

## **Rhetorical Dissonance of Unsynchronized Voices: Issues of Voice-over in News Broadcasts**

**Ali Darwish, American University of Sharjah, UAE, [darwish@surf.net.au](mailto:darwish@surf.net.au)**

**Pilar Orero (1), Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona (Spain)**

**Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona**

**Edifici K-2012**

**08193 Bellaterra, Spain**

**[Pilar.Orero@uab.cat](mailto:Pilar.Orero@uab.cat)**

### **ABSTRACT**

Voice-over as an audiovisual translation modality has traditionally been described for its rendering of the truth or its faithfulness. The manipulation and deviation from the original text through translation has already been the object of study in documentaries. This paper looks at the translation of TV news through voice-over. Technical and content infidelities are rendering the broadcast actualities into sexed up copies of the original, which for all intents and purposes are in sheer contravention of what translation is for as a faithful reproduction of the original and of objective and factual news reporting. The effects of the translator's visibility in news voice-over is re-examined and the physical presence of the translator/voice talent is analyzed. This paper argues that the visibility of the translator in this instance pushes the boundaries of mediation beyond mere technicalities towards a sociopolitical sphere of reasoning and rationality by editorial policy makers. The paper also argues that synchronicity of voice-overs stemming from the rhetorical features of the voice-over styles of delivery and the idiosyncrasies of the voices creates dissonance and renders the original message with a degree of infelicities that undermine the long-celebrated standards of objectivity and neutrality. Consequently, this paper underscores the invisibility of the translator in this mode of translation mediation.

### **RESUME**

L'utilisation de la voice-over comme outil de traduction audio-visuelle est traditionnellement décrite pour son rendu authentique et sa fidélité. La manipulation et les écarts avec le texte original au travers de la traduction ont déjà fait l'objet d'étude dans le domaine du documentaire. Cet article s'intéresse à la traduction des actualités télévisées à l'aide d'une voice-over. Les inexactitudes techniques et dans le contenu font des informations diffusées des copies sensationnalistes des informations originales. Ceci contrevient en tous points à l'objectif de la traduction qui est de reproduire l'originale avec la plus grande fidélité possible de même qu'aux exigences d'objectivité du reportage des actualités. Les effets de la visibilité du traducteur en matière de nouvelles voix-over est réexaminée et la présence physique du traducteur talent vocal / est analysée. Cet article soutient que la visibilité du traducteur dans ce cas repousse les limites de la médiation au-delà de simples aspects techniques vers une sphère socio-politique du raisonnement et de la rationalité par les responsables de la politique éditoriale. Le document fait également valoir

que la synchronicité de voix-off issues de la rhétorique des fonctionnalités de voix sur styles de livraison et les particularités de la voix crée une dissonance et rend le message d'origine avec un degré de maladroitness qui sapent les normes long célèbres de l'objectivité et de neutralité. Par conséquent, ce document souligne l'invisibilité du traducteur dans ce mode de médiation de la traduction.

**Ali Darwish**, PhD, MA, MIS, is a Media, Communication and Translation consultant and scholar. He has taught translation theory and practice and communication studies at Australian universities for 12 years and has published a number of books on media, communication and translation. He is the founder and chief editor of Australia's premier refereed journal of translation studies Translation Watch Quarterly. He is currently Assistant Professor in Translation and Media Studies at American University of Sharjah.

**Pilar Orero**, PhD, MA, lectures at Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona (Spain). She started the two MAs in Audiovisual Translation at UAB, and now is the director of the Online European MA in Audiovisual Translation <http://mem.uab.es/metav/>. She has published and edited numerous books, and guest edited some special issues dedicated to media accessibility. Leader of numerous research projects funded by the Spanish and Catalan Gov. She is a partner in the EC project DTV4ALL. She is part of the research center CAIAC at UAB.

