



Swansea University
Prifysgol Abertawe



Cronfa - Swansea University Open Access Repository

This is an author produced version of a paper published in:

Nature Geoscience

Cronfa URL for this paper:

<http://cronfa.swan.ac.uk/Record/cronfa29427>

Paper:

Gagen, M., Zorita, E., McCarroll, D., Zahn, M., Young, G. & Robertson, I. (2016). North Atlantic summer storm tracks over Europe dominated by internal variability over the past millennium. *Nature Geoscience*, 9(8), 630-635.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/ngeo2752>

This item is brought to you by Swansea University. Any person downloading material is agreeing to abide by the terms of the repository licence. Copies of full text items may be used or reproduced in any format or medium, without prior permission for personal research or study, educational or non-commercial purposes only. The copyright for any work remains with the original author unless otherwise specified. The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holder.

Permission for multiple reproductions should be obtained from the original author.

Authors are personally responsible for adhering to copyright and publisher restrictions when uploading content to the repository.

<http://www.swansea.ac.uk/library/researchsupport/ris-support/>

1 North Atlantic summer storm tracks over Europe dominated by internal variability over
2 the past millennium

3

4 Mary H. Gagen*¹, Eduardo Zorita², Danny McCarroll¹, Matthias Zahn², Giles H.F.
5 Young¹ and Iain Robertson¹.

6

7 ¹Department of Geography, Swansea University, Singleton Park, Swansea, UK.

8 ²Institute for Coastal Research, Helmholtz-Zentrum Geesthacht, Geesthacht, Germany

9 *Corresponding author, m.h.gagen@swansea.ac.uk

10

11 **Certain large, sustained anomalies in European temperatures in the last millennium**
12 **do not match estimations of external climate forcing, and are likely the result of**
13 **internal variation¹. Should such anomalies occur in the future, they could be large**
14 **enough to significantly modulate European temperatures away from the expected**
15 **response to greenhouse forcing²⁻³. Here, past millennium temperature observations,**
16 **simulations and reconstructions reveal that, continental multidecadal-mean summer**
17 **temperature has varied within a span of 1K, largely controlled by external forcing.**
18 **By contrast simulation-estimated subcontinental deviations from the mean,**
19 **described by the temperature contrast between northern and southern Europe (the**
20 **meridional temperature gradient), vary within a span of 2K and are largely driven**
21 **by internal climatic processes. These processes comprise internally generated**
22 **redistributions of precipitation and cloud cover linked to oscillations in the position**
23 **of the summer storm track. In contrast to recent 20th century⁴ wintertime trends,**
24 **regional past-millennium variations of the summer storm-track show a weak**
25 **response to external forcing and dominance of stochastic internal variability. The**
26 **future response of European summer temperatures to anthropogenic greenhouse**
27 **forcing is likely to be spatially modulated by stochastic internal processes which**
28 **have caused multiple periods of cool, wet summers⁵⁻⁶ in northern Europe over the**
29 **last millennium.**

30

31 Climate variability has two, entangled sources. One source comes from external climate
32 forcing factors, such as greenhouse gases, solar irradiance and volcanic eruptions. The
33 response to changes in these forcing factors (the equilibrium climate sensitivity) reveals

34 the magnitude and severity of long-term future warming caused by anthropogenic
35 greenhouse gas emissions. The other source, internal climate variability, does not require
36 changes in external forcing and may cause large amplitude deviations around the
37 externally driven component¹. Whilst external forcing has the capacity to influence
38 internal variability⁷, the degree of independence of the two components is a significant
39 unknown. The contributions of internal variability in climate can be larger at continental
40 scales⁸, and the temporal and spatial structures more complex, in comparison to global
41 scales. Thus subcontinental variability may be capable of locally masking the continental
42 scale forced response in coming decades. Whilst the response of continentally averaged
43 temperatures to external forcing in the Late Holocene has been scrutinized⁹, the spatial
44 structure, and dynamics, associated with deviations from the forced continental mean,
45 remains unquantified. Here we focus on multidecadal summer temperature variability in
46 Europe over the past millennium and its connections to the variability of storm tracks. In
47 this region marked recent multidecadal variations in the position of the storm tracks have
48 been detected in the observational record⁵, suggesting a link to internal regional climate
49 variability.

