

1 **Pneumococcal protein antigen serology varies with age and may predict antigenic**
2 **profile of colonizing isolates**

3
4 Azarian T¹, Grant LR², Georgieva M¹, Hammitt LL², Reid R², Bentley SD³, Goldblatt D⁴,
5 Santosham M², Weatherholtz R², Burbidge P⁴, Goklish N², Thompson CM¹, Hanage
6 WP¹, O'Brien KL², Lipsitch M¹

7
8 1 Center for Communicable Disease Dynamics, Department of Epidemiology, T.H. Chan
9 School of Public Health, Harvard University; 2 Center for American Indian Health, Johns
10 Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland; 3 Wellcome Trust
11 Sanger Institute, Cambridge, UK; 4 Immunobiology Section, Institute of Child Health,
12 University College London, London, UK.

13
14 Word Count:

15 Abstract: 200

16 Main text: 3497

17 References: 37

18
19 Lindsay R. Grant lgrant10@jhu.edu

20 Maria Georgieva georgiev@hsph.harvard.edu

21 Laura Hammitt lhammitt@jhu.edu

22 Ray Reid rreid2@jhu.edu

23 Stephen D Bentley sdb@sanger.ac.uk

24 David Goldblatt d.goldblatt@ucl.ac.uk

25 Mathuram Santosham msantosham@jhu.edu

26 Robert Weatherholtz rwheathe1@jhu.edu

27 Polly Burbidge p.burbidge@ucl.ac.uk

28 Novalene Goklish ngoklish@jhsph.edu

29 Claudette M Thompson cthomps@hsph.harvard.edu

30 Bill Hanage whanage@hsph.harvard.edu

31 Kate O'Brien klobrien@jhsph.edu

32 Marc Lipsitch mlipsitc@hsph.harvard.edu

33
34
35 **Corresponding Author:**

36 Taj Azarian, PhD MPH

37 352.494.2011

38 Center for Communicable Disease Dynamics,

39 Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health,

40 677 Huntington Avenue, Suite 506, Boston, MA 02115

41 tazarian@hsph.harvard.edu

42

43 **Abstract**

44

45 **Background:** Several *Streptococcus pneumoniae* proteins play a role in pathogenesis
46 and are being investigated as vaccine targets. It is largely unknown whether naturally-
47 acquired antibodies reduce the risk of colonization with strains expressing a particular
48 antigenic variant.

49 **Methods:** Serum IgG titers to 28 pneumococcal protein antigens were measured among
50 242 individuals, aged < 6 months - 78 years in Native American communities between
51 2007-2009. Nasopharyngeal swabs were collected at least 30 days after serum
52 collection, and the protein antigen variant in each pneumococcal isolate was determined
53 using genomic data. We assessed the association between preexisting variant-specific
54 antibody titers and subsequent carriage of pneumococcus expressing a particular
55 antigen variant.

56 **Results:** Antibody titers often increased across pediatric groups before decreasing
57 among adults. PspA and StkP IgG titers decreased from <6 months to 6-12 months
58 ($p < 0.01$). Individuals with low titers against Group 3 PspC variants were more likely to
59 be colonized with pneumococci expressing those variants. For other antigens, variant-
60 specific IgG titers do not predict colonization with pneumococci expressing particular
61 variants.

62 **Conclusion:** We observed an inverse association between variant-specific antibody
63 concentration and homologous pneumococcal colonization for only one protein. Further
64 assessment of antibody repertoires may elucidate the nature of anti-pneumococcal
65 antibody-mediated mucosal immunity while informing future vaccine development.

66

67 **Key words:** *Streptococcus pneumoniae*, pneumococci, protein antigens, sera,
68 immunology, PspC, PspA, vaccine, pilus, antibody

69

70 **Introduction**

71 Current pneumococcal conjugate vaccines have significantly reduced invasive
72 disease caused by the included *Streptococcus pneumoniae* (pneumococcal) serotypes.
73 However, the currently licensed vaccines, PCV-10 and PCV-13, target only 10 or 13 of
74 the ~90 recognized pneumococcal capsular serotypes. In addition to incomplete
75 coverage of disease-causing types, significant disadvantages of capsular vaccines
76 include their production cost, production complexity, and serotype replacement. While
77 PCV formulations are still an attractive vaccine approach, these limitations have
78 motivated pursuit of pneumococcal protein antigens as vaccine candidates. Protein-
79 based vaccines would, in theory, generate robust antibody responses, be efficacious in
80 young children, and may decrease carriage (1).

81 Pneumococcal surface protein A (PspA), PspC, pilus (RrgA/B/C), pneumolysin
82 (Ply) and neuraminidase (NanA) are among the pneumococcal proteins being
83 investigated for use in vaccine formulations (1). Studies suggest that in some cases
84 combinations of these proteins may elicit better protection than any of the proteins
85 themselves (1,2). In humans, antibodies to pneumococcal proteins can be detected
86 during colonization and natural infection, providing protection from subsequent
87 colonization and invasive disease (3–8). Virolainen *et al.* showed that among children
88 with invasive pneumococcal infections, those with lowest antibody titers to PspA were
89 infected most frequently with pneumococci (9). However, animal data show that while
90 antiprotein antibodies are correlated with protection against subsequent challenge, the
91 mechanism of protection is not necessarily antibody mediated, suggesting antibody
92 levels may correlate with degree of immune response but not necessarily exclusively
93 mediate protection. Evidence of variant-specific protection, in which antibodies to a
94 particular protein antigenic variant correlate with protection against colonization by
95 homologous pneumococci (i.e. those with that protein variant), would be more strongly

96 indicative of antiprotein antibodies' causal role in protection, as has been observed for
97 serotype-specific anticapsular antibodies (10,11).