## **Rhetorical Dissonance of Unsynchronized Voices: Issues of Voice-over in News Broadcasts**

### **1. Introduction**

Voice-over, as an audiovisual translation modality, is widely used for the translation of news items. Voiceover has traditionally been described for its rendering of the truth or its faithfulness which goes on to give an overwhelming feeling of portraying reality (Luyken 1991). The manipulation and deviation from the original text through translation has already been the object of study in documentaries (Franco 2000, Matamala 2004). Orero (2006 a & b) has also analyzed some formal aspects of voice-over which help in the creation of reality. However, voice-over translation of television newscasts has only recently been afforded attention, and there is certainly a dearth of research into news translation and the effects of these audiovisual modalities on the objectivity and perception of translation-mediated news reporting (Darwish 2009). The importance of accurate voice-over translation for the objectivity and neutrality of news broadcasts cannot be overemphasized since so much depends on the accuracy and precision of the news, not only for the immediate audiences, but also for decision makers who often rely on live news broadcasts for much of their immediate decisions and public diplomacy responses to world events.

This paper examines the translation of TV news through voice-over, paying special attention to an example which will illustrate the theoretical posits. Through the close study of the real-life example in different broadcasting station, it has been observed that technical and content infidelities are rendering the broadcast actualities into sexed up copies of the original, which put into question the role of the translator and the channel where the news are broadcast. The contradiction of using voice-over for rendering distorted translations also has an incidence across all the elements of the

language shift. From the function of translation, formats for its reproduction, and the media for which it's apparently used: objective and factual news reporting, in one of the most prestigious broadcasters in the world BBC.

## **2. What makes the news**

It is well known in journalism that "man bites dog" is news. But what makes news extends beyond the unusual and unexpected to three categories of news values that determine whether an event is newsworthy. McKane (2006) cites three categories of newsworthiness. These are briefly: (1) occurrence of the event, (2) nature of the event, and (3) treatment of the event. However, the overriding factors in news reporting are accuracy, objectivity and neutrality. This certainly is a complex process that is fraught with difficulties and more often news reports fail to meet these standards. The complexity is even made worse when news is mediated through translation, either in written form from newspapers to subtitling or spoken such as dubbing or voiceover, the object of our present enquiry.

Translation studies seem to have lagged behind in the research into news translation, the reason behind pointed by Bielsa (2007) is that journalists have traditionally performed this profession. Interest into news translation has only recently gained some attention (Abusalem 2006, Ali 2006, Andujar 2006 & 2009, Bassnet & Bielsa 2008) and since the 2006 International Conference which took place at Warwick University in the UK, the list of publications into the field is flourishing, with case studies in different media and in many countries and cultures.

Voice-over has been associated to the translation of non-fiction genres (Matamala 2009 a & b) and since much of voice-over work involves news reports, it makes sense to explore how translation mediation of news through voice-over, revoicing and other

forms of audio visual translation affect the original message. The following paragraphs will seek to examine aspects of this phenomenon.

### **3. Voice-over, a definition**

For this paper we will depart from the definition of voiceover proposed by Díaz Cintas and Orero (2006: 477) as: “a technique in which a voice offering a translation in a given target language (TL) is heard simultaneously on top of the source language (SL) voice. As far as the soundtrack of the original program is concerned, the volume is reduced to a low level that can still be heard in the background whilst the translation is being read. It is common practice to allow the viewer to hear the original speech in the foreign language for a few seconds at the onset of the speech and to reduce subsequently the volume of the original so that the translated speech can be inserted. The translation usually finishes several seconds before the foreign language speech does, the sound of the original is raised again to a normal volume and the viewer can hear once more the original speech.”

This operational definition is important because it captures not only the property of overlaying a new voice on top of an original voice, but also the technical variables of synchronicity and volume, and because it sets the baseline for the debate of a standard for audiovisual translation modality. Franco *et al* (2010) have defined the following features of voice-over translation as:

- is mainly applied to non-fictional audiovisual programmes, although in certain East European countries it is also used in fictional programmes;
- renders the words of interviewers / interviewees (dialogues) / talking heads (monologues);

- is the revoicing of a text in another language, or a translating voice superimposed on a translated voice;
- is oral or spoken rendering that is delivered simultaneously and in synchrony with original speech length, recognizable words and images (kinetic/action synchronicity);
- does not account for lip synchronization;
- usually starts a few seconds after the original;
- is prepared and recorded before programme broadcasting, so never produced live;
- is derived from unedited material (production voice-over) or from edited material (postproduction voice-over);
- can render content more closely to the original (voice-over translation) or less closely to the original (what the authors have decided to call free voice-over translation);
- can personify the original speaker (first person voice-over) or report his/her words (third person voice-over);
- reproduces mimetic features to a certain extent (accent, age, emotion, gender, intonation, orality markers, stress);
- keeps its performer (voice talent) invisible.

