An Explorative Chapter on Translation and Translation Studies

(Module One)

by

WING BO TSO

A research training and subject preparation paper submitted to
The University of Birmingham
in part fulfillment of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Applied Linguistics

Centre for English Language Studies
School of English, Drama and American & Canadian Studies
College of Arts and Law
The University of Birmingham
November 2010

Modules 1 and 2

Module 3 is in a separate file

Abstract

The objectives of this chapter are three-fold: firstly, it serves as a literature review for Modules Two and Three. In the first part of the chapter, existing theories on translation are explored, and issues such as the quest for equivalence and the problem of untranslatability are discussed.

The second objective of the chapter is to analyze the translation strategies commonly employed by translators. The analysis in sections 1.8, 1.9 and 1.10 is based on the translation strategies applied in the Chinese translation of Philip Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995). The syntactic, semantic and pragmatic structures of the expressions in English and Chinese are compared and contrasted.

The third objective of the chapter is to give an overview of the basic concepts of the study of ideology and translation. The politics of language, the relationships between gender stereotypes and linguistics forms, as well as the intervention, censorship and manipulation in translation of children's literature are examined.

Total number of words: 155

An Exploratory Chapter on Translation and Translation Studies

(Module One)

Table of Contents:

PART ONE: ON TRANSLATION

PART TWO: ON TRANSLATION STUDIES

An Exploratory Chapter on Translation and Translation Studies
(Module One)

> The Lord said, "If as one people speaking the same language they have begun to do this, then nothing they plan to do will be impossible for them. Come, let us go down and confuse their language so they will not understand each other."
>
> (Genesis 11: 6 – 7)

1. What is Translation?

The word *translation* comes from the Latin word *translatio*, originally derived from the perfect passive participle, *translatus* of the Latin verb – *transferre. Transferre*, meaning 'to transfer' in English, is formed by two parts, 'trans' and 'ferre'. In English, the prefix 'trans' means 'across', whereas 'ferre' means 'to carry' or 'to bring'. *Transferre*, therefore, also means 'to carry across' or 'to bring across' in English (Kasparek, 1983: 83).

However, the term *translation* means much more than 'to transfer', 'to carry across' and to 'bring across'. First of all, there are two different streams of translation, namely written translation and oral translation, though the latter is more commonly known as interpreting or interpretation. Also, the term *translation* can be used to refer to the general subject

field (Munday, 2001), the product (the text that has been translated) or the process (the act of producing the translation, otherwise known as translating) (Hatim and Munday, 2004).

1.1.Types of Translation: Jakobson's Semiotic Classification

On top of the distinction between written translation and oral translation, as well as the three different senses of relating translation as a general subject field, a product or a process, there are also three semiotic categories of translation, as defined by Roman Jakobson (1959 / 2000), the Czech structuralist and linguist,

1. **intralingual** translation, or 'rewording': 'an interpretation of verbal signs by means of other signs of the same language';
2. **interlingual** translation, or 'translation proper': 'an interpretation of verbal signs by means of some other language';
3. **intersemiotic** translation, or 'transmutation': 'an interpretation of verbal signs by means of signs of non-verbal sign systems'. (114)

To put it in another way, intralingual translation is to explain, declare, rephrase or paraphrase a term or an expression in the same language, either in oral or written form. For instance, what I am trying to do here (to explain the meaning of intralingual translation in English) is already a kind of intralingual translation. Another common example of intralingual translation is the English definitions found in an English dictionary, which help to explain English words. Interlingual translation, on the other hand, is to translate or interpret a term, an expression or a text into another language. It is the kind of translation that most people have in mind when the term 'translation' is

mentioned, used and referred to. Finally, intersemiotic translation refers to what is called 'adaptation' nowadays. For example, when a written text such as Jane Austen's *Pride and Prejudice* is made into a film or a TV series, an intersemiotic translation has occurred.

Regarding the focus of the thesis, in this section, I shall limit my discussion only to the process of producing written interlingual translation.

1.2. Translation, or the Process of Producing Written Interlingual Translation

Translation, according to the Encyclopaedia Britannica, is "the act or process of rendering what is expressed in one language or set of symbols (the 'source text' or ST) by means of another language or set of symbols (the 'target text', TT or 'translation')" (1974). On the notion of 'rendering what is expressed' in the ST, Bassnett (2002) gives an even more specific description, which is,

> …to ensure that (1) the surface meaning of the two [ST and TT] will be approximately similar and (2) the structures of the SL [source language] will be preserved as closely as possible but not so closely that the TL [target language] structures will be seriously distorted (11).

Having said so, it is not easy to ensure both, for there often is the dilemma of translating 'word-for-word' (literal translation) or 'sense-for-sense' (free translation). This dilemma in translation, which I will discuss more in the next section, has been compared to the idea of mistresses, "Translations are like mistresses: those that are beautiful are not faithful, while those that are faithful are not beautiful (quand elles sont belles, elles ne

3

sont pas fideles; quand elles sons fideles, elles ne sont pas belles)" (Davis 1996: 31). The metaphor may be shallow and sexist, but it is accurate in pointing out the fact that for most of the time, a translator has to struggle to gain a balance between the two. Translation in this light, as Umberto Eco describes, is negotiation (2003).

1.3. The Quest for Equivalence: Equivalence as Sameness?

It is said that "[t]ranslation is the replacement of a representation of a text in one language by a representation of an **equivalent** text in a second language" (Hartmann and Stork, 1972: 113. My emphasis). Whether it is free or literal translation, and whether it is among readers, translators and critics, the notion of **equivalent effect** has been one of the major concerns in decades. The first and foremost concerns are: What is meant by translation equivalence? Does equivalence mean absolute sameness between TT and ST in all aspects, including form, meaning, style, desired effect, etc.? If so, translation (TT) with one hundred percent equivalence means it is identical to the original work (ST). All kinds of translation strategies, such as addition, deletion, compensation (improving, enriching and / or rewriting "in order not to miss an important detail" (Eco, 2003: 47)), censoring, and worst of all, manipulation and mistranslation of the ST, are, in this sense, flaws that reduce the level of absolute sameness. Any shifts and changes made are unfavourable. However, if translation has to be geared towards absolute sameness, it will be a frustrating and painful task for translators, if not impossible. Holmes (1988) criticizes that the term 'equivalence' is 'perverse', because it is too much to ask for sameness.

1.4. The Problem of Untranslatabilty

Describing translation equivalence as 'perverse' maybe exaggerating, but the view that 'sameness is impossible in translation' is shared by others too. For instance, as opposed to the universalists, Whorfian linguists claim that thinking is determined by language. It is claimed that "the world is differently experienced and conceived in different language communities", and that "language actually causes these differences" in cognition (Cole and Scriber, 1974: 41). Untranslatability is therefore unavoidable. Sameness between ST and TT is deemed impossible, and hence, translation between one language and another is always problematic. Though the Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis has not gained the consent of all, and that cultural gaps can be bridgeable to some extent, what is undeniable is that untranslatability does exist.

On untranslatability, Catford (1965 / 2000) notices there are two categories of untranslatability. One is on the linguistic level, whereas the other is on the cultural level. Linguistic untranslatability occurs when "there is no lexical or syntactical substitute in the TL for an SL item" (Bassnett, 2002: 37), while cultural intranslatability occurs when there is an absence in the TL culture of a relevant situational feature for the ST. Popovic (1976) offers an even more detailed set of guidelines for defining untranslatability. According to Popovic, untranslatability can be classified under two situations,

1. A situation in which the linguistic elements of the original cannot be replaced adequately in structural, linear, functional or semantic terms in consequence of a lack of denotation or connotation.

2. A situation where the relation of expressing the meaning, i.e. the relation between the creative subject and its linguistic expression in the original does not find an adequate linguistic expression in the translation. (Cited in Bassnett, 2002: 34)

The untranslatability under the first situation is purely of linguistic nature. For example, the Chinese word 叔叔 [*su-su*], which refers specifically to the younger brother of one's father, is linguistically untranslatable in English. Even though English users will have no problem understanding the meaning of 叔叔 [*su-su*], and that the Chinese word can be adequately translated into English, the semantic item does not exist in English. Nonetheless, this untranslatability is straightforward and relatively easy to render.

On the other hand, the second kind of unstranslatability suggested by Porpovic is beyond linguistics and therefore more problematic. One example is the Chinese phrase 人在江湖. When literally translated, these words mean "a man in rivers and lakes". However, in fact, this Chinese phrase is a truncated part of a popular rhetorical figure in Chinese folklore called 歇後語 [*xie-hou-yu*]. Xie-hou-yu often appears in two parts. The first part is a figurative phrase, and the second part carries the real meaning, which is usually left unspoken (Jin Di, 2003). On hearing the first part, most speakers of Chinese will immediately think of the second part, where the real point of the saying lies. For 人在江湖 (a man in rivers and lakes), the second part is 身不由己 , meaning "I have no control over things". In light of this, instead of translating 人在江湖 as "a man in rivers and lakes", a better translation can be "this is life, I have no choice." Or, "You can't control everything in the traits' world." Although an adequate expression can be rendered in the

TL (i.e. English), the implicitness and simplicity in the ST have lost. The rhetoric form and essence of the xie-hou-yu cannot be preserved in the translation.

With the existence of untranslatability, absolute sameness in terms of meaning, style and linguistic structure (grammar, vocabulary, etc) is unachievable. Worse still, translated works that are viewed as accurate at one period of time may be accused of being 'unfaithful' and 'incorrect' at another time, because as most postmodernists would agree, under socio-cultural constraints, the signified of signifiers are always shifting. The ever changing ideological positions and attitudes in discourse indicate that the ideal of sameness is invalid and unreachable. In a nutshell, having all aspects considered, it is better to understand the notion of equivalence as similarity or relative similarity.

1.5. Equivalence as Similarity: A See-saw Game Between Accuracy and Fluency

However, defining translation equivalence as similarity or relative similarity also brings on enquiries and debates. First of all, should equivalence oriented towards the ST, or should it be tailored to the reader's linguistic needs and cultural expectations? In *The Art of Translation* (1957 / 1968), Savory identifies six problem areas in translation,

> (1a) A translation must give the words of the original.
> (1b) A translation must give the ideas of the original.
>
> (2a) A Translation should read like an original work.
> (2b) A translation should read like a translation.
>
> (3a) A translation should reflect the style of the original.
> (3b) A translation should possess the style of the translation.

7

(4a) A translation should read as a contemporary of the original.
(4b) A translation should read as a contemporary of the translation.

(5a) A translation may never add to or omit from the original.
(5b) A translation may add or omit from the original.

(6a) A translation of verse should be in verse.
(6b) A translation of verse should be in prose. (1968:50)

By showing these contrasting pairs, Savory makes it clear that the process of translation is a negotiation between being faithful to the original (ST) and keeping the naturalness and fluency in the translated works (TT). Towards the end of his chapter (1968), he proposes that the expected readership is the key. For readers who know nothing about the SL, a free translation should be given; for readers who once knew the SL but have forgotten most of the early knowledge, a translation that 'sounds like a translation' can be made; as for scholars who know the SL and ST well, a translation with 'occasional touches of scholarship' can be given.

Similarly, when approaching the dilemma of whether equivalence should orient towards the original or the reader's linguistic needs and cultural expectations, Nida introduces "two basic orientations": (1) formal equivalence, and (2) dynamic equivalence. As Nida defines,

> Formal equivalence focuses attention on the message itself, in both form and content…One is concerned that the message in the receptor language should match as closely as possible the different elements in the source language. (1964: 159)

Simply put, Nida's formal equivalence aims at retaining as much accuracy and correctness as possible. It emphasizes the ST over the TT, even when it has to distort "the

8

grammatical and stylistic patterns of the receptor language" (Nida and Taber, 1969: 201).

Dynamic equivalence, however, places the target reader and the receptor's needs in the first priority,

> Dynamic equivalence is…to be defined in terms of the degree to which the receptors of the message in the receptor language respond to it in substantially the same manner as the receptors in the source language. This response can never be identical, for the cultural and historical settings are too difficult…(1969: 24)

As Hatim puts it, in achieving Nida's dynamic equivalence, the following procedures should be done,

- Substituting more appropriate target-language cultural material for less accessible source-language items.
- Making references which are implicit in the source text linguistically explicit in the target language.
- Regulating redundancy in order to facilitate comprehension. (2001: 19)

In short, for dynamic equivalence, comprehensibility comes first and the form of the ST follows. Each type of equivalence serves different purposes. Whether equivalence should gear towards the ST or vice versa, there is no easy answer. The translator must judge, under circumstances, whether the translated works ought to be more form-bound (Formal equivalence) or content-bound (Dynamic equivalence).

1.6. Typology and Hierarchy of Equivalence

Besides the issue regarding accuracy versus comprehensibility, there is also another query: In the sea of linguistic studies, there are at least ten core branches, which one shall

find in the table of contents of any introductory course-book of linguistics – phonetics, phonology, morphology, syntax, semantics, pragmatics, sociolinguistics, psycholinguistics, textlinguistics and contrastive linguistics. There are a wide range of linguistic variables with which you can compare between the ST and the TT. If translation is, as Bell defines, "the expressions in another language (or target language) of what has been expressed in another, source language, preserving **semantic** and **stylistic** equivalences" (1993: 5. My emphasis), then equivalence can be looked for in terms of the bigotry of semantics and style. The most detailed and specific search, however, can dig much deeper. For instance, between a poem (ST) and its TT, the equivalence in rhyme scheme, types of rhyme, onomatopoeia, sound symbolism, metre, rhythm, etc., can be looked into in terms of form and meaning. What is at issue is: how many classifications of equivalence can there be? What is the focal point of each classification of equivalence? Koller (1976 / 1979) tries to give an answer to these two questions by suggesting five types of equivalence,

1. **Denotative equivalence**, which focuses on the equivalence of the extralinguistic content of a text. Situation, subject field, time, place, receiver, sender and affective implications such as humour, irony and emotion are included in this category (Reiss, 1971).

2. **Connotative equivalence**, which concentrates on lexical choices, especially between near-synonyms. For instance, items such as dialect, register and specific terminology are investigated.

3. **Text-normative equivalence**, deals with the equivalence of text varieties or genres.

4. **Pragmatic equivalence**, or Nida's dynamic equivalence, which is related to fluency, naturalness and comprehensibility of the TT.

5. **Formal equivalence**, which works on the form and aesthetics of the ST. It is said that word plays and the individual stylistic features of the ST are also included, and it should not be confused with Nida's formal equivalence (Munday, 2001).

In Nida's definition of translation, it is claimed that the equivalence of meaning should be on top of the equivalence of style, "Translating consists in reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the source-language message, **first in terms of meaning and second in terms of style**" (1969 / 1982: 12. My emphasis). This could imply that there is a preference or even a hierarchy of equivalence. Nevertheless, the typology of equivalence shown above is not listed according to an ascending or descending level of significance. It is not arranged in the form of a hierarchy. Rather, it is a neutral display of how many categories of equivalence can there be.

Having said so, for each particular translation task, there are priorities of equivalence. Though the reader, client and / or receptor may not be totally satisfied with the translator's judgment, a translator should judge, according to the aim and context of the ST, and set a unique hierarchy of equivalence for each translation task.

1.7. Translation Strategies

Translation strategies, sometimes called translation shifts, are methods with which translators use to translate the ST into the TT. It "involve[s] the basic tasks of choosing the foreign text to be translated and developing a method to translate it" (Venuti, 1998: 240). In the following, the most common syntactic, semantic and pragmatic strategies will be discussed. They shall be of great use as it comes to chapter four in Module Three, when gender representations of Philip Pullman's *His Dark Materials* (1995 – 2000) and its Chinese translation (2002) are compared and discussed. As I go through the list of translation strategies, I shall attempt to find examples from Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995) and its Chinese translation (2002) for illustrating each strategy. When examples cannot be found from Pullman's work and its Chinese version, I shall cite examples used in other references.

1.8. Syntactic Strategies

In linguistics, syntax is the study of grammatical rules that govern the structure of sentences. Translation approaches with a particular focus on the syntax are called syntactic strategies. The most common syntactic strategies that can be found in translated works are: (1) literal translation, (2) borrowing, (3) calque, (4) transposition, (5) unit change, (6) structural change, (7) cohesion change and (8) rhetorical scheme change.

1.8.1. Literal translation

This method is commonly known as word-for-word translation. It is, as described by Lambert (1998), "ideally the segmentation of the SL text into individual words and TL rendering of those word-segments one at a time" (125). However, at the text level, the TT will become unreadable unless compromises are made – thus, when translating, individual words and the word order of the ST are kept only when it is possible. Here is an example of literal translation from Philip Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995) and its Chinese translation (2002).

Original:
"Happy now? <u>Can we go</u>?" he whispered. (1995:4)

The Chinese translation is:
「開心　　了　　吧？　<u>我們　可以　走　　了</u>　　嗎？」他　　悄聲　　說。

The word-to-word back translation is:
"(Happy) (already) (right)? <u>(We)　(can)　(go)</u>　(already)　(right)?" (he) (softly) (said).

The back translation in standard English is:
"Feel happy now? <u>Can we go</u>?" he said softly.

In the example above, the TT has followed the ST's individual words and word order as closely as possible. Yet, constrained by the Chinese word order, the subject verb inversion "Can we go?" in the ST, for instance, cannot be retained.

1.8.2. Borrowing

It is said that borrowing foreign terms from the source language is the simplest among all translation strategies. According to Vinay and Darbelnet (2000), sometimes, a translator may use borrowing "to introduce the flavour of the source language (SL) culture into a translation" (85). At other times, older borrowings are used "as they have become a part of the respective TL lexicon" (ibid). For instance, French words such as "menu", "chic", "rendezvous" were borrowed and widely used in English. They are now in the English language lexicon. One example of borrowing that I can see in Philip Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995) and its Chinese translation (2002) is that "a miniature lion" (2005: 61) in the ST is translated into 「<u>迷你</u>獅子」(2002: 92) in the TT. While 獅子 means 'lion' in Chinese, 迷你 (pronounced as *mi-ni*) is a borrowed word from the English prefix 'mini'.

1.8.3. Calque

Hatim and Munday (2004) describe the method of 'calque' as "a special kind of borrowing whereby a language borrows an expression form of another, but then translates literally each of its elements" (149). There can be two kinds of calque. The first one is at the lexical level. In keeping the syntactic structure of the TL, a lexical calque introduces a new mode of expression. The second kind of calque is at the structural level. It introduces a new construction into the language (ibid). An English-Chinese calque can be found in the TT of Pullman's *The Golden Compass*.

14

Source language: "<u>Den-Dutch</u> words"

Target language: <u>沼澤 – 荷蘭</u>區的俚語

Immediate back translation: "<u>(Den) – (Dutch)</u> (territory) (possessive) (slang)"

Back translation in standard English: "<u>Den-Dutch</u> slang"

Chinese readers will find the structure of the phrase in the TT slightly unnatural, because in Chinese, normally, "Den-Dutch" should be translated as below:

Target language: <u>荷蘭 沼澤</u> 區

Immediate back translation: "<u>(Dutch) (Den)</u> (Territory)"

Back translation in standard English: "<u>Den-Dutch</u> territory"

In the syntax of Chinese, 'Dutch' should come first, 'Den' should follow because the den is a region or territory belonging to the Dutch. Also, the hyphen in between is not necessary. In this example, it seems that the translator would like to use the method of 'calque' to create a particular syntactic effect, making the TT closer to the ST in form and meaning.

1.8.4. Transposition

Transposition involves a change in grammar from the SL to the TL. The change can be (1) a change of singular to plural; (2) a change when a specific SL structure does not exist in the TL, and (3) a change of an SL verb to a TL noun, a change of an SL noun group to a TL noun and so forth. (Newmark, 1988b) The Chinese translator of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* also uses this technique. Firstly, since all Chinese nouns, when used

without quantifiers, are normally expressed as singular, the most common type of transposition that occurs is the change of plural to singular in the TT. Numerous examples can be found in just one page. For instance, plural words like "decks", "Hollanders", "regions", "eels", "channels", "creeks" and "watercourses" (1995: 112) are all transposed as singular in the TT.

The transposition of a SL adjective to a TL noun can also be seen in the TT. In chapter seven of the novel, Ma Costa comments on Lyra, "<u>Deceptive</u>, that's what you are, child." (1995: 113. My emphasis) 'Deceptive' is an adjective in English (SL), yet in the TT, it is translated as 「欺騙」(Back translation: '<u>Deception</u>'), which is a noun in Chinese (TL).

1.8.5. Unit Change

Unit change takes place when equal-rank equivalence between SL and TL cannot be kept, and that translation equivalence can only be achieved through changes of rank among sentences, clauses, groups, words and morphemes in the TL. As Hatim and Munday (2004) point out, when unit change occurs (which they call 'rank shift', 'change of rank' or 'unit-shifts'), "the translation equivalent of a unit at one rank in the SL is a unit at a different rank in the TL" (146). For instance, "[a]n SL group may have a TL clause as its translation equivalent, and so on" (ibid: 145) It is not difficult to see the technique of unit change in the Chinese translation (2002) of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995). One typical example of unit change can be found in chapter twelve – "That was *intercision*" (1995: 214) in the ST is translated as "這就是 <u>「切割」</u>的意義" in the TT. 'Intercision' is a noun, but with the method of unit change, the SL noun has become a noun phrase in

the TT, '「切割」的意義', which means 'the meaning of intercision' when translated

back into English.

1.8.6. Structural Change

As Al-Zoubi and Al-Hassnawi (2001) analyze, a structure can be realized and described

through the sequence of elements (i.e. order) and the class of these elements (i.e. parts of

speech). For example, the structure of the sentence "Tom plays the piano." can be

analyzed as follows: it consists of three elements, namely a proper noun (Tom), a verb

(plays), a definite article (the) and a noun (piano), which follow the sequence of noun

(subject)-verb-noun (object). In light of this, the structural change in translation can be

described as the changes made in the sequence and class of parts of speech in the TT. In

the Chinese translation (2002) of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), the use of

structural change is frequent. One example can be found in chapter fifteen, "…there was

no mistake" (1995: 265) is translated as 「錯不了的。」in Chinese. 「錯不了的。」,

when translated back into English, means "wrong it cannot be". A structural change has

occurred here because firstly, there is a change in the order of the parts of speech;

secondly, there is also a change in the class of parts of speech, i.e. the noun 'mistake' has

shifted to become 'wrong', an adjective.