50

51 *Proxy and model-derived records.*

52

53 Analysis is facilitated by the global climate simulations of the fifth Climate Model
54 Intercomparison Project (CMIP5), which allow for a dynamical interpretation of
55 temperature variability, and by multiple high-resolution proxy records sensitive to
56 summer temperature, which offer palaeoproxy evidence. The proxy-based summer
57 temperature reconstructions represent a north-south transect in Western Europe¹⁰⁻¹³ (see
58 Online Methods). The climate models were driven by estimations of the main past
59 external climate forcings, which vary among simulations depending on the different
60 estimates used¹⁴ (see Online Methods). We analyse simulations with the Earth System
61 Model MPI-ESM-P, and outputs from another high-resolution model, CCSM4 (see
62 Online Methods).

63

64 Proxy-based, gridded, past millennium climate reconstructions encompassing the
65 European continent have previously been generated assuming that spatial temperature
66 covariance across the region behaved, in the past, as in the observational period¹⁵⁻¹⁶. This
67 strategy bears the risk of artificially identifying the same patterns of variability as
68 presently observed, and overlooking periodically occurring modes of internal climate
69 variability that do not have spatio-temporally uniform expression. . Here we construct
70 independent regional summer temperature composites for four areas under the
71 geographical descriptors Arctic, Central, Pyrenean and Alpine Europe, and choose not to
72 calibrate them to modes of variability expressed in the 20th century. The proxy data set
73 was provided by the EU 6th Framework Millennium project (Table S11). Proxy data are
74 dominated by highly-replicated time series of tree ring width and density variability. The
75 Alpine series contains tree ring, and lake sediment derived data¹⁰.

76

77 The magnitude of subcontinental summer temperature variability in the simulations can
78 be quantified by the total variance left unexplained by the mean continental temperature
79 history. In the MPI-ESM simulation (AD 850-2005), continental mean temperature
80 variability explains half of the total summer temperature variance in the European sector
81 after 21-year low-pass filtering, and is significantly correlated ($r=0.55$, $p=0.001$, see
82 Online Methods for estimation of p-values) with external climate forcing including
83 greenhouse gases, solar variability and volcanic eruptions¹⁷ (see Online Methods for the
84 estimation of total external forcing). Moreover, the continental average of summer
85 temperature also presents the ‘classic’ climate evolution of the last millennium, with a
86 Medieval Climate Anomaly (MCA) in initial centuries, leading into the Little Ice Age
87 (LIA) around AD 1700 followed by a post-industrialisation warming phase (Figure 1A).
88 Similar results are obtained with the CCSM4 simulation (Figure S1) although there are
89 some differences in the regional details and gradient strengths, which may be linked to
90 the differing model physics, or differences in the contributions of internal variability.
91 Mean continental summer temperatures simulated by both models are significantly
92 correlated ($r=0.54$, $p=0.0005$). Despite the differences in the forcings considered¹⁸,
93 multidecadal continental mean summer temperature in both simulations appears to be

94 dominated by external forcing, on the basis of both the correlation with external forcing
95 and the widely-verified temporal evolution (e.g MCA/LIA).

96

97 *Observed, modelled and proxy meridional temperature anomalies.*

98

99 The potential internally-forced variability is better exposed by subtracting the continental
100 multidecadal-mean summer temperature from the simulated grid-cell temperatures. The
101 time series of external forcing explains ~4% of these temperature residuals. The grid-cell
102 residuals from the continental mean are better described by the European Meridional
103 Temperature Gradient (MTG) (defined as the slope of the regression of zonal mean
104 temperature against latitude, see Online Methods), than by the zonal temperature gradient
105 (defined as the slope of the regression of the meridional-mean temperature against
106 longitude). The European meridional temperature gradient explains ~35% of the
107 variability of the temperature residuals, the zonal gradient only ~10%. Similar results are
108 derived from the simulation with the model CCSM4 (40% and 8% respectively), the low
109 correlations with the zonal temperature gradient thus ruling out a major role of external
110 forcing in driving the temperature pattern.

