

Central Vietnam climate over the past five centuries from cypress tree rings

Brendan M. Buckley ¹, Daniel K. Stahle ¹, Hong Truong Luu ², S.-Y. Simon Wang ³, Tran Quoc Trung Nguyen ², Philip Thomas ⁴, Canh Nam Le ⁵, That Minh Ton ⁶, The Hoang Bui ⁶, and Van Thiet Nguyen ⁷

¹ *Tree Ring Laboratory, Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory of Columbia University, Palisades, NY, 10964 USA*

² *Southern Institute of Ecology, Vietnam Academy of Science and Technology, HCMC, Vietnam*

³ *Utah Climate Center, Utah State University, Logan, UT, 84322 USA*

⁴ *International Conifer Conservation Programme of the Royal Botanic Garden, Edinburgh, Scotland, UK.*

⁵ *Forest Science Institute of Central Highlands and South of Central Vietnam, Dalat City, Lam Dong Province, Vietnam*

⁶ *International Center for Tropical Highlands Ecosystems Research, Bidoup - Nui Ba National Park, Lam Dong Province, Vietnam*

⁷ *Forest Science Institute of South Vietnam, HCMC, Vietnam*

1 **Abstract**

2 We present the first crossdated tree ring record from central Vietnam, derived from the growth
3 rings of the rare cypress *Fokienia hodginsii* from the mountains of Quang Nam Province near the
4 Laos border. The Quang Nam *Fokienia hodginsii* time series (QNFH), based on the crossdated
5 sequences of 71 increment core samples from 37 mature trees, is the third published
6 dendrochronological record from this species. The record extends 667 years from AD 1347 to
7 2013 and exhibits a mean series intercorrelation of 0.526, similarly significant with the first two
8 published *Fokienia hodginsii* records: 0.474 for Mu Cang Chai (MCFH) and 0.578 for Bidoup -
9 Nui Ba National Park (BDFH) in the north and south of Vietnam, respectively. The Expressed
10 Population Signal (EPS) for the QNFH record exceeds the generally accepted threshold of 0.85
11 back to AD 1567, but remains above 0.8 back to 1550. Similar to the MCFH and BDFH records,
12 QNFH expresses statistically significant linkages to regional hydroclimate metrics and the El
13 Niño-Southern Oscillation (ENSO). Here we present a reconstruction of the Standardized
14 Precipitation Evapotranspiration Index (SPEI) for the month of April, averaged over a large
15 region of Southeast Asia. As with prior studies we demonstrate that cool phase (La Niña) and
16 warm phase (El Niño) events are linked to regional wet and dry conditions, respectively, with
17 linkages to modulation of the surface water temperature over the adjacent sea to the east of
18 Vietnam as well as the Indian Ocean. A late 18th century megadrought that is expressed widely
19 across South and Southeast Asia, and notably from the MCFH and BDFH records described
20 above, is not as pronounced in Central Vietnam and we explore the reasons why.

21

22 **Keywords:** Vietnam, dendrochronology, cypress, monsoon, tropical forest, ENSO.

23

24 **1 Introduction**

25 **1.1 Prior dendroclimatic research in Vietnam**

26 Paleo-ecological/climatological studies from the terrestrial tropics are of increasing importance,
27 and are therefore increasingly pursued. In the case of tropical dendrochronology the previously
28 held view that tropical trees cannot be relied upon has been replaced by an understanding that,
29 with effort, some species can be successfully crossdated and used (e.g., Baker et al., 2005;
30 Buckley et al., 1995; 2005; 2007a; 2007b; 2010; 2014; D'Arrigo et al., 1997; 2011;
31 Pumijumnong et al., 1995; 2006; 2011; Sano et al., 2009; 2012; Stahle et al., 2011; 2012;
32 Therrell et al., 2006; Zuidema et al., 2013). The most robust Southeast Asian records have been
33 developed from *Fokienia hodginsii* of the family Cupressaceae. Sano et al. (2009) published the
34 first dendrochronological record of this species from Mu Cang Chai in the north of Vietnam
35 (MCFH), followed by Buckley et al. (2010) from the southern limits of the species range at
36 Bidoup - Nui Ba National Park (BDFH). Here we present the third tree-ring record from this
37 species (QNFH) from Quang Nam Province in central Vietnam (locations shown in **Figure 1**).

38

39 The Sano et al. (2009) and Buckley et al. (2010) papers are noteworthy, for they heralded the
40 first successful attempts at passing the rigorous calibration-verification schemes used in
41 dendroclimatology (Cook and Kairiukstis, 1990) for tropical tree growth indices against
42 instrumented climate variables. It should be noted that *Fokienia hodginsii* is the only species
43 from tropical Asia that has been used successfully for climate reconstruction where it has been
44 possible to pass calibration-verification procedures. In both cases noted above, the metric used
45 was the Palmer Drought Severity Index (PDSI, see Palmer et al., 1965), and in both studies it
46 was also shown that sea surface temperature (SST) in the classical “Niño” regions of the central

47 equatorial Pacific were significantly, negatively correlated with the regional hydroclimatology
48 (**Figure 2**) for the beginning or “shoulder” season of the summer monsoon that extends from
49 March to May. In broadly general terms, warm-phase events (El Niño) correspond to regional
50 drought in the early monsoon season as reflected by a reduction in annual radial growth of
51 *Fokienia hodginsii*, while cool-phase events (La Niña) are associated with increased early
52 monsoon moisture and enhanced annual growth. While the Asian Summer Monsoon is the main
53 driver of rainfall for this region, ENSO’s influence as described above is clearly felt.

54

55 A recent paper by Räsänen et al. (2015) demonstrates that the influence of ENSO events across
56 Southeast Asia exhibits a great deal of spatial variability. This is particularly germane to central
57 Vietnam and the region surrounding the current study site (QNFH), where a large percentage of
58 the annual rainfall comes during the months that transition into the winter dry season (October to
59 December), rather than during the peak of the summer monsoon – a rainfall regime that is unique
60 to this mountainous region (Li et al., 2015; Wang et al., 2015). The pattern of terrestrial rainfall
61 in response to ENSO events for the pre-monsoon season (March – May) is, however, very robust
62 and is evident with the instrumental records as well as with the *Fokienia hodginsii* growth
63 indices as shown in **Figure 2**. Buckley et al. (2010) demonstrated that the two most severe low-
64 growth years in the BDFH record corresponded to the two most notorious El Niño events of the
65 instrumental record – the late 19th century Victorian Holocaust Droughts in 1877-78 and 1888-
66 89, respectively (Davis, 2002). The BDFH record also exhibits a very strong relationship to the
67 Southern Oscillation Index and other measures of ENSO (Buckley et al., 2010). In fact, the
68 ENSO signal in BDFH is robust enough to reconstruct SST over the Niño 3.4 region and pass all
69 calibration-verification statistics, and is similarly responsive to the Interdecadal Pacific

70 Oscillation (Buckley et al., 2010). Sano et al. (2009) found a similar response to ENSO
71 variability for MCFH, though not as robustly expressed as for BDFH. These correlations with
72 ENSO for the tree ring records are consistent with the same relationships for the instrumental
73 records from both regions (Buckley et al., 2010; Sano et al., 2009).