1.8.7. Cohesion Change

Cohesion is the lexical and grammatical link that holds a text together. Unlike coherence, which deals with the relations between meaning and context, cohesion has more to do with the relations among surface linguistic forms (Halliday and Hassan, 1976). On the syntactic level, cohesion refers to the links in the grammar and structural content, which may occur in the form of references, ellipsis and substitution (ibid). Cohesion changes in translation, therefore, refer to the change of references, ellipsis and substitution in the TT. In chapter seventeen of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), there is a cohesion change in line one. In "<u>Lyra</u> moaned and trembled uncontrollably, just as if <u>she</u> had been pulled out of water…" (1995: 281), 'she' is the anaphoric reference that refers to 'Lyra', the protagonist. However, in the Chinese version (2002), the line is translated as 「<u>萊拉</u>無法控制地呻吟和發抖，彷彿從冰凍的水裡被拉出來」. When literally translated back into English, it is,

萊拉　　無法控制地　呻吟　和　　發抖，彷彿　從　　冰凍的水裡　　被拉出來
Lyra　　uncontrollably moaned and trembled, as if　from　cold water　　　pulled out

The anaphoric reference 'she' is lost in the TT.

1.8.8. Rhetorical Scheme Change

Rhetorical schemes refer to the arrangement of individual sounds, as well as the arrangement of words and sentence structures (Abrams, 1999). Rhetorical scheme change,

in this light, refers to the change in the deviation in the TT. For instance, in Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), the rhetorical scheme known as apposition is used when Lord Asriel's daemon is first introduced, "Lord Asriel's daemon, a snow leopard, stood behind him" (1995: 11). However, in the TT, this line is translated as 「艾塞列公爵的精靈是隻雪豹，正站在他的身後。」(2002: 31). When translated back into English, it is, "Lord Asriel's daemon is a snow leopard. It stood behind him". Because of the syntax of the TL, the apposition in the ST cannot be translated in the TT. In order to keep the relevant translation equivalence, a rhetorical scheme change has to take place in the TT.

.

1.9. Semantic Strategies

Semantic translation, as Newmark defines, "is a mode of text transfer which involves using the bare syntactic and semantic constraints of the TL to reproduce the precise contextual meaning of the author" (1981 / 1988: 22). Semantic strategies can therefore be regarded as translation methods which pay particular attention to the meaning of the ST. There are eight commonly used semantic strategies in translation. They are (1) using a synonym, (2) using an antonym, (3) using a hyponym / superordinate, (4) condensing, (5) expanding, (6) modulation and (7) rhetorical trope change.

1.9.1. Using a Synonym

Commonly defined as different words with the same or similar meanings (Harmon and Holman, 1996), synonyms, as Aitchison (1996) points out, are dictated by the

surrounding context. The chances of having a total overlap of meaning (perfect synonymy) are rare, if not impossible. It is common that synonyms are similar in meaning but not intermittently interchangeable. Nonetheless, when a word in the SL cannot be translated perfectly into the TL, synonyms with close meanings are frequently used in English-Chinese translation. Examples can also be found in Pullman's *The Golden Compass* and its TT. For instance, "set him free" (1995: 129) is translated as 「幫他逃走」(2002: 178), which, translated back into English, means "help him escape". Also, John Faa's "blunt strong gaze" becomes 「仔細觀看」, meaning "observe closely" in English.

1.9.2. Using an Antonym

On the contrary to a synonym, an antonym "designates a particular type of oppositeness" (Martin and Ringham, 2000: 26) that depends on the context (Aitchison, 1996). For example, 'boy' and 'girl' are antonyms because they oppose each other and possess the common denominator: children. Although opposites are not always interchangeable, a translator may use an antonym when a word or expression in the SL cannot be found or appropriately translated into the TL, and that the nearest TL equivalent is to express it in the form of double negative, i.e. 'negative' plus an antonym. This is not uncommon in English-Chinese translated works. An example can be easily found in the TT of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* too. In chapter five, "yes" in the expression of "Yes, they're negatively charged particles" (1995: 83) is translated in the form of double

negative, 「沒錯」, a common expression in Chinese, which literally means "not incorrect" in English.

1.9.3. Using a Hyponym / Superordinate

Hyponyms, as explained by Aitchison (1996), are the items included under a superordinate (sometimes referred to as 'hyperonym'), the cover term. For example, the word 'flower' is the superordinate, while words such as 'lily', 'rose', 'dandelion', 'narcissus', 'hibiscus', 'daisy', 'bluebell', 'morning glory', etc. are all hyponyms. Because of cultural differences, not all the words in the SL can be found in the TL. Under such circumstances, one of the most common translation strategies is to translate the SL word into its hyponym or superordinate in the TL. In the Chinese translated work of Philip Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), this method can also be found. For instance, the word 'anorak' is used to refer to the thick coat in the ST (1995: 213). 'Anorak' is a British slang that refers to a bookish, dull and usually obsessive person, but literally it is also a special kind of cold-weather, waterproof jacket with a hood and drawstrings at the waist and cuffs. However, in the TT, it is translated into 「禦寒外套」 (2002: 283), which only means 'a cold-weather coat'. Since the word 'anorak' cannot be found in the Chinese language, the translator needs to use a superordinate to replace 'anorak', the hyponym in the TL.

1.9.4. Condensing

Condensing refers to the act of reducing or compressing a text into a shorter form. It is a technique commonly used in simultaneous interpretation and translation for subtitling. When condensing occurs, some parts of the original text will have to be eliminated. It is the translator's task to judge which part must be absolutely maintained, and which part is dispensable, so that the loss of information can be qualitatively minimized. While condensing bears the idea of summarizing and encapsulating, condensing with high quality can also be compared to what Dryden (1680) called 'paraphrase', "where the author is kept in view by the translator, so as never to be lost, but his words are not so strictly followed as his sense; and that too is admitted to be amplified, but not altered" (Cited by Douglas Robinson, 1998: 166).

Condensing does not occur very often in the Chinese translation (2002) of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995). It only occurs in unobvious places where the translator tries to keep the fluency in the TT. For instance, in chapter twenty one, "And when the woman saw that the tree was good for food, and that it was pleasant to the eyes, and a tree to be desired to reveal the true form of one's daemon,…" was translated as 「當女人知道那樹的果實甜美，顏色鮮美漂亮，可顯示精靈的真實模樣，…」(2002: 454). When translated back to English, it means "When the woman knew the fruit of that tree was sweet, colourful and beautiful, and that it can reveal the true form of daemons…" Having compared the ST and the TT, we can see that the translator has summarized "the tree was

good for food" and "it was pleasant to the eyes" into 'sweet, colourful and beautiful fruit'. Similarly, the expression of "a tree to be desired" in the ST is eliminated.

1.9.5. Expanding

Expanding is condensing in reverse. It takes place when the ST is too condensed to be translated literally into the TT. During the process of expanding, first, the translator has to decode (or interpret) the message carried in the ST. Then, the translator has to reword and explicate the content and idea into the TL. This happens frequently in poetry translation, where the ST (poetry) is "writing in its most compact, condensed and heightened form, in which the language is predominantly connotational rather than denotational and in which content and form are inseparately linked" (Connolly, 1998: 171). In cases like translating poetry, expanding is necessary and unavoidable. As Dryden (1680 / 1962) suggested, "it would be unreasonable to limit a translator to the narrow compass of his author's words…I suppose he may stretch his chain to such a latitude" (1962, volume II: 272).

Though expanding is less common in prose, it will still be employed when the language in the ST is not elaborate enough to be translated into ordinary language in the TT. For instance, in chapter sixteen of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), when a man makes the remark, "The Skraelings did it better by hand", another man replies, "Centuries of practice". This reply shows that the communication between the two persons is intimate, relaxed and casual. While it is natural and acceptable to reply just by a noun phrase in English, it is odd to do so in Chinese language and culture. To make it more

natural in the TT, the translator expands the noun phrase "Centuries of practice" into a full sentence -- 「他們可是練習了好幾個世紀。」, which means 'they have been practising for a couple of centuries'. While the reply is expanded in the TT, the meaning of the ST has not been lost, though the intimate tone cannot be retained.

1.9.6. Modulation

Modulation occurs when the translator reproduces the message of the original text in the TL text. This is in conformity with the current norms of the TL, since the SL and the TL may appear dissimilar in terms of perspective (Newmark, 1988). More simply, Hatim and Munday (2004) identify modulation as "a variation of the form of the message, obtained by a change in the point of view" (150). For instance, in Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (2005), the expression "There was only six made" (128) is modulated to become 「天下只有六個。」in the ST. When translated back into English, it means, "The world has only six." In this example, modulation is necessary because there is no such idea or form as a dummy subject ("There") in the TL. When put in the TL, the form of the message must be varied. Instead of having an existential dummy "There" as the subject of the sentence, modulation takes place and the TT has 天下 (*tian-sha*) as the subject. Tian-sha, which literally means "under the sky" in Chinese, is a dead metaphor and a synonym for "the world".

1.9.7. Rhetorical Trope Change

Rhetorical tropes involve changing or modifying the general meaning of a term. The most common rhetorical tropes include the use of allegory, irony, metaphor, metonymy, personification, simile, symbolism, and many more (Knowles and Moon, 2006). Because of cultural differences, very often, rhetorical schemes that are seen in the ST may not be equivalent in the TL. As Baker (1996) remarks, "The way a language chooses to express, or not express, various meanings cannot be predicted and only occasionally matches the way another language chooses to express the same meanings" (68). Only near translation equivalent can be achieved. Thus, unavoidably, a rhetorical trope change must take place. This occurs in Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995) and its Chinese translation as well. For instance, in chapter seventeen, the expression "Lyra yawned. It was a jaw-cracking, lung-bursting yawn that lasted almost a minute" in the ST is translated as 「萊拉打了個大哈欠，幾乎持續整整一分鐘」. When translated back into English, the sentence goes like this, "Lyra had a big yawn, which lasted almost a minute". As we can see, the hyperbole adjectival expression "jaw-cracking, lung-bursting" cannot be retained in the TT, this is because the trope, when translated literally into Chinese, sounds too exaggerated, odd and unnatural.

1.10. Pragmatic Strategies

According to Bell (1991 / 1993), the domain of pragmatics is one step beyond syntax and semantics. It involves "plans and goals and the textual characteristics of intentionality,

acceptability and situationality – the attitudes of the producer and receiver of the text and its relevance to its context of use" (209). From the pragmatic perspective, the most common translation strategies include (1) addition, (2) omission, (3) explicitation, (4) implicitation, (5) domestication, (6) foreignization, (7) formality change, (8) speech act change and (9) transediting.

1.10.1. Addition

Berman (1985 / 2000) comments that TT with additions often over-translates the ST, leading to unfavourable effects such as the unshaping of rhythms and a reduction of the clarity of the work's 'voice'. Yet, according to Eco (2003), sometimes, in order to avoid a possible loss, a translator may say more than the ST. This strategy is used in the Chinese translated work of Philip Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995) – the title of chapter eight is "Frustration" in the ST. Yet, it becomes 「萊拉的挫折感」in the TT, which, translated back into English, means, "Lyra's frustration". Assuming that the reader might wonder who is frustrated in the story, the translation added "Lyra's". However, Eco (2003) also comments that addition should be avoided because by doing so, the important and meaningful reticence or ambiguity in the ST might be lost, "One should never try to make the source text literally 'better'. Even bad style, clumsiness, careless repetitions must be respected" (51).

1.10.2. Omission

Omission in translation is normally considered unfavourable because during the process of omission, some information or effect in the ST will be omitted and therefore lost. While omission is carried out when the content is intentionally or unconsciously deleted by the translator (because of censorship, standardization, or / and the translator's wish to eliminate redundant and irrelevant elements to 'improve' the ST), sometimes, omission also occurs when certain qualities in the SL cannot be kept in the TL (See section 1.7.3.4. for details). In the Chinese translation (2002) of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), obvious omission can rarely be seen, except for standardization, which appears fairly frequently throughout the TT. For instance, in chapter eighteen, there is a conversation between Serafina and Mr Scoresby:

> (Serafina) "An insult to a bear is a deadly thing. To us…inconceivable. How could you insult a witch? What would it matter if you did?"
> (Mr Scoresby) "Well, I'm kinda with you on that. Sticks and stones, I'll break yer bones, but names ain't worth a quarrel. But ma'am…" (1995: 309)

It is obvious that Mr Scoresby speaks in a casual and informal language. The use of "kinda", "yer", "ain't", and "ma'am" reveals that Mr Scoresby speaks a dialectic form of English instead of RP English, which forms a big contrast with Serafina's speech in the conversation. However, in the TT, the informal tone is totally omitted:

Target language: 嗯，我多少同意這點，實在不用爲了小事大動干戈，但是夫
人…(2002: 387)

Back translation: "Well, I am kind of with you on that. It is not worth a quarrel. But
madam…"

The dialectic and informal English in Mr. Scoresby's speech is omitted, smoothened and polished in the Chinese version. The contrast between the languages of the two characters has lost.

1.10.3. Explicitation

The method 'explicitation' was first introduced by Vinay and Darbelnet in 1958. It was first described as "the process of introducing information into the target language which is present only implicitly in the SL, but which can be derived from the context or the situation" (1958 / 1995: 8). Most recently, it is identified as "the technique of making explicit in the target text information that is implicit in the source text" (Klaudy, 1998: 80). It can be seen as a method of addition in translation. In the TT of Pullman's *The Golden Compass*, the translator also employs the technique of explicitation. For example, in chapter sixteen, the expression "I could feel all weak…" (1995: 267) is translated as 「我忽然覺得全身虛弱…」(2002: 341). When it is translated back into English, it looks like this:

「我　　忽然　　覺得　　全　　　身　　　虛弱…」

"(I)　(suddenly)　(feel)　　(whole)　(body)　(weak)"　　(word-for-word translation)

Compared with the ST, "all weak" now becomes "weak all over the body" in the TT. The idea of "all over the body" is present only implicitly in the SL, though it can be derived from the context. In the TT, the idea is made explicit.

1.10.4. Implicitation

Implicitation is often contrasted with explicitation. Inverting the process of explicitation, implicitation is "the process of allowing the target language situation or context to define certain details which were explicit in the source language" (Vinay and Darbelnet, 1958 / 1995: 10). Being considered as a form of omission, it is also often discussed in terms of losses in translation. In Chinese-English translation, implicitation is not intentional but essential and unavoidable. This is because unlike in English, in Chinese, nouns are not marked for plural. They are not even classified as countable or uncountable. Similarly, Chinese verbs are not marked with inflections which may reveal information about gender, number, tense, or person. During the process of translation, implicitation appears in almost every sentence. In the following example depicted from Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995) and its Chinese translation (2002), implicitation occurs more than twice in a single sentence. Inflections regarding tense and number are lost in the TT (The Chinese translation of Pullman's *The Golden Compass*) – "She knew that both Lord Asriel and the Master were members of the Cabinet Council…" (1995: 10) is translated as 「萊拉知道公爵和院長都是內閣會議的成員…」(2002: 29). In the TT, the syntactic structure is preserved, but verbs such as 'knew' and 'were' have lost their past

tense form, and the plural form of the noun, 'members', becomes singular, because these inflections cannot be expressed into the TL.

1.10.5. Domestication

The term 'domestication' is coined by Venuti as the issue of invisibility is discussed. According to Venuti (1995), there are two streams of translation strategy, namely domestication and foreignization. Domestication, as Venuti sees, is a trend dominating Anglo-American translation culture. He sees it as an unfavourable translation strategy that involves "an ethnocentric reduction of the foreign text to [Anglo-American] target-language cultural values" (1995: 20). Nonetheless, Umberto Eco (2003) remarks that domestication is related to the issue of source vs target,

> should a translation lead the reader to understand the linguistic and cultural universe of the source text, or transform the original by adapting it to the reader's cultural and linguistic universe?(89)

A translator who uses the translation technique of domestication is target-oriented and reader-oriented. Sometimes, domestication can also be unavoidable. Eco (2003) cites an interesting example to exemplify the case: the French expression 'mon petit chou' is translated as 'sweetheart' in English when domestication takes place. If the French expression is translated literally without domestication, it will become 'my little cabbage', which could sound insulting in English. In the TT of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), domestication also occurs, although not very frequently. For example, in chapter one, Pullman writes, "The daemon seemed suspicious" (1995: 7). The expression is

translated as 「她…似乎有點疑神疑鬼」 (2002: 26) which literally means 'she seemed to suspect that there are spirits and ghosts'. 「疑神疑鬼」(meaning suspicious, or, 'suspecting there are spirits and ghost') is an expression commonly used in Chinese. The translator domesticates the ST to make it more reader-oriented.

1.10.6. Foreignization

Foreignization is like the opposite of domestication. It is, as Venuti (1997) explains, a highly desirable translation strategy that "entails choosing a foreign text and developing a translation method along lines which are excluded by dominant cultural values in the target language" (242). Eco (2003) proposes that foreignizing translation is not so different from the notion of defamiliarization, "a device by which an artist succeeds in persuading his readers to perceive the described object under a different light and to understand it better than before" (90).

Cases of foreignization can also be found in the Chinese translation (2002) of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), though this translation strategy is not used for most of the time. For instance, the name of a character, "John Faa", is translated as「約翰・法」 (2002: 156) in Chinese. The translator could have translated the name "John Faa" into a Chinese name very easily, where the family name comes first and the first name follows. The family name "Faa" can also be translated as 「范」, a real existing Chinese family name with a similar pronunciation, instead of 「法」, which does not exist in Chinese family names. Nevertheless, the translator chooses to foreignize the name by placing the

first name 「約翰」 (i.e. John) in the initial position. The family name 「法」 behind. This gives readers a sense of foreignness and alienness as they come to read about John Faa the character.

1.10.7. Formality Change

Formality, as Heylighen and Dewaele (1999) observe, can be understood at two levels – surface formality and deep formality. Surface formality "is characterized by attention to form for the sake of convention or form itself" (3). Occasions such as ceremonies, rituals and examinations are typical social situations that exemplify surface formality. On the other hand, deep formality is defined as:

> avoidance of ambiguity by minimizing the context-dependence and fuzziness of expressions. This is achieved by explicit and precise description of the elements of the context needed to disambiguate the expression (1).

One good example that Heylighen and Dewaele use to illustrate the idea of deep formality is by comparing the following pair of expressions:

(1) I'll see him tomorrow.

(2) Karen Jones will see John Smith on October 13, 1999. (1999:5)

While both sentences contain the same amount of information, sentence (1) is heavily context dependent. A person who has no knowledge of the context will find it obscure

and ambiguous; whereas sentence (2) is much more informative, explicit and definite. It can be viewed as a formalized description of sentence (1).

Having defined the term formality, the translation strategy 'formality change' can be understood as the change of surface formality or / and deep formality in the TT during the process of translation. In the Chinese translation (2002) of Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995), the most common kind of formality change happens to be deep formality change. When deep formality change takes place, deictic words regarding time (i.e. now, then, last time), person (i.e. you, me, he, her) and place (i.e. here, there) are often replaced by context independent expressions that, in Heylighen and Dewaele's words, explicitly state "the necessary references, assumptions, and background knowledge which would have remained tacit in an informal expression of the same meaning" (1999: 5). For instance, in the ST, the sentences go like this, "Serafina Pekkala …touched **her eyes** [my bold],…Pantalaimon…crawled to his sleeping place by **her neck**" (1995: 304. My emphasis). Yet, in the TT, 'her eyes' and 'her neck' are translated as 「萊拉的眼睛」and 「萊拉脖子」(2002: 382), which means 'Lyra's eyes' and 'Lyra's neck' respectively. The replacement of 'her' with 'Lyra's' in the TT avoids ambiguity and formalizes the ST.

1.10.8. Speech Act Change

In *How to Do Things With Words* (1962), J.L. Austin the British philosopher introduces the notions of 'locutionary act', 'illocutionary act' and 'perlocutionary act', which later on become common terms in the study of speech acts. Locutionary act, as Austin defines,

is the simplest speech act. It refers to the surface meaning of an utterance. For instance, the utterance "It is raining" performs the locutionary act of stating and describing the fact that it is raining. Illocutionary act, on the other hand, refers to what one does in saying an utterance. For instance, as a priest says, "I now pronounce you man and wife." in the context of a wedding, he marries a couple. Bach and Harnish (1979) identify four major categories of illocutionary act. They are constatives, directives, commissives and acknowledgements. Examples of the four categories are listed as follows:

1.Constatives: affirming, alleging, announcing, answering, attributing, claiming, classifying, concurring, confirming, conjecturing, denying, disagreeing, disclosing, disputing, identifying, informing, insisting, predicting, ranking, reporting, stating, stipulating.

2.Directives: advising, admonishing, asking, begging, dismissing, excusing, forbidding, instructing, ordering, permitting, requesting, requiring, suggesting, urging, warning

3.Commissives: agreeing, guaranteeing, inviting, offering, promising, swearing, volunteering

4.Acknowledgments: apologizing, condoling, congratulating, greeting, thanking, accepting

Last but not least, a perlocutionary act is a speech act that creates an effect (intended or not) on an addressee's thoughts, feelings and / or attitudes as the speaker speaks an

utterance. Examples of perlocutionary acts would be persuading, convincing, threatening, scaring, insulting, and getting the addressee to do or realize something, etc.

Speech act change, as a translation strategy, can be realized as changing the speech act in the ST into another speech act in the TT. In Pullman's *The Golden Compass* (1995) and its Chinese translation, there is an example of a subtle speech act change. At the end of chapter ten, Iorek Byrnison the bear **requests** his armour. He **reveals** that he will not need alcohol anymore when he has got back what he has lost, "I want it [my armour] back, and then I shall never need spirits again" (1995: 181). In the TT, however, it becomes 「一旦我拿回武器，我永遠滴酒不沾。」 (2002: 249). When translated back into English, it means, "If I get back my weapon, I will never touch a single drop of spirit." Apart from the obvious mistranslation of 'armour' as 'weapon', in terms of speech act, the request in the ST has become a **conditional** sentence in the TT. The speech act of requesting has been seemingly lost. Furthermore, "I will never touch a single drop of spirit" creates the effect of a **promise**, which is different from the original utterance.