111

112 A Principal Component Analysis of the temperature deviations from the continental-
113 mean in the simulations confirms these results, with the leading pattern exhibiting a
114 meridional sea-saw in both models, and explaining 37% (2-model average) of the
115 variability (Figure S2). In contrast to the behaviour of the continental-mean temperature,
116 the pairwise correlation between the mean meridional gradient in the simulations is low
117 ($r=0.05$, $p>0.45$). We thus focus on broad-scale, internally driven, climatic mechanisms
118 that might better explain the decadal variations in the European summer MTG.

119

120 The spatial correlation map of time series of the mean simulated MTG with summer
121 precipitation in each model grid-cell reveals a physically consistent spatial structure
122 (Figure 1D). Regions with temperatures lower than the long term mean tend to receive
123 more precipitation (and thus less short-wave surface radiation) in the summertime, and
124 vice-versa. A similar correlation analysis with baroclinic synoptic activity, defined here

125 as the 2-6 day band-pass filtered variability of the sea-level-pressure¹⁹ in each model
126 grid-cell, also indicates that regions experiencing lower than average temperatures and
127 higher than average precipitation are linked to higher than average synoptic activity
128 (more storms than usual enter the region, Figure 1C and 1D). We will later relate this
129 statistical relationship to decadal north-south oscillations of the summer storm-tracks in
130 the European region²⁰.

131

132 *The observed meridional temperature gradient*

133

134 The European MTG has a similar relationship with observed, gridded precipitation and
135 synoptic activity from meteorological reanalysis (AD 1948-1998, Figure 2A and 2B).
136 The observed MTG record is weakly (but significantly) correlated with the continental
137 scale temperature mean ($r=-0.26$, $p=0.001$, Figure 2D). Their multidecadal behaviour is
138 also profoundly different, most conspicuously at the end of the 20th century when
139 continental mean temperature shows a warming trend beginning ~AD 1960, at which
140 time the evolution of the MTG is essentially flat. Over the record length the extremes in
141 the continental-mean and the MTG do not generally coincide, clearly evident during the
142 AD 2003 European heat wave²¹, and the extreme temperature gradient in AD 2012
143 (Figure 2D).

144

145 The multidecadal variations in the MTG as revealed by observational record and
146 simulations promote investigation within the proxy record as such variability can be
147 better characterised by the longer context available. Our north-south transect of proxy-
148 based summer temperature reconstructions (see Online Methods) reveals a pattern of
149 variability consistent with the picture revealed by the simulations and historical
150 observations (Figure 1). The series begin after the Medieval Climate Anomaly and reveal
151 a continental temperature decrease into the Little Ice Age followed by notable warming
152 in the industrial period (Figure 1B). The proxy composite time series were smoothed in
153 the same manner as the simulations (21-year low-pass filter), to highlight multidecadal
154 variability, and were subsequently standardized to unit variance (with reference to AD
155 1264-1992). Standardization was carried out to address the different variance

156 preservation properties of the statistical reconstruction methods used, which could have
157 resulted in series with differing variance characteristics confounding the climate signal⁹.
158 We note that the variance-capture properties of the proxy time series are tested and
159 robust¹⁰⁻¹³.

160

161 *Meridional summer temperature gradient in the proxy records.*

162

163 Each proxy time series can be decomposed as the sum of (1) the mean of the four
164 regional proxy-reconstructions and (2) a residual. If all four proxy records were varying
165 in synchrony, the variance of the residual records would be zero. Here, the sum of
166 variance of the residuals is 35% of the original sum of variances, indicating that about
167 one third of the variance is 'local' (linearly independent of the spatial mean) and 65% of
168 the variance is common to all four records, and can be represented by their average.

