1

2

# Tracing anthropogenic thallium in soil using stable isotope

- compositions
- 3 Michael Kersten<sup>1,\*</sup>, Tangfu Xiao<sup>2</sup>, Katharina Kreissig<sup>3</sup>, Alex Brett<sup>3</sup>, Barry
- 4 J. Coles<sup>3</sup>, Mark Rehkämper<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Geosciences Institute, Johannes Gutenberg-University, D-55099 Mainz,
Germany

<sup>2</sup>State Key Laboratory of Environmental Geochemistry, Chinese Academy of
Sciences, Guiyang 550002, P.R. China

<sup>3</sup>Department of Earth Science & Engineering, Imperial College London, London
SW7 2AZ, UK

11 12

13 **ABSTRACT:** Thallium stable isotope data are used in this study, for the first 14 time, to apportion Tl contamination in soils. In the late 1970's, a cement plant 15 near Lengerich, Germany, emitted cement kiln dust (CKD) with high Tl contents, due to co-combustion of Tl-enriched pyrite roasting waste. Locally 16 contaminated soil profiles were obtained down to 1 m depth and the samples are 17 18 in accord with a binary mixing relationship in a diagram of Tl isotope compositions (expressed as  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl, the deviation of the  ${}^{205}$ Tl/ ${}^{203}$ Tl ratio of a 19 sample from the NIST SRM 997 Tl isotope standard in parts per  $10^4$ ) versus 20 1/[T1]. The inferred mixing endmembers are the geogenic background, as 21 defined by isotopically light soils at depth ( $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl  $\approx$  -4), and the Tl emissions, 22 which produce Tl-enriched topsoils with  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl as high as  $\pm 0$ . The latter 23 24 interpretation is supported by analyses of the CKD, which is also characterized by  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl  $\approx \pm 0$ , and the same  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl value was found for a pyrite from the deposit 25

that produced the co-combusted pyrite roasting waste. Additional measurements 26 27 for samples from a locality in China, with outcrops of Tl sulphide mineralization and associated high natural Tl backgrounds, reveal significant isotope 28 fractionation between soils ( $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl  $\approx +0.4$ ) and locally grown green cabbage 29  $(\epsilon^{205}Tl$  between -2.5 and -5.4). This demonstrates that biological isotope 30 fractionation cannot explain the isotopically heavy Tl in the Lengerich topsoils 31 32 and the latter are therefore clearly due to anthropogenic Tl emissions from 33 cement processing. Our results thus establish that isotopic data can reinforce 34 receptor modelling for the toxic trace metal Tl.

35

# 36 INTRODUCTION

Thallium (Tl) is a rare and dispersed metallic element with an average 37 upper continental crust abundance of  $0.75 \text{ mg kg}^{-1.1}$  Thallium concentrations in 38 natural soils are typically less than 0.2 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>, but they can reach levels of up to 39 100 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> and higher in contaminated sites.<sup>2</sup> Important contamination 40 pathways for Tl are acid mine drainage to sediments and atmospheric emissions 41 from pyrite roasting and coal combustion to soils.<sup>3,4,5,6</sup>, Similar to its 42 neighbouring elements in the periodic table (Hg, Cd and Pb), Tl has high acute 43 and chronic toxicities to mammals.<sup>7</sup> Thallium can occur both in monovalent and 44 trivalent binding forms, but monovalent Tl(I) dominates the speciation in the 45 aquatic environment due to the high redox potential of the Tl(III)/Tl(I) couple 46 (Eh = +1.28 V). A most important property for its biogeochemical cycling is that 47 the  $Tl^+$  cation has a similar ionic radius to  $K^+$  which contributes to Tl48 bioaccumulation in the food chain.<sup>8,9,10</sup> High translocation factors (root-to-leaf 49

50 Tl content ratio) were found for common vegetables like onions (10) and 51 kohlrabi (19) in weakly contaminated soils, and up to 350 (kohlrabi) at strongly 52 contaminated sites.<sup>11</sup> This renders food chain pollution by Tl a particular risk.

53 For more than half a century, the stable isotope systems of elements such 54 as H, C, O and a few others have been applied to investigate natural 55 fractionation conditions (temperatures, biogeochemical reactions), to constrain system mass balances, or as tracers in geochemical and environmental studies. 56 57 The development of new high-precision analytical methods (MC-ICP-MS; multiple collector ICP-MS) now allows the resolution of even small variations 58 in the stable isotope compositions of trace elements in complex natural samples, 59 thereby enabling environmental assessment studies for elements such as Cr, Se, 60 and Cd.<sup>12</sup> The results of such studies show that isotopic data can be used to 61 reinforce trace toxic element receptor modelling, adding significant weight of 62 evidence. 63

Such environmental investigations are also possible for the element Tl, 64 which is comprised of two stable isotopes, <sup>203</sup>Tl and <sup>205</sup>Tl, that have abundances 65 of about 30% and 70%, respectively. Previous work has furthermore 66 demonstrated that Tl exhibits surprisingly large natural stable isotope variations, 67 with an overall terrestrial variability of about 3% for the <sup>205</sup>Tl/<sup>203</sup>Tl isotope ratio 68 (Figure 1).<sup>13,14,15,16,17,18,19,20,21,22,23,24,25</sup> The processes responsible for the 69 70 relatively large observed Tl isotope effects are still debated, but are likely to 71 include mass-independent fractionations that are related to isotopic variation in nuclear volume.<sup>26,27</sup> This study reports on the first successful use of Tl stable 72 73 isotope ratios to assess the sources and biogeochemical fractionations of both geogenic and anthropogenic Tl enrichments in the pedosphere. At present,
virtually no information exists on Tl isotope fractionation by high-temperature
anthropogenic reactions and biogeochemical processes, such as adsorption in
and plant uptake from contaminated soils. The aim of this study was, therefore,
to contribute the first stable Tl isotope data for a soil contaminated by cement
plant emissions and investigate key factors, which may contribute to
post-depositional Tl isotope variability in the pedosphere.