74

75 Another interesting feature noted for the BDFH record was the correspondence of the largest
76 growth index years with years of high rainfall and a linkage to explosive volcanism, as noted by
77 Buckley et al. (2010). Anchukaitis et al. (2010) demonstrated this linkage in greater detail, and
78 they compared these findings with previous model results that did not identify a post-eruption
79 spike in regional rainfall. Xu et al. (2011) have analysed the stable isotopes of Oxygen in the
80 rings of *Fokienia hodginsii* from northern Vietnam and Laos, respectively, and demonstrate
81 further the connection between ENSO events and the hydroclimate over Indochina. Until the
82 current study, however, no crossdated tree growth records have been developed for the central
83 region of Vietnam, a region with a notably different hydroclimate regime that receives a large
84 percentage of its annual rainfall from the months of October to December as demonstrated in
85 **Figure 3**. This peak in rainfall occurs during the transition into the winter monsoon season,
86 which is the dry season across the majority of mainland Southeast Asia including the locations of
87 the MCFH and BDFH sites. The QNFH record that we present here serves to link the northern
88 and southern *Fokienia hodginsii* sites for better regional representation and a first glimpse at the
89 recent paleoclimate history for central Vietnam, a region that has a fundamentally different
90 rainfall regime than regions to the north and south.

91

92 **1.2 The climate over central Vietnam**

93 The autumnal precipitation regime over central Vietnam is associated with an increase in the
94 occurrence of tropical cyclones (TCs) that pose a significant threat to lives and property, making
95 the region particularly vulnerable to the effects of climate change (McElwee, 2012). Li et al.
96 (2015) identified and analyzed a pronounced decadal oscillation of autumn precipitation in
97 central Vietnam within the 8–11 year frequency band that is modulated by the East Pacific–
98 North Pacific (EP–NP) teleconnection, an ENSO-like variability at lower frequency. The
99 negative phase of the EP–NP pattern is associated with a positive SST anomaly in the semi-
100 closed sea east of Vietnam (commonly referred to as the South China Sea, but in Vietnam it is
101 referred to as the East Sea) that induces low-level convergence, enhances convection, and
102 increases precipitation over Central Vietnam and adjacent Hainan Island (China) and the
103 Philippines. This circulation feature is embedded in the large-scale circulation associated with
104 SST anomalies across the Pacific Ocean, where cooling in the Eastern and Central tropical
105 Pacific is sandwiched between warm anomalies in the North and South Pacific and a warm
106 Western Pacific Ocean. The positive phase of the EP–NP features opposite SST and circulation
107 anomalies and reduced rainfall over central Vietnam (Li et al., 2015). Warming SST and
108 enhanced southerly low-level winds coincide with increased rainfall and TCs, and are part of a
109 hemispheric-scale change in the general circulation in the form of a La Niña-like SST anomaly
110 and a strengthened Walker circulation branch that ascends near Vietnam and the far-western
111 Pacific (Wang et al., 2015).

112

113 **2 Materials and methods**

114 **2.1 The study location**

115 We sampled living *Fokienia hodginsii* trees from Tay Giang Protection Forest in central
116 Vietnam's Quang Nam Province, a location that was until recently only suspected of containing
117 *Fokienia hodginsii*. Our study confirms the existence of old growth *Fokienia hodginsii* on
118 variable terrain between 1,200 and 1,500 meters above mean sea level, amongst what appears as
119 a virtually undisturbed mixed evergreen broadleaved-coniferous forest growing over a humus
120 layer up to 1 m thick. We observed very few signs of human disturbance (e.g., stumps, clearings,
121 etc.), and the fact that such a large and old-aged population of *Fokienia hodginsii* remains in this
122 forest is itself evidence for lack of disturbance, since these trees are highly prized and logged
123 over its entire distribution range. Furthermore, the local Co Tu minority group protects this forest
124 as a local "spirit forest", due to *Fokienia's* history as the wood most sought after for use as
125 coffins by their ancestors. Of the five conifer species found at this site *Fokienia hodginsii*,
126 *Dacrycarpus imbricatus*, *Dacrydium elatum* and *Nageia wallichiana* are canopy emergent, while
127 *Podocarpus neriifolius* comprises a less dominant role in the understory. With the exception of
128 *Fokienia hodginsii*, all of these conifer species are members of the predominantly Southern
129 Hemisphere conifer family Podocarpaceae. We also identified multiple broadleaf species at this
130 site, notably from the canopy dominant families of Magnoliaceae, Fagaceae, Lauraceae and
131 Theaceae (see **Table 1** for a full listing of angiosperms we identified at the study site).

132

133 **2.2 Vietnamese cypress increment cores**

134 During January 2014 we obtained 112 core samples from 45 mature *Fokienia hodginsii* stems
135 from the Tay Giang Protection Forest (see **Figure 1**). We used Haglof increment borers to
136 extract 5mm diameter dowels of wood that extend from the bark to as near the center of each tree
137 as possible, and from at least two sides of each stem. Every cored tree was georeferenced with

138 GPS, and all core samples were placed into labeled plastic straw tubes for transport from the
139 forest to the laboratory. Once in the laboratory, all samples were air-dried and then glued into
140 wooden core mounts with their transverse surface exposed. Each core was then surfaced using
141 progressively finer sandpaper and micromesh abrasives in order to reveal the cellular structure of
142 the growth rings, essential for identification of true ring boundaries and occurrences of “false”
143 rings and other anatomical features (Fritts, 1976).

