

Università degli Studi di Pisa

---

FACOLTÀ DI INGEGNERIA  
Corso di Laurea Magistrale in Ingegneria Aerospaziale

TESI DI LAUREA

Variational approach to the problem of  
optimal propeller design

Relatore:

**Prof. Ing. Aldo Frediani**

Correlatore:

**Dott. Antonio Dipace**

Candidato:

**Francesco Torrigiani**

# Abstract

The aim of this paper is to evaluate the theoretical efficiency of propellers with non-planar blade, optimally shaped.

It is well known that non-planar wing configurations can significantly reduce the induced drag [5], hence this can be of interest also for propeller design. Furthermore the adoption of a curvilinear blade system can be justified not only for an efficiency improvement, but also for reason that concerns the structure and the noise reduction [12], [1].

A solution to the optimum rotor problem, in the context of propeller vortex theory, was given by Goldstein [7]. He considered straight blade propellers and expressed the optimum circulation function via a trigonometrical series of Bessel functions. However, such were the difficulties of computation, even after the solution was found, that Theodorsen resorted to the use of rheoelectrical analogy to evaluate the circulation function, unfortunately without great success [14]. Accurate tabulated values of the Goldstein function covering a wide range of parameters became available with an extensive mathematical effort by Tiberi and Wrench [15]. Although this work is based on a completely different approach, Goldstein results are fundamental to validate the procedure for the case of straight blade.

In this dissertation, a variational formulation<sup>1</sup> of the optimum rotor problem is proposed in order to support the optimization of more complex blade configurations, such as the non-planar ones. The first step of the formulation consists into finding a class of functions (representing the circulation distribution along the blade) for which the thrust and the aerodynamic resisting moment functionals are well defined. Then, in this class, the functional to be minimized is proved to be strictly convex; taking into account this result, it is proved that the global minimum exists and is unique.

Some of the configurations analysed are:

- Classical straight blade
- Parabolic blade
- Elliptical blade
- Superelliptic blade

Configurations with the same value of maximum dimensions and performances required are compared in the case of single and multiple blade propellers.

---

<sup>1</sup>This formulation can be seen as the extension of the one proposed in [11].

The main difficulty in the functionals' evaluation, is the fact that an analytical expression of the velocity induced by a semi-infinite helical vortex filament do not exist<sup>2</sup>. For this reason the Euler-Lagrange equation associated with the variational problem is not obtained and a direct method is used. In particular the Ritz Method is adopted.

Another task to deal with, is the evaluation of the singular integral representing the induced velocity. A two-dimensional quadrature rule, based on Legendre polynomials, is used [9].

This procedure is implemented in a MATLAB program that, given the parametric expression of the curve representing the blade, allows the evaluation of the momentum in the required condition and plots the optimal circulation along the curve.

---

<sup>2</sup>Okulov proposed an expression for an infinite helical vortex [10].



# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Airscrew theory</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1	Actuator disk model . . . . .	10
1.1.1	Momentum theory . . . . .	11
1.1.2	Differential momentum theory . . . . .	15
1.1.3	Extended momentum theory . . . . .	16
1.2	Blade element theory . . . . .	17
1.3	Vortex theory . . . . .	21
1.3.1	Rotor with an infinite number of blades . . . . .	23
1.3.2	Rotor with a finite number of blades . . . . .	25
<b>2</b>	<b>Variational formulation</b>	<b>31</b>
2.1	Functionals definition . . . . .	31
2.2	Functions class of $\Gamma$ . . . . .	35
2.3	Existence and continuity . . . . .	35
2.3.1	Thrust functional for straight blade . . . . .	36
2.3.2	Momentum functional for straight blade . . . . .	41
2.4	Convexity . . . . .	42
2.5	Optimal condition . . . . .	44
<b>3</b>	<b>Optimal propeller</b>	<b>47</b>
3.1	Straight blade . . . . .	47
3.1.1	Comparison with Goldstein solution . . . . .	48
3.1.2	Comparison with Momentum theory . . . . .	50
3.1.3	Performance . . . . .	52
3.1.4	Different variational formulations . . . . .	52
3.2	Non-planar blade . . . . .	55
3.2.1	Generalized parabola . . . . .	57
3.2.2	Super-ellipse . . . . .	61
3.2.3	Shifted blade . . . . .	63

<b>4 Numerical method</b>	<b>65</b>
4.1 Ritz method . . . . .	65
4.2 Evaluation of the singular integral . . . . .	68
<b>Appendices</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>A Conservation of axial momentum</b>	<b>75</b>
<b>B Singular part of the kernel</b>	<b>79</b>