#### **4. Voice-over versus voice acting**

From the preceding definition and features of voice-over we distinguish two types of delivery. Voiceover is often confused with voice acting, and the two terms are used interchangeably in the commercial media, where voice acting is often employed for

commercials and dubbed films and entertainment programs (Kaufman 2004). As far as AVT is concerned, voice acting has in fact been used where voice-over should. While Franco *et al* (2010) have already established this distinction from a reception perspective, here we make a distinction between these two different modes as follows: expository and rhetorical (following Darwish, 2006). “The distinction is drawn from the definition of exposition as informative discourse and rhetorical as the persuasive effect of informative discourse realized by means additional to the informative content of discourse” (Darwish, 2006: 80). AVT for news broadcasts falls into the former category.

Voice acting may cause serious dissonance between the original message and the translation voice-over in terms of quality of voice, pace, pitch, matchability and register. In the absence of voice-over standards in television, voice acting has been observed as the standards method of voice-over at three leading Arabic satellite television networks: Aljazeera, Al-Arabiya and LBC, with Aljazeera taking the lead in utilizing this mode of voice-over. As already observed by Fawcett (1983) and Zinik (2006) regarding voice accents, voice acting also forces the voice talent to mimic the original voice’s characteristics, which in some instances may create gender and age congruency problems. Gender and age congruency has been detected as another critical problem in news voice-over, where off-camera voice acting has been utilized. Incongruence occurs when the voice talent’s voice does not match the gender or the age of the original voice.

Though the tradition has it that voice-over starts some two or three seconds after the original speaker has commenced his or her utterance, which remains audible yet

hardly comprehensible. In some examples, the original speaker's is muted completely after the initial seconds, when there should be a voice superposition hence the term voice-over, and remains inaudible throughout. The latter technique, which can arguably be under the category of revoicing, was used in the Bin Laden tape under examination in this article. Both techniques have their drawbacks. When the voice remains audible under the voice-over, it forces bilingual audiences to home in on the hardly audible voice under and strain to discern what the original voice is saying. This is a distraction unwarranted.

Dennis Tedlock (1990) confirms: "Dubbing works best where languages and cultures are reasonably close. As distances increase, so does the frequency of gross mismatches between the shapes of the speaker's mouth and the voice on the sound track; still worse, the speaker may need only a single word to say something that requires a whole sentence in our language, or vice versa. On the page this sort of problem can be solved by adding more white space in one place and crowding the words in another, but there is no way to add or subtract time in synchronized dubbing, short of re-shooting or cutting the performance itself. A larger problem with dubbing is that it creates anachronisms and, along with them, what might be called anachronisms. We hear our own language being spoken at times and in places where it would never be spoken." (*ibid*: 138-139).

## **5. Audiovisual translation voice-over versus dubbing**

Another critical distinction must be made between voice-over and dubbing. This distinction is important to our discussion of voice-overs of news broadcasts because these two types of AVT that require different technicalities. One difference is that



dubbing is a total replacement of the original voice and requires lip synchronization and may create the illusion of reality. In contrast, voice-overs are not lip-synched and allow the original voice to be heard. Illustrating this difference, Antje Ascheid (1977: 34) defines dubbing as follows:

“Dubbing exchanges the linguistic code present in the voice track with another, as in literary translation, but in doing so also changes the communicating source (the specific voice and its potential connotations in relationship with the image). In both cases only part of the cinematic text is transcribed or transformed while another, the visual and aural counterparts to the voiced/linguaged signifiers (i.e., speech, intertitles, close-ups of signs, letters, and other elements that have been left unchanged) remain the same. Therefore, film translation as such has to embrace the necessity for the loss and/or change of the "spirit" of the original.”

