# A Bayesian Joint Dispersion Model With Flexible Links 

Rui Martins

Egas Moniz Health School
Egas Moniz Interdisciplinary Research Center, Portugal

## Summary

(1)

## Background

- Longitudinal studies
- Outline
(2) HIV/AIDS Application
- Data
- Exploratory analysis
- Joint Model


## Questions of interest

- Biomarker, $Y_{1}$
- e.g. CD4 counts, collected repeatedly over time (longitudinal data)
- time to an event of interest, $Y_{2}$
- e.g. death from any cause (survival data)
- Separate Analysis
- does treatment affect survival?
- are the average longitudinal evolutions different between males and females?
- Joint Analysis
- what is the effect of the missing information due to drop-out in assessing the trends of the repeated measures?
- what is the effect of the longitudinal evolution of CD4 cell count in the hazard rate for death?


## Questions of interest

- Biomarker, $Y_{1}$
- e.g. CD4 counts, collected repeatedly over time (longitudinal data)
- time to an event of interest, $Y_{2}$
- e.g. death from any cause (survival data)
- Separate Analysis
- does treatment affect survival?
- are the average longitudinal evolutions different between males and females?
- Joint Analysis
- what is the effect of the missing information due to drop-out in assessing the trends of the repeated measures?
- what is the effect of the longitudinal evolution of CD4 cell count in the hazard rate for death?


## Questions of interest

- Biomarker, $Y_{1}$
- e.g. CD4 counts, collected repeatedly over time (longitudinal data)
- time to an event of interest, $Y_{2}$
- e.g. death from any cause (survival data)
- Separate Analysis
- does treatment affect survival?
- are the average longitudinal evolutions different between males and females?
- Joint Analysis
- what is the effect of the missing information due to drop-out in assessing the trends of the repeated measures?
- what is the effect of the longitudinal evolution of CD4 cell count in the hazard rate for death?


## Correlated data in longitudinal studies



If the two processes are associated $\Rightarrow$ define a model for their joint probability distribution: $f\left(y_{1}, y_{2}\right)$

## Analysing HIV/AIDS data through <br> A Bayesian Joint Dispersion Model with Flexible Links

## Data

- network of 88 laboratories located in every state in Brazil during Jan 2002 - Dec 2006;
- Sample: $n=500$ individuals; 2757 repeated measurements;
- Outcomes: CD4+ ${ }^{+}$lymphocyte counts, $Y$, and time-to-death, $T$;
- Covariates: age ( $<50=0, \geq 50=1$ ); sex (Female=0, Male=1); PrevOl (previous opportunistic infection at study entry=1, no previous infection=0); measurement times; date of diagnosis; date of death; failure indicator, $\delta$;
- Patients: 34 deaths. 88\% between 15 and 49 years old; 60\% males. 61\% no previous infection. Initial CD4 median: 269 cells $/ \mathrm{mm}^{3}$ (men- 250 cells $/ \mathrm{mm}^{3}$; women- 295 cells $/ \mathrm{mm}^{3}$ ).


## Longitudinal outcome

CD4 - counting evolution per number of exam


## Intra-individual variance (dispersion)



Individuals values of the $\sqrt{C D 4}$ vs Std. Deviation (ordered) suggests considerable within-subject variance heterogeneity. Individuals with higher $\sqrt{C D 4}$ values are associated with a higher variability.

## Longitudinal specification

- Mixed-effects dispersion model (McLain et al. 2012)

$$
\begin{align*}
y_{i j} \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}^{2} & \sim \mathcal{N}\left(m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right), \sigma_{i}^{2}\right), \quad j=1, \ldots, n_{i}  \tag{1}\\
m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right) & =\boldsymbol{\beta}_{1}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{1 i}\left(t_{i j}\right)+\boldsymbol{b}_{1 i}^{\top} \mathbf{w}_{1 i}\left(t_{i j}\right),  \tag{2}\\
\sigma_{i}^{2} & =\sigma_{0}^{2} \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{2}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{2 i}\left(t_{i j}\right)+\boldsymbol{b}_{2 i}^{\top} \mathbf{w}_{2 i}\left(t_{i j}\right)\right\}, \tag{3}
\end{align*}
$$

