1

Religious issues in ethnic minority mental health with special reference to schizophrenia in Afro-Caribbeans in Britain: a systematic review.

In D.Ndegwa & D.Olajide (editors) Main Issues in Mental Health and Race Ashgate (forthcoming).

Kate Miriam Loewenthal and Marco Cinnirella

Department of Psychology Royal Holloway, University of London Egham, Surrey TW20 0EX Religious issues in ethnic minority mental health with special reference to schizophrenia in Afro-Caribbeans in Britain: a systematic review.

Background

Religion and mental health

How does religion affect mental health?

By about ten years ago, there was some consensus that there was an overall positive association between the two. Underlying this, there are many effects to consider, many aspects of religion, and many aspects of mental health. The last decade has seen a mushroom-like growth of studies and reviews Loewenthal, 1995; Bhugra, 1996; Worthington, Kurusu, McCullough Sandage, 1996). There is scope for methodological improvements, and many interesting questions to be answered. This review is concerned with one set of such questions: religion and mental health among Afro-Caribbeans particularly those living in the UK and the USA, with particular reference to schizophrenia.

<u>Definition of "Afro-Caribbean" and scope of research in this</u> review.

The Hutchinson Encyclopaedia defines an Afro-Caribbean as a "West Indian person of African descent", and adds that Afro-Caribbeans are descended from West Africans captured, or bought from African traders by Europeans, who shipped them to European colonies in the West Indies from the C16th onwards, until the abolition of slavery which occurred in different countries and colonies at different points in the C19th. Since World War II many Afro-Caribbeans have migrated to the UK, the USA and the Netherlands.

There seems to be little or no research material on mental

illness on Afro-Caribbeans in the Netherlands, but there is a great deal on Afro- (or African-) Americans, and on Afro-Caribbeans in the UK, who are mostly descendants of West African slaves shipped to North American colonies, or immigrants from the West Indies.

While it is agreed that Afro-Caribbeans in Britain and Afro-Americans in the USA have many similarities in their history and current circumstances, we have not used the terms interchangeably. We have drawn on research material from both Afro-Caribbeans in Britain and Afro-Americans, as well as on people of African descent in the Caribbean area, in Africa, and occasionally elsewhere.

Schizophrenia among Afro-Caribbeans.

This review focuses on one specific set of questions: how might religion affect the reported over-representation of Afro-Caribbean groups among those diagnosed with schizophrenia in the United Kingdom? Possibly related problems are the greater use of compulsory detention under the 1959 Mental Health Act, including police involvement in hospitalization, and the use of restraint in control of Afro-Caribbean pharmacological agents patients. Such over-representation also exists of Afro-Americans in the USA, and is by comparison both with other ethnic groups in the UK and the USA, and also with Afro-Caribbeans in African and Caribbean countries, where there has perhaps been a less marked degree of recent disadvantage and minority status (Davis, 1975; Ineichen, 1986, 1991; Cope, 1989; Thomas, Stone, Osborn & Thomas, 1993). Sugarman & Craufurd (1994) have concluded that the very high morbidity risk for schizophrenia among British Afro-Caribbeans is entirely due to environmental (not genetic) factors.

An interesting claim has been made by Littlewood & Lipsedge (1978, 1981a, 1981b), and others. Littlewood & Lipsedge based

their claim on a series of studies of patients admitted with diagnoses of psychosis to a psychiatric hospital in East London. They suggest that the high rates of psychosis among Afro-Caribbeans are explained by rates of schizophrenia similar to those in other ethnic groups, plus rates based on a large number of acute psychotic reactions with paranoid and religious flavour. These latter disorders are diagnosed as schizophrenia, but resemble acute psychotic disorders described in Africa and the Caribbean, and have a sudden onset with a clear provoking agent. Littlewood & Lipsedge's patients were first-generation immigrants. Littlewood & Lipsedge's suggestions deserve further attention, particularly with regard to forms of psychosis in second-generation Afro-Caribbean immigrants, among whom rates of psychosis are reported to be even higher than in the immigrating generation. There has been no comparable work in the USA.

This review takes up the more general but related issue of the ways in which psychosis in Afro-Caribbeans may be affected by religious factors.

Social history

Afro-Caribbean social history in Britain and USA is dominated by the hideous history of slavery. European slave-traders were buying slaves from the West Coast of Africa in increasing numbers during the seventeenth and eighteenth particularly to provide labour for plantation development in the New World (the Caribbean and the Americas), recently colonised native Indian populations were by European settlers. The by desettlement, severely reduced, genocide and Europeanimported illnesses, and African slaves were a readily-available source of cheap labour for the sugar plantations. Increasing numbers of people from West Africa were kidnapped and sold into slavery, and transported across the Atlantic in horrible conditions of cruelty, filth and disease. Altogether estimated 10 million Africans were brought to the New World in this way, mostly to the Caribbean area (Curtin, 1969). In the plantations, any family and social networks which had survived kidnapping and transportation were broken up, and the practice of native religion disallowed (Goveia, 1965). This was coupled with cruel retribution for anything other than passive obedience, engendering disorientation, helplessness, dependence. The abolition of slavery in Europe, the Americas and the Caribbean led to some improvement in social and economic conditions, but these improvements were generally small and the social and psychological legacies of deracination and cruelty remained (Wagley, 1961; Franklin & Moss, 1988). Economic need resulted in steady migration to the Northern United States, and a flood of immigration from the Caribbean to Britain in the 1950s and 1960s. Afro-Caribbeans continue to be beset by racism, exploitation in employment, lack of opportunity, and other forms of social and economic disadvantage in both the UK (Rack, 1988) and the USA, although there have been legislative attempts to remove some of these disadvantages (Franklin & Moss, 1988; Jackson, 1991).

Religion in Afro-Caribbean life.

Afro-Caribbean religion is said to embody responses exploitation, oppression and enabling the expression of spirituality (Baer, 1984; Griffith & Bility, 1996), formation of communitas (Turner, 1969) and hence social support and identity. The two dominant strands have been native African religions, and European Christianity. The former was suppressed, and the latter imposed upon the plantation slaves and, later, encouraged by missionaries to the freed slaves (Gates, 1980; Brewer, 1988; Chatfield, 1989). The current situation involves a huge range of often syncretistic blends, although the African elements are less overt in British and US black-led Christianity than they are in the Caribbean and its neighbourhood, and in Africa.

New black religious movements include Black Islam (Franklin & Moss, 1988; McCloud, 1995) in the USA, and Rastafarianism

(Hickling & Griffith, 1994) in the Caribbean and the UK. However in the UK and the USA the dominant form of black religion is Christianity with African influences (Jules-Rosette, 1980). Howard (1987) concluded that post World War II Caribbean Christian immigrants to the UK expected a warm welcome from the existing churches, but found them cold and unfriendly, and so set up their own groups. Most Christian Afro-Caribbeans in the UK are now reported to be affiliated to black-led churches, with predominantly black membership. The most popular forms are charismatic and pentecostal Christianity, and Seventh Day Adventists. Howard does not offer figures, but of Cochrane & Howell's (1993) random community sample of black men in the UK Midlands, 27% belonged to generally white-led churches (Church of England, Roman Catholic), 52% were Pentecostal (almost or completely black-led), and 4% were Rastafarian (with 18% nonaffiliated). Leadership in black-led churches is generally strong and respected, since religious leaders have emerged by force of personality, charisma, popularity and dedication to the needs of their communities. There is emphasis on enthusiastic prayer, which may include the gift of speaking in tongues, dance, and trance-like possession states, and on living a moral, family-centred life, with good physical health practices, and kindness and helpfulness to others (Howard, 1987). Griffith (1980) provides a valuable description of a week-night service in a pentecostal group in the USA. The service includes extensive and enthusiastic thanks and praise to the Lord for healing and support, as well as the features described above (speaking in tongues etc.). Healing may be an important religious activity, and services in black-led churches are reported by their participants to be emotionally and spiritually positive experiences (Griffith & Mathewson, 1981; Griffith, Young & Smith, 1984; Maloney & Lovekin, 1985).