#### 81 EXPERIMENTAL SECTION

82 Studied Areas. (i). Lengerich, Germany. Thallium emissions from a cement 83 plant near Lengerich, Germany, occurred in the late 1970's. Details about the 84 number and duration of the emission events were never released and the factory 85 owner has denied any official responsibility up to now. In 1979, the effects on vegetation (leaf necrosis) around the cement plant and symptoms of poisoning on 86 grazing animals (*Alopecia areata*) led to the suspicion that Tl deposition at levels 87 of up to 400  $\mu$ g m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> was the cause of the toxic effects.<sup>28</sup> The emissions from 88 89 the cement plant were suspected to have originated from TI-bearing pyrite roaster calcine, which was added to the ground limestone meal as an Fe 90 supplement, until this was stopped by the authorities in 1979.<sup>29,30</sup> The roaster 91 92 calcine, a waste product from pyrite roasting for the production of sulfuric acid, 93 was acquired from a chemical plant (Sachtleben AG, Duisburg, Germany) that 94 used pyrite concentrates from its own sedimentary-exhalative ("SEDEX") Zn-Pb sulfide-barite deposit in the Devonian slate belt of the Rhenish Massif near 95 Meggen (Germany).<sup>31</sup> While the roaster calcine was no longer accessible for 96 97 analysis because the pyrite mine, and hence calcine production, was abandoned

#### 4

in 1992, a pyrite sample representative for the mine was found in the mineral 98 99 collection of the University Mainz. A sample of bypass cement kiln dust was 100 obtained from a former employee who does not wish to disclose his name. 101 Brown-leached soil (podzolic Cambisol) core samples were collected in 2011 on 102 grassland sites within 3 km to the northeast, and hence downwind (given the 103 prevailing SW wind pattern) of the cement plant, using a hammer-head soil 104 probe (Eijkelkamp, Netherlands). The samples were dried overnight in an oven at 60 °C, gently disaggregated to pass through a 2-mm sieve, and homogenized 105 106 in an agate ball mill to 80-mesh (<180 µm) powder.

107 (ii). Lanmuchang, Guizhou Province, China. Further samples studied are from 108 Lanmuchang (105°30'23"E, 25°31'28"N), a remote rural area in southwest 109 Guizhou Province, China, where the local residents exhibit symptoms associated with chronic Tl poisoning.<sup>32</sup> These symptoms are induced by the Tl-rich sulfide 110 mineralization of the area, which is particularly susceptible to weathering and 111 112 dispersion where outcrops are in the hills and due to sporadic artisanal mining activities.<sup>33,34</sup> The Tl mineralization is primarily associated with the Permian 113 114 Longtan and Changxing Formations, which are comprised of limestone, argillite, 115 and an intercalation of coal seams. The host rocks have mostly undergone 116 intensive hydrothermal alteration and weathering, associated with silicification, 117 decalcification, argillization, kaolinization, and baritization. All sulfide minerals 118 such as cinnabar, realgar, orpiment, arsenopyrite and pyrite are rich in Tl, and 119 the local deposits have a long mining history (>350 years) for mercury but have been worked exclusively for Tl since the 1990s.<sup>33,34</sup> 120

The soil horizons in the Lanmuchang area are not well developed

121

5

122 (Oxisol). The soils mainly originate from the weathering of outcrops and they 123 accumulate naturally on the slight to moderately steep slopes within the 124 mineralized area, including in alluvial and colluvial deposits ("red clay"). The soil mineralogy is mainly comprised of quartz, kaolinite, illite and goethite, with 125 Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> concentrations between 100 and 200 g kg<sup>-1</sup>.<sup>33</sup> Analyzed were a stream 126 127 sediment, rhizospheric soil, and the root, stem and leaves from locally grown green cabbage (Brassica oleracea L. var. capitata L.) prone to high 128 accumulation of Tl.<sup>35</sup> The soil and sediment were air-dried in the laboratory and 129 130 then sieved to <2 mm. The plant leaves were cleaned using de-ionized water to 131 exclude any Tl contamination by dust or soil particles, air-dried, and then 132 crushed to fragments capable of passing through a 60-mesh sieve.

133 Thallium Concentration and Isotope Analyses. The mineral acids used were 134 of Merck suprapure grade (Mainz University) or distilled (Imperial College); 135 Milli-Q water (with  $\geq 18.2 \text{ M}\Omega$  cm) was used throughout. The exchangeable Tl 136 fraction of the Lengerich soils was obtained by extraction with aqueous 1 M 137 NH<sub>4</sub>NO<sub>3</sub> according to the procedure of the German Soil Protection and 138 Contaminated Sites Ordinance (DIN 19730:1997; solid/extractant ratio 1:2.5, 24 139 h shaking, centrifugation and 0.45 µm membrane filtration). For total TI analysis 140 of the Lengerich soil and cement dust samples, approximately 50 mg of powder were digested with an HNO<sub>3</sub> – HF acid mixture (15 mL conc. HNO<sub>3</sub> + 5 mL 141 142 conc. HF) using a closed-vessel microwave technique (PerkinElmer Multiwave). 143 Aqua regia was used for the digestion of the pyrite. The Lanmuchang samples 144 were first digested in sealed Savillex Teflon beakers using HF – HNO<sub>3</sub> for soils, 145 and HNO<sub>3</sub> – HCl mixtures for plant samples, and then redissolved in 6 M HCl to establish a clear solution. The Tl concentrations of the Lengerich samples were 146

determined by quadrupole ICP-MS (Agilent 7700 at the University of Mainz) and quantified using matrix-matched standards. For the Lanmuchang samples, the Tl measurements were performed at the State Key Laboratory of Environmental Geochemistry in Guiyang, using separate aliquots of the sample materials and following published protocols.<sup>34, 36</sup> Quality control was established by analyses of the certified reference soil samples GSD-2, GSD-8, and GSS-4 (Chinese loess soils).