98 At the same time, such evidence would provide a mechanism to explain the high
99 level of sequence variation and signs of diversifying selection at these loci. While these
100 protein antigens are present in almost all pneumococci, they are also very diverse, and
101 pneumococcal strains differ considerably in the particular antigenic variants they express
102 (12). Two clear examples are the surface associated choline-binding proteins PspA and
103 PspC. Both are encoded by polymorphic genes with clear structural variability, which
104 becomes the basis for their division into 3 PspA families and 11 PspC groups (12,13).
105 Studies suggest structural differences in these proteins impact the nature and specificity
106 of the antibody response generated toward them. For example, family-specific antibody
107 responses among children exposed to pneumococci possessing family 1 and 2 PspA
108 variants have been observed (14).

109 Important uncertainties remain about the biologic function of protein antibodies
110 and the extent to which their binding and activity are specific to particular variants of
111 polymorphic antigens. Here, we investigate whether naturally acquired antibodies to
112 protein antigens reduce the risk of nasopharyngeal acquisition (i.e. colonization) with
113 strains containing particular variants of diverse proteins such as PspA and PspC. To
114 address this question, we used pneumococcal genomic data to identify variants of 21
115 pneumococcal protein antigens present in *S. pneumoniae* carriage isolates. We then
116 assessed the association between antibody titers and subsequent colonization with *S.*
117 *pneumoniae* strains expressing an antigen recognized by preexisting antibodies. We
118 posited that individuals who had low antibody titers to a specific protein antigen variant
119 would be more likely to be colonized with *S. pneumoniae* expressing that variant.

120

121 **Methods**

122

123 *Study Population, Serum Collection, and Nasopharyngeal Colonization*

124

125 Individuals included in this study were a subset of participants in a larger
126 prospective, longitudinal, observational cohort study of pneumococcal carriage among
127 Navajo and White Mountain Apache families described elsewhere (15). Briefly,
128 participants living on reservations in the southwest USA were enrolled from March 2006
129 to March 2008. Demographic and epidemiological data are provided in Supplementary
130 Table 1. Serum and nasopharyngeal (NP) specimens were obtained on the initial visit
131 after recruitment, and NP samples were collected at each of six follow-up visits at one-
132 month intervals to determine pneumococcal carriage status (16). We selected
133 individuals who were negative for carriage at the initial visit, had an available enrollment
134 serum sample, and subsequently had a pneumococcal isolate detected ≥ 30 days after
135 serum collection. The Navajo Nation, White Mountain Apache tribe and the IRBs of the
136 Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, the Navajo Nation and the Phoenix
137 Area IHS approved this study. Written informed consent was obtained from adult
138 participants and from caregivers of child participants. Assent was obtained from children
139 7-17 years.

140

141 *Protein Antigen Serology*

142

143 Serum IgG to 28 pneumococcal protein antigens were measured using direct
144 binding electrochemiluminescence-based multiplex assay (MSD, Rockville, MD) (7).
145 Antibody levels among participants are expressed as a titer relative to the amount in a
146 reference serum. The 28 antigens represent 21 pneumococcal proteins and alleles or
147 structural variants of polymorphic proteins (Table 1). In particular, antibody titers were

148 measured for variants of PcpC, PspA, pilus subunit RrgB, pneumolysin (ply), and
149 pneumococcal histidine triad D (PhtD). Four PspC variants, representing four of the 11
150 recognized major groups (12), were selected based on their prevalence in a
151 pneumococcal carriage study in Massachusetts, USA (17). Two variants, var-I and var-
152 II, contain choline-binding domains (CBD), while var-III (Group 7) and var-IV (Group 8)
153 contain the LPXTG (sortase) motif. Truncated PspC constructs were designed to
154 uniquely represent each PspC variant. Truncation removed the proline-rich and cell wall
155 anchor motifs, which are highly homologous to those found in PspA (Supplementary
156 Figure 1).

157

158 *Genome Sequencing and Protein Antigen Identification*

159

160 Genomic DNA from *S. pneumoniae* isolates were sequenced on the Illumina
161 HiSeq to produce paired-end 100 bp reads at ≥ 30 -fold coverage. Serotypes were
162 determined by mapping reads to concatenated CPS locus sequences of 90
163 pneumococcal serotypes using SRST2 (18,19). *De novo* genome assemblies were
164 generated with Velvet (20) and annotated using Prokka (21). Pangenome analysis was
165 conducted with Roary (22) to cluster and abstract protein antigen genes. The coding
166 sequence for each protein antigen in the MSD assay was downloaded from KEGG
167 (<http://www.kegg.jp/>) and orthologs from *S. pneumoniae* reference strains were identified
168 (Table 1). The MSD index variant, *S. pneumoniae* reference orthologs, and *de novo*
169 assembled protein antigen genes were aligned with PRANK using a codon-aware
170 algorithm (23). The diversity of each protein antigen among sequenced isolates was
171 assessed to classify each antigen as polymorphic or conserved. Maximum likelihood
172 phylogenies were inferred from the alignments using RAxML v8.0.0. For polymorphic
173 antigens, one reference variant was selected from each monophyletic clade and used to

174 construct a protein database for SRST2 (19). To determine the antigenic profile of each
175 carried pneumococci, reads were mapped to each variant and the highest scoring match
176 was reported.

177

178 *Statistical Analysis*

179

180 To investigate correlation among participants' anti-protein titers and association
181 with age, we performed hierarchical clustering of 28 titers using the mclust v5.2 package
182 in R. We then assessed the association between titers and subsequent carriage of a
183 pneumococcus possessing alleles against which the participant had antibodies. For
184 each polymorphic protein antigen, log antibody titers were compared among individuals
185 carrying a pneumococcus with the respective variant. Statistical significance was
186 assessed using analysis of variance and Tukey's HSD. For the pilus (RrgA/B), which is
187 present in only a fraction of pneumococci, we assessed anti-pilus titers between
188 individuals colonized with piliated and non-piliated strains.