Afro-Caribbean "counter-culture" is said to emphasise partying, promiscuity, drink and drugs (Howard, 1987), but Cochrane & Howell's figures suggest that members of this counter-culture may be a minority among Afro-Caribbeans.

Religiously, the situations in the USA and the UK are somewhat similar, although that the black-led churches in the USA have a longer history than those in Britain, dating from the latter half of the C19th (Franklin & Moss, 1988). Those in Britain date mainly from the post World War II period.

In contemporary religious life in Africa, the Caribbean, and in black communities in Central and South America, the influence of traditional African religions is more overt, and the social-scientific and medical literature shows many examples of traditional African practices relating to health and mental health, some of which will be described in this review.

Definitions of religion

There is a variety of definitions and measures of religion (Brown, 1987). Loewenthal (1995) suggests that religion involves belief in spirituality, a divinely-based moral code, and seeing the purpose of life as increasing harmony in the world by doing good and avoiding evil. All religions involve and depend on social organisation for communication of these ideas. Glock & Stark (1965) suggested five possibly orthogonal aspects of religiosity: experiential, ritual, belief, intellectual, and a fifth dimension reflecting the extent to which the first four are actually applied in daily life. In practice, four popular measures of religiosity are: affiliation, self-definition (as religious), practice (attendance, prayer and other activities), and belief.

Definition of schizophrenia

(Source: DSM-IIIR, American Psychiatric Association, 1987):

- * no major mood changes (i.e. not depressed or elated), and
- * no evidence of organic causes (eg drugs, illness, injury), and
- * continuous signs of disturbance of 6+ months, and
- * deterioration in self-care, work or social relations, and

* for at least a week, <u>two</u> of: delusions, prominent hallucinations, incoherence or bizarre speech, catatonic behaviour (immobile, unresponsive), inappropriate or no emotional responsiveness, <u>or</u>, <u>one</u> of: bizarre delusions (eg. thoughts are being broadcast on TV), prominent hallucinations of a voice.

Search strategy

The search strategy was based on some of the guidelines indicated by the UK Cochrane Centre National Health Service Research & Development Programme (Chalmers & Haynes, 1994; Eysenck, 1994; Knipschild, 1994; Mulrow, 1994; and particularly Oxman, 1994), and by the York University National Health Service Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (1996). These guidelines suggest selecting clinical trials teaching certain standards of research design. The number of such studies in the field under review was negligible, and meta-analytic work was therefore impossible. However the guidelines were followed insofar as search terms and search strategies were defined. These were as follows:

The central problem has been defined as <u>religious issues in</u> schizophrenia among Afro-Caribbeans.

Three groups of search terms were used (where acceptable, the suffix * or ? followed a truncated form of words such as religious, religiosity, religion: i.e. relig* or relig? Otherwise the alternatives were spelled out):

Group 1 (religion)

Relig*

Faith

Belief*

Pentecostal*

Adventist

Group 2 (ethnicity)

Afr*

Carib*

Black

West (W) Indian

Jamaica

Trinidad

Ethnic*

Group 3 (mental health, schizophrenia, and religious behaviour which might be seen as symptomatic of disturbance)

Mental*
Schizophren*
Possession
Hallucination
Glossolalia
Trance

For electronic databases of articles, books and thesis abstracts, three groups were first formed by searching for any of the search terms in the group. The final search was for material which included at least one search term from each group.

For databases of book titles and theses (which yielded very little using the above strategy), searches were also made by combining search terms from two groups at a time: e.g. relig* afr*, relig* carib*, relig* black etc.

Sources searched

Electronic databases of published articles: Sociofile, Medline, ERIC, Embase, Pascal, PsychLit, BIDS (Social Sciences, Sciences,

and Arts & Humanities). In each case the search was made from the earliest year represented in the database up to the most recent; PsychLit contains articles back to 1972, but the other databases start in or around 1982.

<u>Electronic databases of published books</u>: PsychLit, CUPAC, Libertas, BIDS(check). As with databases of articles, the search was made from the earliest year represented in the database.

<u>Electronic sources of unpublished material</u>: theses (Dissertation Abstracts International (1982-1996), AsLib (British M.Phil. and Ph.D. theses) (1970-1992), and WWW.

Other sources: information about ongoing work was obtained by personal contact including conference attendance, by correspondence, and via WWW.

The main product of these searches was in the form of titles, author and abstract (or book chapters). This first crop was sifted for relevance, and some items immediately discarded. Others were sorted into two categories:

a: of some relevance but no further information needed; some items were subsequently discarded as work proceeded.

b: relevant and original book or article needed. In this latter case the item was either obtained immediately (where available), or via the inter-library loan service. Visual searches were made of the bibliographies of the most fundamental of these books and articles: Griffith (1980); Littlewood & Lipsedge (1981a, 1981b, 1989); Worthington et al (1996); Bhugra (1996).

Conceptual approach

The structure of the review that follows two approaches. Firstly we look at pathways into illness (influences on prevalence), using a broad conceptual framework based on Brown & Harris (1978, 1989), and which is generally popular in social psychiatric and related work. The framework involves three wide classes of variables:

STRESS (ADVERSITY) - MEDIATORS (BUFFERS) - DISTRESS (& ILLNESS)

We propose to examine the influences of religion within each of these classes. The second approach is to examine pathways into care. We examine how religion may affect:

REFERRAL - DIAGNOSIS - TREATMENT.

The review focuses on schizophrenia in Afro-Caribbean groups, but some related material has been included, on religion and mental health generally, and particularly in Afro-Caribbeans, and on Afro-Caribbean religion, both in relation to healing, and in relation to behaviours which may be religiously sanctioned and adaptive, but which might give rise to mis-diagnosis by psychiatrists and others ignorant of cultural and religious mores.

1. Religious influences on prevalence.

Adversity

Here we consider ways in which religion may affect levels and types of adversity (stress), and ways in which religious factors may moderate the effects of adversity. We consider first the beneficial affects of religious factors, and then the possibility of stress-exacerbating effects of religious factors.

First, then, the question whether religious factors may help to minimise adversity. We are \underline{not} concerned here with $\underline{general}$ cultural factors - the economic and social difficulties which may be associated with being Afro-Caribbean.

Loewenthal, Goldblatt, Gorton, Lubitsch, Bicknell, Fellowes & Sowden (1996) suggested that patterns of stress - and therefore possibly distress and illness - differed between traditional religious groups and others, among Europeans. Their main conclusion was that severe, disruptive life-events were less

likely among traditional religious groups. This in turn had an impact on the prevalence of depression. We could not find comparable data for Afro-Caribbeans in Britain, but a study of black Americans (Gary, 1984) led to roughly comparable conclusions. This study involved 451 non-institutionalized black adults in Virginia, and one conclusion was that less religious respondents experienced more stressful life circumstances. Further work is needed to confirm the suggestion that religious groups and beliefs may serve to regulate social relations, lessening the likelihood of some forms of stress.

Finally, an intriguing case study suggests further positive features of religious beliefs on stress. Heligman, Lee & Kramer (1983) reported on an elderly black lady who was able to tolerate major abdominal surgery without analgesia. There was minimal post-operative discomfort. She attributed this to the presence of protective angels. Psychological testing and interviews showed her to be "fully in touch with reality".

The sparse material described so far has thrown up several recurrent and important themes in understanding the roles played by religion in Afro-Caribbean mental health. First, the probable importance of religion to many Afro-Caribbeans. Second, the importance of religiously-encouraged social support networks. And finally, the occurrence of religiously-based beliefs and ideas which might be taken as evidence of psychological disturbance by professional care workers without sufficient knowledge of cultural-religious norms and values.

Moderating effects of religion

Table 1 summarises several studies indicating that compared with other groups in Britain and the USA, religion is a more important value for Afro-Caribbeans.

Table 1

Table 1 is replete with suggestions and evidence that religion is indeed important to Afro-Caribbeans in the UK and to Afro-Americans, both in absolute terms and relative to other groups.

We now turn to evidence on the question whether and how religion has a stress-moderating effect among black people.

Table 2

Table 2 tells us nothing directly about schizophrenia, and little about stress-buffering effects of religion, but it does indicate a strong association between religion and various measures of health and mental health: low or absent religiosity is a risk factor for poor (mental) health in black people.

