Detecting gas flares and estimating flaring volumes at individual flow stations using MODIS data

Obinna C.D Anejionu, G. Alan Blackburn and J. Duncan Whyatt Lancaster University, Lancaster Environment Centre, United Kingdom; Email: o.d.anejionu@lancaster.ac.uk

8 Abstract

3 4

5

6 7

9 Gas flaring has gained global recognition as a prominent agent of pollution, leading to the estab-10 lishment of the Global Gas Flaring Reduction (GGFR) initiative, which requires an objective means 11 of monitoring flaring activity. Because auditable information on flaring activity is difficult to obtain 12 there have recently been attempts to detect flares using satellite imagery, typically at global scales. 13 However, to adequately assess the environmental and health impacts of flaring from local to region-14 al scales, it is important that we have a means of acquiring information on the location of individual 15 active flaring sites and the volume of gas combusted at these sites. In this study we developed an approach to the retrieval of such information using nighttime MODIS thermal imagery. The 16 17 MODIS flare detection technique (MODET) and the MODIS flare volume estimation technique 18 (MOVET) both exploit the absolute and contextual radiometric response of flare sites. The levels of 19 detection accuracy and estimation error were quantified using independent observations of flare location and volume. The MODET and MOVET were applied to an archive of MODIS data spanning 20 21 2000-2014 covering the Niger Delta, Nigeria, a significant global hotspot of flaring activity. The 22 results demonstrate the substantial spatial and temporal variability in gas flaring across the region, 23 between states and between onshore and offshore sites. Thus, while the estimated total volume of gas flared in the region over the study period is large (350 Billion Cubic Metres), the heterogeneity 24 25 in the flaring indicates that the impacts of such flares will be highly variable in space and time. In 26 this context, the MODET and MOVET offer a consistent and objective means of monitoring flaring

- 27 activity over an appropriate range of scales and it is now important that their robustness and trans-
- 28 ferability is tested in other oil-producing regions of the world.
- 29 Keywords: Gas Flare, Thermal Infrared Remote Sensing, MODIS Flare Detection, Niger Delta,
- 30 Gas Flaring Volume
- 31

1. Introduction 32

33 Gas flaring is one of the processes, alongside venting and reinjection, used to dispose of the 34 natural gas associated with extracted crude oil. Crude oil from a group of wells in an oil field is ini-35 tially gathered for processing at a flow station where gas is separated from oil. One or a number of 36 flares in the vicinity of the flow station are then used to burn off the gas. Flaring is commonly 37 adopted by oil companies because it is more cost-effective than converting to commercial natural 38 gas. Efforts to empirically assess the environmental impacts of flaring are frequently hampered by 39 limited access to official information on flare locations and volumes, the heterogeneity in spatial 40 and temporal sampling strategies and methods used to collect data and lack of auditability. In order 41 to begin to assess the environmental impacts of flaring in a coherent fashion, there is a pressing 42 need for a robust, consistent and objective means of determining: where active flaring sites are lo-43 cated; what volume of gas is being flared at each site; and how the distribution and volume of flares 44 has changed over space and time. Consequently, there is a need to develop new methods of acquir-45 ing such information, and remote sensing seems the most viable option. However, as explained below, while there have been several approaches developed for monitoring biomass fires, only a lim-46 47 ited number of studies have attempted to map flares or estimate flaring volumes from space. The 48 present study builds upon this work and presents an alternative and enhanced approach.

49 1.1 Fire detection using satellite imagery

50

51 Satellite systems have long been deployed to detect and monitor fires and their effects, due to 52 their timely and repetitive observations, multispectral viewing capabilities, synoptic coverage, and 53 their ability to retrieve information from hazardous locations. Four major classes of algorithm (sin-54 gle channel threshold, multi-channel threshold, contextual and sub-pixel) have been developed to 55 sense fires from satellite images (Li et a.l, 2000, Martin et al., 1999). The two main types of signals employed for this purpose are either direct (flames and heat) or indirect (smoke and burned surfac-56

57 es). Direct signals are most commonly employed in fire detection studies (Movaghati et al., 2009, 58 Justice *et al.*, 2006, Weaver et al., 2004), whilst indirect signals are employed for post fire assess-59 ment and management (Sedano et al., 2013; Lanorte et al., 2011). Most satellite-based fire detection studies have focused on forest/biomass fires, as their impacts draw considerable attention from the 60 61 research community and investigations are facilitated by the availability of well-established fire-62 hotspot algorithms (ATPS, 2013; Wooster et al., 2012; Wang et al., 2012; Xu et al., 2010; Casadio 63 and Arino, 2009; Qian et al., 2009; Roberts and Wooster, 2008; Zhukov et al., 2006; Giglio et al., 64 2003; Prins and Menzel, 1992; Dozier, 1981).

65 Radiation emitted at typical surface fire temperatures mostly lies in the infrared region of the electromagnetic spectrum. Thus, images from sensors such as the Advanced Very High Resolution 66 Radiometer (AVHRR), the Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS), and the Ge-67 68 ostationary Operational Environmental Satellite (GOES) Imager, which have infrared bands, have 69 commonly been used for forest fire detection (Justice et al., 2006; Ichoku et al., 2003; Li et al., 70 2000; Kaufman *et al.*, 1998). These systems have a relatively high temporal resolution, enabling 71 near-continuous monitoring of active fire fronts, which is very important given the ephemeral na-72 ture of biomass fires.

The AVHRR was used to produce the first global fire product and near-real-time global fire 73 74 data set. The fire detection capability of AVHRR nighttime imagery was first applied on fixed tar-75 gets of known location (Matson and Dozier, 1981). The level of success achieved in the detection 76 of fixed fire sources led to the use of AVHRR in biomass fire detection. The MODIS sensor has 36 77 spectral bands, some of which are specifically designed for fire monitoring and has improved fire 78 detection capabilities based on existing algorithms developed for AVHRR (Casanova et al., 2005, 79 Justice et al., 2002). However, gas flaring, has not received as much attention as other high temper-80 ature events (biomass fires, volcanoes, over ground and underground coal fires) and existing fire 81 detection algorithms are often inadequate for detecting gas flares due to the small extent of each 82 flare (Anejionu et al., 2014, Elvidge et al., 2011).

83 1.2 Detection of gas flares using satellite imagery

Croft (1978) was the first to observe gas flares in nighttime Defence Meteorological Satellite
Program (DMSP) and Landsat Multi-spectral Scanner System (MSS) images. While carrying out
research to determine blackbody temperatures of sub-pixel fires Matson and Dozier (1981) discovered that flares were detectable from nighttime AVHRR imagery. Twelve high temperature industrial sources in Detroit (steel mills), and six gas flares in the Persian Gulf were identified using the
3.8µm and 11µm bands of AVHRR. Muirhead and Cracknell (1984) visually inspected daytime
AVHRR images and were able to identify gas flares from North Sea oil rigs.

Elvidge *et al.* (2007) used DMSP Operational Linescan System (OLS) imagery to visually identify flares, using the circularity and bright centres of lights from flares to aid detection, and this was the first attempt to detect flares on a global scale over extended time periods (1994-2008 inclusive). Although the DMSP-OLS method has high temporal resolution (12 hours revisit period), the relatively low spatial resolution (560m – 2.7km) of the imagery limits its ability to accurately detect individual flare sites, particularly amidst urban areas as noted by Elvidge *et al.* (2009a). Furthermore, the visual identification technique employed is subjective and time consuming.

98 Casadio et al. (2012a) applied an active flame detection algorithm (ALGO3) to nighttime 99 Along Track Scanning Radiometer (ATSR) imagery to detect flares on a global basis. The method 100 is a single band fixed threshold algorithm based on the shortwave infrared band of ATSR (1.6µm) 101 and mostly employs temporal persistence of hotspot pixels as an indicator of flaring activity, with 102 the presence of industrial installations (identified from high resolution images available on Google 103 Earth) used to validate the results. However, the method of validation, which does not utilise direct 104 observation of flares on high resolution images, may be inconsistent as not all industrial sites in oil 105 producing regions contain flares. Nevertheless, ALGO3 is more objective than the DMSP-OLS and 106 AVHRR methods, as it adopts a fixed threshold method to automatically discriminate hotspots, thus 107 overcoming the limitations of manual identification. The method has subsequently been revised

through the integration of nighttime ATSR and SAR products to detect flares in the North Sea(Casadio *et al.*, 2012b).

110 Whilst the DMSP-OLS and ATSR methods of flare detection can be useful for detecting 111 flares at global level, they are of more limited utility where precise information on flare locations 112 and flare volumes is required for accurate assessment of impacts from local to regional scales. In 113 our previous work, we exploited the higher spatial resolution of Landsat imagery and its extended 114 time-series to detect flares over a period of 29 years (Anejionu et al., 2014). We developed the 115 Landsat Flare Detection Method (LFDM), a multiband threshold technique that used the near infra-116 red, shortwave infrared and the thermal infrared bands to map active gas flares in the Niger Delta. 117 The LFDM achieved a higher level of spatial accuracy (±23.85m) than earlier methods based on 118 low resolution imagery, and the long archive enabled us to reconstruct the flaring history of the re-119 gion back to 1984. However, despite the success of the LFDM in flare detection, the low frequency 120 of cloud-free images over the region, lack of nighttime data, and the scan line corrector error in post 121 2003 images limited its potential for estimating flaring volumes.

122 In an attempt to identify alternative data sources that may overcome some of the problems associated with Landsat data, we noted that Elvidge et al. (2011) had demonstrated some potential for 123 124 using MODIS imagery to detect flare sites; this prompted us to investigate this data further. A key 125 advantage of MODIS data is the frequency of acquisition from the Terra and Aqua satellite plat-126 forms, which increases the likelihood of obtaining cloud-free imagery, which is a critical constraint 127 at the Niger Delta study site and most other regions of the world. Therefore, the present study ex-128 plores the use of MODIS imagery for accurately and objectively detecting onshore and offshore 129 flares and for estimating flaring volumes.