While it may be argued that Ascheid definition of dubbing is mainly used for fiction, such as films and TV series, looking at further definitions will help to understand the need for a clear distinction between dubbing and voice-over. A more recent definition of dubbing from the realm of Translation Studies is offered by Luyken *et al* 1991: 31 (cited in Baker, 1998:74-5):

Oral language transfer in the audiovisual context falls under two main headings: dubbing and revoicing. Dubbing involves ‘the replacement of the original speech by a voice-track which attempts to follow as closely as possible the timing, phrasing and lip movements of the original dialogue’ (Luyken *et al* 1991: 31), i.e. it involves lip synchronization. The term ‘dubbing’ is also sometimes used to refer to revoicing in

the same language, for example where the original scene is shot against a noisy background and post-synchronization becomes necessary to record the original dialogue. Revoicing may take the form of a voice-over, narration or free commentary, none of which attempts to adhere to the constraints of lip synchronization. While the various methods of revoicing may be pre-recorded or transmitted live, dubbing is always pre-recorded. 'Revoicing' is sometimes used as a generic term to refer to all methods of oral language transfer, including lip-sync dubbing.

Discussing dubbing and subtitling in the context of films, Ascheid (1977:39) argues that both subtitling and dubbing produce a radically altered film experience for their target audiences and that dubbing succeeds in effacing the foreign origin of the film's text. "[T]he dubbed film appears as a radically new product rather than a transformed old one, a single text rather than a double one" (ibid: 40). "This new voice speaking a new text, in conjunction with the visual imagery, the accompanying sound effects, and the music track, thus constitutes a new fantastic universe in which the narrative unfolds" (ibid: 36).

While this may have its positive effects on the audience's experience, however debatable this view may be, it is for this very point that dubbing (which usually employs voice acting) in news broadcasts producing a definite adverse effect. Reporting the news through different tongues does necessitate, for authenticity and validity of the reported news, the retention of the original "universe", to borrow Ascheid's term.

While voice-over is a form of revoicing, it is not a complete transplantation of the original voice track or the enactment of the paralinguistic features of the original voice. Using the categories of delivery defined in Darwish (2006:81), dubbing that utilizes voice acting falls into the category of rhetorical mode of delivery which “attempts to re- enact the speaker’s utterances with full verbal (and sometimes nonverbal) paralinguistic features including auditive information such as intonation, emphasis, volume, pitch, speech patterns, interjections, fillers, false starts, tone of voice, vocalizations, and other rhetorical and illocutionary theatrics”, while Audiovisual translation (AVT) voice-over falls into the category of expository mode of delivery which “carries the informative and communicative intentions of the speaker’s utterances without the verbal paralinguistic features such as quality of voice, pitch, speed, interjections, fillers, and vocalizations, etc. This mode of delivery takes into account the communication medium used to deliver the message and the visual and auditory presence of the speaker” (ibid:80).

## **6. Voice-over specific writing/translation**

In commercials and entertainment productions, effective voice-over begins with a well-crafted script (Drew 2005), depending on the purpose of production. Translation voice-overs (AVT) of news broadcasts, however, have different technical and illocutionary requirements, where fidelity of the original message is theoretically of paramount importance and where technical restrictions force news broadcasters to sacrifice accuracy and precision. In fact, some of the presumably translation-induced errors are essentially infidelities largely caused by technical modulations, where the script translation is crafted to suit audiovisual production requirements. As we discuss later in this paper, these modulations are also governed by editorial policy.

## **7. Voice-over of news items**

One of the most common uses of the translation modality of voice-over is its use for short interventions in news items. This had already been observed by Kilborn (1993:648) “[voiceover] is particularly well suited as a method for the rendering of speeches by foreign politicians”, so much so that “many in the audience would now deem it wholly inappropriate if any other mode were used”.

This is the case for some broadcasters, but it’s not a universal practice. Within the same country, and sometimes within a broadcaster, both subtitling and voiceover can be used in news items. This is the case for Spain where Canal + and TVC will only use subtitling, while Telecinco, TV1 or Antena 3 will use voice-over. The former channels are considered quality channels while the later are popular.

The BBC widely uses voice-over. In the URL [bbc.co.uk](http://bbc.co.uk) there is an important archive of videos many with voice-over translations. It is in this archive where can be found the latest Bin Laden news item which was broadcast in 23 April 2006, 20:12 GMT 21:12 UK with the heading:

“The BBC’s security correspondent Gordon Corera assesses what motivated the latest audio tape attributed to Osama Bin Laden, and looks for other clues in the message.”