144

145 **2.3 Crossdating, measuring and quality control**

146 The surfaced cores were analyzed under microscopy at low magnification (7x – 40x) and were
147 crossdated visually with the aid of the skeleton plotting method (Stokes and Smiley, 1968; Fritts,
148 1976). This proved to be a crucial step for all ensuing analyses due to the complex ring anatomy
149 and growth irregularities (**Figure 4**) that made crossdating difficult in these cores. The absolute
150 dating of growth rings in trees is arguably the most important step in dendrochronology, since
151 without ensuring correct dates for every single ring in sequence, cumulative error is built into the
152 final time series as demonstrated by Fritts and Swetnam (1989) and more recently by Black et al.
153 (2016). In the case of sites where locally absent rings and “false” rings are minimal the error
154 might be marginally consequential to ensuing climate analyses. However, in the case of tropical
155 trees and the *Fokienia hodginsii* from QNFH in particular, a plethora of such problem rings
156 would result in significant error. For example, within our final subset of retained cores 61 of the
157 22,662 rings analyzed were locally absent (0.27%), and there are numerous examples of false
158 rings that challenged our abilities to accurately identify them (examples shown in **Figure 4**).
159 Consequently, there were several cores that we were not able to confidently crossdate and these
160 were excluded from further analyses.

161

162 Following the rigorous crossdating procedure described above, 71 cores from 37 trees were
163 included in our final ring width index (see **Table 2**). We compared our QNFH master index to
164 the BDFH record (Buckley et al., 2010), which is from a location several hundred kilometers to
165 the south (see **Figure 1**). The two site collections do share some key narrow “marker” growth
166 years (i.e., 2005, 1978, 1889, 1804, 1692, and 1565), as well as many key wide growth years
167 (i.e., 1976, 1875, 1835, 1767, and 1645), and similar comparisons were made with the MCFH
168 site from northern Vietnam. While similarities of key years can be seen between all three sites,
169 several marker years are unique to each site, and significant differences in the low frequency
170 components of these records are clearly expressed. As discussed later in this paper, these
171 expressed differences in tree growth are consistent with the variability of regional climate from
172 the different climate regions of Indochina.

173

174 **2.4 Indexing radial growth through time**

175 Tree ring standardization aims to remove what is commonly referred to as the “biological growth
176 trend”, but is actually the result of stem geometry (i.e., adding the same volume of wood
177 annually to a circumference that increases with each annual increment results in an hypothetical
178 negative exponential decay of the width of rings through time). A second aim is to stabilize the
179 time series variance from juvenile to maturity phases, an issue that is related to the biological
180 growth trend (Fritts, 1976; Cook and Kairiukstis, 1990). For the current study we employed the
181 relatively new method of “signal-free” standardization (SFS), first developed by Melvin and
182 Briffa (2008) and expanded upon by Briffa and Melvin (2011). We utilized program RCSigFree
183 (<http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/tree-ring-laboratory/resources/software>), a program developed at

184 the Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory's Tree Ring Lab. The SFS concept is derived from the
185 observation that sequential tree ring measurements are influenced by a wide array of potential
186 time-dependent growth influences that include the temporal variability of climate, internal,
187 biologically-driven processes and stem geometry. SFS attempts to reduce this allocation bias in
188 order to retain the variability of sequential growth that is the sole product of the variability in
189 climate (Briffa et al., 2011). SFS therefore uses division of the common signal into the original
190 measurement data in order to reduce or remove any possible trend distortion in the expressed
191 external forcing signal. This approach requires adjusting the overall trend of the resulting growth
192 indices due to introduction of an arbitrary slope, and as such limits the preservation of variance
193 that exceeds the length of the final timeseries (Melvin and Briffa, 2008). The biweight robust
194 mean was used to calculate the mean-value function for each year's growth index in order to
195 reduce the influence of outliers, and the expressed population signal (EPS) and running RBAR
196 measures of chronology signal strength were calculated using the methods of Wigley et al.
197 (1984). An excellent description of the SFS procedure can be found in Cook et al. (2015) as it
198 was used for the development of the Old World Drought Atlas over Europe. We include the
199 output files and selected graphics of our implementation of this method in the **Supplemental**
200 **Online Materials**.

201

202 **2.5 Climate data**

203 We compared the QNFH indices with a variety of climatic data, focusing initially on the same
204 parameters shown by Sano et al. (2009) and Buckley et al. (2010) to be most strongly correlated
205 with the annual growth of *Fokienia hodginsii* (i.e., the Palmer Drought Severity Index or PDSI
206 from Dai et al., 2004; and global SST fields from the Hadley Center in the UK). We also utilized

207 the Standardized Precipitation Evapotranspiration Index (SPEI) obtained from the Global SPEI
208 database (<http://sac.csic.es/spei/database.html>; Trouet and Van Oldenborgh, 2013). The SPEI
209 data are derived from the Climate Research Unit (University of East Anglia, U.K.) dataset of
210 monthly precipitation and evapotranspiration (CRU TS), which has a spatial resolution of 0.5
211 degree. Vicente-Serrano et al. (2010) first presented SPEI as an improvement over PDSI as a
212 drought metric in the tropics for studying the effects of global warming on drought severity. As
213 with PDSI, SPEI considers the effect of evapotranspiration on the severity of drought, however
214 SPEI is better suited to a broader set of ecosystems due to its multi-scalar nature, its sensitivity to
215 evapotranspiration demand and its simplicity of calculation (Begueria et al., 2014; Vicente-
216 Serrano et al., 2010; 2013). We therefore elected to pursue SPEI averaged over a 1-month
217 window as our target for reconstruction for this region, rather than PDSI. For analysis, we used
218 the web-based KNMI Climate Explorer (<http://climexp.knmi.nl/>) for doing basic statistical
219 correlation and regression analyses, as well as statistical packages developed at the Tree Ring
220 Lab of the Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory such as Principal Components Regression
221 analyses for reconstruction of climate from tree rings.

222

223 **3 Results and discussion**

224 **3.1 Indexed growth at Quang Nam**

225 The stabilized SFS-derived indices of *Fokienia hodginsii* growth at Quang Nam in central
226 Vietnam are presented in **Figure 5**. The fidelity of the common signal at this site is exemplified
227 by an overall series intercorrelation of 0.526, similar to values obtained for MCFH (0.474) and
228 BDFH (0.578), and an EPS value that exceeds the accepted threshold of 0.85 (Wigley et al.,
229 1984) from 1567 out to the present, and exceeds 0.80 from 1550 (see **Figure S4**). QNFH exhibits

230 several periods of above and below average growth over the past five centuries, including a
231 decadal scale low-growth departure at the beginning of the 20th century that is bracketed by two
232 periods of above average growth from about 1860-1890 and from 1920-1950, respectively.
233 Another high growth period is evident during the mid 17th century. The decadal-scale low growth
234 of the latter 18th century that is visible across all of Southeast Asia in prior studies (e.g., Buckley
235 et al., 2007b; 2010; 2014; Cook et al., 2010; D'Arrigo et al., 2011; Sano et al., 2009) appears to
236 be less evident for QNFH, and we contend that this may be the result of the influence of the
237 autumnal rainfall regime that is unique to central Vietnam (see **Figure 3**). We propose that this
238 source of moisture may serve to mitigate the effect of soil moisture deficit that is felt during the
239 subsequent annual dry season, relative to regions to the north and south. In addition, two of the
240 most negative marker years of at BDFH, 1877 and 1889, which reflect the influence of the
241 ENSO-driven late 19th century Victorian Holocaust Droughts (Davis, 2002), are not evident in
242 QNFH. This difference may reflect the modulating effects of local and Indian Ocean SST
243 anomalies as will be discussed in the later part of Section 3.2.