189

190 **Results**

191 This analysis included 242 participants who had new pneumococcal colonization
192 ≥ 30 days after serum collection (range 30-225 days, median=69). Individuals ranged in
193 age from <1 month to 78 years of age, and had 34 pneumococcal serotypes identified in
194 addition to 4 non-typable isolates (Supplementary Table 2). For two participants, two
195 serotypes were identified, and a single serotype was selected for WGS. Among
196 participants, 14 carried pneumococci that were PCV-7 vaccine types, and the distribution
197 of PCV-7 types did not significantly differ by age group (Fisher's Exact, $p=0.28$).

198

199 *Classification of pneumococcal protein antigens*

200 Phylogenetic analysis identified 11 polymorphic protein antigens and 10 that
201 were largely conserved. Table 2 lists the variant frequencies for the 21 protein antigens.
202 In some cases, the protein antigen variant was unable to be assigned; therefore, counts
203 for some antigens do not total 242. We measured antibody titers to multiple variants of
204 three proteins with polymorphisms (PspC, PspA, and RrgB). For the remaining 10
205 proteins, we measured antibody titers for one variant and compared titers among
206 individuals with carriage isolates possessing polymorphic variants.

207

208 *Protein Antigen Serology*

209

210 Participants' responses to different PspC variants were positively correlated,
211 ($r=0.29-0.90$, $p<0.05$ for all correlations), such that those with high PspC var-I titers also
212 had high titers to the other PspC variants (Figure 1 and Supplementary Figure 2). Titers
213 against two of the three RrgB variants were highly correlated with each other (0.96,
214 $p<0.01$), and less correlated with those against Var-III (Figure 1 and Supplemental
215 Figure 3). Among other protein antigens, we found significant correlation between
216 variants of the same antigen (Figure 1). There was also high correlation among
217 antigens including PiuA, PiaA, PcsB, Spr2021, PcpA, CbpA, PhtE, and PhtD.

218 Antibody titers for most proteins increased with age including PspC variants
219 (Figure 2A), PspA variants (Figure 2B), Ply variants (Figure 2D) and others
220 (Supplementary Figure 4). Anti-pilus (RrgA/B) titers did not vary across pediatric ages;
221 however, adults (18+ years) had significantly higher anti-RrgA/B titers compared to
222 pediatric participants (<18 years) ($p<0.001$) (Figure 2C). For PspA ($p<0.01$), StkP
223 ($p<0.01$) and PhtD ($p<0.01$), participants 6-12 months and 12-24 months had lower
224 titers than <6-month-old participants. Among most protein antigens, the magnitude of

225 titers were comparable, with the exception of PspC var-IV titers that were an order of
226 magnitude lower across all ages, compared to other PspC variants.

227 Hierarchical clustering of individual sera by the patterns of scaled antibody titers
228 identified two clusters. The larger cluster (A) included substantial numbers of participants
229 from all age groups, while cluster B was comprised largely of participants <5 years of
230 age (86.8%) (Supplemental Figure 5). This cluster of pediatric participants had antibody
231 titers below the population mean for a large proportion of protein antigens, compared to
232 pediatric participants in cluster A, suggesting this population was either comparatively
233 unexposed to pneumococcal protein antigens, or unresponsive to them.

234

235 *Analysis of individual protein sequence variation and association with antibody titers*

236

237 *PspC*

238

239 Among PspC variants, var-I was the most prevalent (84.1% of carriage isolates)
240 followed by var-II (12%). Var-I corresponds to Groups 2, 3 and 6 of PspC proteins
241 based on sequence identity and structural organization, and var-II corresponds to Group
242 4 (Table 1) (12). The low prevalence of other PspC variants largely limited statistical
243 comparison of anti-PspC titers to var-I and var-II. As age may mediate pneumococcal
244 carriage, we first investigated carriage of the PspC var-I by age group and found that it
245 did not differ significantly between pediatric and adult participants ($X^2=0.03$, p-
246 value=0.87). Similarly, PspC variants II-IV did not significantly differ by age group. Anti-
247 PspC titers did not differ significantly by pneumococcal carriage isolate variant for var-II
248 (p=0.18), var-III (p=0.23), or var-IV (p=0.53) (Figure 3A); however, differences in anti-
249 var-I titers among participants carrying PspC variants approached statistical significance
250 [F(3)=2.41, p=0.07]. We collapsed non-var-I PspC variants into a single category and

251 compared titers between var-I and non-var-I. We found anti-var-I titers were significantly
252 lower among individuals who went on to acquire strains possessing var-I [median log
253 antibody titer 3.20 (var-I) vs. 3.31 (non-var-I) ($p=0.019$)] (Figure 3B). This correlation
254 was found in all age groups but only significant for participants <1 year of age
255 (Supplementary Figure 6). In a logistic regression model controlling for age, low var-I
256 titers were significantly associated with subsequent carriage of a strain carrying the var-I
257 variant (OR=0.36, 95% CI 0.14-0.81, $p=0.02$). This suggests that low anti-var-I titers
258 may be positively associated with acquisition of a strain possessing the PspC var-I.

259

260 *PspA*

261

262 Among pneumococci in this sample, we identified all three families of PspA
263 variants described by Hollingshead and colleagues (13). Most isolates (70%) were
264 family 1 PspA variant (Table 1). Additionally, 1% of strains ($n=3$) were a PspA variant
265 that formed an out-group to Families 1-3. Anti-PspA antibody titers were assessed
266 among individuals carrying four PspA variants (Family 1-3 and Unknown). Among
267 participants carrying pneumococcal strains with polymorphic PspA variants, anti-PspA
268 titers for Family 1 and 2 did not significantly differ ($p=0.53$ and 0.62) (Figure 3C).
269 Additionally, carriage of PspA variants was not found to vary by age.