154 The Tl isotope analyses were carried out at the Imperial College MAGIC Laboratories using previously established methods.  $^{37,38}$  Briefly, the HF – HNO<sub>3</sub> 155 156 sample digests were evaporated to dryness and re-dissolved in 1 M HCl, to 157 which Milli-Q water saturated with Br<sub>2</sub> was added to assure oxidation of all Tl 158 to the trivalent state. Chemical separation of Tl(III) from the sample matrix was then performed using AG1-X8 anion exchange resin in 1000 µL (first stage) and 159 160 100 µL (second stage) columns. The Tl isotope measurements utilized a Nu 161 Plasma HR MC-ICP-MS instrument operated in low-resolution mode, in combination with an Aridus desolvation system for sample introduction. The 162 measured <sup>205</sup>Tl/<sup>203</sup>Tl ratios were corrected for instrumental mass bias and drift 163 using a combination of (i) external normalization to the <sup>208</sup>Pb/<sup>206</sup>Pb ratio of 164 165 admixed NIST SRM 981 Pb, and (ii) standard sample bracketing with 166 concentration matched solutions of NIST SRM 997 Tl + NIST SRM 981 Pb. All 167 Tl isotope data for samples are reported using a  $\varepsilon$  notation relative to the NIST SRM 997 Tl reference material ( $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl<sub>NIST997</sub> = 0): 168

169 
$$\epsilon^{205} \text{Tl}_{\text{Sample}} = 10^4 \cdot \frac{\frac{205}{10} \text{Tl}_{\text{Sample}} - \frac{205}{10} \text{Tl}_{\text{NIST997}}}{\frac{205}{10} \text{Tl}_{\text{NIST997}}}$$
(1)

Based on replicate measurements of matching standard solutions, the samples were assigned an uncertainty (2sd) of  $\pm 0.35$  to  $\pm 0.55 \epsilon$  (Table 1), such that one  $\epsilon$ unit corresponds to about 4sd. Most of the 20 samples were analysed multiple times (n = 2 to 4), and deviations between individual results were consistently  $\leq 0.5 \epsilon$ . Measurements of the Aldrich Tl reference material furthermore yielded a mean value of  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl =  $-0.91 \pm 0.35$  (n = 2), in good agreement with the reference data ( $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl =  $-0.81 \pm 0.33$ ).<sup>39</sup>

# 177 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

178 The analysed soil profiles from Lengerich show the highest total and 179 NH<sub>4</sub>NO<sub>3</sub>-exchangeable Tl concentrations at the surface (0-10 cm), exponentially 180 decreasing with increasing depth (Table 1, Figure 2). These 'addition profiles' 181 indicate that the high Tl concentrations found in the topsoil horizon are not due 182 to accumulation during weathering of the parent rock, but are a consequence of absolute non-pedogenic Tl gains.<sup>40</sup> This topsoil gain is most likely caused by 183 184 atmospheric emissions from the nearby cement plant, a hypothesis that is 185 corroborated by the prevailing wind direction and the larger absolute Tl gains 186 for soil profiles that were collected closer to the cement plant (Figure 2). In the 187 deepest soil samples (90-100 cm), representing the primary C horizon of 188 moraine glacial till mainly composed of marl, the total Tl concentrations of about 0.1 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> are considered to be characteristic of the local geogenic 189 190 background. This conclusion is supported by the observation that the relatively 191 mild 1 M  $NH_4NO_3$  extractant, which is used to leach the exchangeable fraction 192 of elements, recovered only  $\leq 2\%$  of the total Tl budget for soil horizons deeper than 40 cm (with total [T1] <0.3 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>), a value that is typical for 193

uncontaminated soils.<sup>41</sup> The exchangeable Tl fraction increases to up to 17% (of 194 195 total Tl) in topsoils from near the cement plant, suggesting that a highly mobile 196 form of Tl was added to the soils (Table 1). The observed rise in the 197 concentration of readily exchangeable Tl cannot, however, account for the overall increase of the total Tl content (compare Figs. 2a and 2b). This indicates 198 199 some post-depositional loss in the mobility of the added anthropogenic Tl.

200 Further support for the proposed origin of the Tl enrichments in the topsoils is provided by the Tl isotope compositions. A plot of  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl against 201 1/[total TI] displays an inverse linear relationship ( $r^2 = 0.82$ ), indicative of 202 203 binary mixing between two different Tl pools (Figure 3). The Tl in the soils is thereby a mixture between a reservoir with high Tl concentrations  $(1/[Tl] \rightarrow 0;$ 204  $[Tl] > 2 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$ ) and a relatively heavy isotope composition ( $\epsilon^{205}Tl > -1$ ), and a 205 second pool representing the geogenic background, characterized by low Tl 206 contents (4 kg mg<sup>-1</sup> < 1/[T1] < 8 kg mg<sup>-1</sup>; [T1]  $\approx 0.1$  to 0.2 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and light 207 isotope compositions ( $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl < -3.0). Importantly, the inferred  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl values of 208 209 the two endmembers are significantly different at the 99.9% confidence level. The origin of the light Tl isotope composition of the geogenic background at 210 Lengerich, as recorded in the deepest soil profiles samples with  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl  $\approx -4$ , is 211 212 uncertain, particularly because average upper continental crust has a heavier isotope composition of  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl  $\approx -2$  (Figure 1). A possible explanation is that the 213 214 light isotopic signature of the marl is derived primarily from calcareous parent 215 material, as this may feature a seawater-derived isotopic signature similar to modern seawater characterized by  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl  $\approx -6$  (Figure 1). 216

217

An  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl value of  $-0.36 \pm 0.55$  was measured for the Meggen pyrite,

which is enriched in Tl at 200 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 3, Table 1). From the literature, it is 218 219 known that the fluidized bed furnace temperatures during pyrite roasting 220 (typically ~850 °C) are not high enough to achieve significant volatilization of Tl (boiling point of Tl<sub>2</sub>O is 1080 °C). The roasting calcines therefore still 221 contain Tl that is bound to the residual Fe oxides,<sup>42</sup> and at concentrations that 222 223 are three orders of magnitude higher compared to the sedimentary rocks, which 224 are commonly used as rawmix in cement production (commonly <0.5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>).<sup>43</sup> The cement kiln dust (CKD) was found to have a Tl content of 66 mg 225 kg<sup>-1</sup> and an isotope composition ( $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl = -0.19 ± 0.40) that is identical, within 226 227 uncertainty, to the Meggen pyrite (Fig. 3, Table 1), which characterizes the most 228 likely mineral source of the Tl-enriched Fe oxide calcines that were added to the 229 rawmix.

