



Studies in Visual Communication

Volume 6
Issue 2 *Summer 1980*

Article 11

1980

Collins, de Laguna, Carpenter, and Stone: The Far North: 2000 Years of American Eskimo and Indian Art / Stewart: Looking at Indian Art of the Northwest Coast

Aldona Jonaitis
SUNY at Stony Brook

Recommended Citation

Jonaitis, A. (1980). Collins, de Laguna, Carpenter, and Stone: The Far North: 2000 Years of American Eskimo and Indian Art / Stewart: Looking at Indian Art of the Northwest Coast. 6 (2), 90-92. Retrieved from <https://repository.upenn.edu/svc/vol6/iss2/11>

This paper is posted at ScholarlyCommons. <https://repository.upenn.edu/svc/vol6/iss2/11>
For more information, please contact repository@pobox.upenn.edu.

Collins, de Laguna, Carpenter, and Stone: The Far North: 2000 Years of American Eskimo and Indian Art / Stewart: Looking at Indian Art of the Northwest Coast

total deliberation and control. For example, in an interview with Spoto, Tippi Hedren, star of *The Birds*, points out that in planning that film Hitchcock had used charts of rising and falling action, to regulate tension and avoid predictability.

In general, then, Spoto's book is a good example of meticulous visual analysis in response to deserving cinematic material, and in this respect it is relatively unusual as film criticism goes. Spoto is not completely free, however, of all the typical weaknesses of the "serious" critic. The one of which he shows symptoms at times is the undue emphasis on broad thematic interpretation at the expense of attention to the mode of narration itself. What this means is that high-level metaphorical interpretations—like the ones in most of the examples cited here—consistently squeeze out the possibilities of dissecting Hitchcock's method of presenting to the audience the film's actions, in their literal sense. This overemphasis on Spoto's part is a pity: As Hitchcock himself demonstrates in the extended interviews in François Truffaut's *Hitchcock*, what makes his films an endless source of fascination for the careful viewer is not simply the masterful orchestration of thematic vehicles. It is also the extraordinary care lavished on such problems as—in *Psycho*—how to go into an overhead shot without signaling to the audience that the murderer's face and identity are thus being concealed. This kind of analysis is just as important as that of visual metaphors in leading viewers to a better understanding of the conventional expectations about form and meaning held by Hollywood's filmmakers and audiences.

To point out his relative lack of attention to such narrative devices is not to demean or derogate Spoto, however. In terms of his own aims, the author's book is flawless. In fact, the exemplary analysis of visual metaphor emphasized in this review is only one part of the very rich and many-layered immersion into Hitchcock's artistry that Spoto's book makes possible for the reader. Spoto himself hopes that his book will become a compelling impetus to see Hitchcock's films again. It is, in this reviewer's estimate, and provides, in addition, an important new key to their appreciation.

Henry B. Collins, Frederica de Laguna, Edmund Carpenter, and Peter Stone. *The Far North: 2000 Years of American Eskimo and Indian Art.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977. 289 pp., photographs. \$22.50 (cloth), \$14.95 (paper).

Hilary Stewart. *Looking at Indian Art of the Northwest Coast.* Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1979. 112 pp. \$6.95.

Review Essay by Aldona Jonaitis
SUNY at Stony Brook

The Far North: 2000 Years of American Eskimo and Indian Art, a catalog of the exhibition presented in 1973 at the National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C., is among the best books of its kind. Its value lies both in the large number of illustrated objects from museums all over the world and in the informative essays about Eskimo, Athapaskan, and Tlingit art written by the noted scholars of Alaskan cultures Henry B. Collins, Frederica de Laguna, Edmund Carpenter, and Peter Stone. It is thus with great pleasure that I report the reissue of this catalog by Indiana University Press.

The book contains 365 excellent photographs of archeological and ethnographic art of Alaska. In addition to the familiar Eskimo masks and Northwest Coast Chilkat blankets, less well known prehistoric ivory carvings from St. Lawrence Island, stone lamps from Kodiak Island, and wooden masks from the Aleutians are presented. Especially valuable for the scholar are the early nineteenth-century pieces from the Museum of Anthropology and Ethnology in Leningrad, as well as other rarely seen artworks from museums in Finland, Denmark, and Germany. The documentation accompanying each object includes the usual information about dimensions, media, and acquisition dates, in addition to valuable summaries of field notes by collectors and informative comment by the catalog's authors. One's understanding and appreciation of, for example, the Tlingit raven hat from Sitka (Pl. 259) is increased by de Laguna's discussion of the hat's social significance, an explanation based on Louis Shotridge's collection notes and Carpenter's discourse of the hat's mythological connotations.

Three clear but detailed maps provide the reader with a geographic context for this art. The first, a map of the circumpolar region, illustrates the relative distances between Alaska, Siberia, and Kamchatka; the second, a map of tribal distributions, shows the relationships of groups to one another; the third, a place map, gives the precise locations of each ethnographic village and archeological site mentioned in the book.