270

271 *Type 1 Pilus (RrgA-C)*

272

273 Using the presence of RrgB as a marker, we found 11% of carriage strains were
274 piliated (Table 1). Among piliated strains ($n=24$), RrgB var-II was most common,
275 followed closely by the var-III. Piliated strains were most often serotype 35B (42.9%),
276 7B (21.4%), or 19A (14.3%). Carriage of a piliated pneumococcus did not significantly

277 differ between pediatric and adult participants ($X^2=0.49$, $p=0.49$). Anti-RrgB antibody
278 titers of var-II and var-I did not significantly differ by carriage variant ($p=0.38$ and 0.37)
279 (Figure 3C). However, we found that anti-RrgB var-III titers were significantly higher
280 ($p<0.001$) among participants with subsequent carriage strains possessing var-III RrgB.
281 This is contrary to what would be expected if higher variant specific titers were protective
282 against colonization with respective strains. Anti-RrgA titers also did not significantly
283 differ among carriage variants ($p= 0.148$). Last, we assessed anti-RrgB titers among
284 carriage variants, comparing participants carrying piliated and non-piliated strains. Anti-
285 RrgB titers did not significantly differ among participants subsequently colonized with
286 piliated or non-piliated strains (Supplemental Figure 7).

287

288 *Other polymorphic protein antigens*

289

290 For the polymorphic protein antigens NanA, SP0609, SP2194, PhtD, StkP, and
291 StrH, where antibody titers were measured for only one variant, we compared titers
292 among participants carrying pneumococci with heterologous antigen variants
293 (Supplementary Figure 8). Distribution of NanA variants I-III did not differ between
294 pediatric and adult participants ($p=0.32$). Anti-NanA titers varied among participants
295 ($p=0.08$), with var-I titers marginally lower among participants carrying pneumococci with
296 var-I. Interestingly, var-I was the least common, present in only 3.0% of carriage
297 isolates. No statistically significant differences in anti-protein antibody titers were
298 observed among the remaining polymorphic proteins. Additionally, with the exception of
299 SP0609, for which the var-I was more prevalent among pediatric participants ($p=0.001$),
300 protein antigen variant frequencies did not differ by age group.

301

302 **Discussion**

303 Protein-based vaccines aim to further reduce the morbidity of pneumococcal
304 disease; however, a clearer understanding of the dynamics of protein antigen immunity
305 and pneumococcal carriage is required. As with previous studies, we found that adult
306 sera possessed antibodies to multiple antigens and to multiple variants of variable
307 antigens, and antibody titers usually increased across participant age groups, with adults
308 having higher overall mean anti-protein titers (7,14). For PspA, StkP, and PhtD, a
309 significant reduction in protein antibodies was observed between infants <6-months-old
310 and children 6-24 months, likely resulting from the loss of maternally acquired antibodies
311 and slower acquisition in infancy and toddlerhood than for other antigens. While
312 increasing natural immunity with age has been shown in previous studies of
313 pneumococcal protein antigens (5,7,24), this is the first study to assess variant-specific
314 antibodies and their effect on protection against homologous pneumococcal
315 colonization. We found increased carriage of pneumococci expressing var-I PspC
316 among participants with lower anti-PspC var-I titers. However, among all other protein
317 antigens, including PspA, we found no difference in anti-protein antibody titers by
318 subsequent colonization status with those variants. Because our study was designed to
319 focus on variant-specific protection by serum antibody against colonization with a
320 particular antigenic variant, we did not assess antibody levels in individuals who were
321 subsequently not colonized with pneumococcus, so we were unable to assess the
322 absolute level of protection against colonization associated with particular levels of
323 serum antibodies. Our results suggest that whatever protection these antibodies offer, it
324 is modestly variant-specific for PspC and not measurably variant-specific for other
325 antigens.

326 PspC and PspA are structurally similar surface proteins (25) known for their
327 interaction with the host immune system (26,27), involvement in host epithelial
328 adherence (28), and high recombination rates (17,29). Host immune evasion is often

329 invoked to explain the apparent increased recombination rates, sequence diversity and
330 evidence of diversifying selection in *pspA* and *pspC*; however, there is no direct
331 experimental evidence for this (30,31). Studies so far have implicated anti-PspC in
332 protection against colonization, while anti-PspA seems important for protection against
333 invasive disease (14). The growing interest in both PspC and PspA as vaccine
334 candidates underscores the need for better understanding and characterization of the
335 nature of anti-PspA and anti-PspC immunity.

336 In this study, we investigated four variants of PspC, each representing one of the
337 11 recognized PspC groups (12). Our data suggest there may exist specificity against
338 colonization based on exposure history, where colonization with a rare PspC variant
339 leaves individuals susceptible to colonization with the most prevalent circulating strain.
340 This observation is consistent with the concept of balancing selection in which the
341 selective pressure of host immunity is sufficient to impact the frequency of specific PspC
342 variants in the overall pneumococcal population. In general, this hypothesis is supported
343 by the observation of high rates of recombination in the PspC locus, which may provide
344 a way for pneumococci to obtain a PspC variant with low population level host immunity.
345 However, these underlying population dynamics require further exploration.

346 In prior studies, anti-PspA titers in children reflected the PspA family to which
347 they had been exposed (14), while adults often possessed high titers to both major
348 families. Among participants of this study, family 2 PspA variants were found in only
349 27% of carriage isolates and mean anti-PspA family 2 variant titers were consistently
350 lower among each age group. However, we found that anti-PspA titers were not
351 predictive of the subsequently carried strain. In the context of previous studies
352 demonstrating the protective role of anti-PspA antibodies, it appears that the cross-
353 reactivity of antibodies may provide a broad level of protection from all PspA families.