230 The CKD typically has high Tl contents because the volatilized element 231 recirculates due to continuous return of the dust via the gas-suspension 232 preheaters, which gradually heat the rawmix by contact with the hot 233 dust-bearing gas stream from the rear of the rotary kiln. The recirculation 234 involves evaporation of Tl compounds in the rotary kiln, a process that is 235 supported (as with Pb) by the formation of volatile Tl(I) chloride species (TlCl 236 boiling temperature is 806 °C). Owing to the large surface area available, the Tl compounds that were volatilized in the kiln condense onto the dust particles in 237 the preheaters.<sup>43</sup> Up to over 75% of the Tl from the rawmix (with commonly 238  $<0.6 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$  Tl if uncontaminated) is thereby repartitioned onto the electrostatic 239 precipitator dust under normal process conditions.<sup>43</sup> A Tl accumulation cycle is 240 241 therefore formed between the kiln, the preheaters for rawmix drying, and the 242 exhaust gas purification system, from where the CKD is fed back into the

rawmix. Thallium is thus enriched in the CKD to a certain level, which is 243 244 generally limited by bypass purging at the kiln inlet to prevent build-up of 245 excess chloride salts in the cyclone preheaters. Such purging is preferably performed at Tl concentrations of  $< 100 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$ , to enable waste disposal at 246 moderate costs.<sup>43</sup> Thirty years ago, such short bypass purging ("alkali bleed") 247 248 was often not coupled to an additional air pollution control device equipped with 249 electrostatic precipitators, as is nowadays the rule at cement works. In the past, 250 this may have hence led to short but intense blow-out events of Tl-enriched 251 CKD. The Tl compounds that were condensed on the surfaces of dust particles 252 and emitted during bypass processing, were highly mobile, as leaching of the 253 dust with NH<sub>4</sub>NO<sub>3</sub> releases 80% (Table 1), and with EDTA solutions even nearly 100% of the Tl budget.<sup>44</sup> 254

Particulate atmospheric emissions of Cd from high temperature 255 processes were found to be isotopically light relative to the source material,<sup>45,46</sup> 256 257 but no such fractionation was found here for Tl processed in a cement plant. 258 This is likely due to the pyroprocessing stage of cement manufacture, which 259 involves temperatures of up to 1450 °C in the kiln bed, and up to 2000 °C in the 260 firing zone, and is therefore expected to induce quantitative evaporation of the Tl from the rawmix.<sup>43</sup> In fact, considering the 2sd uncertainties, the  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl value 261 262 of the CKD ( $-0.19 \pm 0.40$ ) is identical to that of the topsoil sample from Profile 2, which features the highest Tl concentration (3.2 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>) and  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl =  $-0.08 \pm$ 263 264 0.35 (Fig. 3, Table 1). These results reinforce our earlier conclusion that the 265 elevated Tl contents of the Lengerich topsoils are caused by Tl emissions from 266 the cement works. Since contamination ceased more than 30 years ago, it is 267 important to consider possible post-depositional changes in the isotope signature of the contaminant due to biogeochemical processes in soils. As no constraints are available in the current literature, we addressed this topic through isotopic analyses of additional samples from the Lanmuchang site in China, which features also high natural Tl enrichments albeit by natural processes of pedogenic origin.

273 At Lanmuchang, the arable soil have Tl isotope compositions that are somewhat heavier (with  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl  $\approx$  +0.45) compared to the German soils (Table 1) 274 275 and common Chinese loess soils (Figure 1). While the Lengerich soils have relatively low Fe+Mn concentrations (<1 wt.-%, with no enrichment in topsoil 276 horizon), the Lanmuchang soil features high Fe+Mn contents of >10 wt.-% 277 (Oxisol).<sup>34</sup> The isotopically heavier Tl of the latter soils may thus reflect 278 279 oxidation of Tl(I) derived from weathering of the local sulphide mineralization, 280 and subsequent scavenging of the thus formed Tl(III) by Fe-Mn oxyhydroxide phases.<sup>47</sup> This hypothesis is backed up by (i) experimental studies which show 281 282 that adsorption of dissolved Tl(I) onto Mn oxides leads to an enrichment of isotopically heavy Tl in the solid phase,<sup>48</sup> and (ii) findings that in marine and 283 riverine environments, the Tl bound to Fe-Mn oxides is almost universally 284 enriched in <sup>205</sup>Tl relative to dissolved and silicate-bound Tl (Figure 1). 285

Clearly, the enrichment of Tl in vegetables is generally related to high Tl concentrations in rhizospheric soils, but the mobility of Tl is also affected by the water and organic matter content, pH, mineralogy, and cation exchange capacity of the soils. Moreover, speciation may be a key factor controlling Tl mobility. Unfortunately, the Tl partitioning in the Lanmuchang soils has not yet been measured, though it is known that the rate of Tl uptake by vegetables varies with the partitioning of Tl in contaminated soils. The maximum uptake rate was observed for plants grown on soil containing Tl-bearing clay minerals, whilst soil enriched in Tl-bearing Mn oxides was found to have the lowest potential for Tl release and phytoaccumulation.<sup>49,50</sup> Nonetheless, a high bioaccumulation of Tl was observed for the Lanmuchang green cabbage leaves that were grown on the local soils, with a Tl concentration of more than 100 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> (Table 1).

