeletša dikanegelo tša bona ba mahlalagading ba lesome bao ba lego ka fase ga tlhokomelo ya PEN, Mokgatlo wo e Sego wa Semmušo (NGO), dinyakišišo tše di ba fa sebaka sa go anega dikanegelo tša bona tša go hlokoфalelw tše di swanago di nnoši. Dikanegelo tše di ka bego di ile tša homotšwa ke leuba la go hlokoфalelw ka lebaka la mahu a mantši lefaseng ka bophara ka lebaka la bolwetši bja HIV le Aids. Di lebelela ka bottalo go hlokoфala ga batho ba bantši mo go dirilego gore bana ba ba mahlalagading ba be le mathata le ka moo se se ba amilego e sego fela mmeleng, eupša maikutlong le meboyeng ya bona.

Ka lebaka le, dinyakišišo tše di leka go bontšha ka moo bana ba ba mahlalagading ba lego gare ka tshepedišo ya – ka go šomiša go anega dikanegelo – go beakanya lefsa kanegelo ya mapheло a bona le mapheло a bao ba kgathalago ka bona ka moya wa mmakgonthe wa Botho (Ubuntu) go hwetša kholofelo ye mpsha ka pitšeng ya gauta ye e lego mafelelong a molalatladi ye go bolelwago ka yona ka se.

MAREO A BOHLOKWA

O kgopelwa go lemoga gore ka dinako tše dingwe dikhutsofatšo tše di filwego tša mareo a mangwe di šomišwa ka gare ga thesisi.

- ☺ Mokgwakanegelo
- ☺ Kago ya tša leago
- ☺ Tiragatšo ya Thutabodumedi ya Postfoundational (PFPT)
- ☺ Transversal rationality
- ☺ Kanego ya kanegelo ya Seafrika
- ☺ Ditšhiwana tša HIV le Aids le bana ba bangwe ba matšwamahlalagading bao ba lego kotsing (di-OVA)
- ☺ Dihlophana tša Tree of Life (TOL)
- ☺ Dinyakwa tša monagano le tša semoya tša bana ba matšwamahlalagading bao ba hlokofaletšwego
- ☺ Botho
- ☺ Tlhokomelo ya semoya

TABLE OF CONTENT	
DECLARATION, DEDICATION, ABSTRACT AND KEY CONCEPTS	
DECLARATION	i
DEDICATION / OPGEDRA AAN / DITEBOGO	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
KEY CONCEPTS	iv
OPSOMMING	v
SLEUTELBEGRIPPE	vi
KAKARETŠO	vii
MAREO A BOHLOKWA	viii

TABLE OF CONTENT	
CHAPTER 1	
PROLOGUE TO AN AFRICAN RESEARCH STORY – INTRODUCTION, POSITIONING AND RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 THE ENIGMA OF EPISTEMOLOGY AND POSITIONING	7
1.2.1 Trying to grasp the concept of epistemology	7
1.2.2 Some important thinkers' thoughts on epistemology	8
1.2.3 How do I as researcher know that which I claim to know?	9
1.3 PRACTICE WHAT YOU PREACH: PRACTICAL THEOLOGY	13
1.4 AND SO THE STORY GOES: NARRATIVE APPROACH	18
1.5 PARADIGMS AT WAR: FROM PREMODERNITY TO MODERNITY TO POSTMODERNITY	24
1.5.1 Alive and well in Africa: Premodernism	25
1.5.2 Modern minds: Modernism	27
1.5.3 Past the era of modernism: Postmodernism	29
1.6 SOCIAL ARCHITECTS AT WORK: SOCIAL-CONSTRUCTIONISM AND POSTFOUNDATIONALISM	34

1.6.1 Constructing the world socially	34
1.6.2 Knowing what we know now: Looking back at foundationalism	35
1.6.3 Like Lot's wife: Glancing back at nonfoundationalism	36
1.6.4 Third time lucky: Postfoundationalism as a third way	37
1.7 CUTTING EDGE: TRANSVERSAL RATIONALITY	41
1.8 THE COLOUR OF RESEARCH: WHAT IS RESEARCH?	45
1.8.1 What is social research?	45
1.8.2 Quantitative versus qualitative research	48
1.8.3 Tell me the (research) story: Narrative research	53
1.9 STRUCTURING THE RESEARCH STORY: RESEARCH DESIGN	56
1.9.1 A specific context is described	59
1.9.2 In-context experiences are listened to and described	59
1.9.3 Interpretations of experiences are made, described and developed in collaboration with 'co-researchers'	60
1.9.4 A description of experiences as it is continually informed by traditions of interpretation	61