## Longitudinal specification

- Mixed-effects dispersion model (McLain et al. 2012)

$$
\begin{align*}
y_{i j} \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}^{2} & \sim \mathcal{N}\left(m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right), \sigma_{i}^{2}\right), \quad j=1, \ldots, n_{i}  \tag{1}\\
m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right) & =\boldsymbol{\beta}_{1}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{1 i}\left(t_{i j}\right)+\boldsymbol{b}_{1 i}^{\top} \mathbf{w}_{1 i}\left(t_{i j}\right),  \tag{2}\\
\sigma_{i}^{2} & =\sigma_{0}^{2} \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{2}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{2 i}\left(t_{i j}\right)+\boldsymbol{b}_{2 i}^{\top} \mathbf{w}_{2 i}\left(t_{i j}\right)\right\}, \tag{3}
\end{align*}
$$

- $\mathbf{y}_{i}=\left(y_{i 1}, \ldots, y_{i n_{i}}\right) \rightarrow n_{i}$ observed repeated measures, $\sqrt{C D 4}$
- $\mathbf{t}_{i}=\left(t_{i 1}, \ldots, t_{i n_{i}}\right) \rightarrow$ visiting times
- $\mathrm{x}_{1 i}, \mathrm{x}_{2 i}, \mathrm{w}_{1 i}$ and $\mathrm{w}_{2 i} \rightarrow$ individual covariates (time-dependent?)
- $\beta_{1}$ and $\beta_{2} \rightarrow$ population parameters
- $\left(\boldsymbol{b}_{1 i}^{\top}, \boldsymbol{b}_{2 i}^{\top}\right)=\boldsymbol{b}_{i} \mid \Sigma \sim \mathcal{N}_{p}(\mathbf{0}, \Sigma) \rightarrow$ time-independent random-effects


## Longitudinal outcome

$$
\sqrt{\mathrm{CD4}}_{i j} \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}^{2} \sim \mathcal{N}\left(m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right), \sigma_{i}^{2}\right)
$$

- Longitudinal mean

$$
\begin{equation*}
m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right)=\beta_{10}+\beta_{11} \text { sex }_{i}+\beta_{12} \text { age }_{i}+\beta_{13} \text { PrevOl }_{i}+\beta_{14} t_{i j}+b_{1 i, 1}+b_{1 i, 2} t_{i j} \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

- Dispersion model (3) may assume:

$$
\begin{align*}
& \sigma_{i}^{2}=\sigma_{0}^{2} \exp \left\{\beta_{21} \text { sex }+\beta_{22} \text { age }+\beta_{23} \operatorname{PrevOI}+b_{2 i}\right\}  \tag{5}\\
& \sigma_{i}^{2}=\sigma_{0}^{2} \exp \left\{b_{2 i}\right\}  \tag{6}\\
& \sigma_{i}^{2}  \tag{7}\\
& \sigma_{i}^{2}=\sigma_{0}^{2} \tag{8}
\end{align*}
$$

## - Priors

## Longitudinal outcome

$$
\sqrt{\mathrm{CD}}_{i j} \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}^{2} \sim \mathcal{N}\left(m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right), \sigma_{i}^{2}\right)
$$

- Longitudinal mean

$$
\begin{equation*}
m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right)=\beta_{10}+\beta_{11} \text { sex }_{i}+\beta_{12} \text { age }_{i}+\beta_{13} \text { PrevOl }_{i}+\beta_{14} t_{i j}+b_{1 i, 1}+b_{1 i, 2} t_{i j} \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

- Dispersion model (3) may assume:

$$
\begin{align*}
& \sigma_{i}^{2}=\sigma_{0}^{2} \exp \left\{\beta_{21} \text { sex }+\beta_{22} \text { age }+\beta_{23} \operatorname{PrevOI}+b_{2 i}\right\}  \tag{5}\\
& \sigma_{i}^{2}=\sigma_{0}^{2} \exp \left\{b_{2 i}\right\}  \tag{6}\\
& \sigma_{i}^{2}  \tag{7}\\
& \sigma_{i}^{2}=\sigma_{0}^{2} \tag{8}
\end{align*}
$$