298 At Lanmuchang, the plants are expected to take up isotopically light Tl 299 from the soils because only Tl(I) is bioaccessible, whilst the inaccessible Tl(III) is bound to soil oxides which are enriched in heavier <sup>205</sup>Tl. Indeed, our Tl 300 isotope analyses reveal a significant fractionation of about  $-5 \varepsilon$  between young 301 302 edible plant leaves and the soil (Table 1). The distribution of Tl concentrations 303 in the green cabbage exhibits a systematic pattern, with young leaves  $\approx$  old 304 leaves > stems > roots. The isotopic data collected for the samples (Table 1) 305 suggest that lighter Tl is not only enriched at the soil-root interface but that 306 further isotope fractionation occurs along the physiologically controlled 307 translocation pathway. This follows from the observation that the increasing 308 enrichment of Tl within the green cabbage plant is accompanied by enhanced isotope fractionation, whereby the  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl values decrease from the cabbage root 309 310 (-2.54) and the stem (-2.91) to the old leaves (-3.68) and young edible leaves (-2.54)311 5.39; Table 1). Whilst these limited data suggest an active enrichment of 312 isotopically light Tl in the plant, they do not yet allow elucidation of the 313 mechanisms responsible for the isotopic effects. However, the results are also 314 important because they clearly demonstrate that the Tl isotope trends of the 315 Lengerich soil profiles are not due to biogeochemical fractionations or the input 316 of organic matter enriched in lighter Tl. Importantly, the latter processes would

317 generate isotopic trends in the opposite direction of the observed systematics.

Environmental Implications. As cement demand and production 318 319 continue to grow worldwide, and in particular in Asia with economic rise and 320 increasing construction activities, the contribution of cement plants to the 321 overall atmospheric emission inventory will become an important environmental 322 issue. This rise is, furthermore, accompanied, by a huge increase in the amount 323 of bypass CKD generated which cannot be recycled but must be disposed. In 324 1990, the US cement industry generated an estimated 12.7 million metric tonnes of CKD from 111 plants in 38 states, and 4 million metric tonnes of this was 325 disposed in piles, quarries, and landfills.<sup>51</sup> Clearly, the co-combustion option 326 327 offered by cement kilns is thriving and playing an increasingly important role in solid waste management.<sup>52,53,54</sup> As a consequence of the Lengerich pollution 328 329 case well known in that community, Tl concentration has become an emission 330 parameter pursuant to ambient pollution legislation. Hence, the use of solid waste containing in excess of 2 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> Tl was restricted by regulations in 331 332 Germany and other countries. Nowadays, low flue gas Tl emissions are achieved 333 if cement kilns meet the emission regulation standards and regular Tl emissions of less than 10 kg a<sup>-1</sup> were reported for 44 modern rotary and precalciner kiln 334 works in Germany in 2008.55 However, such beneficial process conditions are 335 easily disturbed if the cement rawmix is contaminated by Tl-enriched waste 336 337 products or secondary kiln fuels. A severe pollution risk may then be posed by 338 Tl contamination and accumulation in the food chain, for example if vegetable 339 crops are grown in the neighbourhood of cement works. When crops from contaminated sites are eaten, this may readily lead to Tl intake levels, which 340 exceeds the suggested WHO threshold value of 5  $\mu$ g Tl d<sup>-1</sup>.<sup>56</sup> 341

Our findings demonstrate that the historical emission of Tl-enriched dust 342 343 from the Lengerich cement plant can unequivocally be traced by the anomalous 344 Tl isotope compositions of the local topsoils. In fact, the source isotopic 345 signature is still well preserved, such that it can be linked to the original 346 emission events, even 30 years after deposition. However, this may be a 347 favorable exception rather than the rule. For example, it is conceivable that 348 continued deposition of plant debris, and organic material derived by 349 degradation thereof, may produce a gradual shift in the Tl isotope signature of mature topsoils, i.e. toward lower  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl values in the A horizon. Such a shift, 350 351 however, is clearly not in accord with the Lengerich soil profiles, as these feature relatively high  $\epsilon^{205}$ Tl near the surface and lighter Tl isotope compositions 352 at depth. The Lanmuchang data suggest also that the Tl isotope characteristics of 353 354 anthropogenic emissions are less likely to be preserved in Fe-Mn-rich soils. In 355 particular, the Tl(I) species deposited by air pollution may be transformed 356 abiotically to less mobile Tl(III) by the ferromanganese oxide minerals which, in 357 turn, can generate significant post-depositional Tl isotope fractionations. Such 358 post-depositional processes may thus hamper the use of Tl isotope 'fingerprints' 359 for apportioning contamination sources. Hence, it will be necessary to further 360 study and clarify the role of pedospheric processes that can alter Tl isotopic 361 compositions until source apportionments, which are based on such records, can 362 be carried out with confidence. A more sophisticated approach such as Tl 363 isotope analysis in sequential soil extractions may then help to differentiate 364 pedogenic from anthropogenic fractionation patterns. In summary, the results of 365 the cases studies presented here provide an improved but still rudimentary understanding of Tl cycling and isotope fractionation in both natural and 366

- to elucidate the mechanisms of the significant Tl isotope fractionation by crops
- that are known bioaccumulators of this toxic element.

370

### 371 AUTHOR INFORMATION

#### 372 Corresponding Author

\*Phone: (+49) 6131-3924366. E-mail: kersten@uni-mainz.de

#### 374 Notes

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

#### 376 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 377 Kahe Lui helped with Lengerich soil digestion and total Tl analysis by
- 378 Q-ICP-MS at Mainz laboratory. Zichen Xue and Julie Prytulak supported the Tl
- isotope analyses at Imperial College.