The essays in *The Far North* increase its value as an informative text on the art and cultures of the Alaskan groups. In "Athapaskan Art," de Laguna gives us insight into the artistic debt the Ingalik owe to the Eskimo; in "Tlingit Shamans," she summarizes the powers and functions of these Northwest Coast doctors. Peter Stone suggests, in "Tlingit Art," that this style illustrates both the complex social order and the profound mythic system of these people. Because they pose aesthetic questions as well as offer ethnographic information, the essays by Collins and Carpenter prove the most valuable for the reader interested in anthropological art.

In "Eskimo Art," Collins examines the history, technology, and art styles of the various archeological Eskimo cultures: Okvik, Old Bering Sea, Punuk, Birnik, Thule, Ipiutak, and South Alaska. He also discusses the masks, ivory and wood carvings, clothing and weaving, and pictographic art of the historical Eskimo. Throughout this detailed and thorough essay, Collins provides insightful aesthetic evaluations of individual pieces. For example, his reaction to an Okvik female figure (Pl. 4) is negative, since the piece "lacks the structural control and sensitivity" of other carvings of the same period (p. 5). He has great admiration, however, for the artworks of the Old Bering Sea III style and asserts that they have a "more balanced and harmonious arrangement of the overall design" than do the earlier Old Bering Sea II pieces (p. 6). Throughout this essay, Collins clearly defines the influences of each style on the one that followed, providing a valuable history of Eskimo art.

Edmund Carpenter, in "Some Notes on the Separate Realities of Eskimo and Indian Art," offers us, as we expect from him, interesting and fresh insights into the art of the North. Using the example of the typical Eskimo mask that represents two beings—one which predominates when the mask is held one way, the other when it is turned around—Carpenter proposes that the Eskimo artist's main interest is to depict simultaneously a host of characteristics, qualities, and meanings. Aesthetics for the Eskimo is "not a concept of becoming, not even a concept of metamorphosis of coming to be, but rather a sense of being where every form contains multitudes" (p. 284). If the reader is intrigued by this notion, he or she can turn back to the illustrations and enjoy the experience of turning Eskimo artworks around to see what different images emerge. For example, the Ipiutak comb (Pl. 21), right side up, illustrates a bear flanked by seals; when turned upside down, an anthropomorphic face appears: its eyes are the same as those of the bear; its nose and mouth are wrinkles in the bear's brow.

Carpenter also compares the significance of borders in Eskimo and Northwest Coast art. The Eskimo artist, who makes mobile-like masks with projecting elements that move gracefully with any motion of the wearer, seems to disregard borders, letting each mask "assert its own dimensions" (p. 284). In contrast, it is the border itself that determines the composition of the Northwest Coast artist's creation. The interplay between the borders, accented with "color, or copper, or abalone," and the representational images and abstract designs that those borders tightly restrain, creates a rhythm, tension, and energy unique to Northwest Coast art. After reading Carpenter's essay, one can gain a clear sense of the aesthetic qualities and unique characteristics of the art of each Alaskan group.

However, by concentrating on the uniqueness of each style, Carpenter and the other scholars who have contributed to this book say little about the similarities between those styles. This is unfortunate, since the particular assortment of objects illustrated here lends itself to interesting cross-cultural comparisons. While it is obviously important to understand the meaning of isolated objects and to define the elements that distinguish one style from another, it is equally valuable to speculate on the historical, and therefore aesthetic, connections between the groups who have created those separate styles.

For example, study of the various plates in *The Far North* reveals intriguing symbolic and stylistic connections between Northwest Coast and Eskimo-Aleut art. Several motifs we associate with Northwest Coast art also occur on archeological Eskimo pieces. A face or faces on the belly of some being, common in Northwest Coast art (see Pl. 279), appear on an Okvik female figure (Pl. 4). The image of one being ingesting an object or another being—the "devouring motif" (Pl. 322)—can be seen on the Ipiutak ivory chain (Pl. 26). And the "simultaneous image," in which two profiles constitute a frontal representation, is not unique to the Tlingit art illustrated in this catalog (Pl. 326) but occurs on the Ipiutak comb (Pl. 21) and the Ipiutak ornamental band (Pl. 19).

In addition to iconographic similarities, stylistic similarities occur between various Alaskan artworks. A "costume ornament in the form of a human head" (Pl. 47), excavated in 1931 on Kodiak Island, illustrates a relatively naturalistic anthropomorphic face surmounted by rectangular earlike forms. This type of animal-eared human face occurs with great frequency in Northwest Coast art. Two Tlingit masks (Pls. 312 and 131) represent such composite beings. All the Aleut wooden masks illustrated (Pls. 48–51) have typically Northwest Coast formline eyebrows; the mask in Plate 48 also has the equally characteristic pinched-eye form. It would have been most interesting had the authors of this catalog—specialists in different aspects of Alaskan cultures—engaged in a dialogue on these iconographic and stylistic similarities.