130

131 132

1.2.1 MODIS fire products and gas flare detection

133 The MODIS fire products (MOD14 and MYD14) from Terra and Aqua platforms, respective-134 ly, were developed for the identification and monitoring of wild fires. The fire detection algorithms

are based on those developed for AVHRR, but with new capabilities (previous AVHRR 3.75µm
waveband was shifted to 3.95µm in MODIS, to minimise the effects of atmospheric water vapour
absorption and reflected solar radiation by 40% (Kaufman *et al.*, 1998)). Fire pixels are retrieved
using a hybrid of absolute and contextual processes that involve the application of sets of thresholds
on bands 22 (3.95µm), 31(11µm) and 16 (0.86µm) (Giglio *et al.*, 2003; Justice *et al.*, 2002).

140 However, as observed by Elvidge et al., (2011), the MODIS fire product is less efficient at de-141 tecting gas flares because thresholds in the algorithms were adapted to minimise the detections of 142 small fires such as gas flares and to maximise the detection of larger and more intense biomass fires 143 (Kaufman et al., 1998, Justice et al., 2002, Giglio et al., 2003). In addition, the algorithms only de-144 tect fires on landmasses (onshore) as they are not expected to occur on water bodies (offshore). This 145 is a significant constraint of the product in the present context because a considerable proportion of 146 flaring activities in the Niger Delta are located offshore. However, ongoing improvements of the 147 MODIS fire product (collection 6) are expected to revise the water mask to facilitate offshore gas 148 flare detection (Giglio et al., 2014; Csiszar et al, 2012). Exploratory investigations (Elvidge et al., 149 2011) revealed that the MODIS fire products were conservative in flare detection, compared with visual observations directly made from the MODIS band 22 image. This indicates that a bespoke 150 151 algorithm is required for the detection of gas flares from MODIS imagery.

152

153 1.2.2 Flare volume estimation from satellite imagery

The first attempt to estimate the volume of gas flared using satellite imagery was conducted by Elvidge *et al.* (2007), who used nighttime DMSP-OLS imagery to quantify the changes in total annual flaring volume for each of the world's oil producing countries over the period 1995 – 2006. The technique was further improved and the period of study extended to 15 years (1994 – 2008) by Elvidge et al. (2009a). However, the researchers noted some limitations in the DMSP-OLS technique such as the saturation of the DMSP-OLS visible band due to the brightness of gas flares, as well as the inability of the technique to detect flares in the mid-to-high latitudes in the summer time

161 due to solar contamination. In addition, the lack of onboard calibration of the DMSP-OLS visible 162 band limits the ability to estimate the total radiative output from flares, and the intercalibration of 163 different DMSP-OLS sensors was based on the assumption that electrically generated lights around Sicily, Italy, had remained constant over the period of study (1994-2008) which was not validated. 164 165 Furthermore, Elvidge et al. (2011) found it very difficult to discriminate flares in lit urban areas and 166 lights from oil facilities other than gas flares are often included in DMSP-OLS signals. These limitations will each contribute to uncertainties in estimates of flaring volume using the DMSP-OLS 167 and suggest that there is value in exploring the potential of alternative remote sensing systems. 168

The first attempt to estimate flaring volume from MODIS was made by Gallegos *et al.* (2007). They found that the reference flare sites with known gas flaring volumes were in some cases not detectable with the MODIS data, and therefore concluded that MODIS data would only be marginally useful in estimating daily gas flaring volumes. However, as noted by Elvidge *et al.*, (2011) the researchers did not work with enough MODIS images to test its capability for monthly or annual estimation of gas flaring volumes.

Elvidge et al. (2011) found that the MODIS fire product (MOD14) was inefficient at esti-175 mating flaring volumes. In many countries such as Nigeria, estimates were typically 25% lower 176 than estimates derived from DMSP-OLS imagery due to the undersampling of gas flares by 177 178 MOD14. Furthermore, for countries in the Amazon such as Bolivia, where biomass fires are com-179 mon, the volume estimates exceeded those derived from DMSP-OLS due to the erroneous inclusion 180 of other fire sources. However, Elvidge et al. (2011) did find a close correspondence between flare 181 volumes estimates made directly from the difference between MODIS bands 22 and 31, and the re-182 sults previously obtained from DMSP-OLS for a particular sample year (but as noted previously 183 there are several limitations with the DMSP-OLS technique itself). Therefore, based on this finding, 184 they recommended further exploration of MODIS for flare detection and volume estimation.

- 185
- 186 In this study, we set out to achieve the following objectives:

- 187 i. develop a technique to detect active gas flare sites from MODIS imagery,
- 188 ii. develop a technique to estimate the volume of gas flared from individual flare sites189 from MODIS imagery,
- 190
- 191
- gas flaring activity and flaring volumes in a globally significant gas flaring region.

apply these techniques to the MODIS archive in order to quantify the trajectories of

192

194

193 2. Study Area

iii.

The Niger Delta (Figure 1) is a densely populated region with over 10 million people and covers an 195 area of approximately 70,000km² (NPC, 2010). It is the largest source of hydrocarbons in Nigeria 196 197 (Tuttle et al., 1999) and the region has been greatly impacted by ongoing oil and gas exploration 198 and extraction, which commenced in 1958. Importantly, the Niger Delta is home to the third largest 199 mangrove forest in the world with rich biodiversity (Niger Delta Awareness, 2007). Consequently 200 the Niger Delta is ranked as one of the highest conservation priorities in West Africa (IUCN, 1994) 201 as it provides the natural habitat for a wide variety of endemic coastal and estuarine fauna and flora, 202 supporting over 60% of the total species in Nigeria (World Bank, 1995, cited in Ugochukwu 2008; 203 IUCN, 1994). Despite its importance, the region is virtually unprotected and as a result has been the 204 focus of increasing research activity in recent years, particularly on the impacts of oil exploitation 205 on the environmental (Bayode et al., 2011; Nwaogu and Onyeze, 2010; Eregha and Irugh, 2009), 206 socio-cultural and economic characteristics of the region (Aghalino and Odeh, 2010; Ajiboye et al., 207 2009). Among the many activities associated with the oil industry that directly affect the environ-208 ment, such as oil spillage and fires, deforestation, dredging and associated waste, gas flaring is a 209 prominent agent of pollution in the region (Ovri and Iroh, 2013; Ovuakporaye et al., 2012; Abdul-210 kareem et al., 2012; Dung et al., 2008). However, efforts to empirically assess the environmental 211 impacts of flaring in the Niger Delta have been hampered by limited access to official information 212 on flare locations and volumes and difficulties in undertaking field investigations due to security 213 issues. Thus, previous research has mostly been speculative or restricted to small areas surrounding

| 214 | individual flares (Obia et al., 2011; Abdulkareem, et al., 2012; Anomohanran, 2012; Oseji, 2011; |
|-----|--|
| 215 | Odjugo and Osemwenkhae, 2009; Dung et al., 2008). Hence, there is an important need to develop |
| 216 | a comprehensive understanding of flaring activity and its impacts in the Niger Delta, particularly |
| 217 | given that Nigeria ranks second among gas flaring countries globally (Elvidge et al., 2009). |
| | |

218

Insert Figure 1 here

219 **3. Methods**

220 3.1 Data and preprocessing

221 Day and nighttime MODIS images from the Terra and Aqua platforms were acquired from 222 Observing System Data and Information System the NASA's Earth (EOSDIS) 223 (http://earthdata.nasa.gov/). Having explored the data available for all months of the year, it was 224 found that only data for the months of December and January had acceptable levels of cloud-free 225 coverage as all images in all other months had greater than 50% cloud coverage. These months fall 226 within the Harmattan weather period, with drier and less humid conditions experienced in the Niger 227 Delta. This study consequently used MODIS data from these months for the period 2000 to 2014. In 228 total, 1643 MODIS images (899 Terra and 744 Aqua) were obtained and processed for the study. 229 Individual images with greater than 30% cloud cover were removed, leaving a total of 588 images 230 for further analysis. The MODIS raw DN values were processed with the ENVI MODIS toolkit to 231 derive spectral radiances. All images were georeferenced to the WGS 1984 coordinate system then 232 clipped to the study area. Bi-monthly temporal composites were computed from the data obtained in 233 the adjacent months of December and January using a maximum value compositing technique that 234 selected the maximum radiance from each pixel from all the images in the bi-monthly stack (Stoms 235 et al., 1997). This approach records the radiance value for each pixel which is least attenuated by 236 cloud cover and therefore effectively generates a cloud-free composite image and minimises noise 237 due to other atmospheric constituents (Jonsson and Eklundh, 2004). In the absence of data on at-238 mospheric conditions over the study sites on the various image acquisition dates, the compositing technique provided a practical and effective atmospheric correction method as has been well established and previously applied to MODIS data (Huete *et al.*, 2002; Holben, 1986). This procedure
generated 15 temporal composite images of the study site covering the 2000-2014 period at an approximately annual sampling interval.