169

170 The averaged record broadly displays the reconstructed temperature evolution of the last
171 millennium (Figure 1B), as in the simulations, and also correlates with the same time
172 series of external forcing¹⁷ ($r=0.71$, $p=0.0001$), with a pre-AD 1800 correlation of $r=0.48$
173 ($p=0.01$), indicating that the proxies capture the forced temperature variability of the last
174 centuries²². Clear minima are displayed in AD 1601 and 1817 associated with known,
175 volcanic, forcing events (Serua and Tambora respectively)²³, although not all minima can
176 be explained by external forcing.

177

178 In order to describe the evolution of north-south temperature differences within our proxy
179 network (see Online Methods) we defined the meridional proxy gradient (MPG) across
180 the proxy regions (Figure 1B). We define the MPG as the slope of the regression of the
181 proxy indicators against latitude; it resembles the temperature slope of the gridded
182 temperature fields (see Online Methods). The MPG explains 18% of the total proxy
183 variance and its correlation with the total external forcing¹⁷ in the period AD 1000-1990
184 (or AD 1000-1850) is small ($r<0.01$ $p=0.43$), as for the simulated MTG. To investigate
185 the large-scale synoptic origins of this mode, we compare the MPG with the meridional
186 temperature gradient derived from gridded temperature observations (Figure 2C). The

187 two time series correlate strongly ($r=0.56$, $p=5 \times 10^{-5}$) in their common period (AD 1850-
188 1980), at both interannual and decadal time scales, demonstrating that the MPG also
189 reflects the underlying meridional temperature gradient. The correlation patterns between
190 the MPG and gridded summer precipitation and synoptic activity in the observational
191 period reflect very similar structures to those derived from the observed MTG (Figures
192 2A, 2B and S3).

193

194 The MPG records six multidecadal extremes, three centred on AD 1310, 1730 and 1910
195 in which the meridional gradient swings to steeper values (indicative of strongly
196 anomalous temperatures), and three periods around AD 1500, 1750 and 1940 in which
197 the meridional gradient was weaker than average (Figure 1B). These extremes do not
198 appear to be correlated to either known volcanic or solar forcing events, conspicuously so
199 during periods of strong volcanic activity around AD 1601 and 1817. The MPG minima
200 at AD 1500 and 1750 correspond to northern European warm anomalies, which have
201 been noted as unforced¹. In contrast to the winter season²², the European summer
202 temperature gradient exhibits large excursions and lacks a strong response to the past
203 external forcing. The link between the MPG and the observed atmospheric circulation
204 (Figure 2A) supports the picture from the simulation data, that the MPG is driven by
205 atmospheric variability which modulates the location of storm centres, and cloud cover,
206 over Western Europe.

207

208 *Position of the summer storm track*

209

210 The correlation pattern of the MTG (MPI-ESM-P simulation) with the summer sea-level-
211 pressure field (SLP), and with incoming shortwave radiation at the surface, is shown in
212 Figure 3. The SLP pattern displays a wave train of alternating positive and negative
213 anomalies across the North Atlantic to Europe. This SLP pattern is consistent with
214 reduced surface shortwave radiation over Northern Europe, and increased surface
215 shortwave radiation over Southern Europe, which favours a steeper meridional
216 temperature gradient in Western Europe. The configuration over Europe is confirmed in

217 the corresponding correlation patterns derived from gridded instrumental data sets and
218 from the simulation with CCSM4 (Figure S1).

219

220 The correlation of the simulated MTG with the total radiation balance at the top of the
221 atmosphere (including shortwave and longwave radiation, positive when directed
222 downwards) indicates that, when the MTG is steeper (higher), below average net energy
223 amounts are entering the atmosphere in Northern Europe and greater than average energy
224 amounts are entering the atmosphere in Southern Europe (Figure 3C). The implied
225 meridional transport of energy, therefore, counteracts the MTG indicating that the
226 meridional energy transport is not the driving factor for variations in the temperature
227 gradient.