## **8. Looking at Bin Laden’s voice-over**

The journalist Gordon Corera delivered the news item, and showed the Aljazeera’s video-clip.



VOICE OF TRANSLATOR

In second 17 the following insert appeared: “VOICE OF TRANSLATOR”. The reporter was the BBC’s Security Correspondent Gordon Corera, but on this occasion it was a voice of a foreign man which delivered the translation with a voice-over, since we could still hear a voice of a male –allegedly Bin Laden - speaking in Arabic in the background.

This news item is representative of voice-over in the sense of its delivery following the definition we have given in section 1. We can hear what we believe is Bin Laden’s voice in the background and a few seconds later a translation is offered as described by Luyken et al. (1991:80) who found that thanks to being able to hear the two languages it “contributes to the sense of authenticity in the translation and prevents a degree of mistrust from developing”. We also have to believe that the voice we hear is that of the translator.

### **8.1. The content of the message**

Although the videotape has never been technically analyzed, the content of the speech chosen to be voiced over does not match the script read out by either the voice-talent or produced by the translator, assuming they are two different people.

While first Arabic few words of the excerpted segment (below) are audible, in order to provide further trust and a feeling of faithfulness or quality (Orero 2006a: 219), the English voiceover does not match. The rest of the voiceover script is a condensed text of two segments of the original, which are barely audible under the voice-over. The voiceover script, which has been reduced and edited by the journalist, lasts the duration it takes to read it out. Usually in news items there are no seconds left at the end, so it is almost impossible to check if the speaker finished the discourse at the same time as the voice-over.

### Original Arabic text (segment 1). *The shaded text was not broadcast.*

ومما يظهر ذلك أيضا رفضهم لحركة حماس بعد أن فازت في الانتخابات مع تأكيدنا على ما نبه عليه الشيخ أيمن الظواهري من حرمة الخول في المجالس الشركية إلا أن رفضهم لحملس أكد أنها حرب صليبية صهيونية ضد المسلمين..

إن الحرب مسئولية تضمنية بين الشعوب والحكومات ، والحرب مستمرة والشعوب تجدد الولاء لحكمها وسلسلتها وترسل أبناءها إلى الجيش لقتالنا ، وتوصل الدعم المالى والمعنوى وبلادنا تحرق وبيوتنا تقصف وشعوبنا تقتل ولا يبالي بنا أحد ، ويكفيكم مثلا على الانتهاكات الصارخة على ملتنا وعلى إخواننا وبلادنا ما قامت به حليفتكم إسرائيل من اقتحام ومدم لسجن أريحا بتواطؤ مع أمريكا وبريطانيا

### Translation

What shows this also [fade out] is their rejection of the Hamas Movement after it has won the elections—with our assertion of Shaykh Ayman az-Zawahiri caution about the prohibition of entering into the infidel council. But their refusal of Hamas has confirmed it is a Crusade-Zionist war against Muslims.






[fade in, under voiceover, hardly audible] The war is a joint responsibility between peoples and governments. The war continues and the peoples renew their allegiances to their rulers and politicians [fade out] and send their children to the armies to fight us and continue to [their] financial and moral support, while our countries are being burned down, our homes bombed, and our peoples killed, and no one cares about us.

### BBC's English Voiceover

It is an ongoing war against Muslims. The enemy continues to murder our children, our women, the elderly, and destroy our homes.

Interestingly, there is no explicit mention of “the enemy”, “our children”, “our women” and “the elderly” in the original message. This is obviously a kind of infelicity that causes the original message to be distorted.



**Table 1 —The Bin Laden Tape Analysis Script Run sheet**

Time in seconds/minutes	Script	Storyboard
0-2	[News opening theme music from Aljazeera television accompanies video excerpt from Aljazeera news interval signpost, fading out into Aljazeera’s news studio showing a long camera shot of news presenter al-Habib al-Ghuraibi]	 
3-6	[Voiceover of BBC analyst Gordon Corera, off camera, while Aljazeera’s news presenter’s voice is still audible in the background fading out soon after]  Surfacing on Aljazeera today the voice of Osama Bin Laden.	
7-11	[Voiceover of BBC analyst Gordon Corera, off camera]  The tape is the first we’ve heard of Al-Qaeda leader for three months.	
12-15	[Voice of Osama Bin Laden in Arabic and still picture of him displayed grabbed from Aljazeera]  وما يظهر أيضا [literally, “and of what also shows”...]	
15-17	[a slightly accented voice of a voice talent/translator employing an expository mode of delivery and speaking in English]  It is an ongoing war against Muslim.  [at the seventeenth second, the insert “Voice of Translator” is displayed for a moment and then dimmed out]	
18-21	[voice talent] The enemy	