243

244 3.1.1 Examination of the flare detection potential of MODIS bands

Each MODIS band was examined interactively and compared to reference data of known flare 245 locations (see section 3.2.1 below) in order to determine its suitability for flare detection. Only a 246 247 small number of bands showed any capabilities for flare detection (Figure 2, see Table 1 for band 248 characteristics). The daytime shortwave infrared (band 6, 1.64 µm; band 7, 2.11 µm) showed some 249 potential for flare detection, as in previous research with Landsat data (Anejionu et al., 2014). In-250 deed, Elvidge et al. (2013) found that for gas flares (at 1800K) the peak radiant emission is in the 251 shortwave infrared at around 1.6 µm. However, in the present study the daytime shortwave infrared 252 bands were highly sensitive to other reflective materials including clouds, the built-environment and 253 sands in and around rivers. Similar confounding effects have been found when attempting to use daytime shortwave infrared VIIRS data (band M10, 1.6 µm) for flare detection (Elvidge et al., 254 255 2013). Furthermore, gas flares could not be detected from nighttime MODIS bands 6 and 7 as the 256 MODIS reflective bands are turned off during "night mode" scans (MODIS Characterization Support Team, 2012). From the MODIS thermal bands that have previously been used in biomass fire 257 258 detection only bands 21 and 22 (both 3.96µm) were useful for flare detection, while band 31 (11.02 259 µm) had no value for flare detection whether acquired during daytime or nighttime. Daytime band 260 21 and 22 data were responsive to flares but were also sensitive to other hot and reflective surfaces 261 such as urban areas, bare lands and sands due to solar irradiation. Nighttime data were equally re-262 sponsive to flares but were not subjected to the solar-induced confounding effects. While bands 21 263 and 22 had similar responses to gas flares, band 21 is known to be noisier with higher quantization 264 error than band 22 (Giglio *et al.*, 2003) and this was evident in the data used for the present study.

265 The noisiness of band 21 is due to the fact that it has a relatively higher dynamic range than band 22, to avoid saturation over very hot and large targets and this has made it useful for the detection of 266 biomass fires and volcanoes. However, due to the relatively smaller size of gas flares band 22 is 267 more appropriate. Based on the spectral emission patterns of gas flares elucidated by Elvidge et al. 268 269 (2013) flares at 1800K have a peak radiant emission at around 1.6 µm therefore MODIS band 22 270 (3.96µm) is on the trailing edge of flare emissions. Using Plank's and Stefan-Bolzmann's Laws, 271 we estimated that for flares at 1800K MODIS band 22 would sample approximately 0.63% of total 272 radiant output, whereas for flares at 1250K band 22 would sample 1.01% of the radiant output. 273 Therefore, MODIS band 22 would become relatively more effective as flare temperature decreases 274 but would be less suitable than a shortwave infrared band for higher temperature flares. However 275 for the practical reasons given above related to solar effects and nighttime MODIS scan configura-276 tion, nighttime band 22 data was used for the development of the flare detection and volume estima-277 tion techniques described in this study.

- 278 279
- 280

281

Insert Figure 2 Here

Table 1. Spectral and spatial characteristics of the MODIS bands examined in this study.

| Band | Bandpass (µm) | Spatial Resolution (m) |
|------|---------------|------------------------|
| 6 | 1.628-1.652 | 500m |
| 7 | 2.105-2.155 | 500m |
| 21 | 3.929-3.989 | 1000m |
| 22 | 3.929-3.989 | 1000m |
| 31 | 10.780-11.280 | 1000m |

282 283

- 284
- 285

3.2 Development of the MODIS Flare Detection Technique (MODET) 286

287 A method which utilised the radiometric and spatial properties of gas flares was chosen for 288 detecting flares and discriminating them from other features with high thermal emissions. Gas flares 289 are smaller in size than biomass fires, occur at flare stacks and pits permanently fixed to a particular 290 location and are mostly continuously active (SPDC, 2013; Elvidge et al., 2011; Friends of the Earth, 291 2005). The continuous combustion of gas is expected to generate a considerable thermal signal that 292 would distinguish fire from non-burning background features. However, given the varying envi-293 ronmental context of flares in the Niger Delta (ranging from offshore, to mangrove swamp and to 294 rainforest areas), we found that a simple threshold method alone was unsuitable for flare detection. 295 We therefore fused a traditional radiometric threshold algorithm with a spatial filtering algorithm 296 capable of identifying gas flares based on differences in radiation between the flare pixels and surrounding pixels. This combination of radiometric and spatial filtering algorithms has been found to 297 298 be valuable when using thermal imagery for fire detection (Roberts et al., 2005; Roberts and 299 Wooster, 2008). In the present study, the radiometric algorithm applied a threshold to band 22 to 300 identify potential flare sites (see section 3.2.2 below which discusses the selection of the threshold 301 value). The spatial filtering algorithm is an adaptation of earlier methods used in the identification 302 of active fires (Flasse and Ceccato, 1996; Prins and Menzel, 1992) and flares from MODIS imagery 303 (Elvidge et al., 2011). A high pass filter was applied to band 22 in order to identify areas of sharp 304 spatial change in radiance. A 3x3 kernel was found to be most suitable for highlighting differences 305 between flares and immediate surrounding pixels. The results of the high pass filtering were subse-306 quently reclassified using a threshold to identify potential flare pixels (section 3.2.2 discusses the 307 threshold value). The results of the spatial filtering were then overlaid with the results from the ra-308 diometric threshold and potential flare pixels common to both algorithms were taken to be the ac-309 tive flare pixels. The key stages of the MODET are summarised in Figure 3.

Given the spatial resolution of the MODIS imagery (1km) it is feasible that within a single pixel or group of pixels identified as flares there may be one or more active flares associated with a flow station. Flares associated with a flow station are typically located within a radius of several hundred metres whereas individual flow stations are located at least several tens of kilometres apart. Therefore, rather than identifying flares (from individual stacks/pits), the MODET actually detects the flaring activity associated with individual flow stations, which we refer to as 'flare sites'.

316

Insert Figure 3 here

317

318 *3.2.1 Reference dataset and validation method*

319 High resolution images covering the Niger Delta obtained from Google Earth were visually 320 inspected in order to construct a reference dataset of active flare sites. This approach was adopted as 321 a ground-based survey of flare locations was not feasible at the time of research, due to logistical 322 and security issues associated with fieldwork in the region. Visible fires from gas flares (e.g. centre 323 of Figure 4) were used in conjunction with clearly discernible physical structures such as buildings, 324 pipelines, flare pits and flare stacks to confirm the locations of active flare sites. This method for collecting reference data on flare locations has been employed effectively by previous researchers 325 326 (Anejionu et al., 2014; Casadio et al., 2012; Elvidge et al, 2009b). The high resolution data cover-327 ing the study area comprise a mosaic of images acquired over different time periods; as a result no 328 single image or acquisition date was able to provide enough reference flare sites for validation. 329 Hence, the reference dataset of 43 active flare sites was obtained from a range of high resolution 330 images acquired between 2002 and 2007 and this was compared to the outputs of the MODET ap-331 plied to MODIS imagery for the corresponding years. All active flare sites within the boundaries of 332 the high resolution images were identified by placing a 1km resolution vector grid over the imagery 333 and systematically viewing and identifying all flare sites within each grid cell. The boundaries of 334 the high resolution images were used to define the sample areas for validating the MODET, there-335 fore errors of omission and commission could be quantified and the user and producer accuracies 336 for detection computed.

337

338

Insert Figure 4 here

339 *3.2.2. Identification of optimal thresholds and assessment of detection and spatial accuracy*

To identify the optimal thresholds for the radiometric and spatial filtering algorithms, a range of radiance values were tested. Characteristic background radiance of onshore and offshore environments for the original and spatially filtered band 22 images were used to identify suitable ranges of thresholds for testing. In turn, thresholds of between 0.5 and 0.7 Wm⁻² sr⁻¹ μ m⁻¹ (with an increment of 0.01) were tested for the radiometric algorithm and between 0.2 and 0.5 Wm⁻² sr⁻¹ μ m⁻¹ (increment 0.1) for the spatial filtering algorithm, and the accuracy of the outputs determined using the validation approach outlined above. Table 2 shows the accuracy statistics for a selection of the best performing combinations of threshold values. The combination of thresholds for the radiometric and spatial algorithms which maximised both user's and producer's accuracy (combination H in Table 1) was selected for the MODET (Figure 3).

Table 2. Summary statistics of accuracies computed from the different threshold combinations based on a reference
 data set of 43 known flares.

| Combina- tion | Radiometric Threshold (Wm ⁻² sr ⁻¹ µm ⁻¹) | Spatial Threshold (Wm ⁻² sr ⁻¹ µm ⁻¹) | Total Detections | Flares omitted | Detections Confirmed | Producer's accuracy | User's Accuracy |
|------------------|---|---|---------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|--------------------|
| А | 0.66 | 0.4 | 35 | 10 | 35 | 76.7 | 100.0 |
| В | 0.645 | 0.4 | 35 | 10 | 35 | 76.7 | 100.0 |
| С | 0.6 | 0.4 | 36 | 9 | 36 | 79.1 | 100.0 |
| D | 0.56 | 0.4 | 40 | 6 | 40 | 86.1 | 100.0 |
| Е | 0.6 | 0.2 | 43 | 4 | 41 | 90.7 | 95.4 |
| F | 0.6 | 0.3 | 42 | 5 | 41 | 88.4 | 97.6 |
| G | 0.6 | 0.5 | 40 | 6 | 40 | 86.1 | 100.0 |
| Н | 0.56 | 0.3 | 43 | 4 | 43 | 90.7 | 100.0 |

352 353

To compute the spatial accuracy of the MODET, the coordinates of the centroids of 20 flare sites detected by the technique were compared with the coordinates of corresponding reference flares derived from the high resolution imagery (Table 3). Offsets in latitude and longitude between the MODET detection and the reference flare locations were used to compute the root mean square error (RMSE) for each flare site and the mean RMSE (844m) was used as a measure of the spatial accuracy of the MODET.