244

245 For each of the three *Fokienia hodginsii* records there are periods that are in and out of phase,
246 and it is evident from the 51-year running correlation analyses shown in **Figure 6** that systematic
247 offsets occur between all three regions. Notably, the latter half of the 18th century during the
248 worst of the Strange Parallels Drought (Cook et al., 2010) is a period of strong agreement
249 between the MCFH and BDFH sites, both of which are poorly correlated with QNFH at this
250 time. This suggests that the decadal scale effects of the Strange Parallels Drought were felt more
251 acutely in the northern and southern regions than they were at QNFH, with the central portion of
252 Vietnam showing far less persistent drought for the important “shoulder” monsoon season in

253 April. Räsänen et al. (2015, Fig. 2) suggests that the boundary of the wet/dry influence of warm
254 phase ENSO events for winter (DJF) as measured from the Multivariate ENSO Index (MEI) falls
255 very near to QNFH, just to the northeast along the Hai Van Pass – a well-known climatic
256 boundary in Central Vietnam at around 16° North latitude (e.g., Ho et al., 2011). According to Li
257 et al. (2015) and Wang et al. (2015), local SST in the Sea between Vietnam and the Philippines
258 and farther east over the Philippine Sea also modulate climate over Indochina, adding another
259 source of variability in addition to ENSO. It is plausible that changes in the mean position of this
260 boundary may influence the soil moisture conditions antecedent to the onset of the summer
261 monsoon, a subject worthy of further study.

262

263 **3.2 Climate-growth relationships**

264 The relationship between QNFH and PDSI, while consistent with prior results from MCFH and
265 BDFH, is more weakly expressed as shown in the left hand panels of **Figure 7**. While Sano et al.
266 (2009) and Buckley et al. (2010) were able to generate robust reconstructions of pre-monsoon
267 PDSI (March-May) from their respective *Fokienia hodginsii* records, the relationship for QNFH
268 is not strong enough to allow for robust statistical reconstruction of this metric. However, as
269 shown in the right hand panels of **Figure 7**, the relationship with the SPEI for the month of April
270 stands out as a month of significant correlation for the QNFH site with a large swath over
271 mainland Southeast Asia. We averaged together the gridded April SPEI measurements from the
272 two regions that are outlined by the black boxes shown in panel (e) **from Figure 7** (data shown
273 in **Figure 8**) and used this as our target metric for reconstruction. The result is a successfully
274 calibrated and verified reconstruction model (**Table 3**) and a reconstruction of April SPEI over
275 mainland Southeast Asia that is plotted in **Figure 9**, and explains 23.3% of the overall variance

276 of the target dataset. While this value may seem somewhat low, the model passes all verification
277 tests when using either half of the record for calibration (**Table 3**). This is particularly the case
278 with regard to first differenced data, which indicates a high degree of year-to-year variance in
279 common. The coefficient of efficiency statistic (CE) for verification on both halves of the record
280 is consistently positive, and therefore indicates an acceptable amount of model fidelity (Cook
281 and Kairiukstis, 1990).

282

283 For comparison purposes a plot of all three Vietnam tree-ring based climate reconstructions,
284 from north to south, is presented in **Figure 10**. The gray shaded boxes within each panel of this
285 plot indicates the period of less confidence based on the EPS, thus limiting our earliest years of
286 comparison to 1650, 1567 and 1250 C.E., respectively. While the response of QNFH to SST over
287 the classic “Niño” regions of the tropical Pacific is similar to that for MCFH and BDFH (**Figure**
288 **2**), the correlation fields are weaker. A look at the relationship between reconstructed April SPEI
289 and temperature at the surface, at the 850mb height and at the 200mb height (**Figure 11**) reveals
290 an apparent inverse relationship between SPEI and temperature over the equatorial zone and the
291 primary areas of ENSO activity in the Pacific, accompanied by an even stronger upper
292 atmospheric La Niña pattern with its accompanying equatorial low-pressure anomalies. An
293 equally strong direct correlation with temperature over the high-elevation of the Tibetan Plateau
294 and most of Eurasia reflects the anomalously strong thermal gradient that develops during the
295 buildup of the annual monsoon that typically forms during La Niña (Shaman and Tziperman,
296 2005). The 850-hPa height and SLP anomalies depict the broad La Niña features in the Pacific
297 such as the strengthened trade winds, and also highlights a local cyclonic cell over and to the
298 west of Indochina. This local circulation appears to be connected with negative anomalies of

299 SST in the Indian Ocean, of which the pattern has been identified as the Indian Ocean Basin
300 Mode (IOBM; Yang et al., 2007). It is worth noting that IOBM is not just a passive response to
301 El Niño, and its negative anomaly during April-May can induce a similar atmospheric circulation
302 pattern to the one shown in **Figure 11**.

303

304 The out-of-phase relationship and shared decadal spectral coherence between the EP–NP index
305 and autumn precipitation in central Vietnam as presented by Li et al. (2015) may explain an
306 apparent reduction in the severity of the 18th century megadrought at QNFH relative to north and
307 south regions of Vietnam. This inference was derived from the fact that historical severe
308 droughts are mostly multi-year events that are tied to decadal-scale variability. At the interannual
309 scale, Chen et al. (2013) describe another linkage between the winter months climatology on a
310 broader scale with the following year’s summer monsoon, and distinguish between years when
311 the East Asian Winter Monsoon (EAWM) is modulated by the effects of ENSO (EAWM_{EN}) and
312 those that are not. They demonstrate that a strong (weak) EAWM_{EN} leads to a weak (strong)
313 summer monsoon in the following pre-monsoon months of March-May over a broad swath of
314 Asia that includes our study region. This relationship is also modulated by the strength of the
315 decadal variability that is present in both the Pacific and Indian Oceans (Chen et al., 2013).