- Priors
- $\beta_{1 p} \sim \mathcal{N}(0,100) ; p=0, \ldots, 4$ and $\beta_{2 q} \sim \mathcal{N}(0,100) ; q=1, \ldots, 3$
- $\boldsymbol{b}_{i} \mid \Sigma \sim \mathcal{N}_{p}(\mathbf{0}, \Sigma) ; \quad \Sigma^{-1} \sim \mathcal{W} \operatorname{ish}(R, \xi)$
- $\log \left(\sigma_{0}\right) \sim \mathcal{U}(-100,100)$; or $\log \left(\sigma_{i}\right) \sim \mathcal{U}(-100,100)$
- Other options: $1 / \sigma_{0}^{2} \sim \mathcal{G}(\epsilon, \epsilon)$ and $\sigma_{0} \mid \varpi \sim \mathrm{h}-\mathcal{C}(\varpi), \varpi \sim \mathcal{U}(0,100)$.


## Survival specification

- Time-dependent coefficients (Penalized cubic B-Splines)

$$
\begin{equation*}
h_{i}\left(t \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\}=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\varrho_{i}(t)\right\} \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$



## Survival specification

- Time-dependent coefficients (Penalized cubic B-Splines)

$$
\begin{equation*}
h_{i}\left(t \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\}=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\varrho_{i}(t)\right\} \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

- $\mathcal{C}_{i}\{.\} \rightarrow$ specifies which components of the longitudinal process are related to $h_{i}($.
- Link $\rightarrow$ Shared parameters - $b_{i}, \sigma_{i}$



## Survival specification

- Time-dependent coefficients (Penalized cubic B-Splines)

$$
\begin{equation*}
h_{i}\left(t \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\}=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\varrho_{i}(t)\right\} \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

- $\mathcal{C}_{i}\{.\} \rightarrow$ specifies which components of the longitudinal process
- Link $\rightarrow$ Shared parameters
- $\mathrm{x}_{3 i} \rightarrow$ baseline covariates
- $\beta_{3} \rightarrow$ population parameters
- $h_{0}(t) \rightarrow$ parametric (e.g. Weibull); P-Splines; Piecewise constant function.
- $\boldsymbol{g}(t)=\left(g_{1}(t), \ldots, g_{L}(t)\right) \rightarrow$ suitable vector of smooth functions (P-Splines) representing the time-dependent coefficients


## Time-to-death

$$
\begin{equation*}
h_{i}\left(t \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\}=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\varrho_{i}(t)\right\} \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

- all models

$$
\begin{equation*}
\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}=\beta_{31} \operatorname{sex}_{i}+\beta_{32} \text { age }_{i}+\beta_{33} \text { PrevOl }_{i} \tag{11}
\end{equation*}
$$

- $\mathcal{C}_{i}$ (.) may assume:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{C}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2}+g_{3}(t) b_{2 i} \\
& \mathcal{C}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2}+g_{3}(t) \sigma_{i} \\
& \mathcal{C}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2}
\end{aligned}
$$

- $g_{1}(t), g_{2}(t), g_{3}(t) \rightarrow$ Penalized Splines with 19 internal knots.
- 3 scenarios for $h_{0}(t)=\log \left(g_{0}(t)\right) \rightarrow$ Weibull, Penalized Splines or piecewise constant


## Time-to-death

$$
\begin{equation*}
h_{i}\left(t \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\}=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\varrho_{i}(t)\right\} \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

- all models

$$
\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}=\beta_{31} \operatorname{sex}_{i}+\beta_{32} \text { age }_{i}+\beta_{33} \operatorname{PrevOl}_{i}
$$

- $\mathcal{C}_{i}($. $)$ may assume:

$$
\begin{align*}
& \mathcal{C}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2}+g_{3}(t) b_{2 i}  \tag{12}\\
& \mathcal{C}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2}+g_{3}(t) \sigma_{i}  \tag{13}\\
& \mathcal{C}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2} \tag{14}
\end{align*}
$$

- $g_{1}(t), g_{2}(t), g_{3}(t) \rightarrow$ Penalized Splines with 19 internal knots.
- 3 scenarios for $h_{0}(t)=\log \left(g_{0}(t)\right) \rightarrow$ Weibull, Penalized Splines or piecewise constant