361 **Table 3**. Details of the MODET detections and reference flare locations used to compute the spatial362 accuracy of the MODET

| MODET D | etections | | Referen | ce flares | |
|----------|-----------|---------------|----------|-----------|----------|
| Long (°) | Lat (°) | Flare Site ID | Long (°) | Lat (°) | RMSE (m) |
| 6.521486 | 5.659878 | MODET 11 | 6.517196 | 5.659283 | 480 |
| 6.708013 | 5.456133 | MODET 22 | 6.694344 | 5.458499 | 1539 |
| 6.662598 | 5.387761 | MODET 27 | 6.657883 | 5.386097 | 555 |

| 6.616185 | 5.239537 | MODET 31 | 6.628775 | 5.236312 | 1442 | | | | | |
|--------------|------------------------|-----------|----------|----------|------|--|--|--|--|--|
| 6.493413 | 5.191626 | MODET 33 | 6.491294 | 5.197543 | 697 | | | | | |
| 6.506888 | 5.097302 | MODET 35 | 6.506823 | 5.099702 | 266 | | | | | |
| 6.364653 | 5.026933 | MODET 37 | 6.358577 | 5.024974 | 708 | | | | | |
| 6.379626 | 4.882203 | MODET 47 | 6.372342 | 4.885274 | 877 | | | | | |
| 6.08198 | 4.657122 | MODET 53 | 6.07764 | 4.661282 | 667 | | | | | |
| 7.06385 | 4.652631 | MODET 55 | 7.060293 | 4.652185 | 397 | | | | | |
| 6.272682 | 4.628248 | MODET 56 | 6.26458 | 4.628168 | 899 | | | | | |
| 6.673079 | 4.544832 | MODET 60 | 6.664416 | 4.549694 | 1102 | | | | | |
| 7.009052 | 4.552018 | MODET 61 | 7.003554 | 4.55646 | 784 | | | | | |
| 8.016076 | 4.547077 | MODET 62 | 8.010454 | 4.552057 | 833 | | | | | |
| 7.049092 | 4.544832 | MODET 63 | 7.045435 | 4.553114 | 1004 | | | | | |
| 6.634151 | 4.523871 | MODET 64 | 6.632621 | 4.526412 | 329 | | | | | |
| 5.280867 | 5.668245 | MODET 123 | 5.275077 | 5.673164 | 843 | | | | | |
| 6.718174 | 4.554332 | MODET 148 | 6.710037 | 4.55965 | 1078 | | | | | |
| 5.133817 | 5.84871 | MODET 238 | 5.133365 | 5.860184 | 1274 | | | | | |
| 5.17438 | 5.614197 | MODET 173 | 5.173002 | 5.624002 | 1099 | | | | | |
| Note: Mean F | Note: Mean RMSE = 844m | | | | | | | | | |

363

364

365 *3.2.3 Application of the MODET*

366 The MODET was subsequently applied to the bi-monthly (December-January) temporal com-367 posites covering the 2000 to 2014 study period. The number of times each flare site was detected 368 was recorded with sites that were detected only once over the fifteen sampling occasions removed 369 as false detections. This is because once flow stations are constructed and flares become active they 370 burn continuously over their operational period which is typically in decadal time scale (SPDC, 371 2013, Onwuka, 2003). Therefore gas flares are highly unlikely to occur on only a single sampling 372 occasion, whereas biomass fires, or other high radiance features are much more ephemeral. Previ-373 ous studies have utilised a similar persistence approach in discriminating flares from false identifi-374 cations (Casadio et al. 2012a, 2012b) or to normalise the impact of background noise on flare detec-375 tions (Elvidge et al., 2009a). Since we do not have data from subsequent years to confirm if the 376 flares detected in 2013/14 were persistent, we incorporated them into the output, on the basis that 377 their detections satisfied the MODET procedure. The flares identified within the study period were 378 used to obtain a flaring history detailing the spatial and temporal variations in the distribution of 379 active flares in the region. The Nigerian political map was used to allocate the detected flares to the different states in the region. As the map did not delineate offshore state boundaries, offshore flares were objectively allocated to the state with the nearest onshore boundary by Euclidean distance. The onshore and offshore flaring was then used to calculate the overall activity for each state, on each sampling occasion.

384

385 3.3 Development of the MODIS Flare Volume Estimation Technique (MOVET)

386 The MOVET is based on the concept that the volume of gas flared at each flow station for any given time period (i.e. the combustion rate) would determine the intensity of fire at that location, 387 388 and by extension the magnitude of the spectral radiance emitted at the location, captured by the 389 MODIS sensor. We therefore set out to establish a method that would optimally harness the infor-390 mation contained in the radiance at the flare sites (flare pixels) and surrounding environment (back-391 ground pixels), to estimate the volume of gas flared. Having identified the locations of flare sites 392 using the MODET, MODIS band 22 was analysed further to derive a statistical relationship be-393 tween the spectral radiance of flare sites and the volume of gas flared. Due to the difficulty in ac-394 cessing official records of oil and gas related information in Nigeria (which gave rise to the present 395 research on alternative information sources on flaring), it was only possible to match detections from the MODET with records of the volume of gas flared at 29 sample flow stations across the re-396 397 gion in December 2004 (data sourced from Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation). Consequently, the band 22 temporal composite image from December 2004 was used together with the flare 398 399 volume records in order to develop the MOVET.

A number of different approaches were explored in order to develop the MOVET. The first stage was to apply a series of different methods for extracting pixel values from the vicinity of detected flare sites, and the second was to use a number of different ways to derive radiometric variables from the extracted pixels. The combination of extraction approach and radiometric variables that produced the strongest correlation with the flare volume records was used for the MOVET. The pixel extraction approaches that were tested were: (i) use of individual or groups of flare pixels at 406 each flare site; (ii) identification of a centroid location for individual or groups of flare pixels at 407 each flare site then construction of a circle of different sizes (1, 2, 3km) around this point and ex-408 traction of all pixels which intersected with the circle (to incorporate flare and background pixels); 409 (iii) use of a buffer of 1 to 3 pixels around each individual or group of flare pixels and extraction of 410 all flare and background pixels within this region. The radiometric variables derived from the 411 groups of pixels extracted in the previous stage were: (i) statistical parameters (minimum, maxi-412 mum, range, sum, mean and standard deviation); (ii) combinations of the statistical parameters such 413 as the product of mean and maximum, standard deviation and sum, and the difference between the 414 maximum and minimum. These combinations of statistical parameters enabled quantification of 415 various relationships between flare and background radiance values, for example, the difference between the maximum and minimum measured the radiance increase above background generated by 416 417 flares; (iii) calculation of the Fire Radiative Power based on fire and background pixel radiances 418 (Wooster et al., 2003); (iv) calculation of the magnitude of slope in radiance between flare pixels 419 and background pixels expressed as a mean value for each group of pixels considered. The optimal 420 combination of pixel extraction approach and radiometric variables was used as the basis as 421 MOVET as follows.

422 The MOVET is based on the combined use of the total radiation intensity at the flare site and 423 a measure of the localised influence of the flares over their surrounding environment. It is thus a hybrid absolute and contextual approach for estimating flare volume which incorporates radiance 424 425 values of flare pixels and surrounding pixels. A buffer of 1 pixel around flare pixels (i.e. in the case 426 of an individual flare pixel constitutes a 3x3 pixel window with the flare at the centre) was found to 427 be optimal for capturing the radiometric zone of influence of flares and some areas of background that were unaffected by flares. The 1 pixel buffer accommodated the variability and effects of gas 428 429 flares in the different environmental contexts. Regression analyses performed on reported flare vol-430 ume and radiance statistics for the 29 sample flare sites demonstrated that the optimal predictor of 431 flare volume was a combination of the sum and standard deviation of radiance values of the extract-

432 ed pixels at flare sites ($R^2 = 0.77$, p<0.01; see Figure 5) which was used as the basis of the MOVET:

- 433 $V = 375(\Sigma r^2.\sigma r) + 6230$ (1)
- 434 where V = flare volume (Million Cubic Metres);
- 435 $\Sigma r = \text{sum of radiance (Wm^{-2} sr^{-1} \mu m^{-1})};$
- 436 $\sigma r = \text{standard deviation of radiance } (\text{Wm}^{-2} \text{ sr}^{-1} \, \mu \text{m}^{-1}).$

Here Σr^2 quantifies the absolute intensity of emissions of the flare site while σr provides a 437 438 measure of the local variation between the radiation from flares and their immediate surroundings. 439 Across the Niger Delta flares are positioned in a variety of environmental contexts (mangrove 440 swamps, rainforest, offshore) with varying background radiance, therefore a given volume of combusted gas may lead to different total radiance emissions from the flare site depending on the con-441 text. Therefore, incorporation of σr into the MOVET model provides the contextual information 442 that effectively normalises the total radiation from each flaring site by accounting for varying local 443 444 conditions.

445 446

Insert Figure 5 here

The predictive power of the MOVET model was tested using the leave-one-out cross validation method (Arlot and Celisse, 2010) based on the sample of 29 flare sites. This revealed a RMSE of 0.007 Billion Cubic Metres (BCM) per month (28% of the mean), equating to an annual estimation error of 0.084BCM for individual flare sites.

451 3.4. Estimating volumetric rate of gas flaring in the Niger Delta (2000 – 2013)

The MOVET was applied to each temporal composite MODIS band 22 image for January and December of each sample year in order to estimate the volume of gas flared at all identified flare sites. In order to estimate the annual total volume of gas flared at each site, we needed to derive estimates of flaring volume in each month of the year. We observed from the available summary of monthly volumes reported for 2005 (the only year for which monthly data was available) that 457 monthly variation in flaring in the region was minimal with a coefficient of variation of 9.6% and no systematic seasonal fluctuation. This indicated that it was acceptable to quantify monthly flaring 458 459 volumes based on the January and December estimates from MOVET. Therefore, for each flare site, the volume estimates derived from the January and December monthly temporal composites in the 460 461 same calendar year were interpolated linearly to estimate volumes for all months of that year. The 462 twelve monthly volume estimates were then summed in order to calculate an annual volume of gas combusted for each flare site. This process was repeated across the MODIS archive in order to de-463 rive an annual estimate for volume of gas combusted at each flare site for each year from 2000 to 464 2013. The volume combusted at each site was summed over the entire study period and totals were 465 466 calculated for each state in the Niger Delta and the whole region. Uncertainty in the flare volume 467 estimates was expressed using the upper and lower 99% confidence intervals for the slope and in-468 tercept derived from the calibration of the MOVET (see section 3.3) for individual flare sites, scaled 469 to annual estimates for states and the study site, as appropriate.