316

317 Under the inference of the aforementioned large-scale atmospheric anomalies, the regional
318 response in climate can be seen from the strong inverse relationship between April SPEI and
319 maximum temperature over Indochina (**Figure 12**). An increase in early season moisture and
320 cloudiness that would accompany this increased onshore flow ought surely play a role in keeping
321 plants hydrated and cool enough through atmospheric vapor pressure to mitigate the effects of

322 drought. It is clear that the large-scale dynamics of climate play a role in modulating the regional
323 hydroclimate that is reflected in the growth indices of *Fokienia hodginsii* from each of our sites,
324 and further study is warranted. Furthermore, research on the nature of *Fokienia hodginsii*'s
325 ecophysiological response to climate (i.e., water, temperature and light) would be an important
326 additional step toward better understanding the results of the current research.

327

328 **4 Conclusions**

329 This study presents the first tree ring record collected from the mountainous region of central
330 Vietnam and the first climate reconstruction of SPEI for the region – one that passes the rigorous
331 calibration-verification tests commonly used in dendroclimatology. The climate of central
332 Vietnam is distinctly different from the rest of the country in that autumn rainfall is a significant
333 contributor to the annual rainfall totals, more so than the summer monsoon that dominates the
334 rainfall regimes of northern and southern regions, respectively. The mechanism for this is found
335 within the coupled ocean-atmosphere dynamics of the sea to the east of Vietnam and across the
336 global tropics, particularly in the tropospheric circulations. The thermal gradient between the
337 Asian high mountains (the Tibetan Plateau) and the equatorial ocean, notably in the areas closely
338 linked with the ENSO phenomenon, apparently modulates the hydroclimate over Indochina as
339 well. The additional influence of the Northeastern winter monsoon over central Vietnam
340 specifically, and broadly across mainland Southeast Asia during times of strong ENSO and
341 decadal modulation, may provide an important counterbalance to soil moisture deficits generated
342 during particularly severe droughts from the annual dry season. Concurrent SST variations in the
343 Indian Ocean also play a role, and a further connection to increased tropical cyclonic activity

344 during the autumn peak of rainfall may serve to mitigate (or worsen) any spring drought over
345 central Vietnam.

346

347 Since the tree ring record and its SPEI reconstruction is the first produced from central Vietnam,
348 more detailed research is needed, particularly with regard to the role of local topography on
349 climate at this site. A deeper, more mechanistic understanding of the physiological controls on
350 the growth of *Fokienia hodginsii* with regard to hydroclimate is needed. In addition, the role of
351 any possible changes in the coupled ocean-atmospheric system over the past millennium needs to
352 be considered in interpreting changes in the regional hydroclimate.

353

354 **Acknowledgements**

355 This research was conducted with the support of the US National Science Foundation grants
356 AGS 12-03818 and AGS 13-03976 and of the Vietnam Academy of Science and Technology
357 grant VAST.HTQT.HOAKY.01/12. The Royal Botanic Garden Edinburgh is funded by the
358 Rural and Environment Science and Analytical Services division (RESAS) in the Scottish
359 Government. The authors wish to thank the managers and staff from the Quang Nam Province
360 and Tay Giang District, especially Mr. Phan Tuan, Mr. Briu Liec and Mr. Bhling Mia, for all of
361 their support and cooperation. The local Co Tu villagers are thanked for their kindness, good
362 cheer and their assistance with the fieldwork. We also thank the staff and directorship of Bidoup
363 - Nui Ba National Park in Lam Dong Province and the Southern Institute of Ecology in HCMC
364 for logistical help, and acknowledge the Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory's Climate and Life
365 Initiative as well as the Lamont-Doherty Climate Center for their support. Lamont-Doherty
366 Contribution No. XXXX.

367 **References**

- 368 Anchukaitis, K.J., B.M. Buckley, E.R. Cook, B.I. Cook, R.D. D'Arrigo and C.M. Ammann
369 (2010). The influence of volcanic eruptions on the climate of the Asian monsoon region.
370 *Geophysical Research Letters*, 37, L22703, doi:10.1029/2010GL044843.
- 371
372 Baker, P.J., S. Bunyavejchewin, C.D. Oliver and P.S. Ashton (2005). Disturbance history and
373 historical stand dynamics of a seasonal tropical forest in western Thailand. *Ecological*
374 *Monographs*, 75(3), 317-343.
- 375
376 Beguería, S., S.M. Vicente-Serrano, F. Reig, B. and Latorre (2014). Standardized precipitation
377 evapotranspiration index (SPEI) revisited: parameter fitting, evapotranspiration models, tools,
378 datasets and drought monitoring. *International Journal of Climatology*, 34(10), 3001-3023.
- 379
380 Black, B.A., D. Griffin, P. Van der Sleen, A.D. Wanamaker, J.H. Speer, D.C. Frank, D.W.
381 Stahle, N. Pederson, C.A. Copenheaver, V. Trouet and S. Griffin (2016). The value of
382 crossdating to retain high-frequency variability, climate signals and extreme events in
383 environmental proxies. *Global Change Biology*. Doi:10.1111/gcb.13256.
- 384
385 Briffa, K.R., and T.M. Melvin (2011). A closer look at regional curve standardization of tree-
386 ring records: justification of the need, a warning of some pitfalls, and suggested improvements in
387 its application. In *Dendroclimatology* (pp. 113-145). Springer Netherlands.
- 388
389 Buckley, B.M., M. Barbetti, M. Watanasak, R.D. D'Arrigo, S. Boonchirdchoo and S. Sarutanon
390 (1995). Dendrochronological investigations in Thailand. *IAWA Journal*, 16(4): 393-409.
- 391
392 Buckley, B.M., B.I. Cook, A. Bhattacharyya, D. Dukpa and V. Chaudhary (2005). Global
393 surface temperature signals in pine ring width chronologies from southern monsoon Asia.
394 *Geophysical Research Letters*, 32(20): 4pp.
- 395
396 Buckley, B.M., K. Duangsathaporn, K. Palakit, S. Butler, V. Syhapanya and N. Xaybouangeun
397 (2007a). Analyses of growth rings of *Pinus merkusii* from Lao PDR. *Forest Ecology and*
398 *Management* 253 (1–3), 120–127.
- 399
400 Buckley, B.M., K. Palakit, K. Duangsathaporn, P. Sanguantham, P. Prasomsin (2007b). Decadal
401 scale droughts over northwestern Thailand over the past 448 years: links to the tropical Pacific
402 and Indian Ocean sectors. *Climate Dynamics*, 29 (1), 63–71. Buckley, B.M., 2007a
- 403
404 Buckley, B.M., K.J. Anchukaitis, D. Penny, R.C. Fletcher, E.R. Cook, M. Sano, C.N. Le, A.
405 Wichienkeo, T.M. Ton, and M.H. Truong (2010). Climate as a contributing factor in the demise
406 of Angkor, Cambodia. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 107 (15), 6748.
- 407
408 Buckley, B.M., R.C. Fletcher, S.-Y. Wang, B. Zottoli and C. Pottier (2014). Monsoon Extremes
409 and Society over the past millennium on mainland Southeast Asia. *Quaternary Science Review*,
410 DOI: 10.1016/j.quascirev.2014.04.022.
- 411