1.10.9. Transediting

Transediting is a two-in-one term consisting of the processes of translation and editing. In an electronic article, "An Insider's View on Transformation and Transfer in International News Communication: An English-Finnish Perspective", Hursti (2001) writes that transediting is "the composite term used to refer to work done in the realm of 'practical

texts', such as news items, in which both of the processes, editing and translating, are not only very much present but also equally important and closely intertwined". Meanwhile, it can also be viewed as a kind of re-writing, which Hatim (2001) sees as a metalinguistic process that "reinterpret[s], alter[s] or generally manipulate[s] texts to serve a variety of ideological motives" (232). Usually, transediting takes place when the translator realizes that the readers may need additional explanations to understand the text. This often happens in children's literature and journalistic daily work, where the translator would consult the editors about the relevance of a text for the readers before translating it (Gutierrez, 2006). The most common ways of re-writing include addition, deletion, (Hursti, 2001), re-organizing the order of presentation, adjusting the focus, eliminating confusing redundancies, creating connections and coherence (Mossop, 2007), correcting factual errors, improving awkward style, (Chesterman, 2000) etc.

In the Chinese translation of Pullman's work, the Chinese translator gives additional information by providing footnotes but rarely by re-writing the text. As apparent examples of transediting or re-writing can hardly be found in Pullman's work and its Chinese translation, I shall cite an example of transediting from Gutierrez's proceeding of the conference titled "Translation in Global News" in 2006. As Gutierrez reveals, in Bolivia, 'El Alto' the Spanish term refers to a city near La Paz. However, the term is often transedited as something like "A sprawling working-class city near La Paz" (2006: 32) in English. Additional information has been added in the TT to suit the English readers.

2. What is Translation Studies?

As an academic discipline, translation studies have developed rapidly through the recent decades. As Bassnett (2002) observes, even though translation studies covers a wide field, it can be roughly divided into four areas of interest, each with some degree of overlap. The four categories are (1) the History of Translation, (2) Translation in the TL culture, (3) Translation and Linguistics, and (4) Translation and Poetics (16 – 17). The first category mainly deals with the investigation of translation theories at different times. The next category focuses on the ideology at work in a particular author's work and its target text(s). The third category, on the other hand, handles the comparative arrangement of linguistic elements between the ST and the TT. Finally, the fourth category studies the whole area of literary translation, both in theory and practice.

My research works on the gender ideology at work in Pullman's *His Dark Materials* (1995 – 2000) and its Chinese translation (2002). According to the four categories of interests set by Bassnet, apparently, my research lies in category two, which, in Bassnet's words:

> extends the work on single texts or authors and include work on the influence of a text, author or genre, on the absorption of the norms of the translated text into the TL system and on the principles of selection operating within that system. (2002: 17)

In light of this, for the rest of the chapter, emphasis will be put on the discussion of ideology and translation. Firstly, the basic concepts of the study of ideology and

translation will be introduced. Afterwards, I shall examine the issue of ideology and translation from the perspectives of (1) gender, and (2) children's literature.

2.1. The Two-way Schematization of Ideology and Translation

Hatim (2001) notices that ideology and translation can be approached in two different ways. The first one is what he calls the "translation of ideology" (126), which focuses on how ideology in the ST can be translated, as well as how the ideology is conveyed in the TT. The second perspective is the "ideology of translation" (127), where ideology becomes "a cover term for what is essentially in and of translation" (ibid). For example, 'fluency' can be considered as an ideology of translation since it is a doctrine subscribed to by certain translation traditions. According to Hatim's (2001) description of the relationship between ideology and translation, my research can be viewed as an assessment of both – at the first level, the 'translation of ideology' is assessed as how the gender ideology manifested in gender representations in the ST and TT are compared and contrasted. With a particular focus on gender, I shall investigate "what the translator has added, what he has left out, the words he has chosen, and how he has placed them" (Alvarez and Vidal, 1996: 5). At the second level, the 'ideology of translation' will also be dealt with as the analysis moves on to the mindset and possible ideological constraints of the translator. A translated work may display different sources of ideology of translation, because translators are constrained in many ways:

> by their own ideology, by their feelings of superiority or inferiority towards the language in which they are writing the text being translated; by the prevailing poetical rules at that time; by the very language in which the texts they are translating is written; by what

38

> the dominant institutions and ideology expect of them; by the
> public for whom the translation is intended. (Alvarez and Vidal,
> 1996: 6)

In my study, the basis on which the translator decides what to translate and how to translate will be explored. It will be an exploration of power relationships in gender within two cultural contexts.

2.2. Translation as a Form of Rewriting and Manipulation

Translation, according to André Lefevere (1992, 1995) and Jiri Levy (2000), is not done in a vacuum. It is an important form of rewritings and a decision process influenced by certain linguistic, ideological and poetic factors. In the preface of Lefevere's *Translation, Rewriting and the Manipulation of Literary Fame* (1992), Bassnet writes:

> Translation is, of course, a rewriting of an original text. All rewritings, whatever their intention, reflect a certain ideology …Rewriting is manipulation, undertaken in the service of power…Rewriting can introduce new concepts, new quotes, new devices, and the history of translation is the history also of literary innovation…But rewriting can also repress innovation, distort and contain. (1992: IX)

To put it in another way, as a text begins to be interpreted and translated, its original ideology, values and norms will be shifted, diminished or lost, and new ideas might be added. It is also said that these alterations in the translation process can be due to "the explicit social, political or moral belief of the individual writer" (Hollindale, 1998:12), or "the less easily perceived implicit and unquestioned assumptions made by authors…those values that are taken for granted by the society in which the text was produced and read"

39

(O'Sullivan, 2005: 82). Moreover, such alterations can be found both at the level of the story (what is being told – incidents, characters, objects, locations, etc.) and at the level of the discourse (how it is told) (O'Sullivan, 2005: 81). In all cases, cultural politics is always at work and the power structures within the cultural context can be observed.

2.3. Translation: A Gender Perspective

If "making women seen and heard in the real world" is "what feminism is all about" (Lotbiniere-Harwood, 1989: 9), then raising gender awareness in translated texts and the translation field is definitely a critical concern among feminists and feminist translators. Flotow (1997) points out that in the 'Era of Feminism', interest in gender and translation has developed in numerous directions, which "ranges from issues in translation practice to translation history and criticism, to new ideas in translation theory" (13). All these can be roughly classified into three strands, each with a different focus, yet all have the goal of making the "feminine, i.e. women – visible" (Lotbiniere-Harwood, 1991: 101).

In the first strand, the aim is to recover woman's works, knowledge and influence lost in patriarchy. Feminists believe that a lot of women's writing, especially the earlier ones, has been ignored and lost, because "the patriarchal canon has traditionally defined aesthetics and literary value in terms that privileged work by male writers to the detriment of women writers" (Flotow, 1997: 30). With the objective of reviving these forgotten, formerly inaccessible women's works previously denigrated by patriarchal scholars, in recent years, feminists have unearthed numerous women's writing, and have

had them translated into different languages and published for contemporary readers. Translation, in this sense, plays a crucial role in "making available the knowledge, experiences and creative work of many of these earlier women writers" (ibid). The second strand, on the other hand, is all about what is now called interventionist feminist translation, which deals with issues regarding intervention and censorship in translation. Since the women's movement, language has been defined as a powerful political instrument, where competing ideologies and institutions, cultural representation and power relations are embedded (Martin, 2005). In light of this, instead of playing the traditional invisible role, claiming faithfulness and equivalence to the original work all the time, feminist translators now see themselves as politically conscious, "active re-producer[s] of texts" (Hatim, 2001: 135):

> [F]eminist translators 'correct' texts that they translate in the name of feminist 'truths'…[they] assumed the right to query their source texts from a feminist perspective, to intervene and make changes when the texts depart from this perspective. (Flotow, 1997: 24)

In other words, the process of translation is seen as a complex cultural negotiation in which the translator can intervene actively and productively. The strategies of intervention in feminist translation include supplementing the ST (Levine, 1991), providing commentary such as prefaces, footnotes (Godard, 1988), afterwords and annotation (Hatim, 2001), appropriation (Homel and Simon, 1989) and collaboration with other translators or with the author (Hatim, 2001). Finally, the third strand is concerned with the translation of the works of important feminists, women writers and thinkers. The extent to which these works are successfully translated or lost is analyzed and discussed in detail.

My research does not actively work on recovering and translating lost women's writing. Nonetheless, by looking into gender representation in Pullman's *His Dark Materials* (1995 - 2000) and its Chinese translation (2002), I explore the relationship between gender stereotypes and linguistics forms, links between the politics of language and cultural difference, and the possible intervention, censorship and manipulation that the translator may have imposed on the ST. With the objective of raising gender awareness in Pullman's work and its translated texts, I do my best in making my research subtly in line with the goal of "making women seen and heard in the real world" (Lotbiniere-Harwood, 1989: 9).

2.4. Translation of children's literature

While feminist translation aims at making the feminine visible, translation of children's literature focuses on the welfare of the child-reader. As in children's literature, it is said that the guiding principles of the translation of children's literature are that the translation should be good for the child and comprehensible for the child. With such educational considerations as the foremost priorities, during the course of translation decision-making, even a priori principles such as fidelity to the author and the integrity of the original work would have to give way (Klingberg, 1986). According to Shavit (1981), it is acceptable for translators to alter and manipulate the source texts in various ways as long as the translation is:

> a) adjusting the text in order to make it appropriate and useful to the child, in accordance to guiding principles with what society thinks is 'good for the child';

42

b) adjusting the plot, characterization and language to the child's
level of comprehension and his reading abilities. (172)

One typical example of such appropriation is the censorship of violence in children's literature. As Lathey recalls (2006), in the original version of Grimm Brother's *Cinderella*, Cinderella's sister cuts off her own toes and heels just to squeeze her big feet into the tiny pair of glass slippers. Also, on Cinderella's wedding day, her sisters' eyes are pecked out by birds. However, violence as such has been omitted in many of the English versions written for children.

O'Sullivan points out that while bearing the two guiding principles in mind, it is important that translators should not treat children's literature as homogeneous. Professional translators should also take the following factors into consideration: different forms (like picture books), genres (drama, poetry, non-fiction, etc), as well as the wide range of age-groups among the so-called child readers. Having said so, authors, scholars and critics tend to be more tolerant and sympathetic to 'incorrect' translation of children's literature. Well aware of the distinctive characteristics of children's literature in translation, Oittinen (2000) asserts, "When translating for children, taking into consideration the target-language children as readers is a sign of loyalty to the original author" (84). On the other hand, more open-minded children's writers such as Lene Kaaberbol gladly accept translated texts not as translation, "but rather one more rewrite" (2005: 15). Not infrequently, the judgment and hard work of translators are acknowledged and appreciated. As Kaaberbol (2005) puts it, "By the grace of your translator, through her talent, hard labour and dedication, your story is about to be

43

reincarnated" (14). Despite the alterations made to the source texts, it is commonly agreed that translation of children's literature should be embraced and celebrated because it enriches our lives, offers the chance for us to learn about other cultures, and "provides a glimpse into the experiences and way of life of children from different parts of the world" (Zaghini, 2005: 22).

Bibliography

Abrams, MH. *A Glossary of Literary Terms.* Fortworth: Harcourt Brace, 1999

Aitchison, Jean. *Words in the Mind: An Introduction to the Mental Lexicon.* Oxford, U.K. & Cambridge, U.S.A.: Blackwell, 1996.

Alvarez, R & Vidal, C-A. "Translating. A Political Act", *Translation, Power, Subversion.* Ed. R.Alvarez & C-A Vidal. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters, 1996.

Al-Zoubi, Mohammad Q.R. & Al-Hassnawi, Ali Rasheed. "Constructing a Model for Shift Analysis in Translation", *Translation Journal.* Volume 5, No.4, Oct 2001.

Austin, J.L. *How to Do Things with Words.* Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1962.

Bach, K. and R. M. Harnish, Linguistic Commuication and Speech Acts, Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1979.

Baker, Mona. *In Other Words: A Coursebook on Translation.* London and New York: Routledge, 1996.

Bassnett, Susan. *Translation Studies.* London and New York: Routledge, 2002.

Bell, Roger T. *Translation and Translating: Theory and Practice.* London and New York: Longman, 1991, 1993.

Catford, J.C. *A Linguistic Theory of Translation.* London: Oxford University Press, 1965, 2000.

Chesterman, Andrew. "Translation Typology", *The Second Riga Symposium on Pragmatic Aspects of Translation.* Ed. A. Veisbergs and I. Zauberga Riga: University of Latvia, 2000.

Cole, Michael and Sylvia Scribner. *Culture and Thought: A Psychological Introduction.* John Wiley & Sons: New York, 1974.

Connolly, David. "Poetry Translation", *Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*. Ed. Mona Baker, London and New York: Routledge, 1998.

Davis, Dick. "Mrs. Carter's Pudding, or Real English Toads in Imaginary Persian Gardens: on Translating Persian Poetry", *Translation Review* 50 (1996), p. 31 – 36.

Dryden, John. *Of Dramatic Poesy and Other Critical Essays.* Ed. G. Watson. 2 Vols. London and New York: Dent / Dutton, 1962.

Eco, Umberto. *Mouse or Rat? Translation as Negotiation.* London: Phoenix Paperback, 2003.

Encyclopaedia Britannica. Volume X. Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc., 1974.

Flotow, Luise von. *Translation and Gender: Translating in the 'Era of Feminism'.* Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing, 1997.

Godard, B. Preface. *Lovhers*, by N. Brossard. Translated by B. Godard. Montreal: Guernica Press, 1988.

Gutierrez, Miren. "Journalism and the Language Divide", *Translation in Global News: Proceedings of the Conference Held at the University of Warwick.* Ed. Kyle Conway and Susan Bassnet. Coventry, U.K.: University of Warwick, Centre for Translation and Comparative Cultural Studies, 23 June 2006.

Halliday, M.A.K. & Hasan, Ruqayia. *Cohesion in English.* London: Longman, 1976.

Hartmann, R.R.K. & STORK, F.C. *Dictionary of Language and Linguistics.* London: Applied Science Publishers, 1972.

Hatim, Basil. *Teaching and Researching Translation.* Harlow, England: Pearson Education Limited, 2001.

Heylighen, Francis & Dewaele, Jean-Marc. "Formality of Language: definition, measurements and behavioral determinants" in Internal Report, Center "Leo Apostel", Free University of Brussels, 1999.

Hollindale, Peter. *Ideology and the Children's Book*. Woodchester, U.K.: Thimble Press, 1998.

Holmes, James. *Translated! Papers on Literary Translation and Translation Studies.* Amsterdam: Rodolpi, 1988.

Homel, D. and Simon, S. *Mapping Literature.* Montreal: Vehicule Press, 1989.

Hursti, K. "An Insider's View on Transformation and Transfer in International News Communication: An English-Finnish Perspective". *Translation Studies, The Electronic Journal of the Department of English at the University of Helsinki.* Volume 1, 2001.

Jakobson, R. "On Linguistic Aspects of Translation", *L. Venuti* (ed.), 2000, p. 113 – 18.

Kaaberbol, Lene. "Everyday Miracles". *Outside In: Children's Books in Translation.* Ed. Deborah Hallford and Edgardo Zaghini. Malta: Compass Press, 2005.

Kasparek, Christopher. "The Translator's Endless Toil". <u>*The Polish Review*</u>, vol. XXVIII, no. 2, 1983, pp. 83-87.

Klingberg, G. *Children's Fiction in the Hands of the Translators.* Lund: Gleerup, 1986.

Knowles, Murray & Moon, Rosalind. *Introducing Metaphor.* London and New York: Routledge, 2006.

Lathey, Gillian. *The Translation of Children's Literature: A Reader.* Clevedon, Buffalo, Toronto: Multilingual Matters Ltd., 2006.

Lefevere, André. *Translation, Rewriting and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*. London, New York: Routledge, 1992.

Levine, S.J. *The Subversive Scribe: Translating Latin American Fiction.* Minneapolis: Greywolf Press, 1991.

Levy, Jiri. "Translation as Decision Process". Lawrence Venuti (Ed.), *The Translation Studies Reader* (148-59). London; New York: Routledge, 2000.

Lotbiniere-Harwood, Susanne de. "About the *her* in other". Preface to *Letters from an Other* by Lise Gauvin. Toronto: The Women's Press, 1989.

------------. *Re-Belle et Infidele. La Traduction comme pratique de reecriture au feminine / The Body Bilingual. Translation as a Rewriting in the Feminine.* Toronto: The Women's Press and Montreal: les editions du remue-menage, 1991.

Martin, Bronwen & Ringham, Felizitas. *Dictionary of Semiotics.* London and New York: Cassell, 2000.

Martin, M. Rosario. "Gender(ing) Theory: Rethinking the Targets of Translation Studies in Parallel with Recent Developments in Feminism". *Gender, Sex and Translation: The Manipulation of Identities.* Ed. Jose Santaemilia. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing, 2005.

Mossop, Brian. "A Socially Neutral Definition of Translating". <http://www.geocities.com/brmossop/SociallyNeutralDefinition.htm>. Accessed on 27 October 2007.

Newmark, P. *Approaches to Translation*. Hertfordshire: Prentice Hall, 1981, 1988.

Nida, E.A. *Towards a Science of Translating*. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1964.

Nida, E.A. and Taber, C. *The Theory and Practice of Tranlation.* Leiden: Brill, 1969, 1982.

O'Sullivan, Emer. *Comparative Children's Literature.* London and New York: Routledge, 2005.

Oittinen, Riitta. *Translating for Children.* New York and London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 2000.

Popovic, A. *A Dictionary for the Analysis of Literary Translation.* Edmonton: Department of Comparative Literature, The University of Alberta, 1976.

Robinson, Douglas. "Paraphrase", *Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*. Ed. Mona Baker, London and New York: Routledge, 1998.

Sapir, E. (1929): 'The Status of Linguistics as a Science'. In E. Sapir (1958): *Culture, Language and Personality* (ed. D. G. Mandelbaum). Berkeley, CA: University of California Press

Savory, T. *The Art of Translation.* London: Cape, 1957, 1968.

Shavit, Z. "Translation of Children's Literature as a Function of Its Position in the Literary Polysystem". *Poetics Today*, 1981.

Venuti, Lawrence. "Strategies of translation" *Encyclopedia of translation studies.* Ed. M. Baker. London and New York: Routledge, 1998.

--------, *The Translator's Invisibility*. London: Routledge, 1995.

Vinay, Jean-Paul and Darbelnet, Jean. "A Methodology for Translation". Trans. Juan C. Sager and Marie-Josee Hamel. *The Translation Studies Reader.* Ed. Lawrence Venuti. London and New York: Routledge, 2000.

Wikipedia. *Wikipedia Online.* Wikipedia Foundation. <http://en.wikipedia.org> Accessed on 13 May 2008.

Whorf, B. L. "Science and Linguistics", *Language, Thought and Reality*. Ed. J. B. Carroll. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1956.

Zaghini, Edgardo. "Babar has come to England: Classic European Children's Literature in Translation". *Outside In: Children's Books in Translation.* Ed. Deborah Hallford and Edgardo Zaghini. Malta: Compass Press, 2005.

The Representations of the Monstrous Feminine in the

Selected Works of C.S. Lewis, Roald Dahl and Philip Pullman

(Module Two, Paper One)

by

WING BO TSO

A research paper submitted to
The University of Birmingham
in part fulfillment of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Applied Linguistics

Centre for English Language Studies
School of English, Drama and American & Canadian Studies
College of Arts and Law
The University of Birmingham
November 2010

Abstract

With reference to Kristeva's Theory on Abjection and Creed's discussion about the monstrous feminine, in this research paper, I examine the representations of female antagonists in three popular children's books – C.S. Lewis's Narnia books, Roald Dahl's *The Witches* (1983), as well as Philip Pullman's *The Amber Spyglass* (2000).

It is found that in the Narnia series and Dahl's book, a similar reductive, repressive pattern recurs in the representations of the female antagonists. As reflected in the plot and the choice of vocabulary, both Jadis in the Narnia series and the witches in *The Witches* (1983) are represented as the nameless abject that blurs the line of demarcation between life and death, human and non-human, masculine and feminine. At the end of both books, the monstrous feminine is ejected, erased, and the 'purification' brings relief and a vengeful pleasure.

The harpies in Pullman's *The Amber Spyglass* (2000), however, are a re-version, instead of a perpetuation of the monstrous feminine stereotype. Under the rewriting of Pullman, the harpies are honoured as the "Gracious Wings" (405) and "the saviour of all, generous one" (379). The monstrous feminine regains its long-lost power in the matriarchal period in human history.

Total number of words: 195

The Representations of the Monstrous Feminine in the Selected Works of C.S. Lewis, Roald Dahl and Philip Pullman
(Module Two, Paper One)

Table of Contents:

The Representations of the Monstrous Feminine in the Selected Works of C.S. Lewis, Roald Dahl and Philip Pullman
(Module Two, Paper One)

With the aim of doing a background research for module three, a comparative study of the gender representations in Philip Pullman's *His Dark Materials* and its Chinese translation, in module one, I explored the translation theories and translation strategies illustrated with original examples extracted from the Chinese version of Philip Pullman's *His Dark Materials* (1995 – 2000). In this module, I will concentrate on investigating gender stereotypes in myths, folklore and children's books. Both modules one and two will serve as a prelude of the search for gender representations and ideological construct in the source text and target text of module three.

1. Introduction

In *The Structural Study of Myth* (1967), Levi-Strauss notices that myths from different cultures from all over the world seem so similar. It is as if the mythological stories have "meaning and order of their own" (1978: vii), or that order has been "imposed by the anthropologists who have collected the stories" (ibid). He argues that like language, myths have their own structure. Each myth is made of units, or what he calls mythemes, that are put together according to certain rules. These units form relations with each other, based on binary pairs or opposites, which provide the basis of the structure. In *The Monstrous-Feminine* (1994), Barbara Creed also agrees that some prototypes do exist in

the mythology of all human cultures. The example she uses to support her point is "the generative, parthenogenetic mother" who "gives birth to all living things" (24):

> She exists in the mythology of all human cultures as the Mother-Goddess who alone created the heavens and earth. In China she was known as Nu Kwa, in Mexico as Coatlicue, in Greece as Gaia (literally meaning 'earth') and in Sumer as Nammu (ibid).