Table 3 summarises evidence on means by which religion may be associated with better mental health among black people.

Table 3

Table 3 focuses on three routes by which religion may lower the prevalence of mental illnesses among black people, possibly by mitigating the effects of stress.

First, social support: both church and family support are important to well-being, and family support may be enhanced by church membership. But as with research in other groups, the relations between religion and social support could do with further clarification. Social support is important for recovery and prevention of relapse as well as prevention of initial onset.

Second, worship-related activities have been reported to induce feelings of well-being, comfort and other aspects of positive mood, which are likely to have a beneficial effect on mental health..

Third, religion is associated with social-cognitive factors such as identity, self-esteem and beliefs which can have a positive impact on mood.

In all cases however there is a lack of outcome studies. Additionally we know very little about the relations between the factors described, and schizophrenia, in black people.

We now look at possible adverse effects of religion upon mental health.

Table 4

The important suggestions in table 4 are that belief in a relation between sin or wrongdoing, and suffering, may actually cause symptoms of distress or illness. However, these believes may contain the seeds of cure, insofar as they indicate remedies which may sometimes be effective. A further important effect is that "Western" health professionals with inadequate knowledge of cultural-religious mores may view such beliefs as signs of mental disorder.

We noted that there was no reported evidence that religion plays a role in creating or exacerbating adversity. However, religiously-associated physical/emotional abuse is a possibility that has been suggested - often controversially - among other groups (Capps, 1992) and could be examined in Afro-Caribbeans.

Overall, the weight of evidence and of suggestions is that religion is important to Afro-Caribbeans, is likely to have beneficial effects (overall) in lowering prevalence of mental illnesses, and that these effects operate via a number of routes. We note however that little of the research relates directly to schizophrenia. Research designs are generally observational or correlational or involve the reporting of clinical case material. Further research could focus on

schizophrenia, and involve designs which look at outcome either retrospectively or if possible prospectively.

2a. Religious influences on referral

Having looked at religious influences on the prevalence of schizophrenia (pathways into illness) we now look at pathways into care and/or diagnosis. Sometimes there is genuine overlap in research material bearing on the two problems, in which case we have repeated our citations of the studies concerned.

Table 5

The material in table 5 is rather sparse, but as far as it goes supports the suggestion that religious factors may, for various reasons, discourage black people from seeking help for mental from (white) mental health professionals: illness Caribbeans may fear that their religious beliefs and values may misunderstood, they may perceive the mental health professions as ineffective or misguided, they may perceive other (religious) helping agents and activities as more effective, and there may be fear of stigma.

If religious helping agents and activities are seen as effective, what are they? Table 6 summarises some information gained in the USA (table 8 offers comparable information from studies on other black groups).

Table 6

The studies in table 6 offer a relatively high degree of quantification, and suggest a range of religious resources seen by black people (at least, those who are church members) as efficacious for mental health problems.

2b. Religious influences on symptoms/diagnosis

An important theme which has intruded throughout this review is the regrettable tendency of (usually white) mental health professionals to regard a range of religious behaviours and beliefs by black people as symptomatic of mental illness. Sometimes indeed there may be a genuine mental illness and it is difficult for the professional to tell whether say, a religious ecstasy, is pathological or not (e.g. Littlewood & Lipsedge, 1989; Csordas, 1987). Table 7 however gives some cause for concern regarding the risk of over-diagnosis of mental illness, particularly of schizophrenia, in black people with religious "symptoms".

Table 7

Table 7 offers a range of descriptive material suggesting that trance/possession, beliefs in evil spirits and witchcraft, and other forms of religious behaviour and beliefs, are particularly likely among people whose background has been influenced by African religion. It is difficult for professionals to distinguish the genuinely pathological_from the culturally alien.

An interesting footnote to table 7 is offered by two studies which suggest the presence and amount of religious symptomatology in schizophrenia is actually unrelated to level of individual religiosity (Littlewood & Lipsedge, 1981b; Arnold, 1993).

2c. Religious and related effects in treatment

Much of the literature of Afro-Caribbean schizophrenia suggests that it is characterized by briefer episodes, faster recovery, and less risk of relapse (Littlewood & Lipsedge, 1981a, 1981b; Stevens, 1987). Here we consider religious influences related to

these effects. These religious influences have been discussed elsewhere in this review: religiously-encouraged social support (Jackson & Birchwood, 1996; and see Table 2), stronger religiosity, treatment preferences for clergy, religious practices including syncretic rituals, trance, possession, glossolalia and prayer for therapeutic purposes (see table 6). An important possibility is that religion influences the form and possibly the occurrence of a "culture-specific" brief psychosis in Afro-Caribbeans, which may not even be a true psychosis in some cases. Even where it is, the prognosis is said to be very good compared to "Western" schizophrenia.

The main thrust of the available evidence is that these religious influences contribute to the better prognosis of Afro-Caribbean schizophrenia. The chief possible adverse effects of religion lie in the risk of misdiagnosis of religious behaviour and beliefs as schizophrenia (see table 7).

We look finally at some more remote religious influences on Afro-Caribbean mental illness and its cures.

Table 8

Table 8 shows a range of overtly African-influenced religious practices and beliefs related to mental illness. Although it has been stressed that this kind of information needs to be taken on board by mental health professionals working with black people, there have been no outcome studies in this area.

The use of culture-sensitive, collaborative, multicultural approaches have been advocated in various ways. Views that black people need to weaned away from "unscientific" beliefs in religious factors now seem out-moded in the face of a two-pronged attack - in one direction from those favouring multicultural approaches in medicine and psychiatry, and in the other direction from an increasing body of scientific evidence

that religious factors may play important preventive and therapeutic roles in mental illness. Several postures on multiculturalism have been outlined (MacLachlan, in press); most authors report that Western-trained professionals are pragmatically taking into account other ("non-Western") beliefs, and where indicated, are referring for treatment which is consistent with those beliefs (Burlew, 1992; Brent & Callwood, 1993; Jackson; 1986; Jones, 1990; Lefley, 1981; Lefley & Bestman, 1977; Richardson, 1991; Sandoval, 1979; Stevenson, 1990).

For example, Csordas (1987) describes several case vignettes from a Brazilian psychiatrist who is an initiated elder of the Afro-Brazilian candomble cult. The cases involved cross-referral from the psychiatrist to religious practitioners, and sometimes back again. Of particular interest in Csordas' account is the observation psychiatrist's that some of the genuine practitioners are able to distinguish between a religious trance (called orixa), a simulated one, hysterical crisis, a feat which the psychiatrist says is beyond the psychiatrist. In the latter case they will tell the client to see a doctor.

Some mental health practitioners have tried to incorporate aspects of traditional healing into their practice - kind of psychiatric syncretism. However some authors (Oyarebu, 1982) incline to the view that it is wiser for Western and religious forms of healing to co-exist (and cross-refer where necessary).

A careful set of suggestions is made by Maclachlan (in press), who recommends that the clinician should draw up a "problem portrait". This is a description of all the things that are "wrong" with the patient (according to the patient), what s/he thinks caused them, and what s/he thinks other members of their social group/s think cause problems like this. This will enable the clinician to draw up treatment goals in collaboration with the patient, and to draw on healing resources that are seen as

appropriate, often using several different kinds of healing resource and cross-referring where necessary.

Summary and conclusions

What then are the religious influences on schizophrenia among Afro-Caribbeans?

Religion is important to Afro-Caribbeans in the UK and to Afro-Americans, both in absolute terms and relative to other groups. Via a number of routes, religious factors may lower prevalence and improve prognosis. This is a bit speculative because most of the evidence relating religion to mental health among Afro-Caribbeans deals with forms of mental illness other than schizophrenia. Clearly there is space for research on the ways religious factors - social support, worship-related activities and social-cognitive factors - relate to prevalence, referral and recovery in schizophrenia. It is suggested that the direction of these effects is likely to be to lower prevalence and referral, and improve recovery. If so, these effects cannot explain any higher rates of schizophrenia referral among Afro-Caribbeans.