Time in seconds/minutes	Script	Storyboard
	continues to murder our children.	
22-25	[voice talent] Our women, the elderly, and destroy our home.	
26-35	[BBC analyst's voice off camera] Bin Laden hadn't been seen in person since this video more than a year and a half ago, and today's tape is designed to show that he is still relevant.	
36-39	[BBC analyst's voice, on camera, with a large still shot of Bin Laden zooming out in the background]  In this latest message, Bin Laden raises three specific issues.	
40-47	[Background display changes to a shot of a Palestinian crowd, with the insert " Hamas" appearing on the video clip]  He says the cutting of funds to the new Hamas government in the Palestinian territory is proof of the West's crusade against Islam.	
48-55	[Background display changes to a video clip of a protesting "Muslim" crowd]  He calls for the trial and punishment of those responsible for the cartoon of the prophet Mahamed, and the boycott of western products.	
56-01:00	[Background display changes to a video clip of a Sudanese crowd and the insert "Darfour" appears on the video clip]  And he calls for opposition to any intervention in the Darfour region of Sudan	

Time in seconds/minutes	Script	Storyboard
01:00-01:04	where there has been talk of sending troops to deal with a humanitarian crisis.	
01:05-01:10	Set in together, this is all designed to maintain his profile and show he is still around.	
01:11-01:17	<p>[off stage scene. Arab analyst/ commentator (Abdel Bari Atwan, editor of the London-based Al-Quds Al-Arabi Newspaper) speaking in English]</p> <p>Osama Bin Laden wants to prove to everybody who wrote him off that they were wrong.</p>	
0:18-01:24	He is still alive. He is still kicking, and he is still trying to manipulate the situation in the Middle East to his own sake.	
01:25-01:30	<p>[BBC analyst, off camera. Exterior scene aerial shot of a mountainous area]</p> <p>Bin Laden is believed to be hiding in this mountainous region bordering Pakistan and Afghanistan.</p>	
01:31-01:37	<p>[BBC analyst, off camera. Exterior. Another shot of mountain side, zooming in on mountain caves]</p> <p>The fact that he is releasing an audio tape rather than a videotape is most likely a sign that he remains worried about being caught.</p>	

Time in seconds/minutes	Script	Storyboard
01:38-01:46	<p>[BBC analyst, off camera, a ground shot of Pakistani troops combing the area]</p> <p>But for western intelligence agencies, they say they don't discount the ability of al-Qaeda's leadership to plan and carry out fresh attacks.</p>	
01:47-01:48	<p>[BBC analyst, off camera, signs off]</p> <p>Gordon Corera, BBC News.</p>	

## 9. The Visible translator

The invisibility of the translator/interpreter has been questioned recently. Angelelli (2004:7) challenges the invisibility model of interpreters, specifically in the medical setting. “Language interpreters are often portrayed as *invisible* [emphasis in original] language facilitators. According to this perception, interpreters are not considered to be part of the conversation, but rather they are seen as language-switching operators in line with the conduit model of communication...”. Commenting on the conduit model of interpreting, Darwish (2003:37) also contends: “the common belief is that the interpreter is just a conduit for the transfer of information from one party to another without the slightest alteration, modulation or intervention. There is nothing wrong with this view except that it looks at the interpreting situation in absolute terms and does not take into account the various communication situations that call for legitimate intervention on the part of the interpreter to fulfill the meaning and complete the communication act where intersubjectivity does not exist between the two parties”. On this note, Angelelli (2004:11) concurs that visibility and participation

are not just present in the linguistic construction of the conversation, but they are also essential elements in communicating cultural gaps as well as removing linguistic barriers, among a list of other things she presents.