228

229 We find that the MTG is linked to the position of the storm tracks in the MPI-ESM
230 simulation over the period AD 850-2005. We applied a storm-tracking algorithm to
231 identify the simulated individual storms in the North Atlantic-European sector during the
232 summer (JJA). The algorithm²⁴ uses the 6-hourly sea level pressure (MSLP) minima and
233 additionally requests threshold values for vorticity at 850 mb height, storm track length
234 and the MSLP gradient to define the presence of a storm (see Online Methods). In order
235 to evaluate summers more affected by northward/southward moving storms we divided
236 the region east of 10°W into two sections, north and south of 52.5°N, and calculated the
237 ratio of the number of northern versus southern storms in sliding 21-year windows
238 (Figure 3D). This smoothed record correlates with the smoothed simulated MTG record
239 ($r=0.53$, $p=5 \times 10^{-5}$), indicating that the meridional shifts of the storm tracks contribute to
240 maintaining the MTG, likely through anomalies in surface shortwave radiation (Figure
241 3B). By altering the atmospheric radiation properties cyclones have a cooling effect over
242 land areas in summer, and hence, more frequent (fewer) storms result in lower (higher)
243 temperatures than normal, and thus in an enhanced (weakened) MTG. The opposite is the
244 case for the southern regions. In contrast, the ratio of south/north storms is not correlated
245 at decadal scales with average continental temperature ($r<0.004$, $p=0.495$), and only
246 rather weakly with total external forcing ($r=0.18$, $p=0.2$). Thus, the position of the
247 European-Atlantic summer storm tracks in the simulation has, on average, varied

248 independent of external climate forcing over the last 800 years, a supportive result to
249 scenario simulations exploring the winter North Pacific storm track²⁵. These results
250 strongly suggest that the variations in the external forcing over the past centuries have not
251 been strong enough to distinctively affect the summer storm tracks in the North Atlantic
252 region, and possibly elsewhere.

253

254 We have also explored to what extent the MTG is related to large-scale modes of climate
255 variability in the atmosphere and in the North Atlantic Ocean. A candidate is the North
256 Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC), since it affects meridional
257 advection of heat by the ocean thus impacting sea-surface-temperatures in the North
258 Atlantic²⁶. In the MPI-ESM simulation, the link between the MTG and the AMOC at
259 decadal timescales is weak but statistically significant with an unlagged correlation of $r=-$
260 0.27 ($p=0.01$) and lower values for time-lagged indices. The spatial pattern of correlation
261 between the AMOC index and near surface temperature in the North-Atlantic European
262 sector at decadal time scales confirms that a more intense AMOC tends to reduce the
263 meridional temperature gradient, this influence describes a large-scale North Atlantic
264 pattern consistent with the canonical structure of the AMOC. Its influence is mostly
265 restricted to the ocean surface and it is weak over European land (Figure S4). The
266 Summer North Atlantic Oscillation (SNAO) has been identified as a pattern of low-
267 frequency climate variability in this region, with a distinguishable sea-level-pressure
268 pattern²⁷ showing a centre of action over the North Sea and extending over Northern
269 Europe. This pattern is clearly different from the sea-level-pressure pattern linked to the
270 MTG in the model (Figure 3A) and in observations (Figure S3), and therefore we
271 conclude that there is no strong link between the variability of the MTG and the SNAO.
272 Previous studies on the variability of the winter NAO in the CMIP models also indicated
273 that most of its decadal variability is unforced²⁸.