Developing from Levis-Strauss's structural study of myth and extending Kristeva's (1983) discussion of horror and abjection, Creed successfully analyses the faces of the monstrous-feminine with reference to a number of classic horror films.

The monstrous-feminine does not only haunt in mythological narratives and horror films. Assigned with the same negative role, she appears in classic children's books. She is often destined with a similar fate – she is either punished or killed, and her menacing power is almost always suppressed at the end of the story. Based on existing theories and discussions about the monstrous feminine, in this study, I will investigate how abject women are represented by English children's writers in the 1950s, 1980s and the twenty-first century. The monstrous-feminine that I have chosen to examine include Jadis in C.S. Lewis's *The Magician's Nephew* (1955) and *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950), the witches in Roald Dahl's *The Witches* (1983), and the harpies in Philip Pullman's *The Amber Spyglass* (2000). Before I start discussing the notion of monstrosity in these selected works, I shall reinstate Kristeva's (ibid) concept of the abject and recapture Creed's arguments. Then, I will briefly discuss the different faces of the

monstrous-feminine in mythologies in order to find out how powerful gender stereotypes can be.

2. Kristeva's Theory on Femininity and Abjection

To understand Kristeva's theory of abjection, we may start by considering the concept of the mother and the formation of the subject. According to Kristeva (1982), before the formation of the subject, the child in the Semiotic cannot differentiate himself or herself from the surroundings and the mother's body. S/he is closely linked to the maternal figure and the Semiotic chora, a space where the child is presented with a preverbal dimension of language structured by sensual impressions and his / her own bodily needs. However, when the child enters into the Symbolic and acquires language, s/he learns to turn towards the Law of the Father. S/he draws boundaries between proper and improper, clean and unclean, self and other, etc. so as to create a sense of security, form and maintain the stability of the subject. As a result, the mother of the Semiotic chora becomes the abject that threatens to trespass the clear demarcation line between the self and other. She has to be "radically excluded" (Kristeva, 1983: 2) from the living subject's proper body.

In a literal sense, the abject refers to bodily fluids and excretions such as blood, vomit, faeces, urine, etc, which are waste matters that cannot be clearly considered as from the inside or outside. Taking the notion at the psychological level, the abject is everything that threatens to transgress borders and the sanctity of the Symbolic order. It can be in the

form of "a language that gives up, a structure within the body, a non-assimilable alien" (Grosz, 1990: 51), crimes and perversions. Wikie-Stibbs (2002) defines the abject as follows:

> All that occupies the margins, all that threatens the belief in stable identity, that threatens to transgress the psycho-social boundaries upon which normative society rests, and which ultimately provokes the horror of individual mortality (2002: 86).

"The subjective sense of "myself", the "I" of the socialized, *signifying*, and speaking subject" (Wilkie-Stibbs, 2002: 85) is constantly and continually threatened by the abject, which is perceived as repugnance and disgust. In order to gain subjectivity, the speaking subject must expel the unwanted abject. As Kristeva says, "I expel myself, I spit myself, I abject myself within the same motion through which 'I' claim to establish *myself*" (1983: 3). It is noteworthy that the abject is different from an object outside the subject. While the object is the external support that provides the subject with stability, the abject is part of the subject. Yet, it is also the part which the subject expels in order to claim its subjectivity. Thus, the abject is the abyss that keeps disturbing the subject and its subjectivity:

> [It] attests to the impossibility of clear borders, lines of demarcation or divisions between the proper and the improper, the clean and the unclean, order and disorder, as required by the symbolic…it disturbs identity, system and order, respecting no definite positions, rules, boundaries or limits. (Grosz, 1990: 73 - 74)

In other words, any unknown creature that does not fall into the binary division of subject and object, self and other, man and woman, active and passive, etc haunts the patriarchal speaking subject. The in-between, the ambiguous, is seen as the abject that must be

rejected and repressed. Hence, in the text, the abject (often a woman who acts in defiance of the patriarchal order) is always represented as something as abnormal, horrible, evil and disgusting as faeces, spit, menstrual blood, sperm, excrement and its equivalents (decay, infection, disease, corpse, etc.), which are to be expelled and expunged.

3. Barbara Creed's Definition of the Monstrous Feminine

Developing her ideas around Kristeva's notion of abjection and the physical body, Creed (1994) argues that the prototype of most definitions of the monstrous originates from the female reproductive body. According to Creed, the monstrous as constructed in the modern horror is often related to or associated with the female abject figure (or the monstrous-feminine) who does not respect social rules and order, or / and whose body does not adhere to certain rules of conduct, mainly that of a clean and proper self. She then explains that the monstrous feminine wears many faces, including the amoral primeval mother, vampires, witches, women as the monstrous womb, women as the bleeding wound, women as possessed body, the castrating mother, women as beautiful but deadly killers (femmes fatales), aged psychopath, monstrous girl-boys, women as non-human animals, women as life-in-death and women as the deadly femme castratrice. Having analyzed the many faces of the monstrous-feminine with reference to a number of classic horror films, Creed concludes that the monstrosity does not come from the abject female figure. Instead, it comes from the patriarchal conceptualization of that figure. The fragility of the law and the subjectivity projects and creates the horror.

5

4. Faces of the Monstrous Feminine in Mythologies of the East and the West

In this section, taking both Kristeva's theory of abjection and Creed's interpretations of the monstrous-feminine into consideration, I will examine how women are portrayed as the abject, disgusting figures in the Greek mythology, in the ancient Hebrew Bible, as well as in some Chinese folklore and legends. This will give us an outlook of how the idea of abject permeates in cultures, East and West. I will specifically examine the prototypes of the monstrous-feminine, namely, (1) Lamiae in Greek mythology and the motif of Vagina Dentata; (2) Medusa, the dark goddess in Greek mythology; (3) Sphinx, the archaic mother in the Greek mythology; (4) Lilith in the ancient Hebrew Bible; and (5) *Huli Jing*, fox spirits in Chinese legends.

4.1. Lamiae in Greek Mythology and the Motif of Vagina Dentata

The prototype of the monstrous feminine can be found in Greek/Roman mythology. In ancient Greece, people believed in Lamiae, and in Rome, in the Striges, who were living dead creatures that returned to drink children's blood and devour babies. Lamia, as the mythology goes, was the lover of Zeus, but Zeus's wife, Hera, was very jealous. She fought ferociously against Lamia. As a result, Lamia was driven mad, and she ended up killing her own offspring. At night, according to the myth, Lamia hunted after other human children (Rickels, 1999: 9 - 10). As we can see here, not unlike Lilith, the vampire-like Lamia is a monstrous feminine that does not conform to the socially

6

acceptable gender roles. She seduces husbands of other women, and as a mother she kills

and eats her own children.

Interestingly, the name of Lamia seems to have foretold her tragic fate of transforming

into the monstrous feminine. In Greek, Lamia means both "lecherous vaginas" and

"gluttonous gullets" (Walker, 1983: 1034 - 1037). This reminds us of the notion of

"Vagina Dentata", a term coined by Sigmund Freud in his *Three essays on the theory of*

sexuality (1927). Vagina Dentata refers to the vagina that castrates the phalluses of men.

According to Barbara Walker,

> It is evocative of a subconscious belief that a woman may devour
> or consume her partner during sex, believed to be aroused by the
> mouth-symbolism of the vagina. Sigmund Freud, who coined the
> term, said, "Probably no male human being is spared the terrifying
> shock of threatened castration at the sight of the female genitals."
> (ibid)

The distinction between mouths and female genitals was blurred by this Greek idea of the

lamiae. What is even more interesting, in English, the word 'mouth' comes from the same

root as the word 'mother'. To Christian ascetics, Hell-mouth and the vagina drew upon

the same ancient symbolism. Both were equated with the womb-symbol of the whale that

swallowed Jonah. In the same light, Christ was also swallowed by the Hell-mouth and

kept for three days (ibid).

From the mythology, we can see that women, especially those who do not respect the

borders set in the patriarchal society, are portrayed as the abject. They are often

associated with the idea of vampires, the Vagina Dentata, sometimes the womb and the

Hell-mouth. They are the monstrous feminine that are uncontrollable, lustful, insatiable

and improper.

4.2. Medusa, the Dark Goddess in Greek Mythology

Besides Lamia and the idea of Vagina Dentata, another famous monstrous feminine in

Greek mythology is Medusa, or Gorgon, the dark goddess with a head of snake hair and a

look that kills – whoever look at her eyes will be turned into stone. However, unknown to

many, the diabolical portrayal is only a biased caricature of the Greek goddess. The name

Medusa means "sovereign female wisdom". As the ultimate personification of feminine

wisdom, power, and creativity, the goddess used to reflect the centrality of women in

religious and cultural life (Gimbutas, 1989). In the Upper Paleolithic, according to Alicia

Le Van (2008),

> Her power is represented in labyrinth, vaginal, uterine, and other
> female designs. Throughout the Neolithic, her forces are symbolized
> by the female figure positioned in holy postures and gestures of
> empowerment. But soon the holy image of the Gorgon Medusa as an
> ancient symbol of female power and wisdom became totally
> unacceptable. By the 6th c. B.C. her rites were disrupted, her
> sanctuaries invaded, the sacred groves were cut down, her priestesses
> were violated and her image defiled. Her images are mastered and
> domesticated.

As the matriarchal period was demolished and replaced by the patriarchal age in 600 B.C.,

Medusa was demonized and made evil. She became a threatening, ugly monster. Her

most popular image became that of her defeat in the Athenian myth of Perseus, where she,

as the proud, non-submissive monstrous feminine, had her head cut off by the hero. The once powerful goddess is now suppressed, marginalized and represented as the fearful, disgusting abject figure.

4.3. Sphinx, the Archaic Mother in Greek Mythology

The Sphinx is a mythological creature with a woman head and a lion's body. As Creed (1994) points out, the creature is also an archaic mother figure like the Medusa, who is associated with the abyss, "the all-incorporating black hole which threatens to reabsorb what it once birthed" (27). It is said that her name is derived from 'sphincter', which suggests that she is the mother of sphincteral training. In the Oedipal narrative, the Sphinx symbolizes the pre-Oedipal mother, i.e. the all-devouring womb and death, who has the key to the secrets of life and the universe. According to the myth, she asked all passersby in Thebes, a city in Greece the riddle of life, "Which creature in the morning goes on four feet, at noon on two, and in the evening upon three?" Whenever people failed to give an accurate answer to the riddle, she strangled and devoured them. The tale about the Sphinx ends as Oedipus replied with a correct answer to the riddle – a human being. As a result, the Sphinx threw herself from her high rock and died. Similar to other myths, the monstrous feminine was outwitted and defeated by a male hero.

4.4. Lilith, the Prototype of the Monstrous Feminine in the ancient Hebrew Bible

The myth of Lilith comes from an old and persistent Jewish legend. In the ancient Hebrew Bible, there is a description of Lilith in the book of Isaiah:

> Wildcats shall meet with hyenas,
> goats-demons shall call to each other;
> there too Lilith shall repose,
> and find a place to rest.
> There shall the owl nest
> and lay and hatch and brood in its shadow. (Isaiah 34: 14f)

According to the Jewish mythology, Lilith was the first woman ever created by God. Knowing that Adam was lonely, God created Lilith as his wife. Just as He made Adam, God created Lilith. The only difference was that she was made out of filth and sediment instead of pure dust. Lilith was unwilling to play the submissive role of Adam's wife. "Why must I lie beneath you?" She complained. "I also was made from dust, and am therefore your equal." Because of her disobedience and rebellion, "she was driven into exile, and Eve took her place as the mother of mankind" (Howard, 1987: 58). It is also believed that she was demonized by God. Each day, she would have to give birth to one hundred babies. Yet, by the end of the day, her babies would all perish. Burned with agony and jealousy, Lilith became a monster that took on the appearance of an owl and roamed at night. She "hates fruitfulness and love and the honest intercourse of man with woman" (ibid). For this reason, she would hunt and kill newborn children and pregnant women (Graves and Patai, 1964). She has also become the devil's dam (Sammons, 1979: 144). In other words, Lilith, a woman who refuses to play the gender roles of an obedient

wife and good mother, symbolizes the intrinsically evil female power and sexuality that

seduce and entrap righteous men (Hourihan, 1997).

4.5. 狐狸精 (*Huli Jing*), fox spirits in Chinese legends

Foxes are associated with cunningness, wit or wisdom in fables and children's stories

such as Carlo Collodi's *Pinocchio* (1883) and Antoine de Saint-Exupery's *Le Petit Prince*

(1943). However, in the Chinese language, *Huli Jing* [a fox spirit] is mostly associated

with witchcraft, repressed desires (Kang, 2005), and beautiful, bewitching women. The

negative connotations in fact originate from Chinese legends – as recorded in Guo's

Records from Within the Recondite (1264 / 1995), a fox spirit is a fox that has attained

great age. When it is fifty years old, it can take on the form of a woman. When it

becomes 100 years old, it can transform itself into a beautiful woman. In *Notebook from

the Thatched Cottage of Close Scrutiny* (1789 / 2006), Ji writes that the strange creature

in human shape is a species between human and beast, the living and the dead, as well as

the immortal and demons. What is more, it is said that the fox spirits are good at

witchcraft. They have the power to beguile people, making them lose their senses.

Although not all of them will bring harm to the living, many wicked ones disguise as

women, entice men and deplete men of their sexual energy and life force so as to gather

spiritual essences. In the feudal society of China, a woman who committed illicit sexual

acts or adultery would be accused of being or being possessed by a fox spirit. Similar to a

witch hunt in the west, "All members of the household and family, including servants"

(Theiss, 2004: 101), were allowed to kill the adulterers "in the act or attempting to

apprehend them" (ibid, 100). Although the belief about this monstrous feminine is considered nothing much more than a myth today, *huli Jing* is now a modern colloquial term for a wicked seductress, a slut, or a whore.

4.6. 白蛇 (*Bai She*), White Snake in Chinese Folklore

Another famous monstrous feminine that occurs in Chinese literature is the seductive enchantress, White Snake. Similar to the serpent in the Garden of Eden, the White snake is a symbol of deception, temptations and forbidden desires. In the horror tale of "Madame White Snake Jailed Eternally in the Leifeng Pagoda" (1624), Feng writes that White Snake was in fact a 1000-year-old female white snake demon that took on the form of a beautiful woman and dwelled in the human realm. The White Snake lived with her soul sister, Xiao Qing, another female green snake demon who caused disasters in the area she lived. When the snake-women visited the West Lake, they met a young male scholar called Xu Xian. Xu Xian fell in love with White Snake and married the demonic creature home, without having any idea about her secret identity. His soul was saved only when a monk called Fahai (Literal translation in English: The Sea of Law) discovered the real identity of the monstrous feminine and casted the evil snake-woman into a deep well in Leifeng Pagoda. Just as the many female monsters mentioned previously, White Snake represents the fearful, disgusting abject figure. At the end, she was defeated and punished by a righteous hero.

5. The Monstrous Feminine in C.S. Lewis's Works

Having introduced the different archetypes of female monsters in mythologies, I will look into the representations of abject female figures in the field of English children's literature. In this section, I will start with C.S. Lewis's *The Magician's Nephew* (1950) and *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1955). Many readers, in particular feminists, realize that regarding the representation of female characters, there is a coherent reductive, repressive pattern recurring in the Narnia series. Fry (2005) notes that in the Narnia series, the nature of stereotypical female interests is condemned. Only female characters who can rise above their femininity will be portrayed with positive qualities. Simply put, if female characters are not 'daughters of Eve', it is almost certain that they are 'daughters of Lilith', i.e. the evil witches / queens who are "mesmerized, somnambulistic, vampirized, or variously transfigured" (Auerbach, 1982: 39). In either way, female characters are restricted by these stereotypes. Typical of what Cixous (1974) calls "the machine of repression", in the chronicles, it "has always had the same accomplices; homogenizing, reductive, unifying reason has always allied itself to the Master, to the single, stable, socializable subject, represented by its types or characters" (1974: 389). Probably influenced by the Christian thinking of the time, Narnia is a world polarized into a bigoted binary division of good versus evil, light versus darkness, life versus death, creation versus destruction, salvation versus damnation, warmth versus coldness, vitality versus sterility, etc. While the positive force is represented by the masculine Aslan, a divine, god-like figure that sacrifices himself to bring hope and salvation to the world, the negative, evil force takes the form of a ferocious, dangerous witch, Jadis.

5.1. Jadis as the Daughter of Lilith

In *The Magician's Nephew* (1950) and *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1955), the White Witch is portrayed as pure negativity. She is an evil, disgusting abject that "disturbs identity, system, [and] order" (Kristeva, 1982: 4). As a nonhuman creature, she "does not respect borders, positions, [and] rules" (ibid). She is portrayed so negatively that even her name creates a deep repugnance. According to Sammons (1979), the name 'Jadis' may be associated with at least two negative connotations about women. Firstly, in the English language, 'jade' is a contemptuous name for a woman. According to the Oxford English Dictionary (2009), 'jade' means "a woman, especially a headstrong or disreputable one; a tart, a hussy [archaic and jocular]". Secondly, 'jadish' also bears the meaning of worn or wearied (1979: 144). Apart from her name, the self-professed, callous and tyrannical Queen also inherits the wild, threatening blood of the monstrous feminine. In the story, Mr. Beaver tells the children as well as the readers that the White Witch is a daughter of Lilith and Jinn,

> …she's no Daughter of Eve. She comes of your father Adam's…first wife, her they called Lilith. And she was one of the Jinn. That's what she comes from on one side. And on the other she comes of the giants. No, no, there isn't a drop of real human blood in the Witch. (1950 / 2002: 76).

Following the motifs of Lilith and Jinn, in the Narnia books, Jadis symbolizes the intrinsically evil female power and sexuality that seduces and entraps righteous men (Hourihan, 1997). According to Briggs (1996), the White Witch's Turkish Delight and Edmund's "perverse hunger" (28) can be read as an implicit implication of sexual

seduction and desire, but the explicit sexual themes are suppressed. Now the sexual impulse, vulnerability and indulgence of the body are "displaced by that other primal and atavistic pleasure of eating" (ibid), that is, "the appetite of food" (ibid). Also, when the White Witch invites Edmund to visit her house, she asks him to look at "two little hills" (1950 / 2002: 40), for her house is "between those two hills" (ibid). Hourihan even suggests that the words here "evoke a sense of the female body, and of the possibility of entering it" (1997: 183). Though, as Hourihan has said, at the conscious level, it is extremely unlikely that children would pick up these hidden implications, Jadis the female character is the antagonist associated with the evil force that diverts "male energy away from the cause of 'virtue' and patriarchal dominance" (ibid). In section 5.2, I will discuss more on the negative connotations of Jadis in the Narnia series.

On the other hand, some also recognize Jadis from a pagan worldview. It is said that besides the crucifixion of Christ, Jadis's ritual sacrifice of Aslan reminds them of "the ancient Winter Solstice rituals and blood sacrifices to cultural gods, whether Hindu, Mayan, Inca or Babylonian" (Kjos, 2005). By and large, whether as the daughter of Lilith and Jinn, or a pagan goddess that has a taste for blood and slaughter, Jadis is stereotyped as an ungodly femme fatale, sometimes even a detestable monstrous feminine that threatens the protagonists with her disruptive power.

5.2. Woman as the Abject Figure

Besides stereotyping Jadis as essentially diabolic, *The Magician's Nephew* (1955) and *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950) also portray her as the abject other that possesses multiple divided, disintegrating selves. According to Jackson (1981 / 2003), in the dominant culture, the conception of a person is a unitary self. Beings comprised of multiple selves are an assault on the dominant ideology. Hence, creatures that undergo disintegration, such as Dr. Jekyll, Dorian Gray and werewolves are perceived as abnormal, horrible and monstrous, because they disturb identity, system, and order (Kristeva, 1982). It is noteworthy that the presence of an abject creature does not necessarily subvert the dominant ideology of the self. Although it stands in opposition to language and law, it is the underside of the Symbolic (Wilkie-Stibbs, 2002). Its existence causes abjection and therefore reaffirms norm and order. In *The Philosophy of Horror* (1990), Carroll points out:

> Many of the divided, disintegrating selves of fantasy fiction – Dr. Jekyll, Dorian Gray, werewolves, and so on – in fact literalize popular religious and philosophical views of the person (as divided between good and evil, between reason and appetite, between human and beast). Thus, these creatures do not subvert the culture's conceptions of personhood, but rather articulate them, or, at least, certain of them. (1990: 178)

Similarly, Jadis, a multiple complex of a macho-woman, a human-like nonhuman creature and a living dead, is the "in-between, the ambiguous, the composite" (Kristeva, 1982: 4) creature that blurs the line of demarcation between life and death, human and

beast, masculine and feminine. She is doomed to be the abject horror, or in King's (1981)

terms, an "agent of the norm" (48) that reaffirms the norm. As Stephen King explains:

> We love and need the concept of monstrosity because it is a reaffirmation
> of the order we all crave as human beings…and let me further suggest that
> it is not the physical or mental aberration in itself which horrifies us, but
> rather the lack of order which these situations seem to imply. (1981: 39)

By abjectifying the Witch as a "threat, as a demanding, desiring, angry and violent

presence" (Jackson, 1981 / 2003: 150), feminine power is constrained, repressed and

dismissed.

5.2.1. Jadis as the Macho-woman

In *The Magician's Nephew* (1955) and *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950),

abjection comes from the incongruous dualisms manifested by the White Witch: Jadis has

the form of an irresistibly beautiful woman but she possesses abnormal macho aggression,

brutal strength and virility. When she is first introduced in *The Magician's Nephew* (1955

/ 2002), she is the most beautiful woman in the world:

> …a woman even more richly dressed than the others, very tall…, with
> a look of such fierceness and pride that it took your breath away…she
> was beautiful. Years afterwards when he was an old man, Digory said
> he had never in all his life known a woman so beautiful (48).

She has airs and graces too, "…you could see at once, not only from her crown and robes,

but from the flash of her eyes and the curve of her lips, that she was a great queen" (53).