470

471 **4.0 Results**

472 4.1 Spatial and temporal distribution of flare sites in the Niger Delta

473 The MODET detected 271 flare sites (190 onshore and 81 offshore) from 2000 to 2014. The 474 spatial distribution of the flares across the states of the Niger Delta is shown in Figure 6. The figure also illustrates the number of times each of the flare sites was detected within the study period 475 based on an annual sampling interval, which is indicative of the duration of activity at each site. For 476 477 clarity, the number of detections recorded in Figure 6 do not represent detections in individual MODIS images, rather they represent the number of detections in each of the bi-monthly temporal 478 479 composites from each sample year. This is why the maximum number of detections is 15, where an 480 individual flare has been detected in all of the 15 bi-monthly temporal composites that were ana-481 lysed between 2000 and 2014.

482 483

Insert Figure 6 here

The number of flare sites identified per state is shown in Table 4. Rivers State had the highest proportion of flare sites in the region over the study period (27%), closely followed by Delta State (26%). Whilst Akwa Ibom State had only 13% of flares sites, it possessed the greatest proportion of offshore flare sites in the region, with 37% of all offshore flare sites in the Niger Delta being located in this state.

| 4 | 8 | 9 |
|----------|----|---|
| – | () | , |

| Table 4 . Distribution of flare sites across the Niger Delta States (2000-2014) | | | | | | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| State | Onshore flare sites | Offshore flare sites | All flare sites | | | | | | |
| Rivers | 56 | 16 | 72 | | | | | | |
| Delta | 51 | 19 | 70 | | | | | | |
| Bayelsa | 41 | 12 | 53 | | | | | | |
| Akwa Ibom | 6 | 30 | 36 | | | | | | |
| Edo | 19 | 0 | 19 | | | | | | |
| Ondo | 5 | 4 | 9 | | | | | | |
| Imo | 11 | 0 | 11 | | | | | | |
| Abia | 1 | 0 | 1 | | | | | | |
| Total | 190 | 81 | 271 | | | | | | |

490

The temporal trajectory of flaring activity across the Niger Delta is shown in Figure 7, which indicates a downward trend from the peak in 2000 to 2014. Each sampling interval indicates a maintenance or decrease in flaring activity, with the largest decreases from 2000 to 2001 and 2013 to 2014 with the only increase in activity from 2010 to 2011.

495

Insert Figure 7 here

496 4.2 Spatial and temporal distribution of the volume of gas flared in the Niger Delta

497 The outputs of the MOVET suggest that there was a wide variation in the annual volume of gas 498 flared at individual flow stations (Table 5). This table shows the specific flare sites which have the 499 smallest and largest volumes of gas combustion within each year, along with the annual mean and 500 standard deviation. The maximum volume for an individual flare site was 4.60BCM, which was 501 recorded in 2005 in Rivers State (MODET 58), and the minimum volume of 0.0363BCM was recorded in Imo State (MODET 224) in 2009. From the peak at 2005, there was a general reduction in 502 503 the mean volume of gas combusted at individual flare sites and a decrease in the variability of flared 504 volume.

| | | | | | 11de | ence 99% | limits | | | | | | |
|------|--------------|--------------------|----------|-----------|----------|--------------|--------------------|----------|-----------|----------|---------------|--------------------|------------|
| Year | Min (BCM) | Uncertainty (±) | Flare ID | State | Location | Max (BCM) | Uncertainty (±) | Flare ID | State | Location | Mean (BCM) | Uncertainty (±) | Std DEV |
| 2000 | 0.0370 | 0.013 | MFDT 52 | Rivers | Onshore | 1.596 | 0.463 | MFDT 58 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.192 | 0.057 | 0.256 |
| 2001 | 0.0369 | 0.012 | MFDT 268 | Edo | Onshore | 2.383 | 0.691 | MFDT 58 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.209 | 0.062 | 0.325 |
| 2002 | 0.0372 | 0.013 | MFDT 339 | Delta | Onshore | 2.039 | 0.592 | MFDT 58 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.200 | 0.060 | 0.296 |
| 2003 | 0.0369 | 0.012 | MFDT 98 | Rivers | Onshore | 3.013 | 0.874 | MFDT 58 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.221 | 0.066 | 0.350 |
| 2004 | 0.0364 | 0.012 | MFDT 367 | Bayelsa | Onshore | 3.792 | 1.099 | MFDT 58 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.225 | 0.067 | 0.414 |
| 2005 | 0.0374 | 0.013 | MFDT 217 | Rivers | Onshore | 4.602 | 1.333 | MFDT 58 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.265 | 0.078 | 0.501 |
| 2006 | 0.0372 | 0.013 | MFDT 332 | Edo | Onshore | 3.606 | 1.045 | MFDT 58 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.249 | 0.074 | 0.448 |
| 2007 | 0.0371 | 0.013 | MFDT 339 | Delta | Onshore | 2.860 | 0.829 | MFDT 61 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.249 | 0.074 | 0.416 |
| 2008 | 0.0372 | 0.013 | MFDT 114 | Ondo | Onshore | 1.941 | 0.563 | MFDT 22 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.192 | 0.057 | 0.314 |
| 2009 | 0.0363 | 0.012 | MFDT 224 | Imo | Onshore | 1.022 | 0.297 | MFDT 75 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.161 | 0.048 | 0.175 |
| 2010 | 0.0372 | 0.013 | MFDT 2 | Edo | Onshore | 1.123 | 0.327 | MFDT 75 | Rivers | Onshore | 0.142 | 0.043 | 0.167 |
| 2011 | 0.0373 | 0.013 | MFDT 332 | Edo | Offshore | 2.043 | 0.593 | MFDT 231 | Akwa Ibom | Offshore | 0.159 | 0.048 | 0.255 |
| 2012 | 0.0369 | 0.012 | MFDT 106 | Rivers | Onshore | 2.253 | 0.654 | MFDT 231 | Akwa Ibom | Offshore | 0.157 | 0.047 | 0.269 |
| 2013 | 0.0370 | 0.013 | MFDT 227 | Akwa Ibom | Offshore | 0.475 | 0.139 | MFDT 87 | Rivers | Offshore | 0.100 | 0.031 | 0.094 |

 506
 Table 5. Summary of annual variations in volume of gas estimated for individual flare sites. The uncertainties are computed based on the upper and lower confidence 99% limits

523 Figure 8 shows the spatial distribution of individual flare sites and the total volume of gas 524 combusted at each site over the study period. Figure 8 also shows the total volume of gas flared 525 within each state over the study period. The results demonstrate that the volume of gas flared at individual sites varied by over two orders of magnitude, as did the volume of gas flared across the 526 527 states. Rivers State flared the greatest volume of gas (135BCM) over the study period, followed by 528 Bayelsa State (71BCM). Figure 9 summarises variations in flaring activities between states in the 529 region over the study period. Most states showed an initial phase of increasing activity followed by 530 a general decrease, although the timing of these phases differs between states and some states do 531 not show this pattern of activity. Figure 9 also shows that there are wide variations between states in the contributions of onshore and onshore flaring, and in those states where there is a mixture there 532 533 are differing trajectories of onshore and offshore activity with offshore generally becoming more 534 prevalent over time.

535 536

Insert Figure 8 here

537 538

Insert Figure 9 here

539 Figure 10 shows the trajectory of annual volumes of gas flared across the whole Niger Delta 540 region over the study period. This reveals that flaring activity increased initially, reaching a maxi-541 mum (36BCM) in 2005 before subsequently declining from 2006 to 2009. There was however, a 542 brief increase in activity from 2010 to 2011, followed by another period of decline to the present 543 levels. These annual volume estimates derived from the MOVET show a reasonably close corre-544 spondence with the trend of the reported volumes of gas flared for the Niger Delta published by the 545 NNPC (2012) (also shown in Figure 10). There are some discrepancies, notably at the middle of the 546 study period where the MOVET estimates showed much greater variability than the reported fig-547 ures. Official reports are not available for 2013, but the MOVET indicated a substantial reduction in 548 flaring volume in the final stage of the study period. The MOVET outputs produced an estimate that 549 a total of 350 BCM of gas was flared in the region from March 2000 to January 2014.

550 551

Insert Figure 10 here

552 **5.0 Discussion**

The location of flare sites detected by the MODET varied considerably at the state level, with some 553 states such as Rivers and Delta having substantially more terrestrial flare sites than offshore, whilst 554 555 others such as Akwa Ibom had the inverse. However, the regional distribution of the flare sites 556 shows that there are more flare sites in the terrestrial environment than the marine environment. 557 This explicit level of variation detected using MODIS data is important as it may be used to isolate 558 and specifically study the varying impacts of flare sites for any particular area. For example flaring 559 in Akwa Ibom State is expected to have greater impact on the marine environment than the terres-560 trial environment, based on the distribution of the flare sites shown in Figure 6. On the other hand, 561 the terrestrial environment of Rivers State will be the most impacted. Furthermore, the spatial distribution of the flares and the number of times they were detected over the study period showed var-562 563 ious clusters of flaring activity. This suggests that the environmental impacts of flaring could be 564 highly heterogeneous, with extreme values in certain locations.