274

275 We present evidence from palaeoclimate simulations, observational and proxy data
276 revealing that variations of the summer meridional temperature gradient over Europe are
277 largely independent of external climate forcing over the last millennium. In addition,
278 palaeoclimate simulations, and the observational record, consistently indicate that this

279 gradient expresses a pattern of distinct internal spatial shifts in synoptic activity linked to
280 spatial patterns of precipitation and cloudiness anomalies. At the regional scale, these
281 internal fluctuations, independent of external forcing, strongly modulate the mean
282 continental temperature response, at decadal timescales. In phases when a strong MTG
283 exists, these anomalies display a physically consistent dipolar structure, with those areas
284 of Europe experiencing anomalously low (high) temperatures also being those which
285 receive more (less) precipitation and cloudiness.

286

287 The two paleoclimate simulations analysed here present remarkably similar results,
288 although both climate models are structurally quite different, strongly suggesting that the
289 results do not depend on the climate model used. However, climate models still struggle
290 to realistically represent the simulation of atmospheric blocking, still a deficiency in
291 state-of-the-art models, which could indirectly affect the simulated variability of
292 storminess in this region²⁹.

293

294 The behaviour of the MTG/MPG, associated with the meridional differences in
295 cloudiness and precipitation linked to the centre of European summer storminess is
296 revealed, by the recent palaeoclimate perspective, to be largely unforced. Whilst this
297 could relate to the surmised small variations of past external forcing it may also indicate
298 that the forced increase in European summer temperatures in the next few decades is
299 likely to be significantly modulated, critically either enhancing or countering forced
300 warming, by powerful internal changes in Europe's meridional temperature gradient.

301

302 Correspondence should be addressed to m.h.gagen@swansa.ac.uk

303

304 **Acknowledgements:**

305 MHG., DM, GHFY and IR were supported by European Union FP6 project Millennium
306 017008 and the Climate Consortium for Wales C3W. The work of EZ and MZ is part of
307 the German Cluster of Excellence CLISAP. MHG, DM and EZ were supported by the
308 PAGES initiative (EuroMed2k), which in turn received support from the US and Swiss
309 National Science Foundations, US National Oceanographic and Atmospheric
310 Administration and the International Geosphere-Biosphere Programme.

311

312 **Author contributions:**

313 MHG: project planning and design, data analysis, manuscript preparation. EZ: data
314 analysis and manuscript preparation. DM: project planning and design, data analysis,
315 manuscript preparation. MZ: data analysis, manuscript preparation. GHFY: project
316 planning, data analysis, manuscript preparation. IR: project planning, data analysis,
317 manuscript preparation.

318

319 **References**

- 320 1. Zorita, E. *et al.* European temperature records of the past five centuries based on
321 documentary/instrumental information compared to climate simulations. *Climatic*
322 *Change* **101**, 143-168, doi:10.1007/s10584-010-9824-7 (2010).
- 323 2. Stott, P. A. *et al.* Detection and attribution of climate change: a regional perspective.
324 *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change* **1**, 192-211, doi:10.1002/wcc.34
325 (2010).
- 326 3. Solomon, A. *et al.* Distinguishing the Roles of Natural and Anthropogenically Forced
327 Decadal Climate Variability. *Bull. Amer. Meteor. Soc.*, **92**, 141-156. (2011).
- 328 4. McCabe, G. J., Clark, M. P. & Serreze, M. C. Trends in Northern Hemisphere
329 surface cyclone frequency and intensity, *Journal of Climatology*, **14**, 2763 – 2768
330 (2001) .
- 331 5. Zhang, X., Walsh, J. E. Zhang, J. Bhatt, U. S. & Ikeda M. Climatology and
332 interannual variability of Arctic cyclone activity: 1948–2002, *Journal of Climate*, **17**,
333 2300–2317, (2004).
- 334 6. Dong, B., Sutton, R. T., Woollings, T. & Hodges, K. Variability of the North Atlantic
335 summer storm track: mechanisms and impacts on European climate. *Environmental*
336 *Research Letters* **8**, 034037 (2013).
- 337 7. Adams, J. B., Mann, M. E., & Ammann, C. M.. Proxy evidence for an El Nino-like
338 response to volcanic forcing. *Nature*, **426** (6964), 274-278 (2003).
- 339 8. Deser, C. *et al.* Communication of the role of natural variability in future North
340 American climate, *Nature Climate Change* **2**, 775-779 (2012).