Yet, soon after that, the readers find out more about her unwomanly behaviour. For

instance, when she speaks, her voice is so strong and terrible that it can make the whole

room shiver, "Then Jadis spoke; not very loud, but there was something in her voice that

made the whole room quiver" (68). She is also too fierce and athletic to be truly feminine.

The following is what happens when she rides a hansom:

> There was no one in the driver's seat. On the roof – not sitting, but
> standing on the roof – swaying with superb balance as it came at full
> speed round the corner with one wheel in the air – was Jadis…The
> hansom crashed into the lamp-post and shattered into several pieces.
> The Witch, with a magnificent jump, had sprung clear just in time and
> landed on the horse's back (82).

Such wildness and fierceness clash tremendously with the initial feminine impression she

gives readers.

What is more, instead of being gentle, modest and ladylike, she treats others rudely,

cruelly and brutally. When she first meets Uncle Andrew, she forcefully "seized a great

handful of Uncle Andrew's grey hair and pulled his head back so that his face looked up

into her" (69). Similarly, she treats Aunt Letty with the same kind of brutal force. To get

Aunt Letty out of her way, like a beast "she lunged forward, caught Aunt Letty round the

neck and the knees, raised her high above her head as if she had been no heavier than a

doll, and threw her across the room" (77). She is unkind to animals too. When she is

riding the hansom, she "flogged the horse without mercy", until the poor animal's

"nostrils were wide and red and its sides were spotted with foam" (82). The odd

combination of her feminine physical appearance and her macho, aggressive manners is

hard for the readers to stomach.

5.2.2. Jadis as the Human-like, Nonhuman Creature

Another incongruous dualism embodied in Jadis is her human-like, yet nonhuman origin. When the witch first appears in *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950 / 2002), she is described as "a great lady" (33). However, at the same time, Lewis has left some lines of foreshadowing. Suspicion and an uncanny feeling emerge as the readers are informed that she is "taller than any woman that Edmund had ever seen" and, abnormally pale, "Her face was white – not merely pale, but white like snow or paper or icing-sugar, except for her very red mouth" (33). In the middle of the story, it is finally revealed that "there isn't a drop of real human blood in the Witch" (76). This has not only created confusion, but also fear and abjection in the characters and readers. As Mr. Beaver says, "…when you meet anything that's going to be human and isn't yet, or used to be human once and isn't now, or ought to be human and isn't, you keep your eyes on it and feel for your hatchet." (1950, 2002: 77). With the discovery of her disguise and her nonhuman origin, the queen gradually loses her persona of decency and solemnity. She sinks backwards towards animality, behaving like a wild beast. When she speaks, she roars like an animal (ibid: 106). In the chapter of "The triumph of the Witch", we are told that people of her kind are all evil beasts and detestable monsters:

> But such people! Ogres with monstrous teeth, and wolves, and bull-headed men; spirits of evil trees and poisonous plants; and other creatures whom I won't describe because if I did the grown-ups would probably not let you read this book – Cruels and Hags and Incubuses, Wraiths, Horrors, Efreets, Sprites, Orknies, Wooses, and Ettins (1950 / 2002: 138).

Such "recidivism (a relapse in crime)" and "regression to bestial levels" (Jackson, 1981,

2003: 116), again, inject horror and abjection in readers.

5.2.3. Jadis as the Living Dead

Throughout the story, the White Witch's morbid quality is often in focus. In *The Magician's Nephew* (1955, 2002), when Digory and Polly see her for the first time, Queen Jadis is as lifeless and still as a piece of waxwork, "There was not a movement nor the sound of a breath" (46 - 47). Even when she is awakened and has recovered her strength later on in the book, Lewis keeps mentioning her ice-cold face and dead-white complexion. In the chapter of "The beginning of Uncle Andrew's troubles", the queen comes up to the real world by holding on fast to Polly's hair. There, her stale-pale whiteness and vampire-like appearance is described in great detail, "Queen Jadis looked different. She was much paler than she had been; so pale that hardly any of her beauty was left. And she was stooped and seemed to be finding it hard to breathe, as if the air of that place stifled her" (66). A similar description can be found in *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950, 2002). In "Edmund and the wardrobe", it is said that "She…was covered in white fur up to her throat…Her face was white – not merely pale, but white like snow or paper or icing-sugar" (33). Also, in "Deep magic from the dawn of time", her stale whiteness is the centre of attraction, "Her arms were…terribly white. Because they were so very white he could see them" (124). She is so abnormally sterile and pale that it is as if there is no life in her. Under her reign, "it is always winter…and never Christmas" (57) in Narnia. Strangely enough, while she shows such morbid features, she

can be "ten times more alive than most of the people one meets in London" (1955, 2002: 67). In the light of the abject combination of such living-dead features, it makes sense to associate her with vampires, or any creatures that drain and dry up people's life force. As Manlove (1987) notices:

> The Witch…is a vampire, a drawer of life from things to herself, and one who lives only with the unnatural and the deformed – with Hags, Werewolves, Minotaurs and the like. She drains the vitality from Narnia, literally 'bleeds it white', and she would with her dagger do the same to Aslan. (1987: 131)

Howard also notes the Witch's vampire-like feature, "If she can lull you and entice you away from light-of-day reality, and lead you into the sterile limbo of illusion where you will dry up and die, then she has done what she wants to do" (1987: 58). In conclusion, being represented as a living-dead, a human-like nonhuman creature, and a queer woman who suspiciously possesses overwhelming virility, the White Witch is doomed to be the abject horror. She is perceived as the abnormal, horrible, unclean being that needs to be ejected and erased. At the end of *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950, 2002), she is well-punished and killed by Aslan and his league. The lure of her feminine power is repressed and dismissed.

6. The Monstrous Feminine in Roald Dahl's *The Witches* (1983)

As a children's book, Roald Dahl's *The Witches* is regarded as funny, fascinating and humourous. In February 2008, it was included in the top 50 children's books, ranking number 24, as voted by the British readers (*Daily Telegraph*, 26 Feb 08). However,

entertaining and enjoyable as it is, *The Witches* has also been regarded as 'scary' by many child readers. In the IMDB website, the film adaptation of *The Witches* (1990) is classified under the genre of "Fantasy, family and horror". Like horror fiction, the nightmarish depiction of the murderous, bloodthirsty witches in the story creates the feeling of horror and disgust in readers as I shall demonstrate in the following.

6.1. Witches as Child-killers

Like the White Witch in *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe*, the witches in Roald Dahl's *The Witches* represent evil, death, destruction, damnation, coldness and sterility. The reader is not given an explanation for the existence and presence of the monstrous feminine. They simply exist as "the most dangerous of all the living creatures on earth" (Dahl, 1983: 3), or, as Creed (1993) remarks, "an implacable enemy of the symbolic order" (76) who wreak destruction in the community. Incapable of creating life like ordinary mothers, the witches hate children "with a red-hot sizzling hatred" (Dahl, 1983: 1). It is said that a real witch "spends all her time plotting to get rid of the children in her particular territory. Her passion is to do away with them, one by one" (ibid). In the witches meeting, the witches show their hatred of children through chanting, clapping and cheering, "Wipe them away! Scrub them off the face of the earth! Flush them down the drain!" (71). Dahl puts it in a humourous way but still it reminds us of Lilith, the woman who refuses to be the obedient wife of Adam. Much affected patriarchal ideology, Lilith is depicted as a jealous, diabolic, vengeful, childless woman who cannot tolerate to see the children of Adam and Eve. Her sole purpose and pleasure are to kill infants and

little human children. The witches, therefore, can be viewed as the daughters of Lilith, because they follow the motif of Lilith – the jealous monstrous feminine.

6.2. Witches as Abject Figure

Besides being the diabolic child-killers, Dahl's witches are also an abject figure that threatens and challenges our bodily identity. In the story, the witches are represented as the ambiguous, nameless creatures that cause fear and repulsion in us. Their feminine outlook and masculine behaviour, their human-like, yet non-human identity, their disfigured, grotesque physical appearances, together with the range of abject things they are associated with: decay, maggots, toads, rat's tails, etc., disturb the demarcation between man and woman, human and beast, natural and supernatural, living and dead, clean and defiled, self and other. Besides forcing the reader to confront their abject bodies, the witches also disgust the reader as they threaten to turn children into spooky creatures that cannot be recognized as humans. In the following section, I will discuss how Dahl portrays witches as the abject "in-between" that "does not respect borders, positions, rules" (Kristeva, 1983).

6.2.1. The Grand High Witch as the Macho-woman

Like Jadis in *The Magician's Nephew* (1955) and *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950), the Grand High Witch in Dahl's book also manifests incongruous dualism – she has the fake angelic outlook of a tiny, young, pretty woman but she possesses beast-like

macho aggression and temper. When the Grand High Witch is first introduced, she is described as "tiny, probably no more than four and a half feet tall", "quite young…about twenty-five or six" and "very pretty" (59). However, soon after that, it is discovered that her pretty face is just a mask to cover up her horrible real face. It is also found that the tiny woman can shout so loudly and harshly that her voice fills the room and bounces around the walls. According to the protagonist, the voice of the Grand High Witch has a "hard metallic quality" (62). Far from being lady-like, "[i]t rasped. It grated. It snarled. It scraped. It shrieked. And it growled" (62). In daily English, these verbs often appear in negative contexts bearing derogatory meanings. For instance, "rasped", "grated" and "scraped" are used to describe dry, hoarsely, metallic sounds:

	Examples found in The Bank of English
rasped	"The motor rasped heavily."
grated	"A line of empty cars that screeched and grated on the rails…"
scraped	"The heavy chain scraped its way along the deck."

On the other hand, "snarled", "shrieked" and "growled" are usually wild and animalistic in nature. The following are some examples that show how the three verbs are used in daily English:

	Examples found in The Bank of English
snarled	"Coyote snarled in frustration."
shrieked	"Somewhere outside a pheasant shrieked."
growled	"…the Beast growled out again."

Apart from the frightening voice, the ruthless, aggressive behaviour of the Grand High Witch strikes a drastic contrast with her petite outlook. For instance, when she talks, no

one can answer her back or argue with her. Anyone who dares to do so and 'make her

cross' will be punished by death, regardless of how one begs for forgiveness.

6.2.2. Witches as the 'Demons in Human Shape'

Again, similar to C.S. Lewis's Jadis in the Narnia series, the witches in Dahl's book are

said to be human-like, yet non-human creatures. First of all, the reader is informed that

"[a] witch is always a woman" (3) and "[t]hey all look like nice ladies" (4). However,

later, it is revealed in chapter three that witches are not women but in fact "demons in

human shape" (24):

> …witches are not actually women at all. They look like women. They
> talk like women. And they are able to act like women. But in actual
> fact, they are totally different animals. They are demons in human
> shape. That is why they have claws and bald heads and queer noses and
> peculiar eyes, all of which they have to conceal as best they can from
> the rest of the world (23 – 24).

The narrator remarks that the fact that witches do not look dangerous make them doubly

dangerous. Similarly, the false womanhood and the uncanny human-like camouflage

(such as their wigs, gloves and pointed shoes) make the witches even more loathsome and

disgusting to the reader. The feeling of abjection is also reflected in the first person

narrative. In chapter seven, the protagonist happens to see the real body forms of all the

witches in the RSPCC (The Royal Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children)

meeting. With the most negative vocabulary, he describes that the sight is "awful",

"grotesque", "monstrous" and "unnatural" not just because of the witches' physical

deformity, but also because the witches are all "dressed in fashionable and rather pretty clothes" (ibid).

6.2.3. Witches and Their Disfigured, Deformed Bodies

Another abject feature possessed by the witches is the deformity of their bodies. What is unacceptable is that the mutated bodies of the monstrous creatures are not quite human, nor are they fully animal. The liminal state they are in transgresses the boundaries of the self. The foreignness and familiarity manifested in the bodies of the deformed monsters confuse the demarcation. The abject figure prevents the subject from defining itself in opposition to the alien object. Worse still, it suggests a slippage between the self and the abject because some part of the abject is too close and similar to the subject. Dahl spends more than a chapter describing the secrets about the witches' hidden and abnormal body parts. Firstly, the focus is on the witches' hands: they have hands like humans but there is some hideous difference – in chapter three, grandma tells the protagonist that witches do not have fingernails but thin curvy claws like a cat's. Later on in chapter seven, the protagonist sees the difference with his own eyes, "I could see the brown claws curving over the tips of the fingers! They were about two inches long, those claws and sharp at the ends!" (62 - 63). Besides the claws, there is also something wrong with the witches' feet. It is said that "[w]itches never have toes". "They just have feet" that "have square ends with no toes on them at all" (24). This is confirmed by the protagonist as well, as he hides in the ballroom which the witches have booked for a private meeting,

> I got a glimpse under the chairs of several pairs of stockinged feet,
> square and completely toeless. Revolting they were, as though the toes
> had been sliced away from the feet with a carving-knife (63).

Other subtler but equally disgusting deformities include the witches' "naked scalps" (64)
where "not a single hair grows on" (19), their "slightly larger nose-holes than ordinary
people" (20), their supernatural power of smell, their blue spit, and their colour changing
pupils, where "you will see fire and you will see ice dancing right in the very centre of
the coloured dot" (22). All these peculiar bodily differences cause fear and threats. It is
the witchophiles' wish to look out for the little signals, root out and destroy all the
witches. In the same light, it is a pain that the abject cannot be easily spotted and got rid
of, as the protagonist discloses, "if only…we could round them [the witches] all up and
put them in the meat-grinder. Unhappily, there is no such way" (5).

6.2.4. Witches as the Living Dead

As Barbara Creed (1994) points out, "The witch is an abject figure who dwells with
abject things" (77). Dahl's witches are no exception. In chapter seven, we are told that the
Grand High Witch's pretty face is just a mask. Her real face is:

> …crumbled and wizened, so shrunken and shrivelled, it looked as though
> it had been pickled in vinegar…There was something terribly wrong with
> it, something foul and putrid and decayed. It seemed quite literally to be
> rotting away the mouth and cheeks, I could see the skin all cankered and
> worm-eaten, as though maggots were working away in there. (60)

 The adjectives used to describe her face are associated with the abject – "foul", "putrid",
"dreadful", "decayed", "rotting", "cankered", "worm-eaten", all of which trigger fear and

disgust in the reader. Below is a table that illustrates how these adjectives are used in real

life contemporary English:

	Sentences or clauses found in The Bank of English
Foul	"The appendix had burst and pus and foul matters were everywhere"
Putrid	"13 hours after I had felt ill, the putrid swollen organ was removed."
Dreadful	"She's got dreadful diarrhea."
Decayed	"His tooth was broken and decayed."
Rotting	"…a vile odour of putrefaction, of rotting bodies, of blood, of stale human sweat."
Cankered	"Badly cankered trees…are best destroyed."
Worm-eaten	"I crouched, abject and let its worm-eaten grandeur roll over me."

As shown in the table above, the adjectives are usually used to describe body waste, dead

flesh, deterioration, illness, our bodies' decay and eventual death.

Another description of the witches that causes the feeling of repulsion is about the "foul",

"spotty", "red and itchy-looking" (64) bald heads of the witches. At first, the protagonist

finds the hair-scratching ladies unattractive and annoying. He relates the act of scratching

with negative associations such as dandruff, fleas and nits in their hair. Then, as he

discovers that all the ladies are bald-headed, and that all of them have their scalp skin

rubbed raw by the linings of the wigs, he is shocked and feels disgusted. The ugly, naked,

scabby scalps as described by Dahl bring up another horrifying abject – the defiled body

with diseased, inflamed skin. Body horror such as the wounded flesh and inflamed skin

challenges our bodily identity because while the swollen skin or wound may not be

totally alien to our body, it threatens to spread the parasitic virus or bacteria, infect our

skin and turn us into one of them.

6.2.5. Witches as the Dehumanizing Threat

In section 6.1, I mentioned that witches are child killers who kill children out of hatred and vengefulness. In the book, Dahl does not explain why witches hate children, but it is stated clearly that "[a] REAL WITCH gets the same pleasure from squelching a child as you get from eating a plateful of strawberries and thick cream" (2). In light of this, we can see Dahl's witches as female monsters similar to Lilith, the jealous ex-partner of Adam who gains pleasure from killing others' babies. However, compared to Lilith in the Hebrew Bible or Jadis in C.S. Lewis's World of Narnia, the witches in Dahl's books are closest to the abject figure. This is because apart from being the figure of transformation, Dahl's witches also have the threatening power and obsession to dehumanize children into "some creature or other that all grown-ups hate" (30), making them suffer before they die of a hideous death.

In *The Witches*, there are numerous examples of witches turning humans into peculiar animals, stone, and even a character in an oil-painting. A*s* the protagonist's grandma reveals in chapter four, children are often turned into slugs so that "the grown-ups step on the slug and squish it without knowing it's a child" (ibid). A crueler trick is to transform children into pheasants when the pheasant-shooting season is about to open. In order to make the evil transformations sound more realistic and terrifying, 'authentic cases' of the dehumanizing processes in Norway are mentioned often with 'real names' of the victims given. In chapter two of the story, two cases of children being turned into lifeless objects are mentioned. It is said that a little girl called Solveg Christiansen vanished after eating

an apple given by a 'nice lady'. Later on, she was found to have become a part of an old

oil-painting in the living room. Also, a boy called Harold was turned into stone as if he

had suffered from the Medusa's gaze:

> One morning his skin went all grayish-yellow. Then it became hard
> and crackly, like the shell of a nut. By evening, the boy had turned into
> stone (15).

Two more cases of children being dehumanized into animals are also mentioned in the

same chapter: a girl called Birgit Svenson was transformed into a chicken that laid big,

brown eggs. It is said that her parents had to keep her in a cage in the garden. Also, a

nine-year-old boy called Leif was transformed into a porpoise after diving into the water.

As the story goes on, we are also told that the protagonist and a boy called Bruno Jenkins

are dehumanized into rats and they are not turned back into humans. Below is a detailed

first-person description of the metamorphosis:

> It was quite literally a tightening and a shrinking of the skin all over my
> body…I was squeezed like an orange into a pulpy mess with the juice
> running out of my sides. After that there came a fierce prickling
> sensation all over my skin…and this…was the growing of the mouse-
> fur…I am not myself any longer! I have gone clear out of my own skin!
> (109 – 110)

The graphic description of the tightening skin, the shrinking body, the growing of beastly

fur, and the disgusting description of the leaking body fluid may look humourous but it

also creates a revolting feeling. The scene reminds us of the eerie transformation of

werewolf. Much against the subject's will, the repulsive abject keeps invading. The

identity of the subject collapses as the acceptable boundary is transgressed without

resistance.

7. The Monstrous Feminine in Philip Pullman's *The Amber Spyglass* (2000)

Having discussed the constructions of the monstrous-feminine in both C.S. Lewis's Narnia books and Roald Dahl's *The Witches*, in this section, I shall move on to a more recent children's fantasy – Philip Pullman's *The Amber Spyglass* (2000), the third book of the *His Dark Materials* trilogy. Published in 1995 - 2000, *His Dark Materials* is popular with children, teen and adult readers. The series has also won numerous prestigious prizes, including the Whitbread Book of the Year prize in January 2002 (the first children's book to receive the award). In 2003, the series took the third place in the BBC's Big Read Poll. Later on in 2005, Pullman was also announced as joint winner of the Astrid Lindgren Memorial Award for children's literature (Wikipedia, 2008). The novel is now being made into motion pictures. The first episode was shown in cinemas worldwide in December 2007. The second episode is said to be coming soon.

While *His Dark Materials* is crowned with countless prestigious book awards and prizes, it is also considered highly controversial by Christians. The subversive retelling of the Adam and Eve myth, the evil portrayal of Christianity and the Church, as well as the blasphemous suggestion for a republic of heaven in the trilogy are read as incitements to defy Christianity. Pullman is labeled "the most dangerous author in Britain" (Hitchens, 2002: 63). Subversive as it is, what I am interested to find out in this section is: how does Pullman represent female monsters in his work? Is the portrayal of the monstrous feminine, i.e. the harpies in *The Amber Spyglass* (2000) a perpetuation of the monstrous feminine stereotype, where women are represented as the "shocking, terrifying, horrific

abject" (Creed, 1994: 1) that threaten to disturb and overthrow the symbolic order? Or has Pullman rewritten the role and fate of the abject women? In the following, I shall first look into Pullman's description of the physical appearance of the harpies. Then, I will discuss the role that the harpies play in *The Amber Spyglass* (2000).

7.1. Harpies, the Human-like, Non-human Creatures

In terms of the physical appearance of harpies in *The Amber Spyglass*, the female monsters undoubtedly fall into the category of 'women as the human-like, non-human creatures'. This is so because at the first place, 'harpies' are not invented by Pullman. Rather, they are legendary dead spirits borrowed from Greek Mythology. Literally, the word 'harpy' means 'that which grabs'. Like a sphinx, a harpy is half-human and half-animal. It is made up of a woman's head (usually with long hair) and breasts, with a vulture's wings, body and claws. In the book, Pullman does not change anything on the appearance of harpies. He presents the harpies just as the way they were presented in the Greek myth. In Pullman's words, "[t]he thing was a great bird the size of a vulture, with the face and breasts of a woman." (2000: 304). The harpies in Pullman's book are therefore bound to be the in-between, uncanny, abject creatures.

7.2. Harpies as the Living Dead

Pullman may not be blamed for the creatures' half-bird, half-human abject body forms, but still he is responsible for how harpies are portrayed in his books. In *The Amber Spyglass*, Pullman has definitely added and exaggerated some abject elements in the

portrayal of the monstrous feminine. For instance, the life-in-death feature of the harpies

is focused and magnified to create the feeling of abjection in readers. In chapter 21, there

is a detailed description of the uncanny, scary face of a harpy:

> Her face was smooth and unwrinkled, but aged beyond even the age of the
> witches: she had seen thousands of years pass, and the cruelty and misery
> of all of them had formed the hateful expression on her features. (2000:
> 304)

What is weird, confusing and disgusting about the harpy's face is that it is young and

aged at the same time. If a face that has seen "thousands of years pass" is extraordinary,

supernatural, and associated with the death, a smooth, unwrinkled face that has seen

"thousands of years pass" is incoherent, irrational, disturbing and nightmarish. To a

certain extent, it is in line with what Creed (1994) calls the "ancient", "archaic maternal

figure" (24), whose presence is outside the Symbolic and beyond the conventional

representational system. In addition to the supernatural, terrifying power of being archaic

but still looking young, Pullman also adds that the harpy's face has formed a hateful

expression. The negative representation is unsurprising as the harpies have threatened the

patriarchal Symbolic order. The monstrous feminine is doomed to be negated and

discredited.