The MODET revealed an overall reduction in the number of active flare sites between 2000 and 565 566 2014 (Figure 5). This may have been as a result of the decommissioning of some flare sites due to 567 the commencement of full operations at the Nigerian Liquefied Natural Gas facility at Bonny Island in late 1999 and subsequent commissioning of additional gas liquefaction trains from 2002, which 568 569 led to increased commercial utilisation of gases associated with extracted crude oil (NLNG, 2013). 570 The noticeable downward trend in the number of flare sites between 2006 and 2009 corresponds to 571 the period when oil and gas production in the region was severely disrupted by the Niger Delta mili-572 tants (Paki and Ebienfa, 2011; Punch Newspaper, 2009). Also towards the end of 2005 gas plants 573 were commissioned at Kwale/Okpai by Nigeria Agip Oil Company, and Okoloma by the Shell Pe-574 troleum Development Company (SPDC, 2011), both of which became fully operational from 2006. 575 The gas recycled from these plants is utilised in the generation of up to 1000MW of electric power 576 (National Petroleum Investment Management Services, 2010). The brief increase in numbers of 577 flare sites between 2010 and 2011, marked the return of relative peace in the region at the com-578 mencement of the Amnesty programme by the Federal Government of Nigeria (BBC, 2009), which 579 appears to have enabled a short period of increased oil and gas production. Since 2011 there has 580 been a steady decline in the number of active flare sites through to present. During this period there 581 has not been any significant unrest in the region that could disrupt oil and gas production, hence the 582 decrease in numbers of flare suggests a decline in the use of flaring to dispose of gas. This may be a 583 consequence of the Soku liquefied natural gas feeder plant, which supplies 40% of the 22 million 584 tonnes of gas per annum (30BCM) to the liquefaction facility at Bonny Island, returning to full op-585 eration towards the end of 2009 (Fineren, 2009). There has also been installation of associated gas gathering infrastructure at various oilfields in the Niger Delta by the oil companies, such as those at 586 587 Forcados-Yokri and Southern Swamps (SPDC, 2013), which has reduced the requirement for flar-588 ing. Hence, the results indicate that the oil and gas companies may finally be working towards the 589 eradication of gas flaring in the region. However, further monitoring of the situation using the 590 MODET is required in order to confirm this trend in subsequent years.

591 The MOVET showed that there was considerably variability between individual flare sites 592 in the volume of gas flared per annum and this is a reflection of the varying quantities of gas pro-593 duced at the different flow stations. Gas produced at flow stations varies due to the commissioning 594 or decomissioning of oil wells that are feeding into a station, changes in the rate of oil and gas pro-595 duction from individual wells and inter and intra well variation in the ratio of associated gas to oil 596 during the production cycle (International Association of Oil and Gas Producers, 2000). Interesting-597 ly, the minimum volume combusted by an individual flare site was recorded in 2009 which coincid-598 ed with the peak in social unrest in the region, which drastically disrupted oil production activities. 599 However, of greater significance is the systematic decrease in maximum and mean volumes com-600 busted by individual flare sites since 2005 (Table 4). This suggests that in addition to the decrease 601 in the number of active flare sites (discussed above), for the remaining active sites, the rate of gas

602 combustion has also decreased which may be a result of reduced production from the wells contrib603 uting to flow stations and/or implementation of alternative strategies for dealing with associated
604 gas.

The state-level trajectories of the volumes of gas combusted (Figure 7) illustrated the specific 605 606 contributions of onshore and offshore flares to the total for each state as well as annual variations in 607 those contributions. We found that prior to the recent decline in flaring activity in 2013, in states 608 such as Rivers (which has the highest flaring volume among the states) and Akwa Ibom there was a 609 noticeable decline in onshore flaring volume, while the offshore volume gradually increased over 610 the same period. This suggests intensified offshore oil exploitation and decreasing onshore activities in these states, which could be as a result of discoveries of new offshore oilfields such as Bonga, 611 612 Oyo, Ofon, Usan and Egina. Delta State however, shows a recent increase in onshore flaring vol-613 ume after an initial decline and steadily decreasing offshore flaring activity. In addition there is a 614 general decline in onshore and offshore flaring volume in Bayelsa State. It was also found that alt-615 hough Delta State had a greater number of active flare sites than Akwa Ibom or Bayelsa states, greater volumes of gas were combusted in Akwa Ibom (71BCM over the study period) and Bayelsa 616 617 State (61BCM) than in Delta State (49BCM). This could be due to a lower gas to oil ratio in the oil-618 fields in Delta State, or because a larger proportion of the gas produced from Delta State is being 619 utilized at recycling locations such as the Forcados-Yokri and Southern Swamp AGG, as well as the 620 Kwale/Okpai gas plant, which are all located in Delta State. As these observations demonstrate, a 621 significant advantage of the MOVET is the ability to provide information with sufficient spatial 622 precision to permit analysis of oil exploitation strategies in different states and, potentially, detailed 623 evaluation of the impacts of gas flaring. This level of information has not been previously explored 624 in flare-related research using remote sensing which has tended to focus on national or global scales 625 (Elvidge et al., 2009a, 2009b, Casadio et al., 2012), whereas the emphasis with MOVET is at the 626 level of the individual flow station.

627 The regional trajectory of the volume of gas combusted (Figure 8) showed a general increase 628 in the first half of the study period corresponding with increasing oil production, followed by a de-629 crease in the second half in response to reduced oil production due to social disruption in the region, in conjunction with the introduction of measures to reduce flaring such as liquefaction of gas. The 630 631 regional trajectory also indicated that the infrastructure for reducing gas flaring was already in place 632 by the end of the period of unrest in 2009, because although oil production returned to levels expe-633 rienced before the period of unrest, the volume of gas flared continued to decrease. There is an 634 overall tendency for the estimates for gas flaring from MOVET to be higher than the reported val-635 ues, with a notable discrepancy during the period of peak flaring in 2005-2006. This highlights the 636 importance of having an alternative means of obtaining information on gas flaring that is independ-637 ent of official sources which rely on data provided by the oil companies. Our method determined 638 that a considerable volume of natural gas (350 BCM) has been flared in the region over the study period; this has an energy value of 3.71×10^9 MWh which, by way of comparison, is approximately 639 640 10 times the annual electrical power consumption of the United Kingdom. Assuming that 184kg of 641 carbon dioxide is produced per MWh of natural gas (DEFRA, 2013), the gas flared in the Niger 642 Delta over the study period has resulted in 682.64Mt of carbon dioxide being released to the atmos-643 phere, suggesting a significant contribution of greenhouse gasses and other pollutants during this 644 period.

645 Owing to the low spatial resolution of MODIS data, the spatial accuracy of the MODET was 646 found to be 844m, which is very much lower than the 24m spatial accuracy obtained from the Land-647 sat Flare Detection Method (Anejionu et al., 2014). However, for regional and state-based studies 648 such as that undertaken here, the MODET appears adequate. Indeed, the distribution of active flare 649 sites in the Niger Delta detected with MODIS data closely corresponds with that obtained from 650 Landsat (Anejionu et al., 2014). The low spatial resolution of MODIS data may also have resulted 651 in the non detection of low intensity flares, leading to the under-detection of 9.3% based on the cal-652 culated producer's accuracy of the MODET. Nevertheless, the spatial resolution of the data did not 27

653 restrict the user's accuracy. Cloud cover was a limiting factor encountered in the course of this re-654 search. As with many areas of the world the Niger Delta is heavily cloud covered and this limits the 655 sampling opportunities for passive optical remote sensing. However, the frequent revisit times of the Terra and Aqua platforms meant that it was possible to construct cloud-free temporal composite 656 657 images which formed the basis of the MODET and MOVET. The temporal sampling was limited to 658 certain months of the year and it was not possible to characterise intra-annual variations in gas flaring activity, but the temporal sampling was sufficient for monitoring the longer-term inter-annual 659 trajectories in flaring. While the annual estimates of flaring volume from MOVET were based on 660 the reasonable assumption that intra-annual variations are minimal at active flare sites, it is likely 661 662 that estimates could be improved if more frequent sampling was possible. In this context, the combination of information derived from MODIS together with that from other passive and active satel-663 lite systems, may help to reduce the impacts of cloud cover and thereby increase the temporal sam-664 665 pling opportunities. For instance, it has been shown that SOUMI VIIRS data is valuable for flare detection (Elvidge et al., 2013). Furthermore, pre-launch algorithm development has demonstrated 666 the potential of the forthcoming Sea and Land Surface Temperature Radiometer on Sentinel-3 in 667 gas flare detection (Wooster et al., 2012). These systems are expected to play active role in the fu-668 669 ture monitoring of gas flaring activities around the world.

- 670
- 671
- 672 **6.0 Conclusion**

This research has demonstrated the utility of MODIS data for detecting individual gas flare sites and estimating the volume of gas combusted at these sites. Two MODIS-based techniques, MODET and MOVET were developed which were capable of providing alternative sources of information on gas flaring activity. The techniques were applied to the Niger Delta region and the outputs provided detailed information on the spatial and temporal variability of gas flaring activity in the region for the past 14 years.

679 The methods developed in this research provide an objective means of monitoring gas flar-680 ing activity which is particularly important in areas such as the Niger Delta, where investigations of 681 gas flaring have previously been hampered by restricted access to official information on flares. Us-682 ing freely-available MODIS data, the MODET and MOVET are consistent across different oil fields; they are timely and reduce delays associated with traditional methods of acquiring flaring 683 684 data; and the data is independent of particular companies or authorities. In principle, with the 685 MODET and MOVET flaring can be investigated at spatial scales ranging from that of the individ-686 ual flare site up to global level and across the time scale covered by the MODIS archive. However, 687 it is now important that the robustness and transferability of the techniques is evaluated in other oilproducing regions of the world. This will enable the methods to make a key contribution to moni-688 689 toring the compliance of countries to the Global Gas Flaring Reduction initiative and for modelling 690 the health and environmental impacts of flaring.

691

692 Acknowledgements

We wish to acknowledge the Surveyors Council of Nigeria (SURCON), who partly supported the initial stages of this project with a research grant, the Department of Geoinformatics and Surveying, University of Nigeria Enugu Campus, for the provision of the political map used in this research and the Petroleum Technology Development Fund (PTDF Nigeria) who sustained the later stages of this research via a scholarship. Thanks also to Lancaster University for the award of William Ritch-

- 698 ie Travel Grant, Lancaster Environment Centre and the Faculty of Science and Technology (Lan-
- 699 caster University) for the awards of travel grants for conferences. Gratitude to NASA for the
- 700 MODIS data used in the research.