However there is also the suggestion that religious factors may influence symptoms, sometimes causing a risk of over-diagnosis of schizophrenia.

However it is unlikely that the high risk of schizophrenia among Afro-Caribbeans can be explained solely in terms of the added likelihood of "culture-specific" psychosis influenced by cultural-religious factors. If this were so, it would be hard to explain the reported rise in risk of schizophrenia among second-generation immigrants to the UK. Moreover, "culture-specific" psychosis is reported in African countries and elsewhere, where rates of schizophrenia are said to be as low as in indigenous

European and other groups. These phenomena might be better understood with better information on religiosity in relation to schizophrenia.

The only way in way in religious factors are likely to contribute to raised rates of schizophrenia is however in over-diagnosis of schizophrenia among disturbed Afro-Caribbeans presenting with a "religious flavour" to their disturbance. But this is speculative and deserves closer study.

Religious methods of healing are to an increasing extent being taken into account by mental health professionals, including those working among Afro-Caribbean groups. It is likely that this trend will continue. It is to be hoped that outcome studies will appear in this field.

Acknowledgements

We would like thank Emma Lowers for her help in the early stages of the literature search, and the library staff of the Bedford Library (Royal Holloway, University of London) and of Senate House (University of London) for advice and assistance in the main phases of the literature search, particularly Adrian Machiraju and Anne Sergeant of the Bedford Library for their advice in formulating a search strategy and in implementing it. We would also like to thank the Department of Health for financial assistance with the literature search.

References

(No author given) (1994) The Hutchinson Encyclopaedia. Middlesex: Helicon Publishing.

(No author given) (1996) The University of York NHS Centre for Reviews and Dissemination: Information Sheets 1-7. York: University of York NHS CRD Centre.

Alonso, L. & Jeffrey, W.D. (1988) Mental illness complicated by the santeria belief in spirit possession. Hospital and Community Psychiatry, 39, 1188-1191.

- American Psychiatric Association (1987) <u>Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders</u> (3rd edition, revised). Washington DC: APA.
- American Psychiatric Association (1994) <u>Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders</u> (4th edition). Washington DC: APA.
- Ananth, J., Davies, R. & Kerner B. (1984) Psychosis associated with thymoma. <u>Journal of Nervous and Mental Disorder</u>, 172, 556-558.
- Arnold, C.C. (1993) Religiosity and Delusional Content among Individuals with Schizophrenia. M.S.W. thesis. Long Beach, California: California State University.
- Baer, H.A. (1984) <u>The Black Spiritual Movement: A Religious</u> Response to Racism. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press.
- Bartocci, G. (1975) Transcultural psychiatry: An investigation of symptoms in two racial groups. <u>Lavoro Neuropsychiatrico</u>, 56, 17-38.
- Bhugra, D. (ed) (1996) <u>Psychiatry and Religion: Context,</u> Consensus and Controversies. <u>London: Routledge.</u>
- Boyd-Franklin, N. (1989) Five key factors in the treatment of black families. <u>Journal of Psychotherapy and the Family</u>, 6, 53-69.
- Brent, J.E. & Callwood, G.B. (1993) Culturally relevant psychiatric care: The West Indian as a Client. <u>Journal of Black</u> Psychology, 19, 290-302.
- Brewer, P.D. (1988) <u>The Baptist Churches of South Trinidad and their Missionaries</u>. M.Th. thesis: Glasgow University.
- Brown, L.B. (1987) The Psychology of Religious Belief. London: Academic Press.
- Brown, D.R. & Gary, G.E. (1987) Stressful life events, social support networks, and the physical and mental health of urban Black adults. Journal of Human Stress, 13, 165-173.
- Brown, D.R. & Gary, G.E. (1988) Unemployment and psychological distress among Black American women. <u>Sociological Focus</u>, 21, 209-221.
- Brown, D.R. & Gary, L.E. (1994) Religious involvement and health status among African-American males. <u>Journal of the National</u> Medical Association, 86, 825-831.
- Brown, G.W. & Harris, T.O. (1978) The Social Origins of Depression. London: Tavistock Press.

- Brown, G.W. & Harris, T.O. (eds) (1989) <u>Life Events and Illness</u>. London: Unwin Hyman.
- Burlew, A.K.H. (ed) (1992) African American Psychology: Theory, Research and Practice. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Caldwell, C.H., Greene, A.D. & Billingsley, A. (1994) Family support programmes in Black churches: A new look at old functions. In S.L.Kagan & B.Weissbourd (eds) Putting families first: America's family support movement and the challenge of change. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Capps, D. (1992) Religion and child abuse: perfect together. Presidential address of the Society for the Scientific Study of Religion 1991. Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. <u>Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion</u>, 31, 1-14.
- Chalmers, I. & Haynes, B. (1994) Reporting, updating and correcting systematic reviews of the effects of health care. British Medical Journal, 309, 862-5.
- Chatfield, A.F. (1989) A Sociology of Trinidad Religion, with Special Reference to Christianity. M.Th. thesis: Leeds University.
- Cochrane, R. & Howell, M. (1995) Drinking patterns of black and white men in the West Midlands. <u>Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology</u>, 30,139-146.
- Cope, R. (1989) The compulsory detention of Afro-Caribbeans under the Mental Health Act. New Community, 15, 343-356.
- Csordas, T.J. (1987) Health and the holy in African and Afro-American spirit possession. <u>Social Science and Medicine</u>, 24, 1-11.
- Curtin, P.D. (1969) <u>The Atlantic Slave Trade: A Census</u>. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.
- Davis, L.G. (1975) The Mental Health of the Black Community: An Exploratory Bibliography. Monticello, Illinois: Council of Planning Librarians.
- Dobbin, J.D. (1982) "Doo'en Dee Dance": Description and Analysis of the Jombee Dance of Montserrat (West Indies). Ph.D. thesis: Ohio State University.
- Early, L.F. & Lifschutz, J.E. (1974) A case of stigmata. Archives of General Psychiatry, 30, 197-200.
- Edwards, K.L. (1987) Exploratory study of Black psychological health. Journal of Religion and Health, 26, 73-80.
- Ellison, C.G. (1995) Race, religious involvement and depressive

- symptomatology in a southeastern U.S. community. Social Science and Medicine, 40, 1561-1572.
- Erinosho, O.A. (1977a) Social background and pre-admission sources of care among Yoruba psychiatric patients. <u>Social</u> Psychiatry, 12, 71-74.
- Erinosho, O.A. (1977b) Cultural factors in mental illness among the Yoruba. <u>International Journal of Group Psychotherapy</u>, 27, 511-515.
- Eysenck, H.J. (1994) Meta-analysis and its problems. British Medical Journal, 309, 789-792.
- Ferraro, K.F. & Koch, J.R. (1994) Religion and health among black and white adults: Examining social support and consolidation. <u>Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion</u>, 33, 362-375.
- Franklin, J.H. & Moss, A.A., Jr. (1988) From Slavery to Freedom: A History of Negro Americans (Sixth Edition). New York: Alfred Knopf.
- Gary, L.E. (1984) Pathways: A study of Black Informal Support Networks. Washington: Mental Health Research and Development Centre, Institute for Urban Affairs and Research Howard University.
- Gary, L.E. (1985) <u>Black Male-Female Relationships: An Empirical Assessment</u>. Washington, Institute of Urban Affairs Howard University: Society for the Study of Social Problems Association Paper.
- Gates, B.E. (ed) (1980) <u>Afro-Caribbean Religions</u>. London: Ward Lock.
- Gesler, W.M. & Nahim, E.A. (1984) Client characteristics at Kissy Mental Hospital, Freetown, Sierra Leone. Social Science and Medicine, 18, 819-825.
- Goviea, E.V. (1965) <u>Slave Society in the British Leeward Islands at the End of the Eighteenth Century</u>. <u>New Haven: Yale University Press.</u>
- Griffith, E.E. (1980) Possession, prayer and testimony: Therapeutic aspects of the Wednesday night meeting in a black church. Psychiatry, 43, 120-128.
- Griffith, E.E. (1983) The impact of sociocultural factors on a church-based healing model. <u>American Journal of Orthopsychiatry</u>, 53, 291-302.
- Griffith, E.E.H. & Bility, K.M. (1996) Psychosocial factors and the genesis of new Afro-American religious groups. In D.Bhugra (ed) Psychiatry and Religion. London: Routledge.