354 The pneumococcal pilus, comprised of proteins RrgA, RrgB and RrgC, facilitates
355 binding to lung epithelial cells and colonization (32) and has been explored as a potential
356 vaccine candidate (33). The pilus operon has been shown to recombine and be acted
357 on by positive selection (34) Immunization with pilus subunits has been shown to
358 provide protection against systemic challenge with pilated pneumococcal strains (35).
359 Previously estimated to be present in ~30% of pneumococci (36), pilus was present in
360 only 11% of our studied strains. We found that while anti-pilus antibody titers were
361 significantly higher among adults compared with children, there was no difference in the
362 proportion of carried strains that were pilated between these age groups. Furthermore,
363 anti-pilus titers were not predictive of either carriage of pilated strains or RrgB variant
364 among carried pilated strains. This was unexpected considering the high anti-RrgB
365 titers in adults and the elevated RrgB var-III titers compared to variants I and II, which
366 were less prevalent among pilated strains (Figure 2C). The low prevalence of pilated
367 strains in the pneumococcal isolates from this study or variations in pilus expression (37)
368 may have reduced our ability to detect differential pneumococcal carriage according to
369 antibody titers.

370 While for the majority of protein antigen variants we failed to find any variant-
371 specific protective effect against carriage, it should be noted that immunity generated by
372 naturally acquired antibodies is likely more complex than a simple variant-specific
373 protective effect. Several prior studies have suggested some degree of cross-reactivity
374 between antibodies to one variant of a protein and pneumococci carrying another. This
375 could be consistent with subtle selective pressures imposed by modestly greater
376 protection against homologous than heterologous variants, which may be hard to
377 measure in a host population. Furthermore immune responses against different proteins
378 may have cumulative effects, such that the variant-specificity of antibodies to a particular
379 protein would be obscured when considering the ability of these antibodies to protect

380 against a strain to which the individual may have many other effective antiprotein
381 antibody responses. Indeed, challenge studies of protein-based vaccines in animal
382 models have clearly shown that combination vaccines including 2-3 pneumococcal
383 proteins are more efficacious for protection against invasive challenge (1,2). This likely
384 reflects the *in vivo* interaction of host immunity with multiple pneumococcal antigens;
385 however, this interaction is difficult to investigate. We observed a correlation of anti-
386 protein titers among several antigen variants, suggesting that individuals likely possess a
387 repertoire of antibodies to a specific set of protein antigen variants.

388 Certain limitations should be considered when interpreting our results. We
389 selected genetic variants of protein antigens based on extant literature and phylogenetic
390 analysis, identifying one strain from each monophyletic clade to represent a putatively
391 antigenically distinct variant. However, each of these protein variants possesses several
392 distinct epitopes, each likely generating a different antibody response. It is conceivable
393 that antibodies against one protein antigen are in fact a mixture of antibodies of varying
394 specificity, complicating the characterization of the overall response against one antigen.
395 This is certainly a confounding factor in our analysis and future studies should assess
396 pneumococcal anti-protein antibody repertoires and functionally characterize distinct
397 protein antigen variants (e.g. PspC) to determine the nature of the antibody response
398 they elicit and further our understanding of protection while informing vaccine
399 development. Secondly, the exposure histories of participants are unknown, and
400 participants were seemingly less likely to be exposed to rare protein variants in the
401 pneumococcal population. Overall, using a large sample pneumococcal strains and sera
402 from those who carried these strains we found only modest evidence for variant-
403 specificity of protection against pneumococcal carriage.

404

405

406 **Conflict of Interest**

407 The authors disclose no conflicts of interest.

408 **Funding Sources**

409 This study was supported by R01 R01AI048935, the Grand Challenges in Global Health initiative
410 through the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, the Native American Research Centers for Health
411 (U26IHS300013/03), the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention National Vaccine Program
412 Office, and the Thrasher Research Fund (02820-9).

413

414

415 Correspondence and requests for reprints should be addressed to Taj Azarian

416 tazarian@hsph.harvard.edu

417 **References**

- 418 1. Darrieux M, Goulart C, Briles D, Leite LC de C. Current status and perspectives
419 on protein-based pneumococcal vaccines. *Crit Rev Microbiol. Informa Healthcare*;
420 **2015**; 41(2):190–200.
- 421 2. Cao J, Chen D, Xu W, et al. Enhanced protection against pneumococcal infection
422 elicited by immunization with the combination of PspA, PspC, and ClpP. *Vaccine*.
423 Elsevier; **2007**; 25(27):4996–5005.
- 424 3. Lebon A, Verkaik NJ, Labout JAM, et al. Natural antibodies against several
425 pneumococcal virulence proteins in children during the pre-pneumococcal-vaccine
426 era: the generation R study. *Infect Immun*. **2011**; 79(4):1680–7.
- 427 4. McCool TL, Cate TR, Tuomanen EI, Adrian P, Mitchell TJ, Weiser JN. Serum
428 Immunoglobulin G Response to Candidate Vaccine Antigens during Experimental
429 Human Pneumococcal Colonization. *Infect Immun*. **2003**; 71(10):5724–5732.
- 430 5. Rapola S, Jääntti V, Haikala R, et al. Natural development of antibodies to
431 pneumococcal surface protein A, pneumococcal surface adhesin A, and
432 pneumolysin in relation to pneumococcal carriage and acute otitis media. *J Infect*
433 *Dis*. **2000**; 182(4):1146–52.
- 434 6. Holmlund E, Quiambao B, Ollgren J, et al. Antibodies to pneumococcal proteins
435 PhtD, CbpA, and LytC in Filipino pregnant women and their infants in relation to
436 pneumococcal carriage. *Clin Vaccine Immunol. Am Soc Microbiol*; **2009**;
437 16(6):916–923.
- 438 7. Turner P, Turner C, Green N, et al. Serum antibody responses to pneumococcal
439 colonization in the first 2 years of life: results from an SE Asian longitudinal cohort
440 study. *Clin Microbiol Infect*. **2013**; 19(12):E551–8.
- 441 8. Simell B, Melin M, Lahdenkari M, et al. Antibodies to pneumococcal surface
442 protein A families 1 and 2 in serum and saliva of children and the risk of