- 341 9. PAGES 2k Consortium. Continental-scale temperature variability during the past two
342 millennia. *Nature Geosci* **6**, 339-346, doi:10.1038/ngeo1797
343 <http://www.nature.com/ngeo/journal/v6/n5/abs/ngeo1797.html#supplementary->
344 information (2013).
- 345 10. Trachsel, M. *et al.* Multi-archive summer temperature reconstruction for the
346 European Alps, AD 1053–1996. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **46**, 66-79,
347 doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2012.04.021> (2012).
- 348 11. Büntgen, U., Frank, D., Wilson, R., Carrer, M. & Urbinati, C. Testing for tree-ring
349 divergence in the European Alps. *Global Change Biology* **14**, 2443-2453,
350 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01640.x (2008).
- 351 12. Büntgen, U. *et al.* Long-term summer temperature variations in the Pyrenees. *Climate*
352 *Dynamics* **31**, 615-631, doi:10.1007/s00382-008-0390-x (2008).
- 353 13. McCarroll, D. *et al.* A 1200-year multiproxy record of tree growth and summer
354 temperature at the northern pine forest limit of Europe. *The Holocene* **23**, 4, 471-484
355 (2013).
- 356 14. Schmidt, G. *et al.* Climate forcing reconstructions for use in PMIP simulations of the
357 last millennium (v1. 0). *Geoscientific Model Development* **4** (2011).
- 358 15. Luterbacher, J., Dietrich, D., Xoplaki, E., Grosjean, M. & Wanner, H. European
359 seasonal and annual temperature variability, trends, and extremes since 1500. *Science*
360 **303**, 1499-1503 (2004).
- 361 16. Mann, M. E. *et al.* Proxy-based reconstructions of hemispheric and global surface
362 temperature variations over the past two millennia. *Proceedings of the National*
363 *Academy of Sciences* **105**, 13252-13257 (2008).
- 364 17. Crowley, T. J. Causes of climate change over the past 1000 years. *Science* **289**, 270-
365 277 (2000).
- 366 18. Schmidt, G. A. *et al.* Climate forcing reconstructions for use in PMIP simulations of
367 the last millennium (v1.0), *Geosci. Model Dev.*, **4**, 33-45, doi:10.5194/gmd-4-33-
368 2011, (2011).
- 369 19. Chang, E. K. Are band-pass variance statistics useful measures of storm track
370 activity? Re-examining storm track variability associated with the NAO using
371 multiple storm track measures. *Climate dynamics* **33**, 277-296 (2009).

