

# **Soundpainting as a system for the collaborative creation of music in performance**

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy  
in the  
Department of Music  
School for the Arts  
Faculty of Humanities  
University of Pretoria  
by Marc Duby

Supervisors: Professor Caroline van Niekerk  
Professor Allan Munro

October 2006

The man bent over his guitar,  
A shearsman of sorts. The day was green.

They said, 'You have a blue guitar,  
You do not play things as they are.'

The man replied, 'Things as they are  
Are changed upon the blue guitar.'

And they said then, 'But play, you must,  
A tune beyond us, yet ourselves,

A tune upon the blue guitar  
Of things exactly as they are.'

Wallace Stevens, "The Man with the Blue Guitar"

## Table of contents

<b>Acknowledgements .....</b>	<b>viii</b>
<b>Dedication .....</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>Summary .....</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>Keywords.....</b>	<b>xii</b>
<b>Notes to the reader .....</b>	<b>xii</b>
<b>Chapter 1 : Research outline .....</b>	<b>1-1</b>
1.1 Introduction.....	1-1
1.2 Background and justification.....	1-2
1.3 Research questions.....	1-3
1.4 Purpose and aims .....	1-5
1.5 Justification.....	1-6
1.5.1 A note on musicking.....	1-6
1.5.2 Creation, mediation, and reception .....	1-7
1.5.3 The role of the conductor in orchestral performance .....	1-11
1.5.4 Free jazz as ensemble performance.....	1-15
1.5.5 The role of the Soundpainter in ensemble performance .....	1-17
1.5.6 The Soundpainter as ensemble director .....	1-20
1.6 Chapter divisions.....	1-22
1.7 Methodology.....	1-24
1.7.1 Survey of scholarship.....	1-25
1.7.2 Theoretical frameworks.....	1-26
1.7.3 Theories of improvisation.....	1-28
1.7.4 Group improvisation as a collaborative process .....	1-31
1.8 Relevance of this study .....	1-33
1.9 Scope and limits .....	1-34
1.10 Glossary .....	1-37

<b>Chapter 2 : Music as sign-system—a survey of scholarship.....</b>	<b>2-1</b>
2.1 Introduction: Semiotics and linguistic theory.....	2-1
2.1.1 Saussure’s concept of language as a sign-system .....	2-4
2.1.2 Peirce’s typology of signs .....	2-8
2.1.2.1 Icon .....	2-10
2.1.2.2 Index .....	2-10
2.1.2.3 Symbol.....	2-11
2.1.3 Structuralism (revealing deep codes).....	2-12
2.1.3.1 Roland Barthes and structuralism .....	2-16
2.1.3.2 The structure of serialism.....	2-18
2.1.3.3 Schenkerian analysis and after .....	2-21
2.1.3.4 New Criticism .....	2-25
2.1.4 Poststructuralism and the play of the text .....	2-30
2.1.4.1 The death of the author .....	2-32
2.1.4.2 Readerly and writerly texts.....	2-33
2.1.4.3 Undercoding and overcoding.....	2-35
2.1.5 On deconstruction.....	2-38
2.1.6 Wittgenstein on language .....	2-43
2.1.6.1 Meaning as use .....	2-43
2.1.6.2 Language-games.....	2-45
2.1.6.3 Grammar .....	2-48
<b>Chapter 3 : Music as work and event.....</b>	<b>3-1</b>
3.1 Introduction: Spoken and written language .....	3-1
3.1.1 Results and procedures .....	3-5
3.1.2 Intractable questions.....	3-6
3.2 Music as work: The semiotics of notation.....	3-9
3.3 Music as event: The semiotics of performance .....	3-17
3.3.1 What was performance? .....	3-21
3.3.2 "Saying something" .....	3-24
3.4 Music and the body .....	3-27
3.4.1 The instrument as extension of the performer .....	3-30
3.4.2 The erasure of the body.....	3-34
3.4.3 Musicking, physicality, and the mind-body problem.....	3-36
<b>Chapter 4 : Towards a language-based model for improvised music..</b>	<b>4-1</b>