- Griffith, E.E.H. & Mathewson, M.A. (1981) Communitas and charisma in a black church service. <u>Journal of the National</u> Medical Association, 73, 1023-1027.
- Griffith, E.E., Young, J.L. & Smith. D.L. (1984) An analysis of the therapeutic elements in a Black church service. <u>Hospital and</u> Community Psychiatry, 35, 464-469.
- Hall, R.L.B. (1984) "Do, Lord, Remember Me": Religion and Cultural Change among Blacks in Florida, 1565-1906. Ph.D. thesis: Florida State University.
- Heligman, R.M., Lee, L.R. & Krager, D. (1983) Pain relief associated with a religious visitation: A case report. <u>Journal</u> of Family Practice, 16, 299-302.
- Hickling, F.W. & Griffith, E.E.H. (1994) Clinical perspectives on the Rastafari movement. <u>Hospital and Community Psychiatry</u>, 45, 49-53.
- Hill, P., Jr. (1987) Passage to manhood: Rearing the make African-American child. Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the National Black Child Development Institute, Detroit.
- Hillard, J.R. & Rockwell, W.J.K. (1978) Dysesthesia, witchcraft and conversion reaction: A case successfully treated with psychotherapy. <u>Journal of the American Medical Association</u>, 240, 1742-1744.
- Howard, V. (1987) A report on Afro-Caribbean Christianity in Britain. Leeds: University of Leeds Department of Theology and Religious Studies Community Religions Project Research Papers.
- Idowu, A.I. (1992) The Oshun Festival: An African traditional religious healing process. Counselling and Values, 36, 192-200.
- Ineichen, B. (1986) Compulsory admission to psychiatric hospital under the 1959 Mental Health Act: the experience of ethnic minorities. New Community, 13, 86-93.
- Ineichen, B. (1991) Schizophrenia in British AfroCaribbeans: Two debates confused? <u>International Journal of Social Psychiatry</u>, 37, 227-232.
- Jackson, C. & Birchwood, M. (1996) Early intervention in psychosis. British Journal of Clinical Psychology, 35, 487-502.
- Jackson, G.G. (1986) Conceptualizing Afrocentric and Eurocentric mental health training. In H.P.Lefley & P.B.Pedersen (eds) Cross-cultural Training for Mental Health Professionals. Springfield, Illinois: Charles C. Thomas.
- Jackson, J.J. (ed) (1991) <u>Life in Black America</u>. Newbury Park, California: Sage.

- Jones, N.S.C. (1990) Black/White issues in psychotherapy: a framework for clinical practice. <u>Journal of Social Behaviour and</u> Personality, 5, 305-322.
- Jones, P. (1992) African-American women: the psychotherapeutic process as a coping style. Paper presented at the American Psychological Association, Washington, DC.
- Jules-Rosette, B. (1980) Creative spirituality from Africa to America: Cross-cultural influences in contemporary religious forms. Western Journal of Black Studies, 4, 273-285.
- Knipschild, P. (1994) Systematic reviews: some examples. <u>British</u> Medical Journal, 309, 719-721.
- Lefever, H.G. (1996) When the saints go riding in: Santeria in Cuba and the United States. <u>Journal for the Scientific Study of</u> Religion, 35, 318-330.
- Lefley, H.P. (1981) Psychotherapy and cultural adaptation in the Caribbean. International Journal of Group Tensions, 11, 3-16.
- Lefley, H.P. & Bestman, E.W. (1977) Psychotherapy in Caribbean cultures. Paper presented at the American Psychological Association, San Francisco.
- Lipsedge, M. (1996) Religion and madness in history. In D,Bhugra (ed) Psychiatry and Religion: Context, Consensus and Controversies. London: Routledge.
- Littlewood, R. (1993) <u>Pathology and Identity: The work of Mother</u> Earth in Trinidad. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Littlewood, R. & Lipsedge, M. (1978) Migration, ethnicity and diagnosis. <u>Psychiatrica Clinica</u>, 11, 15-22.
- Littlewood, R. & Lipsedge, M. (1981) Some social and phenomenological characteristics of psychotic immigrants. Psychological Medicine, 11, 289-302.
- Littlewood, R. & Lipsedge, M. (1981) Acute psychotic reactions in Caribbean-born patients. Psychological Medicine, 11, 303-318.
- Littlewood, R. & Lipsedge, M. (1989) <u>Aliens and Alienists:</u> Ethnic Minorities and Psychiatry, 2nd edition. London: Unwin Hyman.
- Loewenthal, K.M. (1995) Religion and Mental Health. London: Chapman & Hall.
- Loewenthal, K.M., Goldblatt, V., Gorton, T., Lubitsch, G., Bicknell, H., Fellowes, D., & Sowden, A. (1996) The costs and benefits of boundary maintenance: stress, religion and culture among Jews in Britain. Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric

- Epidemiology, (in press).
- MacLachlan, M. (In press) Culture and Health. Chichester: Wiley.
- Maloney, H.N. & Lovekin, A.A. (1985) <u>Glossolalia: Behavioural Science Perspectives on Speaking in Tongues</u>. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Martin, W.I. (1984) Religiosity and United States suicide rates, 1972-1978. Journal of Clinical Psychology, 40, 1166-1169.
- McCloud, A.B. (1995) <u>African American Islam</u>. New York: Routledge.
- Millet, P.E., Sullivan, B.F., Schwebel, A.I. & Myers, L.J. (1996) Black Americans' and White Americans' views of the etiology and treatment of mental health problems. Community Mental Health Journal, 32, 235-242.
- Mollica, R.F., Streets, F.J., Boscarino, J. & Redlich, F.C. (1986) A community study of formal pastoral counselling activities of the clergy. <u>American Journal of Psychiatry</u>, 143, 323-328.
- Mulrow, C.D. (1994) Rationale for systematic reviews. <u>British</u> Medical Journal, 309, 597-599.
- Ndetei, D.M. (1988) Psychiatric phenomenology across countries: Constitutional, cultural or environmental? Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica, 78/supplement, 344, 33-44.
- Ndetei, D.M. & Vadher, A. (1984) Frequency and clinical significance of delusions across cultures. Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica, 70, 73-76.
- Ness, R.C. & Wintrob, R.M. (1981) Folk healing: A description and synthesis. American Journal of Psychiatry. 138, 1477-1481.
- Oxman, A.D. (1994) Checklists for review articles. <u>British</u> Medical Journal, 309, 648-651.
- Oyarebu, K.A. (1982) An Assessment of the Current Status of Mental Illness in Bendel State of Nigeria: Implications for Public Mental Health Policy and Education. D.R.P.H. thesis: University of Texas at Houston School of Public Health.
- Patel, V. (1995) Explanatory models of illness in sub-Saharan Africa. Social Science and Medicine, 40, 1291-1298.
- Peltzer, K. & Ebigbo, P.O. (eds) (1989) Clinical Psychology in Africa, the Caribbean and Afro-Latin America: A textbook for Universities and Para-Medical Schools. New York: Social Psychiatry Research Institute.
- Platt, S.L. (1995) The Comparative Study of Health Lifestyle and