412 Chen, M., P. Xie, J.E. Janowiak, and P.A. Arkin (2002). Global land precipitation: A 50-yr
413 monthly analysis based on gauge observations. *Journal of Hydrometeorology*, 3(3), 249-266.
414

415 Chen, W., J. Feng and R. Wu (2013). Roles of ENSO and PDO in the link of the East Asian
416 winter monsoon to the following summer monsoon. *Journal of Climate*, 26(2), 622-635.
417

418 Cook, E.R., K.J. Anchukaitis, B.M. Buckley, R.D. D'Arrigo, W.E. Wright and G.C. Jacoby
419 (2010). Asian monsoon failure and megadrought during the last Millennium, *Science*,
420 328(5977):486-489, DOI: 10.1126/science.1185188.
421

422 Cook, E.R. and L.A. Kairiukstis (Eds.). (1990). *Methods of dendrochronology: applications in*
423 *the environmental sciences*. Springer Netherlands.
424

425 Cook, E.R. and K. Peters (1997). Calculating unbiased tree-ring indices for the study of climatic
426 and environmental change. *The Holocene*, 7(3), 361-370.
427

428 Cook, E.R., R. Seager, Y. Kushnir, K.R. Briffa, U. Büntgen, D. Frank, P.J. Krusic, et al. (2015).
429 Old World megadroughts and pluvials during the Common Era. *Science advances* 1(10),
430 e1500561.
431

432 Dai, A., K. Trenberth and T. Qian (2004), A global data set of Palmer Drought Severity Index
433 for 1870–2002: Relationship with soil moisture and effects of surface warming, *Journal of*
434 *Hydrometeorology*, 5, 1117–1130, doi:10.1175/JHM-386.1.
435

436 D'Arrigo, R.D., M. Barbetti, M. Watanasak, B.M. Buckley, P. Krusic, S. Boonchirdchoo and S.
437 Sarutanon (1997). Progress in dendroclimatic studies of mountain pine in northern Thailand.
438 *IAWA Journal* 18(4): 433-444.
439

440 D'Arrigo, R.D., J. Palmer, C.C. Ummenhofer, N.N. Kyaw and P. Krusic. (2011). Three centuries
441 of Myanmar monsoon climate variability inferred from teak tree rings. *Geophysical Research*
442 *Letters*, 38: L24705, doi:10.1029/2011GL049927.
443

444 Davis, M. (2002). *Late Victorian holocausts: El Niño famines and the making of the third world*
445 (p. 529). London: Verso.
446

447 Fritts, H.C. (1976). Tree rings and climate, 567 pp. *Academic, San Diego, Calif.*
448

449 Ho, T.M.H., V.T. Phan, N.Q. Le and Q.T. Nguyen (2011). Extreme climatic events over
450 Vietnam from observational data and RegCM3 projections. *Climate Research*, 49, 87-100,
451 doi:10.3354/cr01021.
452

453 Li, R., S.-Y. Wang, R.R. Gillies, B.M. Buckley, H.T. Luu and C. Cho (2015). Decadal
454 oscillation of autumn precipitation in central Vietnam modulated by the East Pacific-North
455 Pacific (EP-NP) teleconnection. *Environmental Research Letters*, 10 024008 doi:10.1088/1748-
456 9326/10/2/024008.
457

458 McElwee, P.D. (2012), Payments for environmental services as neoliberal market-based forest
459 conservation in Vietnam: Panacea or problem?, *Geoforum*, 43(3), 412-426.
460

461 Melvin, T.M. and K.R. Briffa (2008). A “signal-free” approach to dendroclimatic
462 standardisation. *Dendrochronologia*, 26(2), 71-86.
463

464 Palmer, W.C. (1965). *Meteorological drought* (Vol. 30). Washington, DC, USA: US Department
465 of Commerce, Weather Bureau Research Paper No. 45.
466

467 Pumijumnong, N., D. Eckstein and U. Sass (1995). Tree-ring research on *Tectona grandis* in
468 northern Thailand. *IAWA Journal*, 16(4), 385-392.
469

470 Pumijumnong, N. and T. Wanyaphet (2006). Seasonal cambial activity and tree-ring formation
471 of *Pinus merkusii* and *Pinus kesiya* in Northern Thailand in dependence on climate. *Forest
472 Ecology and Management*, 226(1), 279-289.
473

474 Pumijumnong, N. and D. Eckstein (2011). Reconstruction of pre-monsoon weather conditions in
475 northwestern Thailand from the tree-ring widths of *Pinus merkusii* and *Pinus kesiya*. *Trees*,
476 25(1), 125-132.
477

478 Pumijumnong, N. (2013). Dendrochronology in Southeast Asia. *Trees*, 27(2), 343-358.
479

480 Räsänen, T.A., V. Lindgren, J.H.A. Guillaume, B.M. Buckley and M. Kummu (2015). On the
481 spatial and temporal variability of ENSO precipitation and drought teleconnection in mainland
482 Southeast Asia. *Climate of the Past, Discussions*, 11, 5307-5343, doi:10.5194/cpd-11-5307-2015.
483

484 Sachs, J.P., D. Sachse, R.H. Smittenberg, Z.H. Zhang, D.S. Battisti and S. Golubic (2009).
485 Southward movement of the Pacific intertropical convergence zone AD 1400-1850. *Nature
486 Geoscience* 2, 519-525.
487

488 Sano, M., B.M. Buckley and T. Sweda (2009). Tree-ring based hydroclimate reconstruction over
489 northwest Vietnam from *Fokienia hodginsii*: eighteenth century megadrought and tropical
490 Pacific influence. *Climate Dynamics*. 33 (2), 331–340.
491

492 Sano, M., C. Xu and T. Nakatsuka (2012). A 300-year Vietnam hydroclimate and ENSO
493 variability record reconstructed from tree ring d18O. *J. Geophys. Res.* 117 (D12), D12115.
494

495 Shaman, J. and E. Tziperman (2005). The effect of ENSO on Tibetan Plateau snow depth: A
496 stationary wave teleconnection mechanism and implications for the South Asian monsoons.
497 *Journal of Climate* 18.12 (2005): 2067-2079.
498

499 Stahle, D.W., J.V. Diaz, D.J. Burnette, J. Paredes, R.R. Heim, F.K. Fye, R. Acuna Soto, M.D.
500 Therrell, M.K. Cleaveland and D.K. Stahle (2011). Major Mesoamerican droughts of the past
501 millennium. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 38(5).
502

503 Stahle, D.W., D.J. Burnette, J.V. Diaz, R.R. Heim Jr, F.K. Fye, J.C. Paredes, R.A. Soto and M.K.

504 Cleaveland (2012). Pacific and Atlantic influences on Mesoamerican climate over the past
505 millennium. *Climate Dynamics*, 39(6), 1431-1446.