4.1 Introduction: Music and/as language.....	4-1
4.1.1 Defining improvisation.....	4-7
4.1.2 "Playing by ear".....	4-11
4.1.3 The social semiotics of improvisation.....	4-15
4.1.4 Jazz and signification.....	4-17
4.1.4.1 Signifyin(g) and rhetoric in improvised music.....	4-20
4.1.4.2 Music as communal activity .....	4-22
4.1.4.3 Call and response.....	4-22
4.1.4.4 Intonation as an affective device .....	4-24
4.1.4.5 Toy (and little) instruments.....	4-26
4.1.4.6 Timbral play and agency .....	4-28
4.1.4.7 The fourth wall .....	4-33
4.1.4.8 Improvisation and freedom .....	4-35
4.2 Language acquisition in improvised music.....	4-38
4.2.1 The repertoire .....	4-44
4.2.1.1 The blues.....	4-44
4.2.1.2 Standards: the language of the tribe .....	4-47
4.2.1.3 "Rhythm changes" and the contrafact.....	4-50
4.2.1.4 Pedagogical methods for improvisation .....	4-53
4.2.1.5 Third Stream .....	4-55
4.3 Towards a model for improvised music.....	4-57
4.3.1 Language-games in improvised music.....	4-58
4.4 Towards an ethnomusicology of improvisation.....	4-60
<b>Chapter 5 : Creativity, collaboration, and communication in improvised music .....</b>	<b>5-1</b>
5.1 Five characteristics of group improvisation.....	5-1
5.1.1 Creativity myths .....	5-8
5.1.1.1 Creativity as a product of the unconscious.....	5-8
5.1.1.2 Creativity as representing the inner spirit of the individual .....	5-10
5.1.1.3 Creativity as spontaneity .....	5-10
5.1.1.4 Creativity as originality .....	5-12
5.1.2 Individual and group flow .....	5-13
5.2 Collaboration and competition in improvised music.....	5-15
5.3 Communication in improvised music.....	5-18
5.3.1 Shannon's theory of communication .....	5-22

5.3.2 Cybernetics and the virtual orchestra.....	5-23
5.4 Musically configured space: power and hierarchy.....	5-27
5.4.1 Social topology and organizational structure .....	5-33
5.4.2 Improvising big bands.....	5-35
5.5 Deconstructing noise and silence.....	5-38
5.5.1 Sound and silence as aesthetic oppositions .....	5-39
5.5.2 Noise, signifyin(g), quotation, and the postmodern.....	5-41
5.5.3 Noise in the political economy of music .....	5-47
5.5.3.1 Sacrifice (metaphor).....	5-48
5.5.3.2 Representation (metonymy) .....	5-48
5.5.3.3 Repetition (synecdoche) .....	5-49
5.5.3.4 Composition (irony) .....	5-51
5.5.4 Cage, noise, and the aleatoric .....	5-54
5.5.5 Soundpainting, noise, and the avant-garde .....	5-55
<b>Chapter 6 : Soundpainting—history, process, and system .....</b>	<b>6-1</b>
6.1 Soundpainting: a brief history.....	6-1
6.1.1. "A very elaborate series of chord changes" .....	6-2
6.1.2 "Free to be not free".....	6-6
6.1.3 Soundpainting and Abstract Expressionism.....	6-8
6.1.4 Soundpainting and quotation .....	6-11
6.1.5 Soundpainting gestures as iconic signs.....	6-12
6.1.6 Recursion in an improvisation by Charlie Parker .....	6-14
6.1.7 A note on palettes.....	6-15
6.1.8 Anthony Braxton and Walter Thompson .....	6-17
6.2 Soundpainting as collaborative process.....	6-25
6.2.1 Peer learning .....	6-25
6.2.2 Soundpainting as live composition.....	6-27
6.2.2.1 Soundpainting and indeterminacy.....	6-30
6.2.2.2 Soundpainting and extended techniques.....	6-33
6.3 Soundpainting: language or system? .....	6-35
6.3.1 The syntax of Soundpainting .....	6-39
6.3.2 Soundpainting and other gesture-based music systems.....	6-41
6.3.2.1 Harmony Signing .....	6-41