380

#### 381 **REFERENCES**

- (1) Wedepohl, K.H. The composition of the continental crust. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **1995**, *59*, 1217-1232.
- Madejon, P. Thallium. In: Alloway, B.J. (Ed.), *Heavy Metals in Soils*. Environmental Pollution Vol. 22, Springer, New York, **2013**, pp. 543-549

- (3) Casiot, C.; Egal, M.; Bruneel, O.; Verma, N.; Parmentier, M.; Elbaz-Poulichet, F. Predominance of aqueous Tl(I) species in the river system downstream from the abandoned Carnoules mine (southern France). *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2011, 45, 2056-2064.
- (4) Chen, Y.H.; Wang C.L.; Liu, J.; Wang, J.; Qi, J.Y.; Wu, Y.J. Environmental exposure and flux of thallium by industrial activities utilizing thallium-bearing pyrite. *Sci. China Earth Sci.* **2013**, *56*, 1502-1509
- (5) Lopez Anton, M.A.; Spears, D.A.; Diaz Somoano, M.; Martinez Tarazona, M.R. Thallium in coal: analysis and environmental applications. *Fuel* 2013, 105, 13-18.
- (6) Vanek, A.; Chrastny, V.; Komarek, M.; Penizek, V.; Teper, L.; Cabala, J.; Drabek, O. Geochemical position of thallium in soils from a smelter-impacted area. J. Geochem. Explor. 2013, 124, 176-182.
- (7) Viraraghavan, T.; Srinivasan, A. Thallium: environmental pollution and health effects. Encyclopedia of Environmental Health, Elsevier, Burlington, 2011; pp. 325-333.
- (8) Xiong, Y. The aqueous geochemistry of thallium: speciation and solubility of thallium in low temperature systems. *Environ. Chem.* 2009, 6, 441-451.
- (9) Jacobson, A.R.; McBride, M.B.; Baveye, P.; Steenhuis, T.S. Environmental factors determining the trace-level sorption of silver and thallium to soils. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2005, *345*, 191-205.
- (10) Hassler, C.S.; Chafin, R.D.; Klinger, M.B.; Twiss, M.R. Application of the biotic ligand model to explain potassium interaction with thallium uptake and toxicity to plankton. *Environ. Toxicol. Chem.* **2007**, *26*, 1139-1145.
- (11) Pavlickova, J.; Zbiral, J.; Smatanova, M.; Habarta, P.; Houserova, P.; Kuban, V. Tl uptake from contaminated soils into vegetables. *Food Addit. Contam.* 2006, 23, 484-491.
- (12) Weiss, D.J.; Rehkämper, M.; Schoenberg, R.; McLaughlin, M.; Kirby, J.; Campbell, P.G.C.; Arnold, T.; Chapman, J.; Peel, K.; Gioia, S. Application of non-traditional stable-isotope systems to the study of sources and fate of metals in the environment. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2008, *42*, 655-664.

- (13) Rehkämper, M.; Frank, M.; Hein, J. R.; Porcelli, D.; Halliday, A. N.; Ingri, J.; Liebetrau, V., Thallium isotope variations in seawater and hydrogenetic, diagenetic, and hydrothermal ferromanganese deposits. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **2002**, *197*, 65-81.
- (14) Rehkämper, M.; Frank, M.; Hein, J. R.; Halliday, A. N., Cenozoic marine geochemistry of thallium deduced from isotopic studies of ferromanganese crusts. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **2004**, *219*, 77-91.
- (15) Nielsen, S. G.; Rehkämper, M.; Porcelli, D.; Andersson, P.; Halliday, A. N.; Swarzenski, C.; Latkoczy, C.; Günther, D., The thallium isotope composition of the upper continental crust and rivers An investigation of the continental sources of dissolved marine thallium. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2005, *19*, 2007-2019.
- (16) Nielsen, S. G.; Rehkämper, M.; Norman, M. D.; Halliday, A. N.; Harrison, D., Thallium isotopic evidence for ferromanganese sediments in the mantle source of Hawaiian basalts. *Nature* 2006, *439*, 314-317
- (17) Nielsen, S. G.; Rehkämper, M.; Teagle, D. A. H.; Butterfield, D. A.; Alt, J. C.; Halliday, A. N., Hydrothermal fluid fluxes calculated from the isotopic mass balance of thallium in the ocean crust. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 2006, *251*, 120-133.
- (18) Nielsen, S. G.; Rehkämper, M.; Halliday, A. N., Thallium isotopic variations in iron meteorites and evidence for live lead-205 in the early solar system. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **2006**, *70*, 2643-2657.
- (19) Nielsen, S. G.; Rehkämper, M.; Brandon, A. D.; Norman, M. D.; Turner, S.; O'Reilly, S. Y., Thallium isotopes in Iceland and Azores lavas—Implications for the role of altered crust and mantle geochemistry. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 2007, *264*, 332-345.
- (20) Baker, R. G. A.; Schönbächler, M.; Rehkämper, M.; Williams, H.; Halliday, A. N., The thallium isotope composition of carbonaceous chondrites – new evidence for live <sup>205</sup>Pb in the early solar system. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **2010**, *291*, 39-47.
- (21) Baker, R. G. A.; Rehkämper, M.; Ihlenfeld, C.; Oates, C. J.; Coggon, R., Thallium isotope variations in an ore-bearing continental igneous setting: Collahuasi Formation, northern Chile. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2010, 74, 4405–4416.