506

507 Stokes, M.A. and T.L. Smiley (1968). Tree-ring dating. *Tree-ring dating*. University of Arizona
508 Press.

509

510 Therrell, M.D., D.W. Stahle, L.P. Ries and H.H. Shugart (2006). Tree-ring reconstructed rainfall
511 variability in Zimbabwe. *Climate Dynamics*, 26(7-8), 677-685.

512

513 Trouet, V., and G.J. Van Oldenborgh (2013). KNMI Climate Explorer: a web-based research
514 tool for high-resolution paleoclimatology. *Tree-Ring Research*, 69(1), 3-13.

515

516 Ummenhofer, C.C., R.D. D'Arrigo, K.J. Anchukaitis, B.M. Buckley and E.R. Cook (2013).
517 Links between Indo-Pacific Climate Variability and Drought in the Monsoon Asia Drought
518 Atlas, *Climate Dynamics*, 40:1319-1334, doi:10.1007/s00382-012-1458-1.

519

520 Vicente-Serrano, S.M., S. Beguería and J.I. López-Moreno (2010). A multiscalar drought index
521 sensitive to global warming: the standardized precipitation evapotranspiration index. *Journal of*
522 *Climate*, 23(7), 1696-1718.

523

524 Vicente-Serrano, S.M., C. Gouveia, J.J. Camarero, S. Beguería, R. Trigo, J.I. López-Moreno, C.
525 Azorín-Molina, E. Pasho, J. Lorenzo-Lacruz, J. Revuelto and E. Morán-Tejeda (2013). Response
526 of vegetation to drought time-scales across global land biomes. *Proceedings of the National*
527 *Academy of Sciences*, 110(1), 52-57.

528

529 Wang, S.-Y., P. Promchote, H.T. Luu, B.M. Buckley, R. Li, R. Gillies, T.Q.T. Nguyen, B. Guan
530 and T.M. Ton (2015). Changes in the autumn precipitation and tropical cyclone activity over
531 Central Vietnam and its East Sea. *Vietnam Journal of Earth Sciences*, 36: 489-496.
532 http://cliserv.jql.usu.edu/paper/VN_White_Paper_proof.pdf.

533

534 Wigley, T.M., K.R. Briffa and P.D. Jones (1984). On the average value of correlated time series,
535 with applications in dendroclimatology and hydrometeorology. *Journal of climate and Applied*
536 *Meteorology*, 23(2), 201-213.

537

538 Xu, C., N. Pumijumnong, T. Nakatsuka, M. Sano and Z. Li (2015). A tree-ring cellulose $\delta^{18}O$ -
539 based July-October precipitation reconstruction since AD 1829, northwest Thailand. *Journal of*
540 *Hydrology*, doi/10.1016/j.hydrol.2015.02.037.

541

542 Xu, C., M. Sano and T. Nakatsuka (2011). Tree ring cellulose $d^{18}O$ of *Fokienia hodginsii* in
543 northwest Laos: a promising proxy to reconstruct ENSO? *Journal of Geophysical Research*. 116
544 (D24), D24109.

545

546 Yan, H., W. Wei, W. Soon, Z. An, W. Zhou, Z. Liu, Y. Wang and R.M. Carter (2015). Dynamics
547 of the intertropical convergence zone over the western Pacific during the Little Ice Age. *Nature*
548 *Geoscience*, 8(4), 315-320.

549

550 Yang, J., Q. Liu, S.P. Xie, Z. Liu and L. Wu (2007). Impact of the Indian Ocean SST basin mode
551 on the Asian summer monsoon. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 34(2).
552
553 Zuidema, P.A, P.J. Baker, P. Groenendijk, P. Schippers, P. van der Sleen, M. Vlam and F. Sterck
554 (2013). Tropical forests and global change: filling knowledge gaps. *Trends in Plant Science*,
555 18(8): 413-419.
556
557

558 **Table 1.** Common angiosperm forest species that coexist with *Fokienia hodginsii* at our study site in Tay
 559 Giang Protection Forest, Quang Nam Province, Vietnam.

			560
Factor	Family	Genus	Species
<i>Canopy Dominant</i>	Fagaceae	<i>Castanopsis</i>	spp. 562
		<i>Lithocarpus</i>	spp. 563
		<i>Quercus</i>	spp.
	Lauraceae	<i>Cinnamomum</i>	spp.
		<i>Litsea</i>	spp.
	Magnoliaceae	<i>Magnolia</i>	spp.
	Theaceae	<i>Anneslea</i>	<i>fragrans</i>
		<i>Polyspora</i>	spp.
		<i>Schima</i>	<i>wallichii</i>
<i>Below Canopy</i>	Annonaceae	<i>Polyalthia</i>	spp.
	Asparagaceae	<i>Dracaena</i>	spp.
	Euphorbiaceae	multiple	multiple
	Melastomataceae	<i>Melastoma</i>	spp.
		<i>Sonerila</i>	spp.
	Lauraceae	<i>Cinnamomum</i>	spp.
		<i>Litsea</i>	spp.
	Moraceae	<i>Ficus</i>	spp.
	Primulaceae	<i>Ardisia</i>	spp.
	Rubiaceae	<i>Ixora</i>	spp.
		<i>Lasianthus</i>	spp.
Rutaceae	<i>Clausena</i>	spp.	
	<i>Glycomis</i>	spp.	
<i>Herbaceous Layer</i>	Araceae	<i>Arisaema</i>	sp.
	Asparagaceae	<i>Peliosanthes</i>	cf. <i>teta</i>
	Balsaminaceae	<i>Impatiens</i>	sp.
	Cyperaceae	<i>Cyperus</i>	<i>leucocephalus</i>
	Orchidaceae	multiple	multiple
	Piperaceae	<i>Piper</i>	spp.
	Poaceae	<i>Bambusa</i>	cf. <i>balcoa</i>
		<i>Panicum</i>	<i>notatum</i>
	Xanthorrhoeaceae	<i>Dianella</i>	<i>ensifolia</i>
	Zingiberaceae	<i>Amomum</i>	spp.
		<i>Globba</i>	spp.
	<i>Zingiber</i>	spp.	