701 References

- Abdulkareem, A. S. (2005a). Evaluation of ground level concentration of pollutant due to gas flaring by
 computer simulation: A case study of Niger Delta area of Nigeria.
 <u>http://lejpt.academicdirect.org/A06/29_42.htm</u> (accessed 14th November, 2013).
- Abdulkareem, A.S. Afolabi, A.S. Abdulfatai, J., Uthman, H., & Odigure, J.O., (2012). Oil Exploration and
 Climate Change: A case study of heat radiation from gas flaring in the Niger Delta area of Nigeria.
 InTech, 1-27.
- Arlot, S. & Celisse, A. (2010). A survey of cross-validation procedures for model selection. *Statistics Surveys*, *4*, 40–79.
- Anomohanran, O. (2012). Thermal effect of gas flaring at Ebedei area of Delta State, Nigeria. *Pacific Jour- nal of Science and Technology*, 13(2):555-560.
- African Technology Policy Studies Network (ATPS). (2013). Multi-temporal threshold algorithm in forest
 fire detection using MSG satellite: The case of Zimbabwe. *ATPS Working Paper No.* 76.
- Anejionu C.D.O., Blackburn, G.A., & Whyatt, J.D. (2014). Satellite survey of gas flares: development and
 application of a Landsat-based technique in the Niger Delta. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*,
 35(5), 1900-1925.
- BBC NEWS, 2009, Nigeria offers militants amnesty. <u>http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/8118314.stm</u> (accessed on 17th April, 2012).
- Casadio, S., Arino, O., & Serpe, D. (2012a). Gas flaring monitoring from space using the ATSR instrument
 series. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, *116*, 239–249.
- Casadio. S., Arino, O., & Minchella, A. (2012b). Use of ATSR and SAR measurements for the monitoring
 and characterisation of nighttime gas flaring from off-shore platforms: The North Sea test case. *Re- mote Sensing of Environment, 123*, 175–186.
- Casadio, S., & Arino, O. (2009). A new algorithm for the ATSR World Fire Atlas. *Proceedings EARSEL* 2009 Symposium. http://due.esrin.esa.int/wfa/Casadio_Arino_Earsel_2009.pdf. (accessed on 23rd July,
 2012).
- Casanova, J.L., Calle, A., Romo, A., & Sanz, J. (2005). Forest fire detection and monitoring by means of
 an integrated MODIS-MSG system. *Remote Sensing Laboratory of University of Valladolid*.
 <u>http://www.iki.rssi.ru/earth/articles/sec9_12.pdf</u> (accessed on 12th February, 2011)
- 730 Croft, T.A. 1978. Nighttime images of the earth from space. *Scientific American*, *239*, 68-79. 731
- Csiszar, I., Schroeder, W., Giglio, L., Justice, C.O., & Ellicott, E. (2012). Establishing active fire data conti nuity between Aqua MODIS and SUOMI NPP VIIRS.
 <u>http://www.star.nesdis.noaa.gov/jpss/documents/meetings/2012/AMS_NewOrleans_2012/Oral/2012</u>
 <u>AMS_Csiszar_Fire_V1.pdf</u> (accessed on 3rd July, 2014).
- 736 Department of Environment Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA) (2013). 2013 Government GHG Conversion 737 Factors Company Reporting: *Methodology* Paper Emission for for Factors. 738 https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/224437/pb13988-739 emission-factor-methodology-130719.pdf (Accessed on 9th March, 2014).
- Dozier, J. (1981). A method for satellite identification of surface temperature fields of subpixel resolution,
 Remote Sensing of Environment, 11, 221-229.
- Dung, E.J., Bombom, L.S., & Agusomu, T.D. (2008). The effects of gas flaring on crops in the Niger Delta,
 Nigeria. *GeoJournal*, *73*, 297–305.
- Flvidge, C.D., Baugh, K.E., Tuttle, B.T., Howard, A.T., Pack, D.W., Milesi, C., & Erwin, E.H. (2007). A
 twelve year record of national and global gas flaring volumes estimated using satellite data. *Final report*

- *to the World Bank.* http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTGGFR/Resources/DMSP_flares_
 20070530_b-sm.pdf (accessed on 11th October, 2009).
- Elvidge, C.D., Ziskin, D., Baugh, K.E., Tuttle, B.T., Ghosh, T., Pack, D.W., Erwin, E.H. & Zhizhin, M.
 (2009a). A fifteen year record of global natural gas flaring derived from satellite data. *Energies*, 2, 595-622.
- Elvidge, C.D., Baugh, K.E., Tuttle, B.T., Ziskin, D., Ghosh, T., Zhizhin, M., & Pack, D.W. (2009b). Improv ing satellite data estimation of gas flaring volumes. *Year two final report to the GGFR*.
 <u>http://www.ngdc.noaa.gov/dmsp/interest/flare_docs/NGDC_flaring_report_20090817.pdf</u>. (accessed on
 1st February 2011).
- Elvidge, C.D., Baugh, K.E., Ziskin, D., Anderson, S., & Ghosh, T. (2011). Estimation of gas flaring volumes
 using NASA MODIS Fire detection products. *Report presented to NASA*.
- Elvidge, C.D., Zhizhin, M., Hsu, F., and Baugh, K.E. (2013). VIIRS Nightfire: Satellite Pyrometry at Night.
 Remote Sensing, *5*, 4423-4449.
- Fineren, D. (2009). Nigeria LNG sees stable Soku gas feed by 2010-exec. *Reuters*.
 http://uk.reuters.com/article/2009/12/02/nigeria-lng-soku-idUSGEE5B11YU20091202 (Accessed on 9th
 March, 2014).
- Flasse, S.P., & Ceccato, P.S. (1996). A contextual algorithm for AVHRR fire detection. *International Journal of Remote Sensing 17*, 419 424.
- Friends of the Earth. (2005). Communities sue Shell to stop Nigerian gas flaring. Archived press release.
 <u>http://www.foe.co.uk/resource/press_releases/communities_sue_shell_to_s_20062005.html</u> (accessed on 5th October, 2009).
- 768 Friends of the Earth. (2004).Shell oil and flaring Nigeria. gas in 769 http://www.foe.co.uk/resource/images/shell_nigeria_2006/slides/EG_Gas%20flare%20Kolo%20Creek 770 %20shot%201.html (accessed on 5th October, 2009).
- Gallegos, S., Ryan, R.E., Baud, R., & Bloemker, J.M. (2007). MODIS products to improve the monitoring of
 gas flaring from offshore oil and gas facilities. *Final Report to NASA*.
- Giglio, L., Descloitres, J., Justice, C.O., & Kaufman, Y.J. (2003). An enhanced contextual fire detection al gorithm for MODIS. *Remote Sensing of Environment 8*, 273–282.
- Giglio, L., Schroeder, W., Boschetti, L., Roy, D., Justice, C. (2014). Collection 6 MODIS Fire Products.
 Presented at MODIS Science Team Meeting at the Sheraton Columbia Town Center in Columbia, Mary land (April 29 May 1).
- Holben, B.N. (1986). Characteristics of maximum-value composite images from temporal AVHRR data. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*, 7, 1417–1434.
- Huete, A., Didan, K., Miura, T., Rodriguez, E., Gao, X., & Ferreira, L. (2002). Overview of the radiometric
 and biophysical performance of the MODIS vegetation indices. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 83, 195–213.
- Ichoku, C., Kaufman, Y. J., Giglio, L., Li, Z. Fraser, R. H., Jin, J.Z., & Park, W. M. (2003). Comparative
 analysis of daytime fire detection algorithms using AVHRR data for the 1995 fire season in Canada:
 perspective for MODIS. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*, 24 (8), 1669–1690.
- International Association of Oil and Gas Producers (OGP). (2000). Flaring and venting in the oil and gas exploration and production industry: An overview of purpose, quantities, issues, practices and trends.
 Report No. 2.79/288.
- Jonsson, P., & Eklundh, L. (2004). TIMESAT-a program for analizing time-series of satellite sensor data.
 Computers Geosciences, 30, 833-845.
- Justice, C.O., Giglio, L., Korontzi, S., Owens, J., Morisette, J.T., Roya, D., Descloitres, J., Alleaume, S.,
 Petitcoline, F., & Kaufman, Y. (2002). The MODIS fire products. *Remote Sensing of Environment 83*,
 244 262.
- 794Justice, C., Giglio, L., Boschetti, L., Roy, D., Csiszar, I., Morisette, J., & Kaufman, Y. (2006). Algorithm795TechnicalBackgroundDocument:MODISFireProducts.796http://modis.gsfc.nasa.gov/data/atbd/atbd_mod14.pdf. (accessed on 10th March, 2011).
- Kaufman, Y.J., Justice, C., Flynn, L., Kendall, J., Prins, E., Ward, D. E., Menzel, P., & Setzer, A. (1998).
 Monitoring Global Fires from EOS-MODIS. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, *103*, 32215-32338.