# List of Figures

1.1	Reference system . . . . .	10
1.2	Disk actuator model for momentum theory . . . . .	11
1.3	Velocity behavior for momentum theory . . . . .	12
1.4	Pressure behavior for momentum theory . . . . .	12
1.5	Control volume for differential momentum theory . . . . .	15
1.6	Velocity triangle in blade section . . . . .	19
1.7	Interference factors for $\frac{w_0}{V_\infty} = 0.1$ and $\mu_0 = 10$ . . . . .	20
1.8	Circulation for $\mu_0 = 10$ according to blade element theory . . . . .	21
1.9	Velocity triangle in blade section . . . . .	22
1.10	Wake geometry . . . . .	22
1.11	Wake geometry for an infinite number of blades . . . . .	23
1.12	Upstream surface for Stokes' theorem . . . . .	24
1.13	Angular velocity behavior . . . . .	24
1.14	Wake geometry for a finite number of blades . . . . .	25
1.15	Velocities and forces in blade section . . . . .	25
1.16	Velocity of the rigid helicoids near the rotor . . . . .	26
1.17	Geometry of the potential problem . . . . .	27
1.18	Axial and rotational induced velocities for tip speed ratio $\mu_0 = 4$ . . . . .	28
1.19	Distance between spirals . . . . .	28
1.20	Prandtl model for tip analysis . . . . .	28
1.21	Prandtl optimal circulation for tip speed ratio $\mu_0 = 4$ . . . . .	29
1.22	Goldstein (solid line) and Prandtl (dashed line) optimal circulation distribution for a two bladed propeller . . . . .	29
2.1	System of reference . . . . .	31
2.2	Vector definition . . . . .	32
2.3	Integration regular sets . . . . .	39
3.1	Obtained (solid line) and Goldstein (dashed line) circulation distribution for a two-bladed rotor. . . . .	49

3.2	Obtained (solid line) and Goldstein (dashed line) circulation distribution for different number of blades and $\mu_0 = 2$ . . . . .	49
3.3	Obtained (solid line) and Goldstein (dashed line) axial induced velocity for a two-bladed propeller with different value of tip speed ratio. . . . .	49
3.4	Obtained (solid line) and Goldstein (dashed line) rotational induced velocity for a two-bladed propeller with different value of tip speed ratio. . . . .	50
3.5	Obtained circulation (solid line), respectively for propeller with $N = 2, 4, 8, 12$ blades, and circulation according to momentum theory (dashed line), for $\mu_0 = 2$ . . . . .	50
3.6	Obtained circulation (solid line), respectively for propeller with $N = 2, 4, 8, 12$ blades, and circulation according to momentum theory (dashed line), for $\mu_0 = 5$ . . . . .	50
3.7	Propeller with $N = 3$ and $\mu_0 = 2$ . . . . .	51
3.8	Propeller with $N = 3$ and $\mu_0 = 4$ . . . . .	51
3.9	Propeller with $N = 6$ and $\mu_0 = 2$ . . . . .	51
3.10	Efficiency for $C_{Ttarget} = 0.5$ . . . . .	52
3.11	Efficiency for $C_{Ttarget} = 0.8$ . . . . .	52
3.12	Efficiency for $\Omega = 8$ . . . . .	52
3.13	Induced velocity from classical formulation (dashed line) and from our formulation (solid line) for different value of tip speed ratio $\Omega$ . . . . .	53
3.14	Circulation from classical (dotted), minimum $C_M$ (dashed), maximum $C_T$ (solid) formulation for $N = 6$ and $\Omega = 5$ . . . . .	54
3.15	Induced velocity from classical (dotted), minimum $C_M$ (dashed), maximum $C_T$ (solid) formulation for $N = 6$ and $\Omega = 5$ . . . . .	54
3.16	Reference system and blade line vector . . . . .	55
3.17	Semi-parabolic blade . . . . .	57
3.18	Relative efficiency of generalized semi-parabolic blades for $N = 3, \Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.5$ . . . . .	57
3.19	Circulation distribution of generalized semi-parabolic blade for $N = 3, \Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.5$ . . . . .	58
3.20	Circulation distribution of generalized semi-parabolic blade for $N = 3, \Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.5$ . . . . .	58
3.21	Circulation distribution of generalized semi-parabolic blade for $N = 3, \Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.5$ . . . . .	58
3.22	Relative efficiency of generalized semi-parabolic blades for $N = 5, \Omega = 3$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.2$ . . . . .	59
3.23	Circulation distribution of generalized semi-parabolic blade for $N = 3, \Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.5$ . . . . .	59