7.3. Harpies Associated with Excretion and Decay

Besides being portrayed as ancient living dead creatures that do not age, harpies are also meant to be perceived as disgusting, unclean creatures in Pullman's book. When they first appear in Pullman's text, their repulsive features are described in detail,

> Her eye-sockets were clotted with filthy slime, and the redness of her lips was caked and crusted as if she had vomited ancient blood again and again. Her matted, filthy black hair hung down to her shoulders…a drift of putrescent stink wafted from her every time she moved…the harpy…opened her mouth and directed a jet of noise right in their faces… the sheer power of her scream had made him dizzy…The harpy shook her wings wide, and the travelers nearly fainted in the hideous smells of corruption and decay that wafted from her. (304 - 307)

On reading Pullman's description of the appearance of harpies, I find that the polluting, excremental bodily wastes and decay invoke a response of disgust. From the "filthy slime" clotted around the eye-sockets, the "ancient blood" around the "caked and crusted", "sickening" (305) red lips, the "matted, filthy" hair, the "drift of putrescent stink" wafted from the body, to "the filthy state of the claw" (309), we can see the monstrous feminine has been aligned with the abject. Similar to Dahl's witches, Pullman's harpies are the abject which the subject finds loathsome and intolerable. Both Will and Lyra feel "sick and full of pain" (305), "repelled" (ibid) when facing the monstrous feminine. When Lyra is attacked by the harpies and has a clump of her hair torn out, she is "shaky" and "ash-pale" (309). Will also has a hard time "trying not to think of the filthy state of the claw" (ibid) that made the wound on Lyra's head as he takes care of the gash. The unclean abject needs to be 'radically excluded' and propelled

away from the self because the abject reminds the living subject of deterioration and death.

7.4. The Breakthrough: Harpies as the Unclean Maternal Figure with Pure Reason

Despite the abject features possessed by the harpies, Pullman's monstrous feminine is different from Dahl's witches and C.S. Lewis's Jadis in the Narnia books. At first glance, the representations may look similar. Yet, the representation of the abject figure changes across the narrative. As the story continues, the reader will find that the harpies in *The Amber Spyglass* do not actually desire for evil. In chapter 23, No-name (a harpy) discloses that they are not happy with doing sheer evil. As harpies, they need a duty that brings them honour and a task that they can perform with pride. Ultimately, it is pride, respect and honour that the harpies long for:

> We have our pride, and you should not let that be dispensed with. We need
> an honourable place! We need a duty and a task to do, that will bring us the
> respect we deserve! (2000: 333)

It is also revealed that their resentment towards humans and their ghosts only comes from the wickedness, cruelty and greed they see in people. Their aggressiveness is not entirely their fault because it is the Authority who gives them "the power to see the worst in every one" (331). They are made to feed on the worst till their "hearts are sickened" (ibid). By nature, they have a deep hatred towards liars, lies and fantasies. This explains why they attack and mock Lyra when Lyra tells them fictitious stories. Instead of being irrational and unpredictable, the harpies love and are attracted by truths, knowledge and wisdom.

They stop their attacks and listen solemnly while Lyra shares true stories of her life and experience. When Lyra asks them why they cease their attack, the harpies explain:

> Because it was true…Because it was nourishing. Because it was feeding us.
> Because we couldn't help it…Because it brought us news of the world and
> the sun and the wind and the rain (332).

In Pullman's story, harpies may be depicted as a monstrous, abject figure with supernatural power, but what is amazing is that they can also be reasoned with, negotiated with, and eventually tamed. Pullman's harpies, in other words, are not a perpetuation of the monstrous feminine stereotype. Rather, it is a re-version (Stephens and McCallum, 1998) that makes use of the monstrous feminine stereotype and subverts the ideology in the pre-text. It is "a new textual and ideological configuration" (ibid: 2).

In the typical monstrous feminine stereotype, the female abject is a source of the deepest horror. It threatens the existence of the subject and the Symbolic order. Therefore, as Creed (1994) points out, "[a]n opposition is drawn between the impure fertile (female) body and pure speech associated with the symbolic body" (1994: 25). Interestingly, in Pullman's book, the opposition is overthrown. The abject female is now a combination of both – it is a living dead creature with a non-human body, but it also has a rational, logical mind that is compatible with the Symbolic order. Reasoning, negotiation and reconciliation with the harpies are possible. For instance, in exchange for Lyra's true story, they show Lyra and her companions the way out to the upper world. They "take the travelers and their knife to a part of the land of the dead where the upper world was close" (334). The bird-forms are also willing to make a treaty with the ghosts – when the

ghosts tell them true stories of the world, the harpies will guide them faithfully "from the landing-place by the lake all the way through the land of the dead to the new opening out into the world" (ibid).

As the plot develops, Lyra even goes as far as to make friends with the monstrous feminine. Instead of drawing the boundaries between the self and the abject, Lyra embraces the abject. The fear of not being able to keep the subject "whole and proper" is dismissed. This happens when Lyra is at the edge of the abyss, falling, the monstrous feminine rescues her:

> And out of the dark swooped that creature whose claws had raked her scalp not long before, No-Name the harpy, woman-faced, bird-winged; and those same claws closed tight around the girls' wrist…the harpy carried the child up and up out of the gulf and brought her limp and fainting to Will's reaching arms. (2000: 379)

Because of the rescue, No-Name the harpy is blessed, praised, and called "the saviour of all, generous one" (379) by many. Moreover, to thank the harpy for saving her life, Lyra gives the monstrous feminine a beautiful and respectable name, "I'm going to call you Gracious Wings. So that's your name now, and that's what you'll be for evermore: Gracious Wings" (405). The filth and disgusting features of the harpies are much forgotten. For more than once, Lyra kisses and hugs the female monster lovingly,

> As soon as Lyra could move, she reached out trembling for the harpy and put her arms around her neck, kissing and kissing her ravaged face (379)…She embraced the harpy, hugging her tightly and kissing her on both cheeks (405).

In Pullman's re-version, the story of people's lives, "the truth about what they've seen and touched and heard and loved and known in the world" (333) are of first priority. Truths and the pursuit of knowledge are honoured and respected by all, including the female monsters. When compared to the truth, binary oppositions between the self and the abject, the clean and the foul, human and non-human, living and dead etc., become insignificant. The role and the fate of the monstrous-feminine are rewritten in a positive light.

8. Conclusion

In this paper, I analyzed the descriptions of female antagonists in C.S. Lewis's Narnia books, Roald Dahl's *The Witches* (1983) and Philip Pullman's *The Amber Spyglass* (2000). With reference to existing theories and discussions about the monstrous feminine, I revisited the archetypes of monstrous women in the Greek mythology, in the ancient Hebrew Bible, as well as in some Chinese folklore and legends. In sections five and six, I looked into the plot and the words used to describe the female protagonists in two popular children's texts. I proved that a similar reductive, repressive pattern recurs in the Narnia series and Roald Dahl's children's book. In the Narnia books, Jadis is stereotyped as an ungodly, Lilith-like femme fatale who possesses multiple divided, disintegrating selves. As a multiple complex of a macho-woman, a human-like nonhuman creature and a living dead, Jadis is the "in-between, the ambiguous, the composite" (Kristeva, 1982: 4) creature that blurs the line of demarcation between life and death, human and non-human, masculine and feminine.

Employing the same monstrous-feminine stereotype, Dahl's witches are portrayed more or less in the same light. As reflected in the plot and the choice of specific vocabulary that the witches are represented, the female antagonists are represented as the ambiguous, nameless abject that causes fear and repulsion in us. Their feminine outlook and masculine behaviour, their human-like, yet non-human identity, their disfigured, grotesque physical appearance, together with their evil desire and power to dehumanize and kill children make them a life-threatening negation that must be radically excluded. At the end of the story, the abject is ejected, erased and the demarcation line between subject and that which threatens its existence is redrawn more rigidly. The purification brings relief and a vengeful pleasure.

In Pullman's *The Amber Spyglass* (2000), the harpies are first represented as the monstrous feminine who do not "respect borders, positions, rules", that "disturbs identity, system, order" (Kristeva, 1983: 4). However, as the story continues, the harpies are found to be a re-version, instead of a perpetuation of the monstrous feminine stereotype. They are a combination of the in-between, abject body and pure reason. The role played by the harpies is drastically different from the previously mentioned female monsters. Under the rewriting of Pullman, they become "the saviour of all, generous one" (2000: 379). Newly named and honoured as the 'Gracious Wings', the monstrous feminine regains its long-lost power in the matriarchal period in human history. The brave breakthrough from the one-dimensional, portrayals of women is a parody of the archetype of the monstrous feminine. In my opinion, Philip Pullman is not just a best-selling storyteller, but also an

excellent writer who inspires children and young people to go beyond clichés and keep an

open mind when reading.

Bibliography

Auerbach, Nina. *Woman and the Demon: The Life of a Victorian Myth.* Cambridge, Massachusetts and London, England: Harvard University Press, 1982.

Carroll, Noel. *The Philosophy of Horror or Paradoxes of the Heart.* New York and London: Routledge, 1990.

Collodi, Carlo. *The Adventures of Pinocchio.* Trans. Ann Lawson Lucas. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.

Creed, B. *The Monstrous-Feminine: Film, Feminism, Psychoanalysis.* London and New York: Routledge, 1994.

Dahl, Roald. *The Witches*. London: Penguin Books, 1983.

Feng, Menglong. *Jing Shi Tong Yan.* Shanghai: Shanghai gu ji chu ban she, 1624, 1995.

Fry, Karin. "No Longer a Friend of Narnia: Gender in Narnia". *The Chronicles of Narnia and Philosophy: The Lion, the Witch and the Worldview.* Edited by Gregory Bassham and Jerry L. Walls. Chicago and La Salle, Illinois: Open Court, 2005.

Gimbutas, M. The Language of the Goddess: Sacred Images and Symbols of Old Europe. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1989.

Graves, Robert & Raphael Patai. *Hebrew Myths: The Book of Genesis.* New York: Doubleday, 1964.

Grosz, Elizabeth. *Sexual Subversion: Three French Feminists.* Sydney: Allen & Unwin Australia Pty Ltd, 1989, 1990.

Guo Pu Zhuan. *Xuan Zhong Ji* [Records from Within the Recondite]. Shanghai: Shanghai gu ji chu ban she, 1264, 1995.

Hitchens, Peter. "This is the Most Dangerous Author in Britain". *The Mail on Sunday*. 27 January 2002, p.63

Hourihan, Margery. *Deconstructing the Hero: Literary Theory and Children's Literature.* London and New York: Routledge, 1997.

Howard, Thomas. *C.S. Lewis: Man of Letters.* San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1987.

Jackson, Rosemary. *Fantasy: The Literature of Subversion.* London and New York: Methuen & Co. Ltd, 1981, 2003.

Ji, Yun. *Xin yi Yue wei cao tang bi ji* [Notebook from the Thatched Cottage of Close Scrutiny]. Xianggang: Hai xiao chu ban shi ye you xian gong si, 2006.

Kang, Xiaofei. "Sex with Foxes: Fantasy and Power in Traditional Chinese Stories". *River Gazette* 5(2):8. 2005.

King, Stephen. *Danse Macabre.* New York: Everest, 1981.

Kjos, Berit. "Narnia: Blending Truth and Myth". *Kjos Ministries.* <http://www.crossroad.to/articles2/05/narnia.htm>, 2005. Accessed on 10 July 2008.

Kristeva, J. *The Powers of Horror: An Essay on Abjection*. New York: Columbia UP, 1983.

Levi-Strauss, C. *The Structural Study of Myth and Totemism*. London: Tavistock Publications. 1967

------- *Myth and Meaning*. London and Henley: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1978.

Lewis, C.S. *The Chronicles of Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe*. London: Grafton, 1950, 2000.

------- *The Chronicles of Narnia: The Magician's Nephew*. London: Grafton, 1955, 2002.

Manlove, Collin. *C.S. Lewis: His Literary Achievement.* New York: St. Martin's, 1987.

Oxford English Dictionary. Edited by J.A. Simplson and E.S.C. Weiner. Additions. Edited by John Simpson and Edmund Weiner; Michael Proffit. OED Online. Oxford UP. <http://dictionary.oed.com>. Accessed on 20 May 2009.

Pullman, Philip. *The Amber Spyglass.* London: Scholastic Press, 2000, 2001.

Rickels, Lawrence, A. *The Vampire Lectures.* Minneapolis: The University of Minnesota Press, 1999.

Saint-Exupéry, de Antoine de. *The Little Prince.* Trans. Katherine Woods. San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971.

Sammons, Martha C. *A Guide through Narnia.* Great Britain: Hodder & Stoughton, 1979.

Stephens, J & McCallum, R. *Retelling Stories, Framing Culture.* New York: Garland
Publishers, 1998.

Telegraph. "The Top 50 Children's Books". Telegraph.co.uk. 26 Feb 2008.
<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/uknews/1579457/The-top-50-children's-books.html> Accessed on 10 July 2008.

Theiss, Janet M. *Disgraceful Matters: The Politics of Chastity in Eighteenth-Century
China.* Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: University of California Press, 2004.

Van, Alicia Le. *The Gorgon Medusa.*
<http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/classes/finALp.html>. Accessed on 10 July 2008.

Walker, Barbara, G. "vagina dentate", *Woman's Encyclopedia of Myths and Secrets.* San
Francisco: Harper & Row, p. 1034-37, 1983.

Wilkie-Stibbs, Christine. *The Feminine Subject in Children's Literature.* New York and
London: Routledge, 2002.

Wikipedia. *Wikipedia Online.* Wikimedia Foundation. <http://en.wikipedia.org>.
Accessed on 10 July 2008.

Cross-dressing in Chinese Classics and Their English Versions

(Module Two, Paper Two)

by

WING BO TSO

A research paper submitted to
The University of Birmingham
in part fulfillment of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Applied Linguistics

Centre for English Language Studies
School of English, Drama and American & Canadian Studies
College of Arts and Law
The University of Birmingham
November 2010

Abstract

Cross dressing, or the act of adopting the role and many of the customs of the opposite gender, "implies different things in different cultures and has been viewed historically in widely varying ways" (Bullough and Bullough, 1993: 3). To reveal the different attitudes and ideological assumptions about sex and gender in Western and Chinese cultures, in this paper, I examine the portrayals of cross dressing in three well-known Chinese stories: *The Ballad of Mulan* (500 – 600 A.D.), *The Butterfly Lovers* (850 – 880 A.D.), and *Censored by Confucius: Ghost Stories* (1788 / 1986), as well as the representations in their English adaptations and translations.

From the comparative study, it is found that cross dressing rarely "reveals the imitative structure of gender itself" (1999: 175), as Butler suggests. In fact, in most texts, Chinese or English, the cross-dressing motif often serves to reinforce and confirm the existing distinctions between male and female, masculine and feminine, gay and straight. What is also noticeable is that in most English interpretations and translations, the representations of cross dressing become more conservative and less 'problematic'. In all cases, the effect of the potentially subversive gender reversal is reduced.

Total number of words: 192

Cross-dressing in Chinese Classics and Their English Versions
(Module Two, Paper Two)

Table of Contents:

Cross-dressing in Chinese Classics and Their English Versions
(Module Two, Paper Two)

1. Introduction

Cross dressing, or the act of adopting the role and many of the customs of the opposite gender, "implies different things in different cultures and has been viewed historically in widely varying ways" (Bullough and Bullough, 1993: 3). For centuries, terms such as "gynemimesis, andromimesis, gender dysphoria, female or male impersonation, transgenderist, femmiphile, androphile, femme mimic, fetishist, crossing, transsexual" (ibid), etc have been introduced to describe the notion of cross dressing. The wide range of terms indicates that people have come across and perceived the idea of cross dressing in various ways. For instance, early physicians and psychiatrists in the west had the inclination to medicalize cross dressing and queer identities as an illness, a mental or a behavioural problem. On the other hand, radical feminists, Judith Butler for one, see drag and cross dressing as a witty parody of the imitative structure of gender. Meanwhile, in Hollywood cinema, cross dressing and many drag performances that we find in mainstream movies belong to the category of entertainment. Sometimes, cross dressing is represented as humour, which ridicules the drag, arouses laughter and affirms the heterosexual norm. At other times, cross dressing is represented as the monstrous, insanity and danger that needs to be medicalised, separated and removed from society.

The notion of cross dressing is also familiar in Chinese culture. In Chinese Opera, theatrical transvestism, whether male or female, is a traditional cultural practice that aims

at performing drama in its "full sense" (Wang Guowei, 1911 / 1984: 44). In Chinese folk literature, there are also a tremendous number of stories regarding male and female cross dressing. According to Cuncun Wu (2003), about 80 to 90 percent of the "gifted youth and virtuous maidens" romances in late imperial China employ formulaic episodes of either male or female cross-dressing. Among these popular works, one of the most well-known stories is *The Butterfly Lovers*, a love story in which the female protagonist, Zhu Yingtai, disguises as a male scholar so as to leave home and attend a prestigious boy college. Besides *The Butterfly Lovers*, there are also romantic fictions that use cross dressing as a plot device, such as "*Liangjiaoshun* [Swapping weddings], *Baiguizhi* [A story of white jade], *Wanruyue* [Matching as if prearranged], *Yujiaoli* [A tender jade-like pear], *Tiehuaxian shi* [The story of the iron flower fairy], *Xingfengliu* [Woken from a romance], *Jinxiangting* [Pavilion of brocade fragrance], *Lin'erbao* [Rewarded with a perfect son], *Huatuyuan* [A fated painting], *Feihuayong* [Ode to drifting flowers] and *Chunliuying* [An oriole in a spring pillow]" (Wu, 2003: 31), all of which rely on cross dressing to allow young men or women to transgress the conventional male and female spheres.

Apart from the romances in late imperial China, cross dressing also appears in various genres such as poetry, folklore, adventure and bizarre tales in Chinese literature. In these stories, there are a wide variety of reasons for cross dressing. Some of them portray cross dressing as what Richard Dyer calls the "unsocialized pleasure" (1992: 7), namely the kind of unruly delight that breaks free from the discipline of formally well-behaved narrativity and staid, coherent points of view. Even more interestingly, some stories

represent cross dressing as the sexually intriguing.   To find out the different conceptions of cross dressing, in this study I will look into the representations of cross dressing in three well-known Chinese stories, each of which comes from a different genre. The Chinese texts that I will examine include: *The Ballad of Mulan* (500 – 600 A.D.) compiled in Guo Maoqian's *Music Bureau Collection* (12th century), *The Butterfly Lovers* (2004), a folklore (850 – 880 A.D.) retold in a children's series, and *Censored by Confucius: Ghost Stories* (1788 / 1986). The first two involve female cross dressing, whereas the last text is about disguising as female or transforming into female.

The other focus of the research is to compare the representations of cross dressing in the Chinese texts and those in the English adaptations and translations. The alterations and variations found in the English texts will be examined and analyzed at the level of the story (what is being told – incidents, characters, objects, locations, etc.), as well as at the level of the discourse (how it is told) (O'Sullivan, 2005: 81). The five English texts to be looked at are: *China's Bravest Girl: The Legend of Hua Mu Lan* (1993), written by Chralie Chin; *Disney's Mulan* (1998), story adapted by Kathleen W. Zoehfeld; *The Butterfly Lovers* (1995), retold by Lee Geok Lan, and *Censored by Confucius: Ghost Stories by Yuan Mei* (1996), translated by Kam Louie and Louise Edwards. Through the comparative study, I will demonstrate that the portrayals of cross dressing are largely influenced by cultural and social-structural variables. The variations in the representations of cross dressing between the Chinese and English texts will reveal the different attitudes and ideological assumptions about sex and gender in Western culture and the Chinese culture.

Before going into the Chinese and English texts, in the next section, I will approach the notion of cross dressing through recapturing Butler's ideas of gender performativity, drag and parody, which will later on be employed to describe and discuss the various representations of cross dressing in the chosen texts.

2. What is gender performativity?

'Gender Performativity' is a term coined by Judith Butler, the poststructuralist feminist. Drawing on the claim made in Nietzsche's *On the Genealogy of Morals* (1887), that "there is no "being" behind doing, acting, becoming; "the doer" is merely a fiction imposed on the doing – the doing itself is everything." (29), in the first chapter of *Gender Trouble* (1999), Butler introduces the idea of performativity,

> There is no gender identity behind the expressions of gender; that identity is performatively constituted by the very "expressions" that are said to be its results. (33)

She argues that gender is merely a construction regardless of any ontological truth. "[T]here is neither an 'essence' that gender expresses or externalizes nor an objective ideal to which gender aspires" (ibid, 1990: 273). For Butler, gender is never essential or natural. It is not genetically coded. It does not happen once and for all when we are born. Instead, it is "a sequence of repeated acts that harden into the appearance of something that's been there all along." (Salih, 2002: 66) In other words, femininity, masculinity and heterosexual identities are all everyday performativity. They are constructed, represented, repeated and in turn, reinforced as if they are ordained by Nature, but they are not. They

4

are fabricated at the moment when they are performed. In chapter three of *Gender Trouble* (1999), Butler continues to develop her argument,

> If the inner truth of gender is a fabrication and if a true gender is a fantasy instituted and inscribed on the surface of bodies, then it seems that genders can be neither true nor false, but are only produced as the true effects of a discourse of primary and stable identity.(174)

In this light, all gender is a form of parody. It is a 'corporeal style' (177), a 'stylized repetition of acts' (179), and a copy of copy (Salih, 2002: 66). However, such gender parody or performativity should not be interpreted as something that can be put on and off at will, like a costume or role. As Butler declares in *Bodies That Matter* (1993),

> …performativity must be understood not as a singular or deliberate "act", but, rather, as the reiterative and citational practice by which discourse produces the effects that it names. (1)

2.1. Drag and parody

While the majority in society unwittingly engaged in this sort of 'ordinary', everyday gender parody, there are also some gender performances that are more parodic and even subversive, i.e. transvestite drag acts. As Butler explains, "…in imitating gender, drag implicitly reveals the imitative structure of gender itself – as well as its contingency." (1999: 175). By citing 'the feminine' through a range of signifiers such as mascaraed eyelashes, prominent breasts, movements of hips, which have no point of origin in any female body, drag disrupts the assumption of heterosexuality (Brook, 1999: 114). As Salih remarks, drag acts allow "the possibilities of denaturalizing, proliferating and

unfixing identities in order to reveal the constructed nature of heterosexuality." (2002: 67).