- Lanorte, A., Danese, M., Lasaponara, R., & Murgante, B. (2011). Multiscale mapping of burn area and se verity using multisensor satellite data and spatial autocorrelation analysis. *International Journal of Applied Earth Observation and Geoinformation xxx*, xxx–xxx
- Li, Z., Kaufman, Y.J., Ichoku, C., Fraser, R., Trishchenko, A., Giglio, L., Jin, J., & Yu, X. (2000). A review
 of AVHRR-based active fire detection algorithms: principles, limitations, and recommendations.
 <u>http://www.fao.org/gtos/gofc-gold/docs/fire_ov.pdf</u>. (accessed on 4th February, 2011).
- 805Martín. M. P., Flasse, S., Downey, I., & Ceccato, P. (1999). Fire detection and fire growth monitoring using
satellite806satellite
- http://publiclibrary.rfs.nsw.gov.au/CommonDocuments/7300FiredetectionMicrosoft%20Word%20 %20review.pdf. (accessed on 10th March, 2011).
- Matson, M. and Dozier, J. (1981). Identification of subresolution high temperature sources using a thermal
 IR sensor. *Photogrammetric Engineering and Remote Sensing*, 47:1311.
- MODIS Characterization Support Team. (2012). MODIS Level 1B In-Granule Calibration Code
 (MOD_PR02) High-Level Design. MCST Internal Memorandum # M1057 REV. B.
 http://mcst.gsfc.nasa.gov/sites/mcst.gsfc/files/file_attachments/M1057_High-
- 814 <u>Level_Design_082212_REV_B_final_xg.pdf</u> (accessed on 2nd July, 2014).
- Movaghati S., Samadzadegan F., & Azizi A. (2009). An Agent-Based Approach for Regional Forest Fire
 Detection using MODIS Data. *Journal of Applied Sciences 9 (20)*, 3672 3681.
- Muirhead, K., & Cracknell, A.P. (1984). Identification of gas flares in the North Sea using satellite data. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*, 5 (1), 199 212.
- 819National Petroleum Investment Management Services (NAPIMS) (2010). NNPC/AGIP JV to commence 2nd820phaseofKwale-OkpaiIPPsoon.821http://dev.nnpcgroup.com/napims/AboutUs/NAPIMSNews/tabid/245/articleType/ArticleView/articleI822d/246/NNPCAGIP-JV-TO-COMMENCE-2ND-PHASE-OF-KWALE-OKPAI-IPP-SOON.aspx. (Ac-823cessed on 9th, March, 2014).
- National Population Commission (NPC). (2010). 2006 Population and Housing Census: population distribu tion by sex, state, LGA and senatorial district.
- Nigerian Liquefied Natural Gas at Bonny Island NLNG. (2013). Our Company: History.
 <u>http://www.nlng.com/PageEngine.aspx?&id=44</u> (accessed on 24th October, 2013).
- Nigeria National Petroleum Corporation NNPC. (2010). Annual statistics bulletin. <u>www.nnpcgroup.com</u>.
 accessed on 10th March, 2012).
- Obia, A.E., Okon, H.E., Ekum, S.A., Eyo-Ita, E.E., & Ekpeni, E.A. (2011). The influence of gas flare particulates and rainfall on the corrosion of galvanized steel roofs in the Niger Delta, Nigeria. *Journal of Environmental Protection*, 2, 1341-1346 doi:10.4236/jep.2011.210154.
- Odjugo, P.A.O., & Osemwenkhae, E.J. (2009). Natural gas flaring affects microclimate and reduces maize
 (*Zea mays*) yield. *International Journal of Agriculture and Biology*, 11: 408–412.
- 835 Onwuka, S. (2003). Nigeria: Shell builds locally fabricated flow station. *Daily Champion Newspaper* (29th
 836 September, 2003).
- 837 Oseji, O.J. (2011). Environmental impact of gas flaring within Umutu-Ebedei gas plant in Delta State, Nigeria. *Archives of Applied Science Research*, 2011, 3 (6):272-279.
- 839 Ovri, J.E.O. Iroh, M. (2013). Corrosion Effect of Gas Flaring On Galvanized Roofing Sheet in Imo State,
- Nigeria. *The International Journal of Engineering and Science*, 2 (1), 339-345.
- 842 Ovuakporaye, S.I., Aloamaka, C.P., Ojieh, A.E., Ejebe, D.E. & Mordi, J.C. (2012). Effect of Gas Flaring on
 843 Lung Function among Residents in Gas Flaring Community in Delta State, Nigeria. *Research Journal*844 of Environmental and Earth Sciences, 4(5), 525-528.
- Paki, F.A.E., & Ebienfa, K. I. (2011). Militant Oil Agitations in Nigeria's Niger Delta and the Economy. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 1 (5), 140-145.
- Prins, E.M., & Menzel, W.P. (1992). Geostationary satellite detection of biomass burning in South America. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*, 13 (15), 2783-2799.
- Punch Nigerian Newspaper. (2009). Upsurge of Militancy in Niger Delta.
 http://archive.punchng.com/Articl.aspx?theartic=Art20090303762220. (accessed on 20th October, 2011).
- Qian, Y., Yan, G., Duan, S., & Kong, S. (2009). A Contextual Fire Detection Algorithm for Simulated HJ 1B Imagery. Sensors, 9, 961-979.

- Roberts, G. Wooster, M. J., Perry, G. L. W., Drake, N., Rebelo, L.M., and Dipotso, F. (2005). Retrieval of
 biomass combustion rates and totals from fire radiative power observations: Application to southern Africa using geostationary SEVIRI imagery. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 110 (D21111), 1 19.
- Roberts, G.J., & Wooster, M.J. (2008). Fire detection and fire characterization over Africa using Meteosat
 SEVIRI. *IEEE Transactions on Geoscience And Remote Sensing*, 46 (4), 1200 1218.
- Royal Geography Society. (2013). Spearman's rank correlation coefficient–Excel guide
 http://www.rgs.org/NR/rdonlyres/4844E3ABB36D4B148A203A3C28FAC087/0/OASpearmansRank
 ExcelGuidePDF.pdf (accessed on 15th July, 2013)
- Sedano, F., Kempeneers, P., San Miguel, J., Strobl, P., &Vogt, P. (2013). Towards a pan European burnt scar
 mapping methodology based on single date medium resolution optical remote sensing data. *Interna- tional Journal of Applied Earth Observation and Geoinformation*, 20, 52-59.
- Shell Petroleum Development Company of Nigeria (SPDC) (2013). Shell in Nigeria: Gas flaring.
 http://s02.static-shell.com/content/dam/shell-new/local/country/nga/downloads/pdf/2013bnotes/gas flaring.pdf (accessed on 9th March, 2014).
- Shell Petroleum Development Company of Nigeria (SPDC) (2011). Shell in Nigeria: The Afam VI Power
 Generating Plant and Okoloma NAG Facility. http://s00.staticshell.com/content/dam/shell new/local/country/nga/downloads/pdf/2013bnotes/afam.pdf (accessed on 9th, March, 2014).
- Smith, A.M.S., Wooster, M.J. 2005. Remote classification of head and backfire types from MODIS fire radi ative power and smoke plume observation. *International Journal of Wildland Fire*, 14, 249 -254
- Stoms, D.M., Bueno, M.J., & Davis, F.W. 1997. Viewing geometry of AVHRR image composites derived
 using multiple criteria. *Photogrammetric Engineering & Remote Sensing*, 63, 6, 681-689.
- Wang, S.D., Miaoa, L.L., & Peng, G.X. (2012). An improved algorithm for forest fire detection using HJ data. *Procedia Environmental Sciences*, 13, 140 150.
- Weaver, J. F., Lindsey, D. T., Bikos, D. E., Schmidt, C. C., & Prins, E. 2004. *Fire detection using GOES-11 rapid scan imagery*. Weather and Forecasting, 19, 496-510.
- Wooster, M.J., Zhukov, B., Oertel, D. (2003). Fire radiative energy for quantitative study of biomass burning: derivation from the BIRD experimental satellite and comparison to MODIS fire products. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 86, 83-107.
- Wooster, M.J., Xu, W., & Nightingale, T. (2012). Sentinel-3 SLSTR active fire detection and FRP product:
 Pre-launch algorithm development and performance evaluation using MODIS and ASTER datasets.
 Remote Sensing of Environment, 120, 236–254.
- Xu, W., Wooster, M. J., Roberts, G., & Freeborn, P. (2010). New GOES imager algorithms for cloud and
 active fire detection and fire radiative power assessment across North South and Central America. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 114, 1876–1895.
- Zhukov, B., Lorenz, E., Oertel, D., Wooster, M.J, & Roberts, G. (2006). Spaceborne detection and characterization of fires during the bi-spectral infrared detection (BIRD) experimental small satellite mission (2001–2004). *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 100, 29-51.

List of Figure captions

Figure 1. Map of the Niger Delta region, showing its component oil producing states. Map of Nigeria is inset.

Figure 2. Spectral band images demonstrating the gas flare detection potential of day time and nighttime MODIS band
22 and daytime band 7 (band 6 showed a very similar response). Bands 6 and 7 are turned off at nighttime.

Figure 3. Flow chart illustrating the key stages of the MODIS Flare Detection Technique (MODET), based on the harnessing of radiometric and spatial properties of flares in nighttime band 22 imagery.

Figure 4. An active flare in the Agbada oilfield (Rivers State) of the Niger Delta captured in a high resolution image on
 Google Earth

906 Figure 5. Scatterplot of the radiance of flare sites (quantified by the product of the square of the sum of radiance and 907 standard deviation of radiance values in the buffer zone around flare pixels) and recorded volume of gas flared at sam-908 ple flow stations in the Niger Delta, used for calibrating the MOVET model.

909

892 893

- Figure 6. Map showing the spatial distribution of flare sites identified in the Niger Delta with the MODIS Flare Detection Technique from March 2000 to January 2014. Flare sites detected once are those that are newly detected in 2013/14.
- 913 **Figure 7**. Flare sites detected in the Niger Delta from 2000 to 2014. The positive error bar (9.3%) is based on the pro-914 ducer's accuracy of the MODET while absence of a negative error bar reflects the 100% user's accuracy.
- 915
- 916 Figure 8. The distribution of volume of gas combusted at individual flare sites (represented by the size of the symbol that shows the location of each site) and within each state (represented by the colour shading of each state) over the study period (2000-2014).
- Figure 9. Trajectories of annual gas flaring volume (BCM) within the individual states in the Niger Delta over the study
 period, indicating the contribution of onshore (blue bars) and offshore (red bars) flaring towards each annual total.

923 Figure 10. Graph showing the temporal trajectory of annual flaring volume estimated using the method developed in 924 this research compared to reported annual volumes and annual crude oil production within the study area. Error bars 925 represent the 99% confidence interval derived from the calibration of the MOVET.