1.9.5 A reflection on the religious and spiritual aspects, especially on God's presence, as it is understood and experienced in a specific situation	62
1.9.6 A description of experience thickened by interdisciplinary investigation	62
1.9.7 The development of alternative interpretations that point beyond the local community	63
1.10 WRITING FOR RESEARCH: THE RESEARCH REPORT	65
1.10.1 Set in stone (almost): The written word	65
1.10.2 Penning it down: The story of the narrative research report	67
1.10.3 Reflection-in-Progress: On the process of self-reflection	69
1.11 RESEARCH OUTLINE	72
1.12 CLOSING REMARKS ON CHAPTER 1	74

TABLE OF CONTENT	
CHAPTER 2	
IN PERSPECTIVE –	
CONTEXTUALISATION OF THE RESEARCH	
2.1 INTRODUCTION	75
2.2 SPEAKING OUT: THE STORY OF THE CONTEXT OF PEN	77
2.3 VOICING CONCERNs: THE STORY OF ETHICS-IN-PRACTICE	81
2.3.1 What is research ethics?	81
2.3.2 On becoming participant: Informed consent	83
2.3.3 Ethics and the institutional implications of the research	84
2.4 AROUND THE CAMPFIRE: CONTEXT OF THE TREE OF LIFE CAMPS	85
2.4.1 The field of research: Posing the research question	85
2.4.2 Testing the water: Launching a pilot study	86
2.4.3 Coming into being: The <i>Tree of Life</i> (TOL) camps	90
2.4.4 Selecting stories: On design, sampling and data collection	94
2.5 SPEAKING UP: THE CO-RESEARCHERS AT WORD	97

2.5.1 Annie – 'Talking is and always has been the best medicine'	97
2.5.2 Dee – 'Loud and confident, but can't handle pain'	99
2.5.3 Dimakatso – 'Never (to) give up in life'	102
2.5.4 Palesa – 'Fight for my life to be better'	104
2.5.5 Zee – 'Crazy, smart and beautiful'	107
2.5.6 Michael – 'Hold on(to) God in every situation'	111
2.5.7 Moses – 'They see me as a role model'	113
2.5.8 Shaun – 'To be positive in everything'	115
2.5.9 Victor – 'I've been able to cough out what was eating me inside'	117
2.5.10 Wiseman – 'Living life to the fullest'	119
2.6 LEARNING TO LISTEN: MY STORY IN RELATION TO THE CONTEXT	123
2.7 CLOSING REMARKS ON CHAPTER 2	124

TABLE OF CONTENT	
CHAPTER 3	
THE WAY THE COOKIE CRUMBLES – TRADITIONS OF INTERPRETATIONS	
3.1 INTRODUCTION	125
3.2 MAKING THE NEWS: AIDS AND RELATED DISCOURSES	128
3.3 HIV AND AIDS ORPHANS: THE SAD STORY OF STATISTICS	132
3.4 FROM THE PULPIT: THEOLOGICAL INTERPRETATIONS	134
3.5 AFRICAN STORYTELLING AS A TRADITION OF INTERPRETATION	136
3.6 YOUNG PICASSO AT PLAY: USING THE ARTS TO EXPRESS	145
3.6.1 Roots and all: The <i>Tree of Life</i> metaphor in full colour	146
3.6.2 Annie – ‘Save me from my troubles’	155
3.6.3 Dee – ‘Feeling not so lightly’	157
3.6.4 Dimakatso – ‘I think about her each night and day’	159
3.6.5 Palesa – ‘We going to make it in life challenges’	161
3.6.6 Zee – ‘(B)umpy drives sometimes happen for a reason’	163

3.6.7 Michael – ‘(M)y heart keeps bleeding’	164
3.6.8 Moses – ‘(S)tarted to take life as it is’	165
3.6.9 Shaun – ‘(R)each out to my dreams’	167
3.6.10 Victor – ‘everybody deserves to see the light’	177
3.6.11 Wiseman – ‘My life is travelling’	179
3.6.12 Storytelling as a group effort: (The story of Kewame)	180
3.7 CLOSING REMARKS ON CHAPTER 3	184