564 **Table 2.** Details of the QNFH tree ring samples, showing the ID tag for each included tree, the number of
565 cores from each tree that was included in the final indexed record, the first and last years measured
566 (YOM), the number of locally absent rings in each tree (LAB) and the correlation of each tree with the
567 master index (averaged between the total number of cores for each tree).
568

Tree ID	No. Cores	1st YOM	Last YOM	No. LAB	Corr. Master
TGFH02	1	1628	1740	0	0.434
TGFH03	2	1600	2010	7	0.578
TGFH04	3	1588	2013	2	0.528
TGFH06	2	1570	1800	0	0.431
TGFH07	2	1588	2013	1	0.605
TGFH08	2	1560	2006	0	0.455
TGFH09	2	1550	2013	0	0.482
TGFH10	3	1550	2013	5	0.533
TGFH11	3	1600	2013	3	0.563
TGFH13	3	1347	1970	1	0.521
TGFH15	3	1568	2013	0	0.507
TGFH16	2	1560	1750	1	0.431
TGFH17	2	1550	1808	0	0.462
TGFH19	1	1600	1900	0	0.453
TGFH21	2	1645	2012	3	0.538
TGFH23	1	1575	2011	0	0.458
TGFH25	1	1600	2013	1	0.525
TGFH26	2	1680	2013	4	0.521
TGFH29	3	1573	2013	5	0.495
TGFH30	1	1764	2013	1	0.450
TGFH33	2	1520	1940	2	0.421
TGFH35	3	1582	2013	12	0.521
TGFH37	1	1600	1680	0	0.410
TGFH42	1	1750	2013	0	0.506
TGFH43	3	1680	2013	9	0.582
TGFH44	2	1520	2013	0	0.553
TGFH45	2	1601	2013	0	0.524
TGFH46	1	1567	2013	0	0.537
TGFH47	1	1594	2013	1	0.448
TGFH48	1	1800	2013	0	0.495
TGFH52	1	1870	2013	0	0.486
TGFH54	1	1644	1950	0	0.577
TGFH56	2	1561	1800	0	0.464
TGFH57	3	1600	2013	3	0.562
TGFH58	1	1640	2013	0	0.449
TGFH59	3	1532	2013	0	0.638
TGFH60	2	1700	1959	0	0.584

569
570
571
572

573 **Table 3.** April SPEI reconstruction model results for late calibration (1951-2013 top two tables) and early
 574 calibration (1901-1950 bottom two tables) in the left hand columns, and for verification periods as
 575 denoted by the (v) in the 3 right hand columns. The * denotes z scores for Sign test and Kendall Tau tests.

576 *Undifferenced Late Calibration (1951-2013)* *Verification (1901-1950)*

Test	Score	T stat	Prob.	Score (v)	T-stat (v)	Prob. (v)
Equality of means	0.000	0.000	0.996	-0.094	-0.920	0.639
Cross products mean	0.145	3.041	0.002	0.045	0.953	0.326
Sign test	41+ 22-	*2.268	0.012	34+ 16-	*2.404	0.008
Pearson correlation	r = 0.483	4.311	0.000	r = 0.369	2.753	0.004
Robust correlation	r = 0.447	3.904	0.000	r = 0.419	3.200	0.001
Spearman correlation	r = 0.483	4.304	0.000	r = 0.389	2.927	0.003
Kendall Tau	t = 0.344	*3.982	0.000	t = 0.272	*2.785	0.003
Reduction of error	0.233			0.137		
Coefficient of efficiency	0.233			0.106		

577 *First differenced Late Calibration (1951-2013)* *Verification (1901-1950)*

Test	Score	T stat	Prob.	Score (v)	T-stat (v)	Prob. (v)
Equality of means	-0.004	-0.029	0.975	-0.008	-0.060	0.951
Cross products mean	0.506	3.700	0.000	0.215	2.222	0.015
Sign test	41+ 21-	*2.413	0.008	32+ 17-	*2.000	0.023
Pearson correlation	r = 0.659	6.779	0.000	r = 0.493	3.889	0.000
Robust correlation	r = 0.625	6.204	0.000	r = 0.525	4.227	0.000
Spearman correlation	r = 0.658	6.760	0.000	r = 0.481	3.766	0.000
Kendall Tau	t = 0.479	*5.497	0.000	t = 0.344	*3.482	0.000
Reduction of error	0.424			0.241		
Coefficient of efficiency	0.424			0.241		

578 *Undifferenced Early Calibration (1901-1950)* *Verification (1951-2013)*

Test	Score	T stat	Prob.	Score (v)	T-stat (v)	Prob. (v)
Equality of means	0.000	0.000	1.000	0.100	1.060	0.289
Cross products mean	0.060	1.588	0.057	0.087	2.344	0.011
Sign test	32+ 18-	*1.838	0.033	45+ 18-	3.276	0.001
Pearson correlation	r = 0.369	2.753	0.004	r = 0.483	4.311	0.000
Robust correlation	r = 0.419	3.200	0.001	r = 0.447	3.904	0.000
Spearman correlation	r = 0.389	2.927	0.003	r = 0.483	4.304	0.000
Kendall Tau	t = 0.272	*2.785	0.003	t = 0.344	3.982	0.000
Reduction of error	0.136			0.227		
Coefficient of efficiency	0.136			0.203		

579 *First differenced Early Calibration (1901-1950)* *Verification (1951-2013)*

Test	Score	T stat	Prob.	Score (v)	T-stat (v)	Prob. (v)
Equality of means	-0.008	-0.063	0.948	-0.005	-0.034	0.972
Cross products mean	0.170	2.220	0.015	0.401	3.700	0.000
Sign test	32+ 17-	2.000	0.023	41+ 21-	2.413	0.008
Pearson correlation	r = 0.493	3.889	0.000	r = 0.659	6.779	0.000
Robust correlation	r = 0.525	4.227	0.000	r = 0.625	6.204	0.000
Spearman correlation	r = 0.481	3.766	0.000	r = 0.658	6.760	0.000
Kendall Tau	t = 0.344	3.482	0.000	t = 0.479	5.497	0.000
Reduction of error	0.239			0.387		
Coefficient of efficiency	0.239			0.387		