- Beliefs in a Religious and Non-religious Group. M.Sc. Dissertation: St George's Hospital Medical School, University of London.
- Purdy, B.A., Simari, C.G. & Colon, G. (1983) Religiosity, ethnicity and mental health: Interface the 80s. <u>Counselling and Values</u>, 27, 112-121.
- Rack, P.H. (1988) Psychiatric and social problems among immigrants. Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica, 78/supplement, 344, 167-174.
- Redlener, I.E. & Scott, C.S. (1979) Incompatibilities of professional and religious ideology: Problems of medical management and outcome in a case of paediatric meningitis. Social Science and Medicine, 138, 89-93.
- Richardson, B.L. (ed) (1991) <u>Multicultural Issues in</u> Counselling: New Approaches to Diversity. Alexandra, Virginia: American Association for Counselling and Development.
- Roach, R. (1992) Obeah in the Treatment of Psychiatric Disorders in Trinidad: An Empirical Study of an Indigenous Healing System. M.Sc. thesis: McGill University.
- Rosen, C.E. (1982) Ethnic differences among impoverished rural elderly in use of religion as a coping mechanism. <u>Journal of</u> Rural Community Psychology, 3, 27-34.
- Sandoval, M.C. (1979) Santeria as a mental health care system: An historical overview. <u>Social Science and Medicine</u>, 138, 137-151.
- Silva de Crane, R. & Spielberger, C. (1981) Attitudes of Hispanic, Black and Caucasian university students toward mental illness. Hispanic Journal of Behavioural Sciences, 3, 241-255.
- Snow, L. (1974) Folk medical beliefs and their implications for care of patients. Annals of Internal Medicine, 81, 83.
- Stevens, J.R. (1987) Brief psychoses: Do they contribute to the good prognosis and equal prevalence of schizophrenia in developing countries? <u>British Journal of Psychiatry</u>, 151, 393-396.
- Stevenson, H.C. (1990) The role of the African-American church in education about teenage pregnancy. <u>Counselling and Values</u>, 34, 130-133.
- Sugarman, P.A. & Craufurd, D. (1994) Schizophrenia in the Afro-Caribbean Community. <u>British Journal of Psychiatry</u>, 164, 474-480.
- Taylor, J. & Jackson, B.B. (1991) Evaluation of a holistic model of mental health symptoms in African American women. Journal of

- Black Psychology, 18, 19-45.
- Thomas, C.S., Stone, K., Osborn, M., & Thomas, P.F. (1993) Psychiatric morbidity and compulsory admission among UK-born Europeans, Afro-Caribbeans and Asians in central Manchester. British Journal of Psychiatry, 163, 91-99.
- Turner, V. (1969) <u>The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-</u>Structure. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Umoren, U.E. (1990) Religion and traditional medicine: An anthropological case study of a Nigerian treatment of mental illness. Medical Anthropology, 12, 389-400.
- Wagley, C. (1961) Recent Studies in Caribbean Local Societies. In C.Wilgus (Ed) The Caribbean. Gainesville, Florida.
- Walls, C.T. & Zarit, S.H. (1991) Informal support from black churches and the well-being of elderly Blacks. <u>Gerontologist</u>, 31, 490-495.
- Ward, C. (1982) A transcultural perspective on women and madness: The case of the mystical affliction. <u>Womens Studies</u> <u>International Forum</u>, 5, 411-418.
- Ward, C. & Beabrun, M.H. (1981) Spirit possession and neuroticism in a West Indian Pentecostal community. <u>British</u> Journal of Clinical Psychology, 1981, 20, 295-296.
- Worthington, E.L., Kurusu, T.A., McCullough, M.E. & Sandage, S.J. (1996) Empirical research on religion and psychotherapeutic processes and outcomes: A 10-year review and research prospectus. Psychological Review, 119, 448-487.
- Zilborg, G. & Henry, G.W. (1951) <u>A History of Medical Psychology</u>. London: Allen & Unwin.

Table 1: Importance of religion in black compared to white groups, in the USA and in Britain.

StudyCoun		ource and type of ormation	Findings and conclusions
Boyd- Franklin (1989)	USA	Review highlighting five fundamental strengths in black families and implications for treatment.	One strength is "strong religious orientation".
Cochrane & Howell (1995)	UK	200 black 170 white men, random sample.	Similar proportions of blacks (74%) and whites (75%) religiously affiliated, higher proportion of blacks (29%)
than			whites (9%) attended regularly
Edwards (1987)	USA	25 black adults, (8M 17F), self-defined components of psychological health.	Five essential characteristics of a psychologically healthy Black American: religion and spirituality the most important.
Ellison (1995)	USA	Summary of three major surveys	Average levels of religious engagement are higher among African Americans than among whites
Ferraro	USA	National sample	Three dimensions of
religiosi & Koch (1994)	Ly	(Americans' Changing Lives, 1986)(N=3,497)	were strongest among black adults (and women)
Jones (1990)	USA	Review of literature on effectiveness of white therapists treating black clients	Therapists should consider (among other factors) the "intense religious orientations" of black people
Rosen (1982)	USA	Interviews with 148 senior citizens (age over 65)	Blacks used religion to "a greater degree" then did whites, both to cope with adversity and to reduce depression

_

Table 2: Evidence of association between general measures of religiosity and mental health in black groups.

StudyCoun		ource and type of ormation	Findings and conclusions
Brown & Gary (1987)	USA	177 black male, 274 black female adults	No direct or buffering effects of religiosity on mental health; religiosity inversely to physical health among females (only)
Brown & Gary (1988)	USA	245 black females, community-based survey	High religiosity (and perceived social support) important in reducing distress, especially in unemployed compared to employed.
Brown & Gary (1994)	USA	537 urban black males	Denominational affiliation associated with fewer depressive symptoms; higher frequency of church attendance associated with less alcohol cigarette consumption.
Cochrane & Howell (1995) associate relation lower		200 black 170 white men, random sample	Religious observance and belonging to a Pentecostal church were strongly moderation in alcohol: alcohol
consumpti	on explained	and by black	problems among
DIACKS	cxpiainca	by black	religiosity.
Ellison (1995)	USA	Community sample N=2956 (1029) 1927 white)	Denominational affiliation olack, associated with fewer symptoms among blacks only; frequency of church attendance associated with fewer depressive symptoms among whites only; frequency of private devotion associated with depressive symptoms among blacks and whites. Summarises other work showing importance of religion for good mental outcomes especially among black Americans.

Ferraro & Koch	USA	National sample (Americans'	The association between religion and health differs
for (1994)		Changing Lives, 1986)(N=3,497)	black and white people: social support important for health in both blacks and whites; the religious consolation hypothesis was supported for blacks only, and there was an overall association between religion and health among blacks.
Martin attendanc	USA	US annual sui	cide Religiosity (church
(1984)	C)	rates and church attendance among representative sub-populations	associated with lower suicide among both blacks and whites, males and females.
Millet, Sullivan, more	USA	67 black & 78 white subjects read	Black American respondents rated spiritual factors as
Schwebel & Myers (1996)		vignettes on mental health problems, and rated importance of spiritual and other factors as causes, and their effectivesness in treatment.	important in aetiology and treatment than did whites.
Platt with	UK	100 church members	Religiosity was associated
(1995)		(Seventh Day Adventists) and 100 non-members	fewer health and mental health problems (however groups were not closely matched for ethnicity: 79% church members were black; only 37 % nonmembers).
Taylor & Jackson (1991) symptoms.	USA	289 urban African- American women	7 variables (including religious orientation) were significantly related to general mental health

Table 3: Means by which religion may improve mental health among black groups.

Social su	pport	and family	
StudyCoun	ntry	Source and type of information	Findings and conclusion
Boyd- Franklin (1989)	USA	Review highlighting five fundamental strengths in black families and implications for treatment	One strength is "the bond of the extended family".
Brown & Gary (1987)	USA	451 urban black adults	Number of near relatives related to mental health (for women); perceived social support buffered effect of stress on mental health
(women			only); number of confidants inversely related to physical health (men only)
Caldwell, Greene & Billingsl (1994)		Review of historical material and own research programme	Family support programmes provided by Black churches; nature of provision has changed over time.
Ferraro & Koch (1994)	USA	National sample (Americans' Changing Lives, 1986)(N=3,497)	Social support important for health in black people (and in whites)
Gary	USA	Probability sample	Low religiosity, and aspect
of (1984)		of 451 black adults	low social support (being divorced/separated, not being an active communit participant) associated with more stress.
Gary (1985)	USA	Probability sample of 451 black adults	Religion was unrelated to perceived conflict in male -female relationships.
Howard (1987)	UK	Review of studies on Afro-Caribbean Christianity in Britain	Church leaders are emergent, respected for their personal qualities, turned to for advice, offer guidance on matters which may enhance

			family stability e.g. banning extra-marital sex.
Stevenson (1990)	USA	A position paper	Stresses importance of church leadership (in this case, in education about teenage pregnancy)
Walls & Zarit (1991)	USA	98 black elderly people (65-104): interviews.	Family network perceived as more supportive than the church network, but both forms of support contributed to feelings of well-being Involvement with organized religious activities, and spiritual aspects of
J			unrelated to well-being.