TABLE OF CONTENT	
CHAPTER 4	
IN A PLACE OF HUNGER –	
WHEN A CHILD LOSES A PARENT	
4.1 INTRODUCTION	185
4.2 WHEN HUNGER STRIKES: LOSING A PARENT	187
4.3 HUNGRY FOR ‘MORE’: DISCOURSES REGARDING THE BEREAVEMENT NEEDS OF MY CO-RESEARCHERS	192
4.3.1 Hungry for ‘ <u>MORE</u> ’: Meeting material needs	192
4.3.2 Hungry for ‘ <u>MORE</u> ’: The need to be loved by others	197
4.3.3 Hungry for ‘ <u>MORE</u> ’: Addressing spiritual and religious needs	204
4.3.4 Hungry for ‘ <u>MORE</u> ’: Towards emotional empowerment	208
4.4 THE WAY FORWARD: THE PALAVER MODEL	212
4.5 CLOSING REMARKS ON CHAPTER 4	214

TABLE OF CONTENT	
CHAPTER 5	
TWO HEADS (OR EVEN MORE) ARE BETTER THAN ONE – AN INTERDISCIPLINARY INDABA	
5.1 INTRODUCTION	215
5.2 LETTER OF INVITE AND SELECTED STORIES	216
5.2.1 Inviting interdisciplinary team members	216
5.2.2 A story told: Dee's story	219
5.2.3 A story told: Zee's story	228
5.3 IN CONVERSATION WITH THEOLOGY ITSELF	235
5.3.1 Dee's concerns	235
5.3.2 Zee's concerns	237
5.3.3 Importance of theology at interdisciplinary table and unique perspective	239
5.3.4 Theology in conversation with other disciplines	242
5.4 IN CONVERSATION WITH PSYCHOLOGY	244

5.4.1 Dee's concerns	244
5.4.2 Zee's concerns	253
5.4.3 Importance of psychology at interdisciplinary table and unique perspective	258
5.4.4 Psychology in conversation with other disciplines	261
5.5 IN CONVERSATION WITH SOCIAL WORK	263
5.5.1 Dee's concerns	263
5.5.2 Zee's concerns	267
5.5.3 Importance of social work at interdisciplinary table and unique perspective	271
5.5.4 Social work in conversation with other disciplines	275
5.6 IN CONVERSATION WITH OTHER DISCIPLINES	277
5.6.1 Anthropology – Mieke de Gelder	277
5.6.1.1 Dee's concerns	277
5.6.1.2 Zee's concerns	278
5.6.1.3 Importance of anthropology at interdisciplinary table and unique perspective	279
5.6.1.4 Anthropology in conversation with other disciplines	280

5.6.2 Information science – Jacques du Plessis	281
5.6.2.1 Dee's concerns	281
5.6.2.2 Zee's concerns	282
5.6.2.3 Importance of information science at interdisciplinary table and unique perspective	283
5.6.2.4 Information science in conversation with other disciplines	284
5.6.3 Life coaching – François Wessels	285
5.6.3.1 Dee's concerns	285
5.6.3.2 Zee's concerns	287
5.6.3.3 Importance of life coaching at interdisciplinary table and unique perspective	288
5.6.3.4 Life coaching in conversation with other disciplines	289
5.7 CLOSING REMARKS ON CHAPTER 5	290

TABLE OF CONTENT	
CHAPTER 6	
2010 AND BEYOND –	
MOVING FORWARD IN THE SPIRIT OF <i>UBUNTU</i>	
6.1 INTRODUCTION	291
6.2 AN ISIZULU RIDDLE EXPLAINED: THE DISCOURSE OF <i>UBUNTU</i>	293
6.2.1 What is understood by the concept of <i>Ubuntu</i> ?	293
6.2.2 Key values of <i>Ubuntu</i>	297
6.2.3 <i>Ubuntu</i> in a contemporary South Africa	299
6.3 THE CHILDREN OF AFRICA ANSWERING TO THE ECHOES OF LIFE	302
6.3.1 African storytelling and <i>Ubuntu</i>	302
6.3.2 TOL adolescents' understanding of <i>Ubuntu</i>	304
6.4 MOVING BEYOND BEING THE ‘FORGOTTEN ONES’ TOWARDS BEING FORTUNATE: THE ETHICS OF <i>UBUNTU</i> APPLIED	306
6.5 A PASTORAL CARE APPROACH UNIQUE TO THE AFRICAN CONTEXT: UTILISING <i>UBUNTU</i> AND AFRICAN STORYTELLING	309
6.5.1 <i>Ubuntu</i> as personified in ‘ <i>The magic horns</i> ’	309