Having discussed the subversive potential of drag, it is important to note, however, that not all forms of drag are subversive. In fact, interestingly, there are drag performances which serve to reinforce and confirm the existing distinctions between male and female, masculine and feminine, gay and straight. To illustrate this point, Butler cites Dustin Hoffman's performance in *Tootsie* (1982) as an example of how certain 'denaturalizations' of the heterosexual norm actually enforce heterosexual hegemony (Butler, 1993: 231). Such 'high het entertainment', according to Butler, is "a ritualistic release for a heterosexual economy that must constantly police its own boundaries against the invasion of queerness." (1993: 126).

3. Cross-dressing of Mulan, the Chinese Woman Warrior

After discussing Butler's notions of drag and gender performativity, I will now concentrate on the representations of cross-dressing in Chinese literature, the English adaptations and translations. As briefly mentioned in the introduction, I shall first look into the Chinese text, *The Ballad of Mulan* (500 – 600 A.D.). Then, I will examine its English adaptations, *China's Bravest Girl: The Legend of Hua Mu Lan* (1993), as well as *Disney's Mulan* (1998), so as to examine the ideological implications and variations of female cross dressing in Chinese and English cultures. To begin with, I will discuss the background and story setting of Mulan.

3.1. "Ballad of Mulan", a Glorious Breakthrough of Patriarchal Constraints

Mulan, or Hua Mulan, is the name of a young Chinese heroine who disguises as a male warrior, joins the army and goes off to war in her old father's stead. Like all fairy tales and folklore, the time setting of the story is uncertain, but the earliest text that recounts the legend of Mulan can be dated as far back as to the fifth century C.E., when China was dominated by the Wei Tartars (Robin R.Wang, 2003: 250). The poem, known as the *Ballad of Mulan*, was first written in the *Musical Records of Old and New*. For some reasons, however, the original work of the musical records no longer exists. The text of the *Ballad of Mulan* which we can read today is from Guo Maoqian's *Music Bureau Collection* (12th century), in which old Chinese lyrics, songs and poems are compiled and preserved.

What is remarkable about *The Ballad of Mulan* is that it is one of the earliest texts that challenge the oppressive patriarchal constraints on Chinese women. To elucidate my point, here I will talk about the sex roles that are assigned to women in the traditional Chinese society – first of all, under the shadow of the Confucian doctrine, women are required to stay home and perform the conventional female duties and virtues. 'Virtuous women' are expected to follow the rituals of 'three obediences', which mean that before marriage, a woman should obey her father; after marriage, she is to obey her husband; finally, after the death of her husband, she should obey her son, if she has any. In other words, "a girl is…trained to be respectful and submissive from birth" (Xiao, 1994: 13). Men will decide what is good and appropriate for them. A 'decent' Chinese woman

7

should not make any decisions for herself at any point of her life. Besides the three obediences, women must also make sure that they possess four womanly virtues so as to become a truly 'virtuous woman'. According to Ban Zhao's *Nujie* [Precepts for women] (compiled in *Hou Han shu*, 1965), the four virtues are (1) chastity and fidelity, (2) womanly words, (3) womanly bearing; and (4) womanly work. Simply put, a good woman is supposed to behave modestly, speak softly, dress up prettily and work (sew and weave) diligently in order to please and honour her husband and family.

Looking at the narrative of The Ballad of Mulan, we can argue that Mulan is not quite the kind of virtuous woman that the traditional Chinese society would expect. Instead, in the name of filial piety to her father, Mulan sets the three obediences aside – Mulan makes up her mind to fight in place of her father:

昨夜見軍帖，	But last night I read the battle-roll;
可汗大點兵。	The Kehan has ordered a great levy of men.
軍書十二卷，	The battle-roll was written in twelve books,
卷卷有爺名。	And in each book stood my father's name.
阿爺無大兒，	My father's sons are not grown men,
木蘭無長兄，	And of all my brothers, none is older than I.
願爲市鞍馬，	Oh let me go to the market to buy saddle and horse,
從此替爺徵。	And ride with the soldiers to take my father's place.

(English translation by Arthur Waley, 2003: 251)

As we can read from the narrative of the ballad, Mulan does not 'obey' her father. Rather, she has the full subjectivity to make the decision all on her own. From the text, it seems that regarding the military announcement, neither have the people concerned shown any expectations from Mulan, nor has Mulan sought advice and permission from anybody.

What happens is that she tells her father she wants to fight in place of him, and all her father can do is just to believe in Mulan, keep quiet, and let her go off to war for him. Also, whether it is before, during or after the military service, not once has Mulan followed any orders from male. Her husband and son are either not mentioned, or they simply do not exist in the ballad. In other words, Mulan is not under the constraint of the three obediences.

Apart from the three obediences, Mulan has also subverted some of the womanly virtues. At the beginning of the ballad, it is said that like other women, Mulan weaves and performs womanly work, "Mulan sits at the door and weaves" (木蘭當戶織) (Translated by Arthur Waley, 2003: 251). However, as she puts on her armour, she hides her authentic identity and gains back her subjectivity. Under the disguise, she walks out of the domestic sphere and leaves the womanly work behind. She trespasses into the sphere of the opposite sex, and then gets promoted in the symbolic order. Similarly, when Mulan joins the all-male army, she sets herself free from her womanly bearing. The cross dressing is so successful that she deceives the whole army. For twelve years, not a single man discovers her real identity. Thus, when Mulan finally dresses back as a lady after the war is over, her fellow battle companions are all astounded, "Her messmates were startled out of their wits" (伙伴皆驚惶) (Translated by Arthur Waley, 2003: 254). What is intriguing is that there seems to be a hint of unruly delight towards the end of the ballad:

雄兔腳撲朔，	For the male hare has a lilting, lolloping gait,
雌兔眼迷離。	And the female hare has a wild and roving eye;
雙兔傍地走，	But set them both scampering side by side,
安能辨我是雄雌。	And who so wise could tell you "This is he"?

(English translation by Arthur Waley, 2003: 254)

Regarding the ending of Mulan's story, Li (2003) claims that "Mulan's crossing of gender lines is only provisional" (86), because at the end of the story, "Mulan is decorated by the emperor, returns home, removes her male garment, is reunited with her family" (ibid). Indeed, if we look at the text with standards we set today, where political correctness has to be taken into account, the gender subversion in the ballad is only provisional. As Li points out, the story does end perfectly with the unmasking of the cross-dressing. The division of gender spheres is reinstated and reaffirmed at the narrative level. As a matter of fact, considering the time and cultural setting when the ballad was written, it is hardly surprising that the story ends with Mulan returning to the domestic sphere after the war, as the narrative recounts. Having said so, at the story level, Mulan, the cross dresser is not at all punished for deceiving her battle companions with her disguise. Also, at the discourse level, the last four lines of the ballad (as cited above) reflect a subtly subversive attitude that challenges the Confucian gender system – the transgression of gender in the story of Mulan is not taken as a taboo. It is not portrayed as sinful, immoral, or disgusting. On the contrary, and to a certain extent, the disguise is accepted and represented as a fun, delightful, temporary escape from the oppressive patriarchal hegemony. The playful tone is especially strong in the last line, "And who so wise could tell you "This is he"?" (安能辨我是雄雌。) (Translated by Arthur Waley, 2003: 254).

Although the narrative does not assert that real gender identity can be fabricated, the rhetoric style helps open up an alternative way of thinking and seeing for the reader: a buck or a doe, male or female, there is a possibility that both might look the same and behave the same, in spite of their true sex. If that occurs, how do we distinguish the two?

3.2. Chin's Version: Mulan as a Dutiful Daughter and Wife

Because of the popularity of the legend of Mulan, there have been numerous English translations and adaptations in the forms of verse, prose, cartoon and film worldwide. In the following, I will look into two examples of how the original text can be adapted into an English picture book and an animation movie for junior readers and children. The first typical example that I will examine is Charlie Chin's *China's Bravest Girls: The Legend of Hua Mu Lan* (1993). On the whole, Chin's version more or less follows the narrative of *The Ballad of Mulan*. Reading the English text closely, however, many differences can be spotted throughout the adaptations. First of all, at the level of discourse, the problem of not being able to distinguish the doe from the buck is dismissed. Instead of using the 'doe and buck' metaphor to describe the gender confusion, the narrative compares Mulan to a pearl hiding in an oyster:

The ocean hides the oyster.
The oyster hides a pearl.
Bright armor and heavy helmet
Hid China's bravest girl (1993: 24).

In Chinese language, the first part of the word 'pearl' (珍珠, *zhen-zhu*) is pronounced the same as the word 'real' (真, *zhen*). Because of the sameness in the pronunciation, a pearl is commonly used as a metaphor for the truth, the real, the authentic or the essence. One well-known Chinese idiom, "an fish-eye mixed in pearls" (魚目混珠, *yu mu hun zhu*) also employs the metaphor, in which pearls represent the real and the precious, whereas a fish-eye refers to a fake pearl, or something that is just a copy of the real. In light of this, comparing Mulan to a pearl is a subtle way of making the point: the true gender is out there. It can be hidden but it can never be fabricated. Discarding the metaphor of 'a doe and a buck' and replacing it with the metaphor of 'a hidden pearl in an oyster' is therefore, an act to get rid of the sense of queerness and unruly delight submerged in the original version.

In addition to the change of metaphor, Chin also put an emphasis on the female's role, which every woman should play, and Chin's Mulan is no exception. In the original text, the story ends with Mulan choosing to return to her former way of life. For this, not much explanation is given in the ballad – there could be thousands of reasons why Mulan wants to go home. It could be that she misses her hometown, or that she is bored with the life in the military force, etc. The readers are given room for interpretation and imagination. Yet, in Chin's adaptation, the reason why Mulan returns home is clearly stated:

There's nothing that I desire,
neither wealth nor minister's post.
My duty is to my father.
In old age, he needs me most (1993: 18, my emphasis).

"My duty is to my father" is obviously an indication of Mulan's devotion towards the 'Three Obediences'. Be Mulan a heroine, she still sees herself as the subordinate – she is her father's dutiful daughter. The traditional gender position is further reinstated as the story unfolds. Towards the end of the Chin's version, Mulan gets married and becomes her comrade's wife. It is said that Mulan dresses herself up femininely "for the wedding in her husband's hall" (1993: 28). This is yet another hint of Mulan fulfilling the second obedience – as her husband's faithful wife, Mulan puts on what pleases her husband's eyes. With the 'Three Obediences' in mind, Mulan can by no means be free from the female role of being a daughter, a wife and a mother. Under Chin's adaptation, the playful tone and unruly delight of cross dressing disappear.

3.3. Disney's Version: Mulan as the Inadequate Fighter

Adding an ending to the plot and removing the playful tone from the original text do not only occur in Chin's version. It happens in the Disney's version as well. Based on the story of Mulan, the creative team of Walt Disney rewrote the Chinese story and made an animated motion picture in 1994. In 1998, the Disney Press published a colourful picture book called *Disney's Mulan*, which is a special collector's edition that tells the story of the animation. Comparing the Disney's version to the original text, Disney's Mulan becomes much less masculine, decisive and independent. Cross dressing becomes a plot device, where a number of generic elements can be found. These include "the narrative necessity for disguise", "adoption by a character of the opposite sex's specifically gender-coded costume", "an "unmasking" of the transvestite", etc (Straayer, 1996: 43 – 44).

At the beginning of the story, the readers are told that just as other ordinary Chinese teenage girls, Mulan is occupied with the issues of her matchmaking, which she believes is the way of bringing honour to her family. Besides worrying about her marriage like every other girl, Disney's Mulan also shows a lot of feminine traits. As a warrior, she is not as convincing as the original Mulan in the ballad. For instance, Disney's Mulan first begs the Emperor's Aides not to send her father to war; then, she cries in sorrow and prays to her ancestors in the family temple, "Please help me save Father's life" (1998: 18). Not being able to think of a better solution, helplessly, Mulan puts on his father's armour and goes to war as the last resort.

Despite her manly stance and attire, Mulan is not well-trained enough to join the army. The first time when she tries to draw her sword, "it snag[s] on its scabbard and clatter[s] to the ground" (1998: 20). The disguise is so difficult for her that Mulan can hardly convince herself, as she sighs, "It's going to take a miracle to get me into the army" (ibid). She only manages to overcome the obstacle when her ancestors send Mushu, a tiny dragon guardian, to guide her on how to react and behave like a real man: it is Mushu who coaches Mulan to walk and act like a normal soldier in the army camp. It is Muchu who whispers to Mulan that when someone yells at her impolitely, she needs to punch him for "It's how men say hello" (1998: 21). It is also Mushu who cries "Say that to my face, ya limp noodle!" from inside Mulan's kerchief when Mulan fails to react naturally to a man who calls her 'chicken boy'. In other words, Mushu is the patriarchal figure that helps Mulan all the way through. Without the help and constant reminder of Mushu, Mulan will not stand a chance of getting admitted to the army.

Mushu's headache continues as Mulan's inadequate disguise keeps disappointing everyone. It is said that after several days of training, Captain Shang decides that Mulan would never be a soldier. He tells her to go home. Chi Fu, the Emperor's Aide, also comments that Captain Shang's army, including Mulan, "aren't fit to be soldiers" (1998: 22). After observing the poor performance of Mulan and the rest of the troops, Chi Fu decides to send a report to the General so that Mulan and her army camp mates will never see battle. Apart from Captain Shang and Chi Fu, Mushu the dragon guardian is also frustrated by Mulan's lack of virility, "Oh no…How am I going to make Mulan a hero if she doesn't fight?" (ibid). Having said so, Muchu knows as well as the readers that Mulan's poor performance has more to do with her inability, rather than her laziness or unwillingness to try hard. As if ordained by nature, Mulan always makes careless mistakes when carrying out military missions. When Mulan finally gets her chance to go to war, she tries to fight the enemy by planning the cannon and aiming the rocket towards the leader of the enemy. Yet, Mulan misses the golden chance. Instead of aiming at Shan-Yu, the Hun leader, Mulan carelessly zooms the rocket over the enemy's head, causing an explosion on the mountaintop and an avalanche. The fault she makes is something that her male companions can hardly bear, as Mushu exclaims, "You missed him…How could you miss him?" (1998: 23). The fatal mistake is only redeemed when she plays the role of a protector – in the nick of time, she saves Captain Shang out of the avalanche by risking her own life. However, because of that, Mulan is injured, sent to the medic's tent and her disguise is unmasked in her very first battle. Being accused of committing high treason, Mulan faces the sentence of death. Her life is spared only because Captain Shang pities her and sets her free.

Comparing the three versions of Mulan, it is interesting to point out that the cross dressing in the original text is the most successful. In the ballad, Mulan cross dresses easily, fights bravely, and brings honour to her country and family via her victory. Representing the disguise as smooth and easy, the narrative subtly and playfully suggests that in spite of the difference in sex, both male and female can look the same, behave the same and act the same. In Chin's version, Mulan's cross dressing is equally successful. However, Chin seems to emphasis a lot on reinstating the gender role of traditional, virtuous women. For example, Mulan's return to her role of a dutiful daughter is magnified; on the other hand, the plot of Mulan marrying her battle companion and becoming a lovable wife is added to the story. Less light is shed on the heroic act of cross dressing, and the   unruly delight and freedom of cross dressing is not mentioned.

Whereas in the Disney's version, Mulan's cross dressing is represented as inadequate and unsuccessful – even with the help of Mushu, the male dragon guardian, Mulan is not equal to the role of a warrior. The inadequacy makes the disguise neither believable to the characters nor the readers. As a result, the cross dressing is unmasked by the captain at the very first time when Mulan goes off to war. The image of a heroic woman warrior in the previous versions is replaced by that of an inadequate female soldier who is inferior to a real male fighter. The slight hint of subversive notion, if there is any in the original Chinese text, disappears entirely in the Disney's version. Simply put, the Disney's adaptation is not only inaccurate, but also unfaithful to the original source text. Gender stereotypes are being introduced to the adaptation in both the discourse and the storyline.

4. Cross-dressing of Yingtai, the Female Scholar in *The Butterfly Lovers*

After discussing the representations of Mulan, a national heroine who cross dresses as a warrior at wartime, I move on to another famous female cross dresser – Zhu Yingtai in the Chinese love story, *The Butterfly Lovers* (also known as *Liang Shanbo yu Zhu Yingtai*), which is often regarded as the Chinese equivalent to *Romeo and Juliet*. The earliest narrative of the legend of *The Butterfly Lovers* was found to be in late Tang Dynasty, recorded in Zhang Du's *Records of the Xuan Hall* (850 – 880 A.D.). The original text is brief, but as it became widely circulated, recited and rehearsed in the forms of folk literature and opera, more and more details and elements have been added to the legend (Altenburger, 2005).

Based on one of the most popular versions of the legend, I will first briefly introduce the story: a young woman called Zhu Yingtai from a noble family disguises herself as a young male scholar and goes to a renowned school in Hangzhou to study. During her studies, Yingtai makes good friend with her schoolmate and roommate, Liang Shanbo. Studying at the same school and sleeping on the same bed for three years, Yingtai secretly falls in love with Shanbo, but her disguise remains undiscovered after she finishes her studies. Having parted with Shanbo and returned home, Yingtai manages to remind Shanbo to pay a visit to her. Unfortunately, when Shanbo visits Yingtai and finally realizes that she is a woman, Yingtai's family had already decided that Yingtai should marry Ma Wencai, another young gentleman from a rich family. In despair, Shanbo falls seriously ill and dies of a broken heart. On Yingtai and Ma Wencai's

wedding day, there is a thunderstorm. The disheartened Yingtai insists on going to Shanbo's tomb despite the fact that the wedding procession is not supposed to go pass it on the way to bridegroom's family. When she reaches the place where Shanbo is buried, the tomb suddenly opens up. Without a moment of hesitation, Yingtai throws herself into the tomb to join her beloved Shanbo. Since the tragic death of the lovers, a pair of butterflies is often seen flying around Shanbo's tomb. People believe that they are the spirits of Yingtai and Shanbo. The young lovers are therefore called 'butterfly lovers'.

The major difference of Yingtai's cross dressing and Mulan's cross dressing is that Yingtai's male disguise is far much easier than Mulan's. To illustrate this, here I will discuss the concepts of 'wen' and 'wu' in Chinese masculinity. In Chinese culture, besides the binary opposition of 'yin' and 'yang', which refers to female and male respectively, there is also the 'wen-wu' binary in the idea of maleness. According to Louie (2002), as stated in the *Great Chinese Dictionary*, the core meaning of 'wen' centres around "literary and other cultural attainment" (10), whereas that of 'wu' centres around "martial, military, force and power" (ibid). While 'wu' is similar to the contemporary Western conceptions of maleness, 'wen' refers to what Wang calls "soft masculinity" (2003: 41). A man with 'wen' (or 'caizi', a talented male scholar) is usually not a tough, muscular warrior, but an educated, handsome male with "sophisticated cultural tastes in art and literature" (ibid). What is more interesting is that like ladies, 'caizi' almost always have "fair skin, elegant features and delicate physiques, as well as tender voices and romantic hearts" (Wang, 2003: 42). It is believed that the beauty and sexual attractiveness of caixi is a reflection of his cultural cultivation and literary talent.

In light of this, we can imagine that the cross dressing of Mulan is challenging, for to become a convincing 'wu' hero, Mulan must both look like a man and fight like a man. On the other hand, the disguise of Yingtai is relatively easy. As a 'wen' hero (or 'caizi'), Yingtai does not need to hide her feminine appearance and carriage. Wearing male attire, her effeminate look is just what a 'caizi' is expected to look like.

Having discussed the notions of 'wen' and 'wu' in Chinese masculinity, as well as the different nature in the cross dressing of Mulan and that of Yingtai, in the following section, I will examine and compare the representations of Yingtai's male disguise in the Chinese and English versions.

4.1. Chinese Version: Yingtai as a Convincing Cross Dresser

Because the legend of *The Butterfly Lovers* is well loved by Chinese, there have been numerous interpretations and adaptations in the forms of opera, film, fiction, TV series, drama, and the like. Interested in the appropriation of cross dressing in children's literature, I have chosen to work on a recent Chinese version extracted from a popular children's book series which presents very colourful illustrations. In the series, there are six volumes, in which seven well-known traditional Chinese folk stories are collected and retold in around 15 to 20 pages. The volume that tells the story of *The Butterfly Lovers* is first printed in mainland China (in the city of Zhejiang) and then reprinted in Hong Kong in May 2004. The author of the retold version is anonymous, but since the target audience

is young Chinese readers, the selected text will be a good site that helps reflect the reception and ideological implications of cross dressing in mainstream Chinese culture.

On reading Yingtai's disguise in the children's text, one has the impression that the cross dressing as a caizi (a talented male scholar) is easy and convenient, despite the fact that the cross dresser has to put on the disguise for three years, day and night without a break. For instance, it is said that Yingtai's parents do not permit Yingtai to study in the boys' college, unless Yingtai cross dresses as a boy:

Source text   : 條件是她必須女扮男裝 (2004: 44)
English translation: the condition is that she [Yingtai] must disguise as a male.

The implication is that the disguise as a caizi is easy and convincing. The chance of being unmasked and the risk of bringing disgrace to the family are predicted to be very low. Therefore, Yingtai's parents would like their daughter to cheat and cross dress. Also, when Yingtai puts on her male disguise as requested, the narrative remarks that Yingtai's new look is convincing:

Source text   : 居然也有幾分男子的英偉氣慨 (2004: 44)
English translation: Unexpectedly, [Yingtai] shows some manly, handsome features.