## Time-to-death

$$
\begin{equation*}
h_{i}\left(t \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\}=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\varrho_{i}(t)\right\} \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

- all models

$$
\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}=\beta_{31} \operatorname{sex}_{i}+\beta_{32} \text { age }_{i}+\beta_{33} \operatorname{PrevOl}_{i}
$$

- $\mathcal{C}_{i}($.$) may assume:$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{C}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2}+g_{3}(t) b_{2 i} \\
& \boldsymbol{c}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2}+g_{3}(t) \sigma_{i} \\
& \boldsymbol{C}_{i}(.)=g_{1}(t) b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2}(t) b_{1 i, 2}
\end{aligned}
$$

- $g_{1}(t), g_{2}(t), g_{3}(t) \rightarrow$ Penalized Splines with 19 internal knots.
- $g_{l}(t)=\sum_{q=1}^{19} \gamma_{l q} B_{l q}(t), \quad l=1,2,3$
- $\gamma_{l 1} \sim \mathcal{N}(0,1000), \quad \gamma_{l q} \mid \tau_{l}^{2} \sim \mathcal{N}\left(\gamma_{l, q-1}, \tau_{l}^{2}\right), \quad q=2, \ldots, 19$
- $1 / \tau_{l}^{2} \sim \mathcal{G}(0.001,0.001), l=0,1,2,3$.
- 3 scenarios for $h_{0}(t)=\log \left(g_{0}(t)\right) \rightarrow$ Weibull, Penalized Splines or piecewise constant


## Time-to-death

$$
\begin{equation*}
h_{i}\left(t \mid \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\}=h_{0}(t) \exp \left\{\varrho_{i}(t)\right\} \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

- all models

$$
\beta_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}=\beta_{31} \operatorname{sex}_{i}+\beta_{32} \text { age }_{i}+\beta_{33} \operatorname{PrevOl}_{i}
$$

- $\mathcal{C}_{i}$ (.) may assume:
- 3 scenarios for $h_{0}(t)=\log \left(g_{0}(t)\right) \rightarrow$ Weibull, Penalized Splines or piecewise constant


## Joint likelihood

We consider:

- $\mathbf{y}_{i}\left|\boldsymbol{b}_{i} \perp T_{i}\right| \boldsymbol{b}_{i} ; \quad y_{i j}\left|\boldsymbol{b}_{i} \perp y_{i l}\right| \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, j \neq l$
- non-informative right censoring

$$
L(\boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{b}, \boldsymbol{\sigma} \mid \mathcal{D})=\prod_{i=1}^{N}\left(\prod_{j=1}^{n_{i}} p\left(y_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right) \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}^{2}\right)\right) p\left(T_{i}, \delta_{i} \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)
$$

where

- $\mathcal{D}=\left\{\mathcal{D}_{i}\right\}_{i=1}^{N}=\left\{\left(\mathbf{y}_{i}, \mathbf{t}_{i}, T_{i}, \delta_{i}\right)\right\}_{i=1}^{N} \rightarrow$ observed data for the $N$ independent individuals
- $\boldsymbol{\theta} \rightarrow$ other parameters;
- $p(.) \rightarrow$ suitable density function


## Joint likelihood

## We consider:

- $\mathbf{y}_{i}\left|\boldsymbol{b}_{i} \perp T_{i}\right| \boldsymbol{b}_{i} ; \quad y_{i j}\left|\boldsymbol{b}_{i} \perp y_{i l}\right| \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, j \neq l$
- non-informative right censoring

$$
L(\boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{b}, \boldsymbol{\sigma} \mid \mathcal{D})=\prod_{i=1}^{N}\left(\prod_{j=1}^{n_{i}} p\left(y_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right) \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}^{2}\right)\right) p\left(T_{i}, \delta_{i} \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)
$$

where

$$
p\left(y_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right) \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}^{2}\right)=\frac{1}{\sqrt{2 \pi \sigma_{i}^{2}}} \exp \left\{-\frac{\left[y_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right)-m_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right)\right]^{2}}{2 \sigma_{i}^{2}}\right\}
$$