- (22) Nielsen, S. G.; Goff, M.; Hesselbo, S. P.; Jenkyns, H. C.; LaRowe, D. E.; Lee, C.-T. A., Thallium isotopes in early diagenetic pyrite – A paleoredox proxy? *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2011, *75*, 6690-6704.
- (23) Prytulak, J.; Nielsen, S. G.; Plank, T.; Barker, M.; Elliott, T., Assessing the utility of thallium and thallium isotopes for tracing subduction zone inputs to the Mariana arc. *Chem. Geol.* **2013**, *345*, 139-149.
- (24) Hettmann, K.; Kreissig, K.; Rehkämper, M.; Wenzel, T.; Mertz-Kraus, R.; Markl, G., Thallium geochemistry in the metamorphic Lengenbach sulfide deposit, Switzerland: Thallium-isotope fractionation in a sulfide melt. Am. Mineral. 2014, 99, 793-803.
- (25) Hettmann, K.; Marks, M. A. W.; Kreissig, K.; Zack, T.; Wenzel, T.; Rehkämper, M.; Jacob, D. E.; Markl, G., The geochemistry of Tl and its isotopes during magmatic and hydrothermal processes: The peralkaline Ilimaussaq complex, southwest Greenland. *Chem. Geol.* 2014, 366, 1-13.
- (26) Schauble, E.A. Role of nuclear volume in driving equilibrium stable isotope fractionation of mercury, thallium, and other very heavy elements. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2007, *71*, 2170-2189.
- (27) Moynier, F.; Fujii, T.; Brennecka, G.A.; Nielsen, S.G. Nuclear field shift in natural environments. *C. R. Geoscience* **2013**, *345*, 150-159.
- (28) Prinz, B.; Krause, G.H.M.; Stratmann, H. Thalliumschäden in der Umgebung der Dyckerhoff Zementwerke AG in Lengerich, Westfalen. Staub Reinhalt. Luft 1979, 39, 457-462 (in German).
- (29) Dolgner, R.; Brockhaus, A.; Ewers, U.; Wiegand, H.; Majewski, F.; Soddemann, H. Repeated surveillance of exposure to thallium in a population living in the vicinity of a cement plant emitting dust containing thallium. *Int. Arch. Occup. Environ. Health* **1983**, *52*, 79-94.
- (30) Ewers, U. Environmental exposure to thallium. *Sci. Total Environ.* **1988**, *71*, 285-292.
- (31) Mueller, A.G. The sedimentary-exhalative Meggen Zn-Pb sulfide and barite deposit, Germany: Geology and plate-tectonic setting. Slide presentation and explanatory notes. Society for Geology Applied to Mineral Deposits web page (<u>http://www.w-sga.org</u>), Mineral deposit archives (accessed 11/23/2013).

- (32) Xiao, T.F.; Guha, J.; Liu, C.Q.; Zheng, B.S.; Wilson, G.; Ning, Z.P. Potential health risk in areas of high natural concentration of thallium and importance of urine screening. *Appl. Geochem.* 2007, *22*, 919-929.
- (33) Xiao, T.F.; Guha, J.; Boyle, D. High thallium content in rocks associated with Au-As-Hg-Tl and coal mineralization and its adverse environmental potential in SW Guizhou, China. *Geochem. Explor. Environ. Anal.* 2004, 4, 243-252.
- (34) Xiao, T.F.; Yang, F.; Li, S.; Zheng, B.; Ning, Z. Thallium pollution in China: a geo-environmental perspective. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2012, 421/422, 51-58.
- (35) Jia, Y.; Xiao, T.F.; Zhou, G.; Ning, Z. Thallium at the interface of soil and green cabbage (*Brassica oleracea* L. var. *capitata* L.): soil-plant transfer and influencing factors. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2013**, *450/451*, 140-147.
- (36) Xiao, T.; Guha, J.; Boyle, D.; Liu, C.; Chen, J. Environmental concerns related to high thallium levels in soils and thallium uptake by plants in southwest Guizhou, China. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2004**, *318*, 223-244
- (37) Nielsen, S.G.; Rehkämper, M.; Baker, J.; Halliday, A.N. The precise and accurate determination of thallium isotope compositions and concentrations for water samples by MC-ICPMS. *Chem. Geol.* 2004, 204, 109-124.
- (38) Baker, R. G. A.; Rehkämper, M.; Hinkley, T. K.; Nielsen, S. G.; Toutain, J. P., Investigation of thallium fluxes from subaerial volcanism Implications for the present and past mass balance of thallium in the oceans. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2009, *73*, 6340-6359.
- (39) Nielsen, S. G.; Rehkämper, M., Thallium isotopes and their application to problems in earth and environmental science. In *Handbook of Environmental Isotope Geochemistry: Advances in Isotope Geochemistry, Part 2*, Baskaran, M., Ed. Springer: Berlin, 2011; pp 247-269.
- (40) Brantley, S.L.; Goldhaber, M.B.; Ragnarsdottir, K.V. Crossing disciplines and scales to understand the critical zone. *Elements* **2007**, *3*, 307-314.
- (41) Rao, C.R.M.; Ruiz-Chancho, M.J.; Sahuquillo, A.; Lopez-Sanchez, J.F. Assessment of extractants for the determination of thallium in an accidentally polluted soil. *Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 2008, *81*, 334-338.

- (42) Yang, C.; Chen, Y.; Peng, P.; Li, C.; Chang, X.; Wu, Y. Trace element transformations and partitioning during the roasting of pyrite ores in the sulphuric acid industry. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 2009, *167*, 835-845.
- (43) Krčmar, W.; Linner, B.; Weisweiler, W. Investigations into the behaviour of trace elements during clinker burning in a rotary kiln system with grate preheater. *Zement Kalk Gips* **1994**, *12*, E335-E340.
- (44) Makridis, C.; Pateras, D.; Amberger, A. Thallium pollution risk to food chain from cement plant. *Fresenius Environ. Bull.* **1996**, *5*, 643-648.
- (45) Wombacher, F.; Rehkämper, M. Mezger, K. Determination of the mass-dependence of cadmium isotope fractionation during evaporation. *Geochim. Comsochim. Acta* 2004, 68, 2349-2357.
- (46) Cloquet, C.; Rouxel, O.; Cargignan, J.; Libourel, G. Natural cadmium isotopic variations in eight geological reference materials (NIST SRM 2711, BCR 176, GSS-1, GXR-1, GXR-2, GSD-12, Nod-P-1, Nod-A-1) and anthropogenic samples, measured by MC-ICP-MS. J. Geostand. Geoanal. Res. 2005, 29, 95-106.
- (47) Nielsen, S.G.; Wasylenki, L.E.; Rehkämper, M.; Peacock, C.L.; Xue, Z.; Moon, E.M. Towards an understanding of thallium isotope fractionation during adsorption to manganese oxides. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2013, 117, 252-265.
- (48) Peacock, C.L.; Moon, E.M. Oxidative scavenging of thallium by birnessite: explanation for thallium enrichment and stable isotope fractionation in marine ferromanganese precipitates. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2012, 84, 297-313.
- (49) Vanek, A.; Komarek, M.; Vokurkova, P.; Mihaljevic, M.; Sebek, O.; Panuskova, G.; Chrastny, V.; Drabek, O. Effect of illite and birnessite on thallium retention and bioavailability in contaminated soil. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 2011, 191, 170-176.
- (50) Vanek, A.; Mihaljevic, M.; Galuskova, I.; Chrastny, V.; Komarek, M.; Penizek, V.; Zadorova, T.; Drabek, O. Phase-dependent phytoavailability of thallium – a synthetic soil experiment. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 2013, 250/251, 265-271.
- (51) EPA Industrial Waste Homepage Cement Kiln Dust waste: <u>http://www.epa.gov/solidwaste/nonhaz/industrial/special/ckd/index.htm</u> (accessed April 22, 2014).