3.24	Circulation distribution of generalized semi-parabolic blade for $N = 5$ , $\Omega = 3$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.2$ . . . . .	59
3.25	Parabolic blade . . . . .	60
3.26	Circulation distribution of parabolic blade for $N = 5$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.5$ . . . . .	60
3.27	Relative efficiency of parabolic blades for $N = 3$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.5$ . . . . .	61
3.28	Super-elliptic blade . . . . .	61
3.29	Relative efficiency of super-elliptic blades for $N = 2$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.1$ . . . . .	62
3.30	Circulation distribution of super-elliptic blade for $N = 2$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.1$ . . . . .	62
3.31	Circulation distribution of super-elliptic blade for $N = 3$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.1$ . . . . .	62
3.32	Relative efficiency of shifted straight blades for $N = 2$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.2$ . . . . .	63
3.33	Circulation distribution for shifted straight blades with $N = 2$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.2$ . . . . .	63
3.34	Relative efficiency of shifted elliptic blades for $N = 3$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.1$ . . . . .	64
3.35	Circulation distribution for shifted elliptic blades with $N = 3$ , $\Omega = 2$ and $C_{Ttarget} = 0.2$ . . . . .	64
4.1	Base functions (a) and their derivative (b) for $i \in [1, 7]$ . . . . .	66
4.2	Integration sets for the quadrature rule . . . . .	70
4.3	Single integration set for the quadrature rule . . . . .	70
4.4	Planar representation of the integration grid. . . . .	71
4.5	Integration grid . . . . .	71
A.1	Disk actuator model for momentum theory . . . . .	75
A.2	Disk actuator model for momentum theory . . . . .	76

# Bibliography

- [1] R. Avellàn, A. Lundbladh, “*Boxprop, a forward-swept joined-blade propeller*”, AIAA 2013.
- [2] A. Betz, L. Prandtl, “*Schraubenpropeller mit geringstem Energieverlust*”, Göttingen State and University Library (1919).
- [3] J. J. Chattot, “*Optimization of propellers using helicoidal vortex model*”, Computational Fluid Dynamics Journal Vol. 9, No. 2, Jul. 2000.
- [4] J. J. Chattot, “*Design and analysis of wind turbine using helicoidal vortex model*”, Computational Fluid Dynamics Journal Vol. 11, No. 1, Apr. 2002.
- [5] A. Dipace, “*An Invariant formulation for the minimum induced drag conditions of non-planar wing systems*”, Università degli Studi di Pisa, 2011-2012.
- [6] L. E. Elsgolc, “*Calculus of variation*”, Pergamon Press (1961).
- [7] S. Goldstein, “*On the vortex theory of screw propellers*”, Royal Society of London, Series A (1929).
- [8] W. Johnson, “*Helicopter theory*”, Dover Publications (1980).
- [9] G. Monegato, “*The numerical evaluation of a 2-D Cauchy principal value integral arising in boundary integral equation methods*”, AMS Vol. 62, No. 206, Apr. 1994, pp. 765-777.
- [10] V. L. Okulov, J. N. Sorensen, “*Optimum operating regimes for ideal wind turbine*”, Journal of Physics, Conference Series 75 (2007).
- [11] M. T. Panaro, A. Frediani, F. Giannessi, E. Rizzo, “*Variational approach to the problem of the minimum induced drag of wings*”, Variational Analysis and Aerospace Engineering, 2009, pp. 313-342.

- [12] C. D. Paxton, P. J. Gryn, E. K. Hines, "*High efficiency forward swept propellers at low speed*", AIAA 2003.
- [13] E. Pistolesi, "*Aerodinamica*", UTET 1932.
- [14] T. Theodorsen, "*Theory of propellers*", Theory of propellers, 1948.
- [15] C. L. Tibery and J. W. Wrench, "*Tables of Goldstein factor*", report 1534, Applied Mathematics Laboratory, Washington DC, 1964.
- [16] R. Tognaccini, "*Lezioni di aerodinamica dell'ala rotante*", Università degli Studi di Napoli Federico II, 2008-2009.
- [17] F. Tricomi, "*Equazioni integrali contenenti il valor principale di un integrale doppio*", *Mathematische Zeitschrift* (1928), Vol. 27, pp. 87-133.