6.3.2.2 John Zorn's game pieces .....	6-41
6.3.2.3 Butch Morris and conduction .....	6-42
6.4 Soundpainting, conducting, and improvisation .....	6-43
<b>Chapter 7 : Conclusions and recommendations.....</b>	<b>7-1</b>
7.1 Findings.....	7-1
7.2 Recommendations for further research .....	7-8
<b>References .....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>Discography .....</b>	<b>xlv</b>
<b>Videography .....</b>	<b>xlvii</b>

## Acknowledgements

In spite of a persistent fiction, we never write on a blank page, but always on one that has already been written on.

Michel de Certeau (1988:43)

Jean Bourdin (former head of the Alliance Française de Pretoria) provided the initial impetus for my study of Soundpainting by suggesting that our institution host a series of workshops on the topic presented by François Jeanneau in Pretoria during December 2002. Walter Thompson and Professor Jeanneau were both very generous in sharing their time and expertise on the topic with me, and Professor François Théberge (Head of Jazz Studies at the Paris Conservatoire Supérieur de Musique et de Danse) kindly hosted me during Thompson's Soundpainting workshops in Paris during March 2003. Informal conversations with Anthony Braxton and Eberhard Weber in Munich 1980 also proved inspiring and thought provoking.

My supervisors, Professor Caroline van Niekerk (Department of Music, University of Pretoria) and Professor Allan Munro (Research Professor, Faculty of the Arts, Tshwane University of Technology) were very supportive of my efforts and provided invaluable criticism and encouragement. The University of Pretoria and Tshwane University of Technology both provided funding assistance to me. Mr Eric Dinkelmann, former Dean of the Arts Faculty, Technikon Pretoria, was always supportive of my initial steps in the direction of research, and made it possible for me to attend master classes, conferences, and workshops in England, India, and France.

I would also like to acknowledge the contribution of teachers in my undergraduate years at the University of Cape Town, including Professor James May, Caroline Mears, and especially the late Doctor Barney Keaney,



all of whom provided inspiration and encouragement in my initial studies of music and philosophy. Professors Darius Brubeck and Jürgen Braüninger of the University of Natal further shaped and guided my musical studies at Masters' level.

## Dedication

My observations regarding Soundpainting and improvisation are fuelled by some thirty-plus years of experience as an improvising musician and performer in the fields of **jazz** and free music, as well as so-called popular and world music (especially that originating from the Indian sub-continent). These experiences have led to the good fortune of working and playing with some wonderful musicians from all these genres both at home (in South Africa) and abroad. These encounters have not only enriched me as musician and hopefully as human being, but also encouraged the attitude of keeping an open mind (and ear).

In this spirit I thank the following musicians and composers: Walter Thompson, Professors Pauline Oliveros, George Lewis, Diana Blom, Richard Vella, Doctors Frank Denyer, David Bass, and Nishlyn Ramanna, and Messrs Rick van Heerden, Kevin Davidson, Lukas Ligeti, John Davies, John Fourie, Jonathan Crossley, Robert Payne, Ernest Mothle, Nol Klinkhamer, Evan Ziporyn, Bruce Cassidy, Greg Georgiades, Priyesh Bhana, Ashish Joshi, Deepak Ram, and my fellow UP doctoral students Dave Galloway and Chatradari Devroop. Additionally I would like to acknowledge the assistance of Claude Fabre (*Outre Méasure*, Paris), Christian Rollet (of *Association à la Recherche d'un Folklore Imaginaire*, Lyon, France), and further thank the original members of the Darius Brubeck Group: Rick van Heerden, Kevin Gibson, the late Sandile Shange, as well as Allen Kwela, Syd Kitchen, Tony Cox, and Steve Newman.