6.5.2 An alternative African solution to counselling	312
6.6 MORE STORIES TO EXPLORE: SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH	315
6.6.1 Alternative roads to the research journey	315
6.6.2 Opening up more possibilities	317
6.7 CLOSING REMARKS ON CHAPTER 6	319

TABLE OF CONTENT		
CHAPTER 7		
EPILOGUE TO AN AFRICAN RESEARCH STORY – ON BEING QUESTIONED BY OTHERS AND ONE SELF		
7.1 INTRODUCTION		321
7.2 ADDRESSING THE FEARS AND HOPES OF MY CO- RESEARCHERS		322
7.2.1 Slaying the Fear Dragon		322
7.2.1.1 A fear of the Unknown		322
7.2.1.2 People's perceptions based on the research		324
7.2.1.3 Fearlessly unconcerned		324
7.2.2 Hoping for a better tomorrow		325
7.2.2.1 Lead others to a better understanding		325
7.2.2.2 Helping others and ourselves: On becoming 'overcomers'		325
7.2.2.3 God in us: Giving hope and inspiring others		327
7.2.3 Fighting the monster within		328
7.3 ADDRESSING POSSIBLE QUESTIONS BY RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES		329
7.3.1 Why should traditionally Afrikaans Churches (Dutch Reformed Churches) and their training institutions become involved in this current 'hype' around HIV and AIDS?		330

7.3.2 It appears to be the latest do-good craze for almost all churches to have some or other kind of Outreach programme to a remote rural area of South Africa ridden by HIV and AIDS, why all of a sudden?	331
7.3.3 Why the involvement with HIV and AIDS orphans?	332
7.4 ADDRESSING POSSIBLE QUESTIONS BY THE ACADEMIC COMMUNITY	333
7.4.1 Please explain in short the narrative approach to therapy and research and how adhering to this approach impacted on your research	333
7.4.2 What would you say is the contribution of Practical Theology to the research field of HIV and AIDS?	334
7.4.3 Briefly recap the seven (7) movements of Postfoundational Practical Theology (PFPT) and evaluate the chosen methodology of your research	335
7.4.4 What is the difference between the movements and the methods of this specific research?	338
7.4.5 A great deal of theses submitted lately has focused on the topic of HIV and AIDS. What would you say is your research's contribution to this research theme?	338

7.4.6 Why should this thesis be accepted in the Faculty of Theology and not another, say, Humanities Faculty?	339
7.4.7 With reference to the section on interdisciplinary conversations, how did these conversations help you regarding your co-researchers' view on God?	340
7.4.8 How do you understand transversal rationality?	341
7.4.9 Please summarise your research in a few statements	342
7.4.10 What did you learn from your co-researchers?	343
7.5 SELF-REFLECTION ON THE PROCESS: ON QUESTIONING MYSELF	343
7.6 MY STORY OF UBUNTU: BRINGING AN ELEPHANT INTO THE HOUSE	345
7.6.1 My brave new friends: The co-researchers	345
7.6.2 Personnel of the NGO's	346
7.6.3 Sponsors who made the study possible	347
7.6.4 Helping professions: The interdisciplinary team	348
7.6.5 Professional help with the completion of the study	348

7.6.6 To true friends	349
7.6.7 My pillars of support: God and my family	351
7.7 CLOSING THE BOOK ON THE RESEARCH STORY – FINAL REMARKS	351

TABLE OF CONTENT	
BIBLIOGRAPHY AND ADDENDA	
BIBLIOGRAPHY	353
ADDENDUM A – ‘I AM AN AFRICAN’ POEMS	371
ADDENDUM B – INFORMATION OF INTERDISCIPLINARY TEAM MEMBERS	383
ADDENDUM C – CD ‘KEEP PUSHING’ (INCLUDED IN BACK COVER)	