## Joint likelihood

## We consider:

- $\mathbf{y}_{i}\left|\boldsymbol{b}_{i} \perp T_{i}\right| \boldsymbol{b}_{i} ; \quad y_{i j}\left|\boldsymbol{b}_{i} \perp y_{i l}\right| \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, j \neq l$
- non-informative right censoring

$$
L(\boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{b}, \boldsymbol{\sigma} \mid \mathcal{D})=\prod_{i=1}^{N}\left(\prod_{j=1}^{n_{i}} p\left(y_{i}\left(t_{i j}\right) \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}^{2}\right)\right) p\left(T_{i}, \delta_{i} \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)
$$

where

$$
\begin{aligned}
p\left(T_{i}, \delta_{i} \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)= & h\left(T_{i} \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right)^{\delta_{i}} \times S\left(T_{i} \mid \boldsymbol{\theta}, \boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i}\right) \\
= & {\left[h_{0}\left(T_{i}\right) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\}\right]^{\delta_{i}} \times } \\
& \exp \left\{-\int_{0}^{T_{i}} h_{0}(u) \exp \left\{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{3}^{\top} \mathbf{x}_{3 i}+\mathcal{C}_{i}\left\{\boldsymbol{b}_{i}, \sigma_{i} ; \boldsymbol{g}(t)\right\}\right\} d u\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Models comparison

MCMC simulation within WinBUGS.

| Longitudinal model |  | Survival model |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $m_{i}$ | $\sigma_{i}^{2}$ | $\varrho_{i}(t)$ | $h_{0}$ |  |  |
|  |  |  | Weibull | P-Spline | Piecewise |
| (4) | (5) | $(11)+(12)$ | 14671 | 12573 | 14317 |
| (4) | (6) | (11) + (12) | 14700 | 12848 | 14483 |
| (4) | (5) |  | 14307 | 12605 | 13365 |
| (4) | (6) | $+(13)$ | 14452 | 12917 | 13571 |
| (4) | (7) | + (13) | 13134 | 12104 \% | 12921 |
| (4) | (8) |  | 13956 | 12887 | 13533 |
| (4) | (5) |  | 14811 | 13334 | 14463 |
| (4) | (6) | $(11)+(14)$ | 14923 | 13688 | 14599 |
| (4) | (7) | +(14) | 14314 | 13144 | 13968 |
| (4) | (8) |  | 14627 | 13553 | 14355 |
| (4) | (8) | $(11)+g_{1} b_{1 i, 1}+g_{2} b_{1 i, 2}$ | 16984 | 15779 | 16383 |

Tabela: WAIC values for the 33 joint models.
Best fit $\Rightarrow$ share the individual random-effects and the individual std-deviation considered as a covariate for the hazard model (Model \&). The heteroscedasticity is related to the survival time.

## Posterior estimates for the time-dependent coefficients



Figure 1: Posterior mean estimates, together with the corresponding 95\% Credible Bands (CB), for the selected model \%. The top left panel shows $g_{0}=\log \left(h_{0}\right)$ and the subsequent panels have the time-varying regression coefficients as a function of time in years, $t$.

## Brezger, A., and Lang, S.

Simultaneous probability statements for bayesian p-splines.
Statistical Modelling 8, 2 (2008), 141-168.
Faucett, C. L., and Thomas, D. C.
Simultaneously modelling censored survival data and repeatedly measured covariates: a gibbs sampling approach. Statistics in Medicine 15, 15 (Aug 1996), 1663-1685.

Ibrahim, J. G., Chen, M. H., and Sinha, D.
Bayesian Survival Analysis.
Springer-Verlag, 2001.
Lang, S., and Brezger, A.
Bayesian p-splines.
Journal of Computational and Graphical Statistics 13, 1 (2004), 183-212.
Lunn, D., Thomas, A., Best, N., and Spiegelhalter, D.
Winbugs - a bayesian modelling framework: Concepts, structure, and extensibility.
Statistics and Computing 10 (2000), 325-337.
McLain, A. C., Lum, K. J., and Sundaram, R.
A joint mixed effects dispersion model for menstrual cycle length and time-to-pregnancy.
Biometrics 68, 2 (Feb 2012), 648-656.
Rizopoulos, D.
Joint Models for Longitudinal and Time-to-Event Data With Applications in R.
Chapman and Hall/CRC, 2012.

## Thank you!