However, the kind of visibility we are talking about here has to do with the physical presence of the voiceover talent or translator— that is, he or she is visible to the viewers, and the acknowledgement of the voiceover translator in the credits. It also has to do with the translator's accent, as explored in the foregoing section. An affected accent or rhetorical voice acting also contributes to the visibility or invisibility of the voiceover translator.

While translators across modalities and countries are usually invisible, in this Bin Laden excerpt the translator is not only acknowledged but also cued. The issue of visibility (Venuti 1995) or transparency (Allouba 1992) becomes problematic. Seventeen seconds into the video tape, a title or tag is inserted which reads "VOICE OF TRANSLATOR". This kind of inserted announcement has not been used with actualities of other political personalities or footage examined in the archives of the BBC news online videos. To draw the attention to the translator causes immediate dissonance since it immediately reminds the viewers that the voice they are hearing is not that of the person delivering the message. The momentary illusion of authenticity that is required to deliver the message through voiceover mediation is dispelled immediately by pointing to the voice of the translator.

A possible answer is that given the many *fatwas* issued in recent years, which in fact is part of the news item, to writers or journalists, the profession has probably decided

to play it safe and when the news item is deemed “sensitive”, they want to detach themselves from the content and hence the translator (who in fact is only doing his job, as the journalist) bears the responsibility for the translation and uttering Bin Laden’s words. By shifting the responsibility from the journalist to the translator the news broadcaster is also shirking their responsibility for the translator who should be afforded the same status as the journalist. While this point takes the discussion outside the scope of the present paper, it is important to note for future research into the professional status of translators working under such conditions.

#### **10. Concluding remarks: rhetoric dissonance of unsynchronized voices**

The preceding exploration has demonstrated a serious problem with voice-over modalities employed for news mediation. The lack of synchronicity of voice-overs stems from the rhetorical features of the voice-over styles of delivery and the idiosyncrasies of the voices. The dissonance created by the lack of synchronicity renders the original message with a degree of infelicities.

As a form of language transfer or translation, voice-over is used for mediating news reports where personalities speaking another language are revoiced in the language of the viewers. The foregoing discussion of AVT has highlighted a few serious problems with the approaches taken to the voice-over of news actualities by broadcasters. It has also underscored the importance of the invisibility of the translator in terms of the idiosyncrasies of the style of delivery and in terms of announcing to the viewers that it the translator and not someone else who is relating the message to them. The distinction between the different modes of delivery is also of critical importance to the integrity of the original message.

(1) This research has been partly funded by the EU project HBB4ALL (FP7 CIP-ICT-PSP.2013.5.1 # 621014 ), the Spanish Ministry FFI2012-39056-C02-01 ("Subtitling for the deaf and hard of hearing and audio description: new formats") and the Catalan Government 2014SGR27.