- 443 pneumococcal acute otitis media. *J Infect Dis.* **2007**; 196(10):1528–36.
- 444 9. Virolainen A, Russell W, Crain MJ, Rapola S, Käyhty H, Briles DE. Human
445 antibodies to pneumococcal surface protein A in health and disease. *Pediatr*
446 *Infect Dis J. LWW*; **2000**; 19(2):134.
- 447 10. Weinberger DM, Dagan R, Givon-Lavi N, Regev-Yochay G, Malley R, Lipsitch M.
448 Epidemiologic evidence for serotype-specific acquired immunity to pneumococcal
449 carriage. *J Infect Dis.* **2008**; 197(11):1511–8.
- 450 11. Trzcinski K, Thompson C, Malley R, Lipsitch M. Antibodies to Conserved
451 Pneumococcal Antigens Correlate with, but Are Not Required for, Protection
452 against Pneumococcal Colonization Induced by Prior Exposure in a Mouse Model.
453 *Infect Immun. American Society for Microbiology*; **2005**; 73(10):7043–7046.
- 454 12. Iannelli F, Oggioni MR, Pozzi G. Allelic variation in the highly polymorphic locus
455 *pspC* of *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. *Gene.* **2002**; 284(1-2):63–71.
- 456 13. Hollingshead SK, Becker R, Briles DE. Diversity of PspA: Mosaic Genes and
457 Evidence for Past Recombination in *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. *Infect Immun.*
458 **2000**; 68(10):5889–5900.
- 459 14. Melin MM, Hollingshead SK, Briles DE, Lahdenkari MI, Kilpi TM, Käyhty HM.
460 Development of antibodies to PspA families 1 and 2 in children after exposure to
461 *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. *Clin Vaccine Immunol.* **2008**; 15(10):1529–35.
- 462 15. Scott JR, Millar E V, Lipsitch M, et al. Impact of more than a decade of
463 pneumococcal conjugate vaccine use on carriage and invasive potential in Native
464 American communities. *J Infect Dis.* **2012**; 205(2):280–8.
- 465 16. Millar E V, O'Brien KL, Zell ER, Bronsdon MA, Reid R, Santosham M.
466 Nasopharyngeal carriage of *Streptococcus pneumoniae* in Navajo and White
467 Mountain Apache children before the introduction of pneumococcal conjugate
468 vaccine. *Pediatr Infect Dis J.* **2009**; 28(8):711–6.

- 469 17. Croucher NJ, Finkelstein JA, Pelton SI, et al. Population genomics of post-vaccine
470 changes in pneumococcal epidemiology. *Nat Genet.* **2013**; 45(6):656–63.
- 471 18. Bentley SD, Aanensen DM, Mavroidi A, et al. Genetic analysis of the capsular
472 biosynthetic locus from all 90 pneumococcal serotypes. *PLoS Genet. Public*
473 *Library of Science*; **2006**; 2(3):e31.
- 474 19. Inouye M, Dashnow H, Raven L-A, et al. SRST2: Rapid genomic surveillance for
475 public health and hospital microbiology labs. *Genome Med. BioMed Central*;
476 **2014**; 6(11):90.
- 477 20. Zerbino DR, Birney E. Velvet: algorithms for de novo short read assembly using
478 de Bruijn graphs. *Genome Res.* **2008**; 18(5):821–9.
- 479 21. Seemann T. Prokka: rapid prokaryotic genome annotation. *Bioinformatics.* **2014**;
480 30(14):2068–9.
- 481 22. Page AJ, Cummins CA, Hunt M, et al. Roary: Rapid large-scale prokaryote pan
482 genome analysis. *Bioinformatics.* **2015** [cited 2015 Jul 22]; 31(22):btv421.
- 483 23. Löytynoja A. Phylogeny-aware alignment with PRANK. *Methods Mol Biol.* **2014**;
484 1079:155–70.
- 485 24. Simell B, Lahdenkari M, Reunanen A, Käyhty H, Väkeväinen M. Effects of ageing
486 and gender on naturally acquired antibodies to pneumococcal capsular
487 polysaccharides and virulence-associated proteins. *Clin Vaccine Immunol.* **2008**;
488 15(9):1391–7.
- 489 25. Brooks-Walter A, Briles DE, Hollingshead SK. The *pspC* Gene of *Streptococcus*
490 *pneumoniae* Encodes a Polymorphic Protein, PspC, Which Elicits Cross-Reactive
491 Antibodies to PspA and Provides Immunity to Pneumococcal Bacteremia. *Infect*
492 *Immun.* **1999**; 67(12):6533–6542.
- 493 26. Mukerji R, Mirza S, Roche AM, et al. Pneumococcal surface protein A inhibits
494 complement deposition on the pneumococcal surface by competing with the