Worship-related activities

<u>StudyCoun</u>		ource and type of ormation	Findings and conclusions
Ellison (1995)	USA	Community sample, blacks and whites (N=2956)	Frequency of private devotional activity (e.g. prayer) associated with depressive symptoms in both blacks and whites
Griffith (1980)	USA	Observational study of Wednesday night black church service; attendance about 11% of Sunday services, mainly church activists	Thanks to G-d, led by male members, then pastor leads; members give testimony, saying how G-d has helped them cope. Possession/trance states, especially among the women, also glossolalia. Members report feelings of love, warmth and re-birth.
Griffith & Mathewson (1981)	USA	Observational study as described above (Griffith, 1980)	This religious group compared to the "healing community"; involves "communitas" and "healing charisma". It was suggested that improvements in psychiatric status may be "more than transient".
Griffith, Young & Smith (1984)	USA	Interviews with 20 frequent attenders at mid-week services described above (Griffith, 1980) Ages 18-27 years.	Feelings and behaviours in relation to 4 main components of service: testimony - ineffable, religious; possession - ecstasy, relief; dancing

& glossolalia - religious. As a whole - group closeness, hope, altruism, selfexpression, helping others.

Ness & USA Description and Describes faith healing in Wintrob synthesis of folk fundamentalist Christian (1981) healing in the groups, and belief in USA rootwork among black (and white) people in SE USA

Social-cognitive factors: Beliefs and identity.

<u> </u>		urce and type of	Findings and conclusions
<u>information</u>			
Bartocci (1975) Bantus	South Africa	33 Bantu and 30 "Coloured" patients, first hospitalization with psychosis	The coloured patients' disorders were more serious (mostly hebephrenic); no solid cultural background. The background is structured by animalistic beliefs, firmer ego/identity.
Hickling & Griffith (1994)	Jamaica & others	Discussion of clinica perspectives on the Rastafari movemen	l May provide an affirmation an affirmation of black at identity and a moral framework.
Hill (1987)	USA	Observation of Simba Wachanga ceremony; discussion of rearing the African-American child.	Need for coming-of-age (and other) rituals to ensure continuity of culture and cultural identity.
Littlewoo (1993)		Medical Anthropological study, case studies.	Discusses relations between pathology and identity.
Gesler & Nahim (1984) ideas	Sierra Leone	200 in-patients 207 out-patients at the only Western mental	The (more seriously ill) in- patients were less likely to have social support, more likely to express Western
Tucas		hospital.	about the causes of mental illness, and have more Western treatments than outpatients (possibly suggesting weak identity).

Redlener & Scott (1979)	USA		Belief in efficacy of prayer and reform by sufferer and his/her social network
Snow (1974)	USA	Interviews with members and ministers of the Holiness Church	Belief in efficacy of prayer and repentance.

Table 4: Means by which religion may have adverse effects on mental $\frac{1}{1}$ health among black groups.

_

Belief in sin and suffering

<u>StudyCountry</u>	Source and type of information	Findings and conclusions
Redlener USA & Scott (1979)		The grandmother believed that the child's serious condition was due to the mother failing to have prayed enough.
Snow USA (1974)	Interviews with members and ministers of the Holiness Church	Illness can be sent as a punishment for sin; a reminder to improve; children's illness may be the result of parents' sins; a doctor may not be able to heal (as suggested by interviewees).
Littlewood UK & Lipsedge (1989)	Case study	The patient was self-harming and self-destructive; she had a strictly religious, physically-abusive upbringing, and felt she was irredeemably bad.

Belief in evil or harmful spirits or witchcraft

Erinosho (1977b)	Nigeria	4 case histories of Nigerian patients undergoing psychotherapy	Belief in the evil machinations of others through witchcraft reported by all. This belief is not confined to the nonliterate.
Lefley & Bestman (1977)	USA & Carib -bean	Description and discussion of psychotherapy in Caribbean cultures	Describes indigenous healing systems: Voudou (Haiti), Obeah or witchcraft (British West Indies, Virgin Islands, Bahamas), Espiritismo (Puerto Rica), Santeria

(Cuba).

Mentions the practice of various forms of hexing

Hillard & Rockwel (1978)	USA 1	Case study of an intelligent, well-educated black woman suffering from dysesthesia, from the rural Southern USA	The authors suggest that the dysesthesia was a conversion reaction, and it responded to conventional psychotherapy. However the patient believed was the victim of witchcraft. Beliefs in witchcraft (rootwork, hexing) should be inquired about in patients with unusual symptoms and the appropriate cultural background.
Littlewood & Lipsedge (1978, 1981a, 1981b)		Patients admitted with diagnoses of psychosis.	Many Afro-Caribbeans' had a paranoid and religious flavour, resembling "bouffees delirantes" described in the French West Indies, in which the persecutory content is often linked to witchcraft.
Ness & Wintrob (1981)	USA	Description and synthesis of folk healing in the USA	Describes faith healing in fundamentalist Christian groups, and belief in rootwork among black (and white) people in SE USA
Patel (1995)	Africa	Reviews studies of beliefs about the causes of mental illnesses from 11 countries in sub-Saharan Africa.	Causes can include spiritual factors.
Stevens (1987)	Africa	3 case histories	Suggests that belief in witch- craft and fear of ancestor retribution in Africa and developing countries may play a role in acute
psychoses	•		
Ward & Beaubrun	UK	20 members of a West Indian Pentecostal group, 16 women and 4 men, with belief in malevolent spirit possession, tested	The 10 subjects who were defined as spirit-possessed scored significantly higher on neuroticism and hysteria than did the control group. Suggested that possession

neurotic

with the EPI and the may be a culture-bound hysteria scale of the disorder. MMPI.

_

Table 5: Religious factors which may discourage black people from consulting orthodox medical and mental health services: Religion seen or used as a more effective form of coping, and religious/social disapproval of use of orthodox services.

StudyCountry Findings and conclusions Source and type of information Jones USA Literature review on Spirituality is an (1992)psychotherapy with important construct African-American and coping strategy women within the African-American culture Leflev Description and Describes indigenous USA & Bestman & discussion of healing systems: Voudou Carib psychotherapy in (Haiti), Obeah or witchcraft (1977)Caribbean cultures (British West Indies, Virgin -bean and relations with Islands, Bahamas), Espiritismo (Puerto Rica), Santeria (Cuba) psychotherapy. Millet, USA 67 black & 78 white Black American respondents rated spiritual factors as Sullivan, subjects read more important in aetiology Schwebel vignettes on mental health and treatment than did whites. & Myers (1996)problems, and rated importance of spiritual and other factors as causes, and their effectivesness in treatment. 32 Black and The majority of those surveyed Purdy, USA 73 Puerto Rican would turn to their pastor Simari members of 5 rather than to a counsellor & Colon (1983)Pentecostal or clinician for help with churches. personal or family problems. Ouestionnaire on religion, mental illness, and pastor's role. Redlener USA Case study of 9-The mother and grandmother month-old black child said that the baby should & Scott (1979)admitted to hospital be removed from hospital so with meningitis and that proper prayers could be started. Grandmother believed brain damage. Mother devout and grandmother that an illness of the mother an ardent minister of had been cured by prayer, and the Holiness Church the child's condition would not be so serious if the

mother had prayed more.

Silva USA de Crane

Spielberger

309 18-35-year-old Anglo, Spanish-American & Black undergraduates. Attitudes to mental illness.

Blacks and Hispanics had more negative and less benevolent attitudes to mental illness than whites (suggesting possibly greater degree of

stigma.

Table 6: Some forms of coping and treatment reported among black groups in the UK and USA, alternative to orthodox medical and psychological provision.