## REFERENCES

- Abusalem, Ali. 2006. "Standard of Reporting Translated Scripts in News Media". *Translation Watch Quarterly* (2) 1: 25-35.
- Ali, Kadhim. 2006. "Is Translation Halal? Are Translators Traitors? A study of the Narratives of Iraqi Interpreters and Translators." *Translation Watch Quarterly* (2) 1: 37-51.
- Andújar, Gemma. 2006. "La traducción francés-español des titres journalistiques du 'Monde Diplomatique': un exemple de tension entre adéquation et acceptabilité". *Translation Journal* 10 (3).  
<http://accurapid.com/Journal/37titres.htm> [accessed 9/7/2019]
- Andújar, Gemma. 2009. ""Traducir la argumentación en editoriales de prensa: de las estrategias argumentativas a las técnicas traductoras". *Hermeneus* 11: 51-80.
- Allouba, E. 1992. "Translator investigator: a discussion of the problems of translating voiceovers" *Professional Translator & Interpreter* 1, 9-10.
- Ascheid, Antje. 1977. "Speaking Tongues: Voice Dubbing in the Cinema as Cultural Ventriloquism". *Velvet Light Trap* 40, 40.
- Baker, Mona (ed.). 2001 [1998]. *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies*. London & New York: Routledge. xix + 654 pp.
- Bassnett, Susan & Esperança Bielsa. 2008. *Translation in Global News*. London: Routledge. 168 pp.
- Bielsa, Esperança. 2007. "Translation in global news agencies". *Target* 19 (1):135-155.
- Díaz-Cintas, Jorge & Pilar Orero. 2006. "Voice-over". In Keith Brown (Ed.) *Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics*, 2nd Ed. Elsevier: Oxford; 477.
- Darwish, Ali (2003). *Dalil at-turjuman* (The Interpreter's Guide). Writescop: Melbourne (In Arabic). 260 pp.
- Darwish, Ali. 2005. *Language, Translation and Identity in the Age of the Internet, Satellite Television and Directed Media*. Melbourne: Writescop. 444 pp.
- Darwish, Ali. 2006. "Attributing Terror: Evidence on Authorship: Forensic Translation Analysis of Culturally Divergent Clandestine Coded Messages." *Translation Watch Quarterly* 2, no. 4 (2006): 41-66.
- Darwish, Ali. 2008. "Linguistic and Epistemic Inference in Cross-Cultural Communication in Satellite Television News Media." *Translation Watch Quarterly* 4, no. 1 (2008).
- Darwish, Ali. 2006. "Standards of Simultaneous Interpreting in Live Satellite Broadcasts-Arabic Case Study." *Translation Watch Quarterly* 2, no. 2 (2006): 55-88.
- Darwish, Ali. 2006. "Translating the News: Reframing Constructed Realities." *Translation Watch Quarterly* 2, 1: 52-77.
- Darwish, Ali. 2010. *Translation and News Making in Contemporary Arabic Television*. Melbourne: Writescop Publishers. 350 pp.

- Fawcett, P. 1983. "Translations Modes and Constraints". *The Incorporated Linguist* 22, 4: 186-190
- Franco, Eliana. 2001a. "Inevitable Exoticism: The Translation of Culture-Specific Items in Documentaries". In Frederic Chaume and Rosa Agost (eds) *La traducción en los medios audiovisuales*. Castelló de la Plana: Publicacions de la Universitat Jaume I, 177-181.
- Franco, Eliana. 2001b. "Voiced-over television documentaries. Terminological and conceptual issues for their research". *Target* 13 (2), 289-304.
- Franco, Eliana, Anna Matamala and Pilar Orero. 2010. *Voice-over translation: An overview*. Bern: Peter Lang. 248 pp.
- Kaufman, Francine. 2004. "Un exemple d'effet pervers de l'uniformisation linguistique dans la traduction d'un documentaire: de l'hébreu des immigrants de "Saint'Jean" au français normatif d'ARTE". In Yves Gambier (ed.) *Meta* 49(1), 148-160.
- Kilborn, R. 1993. "Speak my language': current attitudes to television subtitling and dubbing'. *Media, Culture and Society* 15, 641-660.
- Luyken, G-M. et al. 1991. *Overcoming language barriers in television: dubbing and subtitling for the European audience*. Manchester: European Institute for the Media. 222 pp.
- Matamala, Anna. 2009a. "Translating documentaries: from Neanderthals to the Supernanny". *Perspectives. Studies in Translatology*, 17(2), 93-107.
- Matamala, Anna. 2009b. "Main challenges in the translation of documentaries". In Díaz-Cintas, J. (ed.) *In So Many Words: Translating for the Screen*. London: Multilingual Matters, 109-120.
- Orero, Pilar. 2004. "The Pretended Easiness of Voice-over Translation of TV". *The Journal of Specialised Translation* 2: 76-96. <http://www.jostrans.org/issue02/issue02toc.htm>
- Orero, Pilar. 2006a. "Voice-over: the Ugly Duckling of Audiovisual Translation". Plenary conference delivered in MUTRA International Conference. Copenhagen, 2-5 May 2006.
- Orero, Pilar. 2006b. "Voice-over a Case of Hyper-reality". Selected papers from MUTRA International Conference. Copenhagen, 2-5 May 2006. [http://www.euroconferences.info/proceedings/2006\\_Proceedings/2006\\_Orero\\_Pilar.pdf](http://www.euroconferences.info/proceedings/2006_Proceedings/2006_Orero_Pilar.pdf)
- Venuti, Lawrence. 1995. *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation*. London & New York: Routledge. 353 pp.
- Zinik, Zinovy. 2006. "Freelance". *Times Literary Supplement* 5360: 14.