- 495 binding of C-reactive protein to cell-surface phosphocholine. J Immunol. Am
496 Assoc Immunol; **2012**; 189(11):5327–5335.
- 497 27. Ren B, McCrory MA, Pass C, et al. The Virulence Function of *Streptococcus*
498 *pneumoniae* Surface Protein A Involves Inhibition of Complement Activation and
499 Impairment of Complement Receptor-Mediated Protection. J Immunol. **2004**;
500 173(12):7506–7512.
- 501 28. Vadesilho CFM, Ferreira DM, Gordon SB, et al. Mapping of epitopes recognized
502 by antibodies induced by immunization of mice with PspA and PspC. Clin Vaccine
503 Immunol. **2014**; 21(7):940–8.
- 504 29. Chewapreecha C, Harris SR, Croucher NJ, et al. Dense genomic sampling
505 identifies highways of pneumococcal recombination. Nat Genet. Nature Publishing
506 Group, a division of Macmillan Publishers Limited. All Rights Reserved.; **2014**;
507 46(3):305–9.
- 508 30. Chaguza C, Cornick JE, Everett DB. Mechanisms and impact of genetic
509 recombination in the evolution of *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. Comput Struct
510 Biotechnol J. **2015**; 13:241–7.
- 511 31. Li Y, Gierahn T, Thompson CM, et al. Distinct effects on diversifying selection by
512 two mechanisms of immunity against *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. PLoS Pathog.
513 Public Library of Science; **2012**; 8(11):e1002989.
- 514 32. Barocchi MA, Ries J, Zogaj X, et al. A pneumococcal pilus influences virulence
515 and host inflammatory responses. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. National Acad
516 Sciences; **2006**; 103(8):2857–2862.
- 517 33. Spraggon G, Koesema E, Scarselli M, et al. Supramolecular organization of the
518 repetitive backbone unit of the *Streptococcus pneumoniae* pilus. PLoS One.
519 Public Library of Science; **2010**; 5(6):e10919.
- 520 34. Muzzi A, Moschioni M, Covacci A, Rappuoli R, Donati C. Pilus operon evolution in

- 521 *Streptococcus pneumoniae* is driven by positive selection and recombination.
522 PLoS One. **2008**; 3(11):e3660.
- 523 35. Harfouche C, Filippini S, Gianfaldoni C, et al. RrgB321, a fusion protein of the
524 three variants of the pneumococcal pilus backbone RrgB, is protective in vivo and
525 elicits opsonic antibodies. Infect Immun. Am Soc Microbiol; **2012**; 80(1):451–460.
- 526 36. Paterson GK, Mitchell TJ. The role of *Streptococcus pneumoniae* sortase A in
527 colonisation and pathogenesis. Microbes Infect. Elsevier; **2006**; 8(1):145–153.
- 528 37. Basset A, Turner KH, Boush E, Sayeed S, Dove SL, Malley R. Expression of the
529 type 1 pneumococcal pilus is bistable and negatively regulated by the structural
530 component RrgA. Infect Immun. Am Soc Microbiol; **2011**; 79(8):2974–2983.
- 531
532

Figures and Tables

Table 1. Pneumococcal serotypes by age group and ordered by prevalence.

Serotype	Age Group								Total	% of Total
	<1	1-4 y		5-17y		18y+				
19A	5	2.07%	7	2.89%	0	0.00%	10	4.13%	22	9.07%
22A	4	1.65%	10	4.13%	4	1.65%	3	1.24%	21	8.67%
35B	6	2.48%	6	2.48%	3	1.24%	6	2.48%	21	8.67%
23B	2	0.83%	8	3.31%	3	1.24%	4	1.65%	17	7.02%
15A	1	0.41%	7	2.89%	2	0.83%	3	1.24%	13	5.37%
34	0	0.00%	6	2.48%	1	0.41%	6	2.48%	13	5.36%
6B	1	0.41%	4	1.65%	2	0.83%	5	2.07%	12	4.95%
11D	2	0.83%	3	1.24%	4	1.65%	2	0.83%	11	4.54%
23A	1	0.41%	4	1.65%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%	10	4.13%
31	2	0.83%	3	1.24%	3	1.24%	0	0.00%	8	3.31%
16F	0	0.00%	2	0.83%	4	1.65%	2	0.83%	8	3.30%
17F	2	0.83%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%	4	1.65%	8	3.30%
37	2	0.83%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%	7	2.89%
6A	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	3	1.24%	0	0.00%	6	2.48%
21	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	2	0.83%	1	0.41%	6	2.48%
35F	2	0.83%	2	0.83%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%	6	2.48%
7B	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	4	1.65%	6	2.47%
10A	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	5	2.06%
15C	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	5	2.06%
3	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	2	0.83%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%
35A	0	0.00%	3	1.24%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%
NT	2	0.83%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	4	1.65%
10B	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	2	0.83%	0	0.00%	3	1.24%
7C	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	3	1.24%
1	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%	3	1.24%
19F	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%
22F	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%
38	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	2	0.83%
12A	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	2	0.82%
12B	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	2	0.82%
15B	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
5	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
7A	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
8	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
9A	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%
10F	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%	1	0.41%	1	0.41%
Total	36	14.9%	87	36.0%	46.0	19%	73	30.2%	242	100.00%

Table 2. Protein antigens and variant frequencies identified through genomic analysis of pneumococcal carriage isolates. The antigen name and function are listed with the number of variants tested. Variants with measured titers are specified with an asterisk.