My colleagues at TUT School of Music over the last fourteen years also provided a number of practical suggestions regarding the teaching of improvisation skills, as did the students who participated with enthusiasm in any number of ensembles under my direction. I certainly believe that I learned as much from them as they might have from me.

As a fairly regular contributor to the National Youth Jazz Festival (held annually in Grahamstown) I was appointed as musical director of the Standard Bank National Youth Jazz Band in 2001. I thank Alan Webster (Festival director) for this opportunity, as well as the Standard Bank National Youth Jazz Band 2001—Ragnhild Tveitan, Siya Makuzeni, Mzamo Bhengu, Simon Bates, Matthew Boon, Michael Bester, Shaun Johannes, and Michael Horn. My family (my mother and sisters Caroline and Josephine) also provided support and encouragement and I owe them a sincere vote of thanks.

I dedicate this work to all these people from whom I have learned so much both personally and professionally, but especially to my wife Lydia for her tremendous encouragement, support, and advice.

## Summary

Soundpainting is the method of "live composition" invented by New York-based composer and saxophonist Walter Thompson. Using physical gestures for the spontaneous creation of music, Soundpainting therefore shares similarities with other types of *gesture*-based systems for music performance, such as orchestral conducting. Thompson himself (2006) describes his Soundpainting system as a "universal live composing sign language for the performing and visual arts," and therefore Soundpainting can be considered as a subset of other communication systems such as verbal and written language, *kinesics*, and *paralanguage*.

This thesis outlines the general principles of Soundpainting as a system for setting into motion spontaneously created music. The author's aim is to describe Soundpainting in relation to the *linguistic turn* in Thompson's own definition. This opens the way to a sociosemiotic analysis, in which it is susceptible to examination in the light of some theories of language that have emerged in the course of the twentieth century.

A theoretical framework is developed drawing on the work of such pioneers of *semiotics* as Saussure and Peirce, as well as the later work in philosophy of language of Wittgenstein, Barthes, Eco, Derrida, and others. The eclectic concerns of Soundpainting suggest situating Thompson's language in the context of current debates in *critical theory* about tonality, jazz, and improvisation as strategies for constructing identity. Soundpainting, by demonstrating that musical signification can be negotiated through consensus, problematizes the convention of the composer as the sole legitimating authority of the work.

Considering Soundpainting as a processual activity, this dissertation outlines the general principles of Soundpainting as a system for the spontaneous

creation of music. Emphasizing the process-based character of Soundpainting (and its affinity with other forms of improvised music) suggests that such categories of musical activity need to be studied from a different vantage point from that of historical musicology.

## Keywords

Communication, Conducting, Critical theory, Experimental music, Free Improvisation, Musicking, Philosophy of Language, Semiotics, Soundpainting, Wittgenstein.

## Notes to the reader

The author wishes to explain in advance a few conventions regarding proper names and references as used in this doctoral study. When the author cites a name such as Ferdinand de Saussure or Michel de Certeau in full, subsequent references will be cited as Saussure and Certeau.

Wittgenstein's writings are normally cited by title and paragraph number, not by page number. To alert the reader to this, the author uses the symbol <§>. A citation from *Philosophical Investigations* aphorism 9 is then understood as (Wittgenstein), PI §9. The author follows this convention also with regard to writings of Debord as cited.

Gestures in the Soundpainting language are indicated by enclosure within these symbols <>, as in the <long tone> gesture.

The whole gamut of musics known as "classical" is defined as largely tonal, notationally based music of the common practice period, dating from the time of Bach until the end of the nineteenth century, and is abbreviated WEAM (for Western European Art Music), after Conrad Cork's "felicitous acronym for

Western European Art Music" (Collier 1998:11).

For convenience, the author provides a glossary (section 1.10), following the convention that the first time such a term is introduced, it is placed in **bold italics**, indicating that a further definition is available in the glossary.