_			
Study Coun		ource and type of ormation	Findings and conclusions
Griffith, Young & Smith (1984)	USA	Interviews with 20 regular attenders of a mid-week black church service.	It is suggested that the service is a mental health resource. Features are testimony, possession. dancing and speaking in tongues. Therapeutic factors include hope, group cohesiveness, altruism and helping.
Lefley use	USA	Description of men	tal Describes belief in hexing,
& Bestman (1977)		health needs and provision for Caribbean immigrant groups in Miami	of folk healers, and a health which attempts to combine traditional and scientific approaches to psychotherapy.
Mollica, Streets & Boscarino (1986) of have	USA	Survey of 116 traditional clergy including 21 black clergy.	The black clergy were functioning as a major mental health resource, compared with others, some of whose activities were very limited partly due to the emergence pastoral counsellors who
liave			largely taken over the counselling functions of
clergy			among non-blacks.
Purdy, Simari & Colon (1983)	USA	32 Black and 73 Puerto Rican members of 5 Pentecostal churches. Questionnaire on religion, mental illness, and pastor's role.	The majority of those surveyed would turn to their pastor rather than to a counsellor or clinician for help with personal or family problems.

Table 7: Religiously-endorsed/encouraged behaviour which might be regarded as psychotic or otherwise disturbed

Findings and conclusions StudyCountry Source and type of information Alonso USA Four case studies of It is suggested that (belief Cuban American in) spirit possession Jeffrey psychiatric patients fostered by the syncretic (1988)Afro-Christian religion Santeria may have complicated diagnosis and treatment Ananth USA Case study of a 19-Post-mortem showed thymoma. (1984)year old black woman The possibility of an organic who died the day cause in patients showing after treatment for psychosis with hyper sudden psychosis religiosity should be with hyperconsidered. religiosity. Dobbin Anthropological The music and steps are Mont-(1983)analysis of European-influenced, but the serrat, West ethnographic data role of trance-divining, Indies on the Jombee the intervention of dance ancestor-Jombees (spirits who possess the dancers) and the use of Obeah (magic) indicate African roots. Early USA Case study: a 10-year There was no evidence of old black girl who psychopathology Lifschutz experienced religious (1974)stigmata (including bleeding), and auditory hallucinations of a religious nature. Discussion of clinical Beliefs and practices Hickling Jamaica include wearing dreadlocks, perspectives on the Griffith Rastafari movement sacramental use of marijuana, others (1994)(includes three opposition to traditional case histories). government. Clinicians are encouraged to diagnose on phenomenological grounds rather than social behaviour. Historical analysis of Traces the development of Hall USA (1984)the religious independent black churches from experiences of blacks the period of slavery (when in Florida 1565-1906 slaves were relegated to whiteseparate pews

final

dominated churches). The

chapter focuses on the centrality and persistence of possession-like ritual behaviour over the period studied.

Hillard USA & Rockwell (1978)

Case study of an intelligent, well-educated black woman suffering from dysesthesia, from the rural Southern USA

The authors suggest that the dysesthesia was a conversion reaction, and it responded to conventional psychotherapy. However the patient believed was the victim of witchcraft. Beliefs in witchcraft (rootwork, hexing) should be inquired about in patients with unusual symptoms and the appropriate cultural background.

Lipsedge UK (1996)

Medical-historical review of religion and madness, including a number of case histories.

Their is little to support Zilboorg & Henry's (1941) conclusion that madness was widely believed to be caused by possession. A number of cases involving religious phenomenology are examined anorexia, possession, (holy visions, etc) are the as debates regarding whether the sufferer was saintly or mad. Lipsedge points out that religious means were effective way for women to gain an audience in cultures

Littlewood UK & Lipsedge (1989)

Case study of a female patient in a state of extreme religious enthusiasm. The patient was excited and talking or babbling incoherently. The psychiatrist thought this was glossolalia, but the members of her Pentecostal church said it was not.

of female disempowerment.

Littlewood UK & Lipsedge (1978, 1981a, 1981b)

Patients admitted with diagnoses of psychosis: 3 studies of hospital admissions

Many Afro-Caribbeans'
had a paranoid and religious
flavour, resembling
"bouffees delirantes"
described in the French
West Indies, in which
the persecutory content
is often linked to witchcraft.

Ndetei (1988)	UK	Phenomenology of psychiatric illness in a London hospital, and socio-cultural backgrounds of West Indian, African and Asian immigrants to the UK (and other groups), all psychiatric inpatients, total n=593.	Paranoid and religious phenomenology associated with African and West Indian groups for cultural reasons rather than their socio- environmental and racial status in Britain. Paranoia was directed to fellow- immigrants rather than to the host population. Suggested that (auditory) hallucinations and first rank symptoms of schizophrenia do not have the same diagnostic significance every culture, and that paranoid and religious phenomenology may not have the same clinical significance (among Africans and Afro- Caribbeans).
Ndetei & Vadher (1984)	UK	593 psychiatric inpatients from 9 cultural groups. Examined patterns of delusions.	Cultural differences in persecutory, grandiose, religious, sexual and fantastic delusions, all of which are at relatively higher frequencies in West Indian and African groups.
Redlener & Scott (1979) child	USA	month-old black child admitted to hospi with meningitis and brain damage. Mother	The mother was described by the hospital social tal worker as relating to the in a loving but unrealistic manner, says the child is respecial to her, fasts and of prays for his recovery, attributes the illness to "demonic forces" and wants to take the child home. In court hearings regarding custody, the mother was evaluated as "paranoid-schizophrenic", and allowed supervised visits only. The child was eventually institutionalized. The authors suggest this tragedy was the result of incompatibility between

and religious ideology.

medical

Ward (1982)	various	4 case histories of 25-38-year-old women from syncretic subcultures in traditional societies	Spirit possession is examined as a form of personal maladjustment and as a form of social protest. Suggested that pathological possession states are precipitated by difficulties like those in industrialized societies, but are coloured by traditional beliefs.
Ward & Beaubrun	UK	20 members of a West Indian Pentecostal group, 16 women and 4 men, with belief in malevolent spirit possession, tested with the EPI and	The 10 subjects who were defined as spirit-possessed scored significantly higher on neuroticism and hysteria than did the control group. Suggested that possession the may be a culture-bound
neurotic		hysteria scale of the MMPI.	-

Table 8: Use of religious therapeutic practices among black people outside the UK and USA

StudyCoun		ource and type of formation	Findings and conclusions
Csordas by	Brazil	Case vignettes from	Patients's recovery assisted
(1987)		interviews with a Brazilian psychiat -rist who is an elder of the candomble cult	
Erinosho (1977a)	Nigeria	Retrospective study, 208 treated schizophrenics and next of kin, from 2 different centres	A substantial number of patients from all educational levels had previously sought help from native healers or syncretic churches.
Griffith (1983)	Jamaica	Interviews with 39 patients, 15 staff, pastor and clinic director or a church -based healing ministry.	Clinic offered health care integrating religious and medical/psychological beliefs. Patients led in prayer before referral for medical treatment or psychological counselling.
Idowu (1992)	Nigeria	Description of the Oshun festival	Traditional healing of mind, and soul; involves bathing in the Oshun river. Fosters
self-			esteem and group ties.
Lefever (1996)	Cuba	Social-anthropological analysis of Santeria from the C16th	Santeria is a syncretism of African religions, Roman Catholicism and French Spiritism. It was not (merely) an attempt to conceal the worship of African gods, but a way of harnessing and appropriating the power of
the			masters.
Peltzer & Ebigbo (1989)	Africa	Edited collection of descriptions of a wide range of traditional forms	Considers psychosocial and psychotherapeutic aspects traditional forms of healing, mainly in Africa, and
including		of healing (mainly in Africa)	those used in hospitals and among Christian groups.
Roach	Trinidad	d Observational	Studied use of Obeah

(1992)study in the treatment of mental illnesses believed to be caused by evil spirits. Explanations are based on a Nigeria Case study of Umoren (1990)explanation and strongly religious worldview. Possession and nonpossession treatment of mental mental disorders are illness among the Annang identified. This case did not involve possession, and treatment included relaxation, suggestion, manipulation, chains and tranquillising medicine.

_