The Far North contains little art produced after the beginning of this century. Hilary Stewart's *Looking at Indian Art of the Northwest Coast* might thus be considered a companion piece, presenting as it does more recent Northwest Coast art. It must be pointed out here that Stewart's title is misleading; her book is not about how to look at all Northwest Coast art, but, primarily, how to look at the silkscreen prints currently being produced on the Coast. This book focuses on how these contemporary Indian printmakers incorporate traditional Northwest Coast stylistic rules and principles into their artworks.

In this regard, the chapter "Cultural Styles" is particularly interesting. Here Stewart points out how the printmakers in the 1970s, dissatisfied with the "rather general Northwest Coast style based largely on northern art" that had been in vogue in the 1960s and anxious to rediscover their tribal roots, tried to incorporate elements of their particular traditions into their artworks. Thus, Kwakiutl printmakers, heirs to an "exuberant," "flamboyant," and "dramatic" tradition, create similarly exciting prints of flying birds, writhing sisiutls, and scintillating suns (p. 97). Haida art, in contrast, had always been "monumental" and "classical"; modern Haida prints are accordingly restrained and understated.

Since her concern is with how tradition is expressed in art, Stewart unfortunately pays little attention to one school of Northwest Coast artists, which, by diverging somewhat from the past, has created an interesting and innovative style: the school of 'Ksan. Although Stewart briefly mentions certain characteristics of works by members of this group of Tsimshian artists, she fails to elaborate adequately on the significant changes from the controlled, sophisticated, and elegant traditional Tsimshian style to the personal, exciting, dynamic, and emotional contemporary 'Ksan style. In a book about modern printmaking, the significance of some of the most original modern printmakers should not be disregarded.

In the chapter "Structural Variations" Stewart brings up the same tendency of the Northwest Coast artist to fill up borders with designs that Carpenter mentions. Since the artist must sometimes disassemble the body parts of the illustrated being to make them fit into the prescribed border, his final artistic product is often almost totally abstract. Both the traditional artist, discussed by Carpenter, and the contemporary printmaker, discussed by Stewart, are fascinated by the possibilities of such distorting and squeezing. Plates 47 to 50 in Stewart's book present an interesting progression of the stylized renditions of a killer whale placed into a variety of borders. The first illustration shows a naturalistic whale in a rectangular border. The second killer whale, squeezed into a square border, becomes more distorted and angular. In the third plate, the animal's head has become enormous, while its body has been reduced to a blowhole and pectoral fin to fit into a narrow vertical frame. Finally, in the fourth illustration, a killer whale placed into a

circular border becomes a virtually unrecognizable but aesthetically appealing two-dimensional design.

As we have seen, Stewart has several interesting ideas to present; it is therefore unfortunate that she devotes so much space in this book to the ideas of others. For example, much of the longest section in this book, "Identification of Design Motifs," a description of the distinguishing features of animals and other beings illustrated on Northwest Coast art, is taken from Franz Boas's *Primitive Art*. Since many books and catalogs on Northwest Coast art have included this kind of how-to-tell-what-kind-of-animal-it-is information, Stewart need not have given it so much importance here. In her chapter "The Basic Components," Stewart describes stylistic elements of Northwest Coast art, such as the formline, ovoid, and u-form, correctly crediting Bill Holm for inventing this terminology. The reader would do much better to consult Holm's book, *Northwest Coast Indian Art* (1965), itself. Since Stewart's subject is new art, one wishes that she had offered us more new information on it.

Both Stewart and Carpenter raise the same difficult philosophical issue: the problem of evaluating the aesthetic and historical merits of contemporary Native American art made for the white art market. Carpenter criticizes this type of art as "spurious" and "spiritually meaningless" (p. 286). Stewart, in contrast, praises it because it continues the tradition of Northwest Coast art. As evidence for its validity, Stewart quotes Haida artist Robert Davidson: "the only way to keep a tradition alive is to keep inventing new things" (p. 12). She points out that silkscreen prints are offered as gifts at potlatches and "even invitations to attend the ceremonial events are specially designed and printed" (p. 16).

The question of the aesthetic validity of such "contemporary" art really tests the romanticism of one's attitudes toward the Indian. The noble savage, living in an enviably socially enclosed and spiritually meaningful universe, creating an art that integrally relates to his daily and religious life, no longer exists on the Northwest Coast. The natives of this area are trying to integrate their traditions with modern life; their creation of "contemporary Indian art" is both an expression of renewed ethnic pride and connection with their past (points stressed by Stewart) and a means of economic survival in a capitalist world. One must, of course, always dispassionately evaluate the aesthetic merit of any native art, traditional or modern. If, however, this art does have artistic worth, as do the prints illustrated in Stewart's book, it is sheer romanticizing to criticize it for being "inauthentically Indian" simply because it was made for a market in the modern world that the Northwest Coast Indians now inhabit.