- (52) Reijnders, L. The cement industry as a scavenger in industrial ecology and the management of hazardous substances. J. Indust. Ecol. 2007, 11, 15-25.
- (53) Huang, Q.; Yang, Y.; Wang, Q. Potential for serious environmental threats from uncontrolled co-processing of wastes in cement kilns. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2012, 46, 13031-13032.
- (54) Garcia, R.I.; Moura, F.J., Bertolino, L.C.; de Albuquerque Brocchi, E. Industrial experience with waste coprocessing and its effects on cement properties. *Environ. Progress Sustain. Energy* 2014, 33, (published online Oct. 8, 2013: http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/ep.11873/full)
- (55) Anonymous. Environmental Data of the German Cement Industry. VDZ Verein Deutscher Zementwerke e.V., Düsseldorf, 52 pp. http://www.vdz-online.de/fileadmin/gruppen/vdz/3LiteraturRecherche/U mweltundRessourcen/Umweltdaten/Umweltdaten2008\_e\_WEB.pdf (11/23/2013)
- (56) WHO. *Thallium*. International Programme on Chemical Safety, Environmental Health Criteria 182, Geneva, 274 pp.

**Table 1.** Total and NH<sub>4</sub>NO<sub>3</sub>-extractable Tl concentrations, and  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl values in total digestions of the Lengerich and Lanmuchang samples. The Tl concentrations are for dried samples. All quoted uncertainties are 2sd. For the Tl concentrations, the uncertainties are based on triplicate sample analyses. For the  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl values, 2sd was determined from multiple analyses of matching standard solutions and multiple (n = 2 - 4) analyses of samples (if not otherwise stated).

Sample	Total Tl (mg kg <sup>-1</sup> )	NH <sub>4</sub> NO <sub>3</sub> -extractable Tl (mg kg <sup>-1</sup> )	ε <sup>205</sup> Tl in total HF-HNO <sub>3</sub> digestions
Meggen pyrite	$200 \pm 15$	-	$-0.36 \pm 0.55$
Cement kiln dust	$66 \pm 5$	$54 \pm 5$	$-0.19 \pm 0.40$
Soil Profile 1			
0-10 cm	$3.17\pm0.43$	$0.554\pm0.045$	$-0.08 \pm 0.35$
10-30 cm	$0.72\pm0.08$	$0.086\pm0.010$	$-1.56 \pm 0.35$
30-40 cm *	$0.23\pm0.02$	$0.020\pm0.002$	$-2.55 \pm 0.40$
Soil Profile 2	•	·	

0-10 cm *	$2.27\pm0.18$	$0.243 \pm 0.014$	$-0.88 \pm 0.40$		
10-30 cm *	$1.64 \pm 0.29$	$0.150\pm0.012$	$-1.69 \pm 0.40$		
30-50 cm	$0.63\pm0.03$	$0.074\pm0.004$	$-2.31 \pm 0.35$		
50-90 cm	$0.21 \pm 0.04$	$0.007\pm0.002$	$-3.59 \pm 0.35$		
90-100 cm	$0.15\pm0.02$	< 0.001	$-3.61 \pm 0.35$		
Soil Profile 3					
0-10 cm	$0.92\pm0.06$	$0.063\pm0.006$	$-2.00\pm0.40$		
10-30 cm *	$0.46\pm0.02$	$0.021\pm0.003$	$-2.59\pm0.35$		
30-40 cm	$0.16\pm0.01$	$0.006\pm0.001$	$-4.17\pm0.40$		
Lanmuchong samples					
Stream sediment (SD05)	30	-	$0.44~\pm~0.35$		
Arable soil (S621)	30	-	$0.45 \pm 0.35$		
Green cabbage root	25	-	$-2.54 \pm 0.35$		
Green cabbage stem	83	-	$-2.91 \pm 0.35$		
Green cabbage old leaf	100	-	$-3.68 \pm 0.35$		
Green cabbage – young leaf (edible part)	105	-	$-5.39 \pm 0.35$		

\* Sample analyzed only once.

# **Figure Captions**

**Figure 1.** Overview of natural Tl isotope variations (shown as  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl values) found in various terrestrial reservoirs and meteorites. The hashed line at  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl = -2 denotes the inferred Tl isotope composition of the continental crust and the Earth's mantle. These are currently best defined by the data for loess and fresh mid-ocean ridge basalts, respectively (data compiled from refs. *13-25*).

**Figure 2.** Soil profiles of (a) 1 M NH<sub>4</sub>NO<sub>3</sub>-extractable Tl concentrations and (b) total Tl concentrations for the three grassland sampling sites near the Lengerich cement

plant. The site/soil profile numbers increase with increasing distance to the cement plant. Trend lines were drawn to guide the eye.

**Figure 3.** Plot of  $\varepsilon^{205}$ Tl vs. 1/total Tl for the HF – HNO<sub>3</sub>-digested soil samples. Also shown are results for the Meggen pyrite and Lengerich cement kiln dust (CKD). The linear trend and associated R<sup>2</sup> value were calculated from the soil data only.