In addition, it is repeatedly mentioned that as Yingtai's close companion, Shangbo discovers nothing about her real gender identity. On page 45, it is written that "…梁山伯為人憨厚誠實…他一直沒有察覺有什麼異樣". Translated into English, the sentence means, "Shanbo is trustworthy and honest …not for one moment does he notice anything

abnormal [about Yingtai]". On page 46, the narrator reminds the readers again that the cross dressing is successful, "倆人在同一張床三年，梁山伯還是一點也不知道祝英台原是女兒身". (English translation: The two of them sleep on the same bed for three years, but still, Shanbo does not realize that Yingtai is a woman). No matter how many times Yingtai subtly reveals to Shanbo her real gender and her secret love to him, still Shanbo does not get it. To some extent, the big success of Yingtai's cross dressing and Shanbo's failure to recognize her real gender can be viewed as comical, playful and even transgressive. On Yingtai's transgressive gender switching, Altenburger (2005) points out,

> …the story's unfortunate ending with the impossibility of marriage and the reunion in death indicates that Zhu Yingtai's male impersonation caused a lasting rupture in the gender order. Therefore, she cannot seamlessly revert to her "original" gender role anymore…

Indeed, thanks to the tragic ending, the unacceptable deception and violation of the code of morality are 'punished'. The cross dressing is after all not qualified to be the kind of 'subversive parody' that Butler mentions. Having said so, since there is absolutely no signs of inadequacy in Yingtai's disguise, it nonetheless proposes a possibility that gender identity can be "an achieved status" based on "tasks performed" and "the significance of clothing" (Bullough and Bullough, 1993: 5). Indirectly and subtly, the socio-cultural construction and gender roles are challenged.

4.2. English Version: Yingtai as a Cautious, Self-conscious Cross Dresser

Also written for junior readers, Lee Geok Lan's *The Butterfly Lovers* (1995) is an English adaptation especially designed for foreign English learners. However, unlike the Chinese version I have discussed just now, in Lee's text, Yingtai's disguise is not easy at all. Before Yingtai cross dresses as a young man and travels to Hangzhou, her father makes her promise to obey three important conditions: firstly, to protect the honour of the Zhu family, the disguise must be never be found out. Secondly, as a virtuous woman with filial piety, Yingtai must return home immediately should her mother's health turns worse. Finally and most importantly, to safeguard her chastity, when Yingtai comes home, her father will ask a midwife to "find out if [she is] still as virtuous as an unmarried woman should be" (1995: 20). Chained by these constraints and surveillance, very little room is left for the cross dressing to become playful.

For a couple of times, Yingtai's male impersonation is on the verge of being unmasked. The first time Shanbo notices something different about his 'brother' is when Yingtai is drunk and she has to be helped by Shanbo to get into bed, "Shanbo noticed that her [Yingtai's] undershirt had numerous buttons like that of a woman's" (1995: 35). Yingtai then explains immediately to Shanbo that wearing a female undershirt is "an act of filiality" (ibid), which is luckily accepted by Shanbo. Besides the female undershirt, Shanbo also discovers other suspicious features – for instance, he is shocked to find out that Yingtai's earlobes have been pierced. Yingtai's real identity is almost out. Fortunately, Yingtai is witty enough to provide a good reason just in time, "As I was a

22

child, my mother believed that I would be protected from all bad luck by having both my ears pierced" (1995: 47). Interestingly, Shanbo is not the only one who is amazed by the effeminate traits shown by Yingtai and her 'page boy', Yin Xin. When Yin Xin asks for a needle and some thread from Mrs. Zhou, the wife of the schoolmaster, Mrs. Zhou cries, "But sewing is only for girls!" (1995: 38) On hearing Mrs. Zhou's startled exclamation, Yingtai is left with no choice but telling more lies, "It's good for us boys to learn to sew a few stitches whenever we are far away from home" (ibid).

Under the constant threat of being unmasked and bringing shame to the Zhu family, Yingtai becomes extremely cautious, self-conscious and sometimes paranoiac. For example, despite the hot weather in summer, she wears two layers of clothes to hide her feminine figure. She dares not take off her clothes "for fear that others might notice" (1997: 37). Often, she reminds herself that she must watch out for being discovered by Shanbo, "I must be very careful, even though Brother Liang is a true gentleman" (1995: 35). Yingtai is also worried that some people might find her disguise inadequate and suspicious. Something as insignificant as a curious smile can arouse her anxiety, "she [Yingtai] suddenly remembered how Mrs. Zhou had smiled at them…as if she suspected something was not quite right" (1995: 39). Under enormous stress, Yingtai can hardly relax. She even goes as far as to warn Ying Xin to be extra careful when talking to people whom she suspects. Simply put, Yingtai's cross dressing is not unsuccessful, but it is far from being a jolly, unruly delight.

5. Male Cross Dressing and Yuan Mei's *Censored by Confucius* (1788)

After looking into the representations of female cross dressing in Chinese texts and their English adaptations, I will now focus on male cross dressing, which is even more controversial and interesting. As Idema (1998) notices, while female-to-male cross dressing is usually considered as a harmless, forgivable deviation, male-to-female cross dressing is commonly regarded either as a taboo or a scandal:

> In a patriarchal society, where there is an unequal division of power between genders, it may be unnatural but still understandable that women aspire to the status of men, but the reverse is both unnatural and scandalous. A woman who wants to be a man underlines the superior position of the male. However, a man who willingly acts the role of a woman denies by this act the normalcy of existing gender relations (571).

Admittedly, entailing a potential usurpation of male power and a disruption of the heterosexual norm, for decades and centuries, male cross dressing has almost always been represented as horror, bizarre, insanity and danger. As we can see from popular thriller movies such as Hitchcock's *Psycho* (1960), Brian de Palma's *Dressed to Kill* (1980), Jonathan Demme's *The Silence of the Lambs* (1991), the transvestite is always an insane killer, a danger to society. At the end of these formulaic movies, the cross dressing freak often gets killed, caught, or imprisoned in an asylum. There can be exceptions though – if the male-to-female disguise is only temporary, then, it may occur in the form of humour, as in Billy Wilder's *Some Like It Hot* (1959) and Chris Columbus' Mrs. Doubtfire (1993). Yet, in such cases, to a large extent, drag acts are ridiculed, and the gender transgression is corrected eventually. Simply put, in mainstream western culture,

the representations of transvestism rarely disrupt, if not consolidate, existing heterosexual power structures.

Having said so, one will be surprised to see how many mid-Qing Chinese writers had written censored tales and records that challenge the patriarchal, heterosexual ideology advocated by the Confucian orthodoxy in the 18th century. Yuan Mei, the author of *Censored by Confucius* (1788), was one of the Qing authors who deliberately wrote on topics which Confucius would not speak of. As Yuan Mei's contemporary Zhang Xuecheung noted, rarely anyone like Yuan Mei "has dared to go to this extreme in denying the precedence of the Classics, doing away with sanctity and law, and indulging in such perverse, depraved, obscene, and licentious idea" (cited in Louie and Edwards, 1996: xxiv). In his collection of short tales, there are numerous bizarre tales of "ghosts, sex, betrayal, revenge, litigation, transvestism, homosexuality and corruption" (ibid, xxiii) that intentionally problematize the stability and naturalized gender myth propagated in traditional Confucian values. To illustrate my view, in the following, I will examine a short tale called "The Female Impersonator".

5.1. Yuan Mei's Version: Transvestite as the sexually intriguing for both genders

It is hard to tell whether the story of "The Female Impersonator" is made up, inspired or based on a true story. Nonetheless, it appears to be a recount about Hong, a beautiful young man who disguises as a traveling female embroidery tutor in the provinces of Hunan and Guizhou. For ten years, Hong has seduced and had multiple sexual relations

with numerous daughters of respected families. He has also had an illicit affair with a male scholar, who loves and cherishes Hong as a lover should. At the end, Hong's female impersonation is unmasked by a man who thought Hong was a woman. Hong is then sent to the police and sentenced to death. Before the execution, the police inspector torments Hong with the cruelest of tortures in order to force Hong to release the names of the adulterous women.

At first glance, it seems that Hong, the transvestite, is well punished for his pervert acts and immoral crime. However, reading the text closely, the reader will find that the narrative is actually criticizing the injustice of the judicial system as well as the hypocritical, moralistic heartless magistrates who carry out sadistic, inhumane corporal and death punishments in the name of 'justice' and 'morality'. Through Hong, the narrator's point of view is stated clearly:

Source text   ：我罪止和奸，畜發誘人，亦不過刁奸耳，于律無死法。(1986: 574)
English translation: Illicit sexual relations and pretending to be a woman are the worst crimes I ever committed. It's only a case of seduction. By law, I don't deserve the death sentence (My translation).

Angry at the miscarriage of justice, Hong curses the official, "後三年，訊我者在此矣" (ibid), which means "Three years from now, the one who passed the sentence will end up being executed here as well". In the end, just as Hong has predicted, the callous, excessively moralistic inspector is executed three years after Hong's death. The ending, as Louie and Edwards (1996) suggest, can be read as "the victim's ghost extracting

revenge" (xxx), which indicates Yuan's vigorous reaction against "the state's right to interfere in what are essentially personal matters of private individuals" (ibid: xxx - xxxi).

In addition, love, sexual pleasure, ambiguous gender appearance and homosexuality are all celebrated in the tale of "The Female Impersonator". For instance, when Hong confesses to being a man, Hong's male lover, Li exclaims,

Source text   : 汝果男耶？則更佳矣 (1986: 573)
English translation: Are you really a man? If so, it is even better! (My translation)

Instead of showing signs of resentment or homophobia, Li gladly accepts Hong and loves him as a lover should. Even more interestingly, under Yuan's pen, the physical examination of Hong is like a sexual fantasy that excites the curiosity and voyeuristic desire of both readers and the sadistic administrators within the plot. The description of the gender-bending has become the sexually intriguing:

Source text: 臬使親驗之，其聲嬌細，頸無結喉，髮垂委地，肌膚玉映，腰圍僅一尺三寸，
            而私處棱肥肉厚，如大鮮菌。(1986: 573)
English translation: The police inspector conducted the physical examination in person. It was
                found that Hong's voice was delicate and soft. There was no Adam's apple
                on [his] neck. [His] long hair reached the floor. [His] skin was as fair and
                smooth as jade. [His] waist was as tiny as twenty inches. And the private part
                was as fleshy and lush as a large, fresh mushroom (My translation).

In *Visual and Other Pleasure* (1989), Mulvey argues that in the patriarchal social system, a woman can be identified in two levels. On the one hand, she is the "erotic object for the characters within the screen play". On the other hand, she is also the "erotic object for the spectator within the auditorium" (19). Looking at the portrayal of Hong and his body, it

appears that Hong has become the passive object of sexual gaze for both the readers and the characters in the story. Being both the prey of sexual desire and a hunter of women's sexuality, the female impersonator has opened up new possibilities and overthrown the binary opposition of the heterosexual structure. What is even more remarkable about Yuan's text is that the readers' latent desire of voyeurism is always left unfulfilled. While Hong's youthful, beautiful body is being scrutinized and obscenely displayed in the physical examination, for the readers, Hong's body and true identity remain ambiguous and mysterious. First of all, Yuan has made good use of the vagueness of language, namely the lack of gender pronouns or genderized endings in the Chinese language. In the description regarding Hong's body, the possessive pronoun 'his' is not employed at all.

Moreover, instead of revealing Hong's male identity explicitly, Yuan focuses on Hong's androgynous features. From Hong's hair, voice, neck, skin to the waist, the readers are made to perceive that Hong's body is more feminine than masculine. Then, for the most crucial part, i.e. the genital, Yuan cleverly refers to it as the 'private part', a gender neutral term. The comparison of the 'private part' to a large, fresh mushroom is equally puzzling – what does it mean to say that Hong's private part is like a mushroom? There are different parts in a mushroom, which could lead to different interpretations. In other words, does Hong's private part resemble the mushroom cap or the mushroom stem? If it is the mushroom cap, then the flat surface on the top and the multiple folds underneath will remind readers of the jutting curves and folds of the female genitalia. However, if it is the mushroom stalk, then the private part must be like a penis. Male or female, cross

dressing or cross gendering, revelation or more deceptions, Yuan's writing strews snares. The male cross dressing is sexually intriguing for both genders, and the unwrapping of the female dressing has only made Hong's body even more enigmatic. Readers are left more space for imagination and sensation.

5.2. English Version: Transvestite as a Womanizer

The English version of Yuan's "The Female Impersonator" is translated by Louie and Edwards (1996). In the translation, the plot is not altered at the story level. Yet, at the discourse level, the notion of ambiguous sexuality cannot be retained. Below is the description of Hong's physical examination in Louie and Edwards' version:

> The inspector found that Hong lacked an Adam's apple and as a consequence had a soft, delicate voice. Moreover, Hong's hair was so long that when it was untied it reached the ground. His skin was as smooth as silk and his waist measured a tiny twenty inches. His penis, however, was thick and firm and shaped like a large mushroom (1996: 209 - 210).

Compared to the original text, gender pronouns such as "his" cannot be avoided in English. The translators have not used any awkward constructions such as 'him/her' to avoid stating Hong's sex identity either. As a result, the vagueness and subtlety in Yuan's writing are missing from the target text. Furthermore, the vocabulary used to describe Hong's private part is much more explicit and specific in the English version. For example, "His penis" rather the gender neutral term "the private part" is used. Also, adjectives such as "thick" and "firm" also remind the readers of the shape and form of the male's phallus. In light of this, when reading the English version, one will not perceived

the cross dresser as a hermaphrodite. Rather, the readers will see Hong as a Don Juan like libertine and womanizer, who pretends to be a wandering seamstress just to prey on the daughters of respected families.

6. Conclusion

In *Gender Trouble* (1999), Butler makes the point that drag performances could be seen as a subversive parody that mocks the existing heterosexual power structures. Yet, looking at how drag and cross-dressing are represented in the selected Chinese texts and their English versions, one will be disappointed. The implications of the drag and cross-dressing motif in most of the texts, Chinese or English, are rarely subversive, if not submissive to male power and the heterosexual hierarchy. What is noticeable is that in most English interpretations and translations, the representations of cross dressing become more conservative and less 'problematic'. In all cases, the effect of the potentially subversive gender reversal is reduced.

In the legend of Mulan, temporary transgression of the borderlines of gender appears when the female protagonist disguises as a male soldier and goes off to war for her old father. In the original Chinese text, *The Ballad of Mulan* (500 – 600 A.D.), the female cross dressing can be viewed as an unruly delight, at most a temporary escape from the oppressive patriarchal hegemony. In the ballad, Mulan's real sex identity is hidden for twelve years. In male clothes, she breaks away from the convention of 'three obediences and four womanly virtues' for the first time in her life. Although the cross dressing does

not last forever, the last few lines of the poem suggests some hint of playfulness. It subtly implies the possibility and plausibility that both male and female can look the same and behave the same, in spite of their true sex identity. Yet, in the English versions, the cross dressing of Mulan is interpreted and represented differently. In Chin's version, the playful tone is removed from the text. Also, a new ending has been added to the plot – Mulan does not only return to the traditional feminine role of being her father's daughter, she has also become her comrade's wife. The gender hierarchy is neatly rendered and reconfirmed. In the Disney's version, Mulan is allowed even less freedom and subjectivity. Starting from day one of the military training, her cross dressing has been represented as inadequate and unsuccessful. The image of the national, heroic woman warrior is replaced by that of an inadequate, fearful woman soldier.

As for the romantic tale of *The Butterfly Lover*, the female protagonist Yingtai is also allowed a temporary space and time to emancipate herself from the suffocating traditional gender roles. In the Chinese version of *The Butterfly Lovers* (2004), Yingtai's disguise as a caizi (male scholar) is represented as easy, convenient and convincing. The basic image of the 'wen' masculinity is sufficiently conveyed. Nonetheless, the hint of unruly delight, not to mentioned Butler's subversive parody, is lacking in the text. May the cross dressing be entertaining, the deceitful attire and disguise are associated with a series of negative connotations, ranging from an unacceptable deception, a violation of the code of morality, to a challenge to the male ideology. At the end of the story, the temporary usurpation of male power ends. The 'deception' is punished with an irreversibly tragic ending. Similarly, in the English version of *The Butterfly Lovers* (1995), neither unruly

delight nor subversive parody can be found. The major difference between the Chinese and the English versions is that in the English version, the stress and threat of being unmasked and bringing shame to the family have been magnified. In Lee's adaptation, Yingtai is portrayed to be extremely cautious, self-conscious and sometimes paranoiac when she is in male clothes.

The only text that manages to show some features of Butler's notion of drag and gender performativity is Yuan Mei's "The Female Impersonator" in *Censored by Confucius* (1788 / 1986). In the Chinese source text, the beautiful female impersonator, Hong seduces and has multiple sexual relations with both male and female. The cross dressing / cross gendering is represented as sexually intriguing to both genders. Interestingly, with Yuan's vague and witty description in the physical examination scene, the unwrapping of female dressing and the nude androgynous body become all the more ambiguous and seductive. Regardless of Hong's true gender identity, both the characters and the readers take Hong as an object of sexual gaze. In the English version translated by Louie and Edwards (1996), however, Hong's real sex identity is clearly stated in the text. As a consequence, readers are not given much room for imagination and fantasy. The cross dressing is only represented as a trick that Hong uses to get near to and seduce women. Simply put, the subversive notion suggested in the source text is lost.

Bibliography

Altenburger, Roland. "Is it clothes that make the man? Cross-dressing, gender, and sex in pre-twentieth-century Zhu Yingtai Lore." *Asian Folklore Studies.* Zurich: The University of Zurich, 1 Oct 2005.

Brook, Barbara. *Feminist Perspectives on the Body.* Malaysia: Longman, 1999.

Bullough, Vern L. and Bonnie Bullough. *Cross Dressing, Sex and Gender.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993.

Butler, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity.* New York and London: Routledge, 1999.

--------. *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of 'Sex'.* New York: Routledge, 1993.

--------. "Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory", *Performing Feminism: Feminist Critical Theory and Theatre.* Ed. Sue Ellen Case. Baltimore: John Hopkins UP, 1990.

Chin, Charlie. *China's Bravest Girls: The Legend of Hua Mu Lan.* California: Children's Book Press, 1993.

Dyer, Richard. *Only Entertainment.* London: Routledge, 1992.

Hou Han shu [The Book of post-Han Dynasty]. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1965.

Idema, Wilt L. "The Story of Ssu-ma Hsiang-ju and Cho Wen-chiin in vernacular literature of the Yiian and early Ming dynasties". *Tbung Pao*, 70 (1984): 60 – 109.

Lee, Geok Lan. *The Butterfly Lovers.* Singapore: Federal Publications, 1995.

Li, Siu Leung. *Cross-Dressing in Chinese Opera.* Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2003.

Liang Shanbo yu Zhu Yingtai [In Chinese]. Hong Kong: Outstanding Publication Ltd., 2004.

Louie, Kam. *Theorizing Chinese Masculinity: Society and Gender in China.* Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Mulvey, Laura. *Visual and Other Pleasure.* London: Macmillan, 1989.

Nietzsche, Friedrich. *On the Genealogy of Morals.* Trans. Walter Kaufmann and R.J. Hollingdale. New York: Vintage Books, 1989.

O'Sullivan, Emer. *Comparative Children's Literature.* London and New York: Routledge, 2005.

Salih, Sara. *Judith Butler.* London and New York: Routledge, 2002.

Straayer, Chris. *Deviant Eyes, Deviant Bodies: Sexual Re-orientations in Film and Video.* New York: Columbia University Press, 1996.

Mulan ci [The Ballad of Mulan]. Trans. Arthur Waley. Indianapolis, Cambridge: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 1923, 2003.

Wang, Guowei. *Guju jiaose kao* [Study of role-types used in ancient drama]. Beijing: Zhongguo xiju chubanshe, 1911, 1984.

Wang, Robin R. Introduction to "The Ballad of Mulan". *Images of Women in Chinese Thought and Culture: Writings from the Pre-Qin Period through the Song Dynasty.* Ed. Robin R. Wang. Indianapolis, Cambridge: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 2003.

Wang, Yiyan. "Mr Butterfly in *Defunct Capital*: "soft" masculinity and (mis)engendering China". *Asian Masculinities: The meaning and practice of manhood in China and Japan.* Ed. Kam Louie and Morris Low. London and New York: Routledge Curzon, 2003.

Wu, Cuncun. ""Beautiful boys made up as beautiful girls": anto-masculine taste in Qing China". *Asian Masculinities: The meaning and practice of manhood in China and Japan.* Ed. Kam Louie and Morris Low. London and New York: Routledge Curzon, 2003.

Xiao, Lily Hong Lee. *The Virtue of Yin: Studies on Chinese Women.* Honolulu: University Hawaii Press, 1994.

Yuan, Mei. *Zi bu yu* [Censored by Confucius]. Shanghai: Shang-hai gu ji chu ban she, 1788, 1986.

Zoehfeld, Kathleen W. *Disney's Mulan: Special Collector's Edition.* New York: Disney Press, 1998.

Films Cited

Dressed to Kill. Dir. Brian De Palma. Perf. Michael Caine, Angie Dickinson, Nancy Allen and Keith Gordon. 1980. DVD. MGM Home Entertainment, 2004.

Mrs. Doubtfire. Dir. Chris Columbus. Perf. Robin Williams, Sally Field, Pierce Brosnan, Harvey Fierstein, Polly Holliday. 1993. DVD. Twentieth Century Fox, 1999.

Psycho. Dir. Alfred Hitchcock. Perf. Anthony Perkins, Janet Leigh, Vera Miles and John Gavin. 1960. DVD. Universal Home Video, 1998.

The Silence of the Lambs. Dir. Jonathan Demme. Perf. Jodie Foster, Anthony Hopkins, Scott Glenn, Ted Levine, Anthony Heald. 1991. DVD. MGM Home Entertainment, 2001.

Some Like It Hot. Dir. Billy Wilder. Perf. Marilyn Monroe, Tony Curtis, Jack Lemmon and George Raft. 1959. DVD. MGM Home Entertainment, c2001.

Tootsie. Dir. Sydney Pollack. Perf. Dustin Hoffman, Jessica Lange, Teri Garr and Dabney Coleman. 1982. DVD. Columbia TriStar Home Entertainment, 2001.