			Polymorphic					
Antigen		Variant	Strain	Accesion/Gene	Count	Freq	P-Distance	
I.	PspC	Pneumococcal surface protein C	Var-I*	ND6053	ERR129207	203	83.9%	0.025 (0.025-0.025)
			Var-II*	CH2016	ERR129074	31	12.8%	0.007 (0.006-0.008)
			Var-III*	BR1086	ERR129054	3	1.2%	0.005 (0.001-0.009)
			Var-IV*	MD5090	ERR129180	1	0.4%	-
II.	PspA	Pneumococcal surface protein A	Family 1*	D39	SPD_0126	166	68.6%	0.200 (0.199-0.201)
			Family 2*	TIGR4	SP_0117	69	28.5%	
			Family 3	BG6380	AF071823	4	1.7%	
III.	RrgA	RrgA pilus subunit, adhesin	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_0462	24	88.9%	0.032 (0.027-0.037)
			Var-II	670-6B	SP670_0540	3	11.1%	
IV.	RrgB	RrgB pilus subunit, backbone	Var-I*	670-6B	SP670_0541	4	13.8%	0.216 (0.199-0.233)
			Var-II*	TIGR4	SP_0463	11	37.9%	
			Var-III*	23F_Taiwan_15	EF560629: 5159-7123	14	48.3%	
V.	NanA	Neuraminidase	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1504	7	3.0%	0.042 (0.041-0.042)
			Var-II	INV200	SPNINV200_15140	75	32.2%	
			Var-III	ATCC 700669	SPN23F16920	151	64.8%	
VI.	SP0609	Amino acid ABC transporter	Var-I*	TIGR4	SPD_0530	161	66.8%	0.015 (0.015-0.015)
			Var-II	ATCC 700669	SPN23F05490	80	33.2%	
VII.	SP2194	ATP-dependent Clp protease	Var-I	Taiwan19F-14	SPT_2213	222	91.7%	0.010 (0.010-0.010)
			Var-II*	TIGR4	SP_2194	20	8.3%	
VIII.	PhtD	Pneumococcal histidine triad D	Var-I	ATCC 700669	SPN23F09290	168	70.9%	0.062 (0.060-0.064)
			Var-II*	D39	SPD_0889	69	29.1%	
IX.	StkP	Serine threonine kinase protein	Var-I	D39	SPD_1542	181	74.8%	0.007 (0.007-0.007)

			Var-II*	TIGR4	SP_1732	61	25.2%	
X.	StrH	Beta-N-acetylhexosaminidase	Var-I*	D39	SPD_0063	101	42.1%	0.007 (0.007-0.007)
			Var-II	TIGR4	SP_0057	139	57.9%	
XI.	Ply	Pneumolysin	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1726	29	12.0%	0.003 (0.003-0.003)
			Var-II*	TIGR4	SP_1923	213	88.0%	
Conserved								
Antigen			Variant	Strain	Accession/Gene	-	-	
XII.	LysM	LysM domain-containing protein	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_0107	-	-	0.004 (0.003-0.004)
XIII.	LytB	Endo-beta-N-acetylglucosaminidase	Var-I*	D39	SPD_0853	-	-	0.008 (0.008-0.008)
XIV.	LytC	Lysozyme (C-ter)	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1403	-	-	0.005 (0.005-0.005)
XV.	PcpA	Choline binding protein	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1965	-	-	0.003 (0.003-0.003)
XVI.	PcsB	Secreted 45 kDa protein	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_2216	-	-	0.006 (0.006-0.007)
XVII.	PhtE	Truncated histidine triad protein	Var-I*	D39	SPD_0890	-	-	0.008 (0.008-0.008)
XVIII.	PiaA	Part of iron uptake ABC transporter	Var-I*	D39	SPD_0915	-	-	0.002 (0.002-0.002)
XIX.	PiuA	Part of iron uptake ABC transporter	Var-I*	D39	SPD_1652	-	-	0.005 (0.005-0.005)
XX.	PsaA	Pneumococcal surface adhesin A	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_1650	-	-	0.003 (0.002-0.003)
XXI.	SP2027	Conserved hypothetical protein	Var-I*	TIGR4	SP_2027	-	-	0.005 (0.005-0.006)

Figure 1. Pearson correlations of log₁₀ antibody titers for 28 protein antigens clustered heuristically by correlation value. Correlations between normalized antibody titers of protein antigens were clustered using heuristic methods. Protein antigens including multiple variants of the same antigen are labeled on the x- and y- axes, and the heatmap displays the correlation values between antigens. The dendrogram on the left represents the results of the heuristic clustering of correlated antibody titers. Significant correlation between variants of the same antigen was observed as well as high correlation among several antigens, which likely exist on the same genomic background.

Figure 2. Protein antibodies titers by age for variants of PspC, PspA, pilus, and ply. Antibody levels were measured using direct binding electrochemiluminescence-based multiplex assay are expressed as a titer relative to the amount in a reference serum. Structural variants of polymorphic proteins were measured individually and were compared among participant age groups. A.) Variant-specific anti-PspC antibodies to Var-I (ND6053), Var-II (CH2016), Var-III (BR1086), and Var-IV (MD5090). B.) Variant-specific anti-PspA antibodies to Family 1 and Family 2. C.) Anti-pilus antibodies to RrgA-I (TIGR4) and RrgB pilus variants RrgB-I (670-6B), RrgB-II (Taiwan 23F), and RrgB-III (TIGR4). D.) Variant-specific anti-pneumolysin (ply) antibodies to variants I and II.

Figure 3. Protein antibody titers among participants carrying pneumococcal strains with specific polymorphic protein-antigen variants. Serum was collected from participants at enrollment, and nasopharyngeal swabs for pneumococcal carriage detection were collected at least 30 days after serum collection. The protein antigen variant in each pneumococcal isolate was determined using genomic data. Antibody levels were

measured using direct binding electrochemiluminescence-based multiplex assay are expressed as a titer relative to the amount in a reference serum. Structural variants of polymorphic proteins were measured individually. The y-axis represents the variant-specific antibody titers, and the carriage isolate protein antigen variant is specified on the x-axis with labels colored to match the corresponding titers. If susceptibility to a strain possessing a specific variant were observed, the respective antibody titer would be the lowest among all other titers. A) Anti-PspC titers vs. carriage isolate PspC variants I-IV and non-typable. B) Anti-PspC titers vs. carriage isolate PspC var-I and combined var-II-IV. C) Anti-PspA Family 1 and Family 2 titers vs. carriage isolate PspA variants Families 1, 2, 3, and unknown. D) Anti-pilus titers vs. carriage isolate RrgB variants I-III and not present.