- 372 20. Bender, F. A., Ramanathan, V. & Tselioudis, G. Changes in extratropical storm track
373 cloudiness 1983–2008: observational support for a poleward shift. *Climate dynamics*
374 **38**, 2037-2053 (2012).
- 375 21. Stott, P. A., Stone, D. A., & Allen, M. R. Human contribution to the European
376 heatwave of 2003. *Nature* **432** (7017), 610-614. (2004).
- 377 22. Hegerl, G. *et al.* Influence of human and natural forcing on European seasonal
378 temperatures. *Nature Geoscience* **4**, 99-103 (2011).
- 379 23. Briffa K.R., Schweingruber F.H., Jones P.D., Osborn T.J., Shiyatov S.G. and
380 Vaganov E.A. Reduced sensitivity of recent tree growth to temperature at high
381 northern latitudes. *Nature* **391**, 678-682. (1998)
- 382 24. Zahn, M. and H. von Storch. Tracking Polar Lows in CLM. *Meteorologische*
383 *Zeitschrift*, **17**, 4, 445 - 453, doi:10.1127/0941-2948/2008/0317. (2008).
- 384 25. Chang, E.K.M., Zheng, C., Lanigan, P., Yau A.M.W. Significant Modulation of
385 Variability and Projected Change in California Winter Precipitation by Extratropical
386 Cyclone Activity. *Geophysical Research Letters* **42**, 5983-5991 (2015).
- 387 26. Latif, M. *et al.* Reconstructing, monitoring, and predicting multidecadal-scale changes
388 in the North Atlantic thermohaline circulation with sea surface temperature. *J. Clim.*
389 **17**, 1605–1614 (2004).
- 390 27. Folland, C. K. *et al.* The summer North Atlantic Oscillation: past, present, and future.
391 *Journal of Climate* **22**, 1082-1103 (2009).
- 392 28. Gómez-Navarro, J. J., & Zorita, E. Atmospheric annular modes in simulations over
393 the past millennium: No long-term response to external forcing. *Geophysical*
394 *Research Letters* **40** (12), 3232-3236 (2013).
- 395 29. Zappa G., Masato, G., Shaffrey L., Woollings T., & K. Hodges K. Linking Northern
396 Hemisphere blocking and storm-track biases in the CMIP5 climate models. *Geophys.*
397 *Res. Lett.*, **41**, 135–139 (2014).
- 398 30. Hulme, M., Osborn, T. J., & Johns, T. C. Precipitation sensitivity to global warming:
399 Comparison of observations with HadCM2 simulations. *Geophysical Research*
400 *Letters* **25** (17), 3379-3382. (1998).

401

402 **Figure captions**

403

404 **Figure 1. Spatio-temporal structure of simulated (MPI-ESM-P, AD 850-2005) and**
405 **proxy mean continental and meridional temperature gradients (meridional gradient**
406 **of European June-August (JJA) near-surface temperature).** A) Continental JJA
407 mean temperature (red) and the MTG (blue, 21-yr low-pass filtered). B) Time series (21-
408 yr low-pass filtered) of average JJA temperature indicators (proxy continental
409 temperature, red) and of the MPG (blue, AD 1260-1996). Anomalies at AD 1310, 1730
410 and 1900 are indicated. C) Spatial correlation between the MTG and near-surface
411 temperature, D) JJA precipitation and E) synoptic activity (high pass filtered [2-to-6
412 days] variance of the daily sea-level-pressure). 95% significance is close to ± 0.20 (See
413 Online Methods).

414

415 **Figure 2. Spatio-temporal structure of the European summer (JJA) near-surface**
416 **temperature meridional gradient from observational data.** A) Spatial correlation
417 between the observed summer MTG and synoptic activity (NCEP/NCAR meteorological
418 reanalysis), AD 1948-2012. 95% significance is close to ± 0.25 [See Online Methods]. B)
419 Spatial correlation between the observed summer MTG and JJA precipitation AD 1900-
420 1998³⁰. 95% significance is close to ± 0.20 . C) Standardized time series of the instrumental
421 MTG (blue) and the Meridional Proxy Gradient (MPG, red). Interannual and decadal
422 (indicated) correlations $p=5 \times 10^{-5}$ and $p=0.01$ respectively. D) Time series of observed
423 continental JJA mean temperature (red) and MTG (blue, HadCRUT4 gridded
424 temperature), correlation ($p=0.001$) indicated.

425

426 **Figure 3 Climate patterns linked to simulated summer (JJA) MTG (MPI-ESM-P,**
427 **AD 850-2005).** A) Correlation between the MTG time series and JJA sea-level-pressure
428 over the North-Atlantic European sector. B) Spatial correlation between the MTG and
429 downwelling short wave radiation at the surface. C) Spatial correlation between the MTG
430 and total upwelling radiation (shortwave plus longwave, negative directed upwards) at
431 the top of the atmosphere. 95% significance level is close to ± 0.20 [See Online Methods].
432 D) Time series of the ratio between the number of northern to southern JJA extra-tropical

433 cyclones, and the JJA MTG, (both 21-year low-pass filtered). The correlation ($p=5 \times 10^{-5}$)
434 is indicated. All series have been previously smoothed with a 21-year low-pass filter.